

Children's temperament and parenting practices in the first five years of life and cognitive, academic and adiposity outcomes in later childhood and adolescence

Shiau Yun Chong

BSc (Hons), MPH

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements
for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

August 2016

**School of Public Health
Faculty of Health Sciences
The University of Adelaide
Australia**

Contents

Contents	iii
Abstract	vii
Declaration	x
Acknowledgements	xi
Publications contributing to this thesis	xii
Presentations arising from this thesis	xiii
Abbreviations	xiv
List of tables	xvi
List of figures	xviii
CHAPTER 1. Introduction	1
1.1 Child temperament and parenting	1
1.2 Why study cognitive ability and overweight?.....	3
1.3 Thesis aim and research questions	4
1.4 Thesis outline	5
CHAPTER 2. Literature review	8
2.1 Temperament.....	8
2.1.1 History of temperament.....	8
2.1.2 Definitions and models of temperament.....	10
2.1.3 Approaches to measuring temperament in infants and children.....	24
2.1.4 Stability of temperament	25
2.1.5 Differences in temperament by gender, socio-economic background, and culture ..	26
2.1.6 Research question 1	28
2.2 Parenting	29
2.2.1 Definition of parenting practices	30
2.2.2 Parenting practices that are important for child cognitive and adiposity outcomes	30
2.3 Temperament and parenting influences on child development	34
2.3.1 Direct and indirect effects.....	35
2.3.2 Theoretical “interaction” models.....	37
2.4 Temperament and parenting influences on cognitive outcomes.....	42
2.4.1 Temperament and cognitive outcomes	42
2.4.2 Parenting influences on cognitive outcomes.....	45
2.4.3 Temperament and parenting and influence on cognitive outcomes	47

2.4.4	Research question 2.....	48
2.4.5	Research question 3.....	49
2.5	Temperament and parenting influences on adiposity and diet.....	50
2.5.1	Temperament influences on adiposity and diet.....	50
2.5.2	Parenting influences on child adiposity and diet.....	52
2.5.3	Temperament and parental feeding practices influence on adiposity.....	55
2.5.4	Research question 4.....	56
CHAPTER 3. Methods		58
3.1	Data sources	58
3.1.1	Avon Longitudinal Study of Parents and Children (ALSPAC)	60
3.1.2	Longitudinal Study of Australian Children (LSAC).....	68
3.2	Methodological & analytical approach.....	73
3.2.1	Research question 1.....	73
3.2.2	Research question 2.....	74
3.2.3	Research question 3.....	79
3.2.4	Research question 4.....	84
3.1	Dealing with missing data.....	86
CHAPTER 4. How many infants are temperamentally difficult? Comparing norms from the Revised Infant Temperament Questionnaire to a population sample of UK infants 90		
4.1	Preface	90
4.2	Publication: How many infants are temperamentally difficult? Comparing norms from the Revised Infant Temperament Questionnaire to a population sample of UK infants.....	92
4.2.1	Statement of Authorship	92
4.2.2	Abstract.....	94
4.2.3	Introduction	96
4.2.4	Methods.....	99
4.2.5	Results.....	101
4.2.6	Discussion and conclusion	106
4.2.7	Online Appendices	110
CHAPTER 5. Does temperament at ages 2-3 directly affect cognitive and academic outcomes at ages 6-7?		112
5.1	Preface	112

5.2	Publication: Does temperament at ages 2-3 directly affect cognitive and academic outcomes at ages 6-7?	114
5.2.1	Statement of authorship	114
5.2.2	Abstract	116
5.2.3	Introduction	118
5.2.4	Methods	119
5.2.5	Results	124
5.2.6	Discussion.....	128
5.2.7	Online appendices.....	131
CHAPTER 6. Parenting practices at 24 to 47 months and IQ at age 8: Effect-measure modification by infant temperament		138
6.1	Preface	138
6.2	Publication: Parenting practices at 24 to 47 months and IQ at age 8: Effect-measure modification by infant.....	140
6.2.1	Statement of authorship.....	140
6.2.2	Abstract	142
6.2.3	Introduction	143
6.2.4	Methods	148
6.2.5	Results	158
6.2.6	Discussion.....	166
6.2.7	Online appendices.....	170
CHAPTER 7. Child temperament, parental feeding practices and adiposity		180
7.1	Preface	180
7.2	PART 1: Temperament and BMI.....	182
7.2.1	Introduction	182
7.2.2	Methods	182
7.2.3	Results	184
7.2.4	Discussion.....	187
7.3	PART 2 (Publication): Associations of parental feeding control of food intake and use of food to soothe with adiposity in childhood and adolescence	191
7.3.1	Statement of authorship.....	191
7.3.2	Abstract	194
7.3.3	Background	195
7.3.4	Methods	196

7.3.5	Results.....	201
7.3.6	Discussion	208
7.3.7	Online appendices	213
7.4	PART 3: Does temperament modify the association between parental feeding control and adiposity?	217
7.4.1	Introduction	217
7.4.2	Method	218
7.4.3	Result	218
7.4.4	Discussion	222
CHAPTER 8.	Summary and Conclusions.....	224
8.1	Key findings and contributions	225
8.2	Limitations and future directions	231
8.3	Implications and recommendations	233
8.4	Concluding remarks	234
8.5	Appendices	235
References	245

Abstract

The aims of this thesis are to examine the associations between children's temperament, parenting practices and three important public health outcomes: cognitive ability, academic achievement and adiposity. While there have been decades of psychological research in this area, this thesis takes a contemporary epidemiological approach to the topic and addresses some of the methodological limitations of past studies by using more advanced methods and longitudinal data from both Australia and the UK.

There are four papers in this thesis. The first study examined whether norms in the Revised Infant Temperament Questionnaire (RITQ) were suitable for use in a population sample of UK infants. The RITQ was normed on a small group of US infants in 1978 and has never been updated. Findings showed that 15% of children would be classified as temperamentally difficult using norms empirically derived from the UK infant data, compared to 24% using RITQ's norms, suggesting that potential misclassification of infant temperament occurred from using different norms. This study highlighted the need for more recent and culturally-specific temperament norms to categorise infant temperament. Temperament categories defined using the norms in this study were used in subsequent analyses in study 3 and 4.

Children's temperament may influence parenting, which is known to affect cognitive and academic outcomes. Most studies of temperament have not adequately accounted for parenting practices when examining the effect of temperament on cognitive and academic outcomes. To properly handle parenting practices at age 4 to 5 years as an intermediate variable, the second study used a marginal structural model to examine the

controlled direct effects of temperament at 2 to 3 years on cognitive and academic outcomes at 6 to 7 years in a nationally representative sample of Australian children. Temperament dimensions measured in this study were reactivity, approach, and persistence. This study found that the controlled direct effects of temperament on cognitive and academic outcomes was small. The largest effect (0.11 SD) was for persistence on verbal ability.

Since temperament had such a small influence on children's cognitive and academic outcomes, this thesis then examined parenting as the exposure, as parenting may have a greater influence on cognitive ability than temperament. The associations between parenting practices (warmth and control) and children's IQ in the UK cohort were explored in study 3. Temperament was contextualised as an effect-measure modifier, a variable that may modify the associations between warmth, control and IQ. Low parental warmth and high parental control at 24 to 47 months were associated with lower IQ at age 8 years. Effect sizes for warmth and control were 0.03 SD and 0.15 SD, respectively. Counter to the study's hypothesis, temperamentally easier children were more susceptible to the negative effects of low warmth and high control parenting than temperamentally difficult children.

Besides cognitive and academic outcomes, there is some evidence that parenting and temperament may influence children's adiposity. The fourth study focused on two more specific dimensions of parenting, namely parental feeding control and using food to soothe a child. The associations between feeding control, using food to soothe, and body mass index (BMI) and fat mass were explored in the UK cohort. Whether these

associations differed for children with different temperaments were examined using an analysis of effect-measure modification. Contrary to some studies, higher parental feeding control at age 42 to 65 months was associated with lower BMI at ages 7 and 15 years and fat mass at age 15 years. No association between using food to soothe (42 months) and BMI (7 and 15 years) or fat mass (15 years) were found.

Using two large, longitudinal observational studies from different countries, different temperament tools, and measures of temperament at different ages, the research in this thesis indicated that the effect sizes for temperament on cognitive, academic and adiposity outcomes are at best, very small. The differential susceptibility theory suggested by previous psychological studies, that temperamentally difficult children were more vulnerable to the detrimental effects of negative parenting, was not supported in the UK cohort and using contemporary epidemiological methods. It is recommended that future studies adjust rigorously for important confounders and use large, representative samples when examining the effect-measure modification by temperament of the associations between parenting and cognitive, academic and adiposity outcomes.

Declaration

I certify that this work contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in my name, in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text. In addition, I certify that no part of this work will, in the future, be used in a submission in my name, for any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution without the prior approval of the University of Adelaide and where applicable, any partner institution responsible for the joint-award of this degree.

I give consent to this copy of my thesis when deposited in the University Library, being made available for loan and photocopying, subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.

The author acknowledges that copyright of published works contained within this thesis resides with the copyright holder(s) of those works.

I also give permission for the digital version of my thesis to be made available on the web, via the University's digital research repository, the Library Search and also through web search engines, unless permission has been granted by the University to restrict access for a period of time.

Signed ...

15-08-2016
Date

Acknowledgements

I am very grateful to my supervisors – Associate Professor Lisa Smithers, Dr Catherine Chittleborough, Dr Tess Gregory, Professor John Lynch, and Dr Murthy Mittinty. Lisa, Cathy, and Tess have always provided me the support and encouragement throughout the candidature and I am very thankful for your patience and support all these years. Thank you John for your insightful comments on chapters and publications. You are always a great teacher and I have learned many things from being part of your team. Thank you Murthy for your advice and support to get me through the process of data analysis and interpretation.

I would also like to thank all participants and staff from the Avon Longitudinal Study of Parents and Children and the Longitudinal Study of Australian Children. I would like to acknowledge and thank the University of Adelaide and the Fraser Mustard Centre for funding this project. This thesis would not be possible without the data and funding sources.

A very special thank you goes to my parents, brothers, and sister. Thank you all for your unconditional love, patience, and giving me all the best opportunities in life. I would like to thank my PhD colleagues - Amelia Maika, Ting Xia, Edilene Lopes, Angela Gialamas, Gizachew Tessema, for sharing your expertise and lending me your ears. To my friends, especially Erica Sung, for your support all these years in my PhD journey. You listened to my frustration, talked through the issues with me, and I am so grateful to know you and your family.

Publications contributing to this thesis

- Chong SY, Chittleborough CR, Gregory T, Lynch JW, Smithers LG. How many infants are temperamentally difficult? Comparing norms from the Revised Infant Temperament Questionnaire to a population sample of UK infants. *Infant Behav Dev.* 2015; 40: 20-28.
- Smithers LG, Chong SY, Chittleborough CR, Gregory T, Lynch JW. Authors respond to the commentary on Chong et al. "How many infants are temperamentally difficult?" (40 (2015)20-28). *Infant Behav Dev.* 2015; 41: 164-166.
- Chong SY, Chittleborough CR, Gregory T, Mittinty MN, Lynch JW, Smithers LG. Parenting practices at 24 to 47 months and IQ at age 8: Effect-measure modification by infant temperament. *PLoS One.* 2016; 11(3): e0152452.
- Chong SY, Chittleborough CR, Gregory T, Lynch JW, Mittinty MN, Smithers LG. Does temperament at ages 2-3 directly affect cognitive and academic outcomes at ages 6-7? Under review.
- Chong SY, Chittleborough CR, Gregory T, Lynch JW, Mittinty MN, Smithers LG. Associations of parental feeding control and use of food to soothe with adiposity in childhood and adolescence. Under review.

Presentations arising from this thesis

- Chong SY, Chittleborough CR, Gregory T, Mittinty MN, Lynch JW, Smithers LG.
Parenting influence on the association between temperament and IQ. Infant and Early Childhood Social and Emotional Wellbeing Conference. Canberra, Australia, October 2013.
- Chong SY, Chittleborough CR, Gregory T, Mittinty MN, Lynch JW, Smithers LG. Child temperament, parenting and IQ: Findings from a population-based cohort of parents and children. Public Health Association of Australia (South Australia Branch) State Population Health Conference. Adelaide, October 2014.
- Chong SY, Chittleborough CR, Gregory T, Mittinty MN, Lynch JW, Smithers LG.
Influence of parenting and child temperament on Intelligence Quotient (IQ) at 8 years. The 20th Occasional Temperament Conference. Lincoln, Nebraska, USA, November 2014.
- Chong SY, Chittleborough CR, Gregory T, Mittinty MN, Lynch JW, Smithers LG. Using marginal structural models to estimate the direct effect of temperament at 2-3 years on receptive vocabulary and academic achievement at 6-7 years. 2015 Robinson Research Institute Symposium. Adelaide, November 2015.
- Chong SY, Chittleborough CR, Gregory T, Lynch JW, Mittinty MN, Smithers LG. Effects of parental feeding practices and temperament on BMI and fat mass from childhood through adolescence. 13th International Congress on Obesity, Vancouver, May 2016.

Abbreviations

ALSPAC	Avon Longitudinal Study of Parents and Children
ARS	Academic Rating Scale
ATP	Australian Temperament Project
BMI	Body Mass Index
CDE	Controlled direct effect
CDC	Centers for Disease Control and Prevention
CFQ	Child Feeding Questionnaire
CSE	Certificate of Secondary Education
DAG	Directed acyclic graph
DXA	Dual energy X-ray absorptiometry
EAS	Emotional, Activity, and Sociability
EMM	Effect-measure modification
FFQ	Food Frequency Questionnaire
IOTF	International Obesity Task Force
ITQ	Infant Temperament Questionnaire
IQ	Intelligence Quotient
IRSD	Index of Relative Socio-economic Disadvantage
K6	Kessler 6 Scale
LAB-TAB	Laboratory Temperament Assessment Battery
LCA	latent class analysis
MAR	Missing at random
MCAR	Missing completely at random
MNAR	Missing not at random
MICE	Multiple imputation by chained equation
LSAC	Longitudinal Study of Australian Children

MSM	Marginal structural model
NYLS	New York Longitudinal Study
PPVT	Peabody Picture Vocabulary Test
RERI	Relative excess risk due to interaction
RITQ	Revised Infant Temperament Questionnaire
RR	Risk ratio
SEM	Structural equation model
STSC	Short Temperament Scale for Children
STSI	Short Temperament Scale for Infants
STST	Short Temperament Scale for Toddlers
TBAQ	Toddler Behavior Assessment Questionnaire
TTS	Toddler Temperament Scale

List of tables

Table 2.1 Definitions, dimensions, and questionnaires used for temperament.....	11
Table 2.2 Definitions and sample items of the nine temperament dimensions proposed by Thomas and Chess ²⁷	15
Table 2.3 The main dimensions and sub-dimensions of temperament proposed by Rothbart ⁵	18
Table 3.1 Outline of data used to answer each research question.....	59
Table 3.2 International Obesity Task Force (IOTF) age and sex specific cut points for BMI used to define overweight/obesity ²⁰¹	64
Table 4.1 Socio-demographic characteristics of the Avon Longitudinal Study of Parents and Children (ALSPAC) sample	103
Table 4.2 Comparison of temperament subscale means and SDs (norms) in the Revised Infant Temperament Questionnaire (RITQ) and Avon Longitudinal Study of Parents and Children (ALSPAC) samples.....	105
Table 4.3 Temperament categorisation of the Avon Longitudinal Study of Parents and Children (ALSPAC) sample based on means and SDs from the Revised Infant Temperament Questionnaire (RITQ) and ALSPAC samples (n=10937).....	106
Table 4.4 Norms from the Avon Longitudinal Study of Parents and Children (ALSPAC) and the four randomly split subsamples	110
Table 4.5 Temperament categorisation in the Avon Longitudinal Study of Parents and Children (ALSPAC) sample and the four randomly split subsamples	111
Table 5.1 Characteristics of response, complete case, and imputed samples.....	125
Table 5.2 Controlled direct effects (CDEs) of temperament reactivity, approach, and persistence at ages 2 to 3 years on child outcomes at ages 6 to 7 years (n=5107).....	127
Table 5.3 Stabilised inverse probability of treatment weights	133
Table 5.4 The effect of a potential unmeasured binary confounder <i>U</i> of parenting practices to outcomes pathway	137
Table 6.1 Parenting measures in the ALSPAC questionnaires.....	152
Table 6.2 IQ, parenting, temperament, and demographic characteristics of response, complete case and imputed sample.....	159

Table 6.3 Association between parenting warmth and control, and child temperament on children’s IQ (Imputed sample, n=7044)	161
Table 6.4 Effect-measure modification of the effect of parenting warmth on IQ (<85) by child temperament (Imputed sample, n=7044).....	163
Table 6.5 Effect-measure modification of the effect of parenting control on IQ (< 85) by child temperament (Imputed sample, n=7044).....	165
Table 7.1 Characteristics of ALSPAC and LSAC samples.....	184
Table 7.2 Association between temperament (6, 24 months, and 38 months) and BMI z-score at 7 years in ALSPAC	186
Table 7.3 Association between temperament (0 to 1, 2 to 3 and 4 to 5 years) and BMI z-score at 6 to 7 years in LSAC	187
Table 7.4 Maternal and child characteristics of those participants according to their responses to the feeding control and use of food to soothe items at 3.5 years (n=7312)	203
Table 7.5 Associations between parental feeding control (3.5 years) on BMI z-score at 7 and 15 years, and fat mass at 15 years in imputed sample (n=7312)	206
Table 7.6 Associations between parental use of food to soothe (3.5 years) on BMI z-score at 7 and 15 years, and fat mass at 15 years in imputed sample (n=7312)	207
Table 7.7 Characteristics of ALSPAC study participants.....	215
Table 7.8 Effect-measure modification by temperament on the association between parental feeding control and overweight ^a at age 15 years (n=7312).....	220
Table 7.9 Effect-measure modification by temperament on the association between parental feeding control and excess fat mass ^a at age 15 years (n=7312)	221

List of figures

Figure 1.1: Socio-ecological context shaping child development ²	1
Figure 2.1 Regression approach to estimate direct effect with exposure X , mediator M , outcome Y and a set of confounders C	36
Figure 2.2 Adapted figure for diathesis stress and differential susceptibility model ¹³²	39
Figure 3.1 ALSPAC eligible study areas. Pregnant women from three District Health Authorities (DHA) were recruited ¹⁹⁸	61
Figure 3.2 An example in the Matrix Reasoning test	70
Figure 3.3 DAG of the hypothesized effect of temperament and parenting practices on cognitive and academic achievement	75
Figure 3.4 Latent class model of parenting warmth and control. Latent variable (oval), latent class indicators (rectangles), associations between latent variable and indicators (arrows).....	80
Figure 3.5 DAG representing the effect of feeding control on child adiposity outcomes ..	85
Figure 3.6 DAG representing the effect of food to soothe on child adiposity outcomes...	86
Figure 4.1 Categorisation algorithm for each temperament group.....	101
Figure 5.1 Causal diagram of the hypothesized effects of temperament at 2 to 3 years and parenting practices at 4 to 5 years on cognitive and academic outcomes at ages 6 to 7 years	131
Figure 6.1 Eligible cohort and numbers included	149
Figure 6.2 Effect-measure modification of the effect of parenting warmth on IQ by child temperament.....	176
Figure 6.3 Effect-measure modification of the effect of parenting control on IQ by child temperament.....	177
Figure 7.1 Flow chart of participants.....	198