Social Media Adoption and Impact in Australian Local Government

by

Mohd Hisham Bin Sharif

Major Thesis submitted to the
Business School, University of Adelaide
As part of the requirements for the degree of
DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

Date of Submission: 4/12/2015
ABSTRACT

Individual and organisational use of social media is rapidly growing. Social media applications offer substantial opportunities for local government organisations to develop better community engagement, save costs and improve service delivery. However, limited attention has been directed in the current information systems literature towards understanding the adoption and impact of social media in the public sector, particularly in local government organisations. Building on DePietro, Wiarda and Fleischer’s (1990) technology-organisation-environment framework (TOE) and DeLone and McLean’s Information System Success (ISS) frameworks, a model of social media adoption and impact is developed and tested. This research explored qualitative evidence sourced from in-depth interviews with officers from 24 local government organisations and with a survey involving 173 local government organisations across Australia. The survey responses were analysed using the partial least squares (PLS) technique. The results suggest that compatibility, formalisation, bandwagon pressure and community demand are the important predictors of social media application adoption. An understanding of the social media application adoption factors provides a foundation for future social media application research as well as valuable guidance to organisations seeking to effectively use social media applications to benefit their organisation. The findings can be useful to many stakeholders, including adoption champions, marketing and communication officers in local government organisations. This study contributes to existing theory by improving current understanding of drivers of social media impact in local government organisations.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract ................................................................................................................................. i
Table of Contents .................................................................................................................. ii
List of Tables .......................................................................................................................... viii
List of Figures ...................................................................................................................... ix
List of Abbreviations ........................................................................................................... x
Statement of Declaration and Publications from Thesis .................................................... xi
Acknowledgement ............................................................................................................... xii
Chapter 1 – Introduction ..................................................................................................... 1
  1.1 Overview ...................................................................................................................... 1
  1.2 Introduction .................................................................................................................. 1
  1.3 Social Media Overview ............................................................................................... 3
  1.4 Social Media and Public Sector Organisations ........................................................... 4
  1.5 Research Motivation ................................................................................................... 5
  1.6 Research Questions ..................................................................................................... 10
  1.7 Research Objectives ................................................................................................... 11
  1.8 Overview of the Research Methods ............................................................................ 12
  1.9 Research Contributions ............................................................................................. 13
    1.9.1 Theoretical Contributions ................................................................................. 13
    1.9.2 Managerial Contributions ............................................................................... 14
  1.10 Thesis Outline .......................................................................................................... 14
  1.11 Chapter Summary ..................................................................................................... 18
Chapter 2 – Literature Examination ................................................................................... 19
  2.1 Overview ..................................................................................................................... 19
  2.2 The History of Social Media ...................................................................................... 20
  2.3 Definition of Social Media ......................................................................................... 21
  2.4 Web 1.0 and Web 2.0 ................................................................................................. 22
  2.5 Classification of Social Media Applications ................................................................ 24
  2.6 Social Media Research in Private Sector Organisations ......................................... 27
  2.7 Factors Influencing Social Media Adoption in Private Organisations ..................... 29
  2.8 Social Media Research in Public Sector Organisations ......................................... 31
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.2.2.1</td>
<td>Top Management Drive</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.2.2</td>
<td>Social Media Policy</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.3</td>
<td>Environmental Context</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.3.1</td>
<td>Bandwagon Pressure</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.4</td>
<td>Social Media Impact</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>Chapter Summary</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>Overview</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>Working Definitions</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>Relationships between Research Questions, Objectives and Methods</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>Research Philosophy</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4.1</td>
<td>Interpretivist Philosophy</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4.2</td>
<td>Positivist Philosophy</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4.3</td>
<td>Determining Research Philosophy</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>Research Approach</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5.1</td>
<td>Qualitative Approach</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5.1.1</td>
<td>Justifications for the Use of the Qualitative Approach</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5.1.2</td>
<td>Using Literature Reviews</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5.1.3</td>
<td>Semi Structured In-depth Interviews</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5.2</td>
<td>Quantitative Approach</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5.2.1</td>
<td>Questionnaire Survey</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5.3</td>
<td>Mixed-Method Approach</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5.3.1</td>
<td>Justification for the Use of a Mixed-Method Approach</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>Qualitative Approach Research Design</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6.1</td>
<td>Conducting the Literature Review</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6.2</td>
<td>Interview Question Development</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6.3</td>
<td>Validation of Interview Questions</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6.4</td>
<td>Administration of the Interviews</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6.5</td>
<td>Sampling Technique</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6.6</td>
<td>Interviewee Selection</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6.7</td>
<td>Interview Process</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5.6.8 Reliability and Validity of the Interviews ................................................................. 97
5.6.9 Interview Analysis ................................................................................................. 98
5.7 Quantitative Approach Research Design ................................................................... 99
  5.7.1 Instrument Development ..................................................................................... 100
  5.7.2 Dependent Variables ......................................................................................... 100
    5.7.2.1 Adoption ........................................................................................................ 100
    5.7.2.2 Social Media Impact ...................................................................................... 101
  5.7.3 Independent Variables ....................................................................................... 102
    5.7.3.1 Perceived Benefits ....................................................................................... 102
    5.7.3.2 Perceived Security ....................................................................................... 103
    5.7.3.3 Compatibility .............................................................................................. 103
    5.7.3.4 Social Media Policy ..................................................................................... 104
    5.7.3.5 Top Management Drive .............................................................................. 104
    5.7.3.6 Degree of Formalisation .............................................................................. 104
    5.7.3.7 Community Demand .................................................................................... 105
    5.7.3.8 Bandwagon Pressure and Faddishness ......................................................... 105
  5.7.4 Validation of Questionnaire Items ....................................................................... 105
  5.7.5 Survey Administration ....................................................................................... 107
  5.7.6 Data Analysis Technique .................................................................................... 109
    5.7.6.1 Model Assessment ....................................................................................... 109
    5.7.6.2 PLS-SEM ..................................................................................................... 110
  5.8 Chapter Summary ................................................................................................... 111

Chapter 6 - Qualitative Findings and Discussion .......................................................... 113
  6.1 Overview .............................................................................................................. 113
  6.2 Technological Context .......................................................................................... 113
    6.2.1 Perceived Benefits ......................................................................................... 114
    6.2.2 Perceived Risk .............................................................................................. 115
    6.2.3 Compatibility ............................................................................................... 116
  6.3 Organisational Context ........................................................................................ 116
    6.3.1 Social Media Policy ....................................................................................... 117
    6.3.2 Degree of Formalisation .............................................................................. 117
6.3.3 Top Management Drive ................................................................. 118
6.4 Environmental Context .................................................................. 119
  6.4.1 Bandwagon Pressure ................................................................. 119
  6.4.2 Faddishness .............................................................................. 120
  6.4.3 Community Demand ................................................................. 121
6.5 Social Media Impact .................................................................... 122
6.6 Hypotheses Development ............................................................. 123
6.7 Refined Conceptual Framework .................................................... 123
6.8 Chapter Summary ......................................................................... 124

Chapter 7 – Quantitative Findings ..................................................... 126
7.1 Overview ....................................................................................... 126
7.2 Data Preparation and Missing Value Treatment ............................ 127
7.3 Descriptive Data Analysis .............................................................. 128
7.4 Normality Test .............................................................................. 130
7.5 Measurement Model Evaluation ................................................... 131
  7.5.1 Internal Consistency Reliability ................................................. 131
  7.5.2 Item Validity ............................................................................ 132
  7.5.3 Collinearity Assessment ............................................................. 134
  7.5.4 Model Fit ................................................................................ 135
  7.5.5 Path Coefficient Analysis/Hypothesis Testing ......................... 137
  7.5.6 Coefficient of Determination .................................................. 140
  7.5.7 $f^2$ Effect Size ........................................................................ 141
  7.5.8 Blindfolding and Predictive Relevance $Q^2$ ............................. 141
  7.5.9 Mediation Effect Analysis ....................................................... 142

Chapter 8 – Discussion ...................................................................... 146
8.1 Overview ....................................................................................... 146
8.2 Technological Context ................................................................ 146
8.3 Organisational Context ............................................................... 148
8.4 Environmental Context ............................................................... 150
8.5 Chapter Summary ........................................................................ 152
LIST OF TABLES

Table 1.1: Research Questions and Objectives ................................................................. 12
Table 2.1: Web 1.0 and Web 2.0 ...................................................................................... 24
Table 2.2: Social Media Categories ................................................................................... 27
Table 2.3: Summary of Factors Driving Adoption in Private Sector .................................. 30
Table 2.4: Benefits of Social Media Applications to Public Sector Organisations ............... 32
Table 2.5: Summary of Social Media Studies in Public Sector Organisations ..................... 34
Table 2.6: Differences between Private and Public Sector Organisations ......................... 36
Table 3.1: Technology Adoption Research Using the TOE Framework ............................... 55
Table 3.2: Summary of Social Media Studies Using the TOE Framework ............................ 57
Table 3.3: IS Impact Variables .......................................................................................... 63
Table 3.4: Findings from ISS Studies .................................................................................. 64
Table 3.5: Strength and Weaknesses of Theories .............................................................. 67
Table 4.1: Key Antecedents for Conceptual Framework ...................................................... 69
Table 5.1: Research Questions and Objectives .................................................................. 81
Table 5.2: Relationships between Research Questions, Objectives and Philosophies ........ 85
Table 5.3: Relationships between Research Questions, Objectives, Philosophies and Approach 92
Table 5.4: List of Interviewees ......................................................................................... 96
Table 6.1: Hypotheses ....................................................................................................... 123
Table 7.1: Local Government Organisations Based on State ............................................. 129
Table 7.2: Local Government Organisations Based on Type ............................................ 129
Table 7.3: Social Media Applications Used ........................................................................ 130
Table 7.4: Skewness and Kurtosis Values ......................................................................... 131
Table 7.5: VIF Values for Independent Variables in the Model .......................................... 135
Table 7.6: Measurement of Model Fit ................................................................................ 136
Table 7.7: Hypotheses Test Results ................................................................................... 137
Table 7.8: Values of $f^2$ ................................................................................................. 141
Table 7.9: Direct Effect, p- and t-Value of Perceived Benefits and Compatibility ............... 144
Table 7.10: Indirect Effect, t and p Value of Perceived Benefits and Compatibility ............ 144
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1.1: Summary of Chapters ........................................................................................................ 17
Figure 2.1: Social Media Applications ................................................................................................. 25
Figure 3.1: Technological Innovation Adoption Contexts ................................................................. 52
Figure 3.2: DeLone and McLean’s ISS Framework ............................................................................ 61
Figure 3.3: Updated DeLone and McLean’s ISS framework ............................................................... 62
Figure 3.4: Combined TOE and ISS Framework ................................................................................ 66
Figure 4.1: Conceptual Framework of Social Media Adoption and Impact ....................................... 78
Figure 5.1: Research Methodology .................................................................................................... 81
Figure 5.2: Qualitative Approach to the Research Design Process ............................................... 92
Figure 5.3: Summary of the Interview Analysis Steps ....................................................................... 99
Figure 5.4: Summary of the Quantitative Research Design Process .............................................. 100
Figure 5.5: Summary of the Research Methodology ........................................................................ 112
Figure 6.1: Refined Conceptual Framework ..................................................................................... 124
Figure 7.1: Path Coefficients (p) and R² values .............................................................................. 138
Figure 7.2: Mediation Effect .............................................................................................................. 142
### LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AGFI</td>
<td>Adjusted Goodness-of-Fit Index</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AMOS</td>
<td>Analysis of Moment Structure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AVE</td>
<td>Average Variance Extracted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CB-SEM</td>
<td>Covariance Based Structural Equation Modelling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CFI</td>
<td>Comparative Fit Index</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EDI</td>
<td>Electronic Data Interchange</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ERP</td>
<td>Enterprise Resource Planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GFI</td>
<td>Goodness-of-Fit Index</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IDT</td>
<td>Innovation Diffusion Theory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IS</td>
<td>Information System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ISS</td>
<td>Information System Success</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NFI</td>
<td>Normed Fit Index</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PLS</td>
<td>Partial Least Square</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RMSEA</td>
<td>Root Mean Square Error of Approximation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SPSS</td>
<td>Statistical Packages for Social Science</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOE</td>
<td>Technology-Organisation-Environment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WWW</td>
<td>World Wide Web</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
STATEMENT OF DECLARATION AND PUBLICATIONS FROM THESIS

This thesis contains no material which has been accepted for the award of a degree, masters or PhD in any other university. To the best of my knowledge, this thesis also contains no material published previously by another person except that which has been properly cited in the text of the thesis.

Some of the material discussed in the thesis has already been published in the following publications:


Evidence of the above publications (abstracts) is provided in Appendix A and Appendix B.

______________________________
Mohd Hisham Mohd Sharif
4 September 2015
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

First of all, I am grateful to my Lord, Allah, the most gracious, the most merciful, for everything that he gave me throughout the 5 year journey.

My best appreciation goes to the two most important people that have always been there for me throughout the years when I needed them, to guide me and to shed light whenever I was in the dark. To both my brilliant, special and effortless supervisors, Dr Indrit Troshani and Dr Robyn Davidson, my acknowledgement to both of you is beyond words.

I also want to extend my gratitude to the people working in local government all over Australia, Karen Purser, Segat Silvana, Jenni Bartlet, Samantha Seymour and many others for helping with the interviews and completing the survey.

I would also like to thank Dr Sally Rao for her insightful comments and Rosemarie Fonseka for checking the survey content. Not to forget, the Postgraduate Coordinator, Head of School, staff at the Graduate Centre, the Business School administration staff and my lovely and supportive PhD colleagues (Chris Matthews, Zubair, Hande Akman, Rebecca Dolan, Ervin Sim, Dao Chao, Li Ming and Karen) for their support and encouragement over the past four years.

Finally, I would like to dedicate all my work to my beloved Mom and Dad, my lovely super-wife Hasifah and my four little angels, Humaira, Hanan, Fatimah and Furqan. Surely, no words can describe my appreciation for the support that has been given to me throughout this time.

Thank you everyone.

Mohd Hisham Mohd Sharif