

Social Media Adoption and Impact in Australian Local Government

by
Mohd Hisham Bin Sharif

Major Thesis submitted to the
Business School, University of Adelaide
As part of the requirements for the degree of
DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

Date of Submission: 4/12/2015

ABSTRACT

Individual and organisational use of social media is rapidly growing. Social media applications offer substantial opportunities for local government organisations to develop better community engagement, save costs and improve service delivery. However, limited attention has been directed in the current information systems literature towards understanding the adoption and impact of social media in the public sector, particularly in local government organisations. Building on DePietro, Wiarda and Fleischer's (1990) technology-organisation-environment framework (TOE) and DeLone and McLean's Information System Success (ISS) frameworks, a model of social media adoption and impact is developed and tested. This research explored qualitative evidence sourced from in-depth interviews with officers from 24 local government organisations and with a survey involving 173 local government organisations across Australia. The survey responses were analysed using the partial least squares (PLS) technique. The results suggest that compatibility, formalisation, bandwagon pressure and community demand are the important predictors of social media application adoption. An understanding of the social media application adoption factors provides a foundation for future social media application research as well as valuable guidance to organisations seeking to effectively use social media applications to benefit their organisation. The findings can be useful to many stakeholders, including adoption champions, marketing and communication officers in local government organisations. This study contributes to existing theory by improving current understanding of drivers of social media impact in local government organisations.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract.....	i
Table of Contents.....	ii
List of Tables.....	viii
List of Figures.....	ix
List of Abbreviations.....	x
Statement of Declaration and Publications from Thesis.....	xi
Acknowledgement.....	xii
Chapter 1 – Introduction.....	1
1.1 Overview.....	1
1.2 Introduction.....	1
1.3 Social Media Overview.....	3
1.4 Social Media and Public Sector Organisations.....	4
1.5 Research Motivation.....	5
1.6 Research Questions.....	10
1.7 Research Objectives.....	11
1.8 Overview of the Research Methods.....	12
1.9 Research Contributions.....	13
1.9.1 Theoretical Contributions.....	13
1.9.2 Managerial Contributions.....	14
1.10 Thesis Outline.....	14
1.11 Chapter Summary.....	18
Chapter 2 – Literature Examination.....	19
2.1 Overview.....	19
2.2 The History of Social Media.....	20
2.3 Definition of Social Media.....	21
2.4 Web 1.0 and Web 2.0.....	22
2.5 Classification of Social Media Applications.....	24
2.6 Social Media Research in Private Sector Organisations.....	27
2.7 Factors Influencing Social Media Adoption in Private Organisations.....	29
2.8 Social Media Research in Public Sector Organisations.....	31

2.9 Private versus Public Sector Organisations	35
2.10 Previous Technology Adoption Studies in Local Government Organisations	36
2.11 Previous Social Media Adoption Studies in Local Government Organisations	38
2.12 Social Media Impact Research in Public Sector Organisations	40
2.13 Chapter Summary	41
Chapter 3 – Theoretical Underpinnings	43
3.1 Overview	43
3.2 Definition of Innovation	44
3.3 Definition and Process of Adoption	44
3.4 Definition of Organisational Impact	46
3.5 The Importance of Innovation Adoption to Organisations	46
3.6 Social Media as an Innovation	47
3.7 Theories Used in Organisational IS Innovation Adoption Research	48
3.7.1 Innovation Diffusion Theory (IDT)	51
3.7.2 Technology-Organisation-Environment (TOE) Framework	51
3.7.2.1 Prior Research Using TOE	53
3.7.2.2 Prior Social Media Research Using TOE	55
3.7.2.3 Rationale for Using the TOE Framework	58
3.8 Theories Used in Information System Impact Studies	59
3.8.1 Information Systems Success (ISS) Framework	61
3.8.1.1 Prior Research Using the ISS Framework	64
3.8 Combining TOE and ISS	65
3.9 Chapter Summary	67
Chapter 4 – Research Framework	68
4.1 Overview	68
4.2 Key Antecedents	68
4.2.1 Technological Context	69
4.2.1.1 Perceived Benefits	70
4.2.1.2 Perceived Security	71
4.2.1.3 Compatibility	72
4.2.2 Organisational Context	73

4.2.2.1	Top Management Drive.....	74
4.2.2.2	Social Media Policy.....	75
4.2.3	Environmental Context.....	75
4.2.3.1	Bandwagon Pressure.....	76
4.2.4	Social Media Impact.....	77
4.3	Chapter Summary.....	78
Chapter 5	– Research Methods.....	79
5.1	Overview.....	79
5.2	Working Definitions.....	79
5.3	Relationships between Research Questions, Objectives and Methods.....	80
5.4	Research Philosophy.....	82
5.4.1	Interpretivist Philosophy.....	82
5.4.2	Positivist Philosophy.....	83
5.4.3	Determining Research Philosophy.....	84
5.5	Research Approach.....	85
5.5.1	Qualitative Approach.....	85
5.5.1.1	Justifications for the Use of the Qualitative Approach.....	86
5.5.1.2	Using Literature Reviews.....	87
5.5.1.3	Semi Structured In-depth Interviews.....	87
5.5.2	Quantitative Approach.....	89
5.5.2.1	Questionnaire Survey.....	89
5.5.3	Mixed-Method Approach.....	89
5.5.3.1	Justification for the Use of a Mixed-Method Approach.....	90
5.6	Qualitative Approach Research Design.....	92
5.6.1	Conducting the Literature Review.....	92
5.6.2	Interview Question Development.....	93
5.6.3	Validation of Interview Questions.....	93
5.6.4	Administration of the Interviews.....	94
5.6.5	Sampling Technique.....	95
5.6.6	Interviewee Selection.....	95
5.6.7	Interview Process.....	97

5.6.8 Reliability and Validity of the Interviews.....	97
5.6.9 Interview Analysis	98
5.7 Quantitative Approach Research Design	99
5.7.1 Instrument Development.....	100
5.7.2 Dependent Variables	100
5.7.2.1 Adoption	100
5.7.2.2 Social Media Impact	101
5.7.3 Independent Variables	102
5.7.3.1 Perceived Benefits	102
5.7.3.2 Perceived Security	103
5.7.3.3 Compatibility	103
5.7.3.4 Social Media Policy	104
5.7.3.5 Top Management Drive	104
5.7.3.6 Degree of Formalisation	104
5.7.3.7 Community Demand.....	105
5.7.3.8 Bandwagon Pressure and Faddishness.....	105
5.7.4 Validation of Questionnaire Items	105
5.7.5 Survey Administration	107
5.7.6 Data Analysis Technique	109
5.7.6.1 Model Assessment	109
5.7.6.2 PLS-SEM	110
5.8 Chapter Summary	111
Chapter 6 - Qualitative Findings and Discussion	113
6.1 Overview.....	113
6.2 Technological Context	113
6.2.1 Perceived Benefits	114
6.2.2 Perceived Risk	115
6.2.3 Compatibility	116
6.3 Organisational Context	116
6.3.1 Social Media Policy	117
6.3.2 Degree of Formalisation	117

6.3.3 Top Management Drive	118
6.4 Environmental Context	119
6.4.1 Bandwagon Pressure	119
6.4.2 Faddishness	120
6.4.3 Community Demand.....	121
6.5 Social Media Impact	122
6.6 Hypotheses Development	123
6.7 Refined Conceptual Framework	123
6.8 Chapter Summary	124
Chapter 7 – Quantitative Findings	126
7.1 Overview.....	126
7.2 Data Preparation and Missing Value Treatment.....	127
7.3 Descriptive Data Analysis.....	128
7.4 Normality Test	130
7.5 Measurement Model Evaluation.....	131
7.5.1 Internal Consistency Reliability.....	131
7.5.2 Item Validity	132
7.5.3 Collinearity Assessment.....	134
7.5.4 Model Fit.....	135
7.5.5 Path Coefficient Analysis/Hypothesis Testing	137
7.5.6 Coefficient of Determination	140
7.5.7 f^2 Effect Size	141
7.5.8 Blindfolding and Predictive Relevance Q^2	141
7.5.9 Mediation Effect Analysis	142
Chapter 8 – Discussion	146
8.1 Overview.....	146
8.2 Technological Context	146
8.2 Organisational Context	148
8.3 Environmental Context	150
8.4 Social Media Impact	151
8.5 Chapter Summary	152

Chapter 9 – Conclusions	153
9.1 Overview	153
9.2 Answering the Research Questions	153
9.3 Fulfilling the Research Objectives.....	154
9.4 Summary of Results	157
9.5 Theoretical Contributions	158
9.6 Managerial Implications	160
9.7 Research Limitations	161
9.8 Further Research Directions	162
9.9 Concluding remarks	163
REFERENCES	165
Appendix A - Abstract of Publications.....	186
Appendix B - Complete Paper Published in JCIS	188
Appendix C - Information Sheet for Interview.....	197
Appendix D - Interview Objectives and Questions	198
Appendix E - Variables and Measurement	199
Appendix F - Questionnaire Survey	201
Appendix G - Items Loading, Reliability, Validity and AVE	206
Appendix H - Complete Quotes for Variables.....	209
Appendix I - Statement of Disclosure and Informed consent.....	210
Appendix J - Letter to Survey Respondents	211
Appendix K - Differences Between Original and Customised Items	212
Appendix L - Ethics Approval Letter	216

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1.1: Research Questions and Objectives.....	12
Table 2.1: Web 1.0 and Web 2.0	24
Table 2.2: Social Media Categories	27
Table 2.3: Summary of Factors Driving Adoption in Private Sector	30
Table 2.4: Benefits of Social Media Applications to Public Sector Organisations	32
Table 2.5: Summary of Social Media Studies in Public Sector Organisations.....	34
Table 2.6: Differences between Private and Public Sector Organisations.....	36
Table 3.1: Technology Adoption Research Using the TOE Framework.....	55
Table 3.2: Summary of Social Media Studies Using the TOE Framework.....	57
Table 3.3: IS Impact Variables	63
Table 3.4: Findings from ISS Studies	64
Table 3.5: Strength and Weaknesses of Theories	67
Table 4.1: Key Antecedents for Conceptual Framework.....	69
Table 5.1: Research Questions and Objectives.....	81
Table 5.2: Relationships between Research Questions, Objectives and Philosophies	85
Table 5.3: Relationships between Research Questions, Objectives, Philosophies and Approach	92
Table 5.4: List of Interviewees	96
Table 6.1: Hypotheses.....	123
Table 7.1: Local Government Organisations Based on State	129
Table 7.2: Local Government Organisations Based on Type	129
Table 7.3: Social Media Applications Used	130
Table 7.4: Skewness and Kurtosis Values	131
Table 7.5: VIF Values for Independent Variables in the Model.....	135
Table 7.6: Measurement of Model Fit	136
Table 7.7: Hypotheses Test Results	137
Table 7.8: Values of f^2	141
Table 7.9: Direct Effect, p- and t-Value of Perceived Benefits and Compatibility	144
Table 7.10: Indirect Effect, t and p Value of Perceived Benefits and Compatibility	144

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1.1: Summary of Chapters	17
Figure 2.1: Social Media Applications	25
Figure 3.1: Technological Innovation Adoption Contexts	52
Figure 3.2: DeLone and McLean’s ISS Framework.....	61
Figure 3.3: Updated DeLone and McLean’s ISS framework	62
Figure 3.4: Combined TOE and ISS Framework.....	66
Figure 4.1: Conceptual Framework of Social Media Adoption and Impact.....	78
Figure 5.1: Research Methodology.....	81
Figure 5.2: Qualitative Approach to the Research Design Process	92
Figure 5.3: Summary of the Interview Analysis Steps	99
Figure 5.4: Summary of the Quantitative Research Design Process	100
Figure 5.5: Summary of the Research Methodology	112
Figure 6.1: Refined Conceptual Framework.....	124
Figure 7.1: Path Coefficients (p) and R ² values.....	138
Figure 7.2: Mediation Effect.....	142

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

AGFI	Adjusted Goodness-of-Fit Index
AMOS	Analysis of Moment Structure
AVE	Average Variance Extracted
CB-SEM	Covariance Based Structural Equation Modelling
CFI	Comparative Fit Index
EDI	Electronic Data Interchange
ERP	Enterprise Resource Planning
GFI	Goodness-of-Fit Index
IDT	Innovation Diffusion Theory
IS	Information System
ISS	Information System Success
NFI	Normed Fit Index
PLS	Partial Least Square
RMSEA	Root Mean Square Error of Approximation
SPSS	Statistical Packages for Social Science
TOE	Technology-Organisation-Environment
WWW	World Wide Web

STATEMENT OF DECLARATION AND PUBLICATIONS FROM THESIS

This thesis contains no material which has been accepted for the award of a degree, masters or PhD in any other university. To the best of my knowledge, this thesis also contains no material published previously by another person except that which has been properly cited in the text of the thesis.

Some of the material discussed in the thesis has already been published in the following publications:

Mohd Sharif, M. H., Troshani, I., & Davidson, R. (2015). Public Sector Adoption of Social Media, *Journal of Computer Information Systems*, 55(4), 53-61.

Mohd Sharif, M. H., Troshani, I., & Davidson, R. (in press/2016). Determinants of Social Media Impact in Local Government, *Journal of Organizational and End User Computing*.

Mohd Sharif, M. H., Troshani, I., & Davidson, R. (2014). Adoption of Social Media Services: The Case of Local Government, In S. Zhaohao & J. Yearwood (Eds.), *Handbook of Research on Demand-Driven Web Services: Theory, Technologies, and Applications*, Pennsylvania: IGI Global, (pp. 287-303).

Mohd Sharif, M. H., Troshani, I., & Davidson, R. (2013). *Exploring Social Media Adoption in Australian Local Government Organisations*, Paper presented at CONF-IRM 2013, Natal, Brazil.

Evidence of the above publications (abstracts) is provided in Appendix A and Appendix B.

Mohd Hisham Mohd Sharif
4 September 2015

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

First of all, I am grateful to my Lord, Allah, the most gracious, the most merciful, for everything that he gave me throughout the 5 year journey.

My best appreciation goes to the two most important people that have always been there for me throughout the years when I needed them, to guide me and to shed light whenever I was in the dark. To both my brilliant, special and effortless supervisors, Dr Indrit Troshani and Dr Robyn Davidson, my acknowledgement to both of you is beyond words.

I also want to extend my gratitude to the people working in local government all over Australia, Karen Purser, Segat Silvana, Jenni Bartlet, Samantha Seymour and many others for helping with the interviews and completing the survey.

I would also like to thank Dr Sally Rao for her insightful comments and Rosemarie Fonseca for checking the survey content. Not to forget, the Postgraduate Coordinator, Head of School, staff at the Graduate Centre, the Business School administration staff and my lovely and supportive PhD colleagues (Chris Matthews, Zubair, Hande Akman, Rebecca Dolan, Ervin Sim, Dao Chao, Li Ming and Karen) for their support and encouragement over the past four years.

Finally, I would like to dedicate all my work to my beloved Mom and Dad, my lovely super-wife Hasifah and my four little angels, Humaira, Hanan, Fatimah and Furqan. Surely, no words can describe my appreciation for the support that has been given to me throughout this time.

Thank you everyone.

Mohd Hisham Mohd Sharif