

Human identification at a distance: The impact of image quality and image restoration techniques on human face matching performance

Joseph Andrew Calleja

*This thesis is submitted in partial fulfilment
of the Honours degree of Bachelor of Psychology*

School of Psychology
The University of Adelaide
October 2016

Table of Contents

List of Tables	v
Abstract	vi
Declaration	vii
Acknowledgements	viii
CHAPTER 1 – Introduction	1
1.1 Rationale	1
1.2 Surveillance and Low Image Quality	1
1.3 Face Matching with Low Quality Target Images	3
1.4 Image Restoration Techniques and Face Matching with Restored Images	4
1.5 Face Matching with High Quality Target Images	5
1.6 Expert Facial Reviewers, Individual Differences, and Operational Settings	7
1.7 Facial Recognition Algorithm Performance	8
1.8 Image Restoration and Facial Recognition Algorithm Performance	10
1.9 The Present Study	11
CHAPTER 2 – Method	12
2.1 Participants	12
2.2 Design	12
2.3 Materials	13
2.3.1 Image source	13
2.3.1.1 Passport-quality images	14
2.3.1.2 Unrestored images	14
2.3.1.3 Restored images	14
2.4 Procedure	15
2.4.1 Image selection	15
2.4.1.1 Exemplar image selection	15
2.4.1.2 Mated pair formation	15
2.4.1.3 Non-mated pair formation	15
2.4.1.4 Addressing duplicates	16
2.4.1.5 Final image preparation	17
2.4.2 Human trial	17

CHAPTER 3 – Results	19
3.1 Data Screening, Assumptions, and Test Selection.....	19
3.2 Overall Performance	19
3.2.1 Accuracy	20
3.2.2 Confidence	20
3.2.3 Response latency.....	21
3.3 Performance on Mated and Non-Mated Pairs.....	21
3.3.1 Hit and correct rejection.....	21
3.3.1.1 Hit	22
3.3.1.2 Correct rejection.....	22
3.3.2 Confidence and response latency.....	23
3.3.2.1 Confidence	25
3.3.2.2 Response latency.....	25
CHAPTER 4 – Discussion.....	27
4.1 Face Matching with Passport-Quality Target Images.....	27
4.1.1 Contradictions with previous literature and the implications	28
4.2 Face Matching with Restored and Unrestored Target Images.....	28
4.2.1 Contradictions with previous literature and the implications	29
4.2.2 Reasoning the inferiority of image restoration	29
4.2.2.1 The restricted number of restored images.....	29
4.2.2.2 Distorting spatial frequencies	30
4.3 Influential Factors	31
4.3.1 The restricted number of impostor identities	31
4.3.2 Using a facial recognition algorithm for impostor selection	32
4.3.3 The own-race bias.....	33
4.4 Strengths	34
4.5 Limitations	34
4.6 Conclusion	35
References.....	37
Appendices.....	46
Appendix A. Examples of Mated Pairs in Each Group	46
Appendix B. Examples of Non-Mated Pairs in Each Group	47
Appendix C. Participant Information Sheet.....	48

Appendix D. Consent Form	50
Appendix E. Instruction Screen Before Practice Trials	51
Appendix F. Practice Trials	52
Appendix G. The Screen Before Experimental Trials	53
Appendix H. Testing Normality with Shapiro-Wilk Tests	54

List of Tables

Table 1. Descriptive Statistics for Accuracy, Confidence, and Response Latency by Group	20
Table 2. Descriptive Statistics for Signal Detection Measures by Group.....	22
Table 3. Descriptive Statistics for Accuracy, Confidence, and Response Latency on Mated and Non-Mated Pairs by Group	24

Abstract

The suitability of surveillance for facial identification has been questioned given the low quality of such imagery often captured at a distance. The Defence Science and Technology (DST) Group have developed the Zephyrus normalised cross-correlation (NCC) restoration technique to enhance long-range images, and demonstrated an improvement in facial recognition (FR) algorithm performance. However, whether this technique could improve human face matching performance was not known. This study aimed to understand the impact of image quality and the Zephyrus NCC image restoration technique on human face matching performance during the conduct of a simultaneous one-to-one face matching task. Participants ($N = 50$) from the University of Adelaide and the general public examined 120 facial image pairs in a repeated measures design, and were asked if they were of the same or different people. The quality of one image (the target image) varied in each pair, and was either a passport-quality, restored surveillance, or an unrestored surveillance image. The other image (the exemplar image) was always of passport-quality. Face matching decisions with passport-quality target images were the fastest, most accurate, and most confident, overall. However, decisions with restored surveillance target images were the slowest, least accurate, and least confident, overall. This may have been due to the restricted number of restored images accessible, and/or the distortion of spatial frequencies necessary to support facial identification. Future research could implement an objective image quality measure, assess the performance of many commercial FR algorithms alongside human performance, and explore various restoration techniques for long-range imagery.

Declaration

This thesis contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any University, and to the best of my knowledge, contains no materials previously published except where due reference is made. I give consent to this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University Library, being available for loan and photocopying.

Joseph Andrew Calleja

October, 2016

Acknowledgements

Firstly, I would like to thank my internal supervisor Dr Carolyn Semmler at the University of Adelaide for her guidance and assistance throughout the year. I appreciate your reassurance, the short-notice meetings you were able to accommodate, and always keeping me in the right direction. I would also like to extend a very big thank you to my external supervisor Dr Rebecca Heyer at DST Group. I cannot thank you enough for your endless help, the constructive responses to my countless emails, and the time and effort you invested in this project. I would also like to thank Dr Veneta MacLeod at DST Group for her assistance and feedback throughout this year.

I would also like to extend a big thank you to my partner Bek. I cannot describe how much I appreciate your unconditional support, positivity, and reassurance throughout even the most stressful of times. I would not have been able to get through this year without you. I would also like to thank my parents Emanuel and Catherine, and my brother David for their patience and support while I have been invested in this project. Finally, I would like to thank my friends, both in-and-outside of university, with a special mention to the boys from my graduating class at Blackfriars Priory School for making this year easier to manage.