Orchestral Education Programmes:
A Study of Australian and British Models
by
Emily Kate Dollman

Submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy

October 2015
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract ........................................................................................................................................ iii
Declaration ...................................................................................................................................... iv
Acknowledgments ......................................................................................................................... v

Introduction ................................................................................................................................... 1

Literature Review ........................................................................................................................... 26

**Part One: Origins and Development of Orchestral Education Programming** ........ 41

Chapter One: Early orchestral education work in Australia ....................................................... 42
Chapter Two: The development of the SSO Education Department ........................................... 52
Chapter Three: The path to divestment: establishing independence ......................................... 59
Chapter Four: Developments in the United Kingdom ................................................................. 65
Chapter Five: Development of LSO Discovery ........................................................................... 75
Chapter Six: The importance of creativity ................................................................................... 83
Chapter Seven: The role of the Association of British Orchestras ............................................ 100
Chapter Eight: The ‘Music Hub’ Model ....................................................................................... 108
Chapter Nine: The implications for tertiary classical music training ........................................ 121
Chapter Ten: The influence of El Sistema ................................................................................... 143

**Part Two: Current Case Studies in Orchestral Education Programming** .................. 160

Chapter Eleven: Case Studies of British Orchestras ................................................................. 161
  11.1 The London Symphony Orchestra ...................................................................................... 161
  11.2 The Hallé Orchestra .............................................................................................................. 173
11.3 BBC Music and Learning: ‘Ten Pieces’ ................................................................. 186
11.4 The London Philharmonic Orchestra .................................................................. 190

Chapter Twelve: Case Studies of Australian Orchestras ........................................... 200
12.1 Sydney Symphony Orchestra ................................................................................. 200
12.2 Melbourne Symphony Orchestra .......................................................................... 220
12.3 Adelaide Symphony Orchestra ............................................................................. 243
12.4 Tasmanian Symphony Orchestra ......................................................................... 250
12.5 Queensland Symphony Orchestra ......................................................................... 256
12.6 West Australian Symphony Orchestra ................................................................. 267

Part Three: Key Findings and Future Development ..................................................... 277
Chapter Thirteen: Key Findings ................................................................................... 278
Chapter Fourteen: The potential impact of the new Australian National Curriculum 287
Chapter Fifteen: The role of animateurs .................................................................... 295
Chapter Sixteen: Recognition of benefits for orchestral musicians ......................... 301
Chapter Seventeen: Importance of participatory education programmes ............... 307
Chapter Eighteen: Development of digital and online initiatives ......................... 313
Chapter Nineteen: The placement of Education Departments within the orchestra... 320
Chapter Twenty: Recommendations for future orchestral education programming ... 327
Conclusion .................................................................................................................. 341
List of Sources ............................................................................................................ 348
Appendix A ................................................................................................................... 381
Appendix B ................................................................................................................... 387
Abstract

This doctoral thesis, submitted to the University of Adelaide, examines the education programmes of symphony orchestras in Australia and the United Kingdom, both past and present. Through this detailed exploration the thesis considers directions for future development.

In Australia, orchestras increasingly look to their education departments to both foster the next generation of musicians and to maintain social relevance. However, there is a mismatch between the evident importance of such work and the relative lack of research in the field. The research presented here aims to fill this gap by presenting the first comprehensive overview of current practice and historical development in the field.

At the time of writing orchestral education programmes are in a period of growth in Australia. Several Australian orchestras have made connections with British specialists, in acknowledgment that the United Kingdom is a world leader in participatory, creative orchestral education programming. The thesis analyses the reasons behind the United Kingdom’s strength in this area, giving particular attention to the development of the creative music workshop format.

Other key topics in the thesis include: the implications of the growth of orchestral education work for classical music training at the tertiary level; the importance of partnership between arts and education organisations and the international impact of the Venezuelan El Sistema upon music education.

New primary source materials have been generated in the form of interviews with leading figures in the field, including Managing Directors and Education Directors of orchestras in both Britain and Australia. The detailed insight gained from these interviews highlights current best practice in the field and reveals possibilities for further growth. The conclusion of this thesis offers a blueprint for future orchestral education programming.
Declaration

I certify that this work contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no written material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text. In addition, I certify that no part of this work will, in the future, be used in a submission in my name, for any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution without the prior approval of the University of Adelaide.

I give consent to this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University Library and the Elder Music Library, being made available for loan and photocopying, subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.

I also give permission for the digital version of my thesis to be made available on the web, via the University’s digital research repository, the Library catalogue, and also through web search engines, unless permission has been granted by the University to restrict access for a period of time.

Emily Dollman

Date: 12 October, 2015
Acknowledgments

Firstly I would like to thank the twenty-eight interviewees, leaders in the orchestral education field in Australia and the United Kingdom, who have shared with me their invaluable personal insights into their profession. This project was made possible through their generosity of time and spirit.

Many thanks also to my Principal Supervisor, Professor Charles Bodman Rae, who provided unwavering support and advice through the preparation of this thesis; and my co-supervisors, Professor Graeme Koehne and Dr. Jennifer Rosevear for their valuable assistance.

My research was made possible by the support provided to me by my family. In particular I must thank my husband, Luke Dollman, for his advice and support in every aspect of my life. As a conductor who has directed many of the orchestras discussed in the thesis, he was able to give a unique perspective on my field of research. I also owe a debt of gratitude to my parents for their life-long guidance and support and to my parents-in-law for their encouragement and assistance.

My children, and the music students with whom I have worked over the past eighteen years, are in many ways the inspiration for this research. They have provided me with a personal insight into the value of orchestral music for the next generation, and the importance of ensuring that this wonderful art form is accessible by all.

This thesis is dedicated in loving memory to my grandmother, Dr. Winifred Lily Ward.
Introduction

The education and community engagement programmes of symphony orchestras have developed into a crucial counterpoint to main-stage performances. Once operating on the periphery of orchestral activity, education departments are now acknowledged as being central to the future viability of symphony orchestras. They seek to deepen and broaden an orchestra’s relevance with its community and to encourage more people to make a personal connection with classical music. Over the past two decades orchestral education departments have developed an increasingly diverse array of activities. Initially focused on school-aged students, they now seek to connect with people of all ages, from pre-schoolers to adults, through programmes that support active music making and informed listening.

Orchestral education activities can be viewed in three main areas, each with an important role to play. Firstly, education programmes for school students aim to help them develop a positive connection with classical music and to support their general music education. Secondly, training programmes are provided to the emerging generation of orchestral musicians and composers to help their transition into the profession. Thirdly, community based activities aim to establish the orchestra’s relevance in society and to support life long engagement with the arts. Efforts are made to share orchestral resources as widely as possible, particularly with sectors of society previously under-represented in the arts. Orchestral education activities have brought musicians off the concert hall stage: they can now be found in venues as disparate as schools, hospitals, prisons, nursing homes, art galleries, museums, public libraries, and even at train stations.
Despite the evident importance of such programmes and the lofty goals placed upon their outcomes, there is at present a paucity of independent studies undertaken on this field of work. No major studies have been made of the education work carried out by Australian orchestras and only limited research on that of British orchestras. This imbalance is addressed through the thesis, via a thorough investigation of the growth of the orchestral education field, an analysis of its aims and ambitions, detailed case studies of present activities and a discussion of points for potential future development. The study focuses on the education and community engagement programmes offered by each of the six State Symphony Orchestras of Australia and compares these with similar programmes of selected leading British orchestras.

- **Aims**

The study aims to analyse the development and current practice of orchestral education programming in Australia and the United Kingdom, in order to establish a model of best practice in this dynamic field. The decision to focus on these two particular countries was influenced by two factors. Firstly, there is a personal aspect to this research. The author has experience working as a professional orchestral violinist and music educator in both Australia and the United Kingdom and has therefore developed an understanding and insight into the links between music education and orchestral education programmes in both countries. In particular, whilst teaching violin through a London music service, several of my students participated in the London Symphony Orchestra’s education programme and I thus gained a first hand impression of the inspiration that such a programme can provide to students at a pivotal stage of learning and development.
The second motivation for this research topic is the realisation that Australian orchestral education departments are currently in a significant period of growth. At the time of writing Australian orchestras are increasingly seeking to develop their education and outreach programmes into more participatory and creative models. To assist them in these efforts, several Australian orchestras have established links with British experts in this field, in acknowledgement that the United Kingdom is a world leader in participatory, creative, orchestral education programming. While each Australian symphony orchestra already has an established education department, the premise of the thesis is that a cross-fertilisation between an Australian and British approach will provide the best pathway to future development in education and community programming.

• **Research Questions**

In order to structure the process of the study and to effectively analyse the information obtained, the following research questions were developed:

1. How did orchestral education programmes develop in the United Kingdom and Australia?

2. How did any differences between a British and Australian approach to orchestral education programmes develop historically and what factors were at play?

3. What are the key differences in current practice in orchestral education programmes in Australia and the United Kingdom?

4. What are the key factors influencing the development and operation of orchestral education programmes in Australia and the United Kingdom?
5. a) What are the aims stated by orchestras for their education programmes?

b) How do orchestras assess whether these aims are realised, including both long-term outcomes and short-term impact?

6. a) How do orchestras perceive the role in society for their education programmes?

b) How has this perception changed historically?

7. What are the implications for the tertiary training of orchestral musicians?

8. To what extent should Australian orchestral education planners adopt methods used by their British colleagues?

The questions listed above helped to guide the research process from its initial period of inquiry and information gathering, through a period of personal observation and interviews with leading personnel, and ultimately provided the basis for reflection upon key findings and points for future development. The research questions and aims have remained largely unchanged through the course of research.

• **Methodology**

The material presented in this thesis is the result of three stages of research, each of which contributed to an overall level of understanding of the topic. Firstly, key relevant existing materials in the form of books, reports, theses, lecture transcripts, promotional material and journal articles were collated and analysed. This literature provided an overview and understanding of the development and current practice of orchestral education programmes in Australia and the United Kingdom. To establish the context for this period of development relevant literature on related topics such as
classroom music pedagogy, government policy, childhood cognitive development, El Sistema, music therapy and tertiary music training was also consulted.

Analysis of this literature provided the basis for the second stage of the research process, in which new primary source material was generated in the form of detailed first-person interviews with leaders in the field. Twenty-eight key personnel were interviewed by the author both Australia and the United Kingdom. Interviews in person with experts in the field in the United Kingdom were made possible with the assistance of a University Travelling Scholarship in 2011.\(^1\) Interviews were conducted at several key points of the research, predominantly in 2011 and 2015. The interviews conducted in 2011 helped to provide a framework of understanding, supplemented by interviews over the following three years. A significant number of interviews were subsequently made during 2015, during the closing stages of research. These interviews were made to ensure that the information included in the thesis was as relevant as possible, and allowed the thesis to acknowledge changes that had occurred over the period of research.

Interviewees were chosen carefully to provide maximum insight into best practice in the field of Orchestral Education. Participants in the project included the Orchestra Education Managers, both past and present, of every orchestra discussed in the thesis. General and Artistic Orchestra Managers of several of these orchestras were interviewed in order to gain insight into their role in guiding and directing Education and Community Engagement activities at their orchestras. Leading music educators and advocates were also interviewed in order to help to ascertain the impact of orchestral

\(^1\) All interviews were conducted with approval by the University of Adelaide Human Research Ethics
education activities upon the broader music education sphere. (Please see the List of Sources for a full list of interviewees).

While interviews were tailored on a case-by-case basis, they all contained the same central questions as a starting point. These questions predominantly focused on the principal aims for orchestral education programming: the rationale for programming choices; key influences; approaches to evaluation; and issues encountered. (For further information regarding the core questions please see Appendix B). In accordance with the University of Adelaide Human Research Ethics Committee protocol, all interviewees were formally contacted to request their participation in the project, with a summary of the topic and aims of the project. Permission was requested to include direct quotations arising from the interviews in the thesis, with the proviso that the interviewee would be given all quotations to approve and/or amend before inclusion. All interviewees gave their full consent to be included in the project, and none requested anonymity.

Having gained consent in writing from the interviewees, the interviews were scheduled, each generally lasting for one hour. The interviews were recorded and transcribed in full, with direct quotations selected to include in the text of the thesis, with the approval of the participant. The information gained through the interview process provides the basis for much of the material presented in the thesis, in particular the Case Studies presented in Part Two. Where possible, Orchestral Education Programmes have also been attended by the author in order to witness first hand the interaction between orchestras and participants.

The final stage of research involved further research on points of interest arising from the interview process. Early in the research process the decision was made to
analyse the new primary source material created through the interview transcripts through a qualitative, rather than quantitative, method. It was apparent that it would not be beneficial to translate the information contained in the interview transcripts into statistical, numerical data. However, the information gained through the interviews underpins the thesis as a whole, and the interviews were analysed for points of consensus in order to look for current, industry-wide patterns. In interview several instances of influence were noted, in which the motivation for new programming initiatives became apparent. Equally, points of difference in the approaches taken at different organisations were also noted and researched. This final stage of reflection and analysis provided the basis for Part Three of the thesis.

• Thesis Overview

The thesis is divided into three main parts, entitled Part One: Origins and Development of Orchestral Education Programming, Part Two: Current Orchestra Education Programmes and Part Three: Key Findings and Points for Future Development.

Part One: Origins and Development of Orchestral Education Programming, analyses the historical development of education departments in Australia and the United Kingdom. This section of the thesis analyses shifts in orchestral education aims and practice, as well as investigating the factors impacting these developments. This section is presented in ten chapters as follows:

Chapter 1. Early orchestral education work in Australia
Chapter 2. The development of the Sydney Symphony Orchestra Education Department

Chapter 3. The path to divestment: establishing independence

Chapter 4. Developments in the United Kingdom

Chapter 5. Development of LSO Discovery

Chapter 6. The importance of creativity

Chapter 7. The role of the Association of British Orchestras

Chapter 8. The ‘Music Hub’ model

Chapter 9. The implications for tertiary classical music training

Chapter 10. The influence of El Sistema

This section of the thesis identifies significant points of development in orchestral education in both countries and looks at the impact of leading individuals and organisations in the field. The difficulties encountered by these early ground-breakers are of as much interest as their successes, as they allow us to learn from past experience. The extent to which these early difficulties have subsequently been addressed and resolved was kept in mind throughout the research. Part One also looks at the impact of government policy and approaches to music education upon the development of orchestral education programming. Part One identifies examples of strong partnerships between orchestral education departments and other arts or education organisations. The UK Music Hub system is of international interest as a landmark national, government-funded approach towards creating such partnerships. The development of the Hub model, issues encountered through the early establishment period, and the potential for future similar international partnerships are explored in Chapter Eight. The impact of orchestral education programming upon the
skills required by orchestral musicians and, therefore, tertiary music training, is examined in detail in Chapter Nine. Chapter Ten looks at the international influence of Venezuela’s El Sistema, which has inspired several orchestras to develop programmes that merge music education with social reform.

Information gained from both research and first person interviews informs Part Two of the thesis: Current Case Studies in Orchestral Education Programming. Part Two is presented in two main Chapters as follows:

Chapter Eleven: British Case Studies
11.1 The London Symphony Orchestra
11.2 The Hallé Orchestra
11.3 BBC Music and Learning: ‘Ten Pieces’
11.4 The London Philharmonic Orchestra

Chapter Twelve: Australian Case Studies
12.1 Sydney Symphony Orchestra
12.2 Melbourne Symphony Orchestra
12.3 Adelaide Symphony Orchestra
12.4 Tasmanian Symphony Orchestra
12.5 Queensland Symphony Orchestra
12.6 West Australian Symphony Orchestra

Case studies of ten orchestral education programmes are provided in total, including those of all six Australian state symphony orchestras in order to provide a comprehensive picture of current Australian practice nationwide. The education departments of three British orchestras are discussed in detail: namely, the London Symphony Orchestra, the London Philharmonic Orchestra and the Hallé Orchestra. In
addition, the nationwide BBC initiative known as Ten Pieces, which involves a number of British orchestras, is also discussed.

The British case studies are selected on the basis of the innovation of their approach to education programming and their reputation internationally. It must be acknowledged that further programmes worthy of inclusion have been omitted for various reasons; primarily, the need to curtail the study to a realistic scope and to allow for a detailed, meaningful examination of the programmes selected. The education departments of other British orchestras are discussed in separate sections of the thesis where appropriate: for example the Philharmonia Orchestra in Chapter Eighteen, the London Sinfonietta and Scottish Chamber Orchestra in Chapter Six, the Aurora Orchestra in Chapter Eight and the Royal Liverpool Philharmonic Orchestra in Chapter Ten.

Part Three of the thesis is entitled: ‘Key Findings and Future Development,’ and contains eight chapters as follows:

Chapter 13. Key Findings

Chapter 14. The potential impact of the new Australian National Curriculum

Chapter 15. The role of animateurs

Chapter 16. Recognition of benefits for orchestral musicians

Chapter 17. The importance of participatory education programmes

Chapter 18. Development of digital and online initiatives

Chapter 19. The placement of Education Departments within the orchestra

Chapter 20. Recommendations for future orchestral education programming

Chapter Thirteen reflects upon and analyses the information gained in Parts One and Two; it also provides a summary of key conclusions drawn from examples of best
practice. Chapters Fourteen to Nineteen identify the primary factors influencing future orchestral education programming, looking now from a predominantly Australian perspective. The essential components for a successful and dynamic education department are presented, and a model for future practice is established. With these findings in mind, Chapter Twenty proposes a series of recommendations for future Australian orchestral education programming that address points for further development and build on current best practice.

• **Background and Context**

In order to understand the context in which orchestral education programming has developed in Australia and the United Kingdom, it is useful to first understand the general background and philosophies underpinning the work. From the 1920s to the 1970s school concerts were the sole focus of orchestral education activity; primarily passive affairs with a lecture concert format. The 1980s and 1990s saw a major period of growth in the industry, with orchestras appointing education officers and managers for the first time. While policy and funding were factors in this growth period, orchestras were also motivated by a desire to bolster music teaching in schools and to maintain their relevance in society.

Although orchestras have increasingly diversified their education projects, a key focal point has remained the desire to support school music education. This work is of crucial importance for several reasons. There is a growing body of evidence of the benefits of music education upon the cognitive and emotional development of
children. Landmark publications on the value of music education have recently been released in Australia, the US and the UK, including: Transforming Education through the Arts\(^2\) (Caldwell and Vaughan, 2012), Champions of Change\(^3\) (ed. Fiske, 1999) and The Power of Music\(^4\) (Hallam, 2015). Each of these reports analyse substantial quantitative data to demonstrate the importance of music and arts education.

However, research has also revealed a growing gap emerging in provision of music education in schools. In Australia, for example, a recent survey revealed that 63% of Australian primary schools have no classroom music and that in total only 37.26% of schools (both primary and secondary) do offer music.\(^5\) Orchestral education departments are increasingly involved in sector wide efforts to achieve a more equitable system of school music education.

Orchestral education programmes for school students also aim to establish a positive connection between children and their local symphony orchestra. It is important for children to experience classical music during their formative school years in order to establish a personal connection with the art-form. For many children, an orchestral education concert may be their first point of contact with classical music. Such a concert could also motivate students to start, or persist with, learning an instrument themselves. Maximum involvement in music at the grassroots level is


\(^{3}\) Edward B. Fiske (editor), Champions of Change: the impact of the arts on learning. Co-commissioned by the Washington DC Arts Education Partnership and the President’s Committee on the Arts and the Humanities, 1999.


essential for a healthy music eco-system as, while not all students will reach professional standards, an education in the arts has been shown to be a key indicator for life-long engagement with the arts.

This link is evident in Figure 1., which is based on data collected from the Surveys of Public Participation in the Arts (SPPA), conducted for the National Endowment for the Arts in the United States between 1982 and 2008. The responses from these Surveys were subsequently analysed in the 2011 Report *Arts Education in America: What the decline means for arts participation*. A key finding of this report was that education in the arts is the strongest contributing factor to attending arts events as an adult, as demonstrated in the graphs below:

Figure 1.6

---

Interestingly, the data demonstrate that adult arts education is a stronger motivator towards arts involvement than childhood arts education. While childhood arts education is, of course, important, this finding emphasises the importance of orchestral education programmes for adults. This area has been increasingly explored over the past decade by symphony orchestras in both Australia and Britain.

At the time of writing programmes provide opportunities for a wide age range, linking with a diverse array of community organisations and facilities. These can include schools, universities, local corporations, hospitals, prisons, nursing homes, housing estates, pre-schools and even shopping centres. This development is demonstrated in changes to the title ‘Education Department.’ In recent years, many orchestras have added ‘Community Engagement,’ ‘Community Outreach,’ or ‘Learning and Participation,’ to the Department title, in recognition of the shift in focus to include the community as a whole. It should be noted however that in this study the terms ‘Education Department,’ or ‘Education Programming,’ are still used for the purposes of clarity to signify all orchestral education and community engagement programming.

The need for orchestras to be strongly connected with their communities was first raised in the late twentieth century. Ernest Fleischmann, the prominent General Manager of first the London Symphony Orchestra, then the Los Angeles Philharmonic, was outspoken and provocative in his advocacy for the need to restructure orchestral practice. In a landmark speech presented at the Cleveland Institute of Music in 1987, subsequently published in essay form, Fleischmann claimed that the traditional symphony orchestra was no longer viable and that a new, more flexible and dynamic
setup was urgently needed. He suggested replacing the traditional symphony orchestra model with a ‘Community of Musicians.’ His concept was that orchestras should in effect merge, thereby increasing the number of players but also exponentially expanding the variety and scope of their work. He felt that the pool of players in the ‘Community’ should be able to turn their hand to classical music, new music, period music and education work. In Fleischmann’s words:

> What can we do to make a life in music more fulfilling, more stimulating for the talented musician in order to attract her or him to a symphony orchestra, and at the same time provide a more valuable, interesting, and exciting musical service to our audiences? I think there are ways of doing this- and they begin by altering the rather rigid structure of the traditional symphony orchestra and turning it into a more flexible Community of Musicians.

Fleischmann felt that this new construct would be of particular benefit for education programming, as there would be different combinations of groups all able to make contributions according to their specialist interests. These ideas were later re-visited by Fleischmann in his 2000 Royal Philharmonic Society (RPS) lecture, entitled ‘Community of Musicians: Musicians for the Community.’ While his original speech in 1987 noted the practical benefits of the concept, such as cutting administration costs and offering musicians more varied and fulfilling careers, the RPS address was more forceful in stating the need for musicians to strengthen their relevance to their community. Fleischmann stated:

> If we do not give urgent and serious thought to this problem (creating new audiences) there is a real danger that over the next decade or two

---

8 ibid., p.14
9 ibid., p.16
the symphony audience will shrink to small pockets of elite enthusiasts found mainly in a few large cities...Musicians and musical institutions must be prepared to invest, to give their services freely to the community, and particularly to the young community in order to turn around the decline in the size and perceptiveness of audiences for symphony concerts in many parts of the world.\(^{11}\)

Fleischmann’s concern for creating the audience of the future was also a motivating factor of early orchestral education programmes, and the data presented in Figure 1 certainly point to a correlation between arts participation and arts education. However, it is interesting to note that over the past decade a clear shift has emerged. Orchestral education managers are now much more focused on the present impact of their work, rather than any potential future legacy. The creation of future audiences is today regarded as a possible by-product of orchestral education programmes: a desired outcome, but not a primary focus. According to Richard Gill, former Artistic Director of Sydney Symphony Orchestra’s Education Department:

\begin{quote}
Audience development in my view is the last cab off the ranks. If the concerts are done properly and the children are played serious repertoire in a serious way then audiences will develop anyway. What constitutes an audience? Why can’t a group of children be an audience in their own right? When people talk about audience development they really mean come to a concert as a grown up but my view is that children are an audience.\(^{12}\)
\end{quote}

While the need to create a viable future for symphony orchestras is of course important, Gill is making a valid point here. The primary concern of all Education Managers interviewed was to provide high quality, engaging experiences to all participants in their education programmes. Their aim is to help a wider sector of the general community, including children, to establish a point of personal connection and

\(^{11}\) ibid.

\(^{12}\) Richard Gill. Conductor, music education advocate and former Artistic Director of Sydney Symphony Orchestra Education Programme. Interview by author, 13 September 2012.
relevance with orchestral performances. Through this sense of connection and relevance, it is hoped, will grow a greater understanding for and engagement with orchestral performances and music.

Although Fleischmann’s call for community engagement made a significant impact upon the classical music profession, Pierre Boulez was also early to recognise the problems inherent in the traditional structure and operation of a symphony orchestra. In his essay ‘Composer and Audience: Where are we now?’, which is based on a lecture presented in 1968, Boulez makes the bold pronouncement that the symphony orchestra model was untenable in its traditional format and suggests a shift to more ‘polymorphous groupings.’

Boulez also states:

The fact that must now be faced is that it [the orchestra] will not continue unless a profound remedy is discovered - and how is that to be done? By organising either concert halls or actual concerts in a much more flexible way.

Many leading orchestral education figures consulted in this study have made mention of concepts related to the visions of Fleischmann and Boulez. Orchestras are now reaching into their communities in ways undreamt of even a decade ago, and new research is pointing to the value of their work in the spheres of health, rehabilitation, cognitive development and social cohesion.

Orchestral education programmes are gradually shifting from the sidelines of an orchestra’s activity to take a central role, a point fully discussed in Chapter Nineteen. While there were initial concerns that Education Managers were marginalised in the symphony orchestra field, their work is increasingly gaining industry support. Leaders

---

14 ibid., p.450.
in the classical field, such as Alan Gilbert, Chief Conductor of the New York Philharmonic; Gustavo Dudamel, Chief Conductor of the Los Angeles Philharmonic and Sir Simon Rattle, Chief Conductor of the Berlin Philharmonic, are all advocates for the importance of orchestral education and outreach work. According to Alan Gilbert, he and many other orchestral leaders are now exploring anew:

What it means to be an orchestra today. What is it that orchestras, and the musicians in them, do, and what can we mean for the societies for which we perform?\(^{15}\)

Gilbert’s comments were made in London in 2015, while presenting the Royal Philharmonic Society’s Annual Lecture. His chosen topic, ‘Orchestras in the 21\(^\text{st}\) Century: A New Paradigm,’ provides illuminating insight into education and outreach work from the perspective of one of the music world’s leading figures. Gilbert himself is clearly supportive of such work, stating:

There are obviously as many explanations for why orchestras fail as there are orchestras that fail, but I am pretty sure that a common feature one can find in all such unfortunate situations is the sense, in some form, that there are simply not enough people in the community who care about what the orchestra provides.\(^{16}\)

This point was reinforced by all interviewees consulted in this research: it is clear that the primary aim of current education work is to maintain the relevance and connection of an orchestra with its community. Gilbert feels that the field of orchestral education and outreach work will continue to grow and develop. He commented:

The world of orchestras has reacted to external forces and embraced education and outreach. This shift away from merely presenting concerts


\(^{16}\) ibid.
to becoming organizations [sic] that think of education as central is fairly universal...now virtually all orchestras have educational wings and have made access central to their very missions.17

Alongside increased efforts to widen points of access to the entire community, another key development has been a gradual shift in education programming from passive learning to highly participatory involvement. From the original, passive lecture concert model, orchestras of the twenty-first century now focus on participatory education programmes that offer an immediate engagement with making music. These may have an instrumental focus, such as events allowing students or community musicians to play in side-by-side performances with the orchestra. Other models involve audience participation through compositions that incorporate singing or body percussion. Some programmes, known as ‘creative workshops’ or ‘jam sessions,’ focus on composition and improvisation skills, with participants working with musicians and a workshop leader to create a new piece of music.

Australian orchestras are increasingly offering each of these participatory models, many for the first time in 2015. Orchestras in the United Kingdom have several decades of experience in this area, having explored such avenues since the 1980s and 1990s. This extra experience has allowed the United Kingdom to reach a level of evaluation in participatory orchestral education not as yet attained in Australia. Therefore their work in this area offers many points of interest to Australian orchestral education managers. As stated earlier, several Australian orchestras have already engaged British leaders in the field, known as animateurs, in their efforts to develop a

17 ibid.
more dynamic approach to their education programming.18 An additional connection was made during the London Symphony Orchestra’s 2014 Australian tour, when the LSO delivered a high profile, creative based education programme in Sydney involving 130 students from across the state of New South Wales.19

Leading orchestras internationally have previously taken influence from the British approach with great success: notably the Berlin Philharmonic and the Los Angeles Philharmonic. In 2002 the Berlin Philharmonic ventured for the first time into the field of education and outreach, under the direction of British conductor Sir Simon Rattle. To establish this programme Rattle engaged leading British animateur Richard McNicol. The Berlin Philharmonic education and outreach programme rapidly gained worldwide acclaim for the dynamic and creative ways in which it engages with the Berlin community. Australian born Catherine Milliken was subsequently appointed the Director of Education for the Berlin Philharmonic in 2005, and is well placed to contribute to Australian orchestral education programming. Milliken has already worked with the Melbourne Symphony Orchestra in a significant mentoring role, as further discussed in Chapter Twelve.

Another British leader in the field, Gillian Moore, was instrumental in developing the Los Angeles Philharmonic’s education department between 1993 and 1995, after their General Manager observed a creative based London Philharmonic

---

18 An ‘animateur’ is a term well established in the UK but not generally known in Australia. In the context of this thesis, animateurs are understood to be orchestral education concert and workshop presenters who are skilled at engaging participants in learning, through both performance and creation of music. A fuller description of their activities and methods can be found in Chapter Fifteen.

19 ‘LSO Discovery at 25,’ retrieved from http://www.lso.co.uk, accessed 15 August 2015.
Orchestra education concert in which students were mentored by composer Sir Harrison Birtwistle.\textsuperscript{20} As Moore explains:

Over the next two years, I acted as a consultant on loan from the Festival Hall, where I was then Head of Education. A stream of fine British musicians clocked up Air Miles flying to LA and running projects and training sessions with LA Philharmonic musicians. The clear message from the orchestra was that, while their ‘Neighbourhood Concerts’ in far-flung areas of the city were successful, they wanted to develop their outreach programmes in the direction of the hands-on British approach - and they consequently invested a lot of money in importing British expertise.\textsuperscript{21}

The Los Angeles Philharmonic education programme has since developed to become a world leader in its own right; however, the seeds of much of its present success can be traced back to this period of British influence.

Further evidence of the spread of the British influence in orchestral education is the breadth of countries across which the leading animateurs work. As Moore notes:

British orchestras have been in demand to export these ideas not only to America, but to Japan, all parts of Europe and to the Nordic countries. Like the LA Phil, these countries have thought the British approach was worth paying for.\textsuperscript{22}

Leading British animateur Paul Rissmann, for example, has worked with the New York Philharmonic, the Vienna Philharmonic and with other orchestras in America, Europe, India, Malaysia and the Middle East. During the period of research for the present study Rissmann has worked with several Australian orchestras and has already made a significant impact upon current practice in the field in Australia. As well as Rissmann, other British-trained animateurs working in Australia have included Fraser Trainer,

\textsuperscript{20} Gillian Moore. ‘Do your homework next time, Mr. Robinson.’ The Times (London), 22 October 1998, p.47.
\textsuperscript{21} ibid.
\textsuperscript{22} ibid.
Matthew Barley and Gillian Howell. The present study aims to document key existing points of intersection between Australian and British orchestral education programming, and to look to any further points of influence.

In order to understand fully the current activities of orchestral education departments, the social, financial and political contexts in which they operate need to be understood. This study takes place in a period of economic turbulence following the Global Financial Crisis (GFC) of 2007-08, which left all sectors of society concerned about their financial future. The arts sector, reliant not only on the whim of the paying public but also on the goodwill of government and corporate sponsorship, has felt the precariousness of its situation particularly keenly in the years following the GFC. Several American orchestras, for example, have had well-publicised financial troubles that have necessitated closures, bankruptcies and pay cuts in the period from 2008 to 2015. In 2011 the Philadelphia Orchestra, one of America’s ‘big five’ orchestras, filed for bankruptcy protection in a move that shocked the international music community, although it was able to financially regroup the following year.23

In Australia the financial situation for symphony orchestras has been additionally complicated by divestment from ABC administration, which left orchestras with a larger than foreseen bill. A series of government reports into the financial operations of the Australian symphony orchestras revealed discouraging conclusions. These reports culminated with the Strong Report, which recommended reduction in player numbers and even possible disbandment of orchestras.24

---

impact of divestment upon the orchestras and their education departments are analysed in this thesis in Chapter Three.

Alongside financial concerns, orchestras are also battling against a perception of elitism and are struggling to maintain their relevance in today’s society. Classical music has long had to battle against preconceptions that it is for the wealthy, white, and predominantly elderly sectors of society only. In order to tackle these assumptions, significant efforts are required. Peter Renshaw, an early advocate for orchestral education programming, has commented:

The point is simple. If orchestras fail to confront the future with vision and energy, if they fail to find a creative place within contemporary culture, they will become extinct.25

Of course, predictions of the imminent collapse of the symphony orchestra are not a new phenomenon and will hopefully be proven to be exaggerated and premature over the coming years. As Charles Rosen famously quipped: ‘The death of classical music is perhaps its oldest continuing tradition.’26 At present, however, these concerns are naturally uppermost in the minds of orchestral managers, and are an underlying motivation behind much education activity.

The success or failure of orchestral education projects in safeguarding the future of symphonic music will, of necessity, take decades to prove. In the meantime, however, every measure should be taken to evaluate the work being undertaken to ensure that the most effective approaches are being followed. Chapter Seven presents

various approaches towards evaluation of orchestral education programmes, and raises the question of whether sufficient evaluation is being undertaken.

Recent research has pointed to the value of music education for students from disadvantaged backgrounds, and this is increasingly a consideration for orchestras when planning their community programming. For example, the *Champions of Change* report claimed: ‘learning in and through the arts can help “level the playing field” for youngsters from disadvantaged circumstances.’

*Champions of Change* includes the research undertaken by James Cotterall, which is based on data collected from 25,000 students. Cotterall found that: ‘Students with high levels of arts participation outperform ‘arts-poor’ students by virtually every measure.’ *Champions of Change* notes that these findings have a clear implication for policy, stating:

> If we now know that arts experiences help level the educational playing field for disadvantaged students, as revealed by James Cotterall, then we need to bring more proven arts learning resources to these students.

Education managers interviewed in both Australia and the United Kingdom have revealed a deep commitment to this issue. Several of the case studies presented in Part Two of this thesis reveal the ways in which orchestras make a positive contribution to the social equity of their local communities. Further quantitative research is currently being undertaken on many such programmes, including the El Sistema-inspired programmes in Melbourne and Los Angeles, as well as the Hallé Symphony’s flagship ‘SHINE on Manchester’ programme.

During the course of research it became apparent that orchestral education work is still an industry in a development phase, and that there remain several points

---

27 Fiske, op.cit., p.viii.
28 ibid.
29 ibid., p.xi.
on which consensus has not yet been reached. In many ways, these points of debate and dissension will drive the industry forwards and the research was undertaken with this in mind, in particular when interviewing key figures. While these interviews provided the most immediate and clear insight into the field, a variety of other sources have helped to cast light on a number of areas. The following Literature Review gives an overview of the most relevant and informative sources consulted throughout the research.
Literature Review

The literature review for this study reveals a lack of academic research into Australian and British orchestral education programming, out of proportion with the importance of such work. This is the first doctoral thesis to focus on Australian orchestral education programmes and the first to cover the British field in the past sixteen years. However, there are selected theses, journal articles and books that are relevant to the present study, either by establishing the social and educational context for orchestral education programmes, or by providing insight into the development stages of the orchestral education field.

By far the most valuable resource available on the topic is Julia Winterson’s doctoral thesis entitled The community education work of orchestras and opera companies: principles, practice and problems. This study, completed in 1998, gives a comprehensive overview of the development of the British field of orchestral and opera education work to that date, as well as a frank and provocative examination of the issues hindering the field from achieving its maximum impact. Winterson’s thesis also includes an illuminating set of interview transcripts with leading figures working in the field of British orchestral education in the 1980s and 1990s, including Gillian Moore, Richard McNicol and Nigel Osborne. It is interesting now to ask, close to two decades later, to what degree the issues highlighted by Winterson have now been overcome. For example, Winterson was particularly concerned by the lack of attention being paid to evaluation by orchestral education managers; progress in this respect is discussed in Chapter Seven of the present study. Winterson also noted the pressing need for tertiary

---

training to mirror the evolving changes in professional orchestral activity, and developments in this area are also discussed in depth in this study in Chapter Nine.

Winterson’s article on the London Sinfonietta’s ground-breaking composer driven, ‘workshop’ model provides insight into the development of a key British education department. Insight into the initial establishment of this programme was also provided by David Ruffer six years earlier in the same journal, in his article ‘The London Sinfonietta Education Programme: an analysis of an interface between the professional artist and music in education’. These articles, together with Winterson’s interview with Gillian Moore, the first Education Manager of London Sinfonietta, help to establish an understanding of the aims and activities of this early, pivotal education programme, ground-breaking in many ways.

The main piece of academic writing on the topic of Australian orchestral education programmes is the 2002 Honours dissertation by Emma Cochran, entitled *The role of symphony orchestra programs: Case Study: Adelaide Symphony Orchestra and Sydney Symphony Orchestra.* While Cochran makes several insightful points, the short length of the dissertation curtails her ability to go into detail and the study is restricted to only two of Australia’s six state symphony orchestras. Cochran noted the need for a future intensive study on the topic to fill the gap in research, stating:

Throughout my research I discovered the available literature on orchestral education programmes to be extremely limited and outdated. It is a topic

---

which lends itself to new studies if orchestra education programs are to have any real relevance in the 21st century.  

Twelve years after Cochran’s dissertation was submitted the same claim can be made, and it is this gap that the present study aims to fill. Another key point made in her dissertation was that as symphony orchestras receive part of their funding from the state they therefore have an obligation to be of service to their community. Cochran comments: ‘as orchestras are both publicly and privately funded vehicles, there is an expectation they should ‘give back’ to the community.’ This point was also made by several sources consulted in this research, including prominent music educator and conductor, Richard Gill. Here Gill talks of his aims, while Music Director of Victoria Opera, to connect the company with the community:

It is a tax-payer funded company. My view is that you go out into the community and you find out what the community’s needs are and you assess the needs.

Gill has certainly made a sizeable commitment to serving the Australian community through his career.

Cochran’s dissertation looks at the early development of the Sydney Symphony and Adelaide Symphony Orchestra education departments and notes that in 1980 the Sydney Symphony Orchestra (SSO) initiated a review of its programs. Cochran observes that this: ‘led to the implementation of the SSO’s education program and prompted other national orchestras to examine their education activities.’ This key point of transition in the evolution of the SSO’s education programmes is studied in

---

34 ibid., p.4  
35 ibid., p.7  
36 Gill. Interview.  
37 Cochran, op.cit. p. 9
more detail in Chapter Two. The measures taken by the SSO to overhaul their educational output transformed a lacklustre, underutilised arm of the orchestra into a vibrant and enriching part of the Australian music education landscape. Insight into the evolution of the SSO’s education programmes was provided by interviews with key personnel including Richard Gill, Margaret Moore and Kim Waldock. In addition several sources were consulted, including Richard Gill’s autobiography, *Give Me Excess of It*,\(^\text{38}\) and *Play On! 60 Years of Music Making with the Sydney Symphony Orchestra*, [Sametz, ABC Sydney, 1992].\(^\text{39}\) Brett Johnson’s speech ‘The Development of an Orchestral Education Program- Sydney Symphony Orchestra 1987-1991’\(^{40}\) provides insight into a key turning point for the SSO Education Department. It makes very valuable reading for anyone interested in creating a strong, relevant education programme.

Stephen Boyle’s doctoral thesis, *Efficiency and Identity: The Transition of Australia’s Symphony Orchestras from Government Departments to Corporate Entities* (2007), gives insight into the process by which the Australian orchestras gained independence from the ABC.\(^\text{41}\) His thesis gives a comprehensive overview of the early years of the symphony orchestra network of Australia, and insight into the process and impact of the devolution from ABC control. David Garrett’s doctoral thesis through the University of Wollongong, *The Accidental Entrepreneur* (2012), provides a more recent


do,\textsuperscript{54} and the response from the industry by the Musicians’ Union: *Summary in response to Ofsted.*\textsuperscript{55} The 2014 King’s College London Report, *Step by Step: arts policy and young people 1944-2014,* was also of great benefit in providing a detailed investigation of sixty years of British arts education policy.\textsuperscript{56}

The link between orchestral education work and the music curriculum is of particular interest at the time of writing in Australia, as the new National Curriculum for the Arts is launched. To gain insight into the impact of the UK curriculum upon orchestral education work a variety of sources were consulted. The seminal work by John Paynter and Peter Aston, *Sound and Silence,* provided a feel for the spirit of adventure and vigour with which a new focus on classroom composition was launched.\textsuperscript{57} Stephanie Pitts’ work: *A Century of Change in Music Education: Historical Perspectives on Contemporary Practice in British Secondary Schools* (2000) also provided a crucial insight into the development of school music education in the UK.\textsuperscript{58}

In order to understand the development of the Music curriculum in the Australian National Curriculum and its potential impact upon both the orchestral education field and the wider music education networks, several sources were of key benefit. Richard Gill’s views on the introduction of the National Curriculum, given in interview with the author, were incisive and thought-provoking. In addition the National Curriculum document itself has been studied in detail, alongside related books and reports including: the *National Review of School Music Education:*

\textsuperscript{54} *Music in Schools: what hubs must do* The Office for Standards in Education, Children’s Services and Skills (OFSTED), Manchester, 2013.

\textsuperscript{55} *Report Summary in response to Ofsted,* Musicians Union, UK, 2014.

\textsuperscript{56} James Doeser. *Step by Step: arts policy and young people 1944-2014.* Commissioned by Culture at King’s, King’s College London, 2014.


Augmenting the Diminished,\textsuperscript{59} Bridging the Gap in School Achievement through the Arts,\textsuperscript{60} Education and the Arts,\textsuperscript{61} Transforming Education Through the Arts,\textsuperscript{62} and the Victorian Parliamentary Inquiry into School Music Education Provision.\textsuperscript{63}

International literature relating to the importance of music and the arts for children and society was also of relevance to this topic. As noted in the Introduction, two landmark reports were of chief importance here in addition to the Australian publications noted above. These were the flagship 1999 American Report, Champions of Change,\textsuperscript{64} and the 2015 British publication, The Power of Music.\textsuperscript{65}

There is a growing body of research available on the history, processes and impact of the revolutionary social music programme in Venezuela, known internationally as ‘El Sistema’. The focus for this study is on the impact of El Sistema on orchestral education work in Australia and the United Kingdom, and this point was kept to mind when selecting research material related to El Sistema. Personal interviews were conducted with the In Harmony Lambeth liaison officer at the Southbank Centre in London; the Education Manager of the Royal Liverpool Philharmonic Orchestra (a partner with Sistema Liverpool); the Education Managers of the Melbourne Symphony Orchestra and West Australian Symphony Orchestra in regard to their Sistema inspired programmes; and Marshall Marcus, the Director of

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{59} National Review of School Music Education: Augmenting the Diminished. Commissioned by the Australian Government, Department of Education, Science and Training, Canberra, 2005.
\item \textsuperscript{60} T. Vaughan; J. Harris and B. Caldwell. Bridging the Gap in School Achievement through the Arts. Commissioned by the Song Room, Melbourne, 2011.
\item \textsuperscript{61} Mary Ann Hunter. Education and the Arts: Research Overview. Commissioned by the Australia Council, 2005.
\item \textsuperscript{62} Caldwell and Vaughan. Transforming Education Through the Arts, op.cit.
\item \textsuperscript{63} Jan Kronberg (Chair). Inquiry into the Benefits, Extents and Potential of Music Education in Victorian Schools. Commissioned by the Education and Training Committee, 2013.
\item \textsuperscript{64} Fiske. op.cit.
\item \textsuperscript{65} Hallam. op.cit.
\end{itemize}
Sistema Europe and former teacher within the Venezuelan El Sistema. Further information was gained through detailed study of evaluative reports, journal articles, books, DVDs and websites, as detailed in the List of Sources.

The importance of the support of the Association of British Orchestras (ABO) for the development of British orchestral education work is discussed in detail in Chapter Seven. In order to gain insight into the ways in which the ABO facilitates networking and seeks to promote examples of best practice in the field of orchestral education, two personal interviews were conducted with Fiona Harvey, the Education and Youth Ensembles Consultant at the ABO. In these interviews Harvey not only discussed her role at the ABO but also gave valuable insight into the development of the Music Hub model. In addition to these interviews, extensive research has been taken into all relevant ABO publications, details of which can be found in the List of Sources.

Insight into the links between Australian and British orchestral education work can also be gained by study of published reports and conference presentations by leaders in the field. One of the most relevant of these is Christopher Wainwright’s Churchill Fellowship Report (2014) in which Wainwright, the Director of the Adelaide Youth Orchestras, discusses his recent international trip to study leading orchestral education programmes. The Churchill Fellowship Report by Nicholas Bochner (Assistant Principal Cellist with the Melbourne Symphony Orchestra) is also of interest for this study. This Report details Bochner’s observation of the London Symphony

---

66 Christopher Wainwright. To learn from the world’s best participatory orchestral programs to aid the development of similar programs in South Australia. Churchill Fellowship Final Report, 2014.
Insight into the early development of training for orchestral education work in the UK is chiefly provided through several articles by Peter Renshaw, published between 1985 and 1992 in the *British Journal of Music Education*. These articles detail Renshaw’s establishment of a new course in animateur skills at London’s Guildhall School of Music and Drama (GSMD), and his views on the need for a fresh approach to the training of orchestral musicians at the tertiary level. The 2005 GSMD book *The Reflective Conservatoire: Studies in Music Education Research Studies 4* was also of particular interest. This work offers insight into developing trends in tertiary music education, as well as practical advice on leading workshops and teaching improvisation.

A further GSMD publication, *The Art of the Animateur*, helped to define and explain the aims and practice of ‘animateurs,’ a key role in British orchestral programming but one little known in Australia to this date.

Alongside the question of training lies the issue of the structure of the symphony orchestra and its place in society. Informative and provocative points have been made on these topics by several key figures over the past half-century. Ernest Fleischmann’s ‘Community of Musicians’ concept, previously discussed in the Introduction, was first presented in a lecture at the Cleveland School of Music in 1987. This lecture was subsequently published as the article ‘The Orchestra is Dead.’

---


his views on this topic in a subsequent speech in 2000 to the Royal Philharmonic Society.\textsuperscript{71} His concept, while radical, was foreshadowed by the views of Boulez as expressed in \textit{Orientations},\textsuperscript{72} and also validated by Leonard Slatkin in his book \textit{Conducting Business}.\textsuperscript{73} Slatkin, writing in 2012, remarked: ‘Now, more than 20 years later, I think not only was he [Fleischmann] right but also very much ahead of his time.’\textsuperscript{74} This view is supported by many leaders of the classical music industry in the twenty-first century. Looking close to home, Stephen Boyle identified the Adelaide Symphony Orchestra as one that was looking potentially to remodel its structure along Fleischmann’s suggestions.\textsuperscript{75} While this has not eventuated, it is a sign of the far-reaching impact of Fleischmann’s ideas.

The Royal Philharmonic Society Annual Lectures provide insight by leaders in the classical music profession. In addition to Fleischmann’s address in 2000, the Lectures presented by Alan Gilbert (2014), Roger Wright (2013), Sir Peter Maxwell Davies (2005), Graham Vick (2003) were also of particular interest to this study in their often provocative and visionary commentary on aspects of the relationship between classical music and contemporary society.

A lecture presented by Marshall McGuire (former Executive Manager of Artistic Planning, West Australian Symphony Orchestra) at the Classical Music Summit 2010, entitled ‘Australian Orchestras- The State of Play’, was also of strong relevance to this study. In this presentation, McGuire was critical of the models of outreach and

\textsuperscript{72} Boulez. \textit{Orientations}, op.cit.
\textsuperscript{74} ibid.,p.240.
education commonly used by Australian orchestras, claiming that much more participatory programmes needed to be developed.76

The report *Psychological well-being in professional orchestral musicians in Australia* (2006),77 provides insight into the stress and pressure under which many Australian orchestral musicians are operating. It is the view of the author that participation in education work can help to alleviate these negative aspects of orchestral practice and can provide a more balanced and fulfilling career path for orchestral musicians. Existing studies in this area, for example by Abeles and Hafeli (2014)78 and Levine and Levine (1996),79 point to the potential benefit of education and outreach participation for orchestral musicians themselves.

While not central to the thesis, several American theses were of value in providing an overview of orchestral education in the US and also offering examples of evaluation of such programmes. *The contributions of Leonard Bernstein to music education: an analysis of his 53 Young People’s Concerts*, by Brian David Rozen,80 discusses the approach taken by Bernstein in his ‘Young People’s Concerts,’ which remain a landmark in orchestral music education today. Bernstein’s education work is also a salient lesson in the impact that a celebrity figure can have: his education concerts were so popular that New Yorkers were putting their children’s names down before birth. *Lillian Baldwin and the Cleveland plan for Educational

---

Concerts provided insight into another formative figure in American orchestral education work.  

A more current American thesis, Conversations with Five Music Directors Regarding the Current State and Future of American Symphony Orchestras (Harrison, 2009), was also consulted. Prompted by the financial struggles of several American orchestras in the past decade, Harrison seeks to provide possible measures to rectify the fortunes of the American symphony orchestra through interviews with five chief conductors. The points of consensus in the interviews are of interest: for example both Michael Christie and Robert Spano suggest that Fleischmann’s Community of Musicians concept could be the best future model for their orchestras. Additionally, all five music directors acknowledged the importance of: ‘the community integration of symphony orchestras- how orchestras become a vital part of the community they serve.’

Philip Hart’s article ‘The Educational Role of the Symphony Orchestra,’ published in 1973, raised several points that have remained valid and relevant to the present date. Hart was the orchestra and concert manager for the Seattle, Portland and Chicago Symphony Orchestras, and director of planning and programmes at the Juilliard School, New York. Hart’s key statements include that: ‘to a distressingly great extent, symphony management and artistic directors know very little about education.

---

83 ibid., p. 26
84 ibid., p. 11
theory, and: ‘if funds and personnel are limited, it would be far better to plan multiple exposures for a smaller number of children.’ The importance of understanding theories of music education, and the question of how best to use funding, were points echoed by several key figures interviewed for this study, and both issues are addressed in detail in Part Three.

The 2006 American Report The Search for Shining Eyes, Audiences, Leadership and Change in the Symphony Orchestra Field (Knight Report) provides detailed quantitative data on the impact of orchestral education work. This data is based upon a survey of 25,000 American classical audience attendees, which remains to date the largest audience survey of its kind. Its key aim was to assess the impact created by orchestral education initiatives sponsored by the Knight Foundation. The Report is of great relevance to orchestral education personnel and management staff both in the US and internationally. The Knight Report and its implications are discussed in detail in Chapter Seventeen.

Eric Booth’s seminal work The Music Teaching Artist’s Bible (2009) gives an American perspective on orchestral education programmes and training for such work at tertiary institutions. Booth began teaching education skills to performance students at the Juilliard School of Music in 1994, and has delivered professional development to the New York Philharmonic’s teaching artist faculty for ten years. His experience in these roles informs his writing with an illuminating and ultimately uplifting perspective on classical music in the twenty first century. Booth is also the founding editor of the

86 ibid., p.28
87 ibid., p.29
*Teaching Artist Journal*, which is a key resource of opinion and data for the developing ‘teaching artist’ field.\(^{30}\)

Gillian Moore, currently the Director of Classical Music at London’s Southbank Centre, has had central role in the development of British orchestral education programming. This dates back to 1983, when Moore began her career as the first British Orchestra Education Manager when appointed by the London Sinfonietta. Moore’s views have been expressed in various formats, including journal articles, interviews and lectures. Interestingly, although Moore was key to the early establishment of the orchestral education field, she has also been openly critical of certain aspects of practice in the field. Her views have in turn influenced the line of questioning taken in this research.

Alongside materials relating directly to orchestral education programmes, a variety of other sources were also consulted in order to establish the social and educational context in which orchestras are operating. Articles on the benefits of music in hospitals, prisons and nursing homes were consulted, alongside resources on the role of music in developing creative skills. Websites of relevant organisations were consulted regularly to obtain information about present activities, current data, and mission statements.

Collectively, study of the materials discussed above helped to form an understanding of the development of the field and shaped the line of questioning in the interview process. The following section of the thesis, ‘Part One: Origins and Development of Orchestral Education Programming,’ is based upon the insight created

---

through interviews with key figures, combined with information gained through analysis of the available sources.
Part One

Origins and Development of Orchestral Education Programming
Chapter One: Early orchestral education work in Australia

The early development of orchestral education in Australia is inextricably linked with the career of Australian conductor Sir Bernard Heinze. Such was the impact of Heinze (1894-1982) that his biographer, Thérèse Radic, declared:

Heinze was responsible for the fact that we have state symphony orchestras, the ABC concert systems (in schools, youth, celebrity and subscription series), and organisations able to promote effectively the creation and practice of Australian music and to educate musically a new generation. Directly or indirectly nothing in Australian musical life has been untouched by his presence.91

In 1923, soon after his return home to Melbourne following a decade of study and war service in Europe, Heinze attended a performance of the Melbourne University Conservatorium’s Symphony Orchestra. He found the concert poorly attended and to his ears the playing quite amateur. Heinze commented:

When the orchestra came out to play a little before 8 o’clock there would have been enough people in the hall to fill two rows...Then the orchestra played (remember the sound of the Berlin Philharmonic under that god of a man, Furtwangler, was ringing in my ears) and made a terrible, amateur sound. I could not believe my ears; it was so different from what I had expected to hear from something called a symphony orchestra. This was, of course, 1923. There was not one professional orchestra in Australia and there was not to be one for many years to come.92

Heinze then made it his firm intention to do what he could to improve the status and standard of music in Australia, aiming to achieve this through the establishment of children’s concerts. While staying in London at Frank Bridge’s house, he had met the conductor of the New York Philharmonic Orchestra, Walter Damrosch, who had

instigated a very successful programme of children’s concerts in New York. Heinze later recalled this conversation with Damrosch:

Damrosch said ‘New York is absolutely alight with interest in symphonic music and I’ve brought this about in a rather wonderful way- by giving children’s concerts.’ Bridge asked what children’s concerts were and Damrosch replied, ‘Just that- children’s concerts: orchestral concerts especially for children in Carnegie Hall. The place is crowded every time we give one. The effect is showing up in audiences for our main public concerts by the New York Philharmonic. We are selling them out’.  

Damrosch (1862-1950) was a German-born conductor and composer who migrated to America. He was greatly admired as a music educator, and was the conductor of the Symphony Society of New York Orchestra from 1903 to 1928 (this orchestra merged with the New York Philharmonic in 1928). In 1926 he inaugurated a series of radio broadcasts, which later aired as the ‘NBC Music Appreciation Hour’ through the United States and Canada from 1928 through to 1942. This was a very popular series of radio lectures on classical music aimed at students, broadcast during school hours. The radio network provided textbooks and workshops to the school-teachers, an initiative that would be taken up some decades later in both Australia and the United Kingdom. He was also an innovator in terms of tailoring his concerts to the age group of the audience. Whilst Walter Damrosch is the best-known musician in his family owing to these radio broadcasts, his brother, Frank Damrosch, also devoted his life to music education. Frank Damrosch was the Superintendent of Music in New York’s public schools and also organised and conducted symphony concerts for children.

---

93 ibid, pp.11-12
By late 1924 Heinze had secured 76 pounds sterling of funding from Sir James Barrett, Chairman of the Finance Committee of the Melbourne Conservatorium, in order to stage his own children’s concert, and the date was set for the 11th of October. This initial concert, however, was nearly a dismal failure. Two days before the concert only sixty seats were sold, and Heinze discovered that the Head Teachers had been throwing out his information leaflets unread. Heinze borrowed Barrett’s car and set off to visit every school he could get to in the time left. By the day of the concert he had found a full audience. This story illustrates some of Heinze’s most valuable character traits: his charm, his self-confidence and his tenacity.

The following five years were a pivotal period both for Heinze’s career and for the development of classical music in Australia. In 1925 he was appointed Ormond Professor of Music at Melbourne University and, in 1929, the Director in General of Music for the new broadcasting service. He campaigned for the ABC to finance orchestras in each capital city, ostensibly to broadcast but also, Heinze intended, to perform in concert to local audiences. While the establishment of the ABC orchestras became the foundation of all symphonic music making in Australia, this inherent conflict between their role in a broadcasting organisation and their desire to deliver live concerts created a tension that grew until the point of their eventual divestment from the ABC. This period of conflict, divestment, and independence is discussed in Chapter Three.

In the 1920s, however, all remained new, exciting and dynamic. Others before had attempted to start a series of children’s concerts, including Benno Scherek, Zelman and Arundel Orchard, but Heinze was the first to make a success of the concept. In

---

95 Buttrose, op.cit. p.12
June 1925 Heinze partnered with the Education Department and from that date the concerts were well attended. The audiences were soon in the thousands, and by the early 1940s Heinze had conducted more than 500 children’s concerts and reached over 80,000 children. Throughout this period of growth Heinze continued to promote his cause in the media, for instance in articles such as this, published in the *Sydney Morning Herald* in March 1930:

No educational institution is fulfilling its function unless it promotes the artistic development of the young minds under its care. In England and America the appreciation of music is regarded so seriously that it has become part of the school curriculum…The plea in Australia, when one suggests these developments, is almost invariably that there is no money. Yet every public school can find funds to remunerate coaches in various departments of sport. I am one of the first to support healthy physical culture, but I do contend that in every school some small sum should be set aside for the artistic training of our future citizens.  

Eighty-five years later these words are still relevant, and indeed could believably have been spoken by a music education advocate of today such as Richard Gill.

Heinze’s belief that children’s concerts could build audiences was soon shown to be justified. In 1924 there were only 67 subscribers to Melbourne’s University Symphony series. By 1937, however, the ABC’s Annual Report to Parliament showed that subscribers were more numerous in Melbourne than in the other capital cities. In 1937 there were 2094 subscribers in Melbourne, 923 in Sydney, 197 in Brisbane, 161 in Adelaide and 176 in Perth. In these early stages education concerts unashamedly aimed to create audiences; today’s orchestral education personnel prefer to see this as a potential benefit of their work but no longer the primary aim, as noted in the Introduction.

---

97 Buttrose, op.cit., p.13
Heinze’s ability to promote his activities and views through the media, both in print and in broadcast, was a key strength that helped him throughout his career. In 1942, with the children’s concerts under threat of cancellation owing to war-related safety fears, Heinze proclaimed:

The concerts for young people are in some ways of greater importance than the big symphonic concerts, for they are directed towards the future...These young people are the audiences of the future, and they will come to concerts with a knowledge of music to back up what they want to hear.98

Making concert programmes relevant, exciting and accessible to differing age groups has long been a chief preoccupation for orchestral education personnel. Heinze attempted to address this issue in the early 1940s, troubled by some signs of inattention in the audiences. He conducted one of the earliest orchestral education evaluation surveys, asking for letters from the audience members in 1941 and again in 1942. Criticism included that the concerts were too programmatic and too thematic. The question of the extent to which concerts should be themed is still relevant today, and indeed is an issue that still is debated by current education managers. Clearly at this point the concerts were not adjusted to different age groups, one complaint being that they had ‘to hear the same or similar talks on the orchestra and such topics time and time again.’99 Soon after these surveys Heinze started to make age-differentiated programmes and by 1947 the ‘Youth Concerts,’ with a higher age limit of twenty-five, were established.

98 Radic, op.cit., p.136
99 ibid.,p.136
In a radio interview from this period, broadcast in 1946, Heinze spoke of his views on the relative benefits of educating children in music as opposed to adults, also speaking of his belief in their greater receptivity towards contemporary music:

I have even come to believe that adult education in music, in the strict sense, can hope for only a partial success. The adult who is sufficiently interested in music to devote part of his time to it, usually knows what he wants and isn’t inclined to listen to anything else. The intolerance of the average concert-goer for modern music is an example of this, and is in strange contrast with the eagerness with which my school audiences listen and write to me about the music of contemporary composers.\textsuperscript{100}

In more recent times, the London Sinfonietta’s education outreach has had particular success in helping young audiences understand and connect with contemporary music. Many orchestral education directors may however dispute Heinze’s claim as to the lack of adult interest in discovering new genres of music. Several orchestras, including the Sydney Symphony and the London Symphony Orchestras, have developed highly popular education programmes focussed on adult learners.

In the same 1946 radio address Heinze spoke of his wish for greater co-operation between the Education Department and the ABC, in order to maximise the benefits of the children’s concerts:

The children’s orchestral concerts would gain in usefulness by a close co-operation between the Education Department and the Commission. With such a policy the programmes could be more progressive and instructive, particularly were it possible to ensure that the same group of children attended a series of successive concerts.\textsuperscript{101}

The importance of effective co-operation between orchestras and the Education Department has been a constant focus through the development of the field. It is of particular relevance in Australia at present as the new National Curriculum is

\textsuperscript{100} ibid., p.138
\textsuperscript{101} ibid., p.138
established in schools across the country, presenting fresh ways for orchestras to link with school syllabus requirements.

The Youth Concerts, established in 1947, were extremely popular for over a decade. In his study of this period in the history of the Sydney Symphony Orchestra, Philip Sametz states:

The popularity of the series was enormous, partly because the adult subscription concerts were becoming so hard to subscribe to, partly because the Youth Concerts were cheaper (sixteen shillings for a season ticket) and partly because the forward looking aura of Goossens’ leadership gave the SSO an energy to which young people responded.102

The Youth Concert concept had clearly tapped into the young adult’s search for the new, exciting, and slightly subversive. At the height of their popularity, the audience needed to queue overnight. For many, this only added to the glamour of the process, much in the same way that today tennis fans willingly camp out in a soggy British summer to claim tickets to Wimbledon. Crucially, soloists and conductors were of the same high standard as those performing in the main series concerts, and programming was kept on the progressive side, featuring composers such as Bloch, Chausson, Arthur Bliss, Schoenberg. The success of the Youth Concerts helped to revitalise the mainstream audiences also. Conductor Joseph Post declared in 1950:

I preach the gospel of these concerts [the Youth Concerts] very strongly…I think they are mainly responsible for the big audiences Australian concerts get now.103

---

102 Sametz. op.cit. p.143
103 ibid.,p.146
By the mid 1950s the Youth Concerts were at their peak; however, the success of the format could not be sustained through another decade. They gradually lost their spirit of adventure and as Roger Covell comments:

...they became gradually more fusty, because the ABC had somehow developed the attitude ‘this is good for you’ rather than ‘this is exciting’.104

Of course in the sixties many factors influenced the youth demographic. The emergence of pop music mania, television and mass marketing all competed for the attention of adolescents and young adults. Another possible factor was the controversial and abrupt departure of the charismatic Eugene Goossens from the Australian musical scene, effectively deported in May 1956 after being found in possession of pornographic items. Heinze’s biographer, Therese Radic, regards the concert on 24 October 1967, which marked twenty years of Youth Concerts with the SSO, as ‘the end of an era.’ Heinze’s health was also starting to fail him, and his Youth Concert performances in 1974 celebrating his Jubilee as a conductor were the beginning of ‘a long series of farewells.’105 After the fiftieth anniversary concert Kenneth Hince wrote:

In those 50 years Heinze has utterly reshaped our music. To call him the most influential figure in Australia music sounds like hyperbole. It is not; it is sober truth. Heinze realised that orchestras needed subscribers even more than people wanted orchestras. In 1924, his concerts began in Melbourne with fewer than 70 subscribers. When he resigned the Ormond Chair at the University in 1956 there were nearly 11,000.106

While the popularity of the Youth Concert scheme gradually faded, the 1960s saw the development of another successful concert format appealing strongly to the youth

104 ibid., p.212
105 ibid., p.203
106 ibid., p.204
market, in the shape of John Hopkins’ SSO Proms. In 1963 Hopkins was appointed the ABC’s Director of Music, combining this role with his conducting and educational activities. The concept of the Australian Proms (which began in Sydney in 1965, soon to be followed by Melbourne, Adelaide, Brisbane and Perth) was modelled on that of the Henry Wood Promenade concerts, presented for 120 years at London’s Royal Albert Hall.\textsuperscript{107} Hopkins’ programming staff included Richard Meale and Nigel Butterley, and together they introduced an adventurous approach with a focus on contemporary and Australian content. By 1968 the Proms were offering a wide range of music, by composers such as Lutoslawski, Machaut, Baird, Ives, Sculthorpe, Schubert, Mozart and Bach. Hopkins describes his collaboration with Meale and Butterley:

> These two were the ones with the ideas. We would each keep a list of pieces we wanted to do, including new pieces we’d heard from overseas radio tapes, and we would pool these ideas and turn them into programs. We went through an incredible sifting process to keep the programs sharp.\textsuperscript{108}

The Proms shared much of the same glamour and excitement as the Youth Concerts at their peak, with similar stories of queueing overnight, and capacity crowds. Hopkins believes that the Proms were as much a marketing exercise as a musical one, and that the queuing system was an important part of its success, later saying: ‘It helped create a camaraderie among the Prommers, a special sense of occasion.’\textsuperscript{109} The Proms shared many similarities with the Youth Concerts including, unfortunately, a short life span. In

\textsuperscript{107} Retrieved from: http://www.bbc.co.uk/programmes/articles/1sgMxZvFzHQG3Y1HktMfg6w/history-of-the-proms, accessed 1 September 2015
\textsuperscript{108} Sametz, op.cit.,p.257
\textsuperscript{109} ibid., p.261
1973 Hopkins left the ABC to become Dean of Music at the Victorian Arts College and in 1976 his successor at the ABC, Harold Hort wrote:

When John Hopkins left you will remember my own view that we could no longer rely on him to run the whole of the Proms season; that, in any case, his inspiration and the type of programming he had advocated was wearing thin and there was no way in which this kind of Prom could be continued.\(^\text{110}\)

In 1977, the year after Hort expressed these concerns, the Proms were discontinued in Sydney, and were gradually phased out nationally.

The following chapter looks at the challenges experienced by the Sydney Symphony Orchestra during the 1980s and 1990s, and the new educational initiatives introduced during this period. The SSO’s approach to Education in the 1990s established the foundations for the present successful SSO Education Department, and has also had a considerable influence on the development of Australian orchestral education programming.

\(^{110}\) ibid., pp.264- 65
Chapter Two: The development of the Sydney Symphony Orchestra

Education Department

At the time of writing the Sydney Symphony Orchestra (SSO) operates one of the leading Education Departments in Australia, as discussed in detail in the Case Study presented in Chapter Twelve. However the present strength of the SSO’s education programming rests on certain key decisions made over the past forty years. This chapter seeks to identify the key points of development of the SSO Education Department, as well as establishing the motivation behind them.

In the 1960s and 1970s the SSO’s education programming began to move into new areas, having at this date already offered school concerts and Youth Concerts since the 1940s.111 In 1960 Dean Dixon (SSO Principal Conductor from 1964-67) introduced a successful series of ‘Toddler Proms’ concerts, aimed at three to four year olds, which were more participatory in style than school concerts.112 An historical newsreel of a 1964 toddlers prom has recently been released by British Pathé, providing a rare glimpse into this period of the SSO’s history.113

This period also saw the establishment of a National Training Orchestra, formed by the ABC in Sydney in 1967, with the aim of preparing young players for professional playing. This was essentially an early precursor of the current training model offered by Sydney Sinfonia and Fellowship, and several players made the

---

112 ibid.
transition from the Training Orchestra to the SSO.\textsuperscript{114} In 1973 the Sydney Opera House was opened, and the glamour of this venue, situated on the sparkling harbour, became a valuable factor in attracting audiences to SSO concerts. The years immediately following the opening of the Opera House were a honeymoon period, with generally full houses.

However the following decade saw the SSO presented with significant challenges, and the years from 1980 to 1985 were perhaps the most critical in the history of the Sydney Symphony. In a paper presented in 1991 Brett Johnson, a former Sydney Symphony Education Manager, gives insight into the role the Education Department played in turning the tide. Johnson comments:

A complex mix of factors in the years 1980 to 1985 led to a dramatic erosion of the subscriber base in all areas...of great concern was the fact that the early evening series traditionally attended by large numbers of high school student and young people (for many years known as the Youth Concerts, but by the 80s renamed the 630 Meet the Music series) was nearly at the point of complete abandonment, such was the falling off of subscriptions.\textsuperscript{115}

A common response by orchestras to the problem of falling audience numbers is to redouble their efforts in education and community engagement. The Sydney Symphony Orchestra did exactly this in the 1980s. The turning point for the SSO, in Johnson’s view, began with identifying the issues contributing to the fall in audience numbers for the Meet the Music concerts. To achieve this the SSO initiated a better communication


process with teachers, to ensure their needs were being met. In 1986 a working party was established between the SSO and NSW teachers. The first meeting of this working party directed strong criticism towards the SSO and made a number of recommendations:

1. That the orchestra play better.

2. That repertoire reflects syllabus requirements.

3. That the conductor and soloist roster be at the same artistic level of the adult evening series.

4. That all education programs be supported by teaching materials.¹¹⁶

This critical feedback proved to be the catalyst for the SSO’s present successful Education Department. In his paper Johnson documents the reaction of the SSO to the meeting and its response to the recommendations of the working party. The first, crucial step was the allocation of more sponsorship funds to the Education Department, which financed the deployment of a school music teacher to work full time for the SSO. Johnson explains:

The position’s duties would be to co-ordinate schools concert planning and marketing, channel advice from the education community to SSO and ABC Concert Music managers, and write resources kits consisting of booklets and cassettes along the lines of the successful Musica Viva resources.¹¹⁷

---

¹¹⁶ ibid.
¹¹⁷ ibid.
This position, together with the extra funding allocated, made it possible for the orchestra immediately to address points two and four from the meeting. According to Johnson:

The demand regarding repertoire made the programmers aware of the need to keep in touch with developments in syllabuses, such as the new senior syllabus requiring the study of post 1965 music with emphasis on the Australian scene.  

This request was immediately met during 1987 and 1988, when the orchestra devoted many days to recording excerpts and complete scores for inclusion in teaching material packs. Johnson comments:

…the first performance of a number of Australian scores…have not been their concert premieres by one or other of the six ABC orchestras, but studio recording by the SSO for use in education kits supporting performance in Meet the Music series or other Education Program events.

The prominence of Australian contemporary music continues to be a key characteristic of SSO’s programming to this date and it is to be hoped that the introduction of the National Curriculum does not impact upon such an important commitment to Australian composition. The SSO’s support of Australian composers has helped to build a public platform for their work and has developed a greater connection between students and contemporary music.

In addition to increasing the Australian content in programming and recording key works, the SSO also turned their attention to improving resources aimed at Kindergarten to Grade 8 level students in 1988 and 1989. According to Johnson, the 1989 K-8 Teaching Kit was the first truly co-operative SSO/Departmental venture, with

---

118 ibid.
119 ibid., p.26
costs of production shared by the Orchestra and the Department of Education. The comprehensive kits included forty to fifty pages of lesson plans and activities alongside a recording of core repertoire, and were free of charge. A similar format is still used today by the SSO for its teaching kits, which lead the field in Australia in their detail and curriculum support.

Johnson acknowledges that the early SSO resource kits were influenced by those already provided by Musica Viva. Musica Viva, founded in 1945, is the world’s largest chamber music provider. Since 1981 Musica Viva has made a significant contribution to school music education through a combination of school performances and teacher resources. Their activity lies beyond the scope of this research, being related to chamber rather than orchestral music, but is worthy of a separate study in its own right.

The first and third points from the August 1986 meeting, regarding the standard of performance, were also addressed by the SSO. Johnson remarks:

…it was an opportune moment to establish loudly and clearly that second-best, whether in playing or skill of conductors and soloists, was not going to be tolerated by teachers or students.

The importance of keeping the standard of playing at education concerts at a high level cannot be underestimated. While the aim of such concerts is to provide a positive, and hopefully inspiring, first experience of classical orchestral music, if the concert is not planned or performed at a high level then it is all too easy for the opposite effect to occur and for students to leave with a negative impression. This is a point which must be kept to mind by any orchestra offering education concerts.

---

120 ibid., p.27
122 Johnson, op.cit. p.25
By the 1990s the SSO’s ‘Meet the Music’ school concerts were performed at a high standard and were received warmly by both teachers and students. The programming for the concerts gradually developed a formula, according to Margaret Moore, former Education Manager with the SSO.\footnote{Margaret Moore. Interview with the author, Sydney, 12 July 2012.} Each concert would include repertoire representing three key categories. These were, broadly speaking: a piece from the classical canon, a modern work with interesting instrumentation or approach to tonality, and a work by a contemporary Australian composer.\footnote{ibid.} This combination of repertoire choices allows for a balanced concert experience to extend students.

The SSO also made improvements to their tailoring of concerts for different age groups in 1989, with attention paid to individual grade syllabuses. Concerts for students in Kindergarten to Year 2 (for approximately 5-7 year olds) were introduced in 1990. In 1997 these concerts were the subject of research by Louie Suthers at the Institute of Early Childhood, Macquarie University. Suthers praised the participatory approach taken by the SSO, which has increasingly been recognised as a key element to concerts for children, and noted that the programming reflected research on early childhood development.\footnote{Louie Suthers. ‘Introducing Young Children to Live Orchestral Performance’, in Wendy Schiller (editor). Issues in Expressive Arts Curriculum for Early Childhood, London: Taylor and Francis, 1997, pp. 55-64.}

From the 1990s until the mid 2000s, the Sydney Symphony Education Department led the field in Australia, in line with its position as the highest resourced orchestra in the country. In 1992 Richard Gill was appointed as Artistic Director of the Sydney Symphony Education Program. Gill held this position for over twenty years, alongside Education Managers Margaret Moore and, more recently, Kim Waldock.
During this period several new elements were introduced to the SSO Education Department, including the flagship orchestral training programmes ‘Sydney Sinfonia’ and ‘Sydney Fellowship’. These, and other more recent initiatives, are discussed in the SSO Case Study in Chapter Twelve. In the past decade, each state orchestra has begun to develop their own individual approach to their education programming, as discussed in the case studies in Chapter Twelve. This period of development was in many ways made possible by the process of divestment from ABC control, a point explored in the following chapter.
Chapter Three: The path to divestment: establishing independence

In the 1970s tensions between the Australian Broadcasting Corporation (ABC) and Australia’s state symphony orchestras began to build, leading to the commission of several investigative reports. The heart of the problem was that the orchestras, created ostensibly as broadcasting ensembles, had become increasingly focused on their live performances. In November 1976 the contents of two publicly funded reports regarding the ABC orchestras were made public. One was the Report on the Structure of the Australian Broadcasting System and Associated Matters, (the Green Report),\textsuperscript{126} the other was a draft report, Assistance to the Performing Arts, by the Industries Assistance Commission.\textsuperscript{127} Both questioned whether it was appropriate for the ABC to continue to subsidise the performance of orchestral music.\textsuperscript{128} The Green Report recommended that the ABC immediately disband a number of orchestras. While this recommendation was not adopted, a further seven reports in the coming decades continued to recommend that the orchestras be either divested or disbanded. These included the Dix Report (1980),\textsuperscript{129} the Tribe Report (1985),\textsuperscript{130} the Review of the National Broadcasting Policy (1988),\textsuperscript{131} the Waks Report (1992),\textsuperscript{132} the Federal

\textsuperscript{126} Frederick J. Green. Inquiry into the Australian Broadcasting System, Commissioned by the Postal and Telecommunications Department. Canberra: Government Printing, 1977.

\textsuperscript{127} Industries Assistance Commission: draft report on assistance to the performing arts. Commissioned by the Industries Assistance Commission, Canberra, 1976.

\textsuperscript{128} Sametz. op.cit.,p.302


One of the principal concerns raised by the various reports was that orchestras should be managed in a way that allowed them to be more fully integrated with their communities. For example the Dix Report (1981) states:

> The orchestras were established primarily to provide music for the broadcast service and the need for other uses of the orchestra has increased. The ABC’s current internal structure serving orchestral and concert management is inappropriate and distances the orchestra from changing community needs in their state.

In 1985, the publication of the Tribe Report reiterated many of the messages of the Dix Report, including the necessity for an orchestra to be integrated with its community.

Today the importance of such integration and relevance is a central aim of all Australian orchestral education and outreach programmes.

The Sydney Symphony was the first orchestra to commence the divestment process from the ABC in 1996. The other orchestras gradually followed, and full

---

136 Sametz. op.cit.
137 Garrett. The Accidental Entrepreneur, op.cit.
138 Boyle. Efficiency and Identity: The Transition of Australia’s Symphony Orchestras from Government Departments to Corporate Entities, op.cit.
139 Dix Report, op.cit, p.17
140 Tribe Report, op.cit
symphony orchestra divestment from the ABC was completed in 2006. The path was finally clear for the orchestras to begin forging their own identities, make closer ties with their communities and audiences and take charge of their future development. However the economic impact of divestment left many of the orchestras in a precarious state financially.

This financial fragility was exposed in 2005 when Dr Brendan Nelson, Minister for Education, Science and Training, commissioned a report to examine how the orchestras were adjusting to their situation post-divestment. The resultant publication, *A New Era: Report of the Orchestras Review* (commonly known as the Strong Report), focused on the financial viability of the orchestras. A primary recommendation was for the orchestras (at that date subsidiary companies of the ABC) to be reconstituted as public companies limited by guarantee. The Strong Report also controversially advised that the Queensland Symphony Orchestra, Adelaide Symphony Orchestra and Tasmanian Symphony Orchestra should reduce the size of their ensembles to improve their financial viability. However, following strong protest, the orchestral sizes were maintained and base funding from Federal and State governments was increased.

The costs of divestment were significantly higher than expected, necessitating cuts and redundancies within several orchestras. For the Sydney Symphony, for example, the cost of divestment was $402,406. The 2007 SSO Annual Report reveals that this was higher than expected owing to increased superannuation costs. The SSO Chairman, John Conde, notes:

---

The Group [the SSO] will continue to incur these additional costs, which are expected to increase over time and will need appropriate funding as part of the 2008 government review of the impact of divestment of the former ABC Orchestras.\textsuperscript{143}

Margaret Moore, Education Manager of the SSO during this period, praises the SSO’s Board and Management for their guidance of the SSO through the divestment process. Moore comments:

They all gave something really important to the company, especially at that time when they had to do so much. Enterprise agreements had to be bargained and things that had never been done before. The SSO were lucky because they were the first one so they got a bit of a grant to help with the transition, but they found that they had huge bills in terms of insurance and superannuation.\textsuperscript{144}

During Libby Christie’s period as Managing Director of the SSO (2003-2009) the orchestra needed to make significant cuts to cover the costs noted above. Exacerbating a difficult financial situation, the orchestra also lost significant sponsorship during this period. Moore was asked to make savings in the Education Department, and needed to cut the programme substantially as well as reducing staff. As finances stabilised, the SSO was able to rebuild their education programme, and Moore comments:

When we rebuilt the programme it was very carefully done so that as we extended back into an area or we developed a new programme we made sure that we had funding support for it. So it created a stronger tree in the long run but it wasn’t an easy time. We lost some really good staff, which is a horrible thing to have to do.\textsuperscript{145}

While this was clearly a difficult time for the SSO, and for Moore personally, the divestment process has resulted in a key development: Australian orchestras are now

\textsuperscript{143} ibid.
\textsuperscript{144} M. Moore, interview.
\textsuperscript{145} ibid.
much more in control of their own identity, and are increasingly proactive in the ways they connect with their communities and respond to their audience’s needs.

Margaret Moore tells of her experience as Education Manager of the Sydney Symphony Orchestra immediately after the divestment:

Before the divestment there had been a strict ABC culture and this was a very different world. There was now the expectation that you’re not just going to be opening the page and playing. Now you’ll be involved in helping to raise money for the orchestra and involved in teaching and presenting small ensemble performances and that was a big change for the orchestra. They’d never had to take any sort of responsibility for the direction and the fiscal health of the actual organisation.¹⁴⁶

This demand for extra responsibility and personal investment, while requiring the development of new skills and qualities, was ultimately a very positive step for the orchestras. Marshall McGuire, former Executive Manager of Artistic Planning with the West Australian Symphony Orchestra (2006-2011), has expressed similar views to Moore regarding the divestment process. Like Moore, he regards the divestment period as a challenging time for Australia’s orchestras, but one that paved the way for them to take control of their own identity:

The ABC offered a unique, centralised artist and repertoire department, but it also limited the way state-based orchestras could engage their local communities and create more meaningful programs and projects suited to each city and state.¹⁴⁷

Here McGuire echoes the message from the 1980 Dix Report regarding the need for orchestras to link with their local communities and, indeed, this has been a key focus for each orchestra in the years following the divestment process. Recent years have seen considerable growth in the education and community engagement programming

¹⁴⁶ M. Moore, interview.
¹⁴⁷ McGuire, op.cit.
of each of Australia’s state orchestras. While there are certain shared characteristics across the sector, they have now each established their own approach. Further details regarding the current practice in the field in Australia are presented in the Case Studies of Chapter Twelve.

Having looked at the formative roots of orchestral education practice in Australia, the following section of the thesis examines the origins of the field in the United Kingdom. The formative influences upon British practice are identified and key points of development are discussed.
Chapter Four: Developments in the United Kingdom

From the early 1920s to the 1970s orchestral education programmes in Australia and the United Kingdom were primarily focused upon lecture-format education concerts. Similarly, in both Australia and Britain the earliest orchestral education activities rested squarely on the shoulders of one dynamic, politically astute and ambitious man. In Australia this figure was Sir Bernard Heinze (1894-1982); in Britain, Sir Robert Mayer (1880-1985). Mayer was a remarkable man by any standards, not least by the length of his life: he lived to the grand age of 105 years and was active to the end, indeed marrying his secretary when he was 101 and she 51. Mayer demonstrated significant musical ability as a child, learning the piano from the age of six at the Mannheim Conservatorium and playing for Johannes Brahms when aged eleven. Like many others, however, his parents did not wish him to have a career in the unstable world of music. In 1896, aged just seventeen, Mayer migrated to London to take up a banking position. He proved to be an astute businessman and made a significant fortune as a merchant of industrial metals, principally copper. Fortunately for musical life in Britain, Mayer decided to use this wealth to become one of the world’s leading music philanthropists, establishing the series of ‘Robert Mayer Children’s Concerts’ in 1923 and the ‘Youth and Music’ organisation in 1954. In these efforts Mayer was supported by his first wife, Dorothy Moulton Meyer, who was herself a singer and music lover. Indeed, while today Robert Mayer is the name that has lived on, many at the time regarded Robert and Dorothy Mayer as equal partners in their philanthropic initiatives.

149 ibid., p.474
150 ibid., p.474
Both Mayer and Heinze were inspired in their music education efforts by the education concerts led by Walter Damrosch in New York. As noted in Chapter One, Heinze was influenced by a meeting with Damrosch in London at Frank Bridge’s house, while for Mayer the point of inspiration came in 1919 when he and his wife attended one of Damrosch’s concerts during a trip to New York. Mayer later described this as: ‘the experience that changed my life.’\textsuperscript{151} Mayer returned to London determined to create his own children’s concerts season, and the first concert was held in the Central Hall in Westminster in 1923. Following a philosophy that he adhered to throughout his life, Mayer charged a nominal fee of a shilling because, as he later explained, ‘they wouldn’t appreciate it otherwise.’\textsuperscript{152} The first three concerts were conducted by Adrian Boult, replaced by Malcolm Sargent in 1924 who then conducted all the London concerts until 1939, when they were interrupted by the war. The concerts grew to be an equal success to those of Damrosch and provided the musical education to generations of British children, including the Queen and Prince Charles.\textsuperscript{153}

The ethos of the concert series was succinctly explained by Mayer: ‘You give children good music, well performed, and explain it, and they can’t help but like it.’\textsuperscript{154} Sargent not only conducted the concerts, he also acted as the compere, and audience participation was used to keep the audience focused and involved. Sargent was criticised for allowing applause between movements, but to this he replied:

\textsuperscript{152} ibid.
\textsuperscript{153} ibid.
\textsuperscript{154} ibid.
With young children it’s absolutely essential they should have a chance, after sitting still for ten minutes, to clap and relieve muscular tension. And why shouldn’t they clap if the music’s marvellously performed?  

The points made here by Sargent are still valid today. The need for young children to be actively involved with the music is at the core of present participatory programming for that age group. Etiquette concerning applause in orchestral concerts continues to attract controversy. Many feel that the unspoken rule of not clapping between movements of long pieces has a negative effect, contributing to classical music’s elitist reputation.

Whole symphonies and concertos were generally avoided in order to keep the children’s attention, performing single movements instead. One notable exception to this was a performance by Schnabel, who gave several concerto performances for the Mayers (always without a fee), and said that he would ‘undertake to do a complete concerto, Mozart’s G Major, without boring the children for a moment.’  

All went according to Schnabel’s plan, showing the power of a truly great performer to hold the focus of children.

Two programmes at the Westminster Central Hall focused on The Messiah, followed by a larger scale concert at the Royal Albert Hall soon after World War II. For thousands of the audience, this was their first introduction to the piece, and Sargent later spoke of their positive reaction to the music as proof that: ‘It isn’t true that young people can’t take the best things in life first time. They usually do.’  

The school concert model established by Mayer and Sargent in the early twentieth century was to continue without significant change for the next half century.

---

156 ibid., p.181  
157 ibid., p.182
A standard repertoire was gradually established for education concerts both in the UK and Australia during this period. This repertoire included works by Britten, Prokofiev and Saint-Saëns, some of which were composed specifically for educational purposes. For example, in 1946 the British Ministry of Education commissioned Benjamin Britten to write a piece for a short film entitled ‘Instruments of the Orchestra’ to be performed by the London Symphony Orchestra and conducted by Sargent. The resultant work, ‘Young Person’s Guide to the Orchestra: Variations and Fugue on a theme of Henry Purcell, Opus 34’, was premiered in Liverpool on the 15 October 1946. Other popular works include Prokofiev’s Peter and the Wolf (commissioned in 1936 by the Central Children’s Theatre in Moscow), Saint-Saëns’ Carnival of the Animals (1886) and Holst’s The Planets (1914-1916). Interestingly, the works listed above have continued to feature prominently in orchestral education programming to the present date.

In the 1970s and 1980s the next stage of orchestral education projects began to take hold in the United Kingdom, with orchestras becoming more actively involved in partnerships with schools and the community. A shift in UK government policy concerning arts education was key to this development. In 1965 Jennie Lee, the first government Minister for the Arts, wrote A Policy for the Arts: The First Steps, the foundation document for many successive government papers concerning the arts and education. Sir Roy Shaw was another key figure in establishing support towards arts education. Secretary General of the Arts Council from 1978 through to 1983, Shaw was a passionate crusader for mass education, who believed that the Arts Council’s

---

159 Doeser. Step by Step, op.cit. p.4.
The Arts Council stated that it would require all its funded organisations to engage in some form of education work and it also set a budget for education, which it used on a rolling basis with the art forms. That was a big change.\textsuperscript{162}

The terms could hardly have been spelt out more clearly: if an organisation is seeking to apply for, or retain, funding, it must demonstrate that significant effort is being made in the field of community outreach and education. This was to set in motion the proliferation of orchestral education and outreach work in the UK throughout the 1980s and into the 1990s, which effectively created a new area of employment for musicians and educators.

While this shift in policy had a significant impact upon British orchestral education programming, progress also depended upon the efforts made by certain key individuals working in the field. One of these is the British flautist, Atarah Ben-Tovim. After commencing her career as Principal Flute with the Royal Liverpool Philharmonic Orchestra, Ben-Tovim became increasingly dissatisfied with the standard of orchestral education concerts. Ben-Tovim established ‘Atarah’s Band’ in 1975 and presented a series of popular, interactive concerts across the breadth of the country. Some concerts were presented independently while others were offered in partnership with orchestras such as the Royal Liverpool Philharmonic Orchestra, City of Birmingham Symphony

\textsuperscript{160} ibid., p.4  
\textsuperscript{161} ibid., p.13  
\textsuperscript{162} Sue Robertson, quoted in James Doeser. \textit{Step by Step, op.cit.} 2014, p.13
Orchestra and the Hallé Orchestra. Ben-Tovim also established a high profile media career as a presenter for music education shows broadcast on both TV and radio.\textsuperscript{163} Ben-Tovim’s education concerts reached over three million children, with a highly participatory element; her primary aim was to encourage students to learn instruments.

Ben-Tovim can be seen as an early ‘animateur’, a role which became a firm part of British orchestral education in 1986 when the Arts Council appointed fourteen animateurs to partnership posts.\textsuperscript{164} While only three of these made it past the trial period, the role of the animateur has gone on to become a strong part of the UK’s music education landscape and a viable career path for both composers and performers. An animateur’s role in orchestral education programmes can be to present concerts, however they are frequently also composers. A key skill for animateurs is the ability to guide students in improvisation or composition workshops, and their impact upon orchestral education work is further discussed in Chapter Fifteen.

Richard McNicol has been one of the UK’s most high profile animateurs since the 1980s, and has been pivotal to the development of current orchestral education practice. McNicol remains an international leader in the field, recently establishing the Berlin Philharmonic’s Education Department at Sir Simon Rattle’s invitation. McNicol’s career has covered a diverse range of the activities available to a professional musician: he was a flautist in several leading London orchestras, after also working as a school-teacher. As a freelance London flautist McNicol performed in several schools concerts, and became dissatisfied with the way in which they were operated and

planned. McNicol gives insight into the unsatisfactory attitude towards education concerts by orchestral personnel at that date:

...the universal feeling among players was that they (schools concerts) were a waste of time and counter-productive. Generally they were done by ambitious conductors and the repertoire was chosen, I am certain, because it was what those people wanted to conduct.  

McNicol is making an interesting point here. Schools concerts are often the first engagement offered by orchestras to emerging conductors, and are often seen as a way of ‘trying out’ a new conductor in what is regarded by management as a low risk concert. Of course to the conductor this concert is seen as their chance to showcase their skills, so it is only natural that their preoccupation is with showcasing their technical and interpretative abilities rather than on creating a concert with repertoire tailored to the age of the audience. The ideal scenario would entail using a conductor for schools concerts who already has a regular role with the orchestra, or at least has been chosen for his or her skills as a presenter and educator. It is unfortunately rare to see a Chief Conductor in charge of an education concert; Leonard Bernstein, Sir Simon Rattle and Gustavo Dudamel being notable exceptions.

McNicol goes on to outline some more of his perception of 1970s schools concerts:

Long diatribes were issued at halls full of uninterested children. We all felt that this was counter-productive and that if any of those kids ever entered a concert hall again they were bonkers.  

Today, most orchestras work to ensure that their education work has a highly participatory element in order fully to engage the children. It is generally recognised

---

165 ibid. Appendix 3, p.9
166 ibid.
that if an orchestra is looking to create a meaningful and positive connection with a child then it is imperative that the work is both of the highest standard and engaging. In the early twentieth century however, a much more passive approach was common and McNicol’s activity helped to effect significant change in orchestral education practice.

In 1976 McNicol approached John Stevens, then the Chief Inspector at the Inner London Education Authority, with the idea of radically reformatting schools concerts to produce a highly interactive experience.\textsuperscript{167} Like many at the time, McNicol was inspired by John Paynter’s work \textit{Sound and Silence}, with its emphasis on the importance of participation and composition.\textsuperscript{168} As McNicol explains:

\begin{quote}
For me the door was opened by Peter Aston and John Paynter’s wonderful book ‘Sound and Silence.’ Here was the idea that we can all be composers.\textsuperscript{169}
\end{quote}

The impact of ground-breaking music educationalists such as Paynter and Aston upon the development of music education principles and practice is further investigated in Chapter Six.

In 1977 McNicol formed The Apollo Trust in partnership with Stevens, an organisation that facilitated participatory, creative education work between orchestras and schools. The activities of the Apollo Trust established a new, more interactive and dynamic format of education concert. Many of their projects included a piece composed by the children and performed in the final concert, modelled on a piece in the orchestra’s repertoire. This format is still commonly used at the time of writing in

\textsuperscript{167} ibid., p.54.
\textsuperscript{168} Paynter and Aston. \textit{Sound and Silence}, op.cit.
Britain, and is increasingly also being used by Australian orchestras. McNicol has subsequently spoken further about his personal belief in the value of such work:

By handling musical material for ourselves we gain extraordinary insight into the music of the greatest musicians of the past and of today. Throughout Britain people are being offered a new dimension to their musical experience, which draws performer and audience ever closer. Many other countries are watching our revolutionary initiative with keen interest.

The UK’s exploration of a creative approach to music education, referred to above by McNicol, continues to influence current practice internationally, as further discussed in Chapter Six.

In 1992 McNicol joined the London Symphony Orchestra (LSO) to direct their newly established Discovery Department, which remains arguably the most dynamic orchestral education department in the UK. His philosophy at the LSO centred on partnerships, co-operation, and excellence in performance, as discussed further in the following chapter. While McNicol was key to this period of development, he was not working alone. Here he acknowledges the sector wide growth in the 1980s:

During the 1980s the climate changed. Orchestras throughout Britain began to look critically at the educational provision they were offering. Simon Rattle, whilst principal conductor of the CBSO, became so convinced of the importance of education that he immersed himself in the educational activities of his orchestra. There were no bored expressions on the faces of those players, none of the shoddy ensemble and suspect tuning that comes from orchestras full of non-members for low-priority concerts. Most importantly of all, the repertoire was exciting.

---

171 Farrell and Mann, op.cit. p.62
McNicol makes particular mention here of the impact of Sir Simon Rattle at the CBSO. Even prior to this appointment, Rattle had been involved in education programming as the Assistant Conductor for the Bournemouth Symphony Orchestra and Bournemouth Sinfonietta from 1974 to 1977. Throughout his career Rattle has continued to raise the profile of orchestral education programming, as discussed further in this thesis in Chapter Six, Chapter Ten and the Conclusion.

While, as McNicol acknowledges above, many orchestras have devoted energy and ingenuity to their education work, the London Symphony Orchestra has been internationally acknowledged as a leader in the field since the 1990s. For this reason, the following chapter analyses the key points in the development of LSO Discovery Department.
Chapter Five: Development of LSO Discovery

The LSO Discovery Department is an international leader in the field of orchestral education and outreach. In this chapter the early development of this Department is analysed; current practice of LSO Discovery is discussed in Part Two of this thesis. Firstly, the structure of the orchestra itself needs to be considered. As a self-governed orchestra since its origin in 1904, LSO musicians have always had the ability to manage their own careers and development to a greater degree than those in a contracted orchestra. The choice to pursue education and outreach work is one, then, that has grown organically from within the players’ committee, not a decision imposed from above. Kathryn McDowell, the current General Manager of the LSO and former Head of Music at the Arts Council, comments on this point:

One clear example of how the LSO’s structure has driven its success, particularly in recent years, is through the LSO’s community and education programme LSO Discovery... Every member of the LSO participates in one or more of LSO Discovery’s projects and these are seen by the musicians as complementary to their role with the LSO... It is unlikely that LSO Discovery would have grown to its current scale without this depth of commitment by the members of the Orchestra and it could easily have been no more than a minor ancillary activity rather than a core part of the LSO’s work.173

While there is no doubt that the players’ commitment has been key to Discovery’s growth, the impact of key Management personnel must also be acknowledged. In particular, the decisions made by two past Managers have left a lasting legacy for the orchestra. The first of these was Ernest Fleischmann, appointed as General Manager in November 1959, a post he held for eight years before moving to the Los Angeles

---

Philharmonic. Fleischmann’s provocative and influential ideas regarding the future of the symphony orchestra were discussed in the Introduction of this thesis. In summary, his philosophy was that orchestral musicians need to be much more flexible in their skills and in the way they approach their work: that it is not sufficient to solely present concert performances, no matter how superb they may be. While this viewpoint is today widely accepted, it was quite radical in the mid twentieth century. Having such a dynamic and forward thinking manager in the 1960s clearly impacted upon the development of the LSO.

Sir Clive Gillinson, General Manager from 1984 to 2005, also made a lasting impact upon the orchestra. His contribution to music in Britain through his work at the LSO was recognised with a knighthood in 2005 upon his departure for a position at New York’s Carnegie Hall. Gillinson’s twenty-one year tenure left two significant legacies to the Education arm of the organisation. The first was the establishment of an education policy and the Discovery Department in 1988, setting in place the foundation for today’s organisation. The second was in pushing through the controversial and costly renovation of St Luke’s church in Islington into an education and outreach centre, with building completed in 2003, two years prior to Gillinson’s move to America. Norman Lebrecht notes the impact of both Fleischmann and Gillinson upon the LSO:

The future of the symphony orchestra has been envisioned most clearly by two managers of the LSO past and present. Ernest Fleischmann… announced ‘the orchestra is dead – long live the community of musicians’…Clive Gillinson, the present managing director, applied a version of this idea by challenging LSO players to tell him how much of their working week they wanted to devote to orchestral playing and what they would like to do the rest of the time- make music in hospices or prisons, for instance, or give

http://lso.co.uk/orchestra/history, accessed 1 July 2015.

ibid.
classroom demonstrations, engage with other cultures, play chamber music.\textsuperscript{176}

The LSO has the flexibility to form a variety of ensembles, from intimate chamber music groups to full-scale symphony orchestra, and the musicians work together to engage with their community. The current Director of LSO Discovery, Judith Ackrill, feels that the present strength of the Department is due to the vision of Gillinson and the team he established. In interview with the present author, Ackrill commented:

\begin{quote}
It came from the top, the Chief Executive who was there at the time, and the Board. There was real interest. It has not been difficult to make the programme happen. Secondly, because we had such strong animateurs from the start working with the orchestral players, there has been a lot of trust between the players and the programme, which means that they have been willing to tread into unknown paths.\textsuperscript{177}
\end{quote}

Gillinson certainly made a very wise choice with the initial animateur appointed to lead the team, Richard McNicol. As discussed in the previous Chapter, McNicol was instrumental in introducing a participatory, creative element to orchestral education programming. In the Association of British Orchestras ‘Workbook, Volume 2,’ published in 2000, McNicol gives insightful detail into his methods of planning and delivering education concerts. Some key points made by McNicol are: to choose music that is varied and demanding; to concentrate on one or two key aspects of the music; to prepare the audience in advance through teachers’ sessions and workshops and to choose a presenter who is part of the performance.\textsuperscript{178}

\begin{flushleft}
\begin{footnotesize}
\textsuperscript{177} Judith Ackrill, Director of London Symphony Orchestra Discovery Department. Interview by author, 10 February 2015.
\textsuperscript{178} McNicol, \textit{The Workbook Vol. 2}, op.cit., p.10.
\end{footnotesize}
\end{flushleft}
In order to maintain the strength of their animateur tradition, the LSO established a training programme known as the Edward Heath Assistant Animateur Scheme. Paul Rissmann (1996), Rachel Leach (1998) and prominent choral director and media personality Gareth Malone (2001) are three successful animateurs who have started their career through the scheme. The Assistant Animateur scheme has enabled the Discovery team to build on the strong traditions set in place by McNicol.

According to Ackrill, by setting the Department off to a good start, the development then followed on naturally, with funding attracted as the LSO education team’s reputation continued to grow. Alongside the importance of laying down a strong foundation to a programme, Ackrill also notes the importance of making strategic partnerships, and of the venues in which the Discovery team work:

The quality of what is being delivered has been high from the start so the reputation and, as a result, the demand is there. The funding has been there through sponsorship (as well as the orchestra’s own willingness to fund posts) and, thirdly, the partnerships have been there. We’ve worked very consistently with ten boroughs (previously five in the pilot phase), and increasingly better with the Guildhall. The opening of St Luke’s gave us a base that was very supported by the funders and the management, which meant that we could showcase our work in an environment which was different to the Barbican.

Richard McNicol focused on providing a highly engaging and inspiring experience to the LSO education audiences. According to McNicol:

First and foremost, our young guests must be riveted by the experience of coming to a concert and hearing a great orchestra performing live. We must offer them first-class music superbly played, and the way it is presented must fire the imagination of each individual listener. Each child must feel personally involved and must go away feeling that the concert was put on especially for him or her.

179 ‘LSO Discovery at 25,’ retrieved from http://www.lso.co.uk, accessed 15 August 2015.
180 Ackrill, interview.
Paul Rissmann has worked with the LSO for twenty years as an animateur and has thus witnessed the growth of the Discovery Department. Rissmann echoes the importance placed on quality by Ackrill and McNicol. However, he also credits the flexibility of the programme as being key to its success:

I think retaining artistic quality is the most important thing that an orchestral education programme can do. It needs to be delivered by the musicians in the orchestra and it is ok to start small but to do things that are outstanding, that are world class, rather than churn out a whole string of events that are underfunded or rehearsed. It should be about producing world-class work that stands alongside an orchestra’s aspirations for an evening performance. I’ve watched the programme grow and seen the type of work that we do change as funding streams change and requirements for engagement have changed and the curriculum has changed. So the programme has had to adapt massively to reflect those things.182

Rissmann’s comments here regarding the importance of quality over quantity connect with those of Philip Hart, presented earlier in the Literature Review of this thesis. This point is further discussed in Part Three. Rissmann also notes that all orchestral education departments are inextricably linked to developments in policy and education philosophies. The keys to LSO Discovery’s continued growth across successive decades are an unwavering commitment to quality alongside a willingness to adapt to changing circumstances.

The venues in which the LSO presents its education and community engagement programmes are also key to their success, and here both Fleischmann and Gillinson made pivotal decisions. The location of the LSO and the Guildhall School of Music and Drama (GSMD) in the same complex gives them a unique basis for their partnership. This relationship began in the late 1970s, when the LSO was selected to be the resident orchestra in the proposed Barbican complex, anecdotally outbidding

182 Paul Rissmann, UK composer and animateur. Interview by author, 16 April 2015.
the Philharmonia Orchestra at the last minute thanks to Fleischmann’s backroom dealing.\textsuperscript{183} When the Centre was opened in 1982, the two organisations began to explore ways in which to connect with each other and the local east London community.

LSO’s other key venue is LSO St Luke’s, the UBS and LSO Music Education Centre, which opened in March 2003 in a church in Islington and is today the venue for most LSO Discovery programmes. Having a venue specifically tailored for education work allows the LSO to establish a strong connection with their community, and allows them to schedule regular activities and rehearsals without needing to hire a venue. Clive Gillinson gives insight into the benefits that St Luke’s brings to the LSO:

\begin{quote}
It is vital. Music education needs to be a special experience...We used to have to hire out draughty old church halls, terrible spaces with no facilities. In St Luke’s every aspect of the experience becomes a thrill for the children. And it’s vital for us to have found an environment right in the heart of the community where we are based.\textsuperscript{184}
\end{quote}

Gillinson commented that St Luke’s allows for stronger connections between the LSO and neighbouring Bangladeshi and Turkish communities, and expresses his hopes that St Luke’s can become an ‘interface’ between the orchestra and local people: more than simply a place where classes can be held. Gillinson explains:

\begin{quote}
We have staked the stability of our organisation on our beliefs... Of course it would have been easier for us not to have done St Luke’s. But we believe that an orchestra has not only a responsibility to its art, but also to society.\textsuperscript{185}
\end{quote}

\textsuperscript{183} ‘Obituary of Ernest Fleischmann’, \textit{The Telegraph}, 16 June 2010.

\textsuperscript{184} Charlotte Higgins. ‘The trumpets are sounding for the LSO’s centenary year, but financial problems could spoil the party.’ \textit{The Guardian}, 15 January 2004, p.17.

\textsuperscript{185} ibid.
This is acknowledged on the LSO website, which speaks of their aim to ‘work in partnership with local communities,’ and provide ‘long term opportunities for the local community to join in.’\textsuperscript{186} The decision to renovate the dilapidated old church and turn it into a state of the art performance and education venue was, with the benefit of hindsight, visionary. When one considers that it came at a time when LSO was not in a comfortable position financially, the bravery of the decision is even more striking. Originally budgeted at 17 million pounds, the costs grew to 18 million, creating significant financial stress on the LSO even with the support of funders, the global financial firm UBS. Gillinson reflects upon the financial implications of the building project:

\begin{quote}
We’ve had a really tough three or four years because in making the decision to create St Luke’s, we put colossal demands on the orchestra. For an organisation that turns over 11m pounds as we do, to raise 17 m pounds was a huge undertaking.\textsuperscript{187}
\end{quote}

This interview took place upon Gillinson’s departure from the LSO in 2005. Further in the interview he observes that St Luke’s was at that date breaking even and that the deficit was almost cleared. However, even before the financial impact of the build had been resolved the benefits of the decision were clear. Public perception of the project was positive, with strong media coverage commenting that the venture marked the LSO as a leader in the orchestral field. The following is typical of British press coverage of the opening of St Luke’s:

\begin{quote}
LSO St Luke’s is a vision of the future for the symphony orchestra. It is the kind of move that makes most London orchestras look like stick-in-the-muds, adrift in the thinking of the last century…St Luke’s is not just a huge step forward for this most dynamic of Britain’s orchestras, consolidating LSO’s role in the vanguard of orchestral music in London. It is also a step
\end{quote}

\textsuperscript{186} \url{http://www.lso.co.uk/aboutlsodiscovery}, accessed 1 June 2014.
\textsuperscript{187} Stephen Moss. ‘It’s been fantastic’, \textit{The Guardian} (London), 13 May 2005, p.11
down a path that other performing arts organisations of all kinds will surely have to follow eventually - if they have the funding - of changing the terms on which orchestras meet their audiences.188

In the decade following the opening of St Luke’s the LSO Discovery Department has continued to grow, and has become a key element to the orchestra’s identity. The current activity and practice of the LSO Discovery Department is discussed in detail in Part Two of this thesis, revealing the legacy created by the pivotal early decisions discussed above.

Chapter Six: The importance of creativity

• Development of the Creative Composition Workshop

‘It is not sufficient to be able to play or sing; we must learn to compose... or we shall never be masters of this science.’ – Jean Jacques Rousseau. \(^{189}\)

The creative, composer led workshop model of orchestral education work is one that first emerged in the United Kingdom in the 1980s, following on from the ground-breaking work of composer-teachers in the 1960s. The workshop model is a highly participatory, creative focused model, which involves collaborative composition of a new piece of music. The group is directed and supported by a workshop leader, or animateur, who provides the framework and points of inspiration for the composition. Orchestral musicians are also often involved, lending their individual expertise on their instruments to help to guide and shape the composition process. This model of education program has remained particularly strong in the United Kingdom from its inception in the 1980s through to the present date. Leading British animateurs have established international careers, bringing their skillset and knowledge to countries, including Australia, that have not explored this area in such depth.

Orchestras take varied approaches to the creative workshop format. Some orchestras with a particular focus on contemporary composition will invite students to make their own creative responses to a particular contemporary work, using techniques utilised by the composer, and often overseen by the composer in person. This offers strong benefits to both the composer and students: the composer is able to

make links with a potential new audience for their work, and the workshop leading itself provides them with a valuable source of income in a financially precarious career. Such workshops offer the participants an entry point into the challenging sound world of modern music by demystifying the aims and methods of composers, as well as helping them to find their own creative voice.

Another approach to a creative workshop is to explore connections across arts forms, such as projects that respond to books, paintings or film through music. This format offers clear possibilities to educators working with the new Australian Curriculum for the Arts, which encourages cross-arts links such as these. Skilled workshop leaders are able to tailor a project to match the skill level of participants. This means that alongside playing on orchestral instruments they often make use of voice, body percussion and percussion instruments. A tradition of workshop ‘games’ and warm-up activities has also emerged, and there is a growing literature of resources and activities in the field. Generally little if any reference is made to traditional music notation, with the animateur relying on their own aural memory, recordings, and graphic notation charts to document musical ideas and help to shape the final product.

Australian orchestral education departments are increasingly introducing collaborative composition workshops to their programming. Over the past decade several specialists, trained in this field in the UK, have delivered projects with Australian orchestras. These have included Paul Rissmann, Fraser Trainer, Gillian Moore and Matthew Barley, who have each passed on their skills to Australian musicians and music educators through a combination of education workshops in partnership with symphony orchestras, and training sessions for musicians and educators. These opportunities have primarily been offered by the Melbourne
Symphony Orchestra in the past. However, they are currently being increasingly explored by other Australian state orchestras including, in 2015, the Adelaide and Tasmanian Symphony Orchestras. In this chapter the development of the creative workshop model in the UK is discussed, as well as an assessment of the value that such a model presents to both the practitioners and participants.

The development of this model owes much to two key figures working with British orchestras in the late 1970s and 1980s; namely Richard McNicol, through his work with the Apollo Trust and the LSO, and Gillian Moore, in her role as the first Education Manager at the London Sinfonietta. However the impetus behind the establishment of this particular model of orchestra education project came from a variety of factors, and it is necessary to look further back, to the 1960s, to understand the development of creativity in the teaching of music in the UK. Developments in classroom music education methodology of the 1960s and 1970s led to the demand for the participatory, composer driven education projects subsequently offered by UK orchestras.

The 1960s were a decade of creative ferment and renewal in many sectors of society. Music education was one of these, principally led by some dynamic composers working within the school education system. This period has been well documented by Stephanie Pitts in her book *A Century of Change in Music Education*.\(^{190}\) Pitts comments that:

> The changing concept of music education that was beginning to emerge in the 1960s challenged the supremacy of listening and teacher-directed performance that had characterised the first half of the twentieth century...Most importantly, a reinterpretation of musical and educational

\(^{190}\) Pitts, op.cit.
aims made the connection with composition, which assumed an increasingly significant place in music teaching.\textsuperscript{191}

Pitts also notes that:

The influence of the ‘composer-teacher’ had been developing throughout the century...In the 1960s and 1970s, this model reached mainstream school, as a small number of young composers took up teaching posts, so bringing their musical experience to an unprecedented number of pupils.\textsuperscript{192}

One of the most influential of these teacher-composers, John Paynter, was instrumental in bringing about a revolution in music education with the publication of the seminal work \textit{Sound and Silence}, published in 1970 and written with Peter Aston, his colleague at the music department of the University of York.\textsuperscript{193} In previous decades music education had been primarily a matter of theory and listening, of learning through studying the works of others. With \textit{Sound and Silence} came the idea of helping children to understand music by creating it themselves. In the Introduction to \textit{Sound and Silence} Paynter and Aston elaborate upon this idea, radical for its time. They make the point that it is expected that children should learn about the visual arts and literature by both studying works of art and also creating their own paintings, stories and poems. Only music education was missing this crucial element of learning through the act of creation, and it was this imbalance that Paynter and Aston sought to correct.

Sir Peter Maxwell Davies is another teacher-composer who contributed to this new method of music education. Upon taking a post as Music Teacher at Cirencester Grammar School in 1959, Maxwell Davies explored new possibilities for classroom composition. His success in this area has been highly influential. Maxwell Davies has also composed pieces allowing for children to participate with symphony orchestras in

\textsuperscript{191} ibid., p.66
\textsuperscript{192} ibid., p.73
\textsuperscript{193} Paynter and Aston. \textit{Sound and Silence}, op.cit.
concert performances. The most notable of these remains ‘The Turn of the Tide,’ which is discussed in detail in Chapter Seven.\textsuperscript{194}

The development of classroom composition practice was to a large degree enabled by compositional techniques such as serialism, minimalism and atonality. School class composition projects benefitted from the freedom offered by modern techniques and styles which freed students from strict rules of harmony and voice leading and, in projects using graphic scores, even from the skill of reading and notating music. George Self’s work, \textit{New Sounds in Class}, published in 1967, was a key influence on the development of graphic score notation, evolving from his work in schools in the mid-1960s.\textsuperscript{195} \textit{New Sounds in Class} includes a collection of graphic scores to be performed by classroom percussion ensembles. Self’s views pre-empt those of Paynte and Aston, for instance when he writes:

\begin{quote}
It is a sad reflection that although many children use their creative energies in painting and poetry, their musical activities are usually confined to performance and listening; with simplified notation it is possible for average children to compose music- and almost this alone would warrant its introduction.\textsuperscript{196}
\end{quote}

Following this period of rethinking how and why children should learn music in schools came a re-evaluation of education by the UK government, which resulted in the creation of the \textit{National Curriculum} and the \textit{Education Reform Act} in 1988.\textsuperscript{197} This was the point at which the new impetus towards teaching music through composition gained official recognition, although not without a struggle. During the 1980s there

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{194} Jolyon Laycock. \textit{A Changing Role for the Composer in Society: A Study of the Historical Background and Current Methodologies of Creative Music-Making}. Bern: Peter Lang European Academic Publisher, 2005, p. 47
\item \textsuperscript{196} George Self, quoted in Pitts, op.cit., p.78
\item \textsuperscript{197} \textit{Education Reform Act}, UK Parliament, 1988.
\end{itemize}
was a rift between those favouring traditional methods of music education, and those championing the new, participatory, approach. However when the statutory orders for music were published in 1992 it was clear that the decision had been reached in favour of composition in schools. There were two attainment targets for music: ‘Attainment Target One for Performing and Composing,’ and ‘Attainment Target Two for Listening and Appraising.’ The UK government department known as ‘Ofsted’ (Office for Standards in Education) carries out regular inspections of teaching in all schools across the United Kingdom. The 1995 Report states:

Lessons in which the teaching is good or very good usually have composing and appraising as their dominant activities, and employ performing as a supporting skill.\(^{198}\)

It is clear that the official education bodies were in favour of a move towards a more participatory, creative approach to music education, and this approach gradually became established across the sector. By the mid 1990s this approach was well developed; as Richard McNicol observed:

\[\text{...the quiet revolution from passive to practical classroom music in Britain and the subsequent introduction of a National Music Curriculum embracing this principle have established us as the undisputed world leader in music education.}^{199}\]

Further in this article McNicol commented on the growing international recognition of such work, and of the admiration he had observed on his travels for the: ‘leap of imagination we in Britain have taken in decreeing that every child shall learn to compose, to perform and, through this process, to understand music.’\(^{200}\)

---

\(^{198}\) Ofsted 1995 Report, as quoted in Pitts, op.cit., p.198


\(^{200}\) ibid. pp. 642-643
While the decision to give children skills and confidence in composing and creating their own music was undoubtedly a positive step, it also caused difficulties for teachers unfamiliar with composition and improvisation. This lack of confidence in teaching composition in the classroom directly contributed to the popularity of the compositional workshop education projects devised and offered by symphony orchestras in the 1980s and 1990s.

The London Sinfonietta was one of the key innovators of partnership work between orchestras and schools and made a significant contribution to the establishment of the creative music workshop model. Michael Vyner was the Musical Director for the London Sinfonietta from 1972 until his death in 1989. During this period, Vyner established a community minded focus within the organisation and sought to merge music and education together in order to bring contemporary music into contact with a wider sector of society. In 1983 Vyner appointed Gillian Moore as Education Officer with the London Sinfonietta, the first official post of its kind in the United Kingdom. Moore has continued to make a significant contribution to classical music and music education in the UK to the present day. She served on the Government’s National Curriculum Working Group in 1990, helping to create the National Curriculum for Music in England and Wales. Since 1993 Moore has been working at the South Bank Centre in a variety of roles, including Head of Education and more recently Head of Classical Music, and she is also a Visiting Professor at the Royal College of Music. Here, however, it is her work with London Sinfonietta that is of particular interest.

The London Sinfonietta was established in 1968 and principally focuses on contemporary and twentieth-century orchestral repertoire. While Moore’s initial
appointment was for one year she stayed in her role for ten years, before leaving to work for the South Bank centre as their Head of Education. Under Moore’s guidance, the London Sinfonietta were pioneers of participatory orchestral education work, working closely with many of the world’s leading composers and performers and setting an example which has since been followed throughout the UK and world wide. The first decade of London Sinfonietta’s Education Programming (from 1983 to 1993) has been extensively researched and analysed by Julia Winterson. Winterson’s article ‘An Evaluation of the Effects of London Sinfonietta Education Projects on their Participants’ found that students involved in London Sinfonietta Education Projects generally developed a positive attitude to modern music. The majority enjoyed both the workshop activities and the concert presented by the Sinfonietta at the conclusion of their project. In this respect it would appear the Sinfonietta was therefore successful in achieving their stated aims:

The policy was and has remained a commitment to breaking down the barriers which had traditionally existed between composers and performers on one side and audiences (or potential audiences) on the other, to making today’s music available and accessible to as wide a public as possible and to handing over the rich resources at our disposal to encourage active and creative involvement in music making among many different groups of people.

In an interview with Winterson in August 1995, Moore talks about her early work as Education Officer with the London Sinfonietta, and gives insight into why composition workshops became a focus of her work there:

Many teachers were desperate for input into composing work. That is why the vast majority of orchestras’ work with children was concerned with

---

composing...composing was the new thing in the curriculum at the time and it was what teachers needed help with.\textsuperscript{203}

In the educational workshop model as developed by Moore, composers would work alongside students, using one of their own works as a blueprint, and create a new work inspired by the musical techniques used in the original composition. The resulting work was then often performed at the commencement of a London Sinfonietta concert. This style of education programme is highly participatory for the students involved and gives them a unique insight into the way in which a composer works. They gain a new understanding of the compositional techniques discussed as well as the various timbres and characteristics of a symphony orchestra. Following the conclusion of the workshop projects students demonstrated an ability to listen to the original compositions with a new level of understanding and concentration. Students were able in this way to gain direct insight into major contemporary compositions, and often had personal contact with the composers themselves. Early London Sinfonietta education programmes focused on the works of leading contemporary composers, such as Lutoslawski, Varèse, Boulez and Stravinsky.\textsuperscript{204}

One of the earliest London Sinfonietta education projects, begun in September 1983, was analysed by David Ruffer. This project focused on Edgard Varèse, and began with workshops using his music as a model, followed by an evening with members of the London Sinfonietta. Ruffer states:

\ldotsone of the most significant achievements of the course was that it had brought together a group of teachers with a wide variety of experiences in teaching music to secondary-age children and had built up enough self-

\textsuperscript{203} Winterson. PhD thesis, op.cit. Appendix 6, p.33
\textsuperscript{204} ibid., pp.81-82.
confidence in them for group composition to take place without the need, or aid, of notation.\textsuperscript{205}

Clearly the London Sinfonietta education programmes were successful in achieving a key aim for orchestral education programming: namely, helping the participants to develop a connection and familiarity with the traditions and techniques of classical music.

Looking further north, the Scottish Chamber Orchestra was also early to explore new ways to connect musicians with their community. Under the guidance of Managing Director Ian Ritchie (1984-1993) the Scottish Chamber Orchestra established its creative learning department, SCO Connect, in 1987. In 1985 Ritchie appointed Sir Peter Maxwell Davies as the SCO’s first Associate Composer/Conductor. During his tenure in this position, Maxwell Davies wrote ten concertos between 1988 and 1995 for the Principal SCO players. Known as the ‘Strathclyde Concertos’, they were created with the remit to serve a dual purpose as a focus for the SCO’s education work in schools: students across Scotland created their own compositional responses to the concertos. In Ritchie’s words, this endeavour was ‘the catalyst for unprecedented creativity and development in the lives of composers and orchestral musicians, catapulting them beyond the concert hall into the heart of the classroom and the local community.’\textsuperscript{206} The SCO has continued to work at the forefront of international practice in community engagement to the present date, serving the breadth of Scotland through touring programmes and an increasingly strong online presence.


Following the initial ground-breaking period of creative-based orchestral education programming, there followed an inevitable but necessary second phase of reflection and critical assessment. Interestingly, although Moore was instrumental in establishing the initial popularity of the format, she was also one of the first to recognise the importance of objective criticism, and has highlighted several issues in particular that she feels needs addressing. These include the need for longer periods of contact with students and the importance of including opportunities for students to perform alongside the orchestra as well as compose. Most UK symphony orchestras are today taking a balanced approach to their education programming for school students, achieved through a combination of education concerts, participatory concerts, creative music workshops and school visits. It would, however, be a loss for the UK to not recognise the strength of their tradition in creative collaborative workshops, and their ability to assist orchestras in other countries to develop such work.

• **The place of creativity in schools**

Several high-profile figures in the arts and education have stressed the importance of assisting children to access their creativity. In 1992, for example, Sir Simon Rattle campaigned against a proposed review of National Curriculum that was potentially going to reduce the creative element of the Music Curriculum. According to Pauline Tambling, former Director of Education and Training at the Arts Council of England:

---

208 ibid. p.33
It was only because Sir Simon Rattle, in his first major public intervention on behalf of music education, stood up for creative music in the primary school against the then Education Minister, Kenneth Clarke, that composition, performing and appraising remained equal parts of the new curriculum.\footnote{Jo Shapcott. Orchestras and Education: A New Era. Commissioned by the Association of British Orchestras, 1998, p.6.}

The 1992 campaign in favour of creativity in the curriculum by Rattle and his fellow supporters was successful, although there remained a lack of consensus upon this point. The use of graphic notation in creative classroom work has been particularly divisive: some celebrate the way that it opens up the world of music composition to students regardless of their previous musical studies, while others feel that it shows a lack of respect for serious music theoretical study and tradition. Today it is generally accepted that a balanced approach to music education must include both participatory and theoretical activities. While the question of notation can still be divisive, an approach has gradually been developed that incorporates both creativity and theory holistically. As leading American educator Eric Booth comments:

I think musical language works like foreign language- we learn it fastest and most excitedly when we are actively immersed in the life of it, not as an exercise apart from its vitality and relevance. Yes, teach standard notation at the teachable moment, but no, don’t postpone the excitement until a level of mastery is attained.\footnote{Booth. The Music Teaching Artist’s Bible, op.cit. p.101}

In 1999 Rattle again advocated for creativity in the music classroom when he served on the National Advisory Committee commissioned by Blair’s New Labour government and chaired by leading educator Sir Ken Robinson. This Committee published the landmark report All Our Futures: Creativity, Culture and Education (also
known as the Robinson Report) in 1999. The key recommendation was that education, specifically school education, needs a much stronger emphasis on creativity and culture, not only in order to ensure that students’ talents and abilities in such areas are supported and fostered, but also to equip them for careers that will require such skills. The report stated that creative thinking is necessary for great achievements in not only the arts, but also science and business. The report also claims that a standard school education relies too heavily upon rote learning and logic.

The Robinson Report stressed the need for partnerships in order to supply children with an ideal skill set, stating:

There is a compelling argument for closer working partnerships between schools and outside organisations.

The Robinson Report also noted that many organisations, including symphony orchestras, were already working in partnership with schools, but that such work was at that date underfunded and not given sufficient weight at management level.

In 2002, four years after the publication of the Robinson Report, the UK government implemented many of the recommendations with the ‘Creative Partnerships’ initiative, which aimed to develop long-term partnerships between schools and cultural organisations. Creative Partnerships received substantial government funding to achieve its goals, totalling forty million pounds between 2002-2011. Initially targeting sixteen pilot areas, the programme rapidly expanded and reached one million children at over 5,000 English schools. Awarded the 2011 WISE Award from the World Innovation Summit for Education, Creative Partnerships

---

211 Sir Ken Robinson (Chair), All Our Futures: Creativity, Culture and Education. Co-commissioned by the Department for Education and Employment and the Department for Culture, Media and Sport. London: National Advisory Committee on Creative and Cultural Education, 1999.

212 ibid.,p.8.
attracted significant attention both within the UK and internationally. While it has since been superseded by the British Music Hub system, the Creative Partnership system has a great deal to offer to other organisations looking to partner with schools. This is evident in the quantity of research undertaken upon Creative Partnerships, which is archived on the ‘Creativity, Culture and Education’ website.\(^{213}\)

Sir Ken Robinson has continued to champion the importance of creativity in school education over the past two decades, using his growing public profile to highlight the issue. His 2006 TED talk, on the topic ‘Do Schools Kill Creativity,’ is the most viewed in TED history, with 32,994,443 downloads to date.\(^{214}\) Key claims made in this speech include that: ‘creativity now is as important in education as literacy, and we should treat it with the same status,’ and, ‘we don’t grow into creativity, we grow out of it.’\(^{215}\) Robinson has subsequently presented two more TED broadcasts on related topics in 2010 and 2013, and consistently advocates for the place of the arts in the curriculum. Robinson’s books are a valuable resource for educators looking to develop creativity, as detailed in the List of Sources.

The level of interest in Robinson’s views is a clear indication that his opinions resonate internationally with both teachers and parents. The only question is to what degree arts educationalists and practitioners will partner together in order to enable students to maximise their potential creativity. Symphony Orchestras can potentially continue to play a leading role in this respect: orchestral creative workshops help children to access their imagination and develop confidence in their creative skills.


\(^{215}\) Ibid.
They provide an enjoyable, yet educative, way for students to explore their own musical voice, and thus retain their relevance to the present date.

**Composition and Creativity in Australian Music Education and Orchestral Education Programmes**

Creative music workshops are a relatively new introduction to Australian orchestral education programming. The Melbourne Symphony Orchestra has led the way, as discussed in the Case Study in presented in Chapter Twelve. In recent years, other Australian orchestras have also begun to explore the possibilities of such programmes. As noted earlier in this chapter, Australian orchestras frequently use British specialists when offering creative workshops, and it is important to ensure that the skills of these visiting artists are passed on to Australian musicians.

The establishment of the new Australian National Curriculum for the Arts, which has a strong emphasis on a ‘Making’ strand of learning, is likely to increase the market for such work. Orchestras and other arts organisations may be of assistance to schools in their approach to this element of the Curriculum. This assumption is based upon the rapid growth of creative music workshops in the UK between orchestras and schools upon the establishment of the UK National Curriculum, which, as noted above, had a similar emphasis upon composition. This point is explored further in Part Three of this thesis.

A new focus in Australia on the importance of creativity in the music classroom is evident in a growing body of research on the topic over the past decade. For example, at the 2005 Conference in Melbourne of the ‘Australian Association for
Research in Music Education,’ Harry Burke’s presentation made direct correlations between music education in the state of Victoria in the twenty first century and the work of John Paynter and his associates.\textsuperscript{216}

The links between Australian, British and American music education practice are also investigated in a recent article in the \textit{Journal of Historical Research in Music Education}.\textsuperscript{217} In this article Robin Stevens, music education professor at the Melbourne Conservatorium of Music, observes that: ‘The origin of school music in Australia is essentially that of transplanted British educational practice.’\textsuperscript{218} This paper also makes the point that investigation of creative music making in the classroom had begun earlier in the UK than in Australia:

\begin{quote}
Creativity and spontaneous music making had been a focus of music education in England since the 1950s, while an emphasis on creativity did not begin in Australia until the 1980s.\textsuperscript{219}
\end{quote}

While the article is focused on the development of classroom music education, a similar point could be made regarding orchestral education work in the two nations.

In the present year of writing, 2015, Australian orchestras are only starting to embrace the UK style collaborative creative workshop. In the past, however, Australian orchestras have supported composition through other initiatives, the most common being development programmes for young composers. These are generally offered to high school students and emerging professionals and offer mentorship and performance opportunities. Such programmes include Sydney Symphony Orchestra’s

\begin{itemize}
\item ibid. p.51
\item ibid., p.137.
\item ibid., p.146.
\end{itemize}
Sinfonietta Program, Melbourne Symphony Orchestra’s 21st Century Cybec Young Composers Program, West Australian Symphony Orchestra’s Composition Project and the Tasmanian Symphony Orchestra’s Symphony Australia Composer School. An earlier project, the ‘ASME Composer-in-Residence and Young Composers Project,’ was initiated in 1994 by Professor Gary McPherson, and analysed by Margaret Barrett. Barrett’s findings were that the chief aims of such programmes were twofold: to mentor a new generation of young composers, and to create new repertoire for performance by school and community groups. She attributes the establishment of such programmes to ‘the growing interest in music composition in educational contexts,’ which she sees:

…reflected in two significant factors: a developing research culture that investigates the contexts, motivations, processes and products of students engaged in composition activity; and, in the last decade, the placement of composition as a central tenet of curriculum policy nationally (Curriculum Corporation, 1994) and internationally (Department for Education, 1995, MENC, 1994).220

While the value of such programmes is unquestioned, UK style collaborative workshops have the capacity to substantially increase Australian orchestras’ impact upon the composition skills of all school students, not merely those who have already demonstrated talent in this area. This point is further discussed in Part Three of the thesis, making particular reference to possibilities for future development in this area in Australia. The following three chapters discuss further points of influence upon the development of orchestral education programming, which also have the potential to impact future practice.

---

Chapter Seven: The role of the Association of British Orchestras

The Association of British Orchestras (ABO) has had a considerable impact upon the growth and development of education programmes in the United Kingdom. Founded in 1947 as the Orchestral Employers’ Association, in 1982 the Association took on limited company status, rebranded as the Association of British Orchestras. There are currently over 175 members of the ABO in the United Kingdom, all of which benefit from nationwide collaborative support and networking. The Education and Community work of the UK’s orchestras has been a central focus of the ABO for some time, as stated in its mission statement:

As a champion of the education and community work of the UK's orchestras, one of the ABO's key objectives has been the support and development of this core area of work. A series of nationally co-ordinated education projects over the past years resulted in a well established Orchestras in Education programme, which existed to promote the education work of member orchestras and to develop the relationship between schools, teachers and orchestral players.221

The ABO has been involved in music education since the early 1990s, managing centrally coordinated education projects and participating in research. As an Association it champions the education and community work of UK orchestras and opera companies, highlighting activities in the field through publications, briefings, and conferences. Of particular interest are the two National Education Programmes facilitated by the ABO in 1993 and 1997, and wide-scale research projects conducted by the ABO on British orchestral education work. The ABO has released several publications which raise issues relevant to education managers worldwide, offer advice

and resources and provide an overview of developments in the orchestral education field. Full details of these publications can be found in the List of Sources.

The first National Education Programme coordinated by the ABO was held in 1993. This is commonly known as ‘The Turn of the Tide,’ after the central piece composed by Sir Peter Maxwell Davies. For this programme the ABO commissioned Maxwell Davies to write a piece of music for orchestra and children on the theme of the environment. Sixteen orchestras participated in the project, which was aimed at helping primary school teachers to develop confidence in teaching music by encouraging them to explore their own creativity. A written resource was included in the programme to help guide teachers through the activities available to students. Here the ABO states the aims of ‘The Turn of the Tide’ project:

Its objectives were firstly to raise awareness of this important work, and its potential to support the newly introduced national Curriculum of Music, and secondly to encourage those orchestras new to education work through training, direct specialist advice and participation with their more experienced colleagues in a nationally organised scheme.  

Over 40,000 school children benefited from the highly participatory programme, which was allocated a generous 300,000 pound budget. Another benefit was that the public profile of orchestral education work in the United Kingdom was significantly boosted. The adage ‘strength in numbers’ was true in this case- the sheer number of

---

222 Libby MacNamara (Director, Association of British Orchestras). Foreword. In Fiona Lockwood (editor), Workbook, Association of British Orchestras, 1997.  
223 Laycock. A Changing Role for the Composer in Society, op.cit., p. 47
participants involved made it newsworthy and thus helped the work to gain public attention, including a feature BBC documentary. 224

In 1997, as part of its 50th anniversary celebrations, the ABO ran a second National Education Programme involving forty-five orchestras and opera companies. This programme however was arguably less successful than the first, lacking the clear focus of the initial programme. The 1997 National Education Programme (NEP) took the form of a more general year-long focus on orchestral education, incorporating a variety of activities including the publication of ‘Mapping the Field’ (a statistical document by Phyllida Shaw) and several Professional Development initiatives. These focused on areas such as networking, disability awareness, evaluation and workshop skills. In addition, forty-one ABO members nominated a particular educational activity as their ‘contribution’ to the NEP. While there was clearly a positive intention behind the second NEP, its lack of focus was noted:

Artistically many felt that the NEP had failed to claim an identity and that orchestras and opera companies didn’t really feel part of the whole…The need to have an artist at the heart of the national project, steering the content, was perhaps most missed. 225

This feedback is particularly pertinent to other organisations contemplating similar collaborative events. The first National Education Programme was successful because it had a single, high quality, point of focus. This highlights the value of commissions intended to be shared between orchestras; the initial financial outlay can be seen to have a clear and lasting impact.

---

224 Pauline Tambling. A Year in the Life: The ABO’s National Education Programme. Commissioned by the Association of British Orchestras, 1996-97, p.3
225 ibid., p.9.
A further important role of the Association of British Orchestras is identifying areas of potential development and skills shortages in orchestral education. For example the ‘Year in the Life’ publication concludes with a list of ‘Issues for further consideration,’ including:

- The relationship of an orchestra’s education policy to its artistic policy. How integrated is the education programme?
- Sufficient time and resources for player training and for the proper evaluation of projects.
- The extent to which the funding source determines the scope and content of an education programme.\(^\text{226}\)

Each of these points is a potentially contentious but important factor for continued growth of orchestral education and outreach practice, not only within the UK, but also across the international sector. Education managers may find it difficult to find a forum in which they are comfortable expressing their concerns over such issues. They are, however, points that it would be valuable to explore within the supportive structure of a national meeting of Education Managers.

One of the most crucial areas for development in orchestral education practice, as identified by the ABO, is that of evaluation. The ABO first raised this issue in 1989 when Sue Robertson (then Director of Education Programmes at the South Bank Centre) presented a paper at a meeting of ABO Education Managers on the subject of evaluation. Robertson raised eight key points for reflection:

- What are our terms and what do they mean (aims, objectives, targets)?
- What are we trying to evaluate?

\(^{226}\) Ibid., p.17.
• Whose experience are we trying to evaluate?
• Who are we evaluating for?
• How do we evaluate? What methods do we select and why?
• How long should the period of evaluation be in relation to a particular project?
• What do we do with the results of our evaluation?
• What are the practical implications of evaluation for all arts organisations?²²⁷

Robertson’s points remain applicable today to evaluation of orchestral education programmes, more than twenty-five years after her presentation. In 1997 the topic was again raised by two key figures at the ABO, Pauline Tambling (Director of Education and Training at the Arts Council of England) and Jo Shapcott (Education Adviser to the ABO). Tambling commented:

While most education managers recognise the importance of evaluating individual projects, the regular evaluation of the programme as a whole is not undertaken as a matter of course; nor are similar standards, aims or expectations applied across the profession as a whole.²²⁸

Shapcott who, like Robertson, worked as an Education Officer at the Southbank Centre during the 1980s, contributed a paper on the subject to the 1997 ABO Workbook, entitled ‘Conversations about Evaluation: have we moved on?’²²⁹ In this paper Shapcott presents her response to Robertson’s provocative presentation and questions whether sufficient progress had been made in the area. Shapcott comments that Education Managers often feel ‘threatened by evaluation’. In an interview between Shapcott and

²²⁷ Workbook, ABO, 1997, op.cit. p.27.
²²⁸ Tambling. A Year in the Life, op.cit. p 16
²²⁹ Workbook, op.cit., p. 27
Robertson several key points are raised. The first relates to the importance of being able to provide clear and quantified data to support the aims of education work:

> We all make enormous claims for education work and heavy demands for its resourcing, so we have to be able to say why it is important in more than simply superficial terms. We have to find the language and the data to support our claims.\(^\text{230}\)

Robertson makes the point that it is crucial for education managers to be clear and honest about the aims of the work:

> Education work is still, all too often, done against the backdrop of the basic, ‘Audiences of the Future’ argument. We need to be clear at the outset of any project, whether it is work in its own right for here and now, or whether it is about audience building and positive positioning for the arts. In order to evaluate it we need to get our aims straight from the start.\(^\text{231}\)

Robertson is here addressing a key point regarding the aims of orchestral education programming. As noted in the Introduction of the thesis, the original motivation for many orchestral education departments was the desire to create the ‘audience of the future.’ However it became evident during the interview process for this research that a gradual shift away from this focus has gradually occurred over the ensuing decades. When questioned on this point, each Education manager responded that this was no longer a primary focus for their work, although it remains a potential positive side benefit. Interestingly, Timothy Walker (Managing Director of the London Philharmonic Orchestra) and Simon Lord (Director of Artistic Planning at the Adelaide Symphony Orchestra) still look to orchestral education programming to build future audiences.

This suggests a developing shift in values between Education Managers and other

\(^{230}\) ibid. p. 28
\(^{231}\) ibid, p.28
Management staff, and is certainly a point that needs to be clarified by each Education Department in order to make a basis for evaluation of programming.

The issue of effective evaluation has remained a focus by the ABO in more recent years. In 2008 the Paul Hamlyn Foundation funded a publication on qualitative evaluation, after a meeting in April 2008 had identified evaluation methodology as an area in which ABO members still required assistance. The publication, entitled Make the Difference: Evaluating Education Projects, is a substantial 53-page examination of the aims of evaluation and ways to incorporate evaluation techniques into all stages of an education programme, from initial planning to post-event reflection. Various methods for evaluation are examined, including observation, written surveys, telephone surveys and face-to-face surveys. The relative benefits and weaknesses for each method are presented, as well as a break down of the specific tasks involved in carrying out the survey in each category. Further valuable advice is presented in writing questionnaires that are clear, precise, relevant and neutral, and finally methods of analysing the data, compiling an evaluation report and disseminating the reports are suggested.

Further ABO initiatives include ‘Orchestras in Education,’ intended to inform primary school teachers about the work of orchestras in schools. The ‘Early Years Cluster Programme’ aims to boost the skills and confidence of professional musicians and early years practitioners in working with music with young children. After incorporating responsibilities for Youth Orchestras in 2010, the ABO has worked to connect Youth Orchestras with the professional sector.

---

and Symphony Orchestras are essential to ensure that the next generation of orchestral musicians are supported and inspired in their learning. Even if they do not go on to be professional musicians, they can potentially be the supporters and audiences for classical music as they move into their adult lives. The need to establish a personal connection with these young musicians is of paramount importance for Symphony Orchestras, a point that is further discussed in the Conclusion of the thesis.

In summary, the Association of British Orchestras has made a significant contribution to the development of orchestral education and outreach programming in the United Kingdom. The many publications commissioned by the ABO over the past twenty years continue to be of relevance and interest today, not only for orchestras and educators in the United Kingdom but also internationally.

In Australia, ‘Symphony Services International’ (SSI, formerly known as ‘Symphony Australia’) is a comparable national organisation representing symphony orchestras. In the orchestral education field, SSI has a primary focus upon supporting the next generation of elite musicians. This is achieved through various programmes that support emerging soloists, conductors, professional orchestral personnel and composers. These programmes are all of high importance, and have been successful in achieving their aims. SSI has also played an important role in the commissioning of new works for orchestral education programmes, such as the recent Paul Rissmann composition H2Oz. SSI makes a significant contribution to Australian music, acting in a national advocacy role for orchestral education programming, and continues to develop resources in this area for Australian orchestras.
Chapter Eight: The ‘Music Hub’ Model

Partnerships between British orchestras and education organisations have attracted international attention over the past decade, and the role of UK government policy has had a significant impact in this respect. The National Curriculum and Education Reform Act (1988), All Our Futures (1999), Creative Partnerships (2002) and the Music Manifesto (2005) each mark a fresh attempt to establish an equitable and efficient arts education system. While there are currently concerns about reduction of funding to arts education in the UK, the government has supported arts education in various key ways over past decades. On the 21st of November 2007, for example, the government made a funding commitment to music education of 332 million pounds, some of which was to be used to further develop orchestral education programmes and the links between orchestras and their communities. Two key programmes were developed from this funding, both of which have had an impact upon orchestral education programming: ‘Sing Up’, a nation wide singing programme, and ‘Wider Opportunities’, a programme for large-group instrumental teaching within schools.

The ‘Music Hub’ model is the current government sponsored system in the UK, aiming to foster partnerships between arts and education organisations. While not without its detractors, the Music Hub model is nevertheless attracting international

---

236 Creative Partnerships. Commissioned by the Department for Culture, Media and Sport, UK, 2002.
attention. In this chapter the development of the Music Hub model is charted, alongside an analysis of its early practice.

In 2010 the UK government commissioned a Review of Music Education in England. Darren Henley was commissioned to chair the review and collated evidence on the current state of music education across England. Fiona Harvey represented the Association of British Orchestras in this process, alongside several orchestral education managers and Chief Executives.239 The report was released in February 2011, with the over-riding message of the need for better partnership working between arts and educational organisations.240 Henley also found that Music Education across England was not uniformly excellent and that areas of less wealth were proportionally offered fewer music education opportunities. The *Henley Report* rapidly led to the development of the *National Plan for Music Education*, published by the government on the 22nd of November 2011.241 The *National Plan* aimed to bring Henley’s vision of fairness, collaboration and partnership to fruition via a scheme of national Music Education Hubs, which would align the activities of key arts and education organisations. In the Foreword to the *National Plan for Music Education*, Michael Gove (Secretary of State for Education) and Ed Vaizey (Minister for Culture, Communications and Creative Industries) state:

> Funds for music education hubs will be awarded following an open application process run by Arts Council England which will focus on outcomes for pupils, partnership working and economies of scale...this is the first time that a National Plan for Music Education has set out a central vision for schools, arts and education organisations to drive excellence for music education. The National Plan is clear about the importance of

---

239 Fiona Harvey. Interview by author, 5 December 2011.
music: it will ensure not just that more children have access to the greatest of art forms, but that they do better as a result in every other subject.242

In interview with the author Fiona Harvey comments on the Music Hub Model:

It is about partnership working, it is about putting the child and young people at the centre and seeing what their needs are in each local area, and how can we provide this in the most effective way….with probably less funding, because there is less funding to go around.243

The reduction in funding is acknowledged in the National Plan, although it is camouflaged by positive sound-bites and hopeful predictions. The funding dropped from 77 million pounds in 2012 to 65 million pounds in 2013, then 60 million pounds in 2014.244 So the reality of the figures is that this new spirit of collegiality and partnership, while laudable, is also intended to help less money go further by streamlining operations. The rationale behind the new funding system is population based, as Fiona Harvey explains:

Before the Hubs system there was no parity throughout the country in terms of how different music services were funded. As part of the Henley Review they decided that Hubs would be funded per capita of pupil in their area- they had to know what the school population was. So some Hubs (that were Music Services) got more funding while others got a massive decrease to start with.245

To fully understand the shift in England’s music education system, it is necessary to understand the historical system for provision of music education. In recent decades England’s music education has been provided to a large degree by Music Services as well, of course, as classroom teaching. Music Services, funded by local councils,

243 Fiona Harvey, interview, 2011 .
244 Fiona Harvey. Interview by author, 30 March 2015.
245 ibid.
facilitate peripatetic teaching of singing and instruments in schools and specialised private tuition in after-school classes at music centres. Some Music Services were already working in partnership with Symphony Orchestras and their education programmes prior to the Henley Review, and the Music Hub system hopes to encourage further partnership along these lines. The Music Hub system has a particular focus on improving music education opportunities for students at state funded schools. In the UK, as in Australia, students attending independent, fee-paying schools generally have a high level of music education available to them. The same level of opportunity is not as yet available for students attending state or government funded schools, a problem noted both by the UK’s 2010 Henley Review and Australia’s 2005 National Review of Music Education.

Following a restructuring period, 123 Music Hubs were established in September 2012, with Music Services joining in partnership with symphony orchestra education departments, youth orchestras and other relevant organisations. However in November 2013, after a little more than a year of operation, a government report was released which made several negative comments upon the progress made. Over visits to 31 schools from February to July 2013, Ofsted inspectors reported only ‘few examples’ of good practice, criticising Hubs for not evaluating their activities. The Report claimed: ‘None of the Hubs visited could provide a telling, qualitative, overall evaluation of the quality of the music education in schools in their areas.’ It found that provision of activities by the Music Hubs was still inconsistent across post-codes, and asked for both schools and hubs to respectively hold each other to account. The

---


247 Music in Schools: What Hubs Must Do, Ofsted UK, 2013, p.18
Report made various Recommendations for school music teachers, including that they should teach the fundamentals of classical music, and in particular notation, more rigorously. For Hubs, the Ofsted Report requested that they each make a school music education plan that would enable them to improve by April 2014. More positively, the Report did note that: ‘the Hubs...brought new energy, collaborative approaches and vitality to working musically with young people.’ However this praise was balanced by the criticism that: ‘while this work is essential it reaches only a minority of pupils.’

There was a significant backlash to the critical Ofsted Report. The UK Musicians Union (MU) released an official statement stating that the Report was ‘undermining and demoralising,’ and claimed that it did not in fact capture a correct view of activity. The MU Report commented that Ofsted inspections were only made to a small sample of schools, and that visits began too soon after Hubs were established, not allowing them time to settle into their new roles. The MU criticised the government’s funding cuts, observing that they had created a sense of deep instability. The emphasis on the teaching of notation in the Ofsted Report was also criticised by the MU. As discussed in Chapter Six, there has been debate over the place for notation in classroom music education since the 1960s. The MU argument to Ofsted was that the emphasis on notation: ‘undermines pedagogical developments based on encouraging creativity and the diverse approaches to music which are relevant to young people.’

---

248 ibid., p. 4
249 ibid., p. 4
251 ibid., p.3
an unresolved debate, although ideally a school music education would allocate sufficient time to allow a place for both creative projects and music theory.

The MU did acknowledge room for improvement in certain aspects of the Hub system, such as the need for greater funding security for Hubs and for clearer accountability. The MU also noted that while professional organisations were increasingly working with Hubs, some Hubs were not behaving in a collaborative way. This point has also been made by Fiona Harvey:

Some Music Services haven’t really changed. They have partners on paper, on the bids, but really it is business as usual which is very frustrating to their partners. Some are doing really good work, being very entrepreneurial and fundraising, but there are others who have sort of stuck their heads in the sand.252

The importance of the spirit of teamwork was one of Henley’s key points, so in order for the Hub System to be fully realised it is imperative for Music Services to make effective links with arts organisations.

At this point, close to three years after the system commenced, certain examples of best practice have emerged. These include the Tri-Borough hub in London and the Greater Manchester Hub. Both are notable for not only the number of organisations involved, but also the quality. The Strategic Partnership for the Tri-borough Hub, for instance, includes the Royal Albert Hall, the Royal College of Music and the Aurora Orchestra, alongside the Music Services of Westminster, Kensington and Chelsea and Hammersmith and Fulham. This partnership provides students at the 150 schools in the Tri-borough with access to elite music venues and experiences.253 Students from the Royal College of Music mentor younger children in the district, and the Hub has staged

252 Harvey, interview. 2015
multi-level performance opportunities. The Tri-Borough Hub facilitated the long-term ‘Seven Seeds’ project, a new commission inspired by the Greek myth of Persephone, which premiered in June 2015. Children from across the Tri-Borough have contributed to the creation of the piece, which is scored for a large choir of 1,200 young singers alongside an orchestra that combined professional musicians from the Aurora Orchestra, Albert’s Band and the Southbank Sinfonia with students from the Royal College of Music and the Royal Academy of Music. Julia Rodericks, Education Manager of the Aurora Orchestra, comments on the Seven Seeds project:

There has been a real investment from the young people themselves in the creation of the work, it hasn’t happened independently from the young people that we work with. That’s at the heart of everything that Aurora does. We believe very strongly that young people need to have a voice in the creation and the production of work.²⁵⁴

Rodericks intends to make a long-term impact on music education in the Tri-Borough through collaborative projects such as these:

There are so many partners and relationships and long standing activities that can be supported. It’s not a flash in the pan, it is about providing music pathways for kids that we’ve worked with. Pointing out the next thing for them, the next activity or club or ensemble.²⁵⁵

Alongside its role in the Seven Seeds project, the Aurora Orchestra is exploring an original approach focused upon high school students. In a new programme starting in September 2015 termed ‘Beacon schools,’ Aurora will be Orchestra-in-residence at selected secondary schools for three years. According to Rodericks:

²⁵⁴ Julia Rodericks. Interview by author, 8 May 2015
²⁵⁵ ibid.
We will really bed down in the culture of that school and be a beacon, make a real difference in terms of young people’s choices and access and independent cultural activity.\textsuperscript{256}

The orchestra is planning to initiate cross-curricular interactive projects, and will set up a ‘young producers group’ that will meet regularly and devise their own events to take place in their schools for their peers. Students will be offered free tickets and access to Aurora concerts and will build up relationships with Aurora musicians. They will also be signposted to other dance and music and theatre activity in their local community.

Rodericks comments:

I think a lot of orchestras, including ourselves, have a bit of a scatter gun approach to working in schools. This will be a really interesting model, similar in a way to El Sistema in forging really close relationships with a number of young people.\textsuperscript{257}

The question of the lasting value of short-term orchestral outreach and education projects continues to be debated by leaders in the field. While a focus on short-term projects allows orchestras to make contact with large numbers of participants, the question remains as to whether such projects can create a lasting impact upon either the participants or the orchestra. As Rodericks comments, more orchestras are now starting to focus significant resources towards longer, more intensive contact with smaller numbers of participants in an attempt to make a more meaningful connection. While the majority of these programmes are focused on primary school students, the success of this model in connecting with teenagers may be prove to be of relevance to future programming aimed at this sector.

\textsuperscript{256} ibid.
\textsuperscript{257} ibid.
The Greater Manchester Music Hub (gmmusichub) was launched on 19 November 2012 at the BBC Philharmonic Studios. Partners in the Hub include the Hallé Orchestra, Manchester Camerata, BBC Philharmonic, Royal Northern College of Music, the Bridgewater Hall, Chetham’s School of Music and nine music services. These partners have combined their resources to offer sequential learning and opportunities to students in the Greater Manchester region. The Hub’s mission statement is:

To develop inspirational partnerships between local music services and regional music organisations, which enable all children, including the most vulnerable, to enjoy high quality music making from the earliest beginnings and to access a broad range of coherent musical pathways.

Naomi Benn, Director of Ensembles at the Hallé Orchestra, brings a welcome voice of common sense to the practicalities of being part of a partnership:

It seems absolutely logical that people who work with children learning music in any capacity should somehow work together. Being able to signpost children to different opportunities is so valuable. The Hallé works in close partnership with the local music hubs, which include the local authority music services and other music or music education providers in the region. The way we’ve always made our partnerships work is to try to focus on what is good for the children. If that is the starting point then we can all talk honestly about what we can and cannot offer, and how what we offer can complement each other.

As Benn notes, it is essential for organisations to honestly assess their own relative strengths and weaknesses when working together in partnership. Another important point made by Benn is that all the delivery and strategic partners need to work together to ensure that there are sequential steps in place in terms of both education and

258 www.gmmusichub.co.uk/about_gmmh, accessed 3 March 2015.
259 ibid.
260 Naomi Benn. Interview by author, 2 March 2015
performance opportunities for students along their learning path. For instance, the Hallé set up its Youth Orchestra to ensure that there was a high quality youth orchestra available to all students in the district. While this was initially perceived as a possible threat by the music services to their own ensembles and youth orchestras, they have now come to see that the extra opportunity in fact motivates students. Here Naomi Benn gives insight into the process of creating the Hallé Youth Orchestra and how it was incorporated into the existing network of orchestral training in Manchester:

When we started the Hallé Youth Orchestra in 2001 there were some youth orchestras within some of the local music services, but not for all of them, so it was a postcode lottery for students whether they got the opportunity to play in one or not. Creating the Youth Orchestra at the time wasn’t an entirely popular move with some Music Services, as they were anxious not to lose their best players.²⁶¹

While it is of course natural that the Music Services were wanting to preserve the standard of their own ensembles, the ‘postcode lottery’ of which Benn speaks is of course not a satisfactory system of providing opportunities to children, and indeed eradicating this inequity is a principal aim of the Music Hub model. Interestingly, now that the Music Hub system is more established, Benn states that the initial concern over competition for young instrumentalists has been allayed:

Now we are in really close relationship with the music services through the Hub model. Some of them say that the standard of their local youth orchestra has lowered as a result of the Hallé Youth Orchestra, but they appreciate where their local provision fits into the overall picture of youth music opportunity and development- when their students are ready they audition to us (and are encouraged to remain members of both ensembles), in the same way that some of our players go on to join the National Youth Orchestra. We also support their work through our education programme and offer Hallé players to tutor for local youth orchestra initiatives.²⁶²

²⁶¹ Benn, interview.
²⁶² ibid.
The Hallé plays a key role in the Greater Manchester Music Hub, and the Chief Executive John Summers sits on the strategic group. Hallé Education Director, Steve Pickett, declares: ‘From my information the music hub system seems to work better here (Greater Manchester) than anywhere. There’s a real feeling of partnership and cooperation.’\textsuperscript{263} This sentiment is shared by Fiona Harvey, who singles out the Greater Manchester Music Hub as an example of good practice.\textsuperscript{264}

The participatory education programmes currently run by the Hallé are detailed in Chapter Eleven. Here the Hallé Education Manager, Steve Pickett discusses how he tailors these programmes in partnership with the Music Hub:

I’m now a member of a forum with the Greater Manchester Hub, which discusses with their teachers their development in whole-class learning so that our materials are as relevant to them as possible. That progressional concept is much more strategic now, we are very aware of what they do and how we reflect that in what we write for them. Whilst there are always ways that things can be improved, this development has been great. All the Hubs in the country are charged with providing progression, and in Greater Manchester the Hallé is integral to this process, through our Youth Ensembles.\textsuperscript{265}

The BBC Philharmonic also plays an integral role in the Greater Manchester Hub, facilitating intensive coaching sessions for talented young strings, brass and wind players. The BBC Philharmonic has a particularly strong connection with Salford Music Service, one of the nine music services in the Hub. In addition to programmes that link with education institutions in Salford, the BBC Philharmonic also established the Salford Family Orchestra and Chorus in 2009, which brings families together a professional composer and players from the BBC Philharmonic. The family orchestra

\textsuperscript{263} Steve Pickett. Interview by author, 2 March 2015
\textsuperscript{264} Harvey, interview. 2015
\textsuperscript{265} Pickett, interview.
has created original musical works and performed them at MediaCityUK (the home of the BBC Philharmonic), The Bridgewater Hall and on BBC Radio 3.

The similarities between the construct of the Tri-Borough and Greater Manchester Music Hubs are of interest to those looking to establish similar partnership models. Firstly, the partnerships are strengthened by Orchestral Chief Executives sitting on the Strategic Boards of their respective Hubs. Secondly, leading personnel of both Hubs stress the importance of laying out clear ‘musical pathways’ for students, and of ‘sign-posting’ them to the next sequential opportunity. This is at the heart of the spirit of partnership, and involves a clear acknowledgment of both the strengths and the limitations of each member of the organisation. As Benn states, the key principle is to always keep the benefit for the community as the key motivation, and to strive to put aside selfish concerns.

While these Hubs have a particular advantage in that they each have access to an unusual concentration of world-class arts bodies, their basic strategic framework can in fact be analysed and replicated in other cities or countries. The key elements to each Hub are a professional orchestra; a tertiary music college or conservatorium; a youth orchestra and a large performance venue. Most developed cities in the world today can provide these organisations, and together they can provide an entire community with lifelong support and training in music, at all levels.

The Music Hub models analysed above reveal the benefits when every element in this partnership works together, co-ordinating and aligning their activities. For instance, tertiary students from the Music Conservatorium can be inspirational mentors for developing instrumentalists, providing a relatable model of achievement in the field. This relationship may also introduce the concept of a career path in music to a
young beginner for the first time. The symphony orchestra offers a point of inspiration to all other organisations in the partnership in various ways, from a first experience of live classical music to young children and their families; to support and inspiration for beginner instrumental students; a bridge to the profession for tertiary music students and participatory music experiences for the community as a whole. The importance of the venue in the partnership can be seen in two important ways. Firstly, by widening the access to a concert hall and thereby encouraging a wider sector of the community to establish a sense of ease and ‘ownership’ with what can be seen to some as an intimidating venue. Secondly, the experience of performing on stage at a prestigious venue considerably adds to the sense of excitement and achievement for participants in any music performance project.

While the Music Hub model is still evolving, the ways in which various Hubs are establishing partnerships and working together are of interest internationally. It shall be interesting to see how the system continues to evolve over the coming years, and the international music community shall continue to look to the model for new innovations. As with all ground-breaking endeavours, it is also important to learn from the less successful aspects of the system in order to continue future progress.
Chapter Nine: The implications for tertiary classical music training

The steady growth in the quantity and diversity of orchestral education programmes over the past four decades has impacted upon the skills required by orchestral musicians. In many ways the growth of the orchestral education field has necessitated a rethinking of the ideal skill-set of the orchestral musician of the twenty-first century. In April 2015 the Chief Conductor of the New York Philharmonic, Alan Gilbert commented on this point:

Orchestras need the best musicians—that will never change. But what is asked and expected of these musicians is constantly evolving. Just as the educational and outreach efforts of orchestras only achieve full resonance when they connect meaningfully and organically with who the musicians are and what they do, musicians in today’s orchestras are only doing their jobs fully when they understand and invest in their expanded portfolio that is demanded by the wider definition of what an orchestra is.266

In the early years of orchestral education programming, musicians reportedly often felt themselves under-prepared when requested to do education or outreach work. This is a far from optimal situation both for the morale of the musicians and for the participants in such education programmes, who deserve to be led by a well-prepared and trained team. In recognition of this issue, professional development training is now often provided to orchestral personnel involved in education programmes, in order to equip them with the skills necessary to confidently lead and inspire participants.

For example, a confidence in improvisation is increasingly required from musicians involved in education programmes, especially creative workshop models. However this is not reflected in the traditional training of orchestral musicians, which aims to foster instead an ability to play accurately what a composer, or conductor,

266 Gilbert. RPS Lecture, op.cit., pp.31-32
requests. Therefore training is needed to enable orchestral musicians to confidently lead creative focused workshops. To do this they need to re-access their creative spark and play freely, away from their precisely annotated scores.

    Orchestral musicians typically come through the music performance rather than music education degree programmes offered at tertiary institutions. Indeed it is fair to say that within a typical music institution there exists a glass barrier dividing the performance and education streams, and their paths rarely cross. There is subsequently a lack of emphasis on pedagogy skills within a music performance degree. Leading music education advocate, Eric Booth, has commented on this issue:

    I know that condescending attitudes still exist that assume any artist who chooses to also educate can’t be a first-rate artist. Well, it just isn’t true.\textsuperscript{267}

Booth is speaking with experience as a member of the teaching staff of the Juilliard School of Music and Drama. Booth has also developed education skills with the musicians of many leading orchestras, including the New York Philharmonic. Booth notes that in his experience:

    Almost all music teaching artists feel that they have been thrust into the work before they are adequately prepared.\textsuperscript{268}

Tertiary music performance students may take a module on pedagogy on their own instrument but they are rarely offered training in group teaching or classroom work. This results in a lack of basic awareness of the skills and techniques necessary to communicate with large group of students in an education programme, and an

\textsuperscript{267} Booth. \textit{Music Teaching Artist Bible}, op.cit., p.6
\textsuperscript{268} ibid., p.96
unfamiliarity with classroom curriculum. Richard McNicol, one of the leaders in the field since the 1980s, was early to recognise this issue. According to McNicol:

I think the fundamental problem with some education programmes is that completely unqualified and inexperienced teachers (i.e. players pretending to be teachers) are put into a classroom and given charge of a project...I would like to see a straightforward teacher training element as part of every conservatoire’s training. Not the theory necessarily, just what happens in a classroom, how a good teacher teaches, how you team teach above all.269

Booth also makes this point:

I encounter hundreds of artists in the top orchestras and arts organisations who work hard to learn education skills way too late, angry that they didn’t have a chance or a conservatory climate that encouraged them to learn teaching artistry during their schooling.270

The importance of improving the provision of education skills for artists, as well as better training in the arts for teachers, has also been emphasised by Sir Ken Robinson. This was an overall finding for Robinson’s 1989 Report All Our Futures: Creativity, Culture and Education, and was also stated in his Foreword to a 2003 publication, The Art of the Animateur. In this publication, Robinson observes:

For a range of reasons, too many teachers are not well enough trained in the arts, and too many artists are not well enough trained—indeed not trained at all—to work in education. Although many artists do work in education at some stage of their careers—and often for long periods—the curricula of art schools, conservatoires and theatre schools often do little to alert them to, or prepare them for, these opportunities. In the medium and longer term, initial higher education in the arts needs to take fuller account of the multifaceted portfolio careers that many artists actually lead in the twenty first century, including work in education and the community. There is an immediate need too to provide training opportunities to

270 Booth, op.cit. p.7
practising artists who are already working, or wanting to work, in these settings. This is what Animarts was set up to do.271

The Animarts research project was an association between the London International Festival of Theatre (LIFT) and the Guildhall School of Music & Drama. Coordinated by Anna Ledgard from 2002-2003, it aimed to explore and better understand the roles and activities of animateurs and teachers. The report *The Art of the Animateur* was published at the conclusion of the project. Key findings included the importance of effective partnership between animateurs and teachers, and the need for a valid accreditation process for personnel working in community music or orchestral education programmes. The Report also stressed the need for work placements and internships:

…we are being advised that the best way for artists to learn how to work effectively in education or other settings is for them to do their learning in partnership with the people they are going to be working with, ie. teachers and other members of a school staff, community arts organisers, etc.272

Often orchestral education projects offered within schools will ensure that a classroom teacher is available to help with discipline and pedagogical outcomes. However it would be greatly to the benefit of the programme if the musicians involved in education projects were first offered training in classroom pedagogy. Even programmes offered outside the classroom will still often require the direction of large groups of people, and here training in public speaking would significantly boost the efficiency and outcome of the programme.

---


272 Animarts Report, op.cit. Introduction by Patricia Clark, p.15
Since the 1990s there has been a growing recognition within tertiary institutions of the need to adjust course content in order to equip emerging orchestral musicians with the new skills increasingly required in their professional activity. Traditionally, classical music performance degrees have had a primary focus on developing instrumental technical skills to the highest possible level, alongside coaching in chamber and orchestral ensemble skills. There is now a need to incorporate skills in improvising, composing, public speaking, pedagogy (both classroom and instrumental) and the use of music technology into the degree structure. Conservatories in the United Kingdom, in particular the Guildhall School of Music and Drama (GSMD), have led the field internationally in terms of their reappraisal of performance degree structure.

According to the Guildhall School of Music and Drama:

The role of a conservatoire should be re-aligned to meet the needs, expectation and potential of today’s society. Reformulating the idea of what a musician could be- what he or she has beyond a technical proficiency on one instrument- is highly relevant to the workplace, as musicians now need many strings to one bow. Important qualities for musicians who want to remain employable are to be creative, multifaceted when performing, and effective in collaborative environments. 273

A tertiary performance degree should, of course, still aim to produce performers with a deep knowledge of the classical music canon and the highest level of performance skills. However alongside this should be training to enable them to access and explore their musical creativity, work experience sessions with orchestral education departments, training in leading creative music workshop sessions, public speaking skills, training in teaching skills and training in music technology. The present chapter

273 Reflective Conservatoire, op.cit. p.298
draws attention to the various ways in which Conservatories are approaching the task of creating musicians who are also effective arts educators and advocates.

The Guildhall School of Music and Drama (GSMD) has been a leader in this area since the 1980s, under the Direction of Ian Horsbrugh (Principal from 1988-2002). Prior to his appointment at the Guildhall, Horsbrugh’s career included posts as Head of Music at two inner London comprehensive schools, concert manager of the Royal Philharmonic Orchestra, Deputy Warden of the Inner London Education Authority music centre and Vice Director of the Royal College of Music. This diverse career path allowed Horbrugh to gain an unusual level of understanding of the links between music education and the profession, which contributed to his approach at the Guildhall.

Four years prior to Horbrugh’s appointment, Peter Renshaw, previously the Principal of the Menuhin School of Music, initiated a new teaching and research programme at the Guildhall School of Music and Drama. The post-graduate ‘Performance and Communication Skills’ course aimed to create more versatile and dynamic musicians who were capable of working within a variety of musical styles and cultures. The course was focused on improvisation, communication, leadership skills and participatory performance. In 1985 Renshaw stated his aims for the programme:

> It is hoped that these experiences will not only encourage the students to redefine their role as musicians in society, but will also help them to acquire the skills with which to create new audiences in the future, to enable them to respond to different musical subcultures, and to serve the needs and cultivate the tastes of many different institutional and informal groups for whom traditional conservatoire training has not catered in the past.  

---

Peter Wiegold was appointed the Artistic Director of the ‘Performance and Communication Skills Department’ in 1985, and was an integral part of its success during its development years. Gillian Moore, Artistic Director of the London Sinfonietta, has endorsed Wiegold as the figure who was: ‘not only the inventor of the workshop form in this country but who remains its best exponent.’ In addition to his position at the Guildhall, Wiegold also helped to establish the workshop format within the classical music profession through training courses in workshop technique, creative leadership and improvisation with many of Britain’s orchestras and opera companies. He has made a considerable impact upon the younger generation of emerging British classical musicians through his workshop training sessions with the UK’s National Youth Orchestra (1996-2005), the Menuhin School and the Southbank Sinfonia (an elite training orchestra for young professionals). He has also contributed to the training of Australian musicians through a partnership with the organisation Youth Music Australia in the mid 1990s, when he coached young orchestral musicians in improvisation techniques.

Wiegold and Renshaw were given the freedom to create their own curriculum for the course, and it incorporated many diverse skills, described here by Wiegold:

…we included Tai-Chi, African drumming, voice, and body work, as well as many kinds of improvisation and composition. It was a wonderful opportunity to test starting from scratch. Just what is it to ‘make music’ and be a real performer?

Lord Yehudi Menuhin supported the ways in which the course structure brought students into contact with diverse sectors of society, commenting:

---

276 ibid.
277 Peter Wiegold. ‘But who will make their tea?’ Harmony. *Forum of the Symphony Orchestra Institute*, Number 12, April 2001, p.3
There is no doubt that the experience of playing in various situations other than the normal concert hall, such as at the Broadmoor Hospital and terminal homes, etc., broadens the otherwise egocentric nature of musical careers.278

Menuhin is speaking with experience of the often isolated and insular life of a musician, particularly at the elite solo level. While Menuhin is referring to the launch of the GSMD course in the above quote, Menuhin was personally deeply involved in establishing stronger links between performers and the community. In 1980 he launched the ‘Live Music Now’ foundation, in partnership with Ian Stouzker, with the intention to bring young professional musicians into contact with a wide sector of society. ‘Live Music Now’ continues to provide performance opportunities for young professionals in diverse venues, such as hospitals, prisons, special schools, care homes and village homes.279

The GSMD course deliberately placed students in unfamiliar situations to help them develop skills to connect and engage with a variety of different audiences. Renshaw felt that:

…technique, music and communication should go hand in hand…Far too often technique is acquired in both a musical and social vacuum, divorced from any context which might give it a point.280

Renshaw acknowledged the conflict between the ideals of this course and the ambitions of a typical conservatoire student who is often focused on acquiring technical virtuosity, passing exams, and gaining reputation and professional status. He

feels however that training aimed at boosting creativity and communication skills will ultimately produce a more accomplished musician. This view is seconded by Gillian Howell, the first Australian graduate from the Guildhall course. Howell states:

It’s not enough just to play well, you need a much broader range of skills. You need to be able to cross over and respond to commissions; composers and performers should be more interchangeable. There should be a dialogue between composer and performer.²⁸¹

Initially funded for three years, the philosophies behind the Performance and Communication Skills course have gradually became embedded in the GSMD.²⁸² The Guildhall Department responsible for community engagement skills has had a variety of titles over the past three decades, including a period known as Guildhall Connect, founded in 2002. At this point Sean Gregory was appointed as Head of the Centre for Creative and Professional Practice. Since October 2009 Gregory has been Director of Creative Learning at the GSMD, bringing together the work of Guildhall Connect and the Barbican Education Department. Gregory was one of the early graduates from the original Performance and Communication Skills Course, and describes it as a seminal moment in his career.²⁸³

Gregory’s Department at the GSMD continues to explore the ideas conceived by Renshaw and Wiegold. At the present date there are two degree programmes focused on community outreach and workshop skills: a two year Masters of Leadership, offered to 12 to 16 students a year, and a Bachelor of Arts in Performance and Creative Enterprise, starting in September 2015. The Masters of Leadership is for those students who wish to pursue a career as an animateur or community musician,

²⁸¹ Howell, interview. 2015
²⁸³ Sean Gregory. Director of Creative Learning Department, Guildhall School of Music and Drama and Barbican Centre. Interview by author, 8 May 2015
and is open to musicians from a variety of backgrounds, not all classically trained. The new BA in Performance and Creative Enterprise is also intended to appeal to a deliberately eclectic mix of students, from classical musicians to rap artists. Gregory explains:

We're deliberately mixing it up a little bit more. The principle remains the same, that it is there to train you to be an excellent artist, no compromising on that front, the same with the leadership programme, but you are expected to be collaborative in your approach and to be socially engaged. The Enterprise part is that we want to be more explicit that you will need to be more enterprising as an artist and a practitioner.  

Alongside these degrees the Creative Learning Department also delivers ‘Professional Studies’, a compulsory core subject for all Guildhall Music Undergraduate students. Professional Studies has two compulsory levels, Professional Studies One (weekly seminars for First Year Students) and Two (for Third and Fourth Year Students). While there is not a compulsory element for second year students, interested students can continue to undertake optional electives which link with the Barbican side of Creative Learning. In Professional Studies One students are given training in improvisation, collaborative workshop skills, financial management and cross arts projects. Gregory comments:

The idea here is beginning to build up the sense of a portfolio by introducing all these different concepts, and you want to keep that thread alive through the four years.  

Professional Studies Two covers teaching skills and has a series of seminars on the ‘World at Work’. Students are all required to do an independent project, to demonstrate their understanding of skills taught through the course. The project can be

---

284 Gregory, interview.
285 ibid.
a concert in an unusual space, or an education or participation project or a combination of the two. Gregory explains:

Then students present all these skills: their teaching experience, workshop skills, independent project, in a final portfolio that they submit at the end of the fourth year along with their CV and they are assessed and interviewed about the portfolio. It is your calling card to the outside world as it were.\textsuperscript{286}

Gregory makes frequent mention to the importance of developing a ‘portfolio of skills’, which he defines as:

Being able to perform to the highest level on your instrument and through your instrument. Also being able to communicate what you perform as convincingly as possible, in many different contexts. You need to be thinking about the people you are wanting to connect with, how you present it, how you talk about it, how you programme it, how you work the room.\textsuperscript{287}

Over the past fifteen years education and outreach skills have gradually been incorporated into the syllabus of many other leading conservatoires throughout the UK. Gregory explains:

When this course set up at Guildhall there was nothing like it and it was definitely a trail-blazer for a lot of the nineties. Around ten years ago other Conservatoires started to introduce this style of work themselves. I don’t think any of the Conservatoires now shy away from the idea that we are now training musicians with portfolio skills and that you need to be thinking in that way. Beyond the UK you have little pockets of things, but there is a lot of interest in the UK because it is not quite happening to the same extent elsewhere.\textsuperscript{288}

While the Guildhall’s alumni continue to make up the best part of this field of practice internationally, other institutions have also taken a similar approach. London’s Royal College of Music (RCM) was early to explore these issues, under the direction of Dame

\textsuperscript{286} ibid.
\textsuperscript{287} ibid.
\textsuperscript{288} ibid.
Janet Ritterman. Australian born, Ritterman was Director of the RCM from 1993-2005 and was a founding member of the Creative Industries HE Forum established by the Department of Culture, Media and Sport. In 1999 the RCM established the Woodhouse Professional Development Centre, which aims to prepare students for entry into the profession in a variety of ways: it provides performance opportunities, experience in planning education projects, and advice on self promotion and entrepreneurial skills. Uniquely, these services are available to students not only through their official studies at the RCM but also for 5 years after they graduate, providing an invaluable support and bridge for students as they negotiate their early career path.

The RCM has continued to explore community music education skills and training, and the RCM Sparks Department is now a strategic partner in the prominent Tri-Borough Music Hub. In 2006 the RCM introduced a Postgraduate Diploma in Creative Leadership, promoted by the College as evidence that their course structure: ‘is becoming increasingly influential in the UK and European music scenes and is drawing attention in the USA and beyond.’

The ‘Open Academy’ at London’s Royal Academy of Music (RAM) offers experience in community music and workshop leading to both undergraduate and postgraduate students. The Open Academy engages with 5,000 participants annually through a variety of initiatives with schools, Music Hubs, hospitals, centres for homeless people, care homes and day centres. Approximately 200 undergraduate RAM students are involved in the delivery of such programmes each year, and those

---

289 Director’s Report (Colin Lawson), Royal College of Music 2005-06 Annual Account, p.6
interested in making their career in this field can then take the intensive nine month Continuing Professional Development Diploma in Creative Music Leadership.\footnote{http://www.ram.ac.uk/study/open-academy/creative-music-leadership, accessed 6 April 2015.}

The Trinity Laban Conservatoire of Music and Dance, based in Greenwich, London, offers several postgraduate degrees and diplomas in performance, workshop skills and education skills. The MA in Music Education and Performance is a one-year full-time post-grad degree designed for any student wishing to pursue an active career as both a professional musician and a teacher or educator. The Secondary PGCE ‘Musicians in Education’ is a collaboration between Trinity Laban Conservatoire of Music and Dance and the University of Greenwich. The aim for this programme is ‘to prepare flexible and creative musicians who are confident working across a range of educational contexts.’\footnote{http://www.trinitylaban.ac.uk/study/music/pgce-musicians-in-education, accessed 7 April 2015.} The training is shared between Trinity Laban, (16 days) and the University of Greenwich (44 days), alongside work experience placements in schools (120 days). As well as providing graduates with Qualified Teacher Status, this programme also offers training suitable for instrumental teachers and musicians engaged in orchestral education work, including experience delivering creative workshops.

In addition to the above degrees, Trinity Laban also offers professional development for musicians already working in the field of education in the form of ‘The Teaching Musician’ Postgraduate Certificate /Diploma. While this course does not offer Qualified Teacher Status, it is designed to bolster the skills of musicians working in education settings, including music leaders, tutors, community musicians and animateurs, through a combination of pedagogy studies and work placements. The course is designed to fit alongside a professional career, with limited contact hours.
The Guildhall is also looking to develop professional training courses such as this. As Gregory explains:

There is quite a flourishing continuing professional development programme for artists: learning labs, weekend courses for emerging and established musicians who want to skill up or further extend their skills, whether it is creative leadership, or performing and collaborating in healthcare settings, working with other art forms. We are looking to build up more short courses in the future.\textsuperscript{292}

The University of York was the first British university to introduce a Community Music module to its three-year undergraduate music degree and now offers a Community Music Degree at postgraduate level. The University of York was also at the centre of early exploration of creative music practice in the community through the work of faculty members such as John Paynter. It has acknowledged the growth of the field of community music, and seeks to equip its students with the skills needed in this growth field.\textsuperscript{293}

The Royal Conservatoire of Scotland (RCS) and the Reid School of Music at the University of Edinburgh are also exploring ways of training musicians for versatile portfolio careers. The RCS offers a BA (Hons) Contemporary Performance Practice, with the course described as being for aspiring performance makers who wish to develop their skills as innovative and socially engaged performers, directors, teachers, and cultural leaders.\textsuperscript{294}

Nigel Osborne, Reid Professor at the University of Edinburgh from 1989-2012, has been at the forefront of efforts to link classical composers and performers with the community. He is well versed in the skills of the ‘creative workshop’, and helped to

\textsuperscript{292} Gregory, interview.
\textsuperscript{293} \url{http://www.york.ac.uk/music/postgraduate/programmes/ma-community-music/}, accessed 8 August 2015
\textsuperscript{294} \url{https://www.rcs.ac.uk/courses/ba-contemporary-performance-practice/}, accessed 7 August 2015
establish training in these skills at both the University of Edinburgh and the Royal Conservatoire of Scotland. Osborne has also been very committed personally to music therapy, most notably in his work with disadvantaged children in Sarajevo. The creation of the Institute for Music in Human and Social Development (IMHSD) in 2005 is another key legacy of Osborne at the University of Edinburgh. Osborne served as codirector of the IMHSD until his retirement in 2012, with the aim to ‘promote the scientific understanding and practical application of music as a therapeutic, educational, artistic and social tool,’ and the IMHSD remains at the forefront of research into neuroscience in music.

The book *Community music in theory and in practice*, by Lee Higgins, gives further detail to the spread of orchestral education and workshop training throughout the UK. Training in workshop leading skills can now be found at most tertiary institutions across the United Kingdom. Looking further afield, the Juilliard School in New York stands out as another innovative and forward thinking tertiary music institution. In America leaders of orchestral education programmes are known as ‘teaching artists’, a term also beginning to be used by selected Australian orchestras. The Juilliard is a leader in this field of training through its Teaching Artists Programme, and in particular through the ‘Morse Teaching Artist Fellowship’.

The current chapter has focused on ways in which the skill-set of emerging orchestral musicians can best be tailored to the changing professional environment.

---


Linked with this consideration, however, is the issue of best practice in partnership between tertiary music training institutions and orchestras. The chief purpose of such a partnership is to provide a ‘bridge,’ or support network, in order to create the most effective possible transition for students from training to professional life. This partnership should take several forms, from a discussion at management level between the orchestra and local conservatorium about the skills expected from graduates and how to achieve them, to opportunities for students to experience the realities of professional orchestral life through work experience placements or side-by-side performance opportunities.

While the benefits of such an approach to the student are clear, there are also considerable benefits to the orchestra in ensuring that graduates already have a clear idea of the standards expected of them in the professional orchestral setting. Side by side work and internships also serve to initiate students into the particular style and approach idiosyncratic to that orchestra. All orchestras have their own particular character and style of working, which has often been developed over centuries. This style is encapsulated in subtle but important details such as the degree of playing behind the beat, approaches to rubato or particular timbre or tone qualities. If orchestras are able to mentor students during their formative study years then the overall standard of performance will rise. It is also important for students to be aware of the spectrum of work undertaken by orchestras and, ideally, to be involved in all aspects of such work at the time of training, including education projects, music therapy projects and community outreach work. The individual approaches taken by orchestras to the question of partnership with tertiary institutions are discussed in a detailed case-by-case basis throughout Part Two of the thesis.
Tertiary orchestral training in Australia

No Australian conservatorium at present offers any specific degree or diploma in community music skills or creative leadership, and as a result Australian orchestras often engage UK experts in this field. Recognition of this skills shortage lay behind the research trip undertaken in 2009 by Nicholas Bochner, the Assistant Principal Cellist of the Melbourne Symphony Orchestra. Bochner was awarded the ‘Dame Roma Mitchell’ Churchill Fellowship in order to undertake a ‘Study of the use of improvisation in the teaching of classical musicians.’ Bochner identified the work by the LSO and Guildhall School of Music and Drama as the leaders in this field, and travelled to London to gain personal insight into the Guildhall’s innovative orchestral training and the way the LSO Discovery Department puts such skills into practice. Bochner summarises the aims and intentions of his research:

During my time working in Melbourne Symphony Orchestra I have become aware of creative approaches to music education, and of a strong need for orchestras to pursue innovative techniques for community engagement...In Australia, current training for performing musicians does not generally provide any basis for this type of innovation and I felt certain that there would be a great deal to learn from examining the practices of, and connections between, the GSMD and the LSO. I also felt that I would be well placed, through my position as a cellist with the Melbourne Symphony Orchestra, and as a member of the resident faculty of the Australian National Academy of Music (ANAM) to make good use of any lessons learnt.299

Bochner made a particular focus on the methods of teaching improvisation at the GSMD, observing the teaching practice of David Dolan, a leader in this area.

Australian orchestral musicians are generally not confident in improvisation as it is not

a key element of their tertiary music training. As it is a skill required for creative music workshops it is important to address this skills gap and to look to models of best practice in the field. Dolan’s methods are proven to help orchestral musicians develop a confidence with improvisation. This is of immediate benefit to their work in creative-based orchestral education work, but also has been shown to develop their performance and theory skills. Further details on Dolan’s approach can be found in both Bochner’s Churchill Report and in an article, by Dolan, published in the 2005 Guildhall publication ‘The Reflective Conservatoire.’

Bochner notes that while there are some musicians in Australia trained through the UK system, the significant difference in the UK is that with so many musicians trained in animateur skills there is a variety and diversity to the workforce, making it easier to engage the most appropriate leader for any particular project. Bochner’s conclusion is that:

Orchestras and music colleges in Australia have much to learn from the creative approaches to teaching aspiring professionals and to engaging with the community at large that I saw in operation at the GSMD and the LSO Discovery Programme.

Bochner is looking to implement a similar relationship between the Melbourne Symphony Orchestra (MSO) and the Australian National Academy of Music (ANAM), both institutions which have shown interest in innovative approaches to creativity and communication. The ANAM, in response, has introduced a Community Outreach Programme in which students engage in at least one project involving a performance in

---

a non-standard context. The MSO’s activity in the area of creative, participatory education projects is discussed more fully in Chapter Twelve.

With increasing numbers of Australian orchestras beginning to incorporate more participatory elements to their education activities, there is a clear need for training in creative, collaborative music making at the tertiary level. There is also a need for professional development training for orchestral musicians, classroom teachers and instrumental teachers in this area, which could be addressed by a part-time certificate or diploma course. Alongside these specific skills, there is also a need to equip performance music majors with education and pedagogy skills and experience, in acknowledgement that most musicians will engage in teaching at some point of their careers. At present the Melbourne Conservatorium and the UWA School of Music are at the forefront of this approach in Australia through their respective Masters of Music Performance/Teaching and Masters of Teaching Degrees, which are aiming to equip students with high-level performance and education skills. The Queensland Conservatorium at Griffith University is also exploring the intersection between performance and education through the Queensland Conservatorium Research Centre. The School of Music at the University of Western Australia (UWA) lists Music in the Community as an optional unit for Music Majors within its Undergraduate programmes.

The Elder Conservatorium of Music, at the University of Adelaide, is currently undergoing a major restructure of course structure and staffing. In a recent interview, Professor Jennie Shaw, Executive Dean of the University’s Faculty of Arts, states that the intention is to move towards a new ‘portfolio’ based curriculum intended to ‘equip
young musicians for the 21st century. To achieve this, the Conservatorium is looking to form stronger partnerships with local arts organisations such as the State Opera of SA and the Adelaide Symphony Orchestra. The changes are intended to be implemented by 2017 and have the potential to bring the Elder Conservatorium in line with the forefront of current practice in tertiary music training. These partnerships will be building upon existing links between the Elder Conservatorium and the Adelaide Symphony Orchestra; the Elder Chorale, for example, has performed with the ASO since 2003 and in 2014 the Professional Pathways scheme created new mentorship links between the two institutions.

The University of Western Australia is introducing a Masters in Orchestral Performance in partnership with the West Australian Symphony Orchestra (WASO), and Cassandra Lake, the Director of Community Engagement at WASO, is hopeful that the course will include experience in orchestral education and outreach skills. Lake explains:

> From my point of view it is very important for kids coming up through university to learn that orchestras are not just about Mahler Symphonies on stage at the concert hall. It is important for students to understand what an orchestral career can include, but also it is important to help them to be ready to deliver that kind of work. It can be confronting.

Lake gives the example of WASO’s outreach work in a hospital setting:

> It is not about a student’s ability to play their instrument. Not everyone is going to want to do it, but there are students who would have a whole other side to their career if they had the capability to be involved in these programmes. So if we can work with them at that tertiary level it helps them to learn best practice skills in doing that.


Cassandra Lake. Executive Manager, Community Engagement, West Australian Symphony Orchestra. Interview by author, 1 June 2015.

ibid.
At present the University of Western Australia does not offer Music Therapy training; interested students need to enrol at the University of Melbourne to undertake a Post-Graduate course.

The need for Australian tertiary music institutions to re-examine their course structures was noted in Australia’s National Review of School Music Education, published in 2005. The Review stated:

As musicians are increasingly called upon to work collaboratively in music education settings…the issue of training of musicians to work in educational environments has arisen.304

The National Review noted the strength of the UK in this area, and in particular called for a greater focus on education skills to be incorporated into music degrees. Barbara Macrae, the Principal of the Sydney Conservatorium High School, strongly stated the need for an education component in performance degrees:

…tertiary institutions educating musicians should, as a matter of course, include some teacher education components as many musicians at some point of their lives teach, either individual students or classes or both.305

Ten years after the publication of the National Review, Macrae’s point still bears current relevance. With orchestral education and community engagement work currently in a growth period in Australia, orchestral musicians are increasingly requested to work in projects requiring non-traditional performance skills. It is therefore timely to look to ways to enhance and support Australian orchestral

---

304 National Review of School Music Education: ‘Augmenting the diminished’, op.cit., p.34
305 ibid. p.183
musicians in their development of the full set of skills now demanded by their profession.
Chapter Ten: The influence of El Sistema

The Fundacion del Estado para el Sistema Nacional de las Orquestas Juveniles e Infantiles de Venezuela, better known as ‘El Sistema’, is one of the greatest music education success stories of recent history. El Sistema was established in Venezuela in 1975 by the economist, politician and keen amateur musician Dr Juan Antonio Abreu. From humble beginnings teaching a handful of children in a garage, in 2015 there are 623,000 students studying across Venezuela via a network of 416 orchestra centres, known as nucleos. Alongside impressive musical standards, El Sistema also has a well-publicised extra motive, namely to improve the quality of life and prospects for children from low socio-economic neighbourhoods. El Sistema is credited with saving generations of Venezuelan children from involvement with crime or drugs by offering an alternative to negative peer influences and the dangers of street life. This is achieved through a system of highly intensive music tuition, of up to 4 hours per day, chiefly focusing on learning orchestral instruments through group lessons and ensemble rehearsals.

The flagship orchestra, the Orquesta Sinfónica Simón Bolívar (also known as the Simón Bolívar Symphony Orchestra) has gained a strong international profile through DVDs, documentaries and frequent international tours. The chief conductor of the Orquesta Sinfónica Simón Bolívar, Gustavo Dudamel, is arguably the system’s greatest success story. Currently the Music Director of the Los Angeles Philharmonic, Dudamel regularly conducts the world’s leading orchestras, including the Berlin Philharmonic and the Vienna Philharmonic. Largely due to Dudamel’s influence there is now a

307 ibid.
thriving El Sistema inspired programme operating in Los Angeles, linked with the Los Angeles Philharmonic (known as YOLA).\textsuperscript{308}

The technical finesse and infectious joie-de-vivre of the Simón Bolívar musicians has won them world-wide attention; this international profile has in turn been a significant factor in the global proliferation of El Sistema inspired programmes. In August 2007, for example, the Simón Bolívar’s celebrated performance in the UK’s Proms series raised their international profile to a new level.

At present programmes modelled upon Sistema ideals and practice can be found in more than 60 countries, although the original Venezuelan approach is generally adapted to fit with differing cultural and social factors.\textsuperscript{309} Marshall Marcus is well placed to give insight into both the early development of the Venezuelan Sistema and the global spread of the model. In 1978 Marcus, a British-born and educated violinist, was appointed concert-master of Venezuela’s Orquesta Filarmonica de Caracas. At this point Marcus also became involved with El Sistema for the first time, teaching within the system in Caracas. Currently the CEO of the European Union Youth Orchestra, Marcus has remained committed to Sistema projects throughout his subsequent career. He is the Founder and Chairman of Sistema Europe, a Director and Trustee of Sistema England, and a Member of Sistema Global’s Advisory Board. Marcus comments on the international spread of Sistema:

\begin{quote}
I think one of the interesting things about Sistema outside of Venezuela is that it hasn’t spread in the way of something like an Apple phone which is the same the world over, produced under licence. There is a generosity about the way it has spread around the world which means that there are many different versions of Sistema in existence.\textsuperscript{310}
\end{quote}

\textsuperscript{309} www.sistemaglobal.org/about/el-sistema-venezuela/, accessed 4 July 2015.
\textsuperscript{310} Marshall Marcus. Interview by author, 2 April 2015.
There is a growing body of research on the Sistema phenomenon, both the original Venzuelan programme and the various international Sistema inspired projects. Marcus has developed ‘SERA’, an online Sistema Evaluation and Research Archive, which is of assistance in charting and analysing the development of the Sistema movement. In Marcus’s words:

SERA was set up in October 2012 following several months of discussion between Eric Booth, Richard Hallam, Glenn Thomas and myself in order to help spread knowledge of, and stimulate new initiatives into, El Sistema evaluation and research.

While the international spread of El Sistema is significant in its own right, the present research project is primarily concerned upon its impact upon the education departments of British and Australian orchestras. In Australia, the Melbourne Symphony Orchestra (MSO) and West Australian Symphony Orchestra (WASO) have both established programmes modelled on El Sistema, focused on primary schools in low socio-economic areas. These programmes are discussed in detail in Part Two in the respective Case Studies of the MSO and WASO.

Establishment of Sistema inspired projects was sparked in the UK by the performance of the Simón Bolívar Youth Orchestra at the London Proms in 2007. In 2008 Sistema Scotland was the first UK organisation to establish a Sistema inspired programme, named ‘Big Noise’, in the Raploch Estate, Stirling. In the same year the British Government allocated one million pounds to the establishment of the English Sistema inspired initiative known as ‘In Harmony’. From 46 applicants three pilot

---

312 ibid.
programmes were chosen in London, Norwich and Liverpool. By April 2009 the projects were underway, with a national steering group chaired by Julian Lloyd Webber overseeing the three projects. The goals for the projects were lofty and, as with the Venezuelan model, combined social with musical aims. Lloyd Webber has claimed:

[El Sistema] is surely the most extraordinary social phenomenon of our times…In Harmony’s huge potential for social regeneration has convinced me that it is the future for music education in this country.

In November 2011, as part of the National Plan for Music Education, the Government announced an expansion plan for In Harmony, now renamed Sistema England, and in July 2014 four new projects were confirmed at Gateshead, Leeds, Nottingham and Telford and Wrekin. Funding was also continued for Lambeth and Liverpool but not, controversially, for Norwich. The Norwich project continues to run as an independent organisation, supported by funding from local primary schools, the Norfolk Music Hub and local trusts.

There are currently eleven different Sistema-inspired programmes active in the United Kingdom: one in Northern Ireland and ten under the auspices of Sistema Scotland and Sistema England. Symphony and chamber orchestras have taken a strategic partnership role with several of these programmes. These include, respectively: the Ulster Orchestra (sponsor of Belfast’s ‘Paper Orchestra’ project); Royal Liverpool Philharmonic Orchestra (partnered with In Harmony Liverpool); Royal

---

314 ibid.
Northern Sinfonia (partner with In Harmony Newcastle Gateshead); City of Birmingham Symphony Orchestra and Manchester Camerata (partner with In Harmony Telford and Stoke-on-Trent) and both the Royal Scottish National Orchestra and the BBC Scottish Symphony (partners with Sistema Scotland). In addition, the London Southbank Centre is an official partner with In Harmony Lambeth; a partnership which has connected In Harmony Lambeth with the Southbank Centre’s resident orchestras, including the London Philharmonic Orchestra.

While each of the UK’s Sistema programmes are of interest in their own right, two have been the focus of significant external evaluation, which has provided valuable data on the progress and impact of the programmes. These two programmes are ‘Liverpool In Harmony’ and ‘Sistema Scotland,’ and here an overview of these programmes and their respective impact is presented.

The Royal Liverpool Philharmonic Orchestra (RLPO) has a partnership role with Liverpool Sistema, coaching the students and offering opportunities for side-by-side performances. This programme focuses on Faith Primary School, located in a low socio-economic area with issues of unemployment, crime, lack of civil engagement and low tertiary education levels. Liverpool Sistema has been assessed annually, with results published in detailed Interim Reports. It is therefore possible to track the success of this programme at achieving its stated aims, both musical and social, year by year. The most recent report reveals the many positive effects now established by the programme. With a very multicultural catchment area, students at Faith Primary were achieving lower than average scores on national literacy and numeracy tests. The programme has had significant and sustained impact upon students’ levels in these areas, in particular reading and numeracy, as shown in the table below.
The data above relate to the percentage of pupils in each year group who are progressing by two sub levels or more in one academic year. This is exceeding the expectation, which is for an advance of three sublevels over a two-year period (i.e. 1.5 sublevels per year). Although there are fluctuations in achievements from year to year, a significant overall improvement is evident from the base line results in 2008, at the commencement of the In Harmony programme.

Musically the students are now reaching a high level, with regular performances compulsory for all participants. The most high profile of these performances to date has been a side-by-side performance with the Royal Liverpool Philharmonic Orchestra in a Proms performance at the Royal Albert Hall in September 2013. This performance demonstrated the progress made by the In Harmony programme, with the young Liverpool students following in the footsteps of the Simón Bolívar on the Royal Albert

---

Hall stage. The inspiration of performing alongside the RLPO at the Proms concert in London was evident in many statements made by the participants in the *Year 4 In Harmony Liverpool Interim Report*. This will be a life long point of pride and inspiration for these children, as well as providing a window into the reality of the operation of a world-class symphony orchestra. The children are also gaining a feeling of security and familiarity with large-scale concert halls, both as performers and audience members.

Ofsted, the nationwide education standards board, has also commented positively on the programme, making Good Practice visits to Sistema Liverpool in 2011 and 2013. The 2013 Ofsted Report found that the music curriculum at Faith Primary ‘has an outstanding impact on the personal and spiritual development of the pupils.’

The 2011 Ofsted Report singles out the In Harmony instrumental teachers for praise:

> Every opportunity is taken to immerse pupils in musical language, and not a minute is wasted. The ‘In Harmony’ teachers are excellent musicians and their expert modelling sets the standard for the technical and musical quality that pupils are expected to match.

While effective instrumental teaching draws upon many skills, the level of technical and interpretative artistry of the teacher should not be underestimated. Students are able instinctively to recognise excellent playing, and a key strength of Sistema programmes linked with symphony orchestras is that students are frequently able to interact with professional players. The positive impact of the RLPO’s role has been noted in the Interim Reports:

---

319 Susanne Burns and Paul Bewick. *In Harmony Liverpool Interim Report Year 4*, 2013, p.50
The leadership role provided by the RLPO is proving to be potent in generating community pride. The high quality musical interventions made possible through the orchestra are arguably critical to the quality of the musical pedagogy and its impact on the children and the wider community.\footnote{In Harmony Liverpool Interim Report Year 4, op.cit., p.7}

The programme is also evidently helping to connect the RLPO more deeply with its community. A Liverpool Council Member states:

For our children and staff at Faith Primary School in West Everton to be taught by musicians from the Liverpool Philharmonic, for them to become our friends, and for Liverpool Philharmonic to become like a second home in our community is something very special...classical music is no longer a world that we are excluded from...it’s now our world, we love being in it and we love having the opportunity to share it with others.\footnote{ibid. Councillor Jane Corbett, Cabinet Member for Education and Children’s Services, Liverpool City Council, p.60}

A similar point was made by Tabby Estell, a former Education Manager of the London Sinfonietta and London Philharmonic Orchestra. Speaking of a Sistema ‘nucleo’ event held at the Southbank Centre in June 2013 that included ‘In Harmony Lambeth’ students, Estell explained:

These children feel that the Centre is theirs. Our aims with In Harmony Lambeth are very much to support the idea that everybody is entitled to any art form- in this case, music. That there don’t have to be barriers, that those barriers can be broken down- and identifying what those barriers are, because it is anything from the perception that it is not available, to financial constraints, to lack of understanding.\footnote{Tabby Estell. Freelance project consultant, Learning and Participation, Southbank Centre. Interview by author, 19 March 2013.}
This feedback suggests that the Sistema programmes are achieving a high priority aim for all orchestral education and outreach work: namely, to break down barriers and ensure that classical music is accessible to all sectors of the population.

Qualitative evidence in the Annual Reports reveals improvements in academic achievement, concentration, attendance, and motivation to learn in students in the programme.\textsuperscript{325} The reports also note:

Increased civic pride…Self determination and social capital are building within the community and In Harmony Liverpool has played a key role in enabling and supporting this. The community feels a strong sense of ownership over ‘their orchestra’ and In Harmony Liverpool as a programme.\textsuperscript{326}

A sense of ‘community ownership’ of an orchestra is, surely, one of the most outstanding achievements for this or any orchestral education programme. If an orchestra can tap into the feeling of civic pride mentioned here and inspire the same passionate support and loyalty that a city offers its sporting teams, then its future is assured.

Strong efforts are made to develop community support for the programme. For example, with the ‘In Home’ visits, a concept originally introduced by Sistema Scotland, music is brought into the heart of the residential neighbourhood. Students, together with the professional musicians, perform literally in their own living rooms for family and friends. Attention is given to those families who are less familiar with classical music or who might be daunted by the procedures attached to a performance in a concert hall.\textsuperscript{327}

\textsuperscript{325} Burns and Bewick. \textit{In Harmony Liverpool Interim Report Year 4}, op.cit., p.5
\textsuperscript{326} ibid., p.6
\textsuperscript{327} ibid., p.64
A further positive benefit of In Harmony Liverpool is that the relationship between RLPO and the Liverpool Music Support Service (LMSS) (now renamed the Resonate Music Education Hub) has been significantly strengthened. Burns and Bewick report that:

There has been a significant development in the partnership between LMSS and the RLPO through practical working and ongoing dialogue. This is clear in the development of pedagogical approaches to delivering music in schools and the link to teaching and learning in the classroom.\textsuperscript{328}

This newly strengthened relationship will continue to benefit the citizens of Liverpool, especially with the establishment of the Music Hub model, which relies on positive and effective partnership between organisations in order to function effectively. It is still too soon to be able to determine the long-term effect of this programme on the participants of this programme, but the available data at this date points to significant positive impact upon general well-being, civic engagement and attitude to learning.

Research undertaken upon the Sistema Scotland projects, known as ‘Big Noise’, points to similar findings. Sistema Scotland was initiated in 2008 in Raploch, Stirling, and is delivered in partnership with the BBC Scottish Symphony Orchestra. The programme has subsequently grown in scope, with two further projects established in Govanhill and Torry. The Royal Scottish National Orchestra is also supportive of Sistema Scotland, and is involved with the Torry project, which launched in June 2015. The Scottish government commissioned an independent evaluation of ‘Big Noise,’ with the findings published in 2011. The report states:

There is strong evidence from parents that Big Noise is achieving a range of short-term outcomes with the children it works with. These are

\textsuperscript{328} ibid., pp.77-78.
primarily around personal and social development, for example it is improving confidence, social skills and concentration in the children who engage.\textsuperscript{329}

While these personal developments are important in their own right, they are also likely to have further positive impact, as concentration and confidence are both essential criteria for a positive attitude towards learning.

Sistema Scotland is also currently the subject of extensive research by the Glasgow Centre for Population Health, which is part of the NHS. In May 2015, the findings to date of this study were published in the report \textit{Evaluating Sistema Scotland: Initial Findings Report Summary}. This research confirmed the findings of the Scottish Government’s 2011 report, stating:

\begin{quote}
Sistema Scotland’s Big Noise programme has the potential to significantly enhance participants’ lives, prospects, health and wellbeing through a variety of identified pathways in the long term.\textsuperscript{330}
\end{quote}

In October 2014 Sistema Scotland hosted an International Sistema Teachers’ Conference. The aim of this conference was to bring together 150 international musicians and teachers involved in delivering Sistema based programmes to network and share their experiences. Sistema Scotland has very strong ties with Venezuelan Sistema. Gustavo Dudamel, the star of Venezuelan Sistema, is a patron for Sistema Scotland and, in 2007, an official partnership was signed between the two organisations. All Sistema Scotland teaching staff have travelled to Venezuela to gain


\textsuperscript{330} \textit{Evaluating Sistema Scotland: Initial Findings Report Summary}. Co-commissioned by Glasgow Centre for Population Health, Education Scotland, Glasgow Caledonian University, May 2015, p.17
personal insight into the model, and Sistema Scotland has in turn hosted Venezuelan musicians including the Simón Bolívar Symphony Orchestra in 2012.\textsuperscript{331}

- **Sceptics, Critics and New Directions**

While public opinion of Sistema to this point has been overwhelmingly positive, in the past few years there has been a growing voice of critical investigation. Marshall Marcus comments:

> We’re now into what I call the ‘third phase’, which is characterised by people beginning to look at El Sistema in newly developed ways. Many have now tried it in their own social context and understand how some of the principles work for them. This third phase also coincides with people beginning to be more critical about Sistema, something which is important, even if a balance in these criticisms is also itself critically needed.\textsuperscript{332}

The most prominent critic is Geoffrey Baker, author of \textit{El Sistema: Orchestrating Venezuela’s Youth}.\textsuperscript{333} In stark contrast to the highly positive tone of most studies of El Sistema, Baker makes critical analysis of all aspects of the program. Baker makes several serious claims in the book, including allegations of misuse of funds, sexual misconduct between teachers and students, drug and alcohol abuse among students and staff and vandalism by Sistema orchestral musicians on tour. It is not the place of this project to prove or disprove such claims; however, it is clearly imperative that they are thoroughly investigated by the relevant authorities. El Sistema’s focus on social inclusivity and reform is also questioned, with Baker stating that reference to such

\textsuperscript{331} \texttt{http://makeabignoise.org.uk/venezuela/}, accessed 30 July 2015.

\textsuperscript{332} Marcus. 2015

elements of the project only became part of the official mission statements of the organisation in 2011.\textsuperscript{334}

Interestingly, Baker is more generous in his assessment of international Sistema inspired programs than of the original Venezuelan model. He feels that, ironically, while El Sistema’s social commitment may be questionable in Venezuela, it is more of a central focus for international programmes. Baker’s claim is that international Sistema projects: ‘are built as much on El Sistema’s illusions as on its realities, and may therefore end up (and may already be) improving on the original. For example, they are taking the idea of social action through music much more seriously than in Venezuela itself.’\textsuperscript{335}

Baker questions whether an orchestra is the positive role model claimed by Abreu and his supporters. Baker notes elements of competitiveness and friction inherent in the construct of the symphony orchestra; both in Sistema orchestras and international professional orchestras. He makes mention of several studies that claim that morale in professional orchestras is concerningly low. These studies and their implications are further discussed in this thesis in Chapter Sixteen.

Supporters of Sistema have engaged in debate upon this point. Marshall Marcus comments:

Personally, I believe that the symphony orchestra is one of our best metaphors for society; it is like a whole city in itself, and a place where people can rise together to heights that they can’t even remotely reach on their own. So to me that makes it one of the most important social paradigms that we have today. My view of society is that one of our biggest challenges is our difficulty in successfully working together. The orchestra is a way for large numbers of people to come together to make something enormously powerful, something which can help them develop and

\textsuperscript{334} Baker, op.cit, p.165
\textsuperscript{335} Ibid., p.306
provide wonderful communication in our society. Fundamentally that is what I see an orchestra is about, and what El Sistema is about.\textsuperscript{336}

Baker also suggests that there are possible patronising missionary overtones to the Sistema model, painting it as a modern continuation of insensitive efforts to impose western culture and traditions upon developing nations.\textsuperscript{337} Marcus observes that this argument is not consistent with his personal experience of the Venezuelan Sistema:

> My experience of Venezuelans is that they are not carrying the same baggage about ‘cold European culture’ as we do. In Europe we feel the terrifying, heavy weight of the past. Latins- not just Venezuelans- tend to be a lot more immediate in their reactions. So for them, they don’t think in categories the way Westerners often do.\textsuperscript{338}

The film footage and anecdotal evidence in the DVD documentaries on El Sistema reveal a level of positive energy and commitment that many Western orchestras would do well to emulate: an oppressed culture is certainly not what comes to mind. Another, more subjective criticism by Baker is that there is too much discipline in Sistema teaching methods. Many advocates of the Sistema model feel that the discipline is in fact a positive element. As Marcus remarks:

> Abreu thought that Classical music was a good way of bringing a field of discipline and commitment to people’s lives. To achieve things in life you do need to apply yourself, and what Abreu was doing was trying to find a really powerful way of harnessing the energy in his country.\textsuperscript{339}

\textsuperscript{336} Marcus. 2015
\textsuperscript{337} Baker, op.cit., p.116
\textsuperscript{338} Marcus. 2015
\textsuperscript{339} ibid.
Bronwyn Lobb, Director of the Melbourne Symphony Orchestra’s Education and Community Engagement Department, feels that the discipline required by orchestral traditions helps to develop many positive skills and character traits:

I think that it is a big thing that an orchestra owns; a huge set of skills and incredible attention to detail. A trained musician is a perfectionist and there is so much that can enhance anyone’s development by being pushed to be the very best you can be all the time. It takes away the idea that ‘near enough is good enough’ because by coming to our concerts you are constantly being exposed to artistic excellence. It requires diligence, focus and patience, and all these qualities are often overlooked today. This year [2012] we ran a project where community musicians came to play with the MSO, and what we saw was that many people came from really high-level professions. They had music training at school and then went on to other things, but all those qualities that they learnt through music, like time management, have made them who they are now and helped them to excel in another field.340

As Lobb notes, the abilities that serious study of classical music helps to foster, such as diligence, focus and perseverance, can be of value to people in all aspects of their life. The existence of specific ‘Doctor’ and ‘Lawyer’ Community orchestras, both in Australia and internationally, shows that music is a key part of life for many in these two prestigious professions.

At present, there is quite a polarised view of Sistema by orchestral management personnel. While many are passionate advocates, others believe that the Venezuelan model cannot translate internationally. Timothy Walker (Chief Executive and Creative Director of the London Philharmonic Orchestra) is one of the sceptics:

It is a different thing. Venezuela and Britain are socially, culturally and educationally at different levels of development and character. Britain is very well served by the Youth Orchestra network, in the way that Australia is by Australian Youth Orchestra. I think it is very important but

---

340 Bronwyn Lobb. Director of Education and Community Engagement, Melbourne Symphony Orchestra. Interview by author, 25 September 2012
where it has been established I think it’s because there are seen to be strong social reasons for it.\textsuperscript{341}

Patrick Bailey, former Education Manager of the LPO, also feels that Sistema does not translate well outside of Venezuela, although the LPO does support In Harmony Lambeth students with coaching and performance opportunities. Bailey comments:

In Venezuela the costing is completely different. I get excited about El Sistema. I think it's brilliant, but I can’t get excited about what’s happening here. There is another project that also deals with putting violin playing at the heart of young people’s school curriculum, called the Bridge Project (run by London Music Masters), which is brilliant.\textsuperscript{342}

The partnership between the LPO and London Music Masters is examined in more depth in Chapter Eleven. In Australia the Manager of the SSO Education Department, Kim Waldock, was not supportive of introducing the Sistema model in Sydney:

El Sistema was cultural. I think it is more the domain of the Sydney Youth Orchestra association because they have their training orchestras. In NSW there are enough schools and regional Conservatoriums that have their youth orchestras. What would be good would be for the government to put more money towards them so there could be more instruments available.\textsuperscript{343}

The management of the Adelaide Symphony Orchestra is favourable to the concept but yet to commit to a Sistema inspired programme. The Director of Artistic Planning, Simon Lord, explains:

There isn’t resistance to it, I think there is a lack sometimes of understanding what it is about, and I think there are colleagues who having grasped it now didn’t initially. We know that it is not necessarily about

\textsuperscript{343} Waldock, interview.
teaching the children how to play the violin, it’s about a community programme, a social project and now people have grasped that here. There is a momentum coming.\textsuperscript{344}

As orchestras already committed to Sistema inspired programmes continue to release highly positive feedback, it will be interesting to see whether any further Australian or British orchestras establish similar schemes in the future. The long-term impact of the current programmes will, of necessity, take time to prove itself. However, at this point, one would have to say that when operated with effective planning and sincere intentions, Sistema-inspired programmes do indeed have the power to change lives.

\textsuperscript{344} Simon Lord. Director of Artistic Planning, Adelaide Symphony Orchestra. Interview by author, 13 December 2011
Part Two

Current Case Studies in Orchestral Education Programming
Chapter Eleven: Case Studies of British Orchestras

11.1 The London Symphony Orchestra

The London Symphony Orchestra (LSO) has developed its education and community outreach to such an exceptional level that the LSO Discovery department is now a major part of the identity of the orchestra, a useful edge to have in London’s competitive classical market. Marking its 25th anniversary in 2015, the Discovery Department now reaches over 60,000 participants annually, at a cost to the LSO of 1.3 million pounds per annum. The Discovery Department has a central focus on the population of East London, but its impact is evident both nationally and, increasingly, internationally. The Discovery Department boasts the largest number of education and outreach personnel of any orchestra internationally: seventeen at the time of writing. This large team oversees a wide range of activities, which are broadly defined by the LSO within three main categories: ‘First Access’; ‘Lifelong Learning’; and ‘Next Generation of Musicians’. The following case study examines each of these areas in detail.

Regular activities in the ‘First Access’ stream of activities are offered to people of all ages, and are intended to be a welcoming introduction to the world of the LSO. For young children and their families there are music sessions for under 5s and their carers, themed as ‘Shake, Rattle and Roll’, and ‘Musical Storytelling.’ For older children the LSO offers a series of sequential School Concerts, linked to the Curriculum and with teacher support. Additionally, there are opportunities for students to join the LSO Discovery Choir, the Digital Technology Group, or to attend LSO Discovery Friday.

---

345 [http://lso.co.uk/lso-discovery/about-lso-discovery](http://lso.co.uk/lso-discovery/about-lso-discovery), accessed 6 August 2015.
346 Ibid.
Lunchtime concerts. The LSO also reaches out to those who have difficulties accessing education programmes through its Children’s Hospital Programme, for children aged 0-18 with acute or life-threatening illness, and the LSO ‘Create and Special Schools’ programmes, for adults and children with learning difficulties.347

Programmes in support of ‘Lifelong Learning’ include the un-auditioned LSO Community Choir, which has over 100 members; the LSO Community Gamelan Group, which teaches Balinese music to adults; and LSO Discovery Days. Discovery Days offer a whole day of activities aimed at increasing understanding of a particular composer to be featured in a main stage concert. These activities include an informative talk, a chamber music presentation, attendance at an open rehearsal and finally the evening concert.348

While Discovery Days are clearly linked with the core performance activity of the orchestra, the same link cannot be so easily perceived with many of the other First Access or Lifelong Learning programmes. In interview with the author Judith Ackrill, the present Director of LSO Discovery, discussed the rationale behind such apparently disparate activities. Ackrill explained:

Some of the activity there isn’t directly linked to orchestral music. Having said that, our players link directly into nearly everything there. The Create programme, gamelan and the digital group- there will be events and occasions where musicians come in to work with the people who are doing that activity. It is both the idea of getting to as wide an audience as possible and the idea of the musicians themselves experiencing the range of people who can get such value out of music. The great thing is that people become familiar with the space.349

347 ibid.
348 ibid.
349 Ackrill. Interview by author, 2015.
One of the benefits of bringing a new sector of the community into LSO venues through these musical activities is that it offers an un-intimidating entry point into classical music. As Ackrill observes, people become familiar with the space, and with the musicians hosting sessions and rehearsals. The formal atmosphere of a large concert hall, while providing a certain glamour and sense of occasion, can also appear a daunting and unwelcoming prospect to those who have not had early experiences of them through family or school. Having gained familiarity with the venues and personal links with musicians, it is then easier to take the further step towards attending LSO recitals and concerts.

A growth area for participation with the LSO, and across Britain in general, is choral singing. The LSO Sing programme, directed by Simon Halsey, encompasses not only the prestigious, auditioned London Symphony Chorus but also the Community Choir and the Discovery Choir, which are un-auditioned but have weekly rehearsals at St Luke’s. There are also regular ‘Singing Days’ at which repertoire is workshopped alongside LSO musicians.\(^{350}\)

The increased interest in singing in the UK can, to an extent, be credited to another LSO Choral Director and animateur, Gareth Malone. Appointed the Edward Heath Assistant Animateur in 2001,\(^{351}\) Malone went on to direct the Community and Discovery Choirs for the LSO. Whilst in this role, he was selected to present the highly popular BBC2 TV show, ‘The Choir,’ which was released in 2006.\(^{352}\) The Choir was succeeded by TV projects in which Malone worked on awaking a love of choral singing with different sectors of society, including adolescent boys and workplace

\(^{350}\) [http://lso.co.uk/lso-discovery/about-lso-discovery](http://lso.co.uk/lso-discovery/about-lso-discovery), accessed 8 August 2015.

\(^{351}\) ibid.

choirs. As well as proving that choral singing, in the hands of an enthusiastic animateur, can connect with all sectors of society, the success of Malone also paved the way for orchestras to tap into the new-found popularity of choral singing.

A number of orchestras now have associated community and youth choirs, and it remains a growth field for the industry. There are also logistical reasons why orchestras are increasingly offering choral community activities; singing being the most accessible entry point into music and negating the need for instruments and equipment. Judith Ackrill gives her views on the growth of the choral programme at LSO:

The choral programme is very successful. Singing is growing in England and the question is whether we should be rolling out the choir programme into the Boroughs and working through the Hubs to do choral things. It does create an environment in which the orchestra will flourish. These people who sing in the choirs are having a fantastic time, they are conducted in the concert by Simon Halsey, they see the players and then they will come to other concerts. It does go in a big circle.353

The UK Government has supported several school choral initiatives, such as the ‘Sing Up’ Campaign, launched in 2007 as part of the Music Manifesto. This was a four-year programme aimed at raising the status of singing and increasing opportunities for children to sing everyday. In April 2012 Sing Up became a not-for-profit membership organisation, which offers members access to resources that include 600 songs, backing tracks and teaching activities.354 Over 95% of British Primary Schools joined the Sing Up programme, which is still supported by Music Hubs. There are therefore strong opportunities for orchestras to link with school choral projects.

353 Ackrill, interview.
In addition to the programmes discussed above, the LSO also offers a number of initiatives that aim to develop the next generation of musicians. These include LSO On Track; Take A Bow; LSO Academies; String Experience; LSO Platforms; Orchestral Artistry Masters Degree (in partnership with the Guildhall School of Music and Drama); Panufnik Composers Scheme; conducting masterclasses; and the Donatella Flick LSO Conducting Competition.\footnote{http://lso.co.uk/lso-discovery/about-lso-discovery, accessed 8 August 2015.}

The LSO was an early proponent of mixed ability performances, where students perform alongside the symphony orchestra in concert. The LSO On Track programme is an example of this model, initiated in 2008 in line with the Olympic movement.

Young musicians from ten East London Boroughs have played alongside the LSO in high profile performances. A notable example was the Opening Ceremony of the 2012 London Olympic Games, at which eighty On Track musicians performed Elgar’s Nimrod, arranged by Welsh composer Gareth Glyn.\footnote{ibid.}

On Track students have also been included in the LSO’s BMW Open Air Classics concert series staged annually in Trafalgar Square, performing arrangements by Glyn of Berlioz’s Symphonie Fantastique (2013), Prokofiev’s Lieutenant Kije (2014) and Shostakovich’s Jazz Suites.\footnote{http://lso.co.uk/lso-discovery/schools-young-people/lso-on-track, accessed 8 August 2015.} Glyn is a leader internationally in this style of arranging, and has at present arranged forty-eight popular classical works for multi-level orchestral performance, as detailed in the Appendix.\footnote{www.garethglyn.info, accessed 1 June 2015.}

The On Track model offers an immediate point of inspiration for young musicians right from the start of their instrumental studies, often the most daunting stage of learning. By performing alongside an elite level orchestra, young players can...
experience the power and beauty of instrumental music at the highest level. As the programme targets the boroughs of East London in particular, which have a very multicultural population, it also provides a familiarity with the LSO musicians and venues for many migrant families who may not have otherwise made the connection. Here an On Track participant gives her point of view on the value of the programme:

Working with LSO members, real, live professional musicians, was unbelievable...It was a very special moment I will never forget. I just felt really proud to be part of such a big event in people’s lives. (Bethany Grogan, 15, LSO On Track participant.)\(^{359}\)

The repertoire choices made by the LSO are an important aspect of the On Track model. By arranging such powerful and colourful symphonic works, students are able to experience the full range and colour of a symphony orchestra, alongside making their own contribution.

While the original On Track programme was aimed towards the Olympic Games, it has been decided to carry the concept of instrumental participation into the future. Judith Ackrill comments that Music Hubs have made clear that they valued: ‘large scale chances to come together and collaborate on something with a high profile, which give the students an experience that they just couldn’t have elsewhere.’\(^{360}\)

These are also offered through programmes such as ‘Take a Bow’ and ‘Rites of Passage’. The Take A Bow programme has a similar philosophy to the On Track model, with students performing alongside the LSO. Repertoire has included arrangements of classical repertoire, such as the Bach Double Violin Concerto, alongside new works

\(^{359}\) http://lso.co.uk/lso-discovery/schools-young-people/lso-on-track, accessed 1 March 2015.

\(^{360}\) Ackrill, interview.
commissioned for multi-level orchestra. These works have the advantage of being
designed from the beginning to fit with instrumental pedagogy, as well as having
engaging themes and stories designed to spark the young players’ imaginations. An
example is ‘The Gypsy Violin’, by Jeff Moore, which is based on a Transylvanian gypsy
folk tale of a violin built by the devil. The Gypsy Violin was originally commissioned
by Wiltshire-based charity Superstrings, but was also programmed in LSO Take A Bow
concerts, conducted by Sir John Eliot Gardiner, in London and Paris. The LSO has
commissioned similar works from Moore, including The Sea and the Sky (2011) and
River Journey (premiered at the Barbican in June 2012). The ‘Rites of Passage’
concert, held at the Barbican each summer, integrates some of the On Track work with
other projects.

While On Track and Take A Bow are designed to support students in their early
learning on their instruments, a number of other LSO programmes are provided for the
emerging generation of professional musicians and composers. For example, ‘LSO
Academy’ is a programme for outstanding Strings, Wind, Brass and Percussion students
aged 14-24. The Academy is an intensive summer training course, with 282 past
participants as of 2015.

The LSO and the Guildhall School of Music and Drama have close ties,
strengthened by their shared residence of London’s Barbican Centre. Students in the
Guildhall’s postgraduate Orchestral Artistry course are coached in elite level orchestral
skills by LSO musicians. They are also offered master-classes by orchestras visiting the
Barbican, including the Concertgebouw, Leipzig Gewandhaus, LA Philharmonic and

362 ibid.
363 [http://lso.co.uk/lso-discovery/about-lso-discovery](http://lso.co.uk/lso-discovery/about-lso-discovery), accessed 7 August 2015.
New York Philharmonic. The course offers elite level students not only the benefits of the Barbican location, but also training in the versatility that characterises the LSO. As stated in the course synopsis:

…students will explore the diverse skills required to become a modern professional ensemble player; a musician with a high level of leadership skills who is equally at home in a symphony orchestra as they are in a trio, or as a soloist, in a recording studio, managing and promoting their own concerts, speaking publicly or delivering education and community work.\textsuperscript{364}

In addition to the Orchestral Artistry Masters Degree, the LSO also offers recital opportunities for selected Guildhall students at the Barbican through the LSO Platforms programme. Opportunities for students at other London music colleges are provided through the String Experience, which has now successfully transitioned fourteen students into membership of the LSO and a further nineteen as extra list players. Twenty-two past LSO String Experience graduates have positions with other leading UK orchestras.\textsuperscript{365} Support is also provided to six young composers a year through the Panufnik Composers Scheme and LSO Soundhub; and to conductors through the Donatella Flick LSO Conducting Competition, with the winner appointed the LSO Assistant Conductor.

The strength of the LSO’s education and outreach work was given fresh publicity in March 2015, upon the announcement that Sir Simon Rattle would be their next Chief Conductor. Official press releases by both Rattle and LSO stressed their shared belief in the importance of developing community links. Here Rattle speaks of

\begin{footnotesize}
\textsuperscript{364} http://lso.co.uk/lso-discovery/the-next-generation/orchestral-artistry, accessed 29 July 2015.
\textsuperscript{365} http://lso.co.uk/lso-discovery/about-lso-discovery, accessed 7 August 2015.
\end{footnotesize}
how the LSO’s desire to be meaningfully connected with their community was a significant factor in his decision:

During my work with the LSO over the last years, I noticed that despite the Orchestra’s long and illustrious history, they almost never refer to it. Instead, refreshingly, they talk about the future, what can they make anew, what can they improve, how can they reach further into the community. In terms of musical excellence, it is clear that the sky’s the limit, but equally important, in terms of philosophy, they constantly strive to be a twenty-first century orchestra. We share a dream in which performing, teaching and learning are indivisible, with wider dissemination of our art at its centre.366

In his final remark here, Rattle touches on one of the key points for future development of orchestral education programming: namely, the degree to which such activities are aligned with the performance work of the orchestra. This issue is gaining increasing attention at the present date, and is discussed further in Chapter Nineteen.

In June 2015 a further announcement was made that Rattle will take on the role of Artist-in-Association with the Barbican Centre and the Guildhall School of Music and Drama. In his press release Rattle stated:

This is a once in a lifetime opportunity to join up every element of our work...it gives us the chance to develop a unique offer of inspiring music for a new generation.367

Specific initiatives will include a series of commissions by the Barbican for the LSO; an annual series of operas mounted jointly by the LSO and the Barbican; a regular series of side-by-side projects for the LSO and Guildhall students; and support for new postgraduate courses in conducting and choral training. This appointment signifies the

commitment to music education that Rattle will bring to London in the next stage of his career.

Rattle has a long history of supporting music education, raising the profile of education at the CBSO considerably during his tenure there, and advocating for the place of music in the National Curriculum. Upon his appointment as Chief Conductor in Berlin, Rattle again illustrated his commitment to education by establishing education programmes with the illustrious orchestra, which had not previously ventured into such territory. While Rattle changed the culture of the Berlin Philharmonic by introducing an education and community engagement department, when he moves to LSO he will be working with an orchestra which has been at the forefront of such work since the 1980s. In this sense it promises to be a strong partnership that offers potential benefits for both the LSO and the community it serves. This is evident in the LSO’s official press release on the appointment:

As Music Director he [Rattle] will be involved in every aspect of the LSO’s work as well as championing the importance of music and music education...Simon Rattle outlined his vision for universal access to music, with children and young people at its heart. He called for new standards in making world-class music available to all. He stated his aim that every musician should be engaged in composing, improvising, mentoring and performing; that the creation of new music will be central to the process, working with leading composers and teachers; and that his appointment will generate new partnerships between London and the whole country to confirm the UK as a world leader in the arts.  

A concrete indication of Rattle’s vision for the LSO, and his commitment to community music making, is that he has already commissioned several works designed for community involvement. The first of these, a choral work for young people, the

368 Press release 3 March 2015 http://www.lso.co.uk, accessed 8 March 2015
community and the LSO by Jonathon Dove, titled ‘The Monster in the Maze,’ was premiered by Rattle and the LSO on the 5th of July, 2015.  

Fiona Harvey, the Education Director of the Association of British Orchestras, gives her view of Rattle’s forthcoming return to the UK:

I am sure that he will talk about music education. There is no way that he will come to LSO and not talk about music education. He will certainly strengthen our cause and fight.

Rattle has the potential to shine a public spotlight upon music education, and is well positioned to advocate its importance to policy makers.

With Rattle’s support, the LSO Discovery Department looks likely to remain at the forefront of international best practice in orchestral education, community engagement and partnership working for many years to come. It promises to be a potent combination: an orchestra with a leading reputation in education and outreach work, and a Chief Conductor who matches rhetoric to action in his advocacy for such work. Together, the LSO and Rattle can potentially create a new model for best practice in terms of a socially relevant 21st Century orchestra, both within the UK and internationally. Of key interest shall be whether Rattle steers the LSO Discovery Department in new directions, or whether he develops activities along their already established lines. Rattle’s influence upon the UK government could also prove to be a pivotal factor in improving the status of music education.

While the principal focus of LSO Discovery is on making connections with its local East London community and strengthening music making in the capital, it has an increasing international presence. This is due in part to the inclusion of Discovery

\[369\] http://www.lso.co.uk, accessed 1 July 2015.

\[370\] Harvey. Interview by author, 2015
projects in LSO international tours; including projects in Paris, Tokyo and New York. On the LSO’s tour of Australia the LSO offered a Discovery project in which 130 students from across the state of New South Wales rehearsed, collaborated and performed with the LSO. The LSO’s increasing Digital presence has also broadened its access both nationally and internationally, and this is an area of future growth for the orchestra. A total of nine million pounds was recently raised through the Endowment Appeal (Moving Music 2012-15) which will be used to further develop the LSO’s digital programming.371

While LSO Discovery is Britain’s most prominent education department in terms of personnel, funding and international recognition, many other UK orchestras have also established dynamic and effective education programmes. Although it is not possible to discuss the education programming of each British orchestra, the following case studies look at selected models in detail.

371 http://lso.co.uk/support-us/moving-music-campaign, accessed 10 August 2015.
11.2 The Hallé Orchestra

The Hallé Orchestra was founded by Sir Charles Hallé in 1858, who was also its principal conductor until his death in 1895.\textsuperscript{372} The Hallé is based at Manchester’s Bridgewater Hall, and serves the population of Greater Manchester and North-East England. In 2014 the Education Department reached over 50,000 people in these focus areas, offering sixty-eight projects that supported school education, music therapy, community choral singing and orchestral training for both school aged students and emerging professionals.\textsuperscript{373} The Hallé’s Education programming is highly participatory, with a focus on participants personally connecting with the orchestral musicians. The Education programme has developed significantly over the past fifteen years, a result of decisions made at the Management level.

In the late 1990s a combination of cash flow problems, management instability and ambitious programming from Music Director Kent Nagano led to a major financial crisis for the Hallé. The orchestra only managed to avoid bankruptcy thanks to generous donations to a public appeal and a vital Lottery grant of just under 3 million pounds.\textsuperscript{374} By the year 2000, with finances stabilising somewhat, the orchestra was ready to take a fresh direction. This was marked with the appointment of a new Music Director, Sir Mark Elder (in 2000) and a new Chief Executive, John Summers (in 1999). The orchestra have also looked to thank the public for their support with a new commitment to their engagement and education programmes. The current Head of Ensembles at the Hallé, Naomi Benn, comments:

\textsuperscript{372} http://www.co.uk/our-history.aspx, accessed 5 August 2015.
\textsuperscript{373} http://www.halle.co.uk/learning-engagement.aspx, accessed 4 July 2015
When Sir Mark Elder and John Summers arrived at the Hallé it had been in dire straits financially and needed reinvigorating, and the drive came from the very top. The Hallé has always had a very strong connection with the community, and when things got really bad financially it was the people of Manchester that saved the orchestra. So given that connection, everything we do is about embedding the orchestra in the community, offering easy access to as many people as possible.\textsuperscript{375}

Overseen since 2002 by Education Director Steve Pickett, the Hallé Education department has tripled its output in the past decade.\textsuperscript{376} In 2015 there is now a team of five in the Education Department (including two part time posts) and a further six part time positions to oversee the Ensembles Department.\textsuperscript{377}

The Hallé has developed a wide range of points of connection with the local Manchester community. One key area of growth has been the Hallé’s support of young musicians. The Hallé has established several umbrella music organisations: alongside the flagship symphony orchestra and choir now stand the Hallé Youth Orchestra and three Youth Choirs for different age groups. According to Benn, the establishment of these youth ensembles was central to the vision of Elder and Summers:

The Chief Executive, John Summers, is very keen to support youth orchestras. He had run a youth orchestra at the Northern Sinfonia (where he had worked before) and totally believes in kids getting to play and experience orchestral music. Mark, on the other hand, while also very supportive of youth orchestras, has a very strong opera background and loves that the North of England has such a strong choral society tradition—he wanted to try to maintain and extend that. Everybody is able to sing, and you don’t need an instrument, so he came up with the idea of a ‘choral pyramid’, with opportunities to sing at a high level feeding down from the adult Hallé choir to youth and children’s choirs. It’s all about investing in the next generation of players, singers and audience members.\textsuperscript{378}

\textsuperscript{375} Naomi Benn. Interview by author, 2015
\textsuperscript{376} http://halle.co.uk, accessed 1 June 2015.
\textsuperscript{377} ibid.
\textsuperscript{378} Benn.
In 2001 the Hallé was awarded stabilisation funding from the Arts Council to implement Summers and Elder’s vision for the organisation, including the choral pyramid and the youth orchestra. The Hallé Youth Orchestra, established in 2002 for children aged 13-19, is intended for students who are not at a specialised music college or school, aiming to create an accessible ensemble opportunity.\textsuperscript{379} The Youth Choir, which started a year after the Youth Orchestra and targets the same age group, shares the same aim, along with the intention to raise the status and standard of the main Hallé Choir. Following on from these two key groups came the Children’s Choir in 2008, Training Choir in 2011, and a number of open access choirs.\textsuperscript{380}

While the aim is for participants to enjoy their experiences, standards are held high and all places are auditioned annually. In the Training Choir, skills in reading music and musicianship are offered, and boys are shepherded through the delicate voice breaking age. The Youth Orchestra plays a double role in the organisation, as it is conducted by the Hallé Assistant Conductor. This is a position, mentored by Elder, which has provided a starting point for many of the UK’s most successful young conductors, including Edward Gardner and Rory Macdonald. The Youth Orchestra has reached a high standard over the past thirteen years and toured to Germany in 2014. They perform a side-by-side concert annually with the Hallé, and several past members have now played with the Hallé.

Alongside the Youth Orchestra and Choir Ensembles, the Hallé also offers other programmes for primary and secondary school students. The flagship school programme is ‘Adopt-a-Player,’ which aims to establish a personal connection between Hallé musicians and students. Each ‘Adopt-a-Player’ project has a number of stages,
which include: inset sessions for teachers; a pre-concert school visit by the ‘adopted’ musician; attendance at a main-stage Bridgewater Hall concert, at which the students are personally greeted in the foyer by the adopted musician; two further visits to school which include composition workshops in response to music heard in the concert; and a concluding in school performance for family and friends. This programme has taken a conventional school concert format and added extra dimensions that help to create a significantly deeper and more long-term connection between students, the orchestral musicians, and the repertoire performed by the orchestra.

Also of particular note is the programme ‘Come and Play with the Hallé,’ in which 16,000 young instrumentalists annually play and sing alongside the Hallé. Designed to link with the government programmes ‘Whole Class Ensemble Teaching Programme’ and ‘Sing Up,’ the concerts feature pieces arranged or composed by the Hallé’s Education Director. Pickett comments:

When I sit in the Come and Play concerts with 1,500 kids playing, it is why I do this job. We recognise this area of development with the Hubs and wanted to provide an opportunity for these kids to perform.\(^{381}\)

Pickett recognises that performance opportunities are of prime importance to children beginning instrumental studies. By playing alongside a professional symphony orchestra they can be shown what is possible on their instruments, hopefully helping to provide them with a motivation to persist through the learning process. Here Pickett comments on the development of this programme:

It has taken time. We started with two concerts in Nottingham back in 2007 and it has expanded: this summer [2015] we have ten concerts and

\(^{381}\) Pickett. Interview by author, 2015
already fourteen lined up for next summer. For the Hallé they have become very much a part of our summer programme.\textsuperscript{382}

While this programme is of clear benefit in and of itself, the extra benefit of bringing in income cannot be underestimated. Pickett makes strong efforts to link with syllabus requirements, and in 2015 ‘Come and Play with the Hallé’ also links with the BBC initiative 10 Pieces (discussed further in this chapter) by including an arrangement of Mars from Holst’s The Planets.

The ability to make strategic partnerships is key to the Hallé’s current operations. In addition to the programmes facilitated independently by the Hallé’s Education Department, they also have established strong partnerships with local organisations. These partnerships cover a variety of sectors, including schools, Music Hubs, the Royal Northern College of Music (RNCM), the Thorn Cross Young Offenders Institution, Pendine Care Homes and SHINE on Manchester. Each of these partnerships adds to the Hallé’s presence in the community and strengthens the Education Department.\textsuperscript{383}

The Hallé SHINE on Manchester initiative is a key programme, which could be of great interest to music education specialists internationally. In operation since 2012, the programme is offered to children from thirty-nine selected primary schools across Manchester, who have been identified as falling behind in literacy and numeracy. The children receive extra support at a Saturday school, where these skills are focused on via a music-based curriculum. Here Pickett comments:

\begin{footnotes}
\textsuperscript{382} ibid.
\textsuperscript{383} \url{http://halle.co.uk}, accessed 1 June 2015.
\end{footnotes}
It puts music at the centre of the curriculum and a panel developed a curriculum with literacy and numeracy around it. There is very positive anecdotal evidence at this point.\textsuperscript{384}

While several studies have looked at the impact of arts participation on the learning progress of selected students, the unique aspect to this programme is that music is central to the teaching methods. The programme is currently being evaluated by Durham University and the official report is due to be published in winter of 2016.\textsuperscript{385}

The Hallé offers two more programmes that aim to use music to actively help the community. The first of these is the programme developed in 2004 with the Thorn Cross Young Offenders Institution. This programme is led by the Hallé’s Principal Tuba, Ewan Easton, who was awarded an MBE in recognition of his work. Here Pickett summarises the aims and methods of this project:

Ewan teaches them brass and uses the concept of learning an instrument to re-address life skills such as persistence and overcoming difficulties. Ewan has created a manual for the work. The process is that the Hallé for Brass quintet goes in and plays in the prison, then there is a 12 week programme which teaches participants to read music, overcome problems, and addresses a number of issues, then they play alongside the Hallé quintet. There have been great anecdotal stories of the ways in which participants have benefitted from this programme and gone on to fulfilling lives after their prison term, joined the army, played in local brass bands.\textsuperscript{386}

While Pickett reveals that this project is currently facing financial pressures, the benefit of the work for participants past and present has clearly been life changing and is further evidence of the ways in which orchestral education programmes can help to develop positive life skills.

\textsuperscript{384} Pickett.
\textsuperscript{385} \url{www.cem.org/attachments/Halle%20page%20text%20FINAL.pdf}, personal communication with Pickett, accessed 2 April 2015.
\textsuperscript{386} Pickett.
The Hallé also runs a programme at Pendine Park Care Homes, focusing in particular on patients suffering from dementia. The benefits of music therapy in hospitals and nursing homes are increasingly being explored, and music’s effect in delaying the onset of dementia is an active area of research internationally. Evidence is increasingly pointing to music’s ability to calm agitated patients, and the ways in which music can help to retain brain pathways are also being explored. Here the methods and findings of a 2005 study in this area are summarised:

This case–control study was carried out by qualified music therapists in two nursing homes and two psychogeriatric wards. The participants were 38 patients with moderate or severe Alzheimer's disease (AD) assigned randomly to a music therapy group and a control group. Results: The study showed a significant reduction in activity disturbances in the music therapy group during a 6-week period measured with the Behaviour Pathology in Alzheimer's Disease Rating Scale (BEHAVE-AD). There was also a significant reduction in the sum of scores of activity disturbances, aggressiveness and anxiety.387

While many past studies have pointed to similar evidence, the quantitative proof and scientific rigour of the methods of research have in the past been questioned. However recent academic studies, such as that referenced above, are finding that there are definite positive measurable effects upon patients working with music therapists. As scientists continue to make progress in their understanding of the brain, there are increasing opportunities for music therapy teams to link with scientific research in order to continue to explore this line of investigation.

The Hallé’s programme at Pendine Park Care Homes aims create a lasting legacy by developing a staff training diploma, provisionally entitled ‘Enhancing Care

and Well-Being in Tune With Music/ the Arts. The Diploma is currently being developed between the Artist-in-Residence, Hallé Musicians and Smartcare, the staff-training branch of the Pendine Organisation. The field of music therapy is rapidly growing internationally and Diplomas such as this are a way to ensure that the practice receives appropriate validity.

The Hallé has traditionally had a close relationship with the lead tertiary training institution in the area, the Royal Northern College of Music (RNCM), which was also originally established by Sir Charles Hallé. At present, the Hallé offers two key programmes in partnership with the RNCM, both offering training and performance experience to emerging orchestral musicians, supported by ‘Help Musicians’. One is the String Leadership Course: a postgraduate course aimed at elite graduates from UK conservatoriums who may be the next generation of section leaders or even concert masters. The other is the Professional Experience Scheme for Wind, Brass and Percussion, which is open to both undergraduate and postgraduate students.

Four students a year are admitted to the String Leadership Course, coming from all over the UK, and each is provided with a year playing with the Hallé. Pickett explains:

We pay them 10,000 pounds, they are mentored by our players and Sir Mark Elder. They do education work with the orchestra as we recognise that as a big part of what an orchestral musician does these days, they are tutored at College and they also have chamber music opportunities.

The professional experience scheme for wind brass and percussion, started in 2003, has a larger intake each year. Pickett recalls that the orchestra was initially concerned

---

389 Pickett.
at the commencement of this programme at having students playing in the orchestra. Now, however, it has now developed to the point at which the players have taken real ownership. Approximately sixty players audition and are placed into ensembles to do workshops. From these around twelve are typically selected to participate in the programme. The scheme gradually steps the students through experiences with the orchestra, from observing within the section, to playing in a rehearsal, then a concert, then being placed on the official extra list.390

There are clear benefits for the Hallé as well as for the students in these training programmes. With the String Leadership Course the Hallé gains the opportunity to make close links with the strongest recent graduates from music colleges across the country. Several past members of the String Leadership Course now have full time positions with the Hallé. The opportunity to mentor talented students in the wind, brass and percussion sections is also beneficial for both the orchestra and students. These positions in an orchestra are much more exposed than string players, and this programme is designed to steadily ease students into the professional environment. Mentors can explain the traditions of orchestral ensemble playing and address any potential performance anxiety issues. From the Hallé’s perspective, it provides a realistic and thorough way of assessing students’ suitability for inclusion in the orchestra.

The Hallé is one of many orchestras in the UK looking to link their education and outreach work with community choirs. Choral singing has long been a strong part of community life in the UK, with many rural towns having their own music society and choir. The Hallé links with this tradition through its associated Choirs, but has  

390 ibid.
recently added another choral programme, the ‘Hallé Corporate Choir Competition.’ The first of these was held in 2013 in partnership with the North West Business Leadership Team. Choirs formed from six companies took part in the pilot year, receiving training from Hallé choral mentors and competing for the opportunity to perform alongside the Hallé in a Christmas concert in Bridgewater Hall.\footnote{http://www.halle.co.uk/news.aspx?News_ID=10445&FriendlyID=Corporate-choirs-compete-for-top-Hall-prize, accessed 2 June 2015.} The programme was a success and is now looking likely to remain as an annual event. The Chief Executive of the Hallé, John Summers, comments on the competition: ‘Whilst being a lot of fun and a great stress reliever, work-based choirs can also help improve many essential skills such as confidence and communication.’\footnote{ibid.}

Other orchestras internationally are also exploring ways in which they can link their community engagement activities with corporations. The Memphs Symphony is a leader in this field through its ‘Leading from Every Chair’ programme.\footnote{http://www.memphissymphony.org/lfec, accessed 10 May 2015} This point of intersect between orchestras and the corporate world has also been successfully explored by conductors Benjamin Zander\footnote{Benjamin Zander and Rosamund Stone Zander. \textit{The Art of Possibility}, Boston: Harvard Business School Press, 2000, reprint Penguin 2002} and Roger Nierenberg, who have each published books based upon their activities in this field.\footnote{Roger Nierenberg. \textit{Maestro: A Surprising Story About Leading by Listening}, New York: Portfolio, 2009} The ways in which music can develop confidence and communication, as discussed above by Summers, are a marketable commodity to corporations looking to boost morale and teamwork in their organisation. Therefore the Hallé corporate choir programme could be of interest to other orchestras internationally.

The skills and training of the Hallé Education Director, Steve Pickett, have made a considerable impact upon the programmes offered. Pickett, who studied both
composition and the bassoon during his tertiary training, first explored orchestral education work during his time playing in the Ulster Symphony Orchestra in the 1980s. During this time Pickett, like many others, was inspired by the work of pioneer McNicol, who was hired by the Arts Council of Northern Ireland to establish early orchestral education work in Northern Ireland. Pickett is a very hands-on Education Director, who is able to compose or arrange pieces for Hallé programmes and whose experience as an orchestral player allows him insight into programmes from the viewpoint of Hallé orchestral members. Pickett observes:

When I came to the Hallé I had worked with a lot of different sectors. I have a very practical background: I’ve had to work very hard on the strategic side of things, but leading from the front and providing compositions throughout the programme have been my key strengths. The Hallé has always had a practitioner in the Education Director role. 396

Another way in which Pickett has made a personal contribution to the Hallé education programme is by insisting on including a programme targeting pre-school aged children, an area he is particularly interested in:

If I was asked where I would focus most funding anywhere, I would always say pre-school, starting them off. In those formative years you can really make an impact. 397

The need for further focus on music education for very young children was supported by the 2014 Report, Step by Step: Arts Policy and Young People 1944-2014. Having reviewed recent research in the area of arts education for children, one of the key recommendations of the Report was to increase arts education for the early years sector, stating that:

396 Pickett.
397 ibid.
It is highly likely that greater attention to arts engagement for very young children would have a significant impact on their engagement in later years.\textsuperscript{398}

The Hallé, like the LSO, has recently renovated a previously derelict church, St Peter’s, to use for their rehearsals and education work. St Peter’s is in North Central Manchester, an area where the industrial revolution started. While many of the buildings subsequently fell derelict, reclamation funding schemes have rehabilitated the area and the local council wanted the arts to be part of the re-development. St Peter’s was given to the Hallé on a peppercorn rent (virtually for free, under the proviso that the Hallé could provide for its upkeep), and they raised 1.5 million pounds for the conversion. From Pickett’s perspective:

St Peter’s has been an amazing change for us. Before that the Hallé had never had a place of its own. We rehearsed in various venues around the city but none of these were really suitable for our needs and the orchestra didn’t have ownership or any real control over these spaces…the main thing for me about Hallé St Peter’s is that it provides an excellent intimate performance space which allows us to put the audience within, or much closer than would normally be the case, to the performers. For early years performances this is ideal.\textsuperscript{399}

This seating arrangement allows the children to feel fully included in the performance and establishes an intimate atmosphere. The St Peter’s venue has also made logistical arrangements for the Youth Orchestra and Choir Ensembles much smoother as they now have a venue available to them for their weekly rehearsals. As Benn observes:

\textsuperscript{398} Doeser. \textit{Step by Step}, op.cit., p.4
\textsuperscript{399} Pickett.
‘Now we have a home for the ensembles, which is shared with the professionals, it’s a game changer, it really is.’ Benn’s point that the venue is shared between the professionals and the students is an important one. In this way, a connection is formed between the main Hallé symphony orchestra and the ‘umbrella’ orchestra and choirs. For students, the weekly rehearsal routine is enhanced with a certain glamour when the venue is shared with the professionals.

In summary, the Hallé is exploring many avenues in which to support music education and create meaningful links with the Manchester community. Having survived their financial crisis in the late 1990s thanks to a generous increase in public subsidy, they have re-grouped with a renewed focus on maintaining elite standards musically and significantly strengthening their connections with the community. While the orchestra still has financial concerns it has certainly stabilised, and looks likely to continue to be an important contributor to the community in the years to come.

---

400 Benn.
11.3 BBC Music and Learning: ‘Ten Pieces’

While the BBC Orchestras each individually deliver strong education and community engagement programmes, it is the BBC Music and Learning flagship programme, ‘Ten Pieces’, that is gaining most attention at present. Launched in June 2014, the BBC ‘Ten Pieces’ Project is a national campaign intended to raise the profile of classical music and encourage students to engage in creative responses to music. The mission statement for the project summarises this aim:

Ten Pieces aims to open up the world of classical music to children – and inspire them to develop their own creative responses to the pieces through music, dance or digital art.  

The first project was targeted towards Primary school aged students, with a second stage (2015-2016) focusing on Secondary age students. The starting point for each project is a selection of ten orchestral pieces covering a wide historical span. For the 2014 project, the works chosen were: Short Ride in a Fast Machine (John Adams), Symphony No 5 (Beethoven), ‘Storm’ from ‘Peter Grimes’ (Britten), ‘Mars’ from ‘The Planets’ (Holst), Zadok the Priest (Handel), In the Hall of the Mountain King (Grieg), Connect It (Anna Meredith), Horn Concerto No 4 (Mozart), A Night on the Bare Mountain (Mussorgsky), and The Firebird (Stravinsky).

The work by Anna Meredith, ‘Connect It’, was commissioned for the project and includes body percussion, enabling an easy participatory entry point to the work for students without instrumental training. Seven of the other works chosen have clear extra-musical themes, again clearly chosen to easily enable children an access point to

---

401 [http://www.bbc.co.uk/programmes/articles/5clQVzSPv8nPjyVQNdCW0rq/the-ten-pieces-champions](http://www.bbc.co.uk/programmes/articles/5clQVzSPv8nPjyVQNdCW0rq/the-ten-pieces-champions), accessed 20 June 2015.
engage with the piece imaginatively. The choice of repertoire for such a high profile music education campaign was always going to attract scrutiny and no small degree of criticism. For instance Judith Ackrill, Director of LSO Discovery, remarks: ‘I think it is a big spend but not terribly exciting myself and I’m not very happy about the repertoire choices.’ Fiona Harvey, from the ABO, comments: ‘I’m glad that nobody has yet said they are the ten best pieces.’ Harvey also comments that the BBC is not breaking new ground with the concept: ‘It’s giving profile to what a lot of our orchestras have been doing for a long time, which is being creative through music.’

On the whole however there is strong support for the project across the UK. 150 organisations including Music Hubs, orchestras, conservatoires and other specialists in the music, dance and arts have become ‘Ten Pieces Champions.’ In some cases this role entails performing some of the Ten Pieces in concerts, while other organisations are offering workshops to assist students with the skills required to make their creative responses. The creative response element is central to the project, and the website has a wealth of extra resources available for students and teachers, including teacher’s notes and specialist videos to support students in their creative skills. In particular the project is looking for original creative responses from the students in three key art forms: composition, dance and art/digital art, and students and schools have been encouraged to upload their completed projects to the BBC for potential inclusion in the Ten Pieces Proms concerts.

The pieces were recorded by the BBC National Orchestra of Wales with an accompanying movie making full use of the BBC’s strength in film and digital

402 Ackrill. Interview by author, 2015
403 Harvey. Interview by author, 2015
404 ibid.
technology. In October 2014 this was released in a week of free nationwide screenings for schools, and has subsequently been issued on DVD. Simon Lord, currently the Director of Artistic Planning at the Adelaide Symphony Orchestra, previously served as Music Producer for BBC Scottish Symphony Orchestra. Lord comments that the digital resources of the BBC have long had a potential use for orchestral education programming:

"BBC Learning has a whole raft of activities of which the orchestras are one tiny part. One of the good things about the BBC is that its presence on the web is so strong, with all those resources of recordings and visuals, all the rights that you would have, all the in house technology and in house expertise to build creative projects is all there. So in some ways it was a resource that already existed and all it needed was someone to come and take it out of the cupboard, put it on the table and make it grow.\(^\text{406}\)

The BBC 10 Pieces project has caused some orchestras to reassess how they should focus their own digital resources. For instance, at the LSO Ackrill states:

"The BBC has the capacity to promote this kind of work very easily and we are all looking at that and thinking how do we sit with that, or how to be different from that.\(^\text{407}\)

Fiona Harvey is encouraged by the way in which the pilot programme has anecdotally encouraged children to start learning instruments, and more evidence of this will be made available following official evaluation. Another strength of the programme is that there are many free arrangements of repertoire available on the website to suit different abilities. This is an invaluable resource for schools and community music


\(^{407}\) Ackrill.
organisations, saving them from the logistical challenges of making such arrangements themselves.  

Aiming to be a truly national programme, participation is well spread across the entire UK, including schools in Northern Ireland, Wales and even remote islands in the Outer Hebrides. One of the obvious benefits of a project with a strong digital and online element is that its reach can be easily spread into remote geographical locations. With official evaluation of the programme yet to be published, it remains to be seen what the longevity and full impact of the programme will be. It has certainly achieved its first aim however, which was to raise the profile of orchestral music.

http://www.bbc.co.uk/programmes/articles/3xWSYQhHiM9dZYfmRmTwVqN/key-stage-2-music-resources, accessed 2 July 2015.
11.4 The London Philharmonic Orchestra

The London Philharmonic Orchestra (LPO) was founded in 1932 by Sir Thomas Beecham and is the Resident Orchestra of London’s Royal Festival Theatre in the Southbank Centre. The LPO has also been the Resident Orchestra for the Glyndebourne Festival Opera since 1964, and has residencies in Brighton and Eastbourne. The LPO focuses its Education and Community Programmes towards four London boroughs: Greenwich, Lambeth, Lewisham and Southwark. In conversation with the author the Chief Executive and Artistic Director of the LPO, Timothy Walker, commented on the aims and activities of the LPO education department:

The LPO has been doing an education programme for around 25 years. I think it’s very important for a number of reasons. One is obviously it helps young people to understand what orchestras actually do, so helps to build your audience for the future. Another is that it supplements or in some instances replaces formal music education that has disappeared from the schools. I think also it is useful in its own right within a broad curricula in order to help students perform better in their other subjects and it is useful for our players to have the experience of going into those environments and imparting knowledge to others. The programmes that we offer are quite varied so we do also work in special needs schools and clearly there quite a lot of training involved to enable our players to do be able to do that.

In the 2014-15 season, the LPO’s Education Department offers a number of programmes that aim to address the points listed above by Walker. Walker particularly highlights the importance of connecting with school students and supporting school music education. The LPO offers a school concert series, known as ‘BrightSparks’, which was attended by 16,000 students in 2014. The BrightSparks series is tailored to

409 A ‘borough’ approximately equates to an Australian suburb, and is used in the United Kingdom to denote an administrative division.
Key Stages 1-5 and is in line with the National Curriculum. The concerts are supported with teacher resources and A-level resources available upon request. In addition to the School concert series, the LPO offers a number of programmes that connect more personally with students. In 2014 the LPO offered classroom workshops, attended by a further 4,000 pupils and teachers. The ‘Creative Classrooms’ programme, aimed at Key Stage Two, is offered to four primary schools annually, one from each borough. This programme aims to strengthen music teaching in schools and hopes to create a lasting musical legacy. It culminates in a group composition project based on orchestral repertoire, led by the classroom teachers and supported by LPO musicians.

Australian-born Timothy Walker’s previous career has included orchestral management posts in both Australia and the UK. With the insight gained from a high profile career that spans both continents, Walker’s views are of particular value for the purposes of this study. In 2010 Walker stated that: ‘British orchestras lead the world in their education and community programmes – particularly in the creative music making participatory experiences they offer to children and adults alike.’

The LPO was an early advocate for a participatory approach to orchestral education programming, introducing opportunities for children to perform alongside the orchestra as early as 1980. In the 1980s the LPO was also one of the first in the UK to work with leading animateur Richard McNicol, who had been a member of the LPO flute section, in programmes that combined creative collaborative workshops and participatory concerts.

---

The LPO has continued to develop a creative, participative element to its education programming; aspects that are particularly evident at present in the ‘Animate Orchestra’ and ‘LPO Soundworks’ programmes. These are both creative based instrumental ensembles, which involve collaborative composition in addition to performance skills. Both ensembles are open to students resident in the LPO’s four focus boroughs, with students welcomed from all instrumental backgrounds. The Animate Orchestra was launched in 2010 in partnership with the Trinity Laban Conservatoire of Music and Dance and in association with several local Music Services. Open to students in school years five to ten who play any instrument (including non orchestral instruments), the group has a strong focus on collaborative composition.

The new programme ‘LPO Soundworks’, also focused on collaborative composition, is for students aged fourteen-nineteen. In 2015 LPO Soundworks is collaborating with the nearby Shakespeare’s Globe Theatre. LPO Soundworks students will contribute new music to a production of ‘Much Ado About Nothing’ by the Globe Education’s Southwark Youth Theatre.\(^\text{413}\) The unique location of the Globe Theatre, a re-creation of an Elizabethan theatre and one of London’s top tourist attractions, is sure to inspire the students.

In 2015 a family concert day at the Royal Festival Theatre will mark a further LPO collaboration with the Globe Theatre Education. Part of the ‘FUNharmonics’ series, the main-stage performance is themed around ‘A Midsummer Night’s Dream.’ This performance is supplemented by free pre- and post-concert activities, including sessions to try out instruments and extra post-concert performances. Two other family

\(^{413}\) [http://www.lpo.org.uk/education/soundworks-next-project.html](http://www.lpo.org.uk/education/soundworks-next-project.html), accessed 9 August 2015.
concerts are offered in the current season, featuring a Pirates theme and Roald Dahl theme respectively.

In addition to the above programmes aimed at school students and families, the LPO also offers training programmes aimed at emerging professionals: ‘Foyle’s Future Firsts,’ and ‘Future Composers.’ ‘Foyle’s Future Firsts’ is a training scheme for postgraduate orchestral students, offered to around sixteen students per year. Students admitted to this programme rehearse with the LPO and perform alongside them, are given lessons and mentoring by LPO players and are given audition preparation skills throughout the year culminating in a mock audition for LPO principals. While programmes such as Foyle’s Future Firsts allow young musicians to form close relationships with professional players, the ability to execute a successful audition is still crucial in a young musician’s career.

Prior to the Foyle’s Future Firsts programme, the LPO had instead offered support to young orchestral musicians through the LPO Youth Orchestra. Upon arriving at the LPO, Walker noticed that the string playing in the Youth Orchestra was lower in standard than the wind and brass, and came to the conclusion that this was because the best players were already committed to the symphony orchestras associated with their training institutions. Therefore Walker decided that the youth orchestra was not the best way that the LPO could support future orchestral musicians and he consulted representatives from UK conservatoires as to how the LPO could best assist students. Walker explains:

In meetings with the conservatoires it became clear that what was required was a post-graduate course or mentoring system that would help musicians get into orchestral positions. \(^{414}\)

---

\(^{414}\) Walker, interview by author.
This is a reminder that partnerships require an assessment of the strength of all the respective partners in order to avoid duplication and maximise benefit for the recipients.

Alongside this training scheme for instrumentalists is another for composers: the Future Composers programme. Four students per year are admitted to this programme, and are mentored by the LPO’s Composer in Residence (in the 2014-15 season this is Magnus Lindberg). The students each develop a new orchestral composition throughout the year, with input from LPO musicians and the Composer in Residence, culminating in a Queen Elizabeth Hall performance. Programmes such as this provide both invaluable insight into the practicalities of composing for orchestra and a platform from which emerging composers can come to attention. They are certainly a necessary aspect to orchestral education programming if the art of orchestral composition is to flourish.

A common concern of all orchestras is to devise ways in which they can attract a more youthful demographic to their performances. Like many arts organisations, the LPO has a programme which offers reduced price ticketing to this age-group: the Heineken NOISE programme, which currently has 9,000 members. The LPO has put thought into the optimal ways in which this Programme can link with students as they transition from school to the next stage of their lives. One way in which the LPO aims to maintain the contact through this period is to actively target university students at the University Fresher Fairs and aim to involve them in the LPO’s NOISE programme, which is for the under 26 age group.

416 Walker, interview.
While this is a very sensible move to maintain contact with students as they transition to University life (and the link with Heineken is sure to be appreciated by university students) Walker acknowledges that this does not help to maintain contact with students who do not go on to University. To achieve this it is important for all students to be invited to join the NOISE programme (or equivalent programmes from other arts organisations) before they leave school. As people, especially those under 30, increasingly communicate through social networks it is important for orchestras to have links with Facebook, Twitter, Instagram, etc. While orchestras often have a staff member responsible for developing a profile on social media platforms, it is also advisable to have a system whereby the students themselves disseminate information. To achieve this, orchestras could approach the student councils of local Universities and Tafes, and ideally have key events publicised directly from students’ own social media accounts. The Royal Scottish National Orchestra has been particularly proactive in this respect through its ‘Student Ambassador’ scheme, in which students are encouraged to contribute to the future strategic planning for the orchestra. The students receive free concert tickets in return for supporting and promoting RSNO activities.417

In addition to the programmes detailed above, the LPO has also formed a partnership with the London Music Masters [LMM] organisation, which was founded in 2007. This particular partnership is strengthened by Walker’s role as a Board member for both organisations. The LMM runs two main projects, which aim to support violinists at very different levels of development. The first of these is ‘The Bridge Project’, influenced by the El Sistema movement in that it offers group violin teaching to primary students in selected inner city London schools in ‘diverse and socio-

In this programme, the LMM’s work shares similarities with that of the UK In Harmony Programmes, and students from the Bridge and In Harmony projects have in fact played alongside each other. At this stage the Bridge Project is showing stronger musical results than those achieved by In Harmony students, a point noted by Patrick Bailey, past Education Manager for the LPO:

The Bridge Project is brilliant. I think they are doing better work than In Harmony, simply because they are getting better violin players at the end of it, and the schools seem better affected by it than the In Harmony schools in Lambeth. But it’s costing them a lot of money to work with two or three schools and while I think that their long-term plans are really sound and good, they are a long way away from fulfilling them.

While assessment of the relative achievements of the Bridge Project and In Harmony projects needs to assess the social goals as well as musical ones of both organisations, the Bridge Project is certainly worthy of international attention. Much of its success can be credited to Itzhak Rashkovsky, Artistic Director and Founder. Rashkovsky is a Professor of Violin at the Royal College of Music and was responsible for setting in place the detailed curriculum plan for each stage of the Bridge Project. Under his guidance and curriculum support the students are achieving remarkable results, with many students reported to have achieved a Distinction pass in ABRSM Grades 3 to 5 while still in Primary school. This is a high level for any young violinist to attain, but it is particularly remarkable for students learning in group lessons. Rashkovsky himself offers tutoring for exceptional students identified through the programme, and many of

---

these are now in the RCM Junior Department and the National Children’s Orchestra of Great Britain.

The second area of LMM’s work is the LMM Award Programme, a scholarship awarded every three years that aims to support potential solo violinists. The link between the LMM Award and Bridge Project is another possible key to the Bridge Project success, as the award winners act as role models for the young beginners, offering them support and inspiration. The LPO works with both streams of the LMM: it offers solo performance opportunities to LMM Award winners, and Bridge Project students have also performed side-by-side with LPO musicians.

Walker describes why he felt the LPO should support the Bridge Project:

It meets one of our objectives: we were particularly keen to find students from different ethnic backgrounds who have the talent to go to conservatoires and then into orchestras so that we can make the orchestra better reflect the ethnic mix of the UK.421

The point made here by Walker about the need for orchestras to reflect a wider section of society is an issue that has been increasingly explored over the past decades by music educators and arts administrators. The lack of diversity in symphony orchestras, and indeed the classical music world in general, has been a focus of attention and research for some time. In February 2015 the King’s College London, funded by the Economic and Social Research Council, published a key paper on this topic. The paper, entitled Equality and Diversity in the Classical Music Profession, observed that there are a number of significant inequalities in the British classical music industry, including the under-representation of women and people from black and minority

421 Walker, interview by author.
ethnic and working class backgrounds.\textsuperscript{422} It is a positive step that leaders such as Walker are aware of this issue, and hopefully as more initiatives are put in to place to attract and support interest in classical music in diverse communities, the balance shall become more equitable.

\section*{Summary}

While it is not possible to cover the education activities of every symphony orchestra in the United Kingdom in this study, it should be noted that orchestral education programming is innovative and well-developed across the entire sector nationwide. UK orchestras are noted for their participatory approach to education programming, and many are now establishing close partnerships with Music Services and other education bodies as a result of the Music Hub model. Orchestras are increasingly incorporating Youth Orchestras and Choirs into their overall organisation. For example, the Hallé Orchestra, City of Birmingham Symphony Orchestra and Royal Liverpool Philharmonic Orchestra each have associated youth orchestras, community choirs and youth choirs; while the London Symphony Orchestra and Royal Scottish National Orchestra each have associated youth and adult choirs.

These formalised links between symphony orchestras, youth orchestras and choirs allow for the establishment of significant and ongoing relationships. They also enable the symphony orchestra to contribute their resources towards raising the standard and depth of music making in the community. Having official partnerships such as these allows for easier facilitation of ‘side-by-side’ events where members of

\textsuperscript{422} Christina Scharff. \textit{Equality and Diversity in the Classical Music Profession}. King’s College London, Economic and Social Research Council, February 2015.
the community choirs, youth choirs and youth orchestras perform alongside the orchestra.

Further details regarding the activities of each orchestra can be found on the website of the Association of British Orchestras. The 2013 ABO publication, *The State of Britain’s Orchestras*, reveals the breadth of orchestral education activities across Britain. For example, a survey conducted in the 2012-13 season found that Britain’s orchestras engaged in more than 10,000 education activities, which were accessed by 660,000 audience members and participants.\(^{423}\) An earlier Mapping Survey conducted in 2005 by Fiona Harvey, *Education Programmes of ABO Orchestras and Organisations*, illustrates the strength across the industry established a decade ago.\(^{424}\)

Having examined examples of best practice in education programming by orchestras in the United Kingdom, the following Chapter details the education and community engagement activities of Australia’s six state symphony orchestras. Particular attention is paid to the unique aspects of each orchestra’s approach and any new directions currently being explored.

---

\(^{423}\) *The State of Britain’s Orchestras*. Commissioned by the Association of British Orchestras, 2013.

\(^{424}\) Fiona Harvey. *Education Programmes of ABO Orchestras and Organisations*. Commissioned by the Association of British Orchestras, August 2005
Chapter Twelve: Current Australian Case Studies

12.1 Sydney Symphony Orchestra

The Sydney Symphony Orchestra (SSO) has developed a high profile, both nationally and internationally, thanks in part to the undeniable glamour of its home venue, the Sydney Opera House. With an annual budget of $39,343,654, the Sydney Symphony serves the state of New South Wales (population 7,565,500) through a main concert series in Sydney, regional touring, digital and online resources and the activities of its Education Department. The Sydney Symphony Education Department has two central focus points: support for school music education, and the provision of training for emerging orchestral musicians. The SSO’s activity in these two areas over the past twenty years has made a significant impact upon music education in New South Wales and the transition to the profession for tertiary music graduates.

The following chapter looks in detail at the programmes and resources of the current SSO Education Department, beginning with the flagship Sinfonia and Fellowship training programmes.

Sydney Sinfonia is the legacy of a major growth period for the Sydney Symphony Orchestra’s education department during the decades that it was managed by Richard Gill (appointed Artistic Director of Education in 1992) and Margaret Moore (Education Manager from 1996). Together Gill and Moore instigated the ground-breaking initiative of Sydney Sinfonia in 1997, a training orchestra for aspiring professional orchestral players on the cusp of their careers. The training offered by Sydney Sinfonia was then augmented by the Fellowship programme in 2001, intended

---

as an even more intensive training and mentorship arrangement for elite music graduates, with five players selected in its first year. Both the Sinfonia and Fellowship have been highly successful, with participants subsequently gaining permanent positions with both Australian orchestras and elite international orchestras, including the Concertgebouw and the Berlin Philharmonic. Originally focused towards Sydney tertiary music students, the Sinfonia programme has steadily grown and the audition process is currently nationwide, with 62 participants accepted in 2015 from 400 applicants.\textsuperscript{427}

For nearly twenty years Sinfonia has been one of the most significant initiatives in the Australian music education landscape. It is worthwhile therefore at this point to take a closer look at its conception and development. In his memoirs, filled with his trademark candour, Gill recounts the interesting, and surprisingly pragmatic, story behind the creation of Sinfonia. In 1996, the year the programme began, he had been the Artistic Director of SSO’s Education Program for four years, a period of time in which he was aiming to further raise Sydney Symphony’s standards of performance in education concerts. This aim, states Gill, did not fit with the goal of the chief conductor at the time, Edo de Waart, who was intent on pushing forward with major concert series, touring and recording initiatives. In the words of Gill:

\textit{…the orchestra’s chief conductor, Edo de Waart, decided that from 1996 onwards, the full orchestra would no longer be available for schools concerts, due to recording and touring commitments. We needed to find a solution quickly.\textsuperscript{428}}

This difficult situation was also recalled by Margaret Moore:

\textsuperscript{427} Kim Waldock, personal communication with the author.  
\textsuperscript{428} Gill. \textit{Give me Excess of It}, op.cit. p.322
At the time the orchestra was in a bit of a dark place where they felt that they maybe weren’t going to be able to fulfil their education commitment with the mainstage orchestra.\textsuperscript{429}

Gill, keen to maintain the education concert activities of SSO, developed the concept of Sydney Sinfonia – an ensemble combining advanced students from the Sydney Conservatorium of Music with mentors from the Sydney Symphony. The new model was an immediate success, as Gill observes:

\begin{quote}
\ldots the ensemble has become a tried and tested nexus between studentship and the profession, succeeding largely because of the gradual development of the orchestral members’ interest in continuing the program.\textsuperscript{430}
\end{quote}

Margaret Moore observes that the programme benefitted both the student participants and the SSO:

\begin{quote}
People who were auditioning for the main-stage orchestra had come up through Sinfonia and understood a lot of the practices of the orchestra. All that had been gone through. So when they joined the orchestra for main-stage performances they were a more reliable player in terms of the culture and the context in which they were working. All those things like how far behind the beat to play and who turns the page and when... all those things are kind of secret things, and they really do differ from orchestra to orchestra, so it is amazing how it just had this really important effect on the musicians of the orchestra.\textsuperscript{431}
\end{quote}

This is a very important point, and a major benefit for orchestras that have established training programmes such as Sinfonia. Each orchestra has its own unwritten traditions, subtle points which, combined, create the sound and character unique to that orchestra. By working with emerging musicians at the beginning of their career,

\textsuperscript{429} Margaret Moore. Interview with the author, 12 July 2012
\textsuperscript{430} Gill. \textit{Give me Excess Of It}, op.cit., p.323
\textsuperscript{431} M. Moore, interview.
orchestras are able to ‘initiate’ them into these customs, thereby strengthening the overall cohesion of the orchestra and ensuring that, if these players become full time members at a later point, the transition will be a smooth one.

Gill has also commented on Sinfonia’s impact on the SSO:

We [the SSO] treat education now not just as concerts for children. With the Sinfonia concerts, the students who play in Sinfonia are also being educated and the players are learning how to be mentors, so the education works three ways. That’s been a big change. The players are active participants, they are not passive givers.432

Gill is frustrated that other state symphony orchestras have not introduced similar training programmes. He states:

Sinfonia is a massive development, and I simply do not understand why the model is not copied all over the country. People are travelling from all over to come to Sinfonia.433

At the time of writing, Sydney Symphony is still leading the field in in terms of training opportunities for emerging orchestral musicians. The only comparable scheme is the Australian Chamber Orchestra’s Emerging Artists’ Program (EAP), offered each year to a small number of elite emerging string players, aged between 18 and 27.434 In a similar concept to SSO’s Sinfonia programme, past and present EAP members are placed in a training ensemble, known as ACO2, which since 2007 has delivered the ACO’s regional tour and education programmes. Four previous EAP members have now been appointed to the ACO.

432 Gill, interview by author.
433 ibid.
In conversation with the author in March 2015, Kim Waldock (Director of Learning and Engagement at SSO) explained that the SSO intends to adapt the Sinfonia/Fellowship programmes in 2016. The Sinfonia model will be scaled back, and the Fellowship programme augmented. According to Waldock, this decision was made principally owing to a lack of co-ordination between the Sydney Symphony and the management of the tertiary institutions at which the majority of Sinfonia students were studying, which resulted in a clash of commitments for the students. According to Waldock:

Sinfonia is phasing out because the Sydney Conservatorium of Music and Australian Institute of Music (AIM) are failing their students for participating in it. If they miss University to do orchestral training they fail. It’s ridiculous and it is just not working. It’s putting the students under extraordinary pressure.

While it is concerning if performance major tertiary music students gaining a place in such a prestigious professional training scheme are not supported by their faculty, this insight certainly explains the decision by SSO to re-examine the structure of their training programmes. It would perhaps have been to the benefit of the students for the growth of the Sinfonia model to be planned in partnership with the Sydney Conservatorium of Music and AIM, and ideally incorporated into the degree structure.

Waldock explains why the decision has been made to focus now on expanding the Fellowship arm of their training opportunities:

Sinfonia is great orchestral training but only for the weeks of the year that they are with us, whereas with Fellowship they are with us all year, so we decided to stick with that. There are other opportunities for undergrad

---

435 At the time of submission Waldock has taken a new role as Director of Education at The Royal Opera House, Covent Garden, London.
436 Waldock, interview.
students, so we decided to put our time and resources and energy into expanding the Fellowship and really getting that next level up. Twenty years ago we were leading the field when we started Sinfonia, that was the only opportunity. We’ve re-calibrated and we’re moving forward in this way.\textsuperscript{437}

While the Fellowship scheme was initially only offered to string players, it will now be augmented; the intention is that in 2016 eighteen places will be offered, so that there will be one for each instrument.\textsuperscript{438} The year long Fellowship programme offers young graduates invaluable experience as casual musicians with the Sydney Symphony, in addition to extra training in the form of mock auditions, repertoire reading, excerpt preparation and master-classes with visiting soloists. A generous scholarship of $30,000 AUD is awarded to all Fellowship members. This includes payment for 40 casual calls with the SSO, as well as calls with Education programmes; any extra calls throughout the year are paid at the SSO’s casual rate. The Director of the Fellowship programme is Roger Benedict, the British-born Principal Violist for the Sydney Symphony. Benedict aims to help the students to make connections with the community. This is achieved through both chamber music concerts and, more recently, workshops in prisons and correctional services. Benedict remarks:

I always wanted the musicians in our training academy, the fellowship program, to play to the widest possible audience. Not just to play to audiences at the Concert Hall in the Sydney Opera House, but go into the community, play to school children, play to old people, play to inmates in a prison like this because it’s such a fantastic experience for them. It takes them out of their comfort zone. And I think as a training alone, it’s just a really wonderful way to become a more expressive and more communicative musician.\textsuperscript{439}

\textsuperscript{437} ibid.
\textsuperscript{438} ibid.
\textsuperscript{439} Roger Benedict, quoted from the 7.30 Report, retrieved from: http://www.abc.net.au/7.30/content/2015/s4228062.htm, accessed 1 July 2015.
The payment to participants is a crucial element of the SSO’s training programmes. The Fellowship stipend of $30,000 AUD enables the students to support themselves upon leaving university without needing to take on casual work, which would inevitably detract from their efforts in securing a full-time orchestral position. Students playing in Sinfonia were also paid, although the mentoring was considered a part of this payment. Moore comments:

We wanted them to be able to immerse themselves and focus on what they were doing for the year. Luckily we were able to get some private donors and corporate sponsorship for both of those programmes so that went a long way to making them cost neutral. Nothing succeeds like success, so once you get two or three people sponsoring a Fellow then there is more hope of getting others interested because they can see that it’s worthwhile, and you can see a direct benefit for what you are doing with your money.440

The cost of a similar programme has to be a factor seriously considered by any other organisation contemplating such a scheme, however Moore rightly points out that donors appreciate being able to perceive a direct benefit from their generosity. By demonstrating the immense value of the Sinfonia and Fellowship programmes in enabling the next generation of young orchestral players to reach the highest levels possible, the SSO was able to build up a sizeable quota of sponsorship for the programmes. There is good reason to believe that this generosity would be repeated if other state orchestras were to look to building up a similar training programme. While it is troubling that the Sinfonia model, which began with such enthusiasm and has benefitted so many young emerging orchestral players, could not continue to build on its strengths, it is to be hoped that the expanded Fellowship programme will continue this important role for the SSO. In the coming years, however, the other state orchestras

440 M. Moore, interview.
may be required to make a larger contribution in this area. As mentioned earlier, the intake to Sinfonia has represented students from several states of Australia. If this opportunity is not available to them due to cuts to Sinfonia then it is conceivable that the overall standard of professional orchestral playing may drop. It is this gap in training that may need to be addressed by Australia’s orchestras.

Linked to the scale back of Sinfonia there will be another key change in 2016 when the Discovery Series of lecture concerts for adult audiences is discontinued. This would appear to be a direct result of Richard Gill’s departure from the orchestra: Gill resigned as Artistic Director of the Education Department at the end of 2014, although he is still presenting the Discovery Concerts in 2015. The Discovery Concert format (initially named Adult Themes until Moore realised the risque connotation meant that the name was problematical for internet bookings)\(^\text{441}\) is similar in style to the ‘Keys to Music’ series, delivered by Graham Abbott.

Abbott is an Australian conductor and ABC radio broadcaster with a background in school music education. In 2003 Abbott began the ‘Keys to Music’ series, which are lecture concerts that combine live symphony performances with an exploration of the composer’s background, life and musical techniques.\(^\text{442}\) Leonard Bernstein’s ‘Young People’s Concerts’ series can be seen as a precursor to both Abbott’s ‘Keys to Music’ and Gill’s ‘Discovery’ concerts. The strength of such a programme relies primarily on the charisma and communication skills of the presenter, key strengths of Gill, Abbott and, of course, Bernstein. Margaret Moore speaks of the rationale behind the Discovery Programme:

\(^{441}\) ibid.
\(^{442}\) http://www.abc.net.au/classic/program/keystomusic/presenter/, accessed 8 August 2015.
If you understand something then you engage with it on a totally different level. Richard will play the piece of music and then unpick it and then play it again, and when you hear it a second time it is totally different experience.\textsuperscript{443}

There will always be a role for a lecture concert format within an orchestra’s education programming, and it is to be hoped that the SSO, and the other state orchestras, will continue offer this model in the future.

This transition period at the SSO sees significant areas of growth for education programming as well as the changes discussed above. One of these is the SSO’s support and mentorship of school-teachers, both primary and secondary. The SSO has traditionally had strong links with school music education, with repertoire for its ‘Meet the Music’ and schools concerts carefully tailored to fit with the NSW curriculum. In recent years however the links between the SSO and the curriculum have strengthened further, owing in large part to the appointment of Kim Waldock as Director of Learning and Engagement. Waldock began her career as a school music teacher and therefore has direct experience of the challenges and rewards associated with working to engage students with music in the classroom. In addition to offering several workshops supporting teachers in preparing their students for SSO education concerts, Waldock has also developed a flagship training programme for general primary teachers, known as TunED Up.

The key aim for the ‘TunED Up’ programme is to help teachers gain confidence in the central musical skills and concepts of the Australian Curriculum. It is a five-day residential programme for general primary school teachers wanting to improve their musical knowledge and skills. It is held in Sydney, for teachers from New South Wales,\textsuperscript{443}

\textsuperscript{443} Moore, interview.
with a generous number of scholarships on offer: twenty in 2014 and fifty in 2015. Participants are guided through singing, percussion, composition and listening exercises. They are also provided with access to SSO’s online resources, lesson plans and recordings, alongside training in how to present these to their students.

The programme’s content is focused on the skills and knowledge required by the new Curriculum in the Arts. It is part of the blueprint for this programme that participants will network with their fellow participants as well as other teaching contacts in order to share ideas and skills and pass on the training. Waldock explains the impetus behind the creation of this new education model:

Essentially we started the TunED Up programme because there’s a need for further up-skilling for generalist teachers in delivering music. Because the Curriculum is now more rigorous for music we’ve started offering a forty hour course, which is essentially three times what they would have received as their music training when training to be primary teachers. I think there is a need for more resources. What we are trying to do is to train teachers in key areas so that they can then in-service their colleagues. It only works if they work as a good networking unit so we have some closed Facebook groups where they are able to swap ideas and talk things through. Under the National Curriculum they need to do Listening, Composing, Performing and Movement and learn some notation.

With the second year attracting more than double the number of participants of the pilot programme, TunED Up is clearly a programme that is needed in NSW and looks set to become a long-term element of the SSO’s education department.

The depth of educational expertise that underpins the SSO’s professional development programmes for teachers was recognised in 2010 when it was awarded accreditation by the New South Wales Institute of Teaching. Having official accreditation lends the programme an extra level of gravitas, and will also hopefully

444 Waldock, interview.
445 ibid.
make it easier for music teachers to explain to their Principals or Head Teachers the value of their participation in SSO’s education programme.

The SSO annually offers a series of education concerts, tailored for Kindergarten and Primary aged students (Stage 1-3) and Secondary Students (Stage 4). Stages 1 to 3 concerts are held at the ABC Centre, Ultimo, in 2015 and Stage 4 in the beautiful new concert hall Angel Place in the centre of Sydney. The Primary concerts are themed, in 2015 using the themes of ‘Kings and Peasants’ and ‘Music Inspired by Art’. Based on these themes, students are offered some compositional participatory activities, by writing a fanfare for the ‘Kings and Peasants’ concert and a piece of music inspired by an Australian painting for the ‘Music Inspired by Art’ concerts. While the education concerts offered by the SSO are not ground-breaking, they are planned and operated with an unusual level of care and thought. Here Waldock gives some insight into the amount of planning that goes into the presentation of a typical SSO education concert:

When Nicholas Carter [former Assistant Conductor at the SSO] started off we would have spent forty hours preparing for his very first concert. It has basic principles – little children have to change activity every ten minutes or you will lose them. That’s just all the teaching experience I have which makes it really easy, once you know. For the Primary concerts there is always body percussion and there will always be some kind of movement, or dance. It might be to show structure or to show some interpretation of the ostinato rhythm in the song. There’ll always be echo clapping, there’ll always be ‘answer this question.’ There might be conducting for everyone and a couple get to come out.

Moore, Gill and Waldock are all unified in the importance they place on the role of the presenter, and on keeping audience sizes small enough that the children can feel personally engaged and connected with the onstage activity. Moore states:

---

447 Waldock, interview, 2012
You can’t just play music to children without any kind of person to explain it or engage them with it. It’s really important that the audiences are not huge because if you are playing to a sea of 1,500 faces it is very hard to make the child at the back feel just as engaged as the child at the front and the child at the back has just as much right to be involved and engaged in the music. One of the things that we fought for and is still is very much a part of the SSO programme is that you play to smaller audiences within the education programme, because then you can actually have direct contact and if a child asks a question there’s a hope that you’ll see them and be able to answer them.  

The point about the size of the concert hall was also made by Gill, who here tells of the change in style that was possible when education concerts were shifted to the more intimate Eugene Goossens Hall in Ultimo:

My idea was that the concerts should be played in a smaller venue, where every child had a clear view of the orchestra, and the presenter or conductor had the opportunity to communicate with every child. The Eugene Goossens Hall at the ABC Studios in Ultimo proved to be the perfect venue. I agreed to conduct the concerts there and their nature changed, in my view, for the better.

While Moore, Gill and Waldock believe that a smaller, more intimate hall allows them to keep the children better engaged with the concert experience and thereby gain more real benefit from it, it is not a viewpoint that always matches well with the need to provide feedback to funding bodies. Often orchestral websites will proudly declare that their education programmes have reached tens of thousands of students over the course of the year, and naturally these large figures are more easily attained by presenting concerts in large venues. This point needs to be addressed in order to ensure that the children are gaining real benefit from their concert experiences.

448 M. Moore, interview.
449 Richard Gill, Give Me Excess of It, op.cit., p.322
The SSO education concerts are supported by extremely well researched resource packs provided to the teachers involved, including detailed lesson plans. This initiative began in the late 1980s, following the appointment of the first full time Education Officer to the SSO.\textsuperscript{450} At present Waldock is involved in the planning and delivery of these resource packs, and she takes every step to ensure that they are directly relevant to the Curriculum. Waldock explains:

In the teaching notes on each work we list the sort of concepts that each work shows and list the things that the student will learn if they do the activities. All the people that I get to write are HSC teachers and examiners.\textsuperscript{451}

Lesson plans are posted on line with a detailed scope and clear objectives. Waldock is aiming to make them accessible by generalist teachers as well as useful to music specialist teachers. Waldock tells of the balance she is trying to strike in this respect:

We’re going to keep writing digital resources that are easy to use with very clear pedagogy. They need to be clear because most of the teachers are not music specialists, so we also do workshops with them. The idea is that they can always understand what is required. I think if you know nothing at all about music the lesson plans are a bit daunting, but if we simplify them down too much then they lose what they are trying to do. That’s why we support them with Professional Development.\textsuperscript{452}

While participatory projects are not at present a key focus of the SSO’s education department, there are some models that include a participatory element. The 2015 Parramatta Park concert, in which 250 school children were included in a multi-level performance alongside the SSO, was one such project. The partnership between the SSO education team and the teachers and students involved began well before the

\textsuperscript{451} Waldock, interview. 2012
\textsuperscript{452} Waldock, interview. 2015.
performance date. Waldock arranged the piece for a range of abilities, from an ostinato percussion pattern to simplified versions of the orchestral parts and, in interview with the present author, declared the concert a great success. Past participatory projects for the SSO have been chiefly associated with their regional work, when local students and amateur musicians have been invited to play alongside SSO musicians. It is to be hoped, given the research pointing to the importance of participatory education programming, that the SSO will continue to develop its ventures in this direction. To be involved in an SSO main-stage concert at the Sydney Opera House, for instance, would be an event that would live long in any child’s memory and could easily be the catalyst to ignite a life long study of music.

The Sinfonietta Composition programme, which began in 2007, was another legacy of the Moore/Gill era in the SSO’s education department. In this programme school children with a talent for composition are coached by Gill and the SSO Fellows, who rehearse and perform the students’ works. In 2014, the focus was on the Australian composer Brett Dean, who was premiering his new trumpet concerto, ‘Dramatis Personae’, with the SSO. In interview with the author Gill explained the intentions for this education model:

I feel there should be more emphasis on composition in Australian schools; that is why we run a composition project with the orchestra. Composition is pretty strong in NSW but not in the rest of the country. Teachers are very frightened about teaching it. I’ve always taught composition in schools and one of the principal reasons you teach music is so that the kids can compose. It’s a matter of getting teachers to become confident with teaching composition and that can be really tough. Composition needs constant follow through. It’s not something you can do as a one off, it’s interesting as a one off but you need to do it regularly.  

\[453\] Waldock. Interview by author.  
\[454\] Gill, Interview by author.
The SSO’s Education Department has been a strong supporter of composition for the past twenty-five years, through the Sinfonietta programme but also by programming works, often premieres, by contemporary Australian composers in their main-stage concerts. Margaret Moore shares her views on the importance of supporting contemporary composition:

We’ve had an Australian music composer featured each year since the 1990s. That meant that there would be one of that composer’s works featured in each schools concert and each Meet the Music and the Discovery series. This is to support the NSW curriculum, which has a requirement that you study music written in the last twenty-five years. As a group, they are such an amazing group, our Australian composers. They are so generous and so interested in young people and so willing to engage with them and write something that they hope will have a real impact on them.455

The SSO has also engaged resident composers, including Matthew Hindson, and has commissioned several works for the education programme. For some time SSO worked in partnership with university composition students, but found that the style requirements of writing effective school concert pieces caused difficulties for the students. As Moore observes:

Universities are trying to give the young composers the opportunity to compose in a variety of styles. So it was difficult to say to the composers that we needed their piece to fit with certain parameters around it, and the pieces didn’t end up being as useful as some of the pieces that we’d actually actively commissioned. We commissioned a couple of pieces through Symphony Australia that fulfilled objectives for a range of the state orchestras, which was a really good outcome.456

Margaret Moore tells how the decision to focus on school composition students came from a pragmatic evaluation of the programme with university students:

455 M. Moore, interview.
456 ibid.
Richard [Gill] decided that we’d go right back to young kids because that was where he felt he could be the most help and they didn’t have as many constraints around their composing or their voice. So that is when the Sinfonietta started.\footnote{ibid.}

In the Sinfonietta model, students would use a well-known work as a basis for their own composition, which was then workshopped with SSO musicians and Gill. This direct access to elite level musicians offers invaluable insight to young composers exploring the symphonic sound world for the first time, and helps them to establish how to write for the various instruments. This feedback can really only come from the players themselves, as textbooks may tell you the range for each instrument yet are unlikely to be able to give the same detailed insight into which fingerings may work better. It also gives students the chance to explore questions of balance with the orchestra, something that composition students even at the tertiary level are rarely able to access. It is to be hoped that this training for young composers can be continued into the future, as well as the strong links with established composers that SSO has built up over a period of decades.

Currently, at the time of writing, there is room to explore the existing links between Australian composers and the SSO even further. With personal relationships already established with many of Australia’s best living composers, there is a possibility to further increase their connection with students and the general public through collaborative creative workshops. In this model, explored in detail in Chapter Six, the composer and their methods are demystified and the barriers between composers and their audiences are broken down in a very positive way. This style of project was trialled by the SSO in 2010, focusing on a work by Matthew Hindson \cite{457} (currently Head
of Composition at the Sydney Conservatorium of Music) called ‘Dangerous Creatures.’ The SSO asked students to create their own interpretations of the work, some of which were then played at education concerts. A further development of this programme format would be for the SSO to facilitate workshops to guide the student compositions.

In addition to the above-mentioned programmes, ‘Playerlink’ is another participatory model offered by SSO. Begun in 1994, Playerlink is an annual week of coaching and mentoring to support students in country areas which follows a similar pattern each year. A temporary youth orchestra is formed, and during an intensive week students receive tutorials and ensemble coaching by the SSO players, culminating in a concert. A student’s feedback from the 2014 session gives insight into the importance of such outreach education work from the perspective of the students and its potential to offer inspiration for a future career: ‘It was an amazing opportunity and the sound was incredible. It has just reinforced my career goal to be a musician in a symphony orchestra.’ While this project is clearly providing a valuable step in the training and nurturing of students who have an interest in classical music and who live in regional areas, its impact could be increased significantly if investments were made in digital schemes to allow for participation online in the programme. Ideally, all students in NSW should be able to access points of inspiration provided by the SSO.

In 2012 SSO offered digital workshops for the first time, and in 2015 staged an ambitious participatory performance of Holst’s The Planets (in support of an ‘Earth

---

Hour’ event), which allowed instrumentalists to play along from their homes.\textsuperscript{460} If the SSO explores further developments along these lines it would significantly broaden their accessibility, as further discussed in Part Three of this thesis.

In 2005 the Sydney Symphony started a programme linked with music therapy, partnering with MBF Private Health Fund (now known as Bupa) in their music4health programme.\textsuperscript{461} Since that date, the orchestra has performed at around eight hospitals a year. Additionally, Kirsten Williams, the SSO’s Associate Concertmaster, regularly volunteers to play in the Intensive Care Unit of the Neonatal Ward of the Westmead Children’s Hospital and has also taken part in music therapy at The Golden Stave Music Therapy Centre, University of Western Sydney.\textsuperscript{462}

Incorporating education programmes with international tours is another area of development for orchestras both in Australia and the UK. The Sydney Symphony orchestra is increasingly exploring this link, for example in South Korea during its 2011 tour. More recently SSO entered into a partnership with the Xinghai Conservatory of Music in Guanzhou, China.\textsuperscript{463} There have been strong links between Guangzhou and Sydney since 1986 when they became officially ‘sister cities’.\textsuperscript{464} This arrangement marked the beginning of several cross-cultural projects, including the building of Sydney’s Darling Harbour Chinese Garden of Friendship, commissioned in 1988 by Guangzhou, and the loan of 120 pieces, including ten warriors, from the priceless

\textsuperscript{461} SSO Annual Report 2005, pp.16-17
\textsuperscript{463} Waldock. Interview with the author, 2015.
Terracotta Army to the Art Gallery of NSW from 2 December 2010 to 13 March 2011.465

The link between the SSO and the Xinghai Conservatory of Music was initiated with masterclasses and a rehearsal held at the Conservatory during the SSO’s 2012 China tour. The workshops were led by Waldock and key SSO musicians and the following rehearsal was conducted by Vladimir Ashkenazy. Ashkenazy’s personal involvement made clear the seriousness with which the overture was being made. The partnership between SSO and the XCM was subsequently formalised with a Memorandum of Understanding, signed in July 2012. The press release states: ‘the signing marks the commencement of a three-year partnership aimed at strengthening connections between musicians from each city.’466 Managing Director Rory Jeffes comments that the SSO:

...having reached a new level of maturity in the Australian market, now has the opportunity to align itself strategically with the major political and cultural changes in the world- including the growing focus on classical music in Asia.467

As Australia looks to strengthen its links with Asia in general and China in particular, the arrangement is also in line with our diplomatic and political policies.

As part of the Memorandum, the SSO offers XCM students instrumental tutorials and masterclasses in orchestral techniques and tradition. Expertise in this area is welcomed in China as interest in classical music flourishes. At present Chinese conservatories are producing students who are very strong technically yet do not have the ease with

---

467 ibid.

218
classical symphonic tradition that orchestras in western societies possess. As Waldock comments:

They don’t get that level of orchestral training in China. Every time we go we do some activity in the town that we’ve performed in and we also did that in South Korea. South Korea was the first model four years ago when we worked with University students in South Korea. It is always the same concept, having some SSO players take a sectional and then a rehearsal on serious repertoire; a Tchaikovsky symphony for example.  

Orchestras from other countries, including the United States and the United Kingdom, are also incorporating education programmes with their touring in the Asian region. Australian orchestras however are well situated geographically to make the most of this link.

In summary, it can be seen that certain aspects of the Sydney Symphony Orchestra’s Education Department have made a significant impact upon music education in New South Wales, particularly through their Curriculum support, teaching training and focus upon Australian composers. Their training programmes for tertiary performance students, and experience provided to young composers, have also created a notable legacy and have strengthened musical activity not only in New South Wales but also across Australia. In interview with the author, the Education Manager Kim Waldock commented that the SSO are looking to align their education programming closer to the heart of the organisation. This is a positive aim and one that is emerging as an international focus in the sector, as discussed further in Chapter Nineteen.

---

468 Waldock, interview.
The Melbourne Symphony Orchestra is situated in the city of Melbourne, often regarded as the arts capital of Australia, and serves the state of Victoria, population 5,886,400.\(^{469}\) The Melbourne Symphony Orchestra (MSO) has an annual budget of $30,437,538\(^{470}\) and has established a strong reputation for both its main-stage performances and its connection with the community. The MSO offers a variety of dynamic and engaging programmes through its Education and Community Engagement Department, which spans three main sectors of activity: Schools and Teacher Training, Community Engagement (which includes concerts and activities for Family), and Young Artists Programs.

The following case study shows that the Education programmes of the Melbourne and Sydney Symphonies have taken different paths in recent years, after emerging from similar origins. The previous case study demonstrated that the Sydney Symphony Orchestra has chiefly developed a focus on the dual roles of supporting music education in the school system and the training of developing orchestral instrumental players. The MSO, while still supporting these areas, has also developed several participatory and creative based programs that aim to facilitate engagement with a wide sector of its local community.

The Education and Community Engagement Department has been directed since 2010 by Bronwyn Lobb, assisted by two team members: Lucy Rash and Lucy Bardoel. Lobb’s career has previously included roles at institutions including the Australia Council and the Australian Youth Orchestra. She came to her role at MSO


\(^{470}\) MSO 2014 Annual Report, p.41
direct from a position as Event Manager at London’s Southbank Centre, and has spoken of how her experiences in London have influenced her work at MSO. Lobb comments:

Having come straight from the UK to Melbourne I’d been exposed to how engaged the British orchestras are in their communities. I came with ideas to expand and build on what MSO had already done but certainly was very happy to be taking on a role that had a lot of that established.\footnote{Bronwyn Lobb. Interview by author, 2012.}

Certainly UK orchestras, as detailed in earlier chapters, have been highly proactive in their efforts to engage with their communities during the past three decades. A similar focus on community engagement is developing in Australian orchestral education departments and the Melbourne Symphony Orchestra is at the forefront of this field within Australia. In this case study several of the MSO’s flagship education and community engagement initiatives are examined in detail.

In order to engage with the Melbourne community Lobb has maintained and developed several participatory and creative based programmes that were established prior to her appointment. These include the flagship ‘Pizzicato Effect’ programme; the Jams for Juniors programme; and the MSO Art Play Ensemble. Alongside developing these areas, Lobb has also overseen the creation of several new key education and outreach initiatives, including the MSO’s online education profile (further discussed in Chapter Eighteen).

The MSO ‘Education Week’, introduced in 2011, is another significant development, which consolidates several high profile events into a single week in order to maximise their impact, in the manner of a festival. This concept has several benefits; for example it is easier to publicise the events through a single concentrated marketing effort. It is also easier to co-ordinate with the orchestra’s schedule: by
blocking out the week in long-term planning the MSO can ensure player availability.

The feel of a festival adds a certain excitement to the events, raising the profile of the Education Department within the community. Lobb observes:

   Education Week is very much embedded in the Orchestra’s annual calendar of events. We still run lots of other activities outside the week, but a dedicated week gives us a platform to say “come and experience the MSO in all its glory”. The other thing that has really been key to the week’s success is how we have worked with our Marketing and PR teams to increase our presence in the Education space.\textsuperscript{472}

Lobb comments that each Education Week is well publicised, and that efforts are made to visually celebrate the events with banners inside and out the concert hall. In this way it is possible to maximise the impact of the Week, and to help to create an awareness of the event in a broad sector of society. The 2015 Education Week included seven concerts, all with a participatory element and appealing to a range of age groups. Throughout the week, the Orchestra performed to over 15,000 people: a statistic which reflects significant growth when compared with combined audiences of approximately 11,000 people in 2014.\textsuperscript{473}

   Leading UK animateur Paul Rissmann presented five of the concerts, which featured his own participatory compositions alongside Classical favourites. Rissmann recently composed a new piece inspired by Australia, H2Oz, which was presented at the two ‘Meet the Orchestra’ concerts, intended for primary school students. Completed in April 2015, this work was commissioned by Symphony International and performed in June 2015 by the Melbourne, Adelaide and Tasmanian Symphony Orchestras. Written in Rissmann’s trademark participatory style, the piece involves body percussion and songs and text to be learnt by students prior to attending the

\textsuperscript{472} ibid.
\textsuperscript{473} ibid.
performance. Rissmann’s inspiration for the work was the waterways of Australia, and their representation in art and poetry. In particular he was inspired by four artworks: 1) An Aboriginal rock painting of the Rainbow Serpent, 2) ‘Waipu Rockhole’, by Tommy Watson (2004), 3) ‘Walls of China’, by Russell Drysdale (1945) and 4) ‘Australian Beach Pattern’ by Charles Meere (1940). Inspiration for the text of the composition was found in a quote by Kuninjku artist Ivan Namairrkki, ‘Our Spirit Lies in Water’, Dorothea Mackellar’s poem ‘My Country’, and the names of selected Australian rivers and beaches.474

Three further concerts were provided to a younger age group and families, including two performances of Rissman’s ‘Stan and Mabel’ composition and a collaboration with The Wiggles. Opportunities for both adult amateur and student musicians to play alongside the MSO have been introduced to the Education Week, allowing them to experience the unique energy that only a professional orchestra can provide.

The ‘Symphony in a Day’ is for adult amateur musicians, which specifically links with players from the many community orchestras in and around Melbourne.475 In 2015 this performance was conducted by the MSO’s Chief Conductor, Sir Andrew Davis, which contributed to not only the quality of performance but also to the sense of occasion for participants. The Secondary Symphony Project, formerly known as ‘Share the Chair’, is a similar event, in which 50 high school students perform alongside the MSO. The 2012 MSO Annual Report acknowledged the value of these

475 Lobb, interview.
participatory events, soon after they were first introduced. Harold Mitchell, the Chairman of the MSO Board, commented:

For the first time, we invited amateur musicians from around Victoria to rehearse and perform with the Orchestra in Symphony in a Day under Benjamin Northey’s direction, and the results – in terms of the number of participants, the musical result and the sheer joy of the whole experience – exceeded everyone’s expectations.476

This event offered a new level of connection with the MSO to the participants, and was celebrated by Managing Director André Gremillet as proof that: ‘we are heading in the right direction in our efforts to engage with the community as broadly as possible.’477

While the Education Week is a focal point for the MSO Education and Community Engagement Department, several of their flagship programmes operate across the calendar year. The most high profile of these is the El Sistema inspired ‘Pizzicato Effect’, now in its sixth year of operation. Based in the multicultural Melbourne suburb Broadmeadows, this programme commenced in 2009 at Meadows Primary School with two MSO musicians working with the Grade 1 and 2 students. Bronwyn Lobb, the MSO Director of Education and Community Engagement, explains the initial impetus for the programme:

There are definite points of inspiration that the Pizzicato Effect has drawn from El Sistema. However, it is different in that it needs to respond to the unique environment in which it is operating. The program was set up as a response to a State Government Regeneration Project being implemented in Broadmeadows, which is one of the lowest social economic catchment areas in Melbourne. There are a lot of refugee families and new migrants in the community and so it was important that the program provided a platform for everyone to come together and start afresh.478

476 Harold Mitchell (Chairman) in the MSO Annual Report 2012, p.5
477 ibid.
478 Lobb. Interview, 2012
In the current year, 2015, access to the programmes has broadened. Each year group within the school is now offered tailored activities to develop students’ musical and instrumental skills systematically, via age appropriate activities. For instance, the youngest students develop their natural musicality and rhythmic skills through class Kodaly-based aural lessons. Lobb comments:

A lot of the children had received no prior music education so providing them with a formalised training program to develop foundation skills before commencing on instruments was an important step in the learning journey.  

When students reach Grade 5 they are offered more individual lessons to allow for teaching tailored to their specific learning levels. In addition to the lessons within the school day, more advanced students are offered an after school programme which meets twice a week for ensemble coaching. MSO provides all the instruments, weekly instrumental and aural lessons and access to MSO concerts. Students have a number of performance opportunities each year. These have included a performance for Prince Charles and the Duchess of Cornwall on their Australian tour in 2012 and a performance at the Melbourne Town Hall in 2011 as part of the MSO’s inaugural Education Week. In August 2013 the children performed as part of the Australian Council for Educational Research ‘How the Brain Learns’ conference.  

Teachers at Meadows Primary have noted improved grades, behaviour, focus and self-confidence in students in the Pizzicato Effect programme. In 2013, the University of Melbourne, led by Dr Margaret Osborne, researched the execution and impact of the programme. Osborne’s research has identified clear improvements in the literacy and numeracy skills of the students involved in the programme. Although her

\[\text{ibid.}\]


225
report has recently been accepted for publication, it was not yet available at the time of writing.\textsuperscript{481} 

It is important for the methods and results of Sistema programmes to be critically assessed and Lobb acknowledges the importance of a rigorous evaluative process in guiding the future course of the Pizzicato Effect. The MSO’s recent strategic planning process, led by consultants from Bailey and Yang, has provided quantitative data on the impact of the programme so far. Lobb explains:

Bailey and Yang spoke with students, teaching artists, teachers at the school, the principal and parents, and the feedback from them is that this programme is changing these children’s lives. It is fantastic that it is being that powerful. So that is what is driving us with moving forward, looking at how we can make it even more accessible, for more students, and ensure that we are partnering with the right people.\textsuperscript{482}

One of the ways Lobb is looking to make the Pizzicato Effect programme more sustainable is by partnering with the University of Melbourne to develop relevant skills in emerging instrumental teachers. Lobb comments: ‘We’re trying to work to diversify the skills of young teachers so that they will be equipped to be part of the programme in the future.’\textsuperscript{483}

Other programmes in Victoria are also aligned along Sistema ideology. For example Laverton hosted the pilot programme for the Sistema Australia organisation, and while Sistema Australia is no longer in operation, the Laverton programme continues.\textsuperscript{484} MSO does not have an official affiliation with Laverton’s programme, but does support it by providing concert tickets for the students involved. The Song Room also runs music education programmes in selected Melbourne schools, aiming to

\textsuperscript{481} Lobb, personal communication with the author, 2015 
\textsuperscript{482} Lobb. Interview by author, 2015 
\textsuperscript{483} ibid. 
bolster music education in Victoria.\footnote{http://www.songroom.org.au, accessed 2 May 2015.} Despite the similar aims of the programmes managed by these organisations, they retain their autonomy. Lobb observes:

> We all work together and there is a bit of cross over between the teams. Everyone is working towards a common goal but they are different programmes.\footnote{Lobb. 2015}

Funding for The Pizzicato Effect programme remains uncertain from year to year, relying on donations from individual donors and Foundations. It is to be hoped that government support for this programme and those modelled upon it will be strengthened in the coming years. The original attempt to create an Australian Sistema was unsuccessful, principally due to lack of public funding, although founder Christopher Nicholls made considerable personal contributions of both time and finances and remains committed to music education.\footnote{Christopher Nicholls. Interview with the author, 6 February 2015.}

Lobb’s personal commitment to the Pizzicato Effect and the El Sistema philosophy was demonstrated by her undertaking a grant-funded trip in late 2014 to Venezuela and Los Angeles, with assistance from Symphony Services’ Professional Development Fund and a private donor.\footnote{Bronwyn Lobb. Experiencing El Sistema in Caracas and Los Angeles, Symphony Services Acquittal Report, 2014.} Lobb’s aim was to gain further insight into El Sistema, both in its country of origin and in the model developed by Los Angeles Philharmonic [YOLA]. The Los Angeles Philharmonic has also established the initiative known as ‘Take a Stand’, which is supporting American Sistema programmes via a Masters of Arts in Teaching, annual conferences and facilitation of a national Sistema youth orchestra.\footnote{http://www.take-a-stand.org, accessed 25 July 2015.} Lobb spent a week in Los Angeles and a week in Caracas. Like
many international observers of El Sistema activity in Caracas, Lobb was inspired by the level of energy and industry, commenting:

It is such a powerhouse of activity and music-making and there is a real can-do attitude. Nothing ever appears too hard, there is nothing that couldn’t be overcome.490

Lobb also noted that the Venezuelan Sistema has developed a method that unifies activity across all parts of the country:

Whichever nucleo you go to see, you see a systematic roll out of a programme which has been shaped to be this incredibly successful model of delivery. If you are going to do something of that scale it needs to have that rigour about it.491

Lobb was impressed by the ‘evolution of the programme, which ties back into itself with graduates becoming teachers and administrative staff etc.’492 A key element to the El Sistema model is that older students mentor and help coach younger members, a system that benefits both students. The younger student can relate to the role model presented to them, while the more advanced student’s learning is validated and celebrated. Lobb saw this process in action during her trip:

That concept of ‘If I know ABC then I can teach you ABC’, even if they are at the beginning stages of learning, it is very empowering to be in the position of passing on knowledge. It is a really clever way of encouraging peer teaching and also making a child feel very proud of what they have learnt.493

The peer teaching process helps to achieve a significant aim for global Sistema programmes: to improve self-esteem and motivation in under-privileged children. Certainly these factors are key for Lobb, and were a focus of her trip to Venezuela:

490 Lobb, interview. 2015.
491 ibid.
492 ibid.
493 ibid.
The social outcome is paramount, the inclusivity, the peer mentoring and how they work with each other and with the teachers. The learning environment is so positive and so hard-working, so incredibly hardworking.\textsuperscript{494}

The hours of contact time between teachers and students in the Venezuelan Sistema are unusually intensive by international standards, with students meeting up to four hours a day after school. This particular element is difficult to translate to international contexts, although the case studies listed here each reveal that efforts are made to keep the experience as immersive as possible.

A current focus for the MSO is the transition of the original Pizzicato students to High School, which occurs at Year 7 in the state of Victoria. At present the MSO does not have an official relationship in place with any secondary school but is maintaining contact with the students by including them in after-school sessions at the primary school. The after school lessons are a combination of string ensemble work, multi-level choral work and theory, alongside a supervised practice club. The high school students do not have regular set lesson times, but are given ‘pull out’ lessons during sessions as pairs or individuals.\textsuperscript{495} The ‘pull out’ or ‘corridor’ lesson is a common arrangement in the Venezuelan Sistema, and Lobb also saw it in practice in Los Angeles. While this arrangement serves to continue the relationship, Lobb acknowledges that there are certain limitations in the system and is continuing to look for a long-term solution. Lobb is also looking to connect the students with other music organisations, commenting:

\textsuperscript{494} ibid.
\textsuperscript{495} ibid.
I think also to have a transition to mainstream music-making is really important in terms of where can they go from here, how can they become part of something even bigger again.\textsuperscript{496}

Such partnerships could be established with youth orchestra associations at a state or national level, either in a mentorship role or by providing scholarships to Sistema students.

While Lobb’s personal interest in Sistema is key to the strength of the programme, MSO’s appointment of Diego Matheuz as Principal Guest Conductor is another link with Sistema. Matheuz is a graduate of the Venezuelan Sistema who, like Dudamel, began his studies as a violinist and has now found his place in the international conducting arena. He is an advocate for both the original Venezuelan Sistema and the international programmes modelled upon it. In September 2014 Matheuz worked with Pizzicato Effect students alongside Scottish violin soloist Nicola Benedetti, who is herself a patron of Sistema Scotland, upon her visit to Melbourne. Benedetti visited Meadows Primary to give an afternoon instrumental workshop and subsequently some students played alongside Benedetti in a movement from the Four Seasons, conducted by Matheuz.\textsuperscript{497} The ability to provide links between disadvantaged students and the world’s most elite soloists and conductors is a major strength of the global Sistema movement.

At the time of writing, the MSO Education Department is undertaking a comprehensive strategic planning process of all its operations, which shall influence the future operation and further development of the Pizzicato Effect program. The current model has much to offer other organisations looking to establish a similar

\textsuperscript{496} ibid.
model. Lobb gives insight into the MSO’s future plans for the Pizzicato Effect programme:

It is a sizeable, high-impact programme and commitment by the organisation. We are looking at ways to expand the programme, and to develop it to reach further students. We are mid-way through that plan right now.\footnote{Lobb, interview. 2015}

Alongside the Pizzicato Effect the MSO also offers key education programmes with a focus on creative, collaborative composition skills, namely the Family Jams, Jams for Juniors and the Art Play Ensemble. These programmes are supported by Professional Development offered to MSO musicians in the skills required to deliver creative workshops. Lobb speaks of her intention to increase the involvement and confidence of MSO players in this area:

I am working on increasing participation and orchestral ownership. I’ve really tried to push the boundaries and get new people involved, I check that we all know what is happening this week and next week and that we all feel empowered to go and do the things that we are talking about.\footnote{Lobb. 2012}

The MSO has hired several prominent UK animateurs to present education programmes, including Fraser Trainer, Paul Rissmann and, earlier, Matthew Barley.

Australian-born Catherine Milliken, former Education Manager for the Berlin Philharmonic, has also delivered an intensive period of training for MSO musicians in creative based education skills. A composer and musician, Milliken is well versed in the UK style creative workshop approach. During her period as Education Manager for the Berlin Philharmonic (from 2005 to 2012) Milliken was at the helm of an education department originally established by leading British animateur Richard McNicol.

In late 2012 Milliken worked with the MSO intensively for a month, in a
collaborative composition project involving Melbourne students and five MSO musicians. The project was based around ‘Romeo and Juliet,’ and over the course of the month Milliken guided the creation of a new work inspired by Shakespeare’s text and related orchestral scores. The result was a work, in Milliken’s words: ‘part oratorio, part hip-hop opera, part music theatre piece.’ The new collaborative composition was performed on the 1 and 2 of November as a pre-concert event linked to the MSO’s Romeo and Juliet concerts presented with Bell Shakespeare.

The event was highly successful both in terms of the musical outcome and the legacy created. A positive impact was created for the students involved, evident in their responses detailed on the MSO website’s documentation of the project. The legacy can also be seen in the skills developed by MSO musicians by working intensively alongside Milliken over a month. Lobb observes:

Milliken said that she didn’t just want to do professional development session on the side, she wanted to be able to work with the musicians on an ongoing basis.

Milliken was building upon skills that several MSO musicians have already been exploring for more than a decade. As previously noted, the MSO has established relationships with UK animateurs Paul Rissmann and Fraser Trainer, who have both delivered creative-based projects for the Education Department and Professional Development sessions with MSO musicians. Lobb explains:

I’ve tried to bring in as much expertise as I can to provide sufficient development for our musicians. In doing this I’m not trying to just bring someone in to fill a gap, but aiming to expose our musicians to the key

---

501 Ibid.
502 Ibid.
503 Lobb, interview. 2015.
skills they need in order to participate confidently in creative workshops. A lot of classically trained musicians are not necessarily comfortable working in forums that require improvising or presenting their craft in different ways, it’s not what they are trained to do. So we look to work with artists like Paul Rissmann, Fraser Trainer and Catherine Milliken who have established methods to assist in preparing musicians for working and presenting in different capacities. These artists build so much preparation into their workshops that they can quickly make the musicians feel confident operating outside of their comfort-zone, to the point that they may not even realise that they’ve just improvised.\footnote{504}

Continuing Professional Development (CPD) training by workshop specialists helps to achieve this sense of empowerment. Fraser Trainer comments on his experiences offering professional development to MSO players:

People were very supportive of the work I was doing in Melbourne. Fantastic musicians were involved in the work and really interested in what it was, and were really excited in the possibilities. There are a pool of musicians there building up a lot of skills in the area but there were also some in the team that I was working with who were doing it for the first time but were equally enthusiastic and interested.\footnote{505}

Lobb tells of how the initial connection with Trainer and Rissmann evolved:

Huw Humphries [former MSO Director of Artistic Planning] is British, so he knew Fraser and, like me, had heard of Paul. I think for that reason as well, MSO has continued to be very forward thinking in this sphere because, like me, Huw had seen and been inspired by all the great things that the UK practitioners and orchestras were doing in this space.\footnote{506}

It is important for the development of education work at MSO as well as all other Australian orchestras that they focus on helping players to acquire a greater level of familiarity and confidence with education skills. Lobb notes the particular skills focus of the CPD sessions:

\footnotesize
\begin{itemize}
\item \footnote{504}{Lobb, interview 2012.}
\item \footnote{505}{Fraser Trainer, interview by the author, 2015.}
\item \footnote{506}{Lobb, interview. 2012}
\end{itemize}
They work on collaborative composition, the skills required to engage groups of children in our art-form. These can be little musical games, rhythm games, or ideas for how to lead jam sessions with children on instruments. They also deliver some specific workshops in developing improvisation and workshop presentation skills.\textsuperscript{507} The MSO has a long-term aim to produce its own workshop leaders, and has already identified several musicians with a passion and skill in this area.

Gillian Howell, former Education Manager of the MSO, is already well versed in such skills. Australian born, Howell lived in the UK for several years and, in 1993, was the first Australian graduate from the Guildhall School of Music and Drama’s ground-breaking Performance and Communication Skills Course.\textsuperscript{508} This Course, at the vanguard of thinking about the role of a musician in society, left a large impact upon Howell’s goals as a musician and educator, as well as her methods of attaining these goals. The course covered skills in improvisation, group composition and workshop leading, as discussed in Chapter Nine.

Howell’s role with the MSO has taken a variety of forms: firstly Education Director from 2002-2004, and subsequently the Creative Director of the MSO’s Community Outreach Program from 2003-08. Howell continues to direct education projects for the MSO on a freelance basis. Her skills, developed at the Guildhall, have clearly influenced her contribution to the MSO. For example, Howell was instrumental in developing several MSO programmes requiring practical skills in workshop leading, improvisation and group composition; such as the MSO Art Play Ensemble and Family Jams.

\textsuperscript{507} ibid.
\textsuperscript{508} Gillian Howell. Interview by author, 19 February 2015.
In addition, several projects show the impact of Howell’s deep-held belief that musicians and organisations in receipt of public funds should strive to use their skills to make a positive contribution to society, beyond the concert platform. These programmes included outreach work in prisons and hospitals, both new initiatives for orchestras in Australia at the time. The roots for these programmes can again be found in Howell’s Guildhall training. Howell observes:

For me the Guildhall course was a complete opening up of an absolutely different way of thinking about being a musician. The course showed me a way to have a more tangible contribution to making the world a better place. That was what was important to me in my life and this offered a way that I could do this with music. 509

Two specific programmes introduced by Howell at the MSO clearly show her desire to use music to make ‘the world a better place.’ The first was a partnership with the Royal Children’s Hospital in Melbourne, initiated in 2007, which has been well documented by Clare Kildea 510 and Dr. Helen Shoemark 511 in Voices: A World Forum for Music Therapy. The second partnership was the MSO Prison project, which commenced on 3 March 2008. This was a collaborative composition project between prison inmates and selected MSO musicians, facilitated by Howell. Howell observes that this was a confronting yet ultimately rewarding experience for the MSO musicians who took part, claiming: ‘for the musicians, I think it was the most extraordinary thing they had ever done.’ 512

---

509 Howell, interview.
512 Howell, interview.
Howell explains her intentions for these projects, which she actively pursued over several years:

I was very interested in partnerships. I was interested in the orchestra building relationships with people who were not music based organisations and for us to explore what happens when highly skilled musicians go into these other environments – what it is they are able to bring, to contribute to that organisation’s overarching goals and intentions.\textsuperscript{513}

The benefits of music outreach programmes in both hospital and prison settings are being increasingly explored, both within Australia and the United Kingdom. However Howell felt that the MSO was the Australian orchestra most ready, at the date of her first appointment there in 2002, to adopt innovative methods of connecting with their community. As Howell recalls:

They were the only orchestra in Australia that seemed to be asking some of these questions, and were interested in expanding their musicians’ role in the community. SSO had the Playerlink program running very successfully each year at that time, which offered training support to young musicians in rural areas. Orchestra Victoria adopted a similar approach, the MOVE program, which built on the Playerlink model. Different orchestras tended to develop their programmes according to the strengths and interests of their players, education staff, and communities. I was interested in exploring expanded roles for orchestras in communities beyond those of young classical music students. MSO as an organisation was also interested in this, and so the Community Outreach programme at MSO moved in those directions.\textsuperscript{514}

The SSO and the MSO have continued to take a contrasting approach to the development of their Education and Outreach work. The SSO has focussed primarily on school music education, teacher support and tertiary training programmes. The MSO, while also making significant contributions to these areas, has also developed its

\textsuperscript{513} Howell.  
\textsuperscript{514} Howell.
links with the community with a number of participatory and creative based programmes.

The Art Play Ensemble is one such programme. Formed in 2005, the Art Play was established in partnership between the MSO and the City of Melbourne. It is an inclusive ensemble, open to children playing orchestral instruments but placing more importance upon their creative and ensemble skills than upon their technical level on their instrument. Each year 28 participants are selected from an initial Open Workshop to work alongside four MSO musicians in a further three workshops. During these workshops, repertoire from the current MSO season is explored, leading to the creation and performance of a new piece of music inspired by the original work. Since the programme’s inception ten years ago the earliest participants have now moved on to tertiary training, and many have chosen to make music their career. In her detailed and informative blog, ‘musicwork,’ Howell gives her insight into the lasting benefits of the ArtPlay Ensemble for its members. Howell observes:

They are making choices now that will see them becoming the next generation of orchestral musicians, jazz musicians and music therapists. I believe that if you experience yourself as musical and creative in your formative playing years, this creates a strong foundation for seeking and trying out new musical ventures as you mature.

The MSO Family Jams are a similarly participative and inclusive education model in which children and their parents join with MSO musicians to create a new piece of music based on an MSO main-stage concert work. The Jams are divided into two age groups- Jams for Juniors, for children aged 0 to 5 alongside their parents, and Family

517 ibid.
Jams, for children aged 6 and upwards, again with their parents. All Jam sessions are inclusive, informal and highly participatory, however the Jams for Juniors are much more curated than the Family Jams model in order to best cater for the younger age group. There is no pre-requisite level of instrumental skill needed for these programmes, and participants can choose to bring their own instrument or borrow one from the MSO.

Bronwyn Lobb notes that the Jams for Juniors programme has continued to develop and grow throughout her years as Education Director, under the leadership of musician and educator Karen Kyriakou. Lobb feels that the continued success and demand for this program points to further potential for future growth. Lobb observes:

>The number of Jams for Juniors sessions we run has more than doubled in the past year. It used to be free and was always oversubscribed, however this year [2015] we decided to ticket the sessions as a way to manage numbers and recoup some of the programme costs. All the sessions sold out in less than twelve hours. This end of the Family market is strong right across the sector, and one where we will continue to focus our efforts.\(^{518}\)

As Lobb notes, this model presents benefits for a wide range of age groups. It could also be modified to be suitable for senior school students by including more of a curriculum focus and links with leading Australian composers, in the style of the London Sinfonietta workshops discussed earlier in Chapter Five.

The Young Artist programs run by the MSO aim to foster emerging orchestral musicians and composers. They comprise the Snare Drum Award, established in 2004 to foster and mentor emerging percussionists; String Fellowships offered in partnership with the Australian Youth Orchestra, and the Cybec 21\(^{st}\) Century Australian Composers Program. The AYO/MSO String Fellowships, established in 2007, are offered to

\(^{518}\) Lobb, interview, 2015
Australians aged 18-25. The Fellowship takes place over two stages; stage one is a week of intensive mentorship culminating in a casual audition. Stage two, for those who pass the casual audition, involves three weeks of casual work with the MSO. In 2014 nine students were accepted into the programme, with four selected for the casual work stage of the programme. In total more than twenty graduates of this programme have gone on to work professionally with the MSO. The Cybec Composers Program is a year-long mentorship for four young composers, during which they each compose a new work to be performed by the MSO at the culmination of the Program. A further two are selected for inclusion in the Metropolis New Music Festival, thus providing a public platform from which to showcase their works.

At the time of writing the MSO is midway through a strategic planning process. As part of this process, Lobb is assessing areas for future development and clarifying her ideas as to the central aims and purposes of her work. Lobb observes:

It is really interesting establishing what the orchestra’s role is in music education. I think we have a huge role in advocacy, a huge role in supporting what’s happening in the classroom. In 2015 this support is provided through the MSO’s Education Concerts, tailored to a variety of school age groups; teacher training workshops and online resources. In addition to the schools concerts featured in the Education Week, the MSO also offers four lecture concert main stage concerts throughout 2015, intended for VCE (upper high school) students. These include three concerts presented by Richard Gill, in the ‘Ears Wide Open’ series, and a live radio broadcast of Graham Abbott’s Keys to Music program.

519 2014 MSO Annual Report, p. 18
520 Lobb, interview. 2015
The ‘Up Close and Musical’ series of concerts are also tailored towards VCE students and are linked to specific VCE Music Study Design outcomes. The concerts feature works by contemporary Australian composers, such as Paul Stanhope, Stuart Greenbaum and Katy Abbott. In 2014 and 2015 this concert series featured a work by Katy Abbott, commissioned by the MSO in 2011 and entitled ‘Introduced Species: Symphony No.2’. Abbott was inspired by a series of paintings by Australian artist Matthew Quick, in particular ‘Intrepid Travellers: Introduced Species’. Quick’s paintings and Abbott’s musical interpretation have an environmental focus, exploring the growing issue of garbage in the ocean. In this respect the work also provides a link with the Australian Curriculum’s focus on sustainability. The presentations of ‘Introduced Species’ featured a performance by MSO musicians conducted by Luke Dollman, an analysis of the work by Abbott, an introduction to Quick’s artworks and a discussion on the environmental issues highlighted by the composition. Teacher resources are included on the MSO website for this and other Australian compositions, including insight into the composers’ intentions and methods. Resource packs for Paul Rissmann’s concerts are also included online in 2015 to support his participatory performances.

The MSO’s teacher training is offered in two streams. The first is ‘Music in the Classroom,’ delivered by Richard Gill and recommended for primary teachers. Over two professional development sessions these workshops cover the key elements of music in the Australian National Curriculum for the Arts. The second stream of teacher

---

training is delivered through ‘Instrumental Conducting Workshops,’ presented by Benjamin Northey, the MSO’s Associate Conductor. These workshops focus on developing skills in ensemble conducting and are intended for secondary school teachers.

While the MSO strongly supports and links with school music education, Lobb feels that it is important to keep the unique values inherent to the symphony orchestra to mind when planning Education Concerts. Lobb comments:

I think our greatest value is simply being an orchestra, for the students to experience that power. We did Mahler’s Third Symphony last night, and you can’t translate that as a group of three musicians going into a school. That’s something that we need to hold on to.\footnote{Lobb, interview.}

The question of how best to use the resources of the orchestra in engaging with the community is key to the planning of education programming. While events in schools allow for personal interaction between players and students, ideally all orchestral projects taking place in schools should be linked back to a full orchestral performance so that students are able to appreciate the power of the full symphony.

Lobb has identified five core areas of activity and future growth for the MSO ECE Department. These are: schools, including teacher training and resources; family events; community projects; artist development and adult life-long learning.\footnote{ibid.} Upon the completion of the strategic planning process the details for future development in these areas will be decided. However the present structure and activity of the MSO ECE Department already has much to celebrate. It has evolved into a dynamic, versatile organisation able to create lasting and significant connections with its
community. Clear points of reference to the MSO’s approach to community engagement can be seen in the case studies of the following Australian orchestras.
12.3 Adelaide Symphony Orchestra

The Adelaide Symphony Orchestra (ASO), founded in 1936, is the largest performing arts company in the state of South Australia (population 1,691,500). With an annual budget of $13.3 million, the ASO delivers 100 concerts annually and also performs for productions with the State Opera of South Australia, the Australian Ballet and Opera Australia. The education programmes of the Adelaide Symphony Orchestra are planned and delivered by the ‘Learning’ Department, led since 2013 by Education and Community Engagement Co-ordinator, Emily Gann. A number of new Learning programmes have been developed by the ASO over the past three years, and the orchestra is now achieving new levels of participation and community engagement. Gann reveals that upon her arrival at the ASO she set up a three-year plan, with distinct stages of activity and development for each year:

The first year was really about gaining trust, making everyone aware that we were serious about what we do, and implementing the pilot professional pathways program. 2015 is about ‘Create and Participate’: it is all about creative involvement and participation. 2016’s theme is ‘Building Communities’, so still being creative and participative but moving on a step further and doing a lot more community work and bringing people together, connecting communities through music.

New initiatives for the ASO Learning Programme include ‘Junior Jams’ and ‘Creative Workshops,’ both introduced in 2015, and opportunities for students and community musicians to play alongside the ASO, first introduced in 2014. The ‘Big Rehearsal’ is an opportunity for students to play alongside the ASO, and the ASO also has an opportunity for community musicians to do the same, in the ‘Come and Play.’

---

528 ASO 2014 Annual Report, p. 12
529 Gann, interview.
Mendelssohn’ event. The ‘Festival of Learning and Participation’ is a further new initiative for the ASO, first introduced in 2015. The Festival is similar in style to the MSO’s Education Week model, and is led by British animateur Paul Rissmann, who also worked with the MSO and TSO in 2015. During the ASO Festival Rissmann facilitated creative education workshops for secondary students and presented concerts with a participatory element for junior school, middle school and family audiences.\textsuperscript{530}

Rissmann can potentially create a lasting impact upon the practice of music education in Adelaide through his visit, as alongside his public performances and workshops he also offered training sessions for both classroom teachers and ASO musicians. While the exemplary quality of Rissmann’s work will add substantially to the development of the ASO’s learning department, there is a need to build up local skills in his areas of expertise. It is to be hoped that a significant number of teachers and musicians absorb some of his skills and methods with a view to, ideally, create more Australian workshop leaders of his calibre.

The ASO’s Junior Jams are already utilising the workshop leading skills of Australian jazz violinist Julian Ferraretto. Originally from Adelaide, Ferraretto moved to the UK in 2002 and built his career there for eleven years. Alongside his performing career as a leading jazz violinist, Ferraretto also developed an interest in the creative, improvisation based music education work that the UK is particularly known for. His workshop skills were developed with two key ensembles in London: the Wigmore Hall’s resident creative ensemble, ‘Ignite,’ and the London Music Masters’ Bridge Project.\textsuperscript{531} Ferraretto led the London Music Masters (LMM) in several improvisation workshops that culminated in a performance alongside London Philharmonic

\textsuperscript{531} \url{www.julianferraretto.com}, accessed 2 May 2015.
Orchestra members and Ferraretto’s jazz quartet at the Royal Festival Hall. Further information about the LMM can be found in Chapter Ten. The influence of the UK workshop style is evident in the way Ferraretto works creatively with students, including his use of warm up games and non-notated scores that create a sense of ease while improvising. The ASO has plans to further develop and grow this stream of their education programming.

The Professional Pathways scheme began in 2014 as a partnership between the ASO and the Elder Conservatorium of Music, University of Adelaide. Following the pilot programme in 2014, in 2015 the Professional Pathways scheme has three strands: Orchestral Traineeships, Learning Traineeships and Artist Insight Series. The Orchestral Traineeships offer tertiary students mentorship and audition coaching, and opportunities to play in rehearsal and chamber music settings with ASO musicians. Here Gann is building upon earlier links between the ASO and the Elder Conservatorium; for example in 2005 the two institutions joined together to perform Mahler’s Ninth Symphony in an initiative led by Elder Professor Charles Bodman Rae.

The Learning Traineeships also offer mentoring to music education graduates, giving them insight into the daily operations of the ASO Learning Department. The Artist Insight Series has the highest intake in Professional Pathways, with 30 students invited to attend various presentations and discussions throughout the year that reveal different approaches to a career in music and offer advice on how to successfully develop such a career. Gann explains the intent of this particular programme:

This is aimed at showing students different pathways in music through the careers of different artists. It gives insight into a range of different aspects of music careers and what’s available, because a lot of people have their

---

532 ibid.
sights set on an orchestral playing career and it can be eye-opening to see different people and their aims and how they changed along the way.\footnote{Gann, interview.}

It is true that most students entering a music degree would have two main career paths in sight: either an orchestral position, or a teaching role. Increasingly, however, musicians are establishing ‘portfolio’ careers, which allow them to step between a variety of roles. These roles may require skills in composing, presenting, editing, promoting, educating or researching, alongside performing. The Artist Insight series shows some of the ways in which these skills can be developed. It offers students invaluable real life insight into possible ways to thrive in a notoriously difficult profession, and is a concept that could easily translate to other arts organisations.

Another new initiative for the ASO in 2015 was the commission of a new school concert project, ‘The Bush Concert’. This is based on an Australian picture book by Helda Visser, which tells the story of a group of birds who are experiencing a drought. With this programme the ASO musicians are on familiar ground, as the orchestra has for some time offered schools projects based on books, most notably ‘Edward and Edwina’. The new, and very positive step, taken by ‘The Bush Concert’, is that it places the focus firmly on the ASO musicians. The ‘Edward and Edwina’ project, while very popular, was a joint performance by ASO musicians and puppeteers who acted out the story. As always in such a scenario, it is easy for children to lose focus from the musicians and become absorbed in the visuals of the puppetry. With the ‘Bush Concert’ format, the eight musicians tell the story, with support by a singer/presenter.
The project is highly participatory, with students encouraged to learn songs and dances that are included in the performance. Schools are also given the opportunity to include a creative music workshop before the performance. During this workshop students develop original music, which is then incorporated into the performance. The show is a delightful way for students to engage with music, and also offers substantial cross curricula learning. The story and music closely connect with the Australian landscape and wildlife: for example over thirty five Australian bird calls are included in the music, and a tongue twisting song lists a bewildering number of gum trees. The preparatory activities cover all five areas of the new Australian Curriculum for the Arts and are supported by a teacher professional development workshop. Alongside ‘The Bush Concert’, the ASO also presents ‘Tigers and Teapots’ to school audiences. This is a participatory concert, developed in 2014 with Australian conductor and educator David Banney, in which students sing as a choir alongside ASO members in an in-school workshop and performance.

While there are clearly many positive developments underway at the ASO at the present time, their long-term planning can sometimes be hindered by a lack of a permanent venue. As Gann explains:

A big problem for the ASO is that we don’t have our own concert venue so a lot of our planning has to be around when venues are free. It is a constant jigsaw puzzle and if we had our own venue it would change how we do everything.

Certainly it has been clear through the course of study how the availability of venues influences education and community programming. Orchestras with a permanent

---


535 Gann, interview.
space available to them are able to develop programmes with a regular and ongoing point of community engagement.

Having already overseen considerable advances in the ASO’s Learning Department, Gann has plans to further develop the programme. In interview with the author she has spoken of how she has been influenced by the way that British orchestras connect with their communities:

These organisations in the UK see themselves as a community resource. That’s what I would really like the ASO to be because at the end of the day we are the biggest performing arts company in South Australia, we are the ones who have 75 musicians as a resource. We have the potential to lead the way. There are holes in Adelaide’s offerings in music and, as a community resource, we can become a place people can come to and access music.\(^\text{536}\)

With these words, Gann is echoing the famous Fleischmann vision of ‘a community of musicians, musicians for the community’. There are further signs that the ASO management is keen to invest and develop its Learning Department. In 2013 the ASO undertook a Strategic Review, supported by the Australia Council and Arts SA, and arrived at several key recommendations to help them move forward. One of these recommendations was to form a comprehensive Community Engagement Plan, with a Learning Programme central to that Plan. Alongside this was a commitment to commission new works each year, and to develop a digital strategy for an online Learning Programme.\(^\text{537}\) The ASO’s Learning and Community Engagement has subsequently grown considerably, and they have followed through with the commitment to commission new works. At present however there remains the need to increase their digital outreach and online content. The state of South Australia has

\(^{536}\) ibid.
\(^{537}\) ASO 2013 Annual Report, pp.11-12.
many isolated communities, which would benefit from webcasts or live broadcasts of education concerts and presentations.

In April 2015 the next Chief Conductor was revealed to be German-based Australian, Nicholas Carter. In his press release upon this announcement, Carter stressed that he is interested in helping the orchestra to engage more fully with its South Australian community:

I think my appointment comes at a really interesting time in the musical and cultural landscape in Australia and throughout the world, where orchestras and other cultural organisations are trying to redefine their relevance in the world in the 21st century. I’m passionate about the merits of bringing classical music to as many people as possible and to engage not only the communities that already know about the ASO but also the communities that perhaps have had no experience or exposure to orchestral music so far.538

Carter’s first official appointment was Assistant Conductor to the Sydney Symphony Orchestra, a role linked to the SSO’s Education department. He is therefore experienced in delivering Orchestral Education programmes and can potentially develop the ASO’s public profile through its community engagement activities, although this will depend upon his scheduling. It is to be hoped that the participatory based engagement between ASO musicians and the South Australian community can continue to develop over coming years.

12.4 Tasmanian Symphony Orchestra

Based in the city of Hobart, the Tasmanian Symphony Orchestra (TSO) serves the island of Tasmania, Australia’s smallest state (population 515,200). With an annual budget of $10,966,822, the TSO stages annual concert seasons in Hobart and Launceston, Tasmania’s two main cities, as well as touring to regional centres across the state. The TSO operates Outreach and Education programmes in three key streams: education concerts, training opportunities for emerging musicians, and community engagement. The following case study looks at the TSO’s activity in each of these areas in further detail, beginning with the Education concerts in the current 2015 season.

The TSO education concerts are tailored towards a variety of age groups. Concerts for pre-schoolers were first introduced by the TSO in 2014, and in 2015 this age group is offered the ‘Mini Maestros’ series and a performance of ‘Melvin’s Musical Circus’, presented by popular ‘clownductor’ Melvin Tix. UK animateur Paul Rissmann is presenting two series of schools concerts, also seen in the ASO and MSO’s 2015 Education programmes. Rissmann’s concerts for junior primary students, ‘The Beat of your Feet,’ feature his participatory composition Stan and Mabel; while his concerts for older students, ‘Symphonic Snapshots: Heroes and Villains’, feature his work H2Oz, previously discussed in the MSO case study. Rissmann is also offering a teacher training workshop through the TSO, ‘Creative Classrooms’, in which he aims to increase teachers’ confidence in exploring their creativity.

The ‘Mini TSO’ school concerts feature fifteen TSO musicians in performances both in concert halls and in schools; six of these performances are scheduled for 2015.

---

540 TSO 2014 Annual Report, p.31
541 ibid, p.10
although more may be supplied upon request. For senior school students the TSO is featuring Australian composer Katy Abbott’s work ‘Introduced Species’, also discussed previously in the MSO case study. Several of the TSO school concerts have a literacy theme in 2015, such as a new work inspired by Roald Dahl’s ‘Dirty Beasts’, composed by Benjamin Wallfisch, alongside internationally successful book adaptations ‘Maximus Musicus’ and ‘Stan and Mabel’. This has been planned by the TSO in order to support the present focus on improving literacy in Tasmania.\(^{542}\)

The TSO offers several training opportunities to emerging musicians. The TSO Symphony Australia Composer School offers a week of mentoring to emerging young composers by leaders in the field. Jennifer Compton, Outreach and Executive Manager of the TSO since September 2014, has plans to further develop the TSO training programmes for emerging composers in 2016. Compton is looking to support Grade 11 and 12 students undertaking pre-tertiary University of Tasmania Courses. She would also like to establish further opportunities for emerging composers who have passed through the TSO Composer’s School so that they can continue to develop their skills in writing for orchestra.\(^{543}\)

The ‘Big Rehearsal’ is a side-by-side performance opportunity for students from the Tasmanian Youth Orchestra to play alongside the TSO for a day. Thirty-one young musicians from the Tasmanian Youth Orchestra took up this opportunity in 2014, and were conducted by Richard Gill. Compton observes:

> The Big Rehearsal has been really successful and it’s been a great training day. There are musicians who would really like to have a more extensive involvement with TYO.\(^{544}\)

\(^{542}\) Jennifer Compton. Outreach and Education Executive, Tasmanian Symphony Orchestra. Interview by author, 16 February 2015.

\(^{543}\) ibid.

\(^{544}\) ibid.
The TSO also offers Fellowships for Wind, Brass and Percussion in partnership with the Australian Youth Orchestra Association. This complements the AYO/MSO String Fellowships and follows a similar pattern, whereby students are provided with masterclasses, mentorship and finally a casual audition for TSO. Concerto performance opportunities are offered to students from the Australian National Academy of Music, as well as the winner of the ‘Rising Star’ Concerto Competition, which is open to talented Tasmanian players under the age of twenty-one.

A recent collaboration has been formed between the TSO, Victorian Opera and Symphony Australia. In this project, four young composers are working together to produce a new musical theatre work based on the ‘Seven Deadly Sins’, which shall be performed in Melbourne in November 2015. Each composer has been allocated two movements- sharing the seven sins and an introduction movement- and sins have been linked to the capital cities of Australian states – Brisbane: Sloth, Sydney: Lust, Canberra: Pride, Melbourne: Greed, Hobart: Covetousness, Adelaide: Gluttony and Perth: Anger. The project will offer the young composers selected invaluable practical experience and, with a high profile performance by Orchestra Victoria, a platform from which to display their work.\(^{545}\)

The TSO’s outreach programming has established links with hospitals and aged care patients, with recitals recently staged at Royal Hobart Hospital and Mathers House. Further outreach work is also planned at Risdon Prison with families of inmates. This is in support of a new initiative, ‘Breaking the Cycle’, which is intended to address the emotional health of the inmates and build up their self esteem. Impetus

for the work is coming from Norman Reed, a pastor working with the prison and the TSO, who travelled to the UK, Europe and Singapore in 2014 with a Churchill Fellowship in order to study international work in this area.\textsuperscript{546} The project is designed to be a positive experience for children of inmates to experience alongside their parents. Compton explains:

> The idea is that children who maintain a relationship with their fathers have a much lower statistical likelihood of also ending up in prison. So the point is to help the children.\textsuperscript{547}

Four musicians from the TSO have volunteered for this project, and Compton will arrange training for them to support them in their work. As a relatively new field of work for Australian orchestras, it could be interesting for Australian education managers to look to the work carried out in this field in the UK over a period of some years, as well as that of the MSO and SSO. Compton is looking to develop this programme further and the TSO is now involved with the Prison Rock Band. Compton observes:

> TSO’s involvement with the prison is about helping families, which includes the children and the prisoners. If prisoners can feel they are part of a bigger world when they are released, as well as feeling they have grown as a person, they may find it easier to forge a life that will not include a return to prison. Having a positive relationship with their children that has also been ongoing through their time in prison helps enormously. The positive outcomes of the Family Support program in prisons cannot be underestimated.\textsuperscript{548}

As revealed in interview with Gillian Howell and Steve Pickett, such work can also have lasting benefit for inmates; not only in terms of new skills but also in helping them

\textsuperscript{546} \url{www.churchillfellowstas.org.au}, accessed 4 May 2015.
\textsuperscript{547} Compton.
\textsuperscript{548} Compton. Personal communication with the author, August 2015.
to develop qualities of determination, patience and creativity which may stand them in good stead in the future.

The TSO is interested in connecting with young instrumental students. This is an area currently in need of support in Tasmania, as the government recently made significant cuts to music education that have impacted upon school instrumental programmes.\(^5\) Compton explains:

Tasmania has just undergone brutal cuts in education, which have affected music programmes, in that the extra curricula activities have been cut (like the grade five and six string/choir/band programme). The outcome is that many schools have had extra curricula programmes in music cut and all the public primary school string programmes have ended. That was a big disappointment to the music community.\(^6\)

While these cuts have weakened instrumental teaching in the school curriculum, there will of course still be many students learning outside the school system. A major concern with cuts such as these is that they inevitably impact more upon students attending state primary schools than those attending private schools, thereby increasing the gap of inequity that already exists in Australia music education. This issue was raised in the National Review of School Music Education a decade ago, and has been reiterated by many studies in the succeeding years. It will need a significant government commitment to establish a meaningful level of equity in terms of access to music education. In the absence of such government support, organisations such as TSO can play a major role in helping to create a fairer point of access to music education for all children across the state. Compton is aware of the need and is looking at ways in which to engage with the sector.


\(^6\) Compton.
At the time of writing Compton was newly arrived to her role at the TSO and therefore had little opportunity to make a personal contribution to the development of the Education Department. In personal communication with the author, Compton explains that her chief plans include further developing the TSO’s support for young composers; the development of the TSO Scholarship in Orchestral Studies in partnership with the University of Tasmania; and continuing to develop the recently established outreach programmes.
12.5 Queensland Symphony Orchestra

The Queensland Symphony Orchestra (QSO) is based in the city of Brisbane and serves the state of Queensland (population 4,750,500).\(^{551}\) With a budget of $18,496,225,\(^{552}\) the QSO offers a main concert series in Brisbane, regional touring and Education and Community programmes. The QSO is also increasingly developing a digital presence. In late 2013 Sophie Galaise was appointed as CEO, and the QSO has subsequently strengthened its presence in the community. Galaise describes her principal aims in this regard:

Everybody agrees that we want to engage with communities and be relevant to the people here in Queensland and Brisbane, and then from that point go beyond to other states and be known as champions of music.\(^{553}\)

The impact of Galaise’s approach can be seen in the figures released in QSO’s 2014 Annual Report: there was an 82% increase in education participants from 2013, with 22,460 participants recorded in 2014, and the orchestra posted a surplus of $622,369.\(^{554}\) The orchestra’s key education activities to this date have been Education Concerts tailored for primary, middle and secondary school students, staged both in Brisbane and on regional tours of Queensland. The QSO connected with 115 schools in 2014 through their Education Concerts and associated workshops and demonstrations.\(^{555}\)


\(^{552}\) QSO 2014 Annual Report, p.30


\(^{554}\) QSO 2014 Annual Report, p.2

\(^{555}\) ibid.
Since 2012 the QSO Education Programmes have been managed by Pam Lowry and in 2014 the QSO also appointed a Community Engagement Officer, John Nolan, in a position financed for a period of three years by the Tim Fairfax Foundation. Lowry’s appointment marked a change from a long-standing arrangement whereby the QSO Education Manager was appointed on secondment from the Queensland Department of Education. Under this system a teacher would be seconded to work with the orchestra for a period of three years, before being withdrawn and given another posting. While this arrangement ensured that the QSO Education Manager had an in-depth knowledge of current school music education, there were also drawbacks. For example when each three-year cycle ended, there was unavoidable disruption to the operation of QSO’s education and outreach work. Additionally, it could be considered that commitment to long-term planning was compromised by the rotating management.

In late 2012 the situation in Queensland changed when a new government came into power, led by Campbell Newman. Newman’s ambition to rebalance Queensland’s finances resulted in widespread cuts to public services and positions, including the QSO’s Education Manager position. Queensland’s Department of Education and the QSO worked together to find a way to maintain the education and outreach work of the orchestra, and in August 2012 Pam Lowry, previously Coordinator of Music Programs in the South East Region for the Department of Education, stepped into the role of Education Officer at the QSO.556 To enable Lowry to make this move, the Department of Education placed her on indefinite leave, and the QSO for

---

556 Pam Lowry. Education Liaison Officer, Queensland Symphony Orchestra. Interview by author, 27 March 2015.
their part readjusted their budget in order to finance her position from their own funding.  

While this arrangement was clearly successful, with Lowry still in the position three years later, it did create limitations on the QSO’s progress in the field of education and outreach, as they could only afford to finance a part-time position for three days a week. While Lowry is co-ordinating an impressive range of education activity, she acknowledges that a part-time role does present limitations. In order therefore for the QSO’s education and outreach department to achieve its maximum versatility and impact, it is to be hoped that they can find funding for a full-time position. This would be a demonstration of the importance of the role within the QSO, and would allow Lowry to have a wider focus for her ambitions to expand the programme.

Before discussing the QSO Education Department in detail, it is important to look at the Queensland approach to school music education, as it impacts upon QSO’s education department in several ways. Music teaching has much stronger government support in Queensland than in other Australian states. Dating back to 1971, Queensland has a system whereby a music specialist teacher and instrumental teacher are employed at state schools. At the present date, for example, there are more than 400 primary music specialists reaching over 50,000 students across the state. As a former regional coordinator in the system, Lowry is well placed to explain the system further:

---

557 ibid.
558 ibid.
All of the teachers in the school are double degree teachers, with both a teaching and music degree, and are employed as teachers in every school across the state. The system that is working very successfully is that we put a string, woodwind, brass and percussion specialist in each high school and from there they go out and work in the primary schools. Each teacher will also go to between two and four primary schools, and it is all free in the system.\[560\]

An important note here is the fact that all music teachers- both classroom and instrumental- are required to have a degree in teaching alongside their music degree. As discussed in Chapter Nine, there is a growing awareness of the importance for music graduates to have qualifications in education, in recognition that a large percentage will be involved in teaching at some point of their career. The other point to note here is that the same instrumental teachers will be found at both the primary and high schools in a particular catchment area, thus creating continuity for students as they negotiate the change from primary to secondary school. This is often a point at which students will stop learning their instrument, particularly those who began their studies in a structured group class in primary school.

Each region has an instrumental co-ordinator to arrange timetabling and logistical matters, and there is a specific Instrumental Curriculum that covers all levels of student development. While other Australian states have similar schemes, the Queensland Instrumental Teaching system is regarded as the finest and most extensive in Australia, and is internationally recognised as a leader in the field of instrumental music education.\[561\] Here Lowry tells of how the programme survived the savage cuts

\[560\] Lowry.
of the Newman government, at a time that many other arts organisations were being drastically cut back:

SA and Tasmania also have had instrumental programmes but have had massive cuts. Queensland has survived and strengthened which is great. There was a lot of stress under the recent Campbell Newman government, which was cutting across the board. One of the programs, MOST, was threatened but there was such an uproar that it stopped it: it is very well supported by the community.  

Established now for forty-four years, Queensland’s state music system has provided generations of students with a strong musical education, and many past students of the system are now involved in music in the community in various ways. For instance, there are now an unusually high number of amateur music groups across Queensland with community orchestras, bands and string ensembles found in most regional centres and towns. It is also important to note that while the system discussed above is for state schools, private schools have followed suit and also employ music specialists, including instrumental staff, thus keeping step with the strength of music teaching at the state school level.

While the Queensland state sponsored music system is of interest in its own right, it is the impact upon QSO’s education programming that is of principal relevance to this thesis. Lowry explains:

At QSO we are on a slightly more advanced level, we aren’t doing the basic introduction to instruments, it is more about the technique, because of the education they are all getting at school. They have the basics. We can often work at a higher level than in other states, and we can tailor the experiences more specifically.

---

562 Lowry, interview.
563 ibid.
564 ibid.
Here Lowry is discussing the manner in which QSO players interact with school students in their education concerts, as well as in their work in schools. As Lowry observes, students attending QSO concerts already have a certain level of familiarity with orchestral instruments and the key elements of music. The QSO’s role therefore is to provide a point of inspiration for students already learning instruments, as well as support for Queensland class and instrumental teachers. In order to develop this role, Lowry and Community Engagement Officer John Nolan have established three areas of future growth at the QSO. These are: regional touring and outreach; participatory performance opportunities with the orchestra; and digital and online links. Each of these refers back to the orchestra’s key strength: setting the standard for elite music making in the state. Here the QSO’s expansion in these three key strands and the ways in which they are interlinked are discussed in further detail.

Firstly, the expansion of regional outreach has entailed both a geographical shift and an expansion of community interaction with the orchestra. The QSO’s previous model for regional outreach involved small chamber groups touring towns along the Queensland coastline. Lowry and Nolan are overseeing an expansion of this touring programme in several ways: as well as travelling further west into inland Queensland, they have also replaced the small chamber groups with a 12-piece chamber orchestra. Lowry comments:

Our plan is to be able to offer a concert programme to play in our regional areas so that we are not reinventing the wheel each time we go to a different town. We’ve co-ordinated it much more this year, as a result of having a Community Engagement Officer. We are putting a community concert on in each town now. We also do workshops with the schools, community workshops with adult orchestras, a concert that features the students with QSO playing, and another concert featuring just the QSO.
We have a basic programme of chamber repertoire that we are selecting from.\textsuperscript{565}

One of the benefits of a larger touring ensemble, which represents each instrument in the orchestra, is that specialist tutoring can be offered to any student or amateur musician participating in regional workshops. As Lowry states, another benefit is that they are able to plan and rehearse a concert programme which can then be performed many times with minimal need for extra preparation. Lowry explains:

We offer high schools tutorials and ensemble assistance, tailored to the school. Either tutorials for specific instruments, sectionals or full ensembles. In primary schools we do presentations, introduction to the instruments and talking about the instruments. We also interact with the adult musicians in each town, the amateur groups. Again we tailor it to what they want, whether they want us to sit in their ensemble or do tutorial sessions, or play for them. These events give these groups a real boost.\textsuperscript{566}

Any musician who has sat next to a stronger musician in an ensemble will vouch for the immediate boost this experience provides. The QSO players are able to set a benchmark in terms of tone, rhythm and ensemble techniques for the groups with which they are working. As Lowry comments, these interactions between QSO musicians and community musicians have the potential to boost the standard of playing, thereby creating a lasting legacy for the visit.

The second key area of growth for the QSO is the establishment of a new participatory programme, ‘A Day in the Orchestra’, which will be offered for the first time in October 2015. In this event community musicians will come to play alongside thirty QSO players in their Brisbane studio, in a programme very similar to MSO’s ‘Symphony in a Day.’ The first of these events will be targeted at adult community

\textsuperscript{565} Lowry, interview.
\textsuperscript{566} ibid.
musicians, aged 25 and above, but the plan is to eventually run several of these events a year, with each targeting a different group. Lowry explains that the age group of the first event was again inspired by the impact of the school music programmes. Lowry comments:

There are thousands and thousands of adults who have learnt an instrument in Queensland. We want them to get their instruments out and enhance and strengthen the community orchestras and promote them.\footnote{Lowry, interview.}

Orchestras that have already initiated programmes such as this have spoken of the positive impact upon participants. Such programmes have the potential to significantly strengthen grass-roots instrumental playing in Queensland, which should ultimately help to also strengthen long term support for QSO main stage performances.

While this will be the first time the QSO offer a participatory programme such as this in Brisbane, they have explored the concept before on a regional tour to Cairns in 2014, and the same opportunity will be offered again in 2015 in Ipswich. A further area of development for the QSO could be a large-scale participatory education concert series, in a similar model to ‘Come and Play with the Hallé.’ This would be a logical link between the orchestra and the instrumental music teaching in schools. The school music programme offers a structured hierarchy within which it would be possible to plan repertoire and events.

The QSO’s exploration of digital and online initiatives has been assisted by a funding partnership between the QSO and the Australia Pacific LNG group. This partnership has been principally focused towards the ‘Gladstone Enrichment through Music’ (GEM) Initiative, which began in 2011. A multi-faceted outreach programme
has been targeted towards Gladstone over the past four years, which has included regular tours by QSO musicians alongside an exploration of developing digital initiatives. With the funding support from the Australia Pacific LNG the QSO has explored live streaming, web conferences and webinars, all focused towards the Gladstone project.\footnote{http://qso.com.au/regional/gem-initiative, accessed 27 May 2015. Additional information from Pam Lowry in interview.}

The web conference, for example, was presented by young Australian conductor Nathan Aspinall for teachers in Gladstone, and the first webinar was for students in the area learning the oboe. Lowry explains that the choice of instrument for the webinar was ‘made to support our teachers, by focusing on the rarer instruments angle.’\footnote{Lowry.} This is in recognition of a limitation of the Queensland instrumental music programme, in which a single teacher will often be expected to give lessons on all instruments in a ‘family’: for example a flautist might also be teaching oboe or clarinet students. While there is much to admire in the Queensland system, this is an obvious weak point, although one that it is not financially feasible to rectify as the cost of providing a teacher for every instrument in every school would put too much strain on the budget of the overall programme. The QSO is hoping to make a series of webinars focusing on various ‘rare’ instruments, and can in this way provide a much needed skills boost to teachers.

In addition to the above school and community programmes, the QSO also has a growing commitment to tertiary training and offers an orchestral internship in collaboration with the nearby Queensland Conservatorium (Griffith University). The geographical location of the two organisations, situated within 100 metres of each
other, makes a partnership extremely viable. At present, this partnership consists of the Work-Integrated Learning (WIL) Music Industry Internship, an opportunity offered annually to students at Queensland Conservatorium. Structured as a subject in their degree, the internship offers the students a close mentorship with a musician from the QSO and opportunities to play in the orchestra, receiving constructive advice and criticism. While students are not paid for their performances with the orchestra, the experience gained is of clear benefit to their progression from student to the profession.  

The ‘Journey through the Cosmos’ project, presented in November 2014, is one of the most innovative projects presented by the QSO in recent years. The four-day programme linked together music and physics and centred upon three main-stage performances on the theme of the cosmos, presented by internationally recognised particle physicist Professor Brian Cox. Originally only two performances were scheduled, but a further two were added when the demand for tickets was higher than expected.  

This clearly indicates a public interest in themed events that link different fields of endeavour to music in an innovative way, and could provide the basis for similar projects by other orchestras and arts organisations. Part of the appeal was doubtless also due to the repertoire programmed: alongside Holst’s popular ‘Planets’ Suite, the QSO also gave the world premiere of the ‘Voyager’ violin concerto, commissioned for the event by well known film composer Dario Marianelli. Alongside these concerts the project also featured supporting events including an education concert, lectures by UK musicologist Stephen Johnson, a lecture demonstration by

---

571 QSO 2014 Annual Report, p.14
Marianelli, and a music and lecture event co-hosted by Professor Brain Foster and Jack Liebeck.

While the cutbacks of the Campbell administration served as a reminder of the dependence of music education upon government support, both music education in Queensland in general and the QSO Education Department in particular appear at present to be in a strong position. The orchestra is looking to new, increasingly participatory, initiatives in order to engage with the Queensland community and, judging by the positive figures of the QSO 2014 Annual Report noted at the beginning of this case study, these new approaches are already paying dividends.⁵⁷²

⁵⁷² ibid., p.2
12.6 West Australian Symphony Orchestra

The West Australian Symphony Orchestra (WASO) is based in Perth, the capital city of the state of Western Australia, and has an annual budget of $18,910,377. The education and community engagement programming at WASO covers three main areas of activity: family and schools; young and emerging artists; and community outreach and touring. The following case study looks at the activities of each of these areas in detail, beginning with community outreach, which has been a particular focus of WASO management since 2012.

Perth is the most geographically isolated of Australia’s state capitals, and the state of Western Australia has many remote communities scattered across large distances: the state covers 2,529,875 square kilometres. A number of WASO’s initiatives are influenced by the geography of the vast state of Western Australia. Historically, WASO has offered regional tours by its education chamber orchestra [EChO] or a small chamber ensemble. However following the establishment of a Community Engagement Department in 2013 WASO is exploring new programmes that aim to establish a more lasting connection between the orchestra and its community, both in the city and the country.

One of these is the Onslow OK Me! Programme, established in June 2014 by WASO in the outback town of Onslow, with financial support by the Chevron operated Wheatstone Project. The two-year pilot programme offers free music lessons to every student from K-7, and professional development to non-music specialist teachers at the

---

573 WASO 2014 Annual Financial Report, p.8
Onslow state school. Cassandra Lake, the Executive Manager of Community Engagement at WASO, engaged two artists to deliver the programme, which is focused on percussion. They travel to Onslow three times a year for what Lake terms ‘teaching pods’. In an interesting education model, the children are taught how to build their own instruments by one of the specialist teachers, then how to play them. Lake wanted to: ‘create a music education programme which is a practical hands on model, creative play style.’

The head-teacher of the school and Lake are both so far extremely satisfied with the results of the programme. The head-teacher makes particular mention of the confidence with which the students performed at an end of year concert. The students also performed alongside the EChO during their 2015 visit to Onslow. Onslow is geographically extremely isolated: to travel there from Perth requires a two-hour flight followed by a three-hour drive. Lake makes the valid point that: ‘the school doesn’t have the funding to hire an arts specialist, and with the remote location could struggle to attract one.’ The project therefore offers the students an education opportunity that would otherwise be lacking. WASO is looking to possibly expand upon the programme. Lake notes:

It is a really exceptional model for us for working with kids in remote location. We are looking at it as a model of a way to work with a community before we visit them with the EChO or chamber ensemble.

---

576 Cassandra Lake. Executive Manager, Community Engagement, West Australian Symphony Orchestra. Interview with the author, 1 June 2015.
577 Ibid.
578 Ibid
579 Ibid.
If further developed, the Onslow model has the potential to make a significant contribution to music education provision in remote areas, and could be of interest to other orchestras looking to develop their support of this field.

Another new flagship programme was introduced by WASO in mid-2014, with the establishment of an El Sistema-inspired programme in three Kwinana schools. According to Janet Holmes a Court, Chairman of the WASO Board, this programme aims to: ‘empower children from disadvantaged backgrounds through classical music.’\(^{580}\) The programme begins with vocal lessons, percussion instruments and movement to music, with string instrumental lessons in Year 2. Sponsorship by the Stan Perron Charitable Foundation and the Fellman Family Foundation is helping WASO to provide the programme free of charge to the schools. Cassandra Lake notes that the Kwinana region, situated only 45 minutes drive from the centre of Perth: ‘has generational disadvantage, homelessness, drug abuse, crime, all the factors that we identified as ones that would indicate a community likely to benefit from a programme like Sistema.’\(^{581}\) While the Sistema programme is still new, there are signs that it can make a positive change to the children’s school life and links with community. According to Lake:

Teachers found that concentration had improved hugely over the eight-week trial period. At the start of the programme there were students who were struggling to concentrate during a thirty second listening exercise, whereas by the end of the pilot programme they were able to listen to a three and a half minute piece of music. That transferred into other classes, with teachers saying that they had noticed a much improved concentration span.\(^{582}\)

\(^{580}\) WASO 2014 Annual Report, p.3
\(^{581}\) Lake, interview.
\(^{582}\) ibid.
The WASO commitment is long-term. They hope to teach every student in the school, from pre-primary onwards, so by the time a student leaves at the end of year six they will have been in the programme for seven years. They are also aiming to link the programme to the orchestra’s main stage activity. As Lake comments: ‘One of the important considerations when a symphony orchestra takes on this kind of work is to relate it back to the symphony orchestra.’\textsuperscript{583} In order to achieve this, WASO is arranging concerts with their Education Chamber Orchestra (EChO) in Kwinana, and the students are also taken to a full WASO concert in the Perth. In a sign of the isolation in which some of the Kwinana families are living, for many children this has been their first trip to the city. WASO is hoping to affect real change for the community by aligning their work alongside that of other agencies. Lake explains:

\begin{quote}
It is a shock to learn that kids who live 45 minutes from the city are living with this level of disadvantage, or with responsibilities well beyond their years. With this programme I am really careful to say that we will not change these kids’ lives on our own. We are just one piece of the pie, and we need to work with other support agencies in the area to create opportunities and support these kids to understand that there is a life outside the one they know.\textsuperscript{584}
\end{quote}

While this programme is still in its initial stages, present signs reveal that it is already making a positive impact upon the Kwinana region. In coming years the extent of this impact shall become more apparent; here a long-term external evaluation process would be of benefit.

In 2015 WASO are trialling the Education Week model, which was first introduced in Australia by the MSO in 2011. Lake explains:

\begin{flushright}
\textsuperscript{583} ibid.\textsuperscript{584} ibid.
\end{flushright}
I think the timing is right for us to introduce an Education Week, following the restructure of the programme and the new focus on a broad range of community work.\footnote{ibid.}

WASO’s 2015 Education Week is also a celebration of the first year that they have management of the Perth Concert Hall. In Lake’s view however, it is primarily an opportunity to raise the public profile of WASO’s Education activities. Lake observes:

> It is a whole week of activities to promote what we do, and highlights to the broader community how involved we are at different touch points and levels of the community.\footnote{ibid.}

The WASO philanthropy department is running a ‘community support month’ in June, the month of Education Week, so it is also an opportunity to celebrate the programmes already receiving generous funding and hopefully to build further relationships with future funding partners.\footnote{ibid.}

WASO’s relationship with the University of Western Australia School of Music is in a growth phase, with a joint Masters of Orchestral Performance in development, although details of this programme are yet to be released.\footnote{ibid.} In addition to existing training opportunities for future orchestral musicians, WASO also offers internships for Arts Management students, and introduced an Assistant Conductor position in 2013.\footnote{ibid.}

Emerging composers are supported through the Composition Project, in which they work with Artistic Director James Ledger over three months and compose a new work, which is then recorded in a live studio performance by WASO musicians. While the WASO’s composition programme is principally aimed towards emerging young
composers, in 2015 it is to be linked with school students for the first time, with the final performance to be presented in a local high school.\footnote{Lake, interview.}


Participatory, side-by-side performances are an area of future growth for the orchestra. Lake explains:

> We have a funding application to do a big project with high school students and university students next year and we might look to incorporate choirs to sing along with our programmes.\footnote{Lake, interview.}

WASO is starting to explore this model with the ‘Rusty Orchestra’ programme, first introduced in 2014,\footnote{WASO 2014 Annual Report, p.17} and also included in the 2015 Education Week. This is an opportunity for community musicians aged 25 and over to play alongside the orchestra, similar to the MSO’s ‘Symphony in a Day.’ There is considerable room for growth in this aspect of the WASO’s education programming, as with many other Australian orchestras. In addition to the age groups mentioned by Lake, there are also
benefits to establishing participatory concerts for primary aged beginners. This could be an element to introduce in support of the Sistema-inspired Kwinana project, but would be of equal benefit to other primary schools.

At present WASO’s links with school students lie primarily with their various education concerts, in addition to the Onslow and Kwinana programmes discussed earlier. The education concerts include the ‘Kids Cushion Concert’ series and performances in schools, which also include an opportunity for students to try playing the instruments. Other education concerts include ‘Rhythm in your Rubbish’ (a junk orchestra concert); a WACE concert focused on Year 11 and 12 curriculum repertoire; a 60-minute morning symphony; and open rehearsals.\(^{596}\)

WASO also offers an opportunity for year 9-12 students to come back stage prior to a performance. Known as the ‘Back Stage Pass,’ this low cost initiative provides a simple but effective way for students to feel connected with orchestral musicians and gain insight into the backstage atmosphere before a concert.\(^{597}\) Students are given a talk in the Green Room one hour before attending a concert. As Lake comments:

> It is a simple idea in many ways but the students love coming in through back stage, they see the orchestra warm up, they have refreshments and have a talk with the musician about what it has been like that week in rehearsal, so they get the behind the scenes gossip. It gives them a personal connection to what has been happening and something to listen out for. Most people have no idea what it is like backstage, what is happening.\(^{598}\)

This model has many benefits. It is cost efficient, easily replicated and helps to connect students with the behind the scenes preparation for a concert. In addition it enables personal connection between the students and the orchestral musicians.


\(^{598}\) Lake, interview.
In order to meaningfully connect with such a vast state, it is clearly vital for WASO to explore digital and online possibilities, and they are increasingly developing this area. In 2014 WASO webcast four productions and reached 110,000 online viewers, and the 2013 Annual Report acknowledged exiting Principal Conductor Paul Daniel’s support for digital technology. In 2014 the regional tours by brass and string ensembles were supplemented by live-to-air broadcasts in partnership with the Pilbara Education Regional Office (Department of Education) and the Port Hedland School of the Air. With further exploration of this technology, the reach of the WASO school concerts can aim to truly connect with students across the entire state. In the words of Cassandra Lake: ‘An orchestra has to keep reinventing itself and look to new ways to reach people and create opportunities to engage.’ At present WASO is certainly exploring many new avenues in their attempt to create meaningful engagement with its community. The long term development and impact of current pilot community engagement programmes can potentially impact the future development of not only the WASO, but also other orchestras further afield.

**Summary and Overview**

Having analysed each Australian orchestra’s approach to education and community engagement, it is possible now to gain an overview of activity nationwide in this sector. This is summarised in the following chart:

---

599 WASO 2014 Annual Report, p.6  
600 WASO 2013 Annual Report, p.3  
601 Lake, interview.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Programme Format</th>
<th>SSO</th>
<th>ASO</th>
<th>MSO</th>
<th>QSO</th>
<th>WASO</th>
<th>TSO</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Primary Education Concerts</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secondary Education Concerts</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adult Lecture Concerts</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Side by side participatory concerts: secondary students</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Side by side: Primary Students</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Side by side: youth orchestra</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Side by side: adults</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tertiary training: linked with conservatorium/university level students</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creative workshops/lams: primary students</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creative workshops: secondary students</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher training</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sistema inspired programme</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Composition training/competition</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Music Therapy</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prison Programme</td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community Choral Event</td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Digital streaming of concerts</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pre-school/early childhood/family</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regional touring</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The above chart gives an overview of Australian Orchestral Education programming in 2015, at the time of submission. Shaded boxes indicate areas of new development by departments, which have been introduced during the past five years. Several areas of new development thus become apparent, including participatory events (both instrumental and creative based) and digital streaming of concerts.

Equally, areas not yet fully explored are also revealed, including partnerships with Youth Orchestras, Community Choral events, Adult Lecture concerts and side-by-side events with primary aged students. These areas of new and future development in Australian orchestral education programming are explored in Part Three of the Thesis.
Part Three

Key Findings and Future Development
Chapter Thirteen: Key Findings

This chapter presents and discusses the key points that have an impact upon best practice in orchestral education programmes. These have been identified through extensive research of existing materials, interviews with key figures in the field, and assessment of the detailed case studies of Part Two. The following ten key findings have been established:

1. The scope of orchestral education activities has shifted from an original focus on school education to now encompass the whole community.

2. A participatory element to programming is essential to break down barriers, engage and inspire.

3. Training for orchestral musicians in education and creative skills is important in order for them to confidently contribute to programmes.

4. Partnerships between orchestras and other institutions ensure that all contributors to the musical ecosystem are working together, and that orchestras’ resources are used to best advantage.

5. It is essential to thoroughly evaluate programmes, to ensure that best practice is being established, establish whether key aims are being met, and to provide data to possible future funding bodies.

6. A shift is developing towards programmes that establish a personal connection between musicians and participants, conducted over a long-term time period.

7. Creative based programmes developed in the United Kingdom earlier than in Australia; but they are now, at the time of writing, a growth area in Australia.

8. There is a growing awareness of the possibilities for orchestras to be of benefit to disadvantaged sectors of society.
9. The choice of venue can make a significant impact upon the result of a programme.

10. Orchestras are increasingly exploring the possibilities inherent in digital and online technology.

Each of these ten points will now be considered in more detail.

1) Establishing community relevance

A general broadening of the scope of orchestral education activities is emerging, developing from a focus on schools to a comprehensive range of programmes for the whole community. Orchestral education and community programmes now offer opportunities for life-long learning. From pre-schoolers (even newborns) to adult community musicians, or retirees interested in enriching concert attendances through lectures or educational events. Alongside this broadening of activities comes a shift in the key aims of Education Departments, from the initial aim to build the ‘audience of the future’, noted by many involved in the field in the 1990s, to the present focus on maintaining the orchestra’s relevance in the community. The importance of community relevance was frequently referred to in interviews conducted with key orchestral education personnel.

This shift in focus occurred earlier in the United Kingdom than in Australia. It is a notable feature in Australia at present: for example, WASO established a Community Engagement Department in 2013, QSO appointed a Community Liaison Officer in 2014 and MSO renamed their department Education and Community Engagement in 2014.
2) The importance of a participatory element

The second key finding is the importance of a participatory element to Education and Community programming. This is an essential component of programming for all age groups, in order to fully engage participants and enable them to find a point of personal connection with the music. There has been a developing understanding over the past fifty years by Orchestral Education Departments of the value of participatory education programming, and in the twenty-first century it has become a primary focus for their work. This development and its implications are discussed in full in Chapter Seventeen.

3) Impact of orchestral education programmes on tertiary music education

The need for further training for orchestral musicians in education and creative skills was raised throughout the study, both in study of source material and through the interview process. It was also a key finding of Julia Winterson’s evaluative study of British Orchestral Education Programmes, conducted in the late 1990s. However since Winterson’s research, the UK has developed a strong system of training in the field and it is now customary for UK tertiary music conservatories to provide training in education and workshop skills. The international impact in this area of the Guildhall School of Music in particular, and UK conservatories in general, became increasingly apparent through the course of research. This was evident both through the UK’s advocacy on this point at conferences and in publication, as well as in analysis of the course structure of UK tertiary music degrees. Graduates from the UK have established an international influence through their education work with orchestras in several countries, including Australia.
A greater focus upon providing training in these areas in Australian conservatoriums can help to develop graduates equipped with these skills, with the long-term vision to produce Australian leaders in the field. This would also ensure that education programmes would be delivered by orchestral musicians feeling confident and capable in their roles.

4) The importance of partnerships

Linked to the above point is the importance of partnerships between Symphony Orchestras and Schools, Tertiary Music Conservatoriums/Universities, Youth Orchestras and Community Orchestras. These partnerships are essential to ensure that orchestral education programmes are effective, that they provide support where most needed, and that all organisations work together to ensure that there are no gaps in music provision. The UK’s Tri-Borough and Greater Manchester Music Hubs are excellent examples of such partnership work. The partnership work of the London Symphony Orchestra with local Music Services and the Guildhall School of Music and Drama is exemplary, as is the Hallé Orchestra’s support of Whole Class Music Teaching.

While Australian symphony orchestras connect with youth orchestras and community musicians through a variety of programmes, they have not yet formalised these partnerships to the same extent as British orchestras. For example, Chapter Ten noted that the Hallé, CBSO, RSNO, RLPO, and LSO all have established umbrella youth and community choirs, and also in some cases youth orchestras. This step has not yet been taken in Australia.
Government policy has a significant impact upon the development of partnerships between orchestras and other community organisations. The UK Government has been pro-active in the arts education field for over sixty years with policy and funding commitments. In the past decade these have included the establishment of the National Plan, the development of the Music Hub system and financial support for Sistema Programmes in England and Scotland. The Australian Government has not made a similar commitment, either in policy or funding, towards the establishment of partnerships between orchestras and other organisations.

5) The importance of evaluation

The importance of evaluation of orchestral education and community programming was raised by Winterson’s thesis, as well as other key figures in the field. The Association of British Orchestras has addressed this issue in conferences and through publications. These publications, discussed in Chapter Seven, are of potential interest and value to not only British orchestras but also to international organisations. Evaluation of programmes is important for a number of reasons: it helps to ensure that programmes are effective, provides data for release to funding bodies, and can establish the long term impact of programmes.

6) Importance of a long-term connection with participants.

A focus on programmes that work intensively with small numbers of participants over an extended period of time, avoiding what some have named a ‘scatter-gun approach’, is now developing. Short-term projects, such as workshops, school visits and education concerts, have historically constituted the bulk of orchestral education
programmes. While such programmes certainly bear merit, long-term projects are better able to establish a connection between musicians and participants, and therefore have a higher likelihood of achieving a lasting impact. Examples of long-term programmes include the various El Sistema inspired programmes discussed in the thesis, the Tri-Borough Hub’s Seven Seeds project and the Aurora Orchestra’s Beacon Schools programme.

7) The creative based workshop model

A focus on creativity and composition developed early in the UK, as discussed in Chapter Six. It is in this area in particular that the UK leads the field, owing to the ground-breaking work in this field by British animateurs in the 1980s and 1990s, and the training subsequently established in British tertiary music degrees. Australian orchestras are increasingly exploring this area, through models such as the MSO Jams for Juniors and Family Jams, ASO Jams and Junior Jams, and WASO Jam on a Classic. UK animateur Paul Rissmann made a particularly strong contribution in this area during his 2015 Australian tour. Progress in Australia in this area has also benefitted from the work of Gillian Howell, Fraser Trainer, Catherine Milliken, Julian Ferraretto and Matthew Barley. There is further potential for all Australian orchestras to explore here, for example composition focused programmes linked with Australian compositions. These would take a recent Australian composition as a template and explore the methods and musical concepts that shaped it.

As noted in Chapter Six, orchestral education programmes have the potential to help children develop their creativity. Creativity is increasingly regarded as an essential quality for the future generation, although it is not at present a key focus for school
classroom education. The focus on music composition in the new Australian National Curriculum for the Arts may create a greater demand for creative-based orchestral education programmes, a point further discussed in Chapter Fourteen.

8) **The potential for orchestras to be of benefit to society, beyond their role as a concert-provider.**

The international impact of the success of the Venezuelan El Sistema has highlighted the potential of orchestral music programmes to benefit disadvantaged students, and to help create social cohesion. The potential for music programmes to assist students under-achieving at school is also being increasingly explored, for example by the Hallé in their SHINE on Manchester programme. Evaluation of these programmes is ongoing, with positive data already emerging.

The benefits of linking orchestral education programmes to music therapy are also being increasingly explored. Several orchestras in this study have established programmes in this area in recent years, including the SSO, MSO, WASO, TSO, LSO and the Hallé Orchestra. The field of music therapy itself is worthy of study in its own right; however, this is beyond the scope of the present research.

9) **The choice of venue**

Orchestras can now be found in a diverse range of venues, including large concert halls, church halls, schools, prisons, hospitals, train stations, art galleries, museums, libraries, community centres, shopping centres and even the lounge rooms of participants. Each of these venues influences the outcome of the education or community programme undertaken. Here several key venues are discussed:
• A concert hall: this is used to best effect in programmes with a participatory element, ideally with participants sharing the main stage with the orchestra. In this way, participants can experience the excitement of a concert hall stage first hand, and their achievements celebrated. Care needs to be taken when using large concert halls for school education concerts as it is difficult to connect with large audience numbers, although a screen behind the stage can help to address this issue.

• A specific education venue owned/operated by the orchestra is highly desirable. The impact of such a venue upon an orchestra’s education and community programming was clearly demonstrated in both the LSO and Hallé case studies. This arrangement can overcome scheduling difficulties, provides a welcoming and intimate environment for education activities, and allows an orchestra to fully develop its education and community programming without encountering logistical problems.

• Events held in schools bring the orchestra into direct contact with students in their own environment, and naturally help orchestras to enter into effective partnerships with school-teachers. Ideally, such programmes should feature full-time orchestra members, and should be linked back to a main-stage concert in order for students to appreciate the unique power of the orchestra in full performance.

• Events scheduled at other community venues, such as art galleries, museums, libraries and residential homes, help to link the orchestra directly into its community and take away the invisible barrier that many feel a large concert hall represents.
10. An increasing exploration of the possibilities of digital and online media for education programming.

Orchestras are increasingly exploring the ways in which digital and online media can enhance their education and community programmes. Technology offers ways to engage participants more fully and to support students and teachers through online webinars, video links and resources. Online technology can help to significantly geographically broaden the scope of an orchestra's programming, creating a more equitable level of access. This topic is more fully discussed in Chapter Eighteen.

While the above points represent the ten key findings of this research based on present and past practice in the field, the following chapters of the thesis present six points for future development. This analysis is made from an Australian perspective, with the over-arching intention being to provide a basis for discussion for the future of education and community engagement programming within Australia. The concluding Chapter of Part Three of the thesis outlines recommendations for future Australian orchestral education and community programming. These recommendations amalgamate points of best current practice in the field with areas for future development.
Chapter Fourteen: The potential impact of the new Australian National Curriculum

At the time of writing the Australian National Curriculum for the Arts, including Music, is being introduced at schools across the country. Several specific aspects of the National Music Curriculum may have particular impact on orchestral education departments. In this chapter, three of these aspects are discussed in detail.

The first is that Music has been included as part of an overall Arts Curriculum, alongside Drama, Visual Arts, Dance and Media Arts. This decision has been controversial, with Richard Gill particularly vocal in his belief that music deserves a place on its own in the curriculum. At present however, this decision appears final, and therefore for orchestras it raises the need to explore cross-arts models in their education programmes. Possibilities could include setting music to plays or movies, creating music linked to paintings or other artworks, or linking music to dance.

The second point for consideration is the focus on creativity and composition in the ‘Making’ strand of the Music Curriculum, which requires students of all levels to improvise and compose their own works. From an orchestral education perspective, this would link well with the creative music workshop model discussed in detail in Chapter Six. Students in Years 7 and 8 are expected to ‘analyse composers’ use of the

---

elements of music and stylistic features,\textsuperscript{606} and here composer led workshops could be of great benefit to students.

The Australian Curriculum takes a balanced view to the question of graphic or traditional notation, stating that knowledge of both methods will help students to become independent learners.\textsuperscript{607} The Curriculum recognises the importance of creativity in music education, intending to help students develop: ‘the confidence to be creative, innovative, thoughtful, skilful and informed musicians.’\textsuperscript{608} Australian orchestras could note that when a similar focus on creativity was introduced in the UK National Curriculum there was a significantly increased demand for orchestral education programmes in schools, in particular those involving improvisation and composition skills, as discussed in Chapter Six.

The third point for consideration by orchestral education departments is that the National Curriculum seeks to connect students with a strong understanding of Australian indigenous culture and traditions. Students of all year groups are now required to learn about Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander music and traditions, in addition to music of other cultures.\textsuperscript{609} There is a possibility here for orchestral education departments to commission new works to reflect this focus and provide teachers with a new body of resources to draw upon. Ideally, orchestras should include Aboriginal and/or Torres Strait Islander music in their schools concerts in order to increase students’ familiarity with and connection with these traditions.

Aside from these specific points, it is expected that the National Curriculum will have an impact upon the national provision of music in schools. In particular, music educators hope that the National Curriculum will help to establish a long overdue, more equitable system. The National Review of School Music Education (2005) revealed that a postcode lottery to music education in schools has developed, with poor provision for students in rural and low socio-economic areas in particular.610 Concerningly, recent research by the University of New South Wales and the Music Council of Australia has revealed that, a decade after the publication of the Review, little has changed. Irina Petrova’s research through the University of New South Wales, for example, found that in 2012 62.74% of Australian primary schools had no classroom music611 and 33.78% of secondary schools no classroom music.612 The Music Council of Australia pointed to similarly concerning figures in 2013, in its Submission to the Victorian Parliamentary Inquiry. The Submission stated that ‘only 23% of public schools offer a music education program that would meet the National Review of School Music Education Recommendations.’613

Clearly, the best solution is for all schools to have a music specialist on staff, although the costs associated with this could be prohibitive. Another solution, suggested by Richard Letts, is to look to the British system and establish further partnerships between schools and music professionals.614 Failing this, more support for general teachers is needed to develop their skills and confidence in music.

612 ibid., p.449
613 Richard Letts. Submission to the Victorian Inquiry, Music Council of Australia, 2013, p.4
614 ibid., p.10
Many studies have pointed to the need for more focus on music in Australian tertiary education degrees and prominent music educators such as Richard Gill have advocated for this step to be taken. Australian general teaching degrees offer an average of seventeen hours of music training (at best thirty-six hours), compared to two hundred and seventy hours in Finland. Finland is acclaimed both for its approach to music education and its general education system, and many feel that a connection exists between Finland’s support of music education and its overall success in school education.\textsuperscript{615}

Several studies, both in Australia and overseas, have made strong claims regarding the benefits of music and arts education in schools. Recent Australian reports and notable publications on this topic have included \textit{Education and the Arts} (2005),\textsuperscript{616} \textit{Transforming Education Through the Arts} (2012),\textsuperscript{617} \textit{National Review of School Music Education} (2005)\textsuperscript{618} and the \textit{Inquiry into the Extent, Benefits and Potential of Music Education in Victorian Schools} (Nov 2013).\textsuperscript{619} Internationally, the landmark US report \textit{Champions of Change}\textsuperscript{620} and recent UK report \textit{The Power of Music}\textsuperscript{621} have also highlighted the significant value of music and the arts in a child’s education. Despite this body of research, an appreciation of the value of music in schools is still not firmly established. It is to be hoped that the National Curriculum can be a catalyst for change,

\textsuperscript{615} Jan Kronberg (chair). \textit{Inquiry into the Benefits, Extents and Potential of Music Education in Victorian Schools}. Commissioned by the Education and Training Committee, 2013, p.98
\textsuperscript{616} Mary Ann Hunter. \textit{Education and the Arts: Research Overview}. Commissioned by the Australia Council, 2005.
\textsuperscript{620} Fiske. \textit{Champions of Change} op.cit.
\textsuperscript{621} Hallam. \textit{The Power of Music} op.cit.
and its introduction offers a fresh chance for symphony orchestra education departments to strengthen their support for music in schools, both in practical connections and in an advocacy role.

In addition to raising the standard and quantity of music training in education degrees, support also needs to be provided to general class teachers currently delivering music, and here symphony orchestra education departments can be of assistance. Many orchestras, both in Australia and internationally, already make significant efforts to support classroom teachers delivering music education. While orchestral education departments all acknowledge the importance of their support for school music education, some feel that they are being overly stretched. For example, Richard Gill has commented:

We (orchestras) do a lot of teacher insets and workshops, but there is a limit - we are not a university and we are not a teacher institute but we do more than our share in training them.622

Gill has explored various models of orchestra-led teacher training, both at the SSO and Victorian Opera, and in his present role at Musica Viva. Gill is also currently involved with the Australian Youth Orchestra’s government sponsored teacher mentorship scheme, which began in February 2015.623 He has, however, also been a vocal advocate for increasing the hours allocated to music in a general teaching degree, and this is certainly a crucial step that needs to be taken at tertiary institutions to provide sector wide change in this respect.

622 Gill. Interview by author.
While Gill is also noted for his commitment to orchestral education programmes, he feels that ideally orchestral education programming should act as a support and point of inspiration to school music education: that the teaching within schools needs to be strong within itself. Gill states: ‘My view is it is curriculum enrichment: the curriculum is a point of departure, not a point of reception.’ Gill also makes the point that orchestral education concerts can go too far in tailoring their repertoire to the curriculum:

There is no point in playing them music that they are going to hear in the classroom over and over again. But we can play some examples of that plus other examples related to that, by style, by theme, by genre, by composer etc.

Here Gill is speaking with regard to the ‘set works’ in the curriculum for certain states, and making the point that orchestral education programming should not restrict itself to those mandated works. While there is a clear benefit to students in hearing live the works set for their study, it would also be of use for them to hear in concert supplementary works to enhance their learning.

Marshall McGuire makes a similar point to Gill, in regard to the relationship between orchestras and schools:

Orchestras will continue to offer programs that complement the work that goes on in school. However, they shouldn’t be expected to become de facto providers in music. This is something which education providers need to be cognisant and active about, if future Australians are to be musically literate.

624 Gill, interview.
625 ibid.
McGuire feels that the principal aim for orchestras should be to ensure that school students have an understanding of the symphonic art form:

Increasingly, the study of classical or instrumental music in schools is diminishing and we will find ourselves with a new generation of students who will have had little or no music training or exposure. The understanding of the basics of an art-form is key to developing a relationship with an audience, just as it is in theatre, or sport, or visual arts.627

This statement encapsulates a key aim for orchestral education programming. If children do not have contact with classical music in their early, formative years, then they are unlikely to develop an appreciation for it later in life. Conversely, if children have positive, participatory experiences with classical music during their schooling years then they will have a life long point of reference with the art form. McGuire’s views influenced the WASO’s approach to education during his period as Executive Manager Artistic Planning (2006-2011) and he continues to work with young musicians in several forums.

While many orchestras in Australia and the United Kingdom have established strong links with school music education, the SSO stands as a leader in this field, assisted by the education background of past SSO Education Managers, Richard Gill and Kim Waldock. Waldock’s expertise in this area led to an invitation to be an Advisor in the development of the Arts Curriculum. This appointment provided Waldock with an opportunity to link the SSO’s education work even more closely with school curriculum, and the SSO’s reputation as a supporter of classroom music continues to grow.

627 ibid.
In summary, the impact of the new National Curriculum in the Arts upon school music education and orchestral education departments is yet to become evident. There are certainly many areas in which orchestras can continue to make a meaningful contribution to music education in schools. However, in order to rectify many present issues in Australian music education, change is also required in government policy and approaches to tertiary teacher training.

A national plan would be needed to establish a more equitable system of music education provision. To place music specialists in each school is desirable but financially demanding; therefore a partnership plan between schools and professional music organisations could well be the answer and here the British Music Hub model could be of relevance. With regard to teacher training, the need for music degrees to offer more support to students in terms of pedagogy skills was discussed in detail in Chapter Nine. Conversely, there is a clear need for tertiary teacher training to provide future graduates, particularly primary teachers, with a much greater understanding of key elements of music education.
Chapter Fifteen: The role of animateurs

The term ‘animateur’ is not generally recognised in Australia at present, although it is very commonly used in the UK. The term became popular in the UK during the 1980s, and during the 1980s and 1990s training for animateurs was gradually incorporated into the syllabus of several UK tertiary music institutions, as discussed in Chapter Nine. In 2003 a landmark report into Animateur practice defined the term as: ‘a practising artist, in any art form, who uses her/his skills, talents and personality to enable others to compose, design, devise, create perform or engage with works of art of any kind.’ In the context of this thesis, animateurs are understood to be orchestral education concert and workshop presenters who are skilled at engaging participants in learning, through both performance and creation of music.

With the increasing international acknowledgment of the importance of creativity, the skills of animateurs could potentially be under greater demand in the future. It is an area of growth in Australia; several UK-trained animateurs have been engaged to work with Australian orchestras in 2015 and in recent years. This chapter provides further information about the requirements of the role and gives insight into current best practice.

Leading US music educator Eric Booth equates an animateur with the American role of a ‘teaching artist’, a term recently also used by the MSO and WASO. In his seminal work ‘The Teaching Artist Bible,’ Booth states: ‘an animateur is basically a teaching artist placed in a position of musical leadership.’ Booth places great importance upon the role of a teaching artist, or animateur, claiming:

---

628 Animarts, The Art of the Animateur 2003, op.cit., p.9
629 Booth. The Teaching Artist Bible, op.cit., p.249
What teaching artists know and can do is essential to engaging new audiences for classical music, and for leading the entire field towards a culturally relevant future.  

Experts in the field stress the need to engage participants at the beginning of a session with a fun activity designed to put everyone at ease. For example Booth advises teaching artists to: ‘Start with success. Make sure the first activity is fast and fun and has an immediate experiential reward.’  

Paul Rissmann, one of today’s highest profile animateurs, seconds this advice. Rissmann comments:

I think it is important to make people laugh quite quickly because then they relax. With any well-structured creative workshop, you need to get people on your side quite quickly so you can start working. Everyone has this repertoire of warm up games at their disposal. I’m not a big game player because I think there is a danger that you get so wrapped up in the content of them that you forget the overview.

This point is also made by Patrick Bailey, former Education Manager at the London Philharmonic Orchestra:

I worry that some of the young leaders can do the games and be friendly but they don’t have really sharp musical skills. Fraser Trainer is someone we have worked with a lot. He has a very calm energy and is very good at communication but what makes him a good workshop leader is that he is a really good musician with a very good ear and is a composer himself. He is able to challenge and stretch people musically.

The ‘warm up games’ frequently involve clapping, body percussion and call and response. As Rissmann notes, they are designed to combine musical objectives with setting a positive atmosphere for the session. While they serve a useful purpose and are

---

630 ibid., p.6
631 ibid., p.201
always popular with students, it is certainly important to ensure that they are only a means to an end, not the main focus of a session.

Leading animateurs such as Rissmann and Fraser Trainer combine a sense of playfulness with an underlying commitment to connect participants meaningfully with orchestral music. It is important to be able to quickly enable participants to unlock elements of works from the orchestral canon and make personal connections with them. Rissmann explains:

The real secret of success creatively is you need to find a way to make your instructions as simple as humanly possible, to reduce Stravinsky to its bare bones; for instance you can reduce the beginning of Petrushka to basically four notes. Doing that level of preparation and planning beforehand is vital so that when you are in that creative situation you are ready to fly.634

Compositions by Igor Stravinsky are often used by animateurs as a starting point for programmes. Rissmann explains this is because: ‘he enables you to very easily connect people to the rhythm.’635 Rhythm is more often used as the point of access than melody, as it ‘is the easiest way to get people to participate: people are much happier to clap and count than they are to sing.’636 Rissmann gives as an example a crowd participation activity that he directed with the LSO at a concert in Trafalgar Square, when 10,000 people clapped the rhythm of Stravinsky’s Augurs of Spring.

As animateurs frequently lead projects that aim to create new pieces of music, there is often an assumption that they need to be a composer. Rissmann disputes this however:

634 Rissmann.
635 ibid.
636 ibid.
To be a good animateur you don’t have to be a composer; it’s like people saying that they can’t improvise because they’re not a jazz musician, it’s very limiting. Of course it helps to be a composer.\textsuperscript{637}

Sean Gregory, Director of Creative Learning at the GSMD, agrees:

You need musicians who can perform, communicate, lead and facilitate, who can create and respond creatively. It doesn’t mean they have to be a top class composer but you can respond to ideas. You need to be able to improvise, and not just in the jazz sense of the way, but just to be able to play with music and aurally pick up on things and come up with ideas and respond with ideas.\textsuperscript{638}

Fraser Trainer, a leading animateur in his own right, is also at the forefront of teaching the next generation of animateurs, both at the GMSD and RCM. Trainer stresses the need for an animateur to bring a new skill to the group they are working with, but says that it can be as ‘a composer or a musician.’\textsuperscript{639} Trainer takes a collaborative approach, guiding the group in the creative process. While Trainer also acknowledges the need for preparation stressed by Rissman, he makes the point that an animateur needs to respond to each workshop in an organic way. ‘Music has its own logic and it’s important to follow that and balance it with the needs of the group.’\textsuperscript{640} A composer himself, Trainer enjoys using his skills as an animateur to demystify contemporary music:

I am a believer that you can do anything in those creative situations. I don’t think there is a kind of music that you can’t work with or shouldn’t employ. I’ve done a lot of work with what people might perceive as very challenging contemporary music and I love that challenge, I really enjoy it.\textsuperscript{641}

\textsuperscript{637} ibid.
\textsuperscript{638} Gregory, interview by author, 2015.
\textsuperscript{639} Trainer, interview by author, 2015.
\textsuperscript{640} ibid.
\textsuperscript{641} ibid.
A key task for animateurs is to help workshop participants feel at ease when creating music. To achieve this it is best to give instructions that create the right balance of freedom and direction. Trainer explains:

You might give a starting point and say we are going to make a melody that is fifteen beats long with five pitches. The idea that a performer has a creative choice to make can be new to people when they start doing creative work as a participant, so some kind of template or framework can be very useful. Right at the beginning people can find that quite difficult but once you have worked that out then you are starting to inhabit the world of a composer- why have I decided to do this and not that, and what is it that I have done? If you analyse what you have done then you are starting to develop a compositional technique because you can follow that through or do that in a different context or with a different instrument, so it is starting to open up that individual creativity and find reasons for doing that.  

The 2005 GSMD publication ‘The Reflective Conservatoire’ gives insight into recent practice in the animateur role and the creative music workshops they commonly lead. A chapter written by Sean Gregory, entitled ‘The creative music workshop: a contextual study of its origin and practice,’ is of particular interest. Gregory notes differing ways to spark creativity at the beginning of a workshop session, such as a skeleton score of notated rhythms, melodies or harmonies; a theme; or a narrative text. He also stresses the importance of rehearsing and refining as the new composition develops, with the animateur evaluating, listening and guiding the process.  

Peter Wiegold, a leading UK animateur who initiated the GSMD’s training in this field, looks for the ‘third arm’ between free improvisation and notated

642 ibid.
composition, for instance by giving performers prompts, or working from a skeleton score, stating: ‘there is a simplistic view that music is either written or improvised…But there are a thousand worlds in between.’\(^{644}\) Wiegold explains that he looks for the aspects of a score that allow performers to exercise their creativity and interpretative skills. For instance he may ask for a high trill, finished with a flourish, or ask for arpeggiation of certain chords for a set number of bars. Wiegold explains: ‘Much of my research has been about this critical balance. What frees musicians while maintaining integrity and purpose in the music?’\(^{645}\)

While the visits by UK animateurs to Australian orchestras have had a positive impact, it is important for Australia to now look to develop its own workshop leaders with creative skills. This will allow Australian orchestras to offer long-term sequential programmes with a creative focus, rather than short-term intensive projects facilitated by a visiting international animateur. For this to be achieved, the visits of UK animateurs to Australia need to include professional development workshops for musicians within the orchestra with which they are working. It is also important, as discussed in Chapter Nine, for Australian Conservatoriums to offer training in the skills required by the animateur role. Such training needs to include skills in improvisation, collaborative composition and public speaking. Identifying within the Australian music community those individuals with the necessary combination of charisma, creative flair and passion for music education, and offering them support and training, will potentially help to create exciting new possibilities for Australian orchestral education programmes.

\(^{644}\) Peter Wiegold. ‘But Who Will Make their Tea?’ Harmony. Forum of the Symphony Orchestra Institute, No. 12, April 2001, p.4

\(^{645}\) ibid., p.5
Chapter Sixteen: Recognition of benefits for orchestral musicians

The primary focus for orchestral education programmes to this date has been their ability to be of service to the community. However there is also a growing recognition of the positive impact that participation in education programmes can have upon the personal development and job satisfaction of orchestral musicians themselves. A member of the London Symphony Orchestra involved in its education programming has observed: ‘I now feel like a musician again, rather than an instrumental operative.’ Education programmes allow players to express their individual musicality freely, a welcome outlet for players who usually need to put their personal opinions aside in deference to ensemble cohesion. Animateur Fraser Trainer confirms that his own experiences working with orchestral musicians in creative workshop programmes have revealed this benefit:

The musicians that I have worked with said that there is an extra element of creativity and responsibility for them. Within an orchestral setting you are often not making too many choices yourself about what you do, where you go, who you play to, the way you play, when you play. So being involved in creative work, suddenly you are a musician that has a really strong important creative role and you can start to make decisions about how the music should sound and the way it should go and how it should be played. So I think that is very enriching. There are certainly some people here in the UK where the introduction of this kind of work has refreshed their whole career and their whole perspective on music making.

Several surveys of orchestral musicians have revealed low levels of job satisfaction, despite the high competition for such positions. In 1991 a survey of orchestral musicians from selected US, UK and German orchestras placed orchestral players’ job


\[647\] Trainer, interview.
satisfaction at a lower level than federal prison guards. Professional string quartets, on the other hand, reported extremely high levels of job satisfaction, placing first in the survey.\textsuperscript{648} The obvious inference to be made from this data is that the higher level of independence and responsibility required by chamber music contributes to greater work satisfaction. As many orchestral education programmes involve performances by small chamber ensembles, orchestral musicians are thus able to access the benefits of chamber music within their orchestral career.

While most research in this area has come from the US, there is also clear relevance for Australian orchestras. A recent survey of Australian orchestral musicians returned concerning data regarding levels of psychological stress and job dissatisfaction. Many participants also reported problems with alcohol and drug dependency. Findings from this survey were published in the report ‘Psychological well-being in professional orchestral musicians in Australia: A descriptive population study.’\textsuperscript{649} The report warns:

\begin{quote}
This study has identified a significant pattern of anxiety, depression and health behaviours that require attention in occupational health and safety policies and programmes for this workforce.\textsuperscript{650}
\end{quote}

From 377 participants drawn from all Australia’s professional orchestras, 32\% gave a positive depression screen and 22\% answered affirmative for a question screening for post-traumatic stress disorder.\textsuperscript{651} In light of these issues, it is clearly important to consider seriously the current orchestral career and ways that it can be modified to

\textsuperscript{648} J. Allmendinger; R. Hackman and E. Lehman. ‘Life and Work in Symphony Orchestras’, \textit{The Musical Quarterly}, Vol.80 (2), Summer 1996, p.201
\textsuperscript{650} ibid, abstract.
\textsuperscript{651} ibid.
improve quality of life and job satisfaction. The benefits of participation in education work for orchestral musicians deserve to be carefully considered by orchestral management.

In addition to the benefits of taking part in chamber music performances or creative based workshops, Margaret Moore, former Education Manager of the SSO, notes that there are also benefits for players in taking a more traditional teaching role.

When you have to talk about what you are doing and articulate it to someone else often it helps you to reflect on your own practice. I think that it is a really important part of an education programme that maybe gets ignored sometimes.\footnote{M. Moore. Interview by author.}

In explaining music or techniques to others, the teachers themselves gains a better understanding of their practice. For example, Eric Booth discusses the results from an American survey of orchestral musicians involved in education work: ‘Being a teaching artist makes you a better artist.’\footnote{Booth. \textit{Teaching Artist Bible}, op.cit., p.42} Booth goes on to state:

\begin{quote}
Teaching, most of the respondents stated, changes you as a performer. The change mentioned most frequently was becoming freer in performance, looser and braver at improvisation.\footnote{ibid., p. 43}
\end{quote}

As well as helping players in their sense of personal fulfilment, participation in education programmes can also help to achieve a better understanding of a composition, and can help to shape an interpretation. Fraser Trainer explains:

\begin{quote}
It puts you very much in touch with an audience. It is very tangible, you know immediately in that setting if you are doing something that is working or not. As a performer on stage in a concert scenario you don’t very often have a direct close contact with your audience.\footnote{Trainer, interview.}
\end{quote}
While Trainer comes from a composition background, his point about receiving direct audience feedback is pertinent to both performers and composers. Trainer also observes that education programmes provide possibilities for orchestral players to connect with each other in different ways, helping to establish a better sense of chamber music within the larger ensemble. He comments:

Musicians sometimes find things out through these projects about the music they are playing that they wouldn’t have otherwise known or encountered. I recently did a project here where we explored Shostakovich 1st cello concerto and we had a couple of workshops on the piece and discussions about what it is we wanted to explore. Suddenly we had situations where for example the clarinets were engaging with the viola part. That can only be a good thing really, to bring home the compositional makeup of a piece of music to the musicians.\textsuperscript{656}

The large number of players in a symphony orchestra can hamper connections such as this between different sections of an orchestra, and players therefore largely rely upon a conductor to draw such connections to their attention. It will undoubtedly make for a stronger performance, as well as a more engaging experience for the musicians, if they are fully aware of their place in the overall construction of the piece they are performing.

A recent study tested the hypothesis that participation in education programmes is beneficial for the well-being and job satisfaction of orchestral musicians. The researchers, Abeles and Hafeli, compiled data from 47 musicians from two US orchestras relating to their participation in education programmes.\textsuperscript{657} Abeles and Hafeli note the implications of an earlier study by Parasuraman and Purohit (2000), which ‘identified the lack of artistic integrity- which leads to “boredom stress”‘- as a major

\textsuperscript{656} ibid.

contributor to the stress orchestra musicians report. They suggest that part of the problem is a dichotomy between orchestral musicians’ training and work life:

This subordination of orchestra members’ individual autonomy as artists conflicts with how orchestra members are educated (Baumel and Bowen 1966). Typically, musicians’ education focuses on their development as solo performers and emphasises the creative and aesthetic dimensions of musicianship.

This loss of independence could be surmised to principally affect string rank and file players. Hafeli and Abeles’ research returned promising results. Their interviews and observations of the 47 musicians led them to the following conclusion:

It was clear to us that the musicians felt rewarded, on more than one level, for their work in the programs and these rewards may help to resolve the tensions present in other parts of their profession, increasing their commitment to the organization.

The report included a quote from a musician known as ‘Amy’, who commented:

To play in an orchestra is to sacrifice individuality in favour of group blend, and this program provides a creative outlet to fill that artistic void.

While this is a field that would benefit from further quantitative data, anecdotal responses such as these would seem to prove true the prediction made by Peter Renshaw in 1992, as the industry was first emerging. Renshaw envisioned that:

As orchestras become transformed into an integrated community of musicians and management, the players will have an increasing opportunity to play a central role in major decision making...This constitutes nothing less than a renaissance for orchestral players. They will rediscover who they are as individual musicians; their engagement with

658 ibid. p.36
659 ibid. p.36
660 ibid. p.47
661 ibid. p.45
music is regenerated from the inside; the possibility of making many different kinds of music is rekindled; with newly acquired skills the opportunity to reach out and serve the community is now feasible.\textsuperscript{662}

Recognition of the benefits of education and community engagement work for orchestral musicians continues to grow. While this should not be the primary motivation in planning an orchestra’s education and community engagement programming, it is a significant consideration. Orchestras are staffed by talented and creative people and, as in all workplaces, it is important to ensure that their skills are being effectively utilised. It is however important to note that care should be taken to match players to the style of education programming to which they are best suited. Additionally, in order for musicians to fully experience the benefits of education and community engagement activities they need to feel suitably equipped with the knowledge and skills necessary, and here earlier points regarding training and professional development are relevant. When fully prepared and confident in their roles, orchestral musicians can find education programmes a welcome chance to express their personal musicality. The leadership, collegiality, creativity and engagement required in leading education programmes can balance the conformity often required by an orchestral career.

\textsuperscript{662} Peter Renshaw. ‘Orchestras and the Training Revolution,’ \textit{British Journal of Music Education}, Vol.9 (1), March 1992, p.69
Chapter Seventeen: Importance of participatory education programmes

As this thesis has shown, one of the chief differences between Australian and British orchestral education programming is that the UK developed a participatory approach earlier than Australia. It is common for orchestras in the UK to offer education programmes where new music is composed in workshop settings, or where there are opportunities for students of all levels to perform alongside the orchestra in high profile main-stage concerts. By linking participants directly to the professional activities of performers and composers they are offered an illuminating and inspiring insight into the reality of the profession. As well as the value offered by such programmes to participants, there are also many benefits for the orchestra and the classical music industry as a whole.

Research has shown that participatory education programming is the most likely to result in a long-term connection with symphonic music, and is more likely to encourage participants to be active audience members. One of the most significant classical music consumer surveys in recent years was the Classical Music Consumer Segmentation Study How Americans Relate to Classical Music and their Local Orchestras. With 25,000 interviewees it was the largest discipline specific arts consumer study ever undertaken in the United States. Findings from this survey informed the influential report entitled: The Search for Shining Eyes: Audiences, leadership and Change in the Symphony Orchestra Field.

663 Bridging the Gap: Innovations to Save Our Orchestras. Commissioned by the Knight Foundation, 2003, p.1
From 1994-2004 $13 million in funding was granted by the ‘John S. and James L. Knight Foundation’ to 15 US orchestras. This funding grant was originally sparked by a paper by Frederick Starr, president of Oberlin College, presented at the American Symphony Orchestra League’s 1988 annual conference.\cite{665} Starr argued that orchestral concert audiences were declining because the orchestras were no longer in touch with their communities. He proposed several remedies, including breaking down barriers between players and audience, and scheduling concerts of a variety of times and lengths. Inspired by Starr’s concepts, the Knight Foundation established a funding programme that aimed to help his visions become reality. Following the initial period of funding, the Knight Foundation commissioned the cultural research firm Audience Insight LLC to oversee an audience survey, as well as engaging Philliber Research Associates to undertake site-specific evaluations on the impact of their donations. The chief findings of the survey and evaluations were as follows:

- There is no evidence that exposure programmes for children, especially large concert format offerings for school children will turn them into ticket buyers as adults.
- Free programming and outreach do not turn people into ticket buyers. They simply turn them into consumers of free programming.
- Traditional audience education efforts- targeted to the uninitiated- generally end up serving those who are most knowledgeable and most involved with orchestras.

\cite{665} ibid., p.8
Participatory music education—primarily instrumental lessons, ensemble and choral programmes—will turn people into ticket buyers as adults.\textsuperscript{666}

While the bulk of these findings are dispiritingly negative, the final point offers a more positive message. The Knight Report reiterates the importance of participatory programming further in the study, stating:

Participatory education programs—ones on which children actually played instruments and sang in choruses—were strongly correlated with later concert attendance.\textsuperscript{667}

It should be noted that the Knight Foundation funding, and research, was primarily undertaken with the intent to build wider and larger audiences for struggling American orchestras. As noted earlier in the thesis, the primary focus at present in Australia and the UK is on the present impact of education programmes, not future audience development. However the Knight Foundation research is still of great interest, and proves that participatory education programmes are likely to have a long-lasting impact.

In Australia the lecture concert format has been the norm up until recent years, with the Melbourne Symphony Orchestra the earliest to explore more participatory activities in depth. This has been acknowledged by several key figures working in the field today. For example Marshall McGuire has stated:

More could be done to facilitate a more active program of events for students. At the moment, most of our education programs involve passive engagement—sitting in a hall listening to a performance. More hands-on activities with professional players could see a greater engagement with young audiences, and this sector as a whole. Programs such as AusKick, an

\textsuperscript{666} ibid., p.6
\textsuperscript{667} ibid., p.33
AFL program designed to get kids involved from an early age, could serve as apposite models. Getting on stage (on the field) with your favourite orchestral player and playing (kicking) with them could stimulate an interest in classical music much better than just sitting and watching.\textsuperscript{668}

The question of why Australian orchestras have been comparatively slow in establishing participatory education programmes by international standards is an interesting one. It is the view of the author that the relative conservatism of the Australian approach, particularly in relation to the avant-garde nature of many UK offerings, is the result of the control over the Australian orchestra network by the ABC, only broken during the divestment process. It is worth noting that in the UK the most adventurous and radical education programming has tended to come from the independently governed orchestras not under BBC protection. This view is supported by Bronwyn Lobb, Education Manager at the Melbourne Symphony Orchestra. Lobb comments:

I think it could be because for so long the orchestras were tied to the ABC and they were broadcast orchestras, as opposed to something to like the Philharmonia which is member run where each of those players have an investment in the orchestra and it is a very different approach.\textsuperscript{669}

Lobb has worked to maintain and strengthen the MSO’s participatory approach to education programming, also a focus of her predecessors. Lobb comments: ‘Most of our programmes have an element of participation, especially for younger audiences, and that’s really important.’\textsuperscript{670}

The question of how to balance the scales between participation and education was central to the planning of education programmes at each orchestra studied for this

\textsuperscript{668} McGuire. op.cit.
\textsuperscript{669} Lobb. Interview by author, 2012.
\textsuperscript{670} ibid.
project. Although the Sydney Symphony’s Education Department has been known for an uncompromising focus on education, not entertainment, Margaret Moore makes the point that participation is key to education. Moore states:

I would always err on the side of participatory because I think the more participate, the more you engage, the more you learn, the more you get out of it, the more meaningful it is. The more passive you are the less that equation happens. 671

In recent years the Sydney Symphony has begun to explore more participatory education programming. Perhaps the creative workshop, as discussed in Chapter Six, could be explored to further support the SSO’s focus on contemporary Australian composition. The creative workshop format is highly participatory yet also firmly educational, especially when used to illustrate and explain composition techniques. Margaret Moore saw that as one of the roles of the SSO’s education work:

I also think that one of the roles of the orchestras is to commission music from new composers and to encourage young people to engage not just with listening to music but understanding it and examining it and teaching them tools and things to be able to engage it and demystify it. You can sell things to kids if you do it in the right way, and older people too. Older audiences are often very interested in new music if you present it to them with a bit of information and sort of contextualise it. 672

While the SSO has demonstrated a strong commitment to contemporary composition, there is further potential for them, and other Australian orchestras, to increase the participatory side of their education programming. At the present date this is a key area of growth in Australian orchestral education programming. Further development of participatory programmes will help to create a deeper personal connection with music in both the younger generation and the general community. This will strengthen

671 M. Moore, interview.
672 ibid.
activity in music at the grassroots level, and thereby benefit the entirety of the music ‘ecosystem’.
Chapter Eighteen: Development of digital and online initiatives

All orchestras consulted in this research were engaged in further exploration of digital and online technology. Orchestras are increasingly looking to widen their access through the utilisation of live streaming, webinars, online resources and video channels. Some orchestras have also put considerable resources into establishing educational Apps and interactive digital installations, and the use of technology to enhance live concerts is also being explored. There are obvious benefits to the incorporation of digital technology into education programmes. This is especially true for a country such as Australia, with vast distances between capital cities and many isolated communities. The BBC Ten Pieces programme, discussed in Chapter Eleven, has successfully used the internet to involve children across the whole of the UK, including remote areas such as the Hebrides, as discussed in Chapter Eleven.

In Australia the Australian Chamber Orchestra (ACO) and Melbourne Symphony Orchestra lead the field in digital and online initiatives at present, although the SSO, QSO and WASO are also exploring new models. The ACO’s flagship programme in this area is ‘ACO Virtual’, an audio-visual installation released in mid 2013. The 30-minute installation creates the sense of being part of the ACO in performance, with projections of thirteen musicians surrounding you and sound coming from the direction of their projection. Interactive possibilities include isolating different instruments, seeing players in close up, playing along or following along on scores. In 2014 and 2015 the installation has been offered at selected Art Galleries, Arts Centres and the Darwin Entertainment Centre. There is also the possibility for schools to access it although they need to negotiate the logistics with the ACO. The ACO is also looking

to develop online lessons, starting with a cello lesson focused on Baroque techniques.\textsuperscript{674}

In June 2015 the MSO live streamed an education concert led by Paul Rissmann, in a new initiative that looks likely to become common practice in coming years.\textsuperscript{675} The MSO’s key focus digitally has been the ‘Learn App’, launched in June 2011, which explores the various instrument groups of the orchestra through graphics, interviews with fifteen MSO players and un-compressed audio.\textsuperscript{676} In the 2011 Annual Report it was stated that: ‘MSO Learn is a potent symbol of our move towards a fully integrated digital future,’ revealing that this is acknowledged as an important area for future growth by MSO management.\textsuperscript{677} Bronwyn Lobb gives insight into the development phase of creating the App:

The funding had come through just as I started and we then came up with the idea and worked with the developers to create the App. I was quite inspired by a Philharmonia Orchestra project I’d seen in London called Re-Rite where you were able to get close to orchestra sections in different ways.\textsuperscript{678}

The App has been a highly successful venture for the MSO. It has been downloaded more than 87,000 times over the past four years and has established an international profile.\textsuperscript{679} As well as providing insight into the inner workings of the orchestra, it helps to establish a personal connection with the musicians through interviews that cover a wide range of topics such as their choice of instrument, favourite books and opinions


\textsuperscript{675} http://splash.abc.net.au/livestream/-/l/1869205/meet-the-orchestra-live-stream-, accessed 1 August 2015.

\textsuperscript{676} https://itunes.apple.com/au/app/mso-learn/id441422027?mt=8, accessed 1 August 2015.

\textsuperscript{677} 2011 MSO Annual Report, p.2

\textsuperscript{678} Lobb, interview. 2012

\textsuperscript{679} 2014 MSO Annual Report, p.29
on Melbourne’s best restaurants. Lobb speaks of being inspired by the Philharmonia Orchestra’s digital initiatives, and they are the acknowledged leader internationally in this field.

The Philharmonia Orchestra’s 2009 digital installation ‘Re-Rite’, based on a performance of Stravinsky’s Rite of Spring, was the first of its kind at that date. Filmed using multi-camera angles, it is designed to give an immersive experience of being part of the orchestra during their performance. This project was selected for the Royal Philharmonic Society award for audience development, and has been taken on tour by the Philharmonia, both within the UK and internationally. It had a particularly strong impact in China, with 85,000 visitors in Tianjin. The Philharmonia has recently released a new digital installation project, ‘Universe of Sound’. Both Re-Rite and Universe of Sound were strongly backed by the Chief Conductor of the Philharmonia, Esa-Pekka Salonen, and were conducted by him. A ‘conductor camera’ allows audiences to have a musician’s view of Salonen, revealing the way that he uses his facial expressions and gestures to draw out the music.

The Universe of Sound installation features Kinect technology (as used by X-Box) to allow visitors to try conducting the orchestra, as well as giant video displays and touch screens. Aimed at both novices and experts, it again won the Royal Philharmonic Society Award for Audiences and Engagement in 2013. Universe of Sound is based on a performance of Holst’s The Planets and premiered at London’s Science Museum as part of the cultural festivities for the 2012 Olympics. Also available on DVD and Blu-Ray, it is being prepared for international touring, although it requires

680 http://www.philharmonia.co.uk/re-rite/, accessed 3 March 2015.
681 ibid.
682 http://www.philharmonia.co.uk/universeofsound, accessed 4 March 2015.
a large space such as a concert hall, warehouse, or gallery.\textsuperscript{683} The Philharmonia’s iPad App ‘The Orchestra’ is featured in Apple ads and was awarded the RPS Award for Creative Communication.\textsuperscript{684} ‘Sound Exchange’ is a further resource created by the Philharmonia, which includes 3,000 samples of music recorded by the orchestra’s musicians to be used as a composing and creating tool.\textsuperscript{685}

Digital outreach is a key area of growth for the LSO, as for many orchestras internationally. The facilities at LSO St Luke’s, in particular the Candide Discovery Room, have enabled growth in this area, allowing the LSO to explore digital ways of connecting with communities. The Discovery Room is equipped with 10 computers, audio software, microphones, acoustic and electronic instruments and access to the LSO’s audio sample archive. The LSO’s Digital Technology Group is open to thirteen to twenty year olds from East London who meet weekly to explore ways of using technology in creating music.\textsuperscript{686} There are also many videos on the LSO website, covering areas such as masterclasses, audition tips, interviews with visiting soloists and conductors, and A Level Seminars presented by Rachel Leach and Paul Rissmann.\textsuperscript{687}

The Director of LSO Discovery, Judith Ackrill comments:

There’s been a fundraising appeal called ‘Moving Music’ which was specifically to raise some millions towards digital outreach. Firstly, adding into Live more resources for teaching, secondly streaming concerts of various kinds and thirdly presenting online learning for various age groups. Currently we are looking at things that have been created specifically for digital purposes and that’s an expensive business. We are also interested in playing with digital in the concert hall, both with cameras on instruments and people holding things that they can access through their phones.

\textsuperscript{683} ibid.
\textsuperscript{684} http://www.philharmonia.co.uk/shop/114/the_orchestra_app, accessed 12 June 2015.
\textsuperscript{685} http://www.philharmonia.co.uk/explore, accessed 12 June 2015.
\textsuperscript{686} http://lso.co.uk/lso-discovery/community/digital-technology-group, accessed 20 May 2015.
\textsuperscript{687} http://lso.co.uk, accessed 20 May 2015.
Sending ourselves out digitally is the big priority for the next phase of the LSO’s life.\textsuperscript{688}

As part of their move into the digital field, the LSO launched LSO Play in 2013.\textsuperscript{689} LSO Play is an interactive web based platform that features performances by the LSO of Ravel’s Bolero and Berlioz’s Symphonie Fantastique. By filming with multiple camera angles, viewers are able to watch up to four streams simultaneously, including a close up of chief conductor Valery Gergiev. Aimed at complementing the orchestra’s education work, it is designed with schools in mind, and includes resources such as background information about the repertoire and instruments, masterclasses and commentary by LSO players. It is differentiated from the Philharmonia’s ground-breaking app, ‘The Orchestra,’ as it is free and does not require Apple compatibility, being accessible by any computer with flash. Upon the launch, McDowell issued this statement:

Providing access to the LSO through innovative use of video content and digital platforms is at the very heart of LSO Discovery, and I’m delighted that LSO Play launches today featuring the first of many high quality films of LSO concerts. I hope that the public will enjoy seeing the performances from angles which are usually seen only by the musicians and conductor.\textsuperscript{690}

The Moving Music appeal has raised a sizeable total of nine million pounds, which can potentially make the work of the Discovery team available to the widest possible audience.\textsuperscript{691}

\textsuperscript{688} Ackrill. Interview by author, 2015.
\textsuperscript{689} http://play.lso.co.uk, accessed 21 May 2015.
\textsuperscript{690} ibid.
\textsuperscript{691} Retrieved from: http://lso.co.uk/support-us/moving-music-campaign, accessed 5 August 2015.
As people increasingly depend upon their mobile devices, it also follows that orchestras should ensure they have as large a presence there as possible. The Sydney Symphony Mobile App links pre-concert preparation activities and information and streams live performances to mobile web devices. Margaret Moore feels that there is also a case for further exploration of technology during the concert experience itself. In interview with the author Moore noted that the use of ear-pieces with audio commentary could potentially be explored in the future, as well as further usage of screens to provide visual enhancement to the concert. The New World Centre in Miami is a leading example of how technology and architecture can be used to enhance a concert experience. Designed by Frank Gehry in consultation with Michael Tilson Thomas (Music Director of the resident New World Symphony), the Centre allows maximum involvement between the audience and performers, including sail-like panels on to which images can be projected.

The Adelaide Symphony Orchestra is also exploring new ways to use technology to engage audiences. In July 2015 the ASO trialled a new Samsung Gear Virtual Reality headset that combines immersive audio with goggles that provide a 360 degree view of the orchestra, filmed using 14 Go-Pro cameras. The Managing Director of the ASO, Vincent Ciccarello, explains:

We see it as an opportunity to introduce people to the world of orchestral music mediated by the latest technology. Given that technology is playing such an important role in the delivery of all forms of entertainment, we want to embrace that.

---

693 M. Moore, interview.
In 2015 this technology is offered in the ASO’s ‘Classics Unwrapped’ series, however Ciccarello is also looking to introduce the concept to schools concerts as a way to enhance students’ learning.\textsuperscript{696}

To those who worry that developments in technology will make live performance obsolete, Peter Wiegold reminds us that the live performance will always have its own unique strength:

\begin{quote}
We have one ace up our sleeve. The sense of occasion. The unique moment that could only happen there and then, in that hall, in that community, between those people.\textsuperscript{697}
\end{quote}

In a world that is increasingly influenced by digital and online media, this reminder of the potency of a live experience is timely. While digital media have a significant potential to allow for greater access to orchestral education programmes, their primary role should still remain to disseminate and enhance live performances, not to replace them.

\textsuperscript{696} ibid.
\textsuperscript{697} Peter Wiegold. ‘But who will make their Tea?’ \textit{Harmony, Forum of the Symphony Orchestra Institute}, No. 12, April 2001, p.8
Chapter Nineteen: The Placement of Education Departments within the orchestra

The need for education and community engagement programmes to be closely aligned with orchestral main-stage work was emphasised by many interviewees consulted for this project. There remains at the present date a danger that education and community engagement programmes may operate as satellite activities, disconnected from an orchestra’s main series of concert performances. This issue is gaining attention across the international sector, and was a focal point for the recent League of American Orchestras National Conference, held in May 2015. In his opening address, Jesse Rosen, the CEO of the League of American Orchestras, noted the need for orchestras to: ‘Integrate community engagement in all activity; it’s a value, not a programme.’ Rosen also commented:

“Community engagement”, though, is a problematic term. We often use it to describe ancillary activity that often has little or nothing to do with the orchestra in its essential form, giving concerts of classical music in its main stage series.

Here Rosen has encapsulated the problem: while orchestras may wish to engage with the community, this connection has not truly developed unless the activities of education departments are truly linked to the heart of the orchestra. The closing session of the Conference, chaired by Eric Booth, was also focused on this issue. With the theme: ‘The next frontier is Center Stage [sic]: Enhancing the Relevance of our Core Artistic Work,’ this session was devoted to looking for ways to correct this situation and

---

achieve a closer alignment between the experimental activities of orchestral education departments and main stage concert performances.

The main requirement for this integration to occur is a close dialogue and collaboration between Orchestra Managing Directors, Artistic Directors and Education Managers. This will enable education programmes to enhance and support the orchestra’s long-term artistic and strategic planning. This point was first raised more than two decades ago by Peter Renshaw, whose role in establishing education training for UK orchestral musicians was discussed in Chapter Nine. According to Renshaw:

The success of any training and development programme depends initially on the conviction and enthusiasm of the Managing Director and key Board members...The long-term aim, then, must be to integrate this developmental work into the central artistic policy of the orchestra. This can only be realised with the full support and active involvement of the Music Director.⁶⁹⁹

Although Renshaw was writing in 1992, this ‘long-term aim’ cannot yet be said to have yet been established sector wide.

There are positive indications however that Education Managers are increasingly being given deeper support by their Orchestral Board Members, Senior Management and Chief Conductors. In Australia, for instance, the Melbourne and West Australian Symphony Orchestras have both recently established new Departments for Community Engagement, with the result that their Education Managers are now Senior Management staff. Bronwyn Lobb gives insight into the positive impact of this structural development at the Melbourne Symphony:

To have Education and Community sitting on Senior Management makes quite a big difference in how we operate: in how quickly we can respond to things and in understanding what other aspects are coming into play with regard to the orchestra’s time or other programme opportunities. It has really helped to position Education and Community Engagement [ECE] in everyone’s mind as an equal contributor to the organisation, so it has been a really positive step for the organisation.\textsuperscript{700}

Cassandra Lake, Community Engagement Director of the West Australian Symphony Orchestra has also noted similar benefits after her role was incorporated into Senior Management in 2013. Lake states:

\begin{quote}
It means that as we do our long-term planning as an organisation we can look to see what we are doing in terms of bringing education and outreach work alongside main stage concert hall activity.\textsuperscript{701}
\end{quote}

As noted in the case study for the West Australian Symphony Orchestra, several new flagship initiatives have already been introduced since the establishment of the Community Engagement Department. Lake notes that this growth was achieved with support from the orchestra’s CEO and Senior Management:

\begin{quote}
The impetus behind our programme started at a high level of strategic planning for the organisation. Our CEO and his team looked at the whole organisation when writing a Strategic Plan a couple of years ago, and decided that what they really wanted to do was invest themselves in the community, in terms of the relevance of the organisation to the community. So he changed the structure of the organisation. At that time there was an Education Manager who answered to the Artistic Planning Executive. They took Education out from Artistic Planning where it had always historically sat and created a Community Engagement Department.\textsuperscript{702}
\end{quote}

\textsuperscript{700} Lobb. Interview by author, 2015  
\textsuperscript{701} ibid.  
\textsuperscript{702} Lake. Interview by author, 2015
Lake feels that: ‘other orchestras, as they look to grow these programmes, may also look to restructure in this way.’\(^\text{703}\) Lobb seconds this point, observing that: ‘Education and Community Engagement hasn’t consistently established its place in management across the sector, but that is starting to change.’\(^\text{704}\) In Australia the Sydney Symphony, Melbourne Symphony and West Australian Symphony Orchestras now have Education and Community Engagement Departments on Senior Management, however the Adelaide Symphony, Tasmanian Symphony and Queensland Symphony Orchestras have not yet taken this step.

The support of the Chief Conductor is another key factor in the position of the Education Department within the orchestra. In interview with the author, the SSO’s Education Manager, Kim Waldock, has commented on the positive impact made in this respect by the new Chief Conductor, David Robertson. Robertson has been actively involved with education work throughout his career, creating and leading outreach programmes with the Ensemble Intercontemporain and the Orchestre National de Lyon. As Waldock comments:

> David Robertson is very supportive of education work. He gets involved in it and instead of our work being a satellite program that works outside of the orchestra, he enables me to bring it back into the main body of orchestral activity.\(^\text{705}\)

Here, for example, Waldock comments on Robertson’s personal interaction with teachers engaged in an SSO education workshop:

> The fact that David is taking an interest in the teachers gives it so much more validity. In the past it’s been quite a satellite program and a lot of it

\(^{703}\) ibid.  
\(^{704}\) Lobb, interview.  
\(^{705}\) Waldock, interview.
has been projects that Richard Gill has been doing because he is interested in doing them, but it hasn’t been aligned with the core business of the orchestra and therefore many people didn’t know what happens in the education work. With Robertson’s support the education department is now much closer aligned with mainstage programming.\footnote{Waldock, interview.}

These are very important points to make. Clearly it is to the benefit of the entire organisation, as well as participants in the education programme, if the education programmes are as closely entwined with main-stage events as possible. In this way participants feel truly connected with orchestral personnel and are offered realistic insight into their daily activity.

Another indicator of the importance placed on education work is the number of personnel allocated to the Education and Community Education Departments within the management team, although this is of course influenced by the available budget of the orchestra. Internationally, the LSO has the greatest number of Education positions, with seventeen personnel working in various education roles. In Australia the SSO Learning Department has four staff; the MSO Education and Community Engagement Department has three staff members; and WASO and QSO Education Departments both two. The ASO and TSO education programmes are both operated singlehandedly, and ASO and QSO through part time positions. While each orchestra is achieving strong results with the personnel available, there are of course limits to what can be achieved through a single part time position in comparison to a well-staffed Department.

Alongside the above points in regard to the support of general management and adequate staffing, the next question is to understand how education and community engagement programmes can be centrally aligned within the
orchestra. Over the course of this study, a number of ways in which this can be achieved have emerged. Firstly, it is important that the programmes involve core orchestral members as much as possible, rather than relying on casual players. A personal connection should ideally be developed between participants and orchestral musicians. While programmes often make use of a freelance workshop leader or animateur, ideally this position should also be connected with the orchestra as closely as possible.

A second important point for possible connection is through programming: for instance, by structuring education events around a main stage concert programme. Examples of this approach have been noted through this research, such as the creative music projects based on main-stage programmes offered by the Melbourne Symphony and several British Orchestras. The creative workshop model of programme invites participants to make a personal connection with the music, to understand it from the inside. It is then important to link this connection back to the main-stage performance of the work by the symphony orchestra.

In summary, realisation is growing sector wide of the importance of education and community engagement programmes. The position of the education department is steadily growing closer to the central management and activity of the orchestra. The support of chief conductors, CEO’s and Board Members is helping to raise the profile of orchestral education programming both within the music industry and with the general community. Realisation is growing that if education and community engagement programmes fail to be aligned with main stage programming then orchestras run the risk of creating a second tier of
activity unrelated to their main concert performances. While significant progress has been made in this respect over the past decade, there still remains room for further development, and it is likely that in coming years Education Managers will continue to play a more prominent role in orchestral strategic planning. In this way further points of intersection between Education and Community programmes and orchestral main stage performances can be established, thereby fostering meaningful relevance between orchestras and their communities.
Chapter Twenty: Recommendations for future orchestral education programming

Having examined the development and current practice of orchestral education programming, recommendations for future programming can be now proposed. These take points of inspiration from examples of best practice identified through the course of research, as well as considering areas of future development. Efforts have been made to keep the proposed model valid for a wide range of orchestras; however, should this blueprint be put into practice adjustments may be required according to the available resources of each organisation. It should be noted that this model is presented with a predominantly Australian perspective.

The model is presented with the understanding that the Education Department would have the full support of the Board, Senior Management and Chief Conductor, and that relevant Professional Development Training would be offered to orchestral musicians as required. The model is structured to create maximum impact through participatory engagement with a wide range of age groups, as well as making a positive contribution to society. There would also, of course, be associated benefits to the orchestra in terms of providing future high quality orchestral musicians, a raised profile in the community, greater social relevance and a widened potential audience.

The model has two main components: one being a flagship year-long project that ties together a number of concepts; the other a variety of shorter-term programmes. It is important for the projects to be delivered by full-time members of the orchestra in order for maximum connection to be made with the community. This connection will also be enhanced by personal, sustained contact between small groups of participants and the orchestral members involved.
The programmes need to be incorporated into the orchestra’s long-term planning in order to ensure player availability and align the content with main stage concert repertoire. This would entail the Education Manager being included in strategic planning sessions. Having established the schedule and personnel for the education programmes, a brochure with relevant details would be circulated around all relevant educational and community organisations and the participants chosen. Efforts should be made to ensure that the opportunities are available to participants from a wide socio-economic range, which may entail sponsorship in the form of financial subsidies or travel assistance. Where possible digital and online media should be used to ensure that access is as wide as possible.

Evaluative measures should be put into place for each programme from the outset of the planning stage. These should include the intended aims for each programme, a method for attaining and recording data, and a final evaluative summary of the programme. Both the positive impact of the programmes and any areas for future development should be considered in a final evaluation report. Material for future publicity or funding applications would then be created.

The recommended components for an orchestra’s education and community programming are as follows:

1. A year long, flagship project centred around participation and partnership.
2. Performances featuring multi-level participation.
3. Education Concerts.
4. Early years programme.
5. Family Jams.
6. Workshops for secondary school students.
7. Open rehearsals.
8. A programme tailored to the early years sector.
10. Partnership with local music college and youth orchestra.
11. Digital and online resources.
12. Music therapy and community support.

These eleven components cover three key streams of activity: Schools, New Generation of Musicians, and Community Connections. Each is now discussed in greater detail, including a chart that demonstrates how the activities are allocated across the course of the year.

**1. A year-long, flagship project centred around participation and partnership.**

This is a year-long project involving both school children and advanced students (either students enrolled in tertiary music performance degrees and/or players from the local youth orchestra). The students would work together alongside the orchestra and a composer. The aim for this project is to create, rehearse and finally perform a new multi-level work, based on a story with an Australian focus. The choice of an Aboriginal dreamtime tale, for example, would support the new focus on Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander music in the National Curriculum.

There are many benefits to this concept. Firstly, it allows for role modelling between the tertiary students and school students, with potential for work experience in pedagogy skills. The hands on experience of creating music supports the new
Australian National Curriculum and acknowledges the importance of developing creativity in children that was discussed in Chapter Six. The piece should include multiple levels of entry points to allow all children to be involved in the final performance, incorporating choral and instrumental parts.

By taking place over a whole year, a meaningful connection would be established with the participants, avoiding the ‘scatter-gun’ tendency of much education programming. Finally, efforts should be made to ensure that the final performance is in a high-profile concert venue, both to increase the sense of achievement for the participants and to assist with publicity.

The role of a professional composer is essential here to help shape the students’ concepts as they arise, and it would be important to allow sufficient time to polish the final work and allocate sufficient rehearsal time. In order to streamline the composing stage of the project, it could be beneficial to use a ‘windows’ style piece. With this format the composer provides the framework for the composition at the start of the project, but leaves spaces in which the students incorporate their compositional material. After the workshop period of the project the composer would then work on bringing the piece together cohesively, smoothing the transitions between the different sections.

Ideally the concluding concert should be conducted by the Chief Conductor of the Symphony Orchestra to ensure that the project is well incorporated into the orchestra’s main activities, as well as contributing to the quality of experience for the participants. The entire project could be filmed as a documentary, looking to the ‘Hallé
Harmony Youth Orchestra\textsuperscript{707} documentary, or ‘The Choir’ and its sequels,\textsuperscript{708} all broadcast on prime-time UK TV, as successful past precedents.

The structure of the programme over the course of the year would be as follows:

- February-June: 2 workshop sessions each month to create the compositional material, involving the students, a workshop leader/composer and a minimum of four orchestral musicians from string brass woodwind and percussion sections.
- July-August: the composer edits and refines the composition. Parts are distributed to students to prepare with their instrumental and class music teachers, along with teacher resource packs.
- September: 3 rehearsals with students, workshop leader/composer and orchestral mentors.
- October: 2 dress rehearsals with students alongside the full orchestra.
- October: performance/s.
- November: post concert session to view any recorded footage and an opportunity for participants to meet with orchestra members in a relaxed and informal environment.

2. Performances featuring multi-level participation

- Number of sessions: 4
- Personnel required: orchestra and presenter
- Venue: concert hall/rehearsal venue

\textsuperscript{708} \url{http://www.bbc.co.uk/programmes/b008y125}, accessed 4 August 2015.
In addition to the flagship programme, four extra concerts are scheduled to allow players of a range of ages and abilities to play alongside the orchestra. These would be offered to Primary students, Secondary students, Youth Orchestra and Community Musicians.

While Australian orchestras are already exploring such opportunities for community musicians, tertiary students and high school-aged instrumentalists, there is a need for similar connections with younger instrumentalists, even beginners. There is already a significant body of repertoire for this combination (see the Appendix for further details). The orchestra would work in partnership with peripatetic instrumental teachers in order to help students to prepare their parts.

There is also a need for further exploration of choral participation with orchestral programming in Australia, for example through events linking with school choirs, tertiary choirs or community choirs. These would fit particularly well with orchestras that have a resident Choir, such as WASO, MSO or TSO. School and tertiary choirs would be included in the flagship year-long programme and the education concerts. Community choral and instrumental participation would be included in an end of year concert of a key work, such as Handel’s The Messiah.

3. Education concerts

- Number of sessions: 6
- Personnel required: orchestra and presenter
- Venue: either small concert hall or rehearsal venue

While Education concerts are the oldest form of programming, they remain a relevant part of a twenty-first century orchestra’s annual activity. In order to be most
effective however, they should be highly participatory and well tailored to each age group. The model presented here has three concerts for Primary students and three for Secondary students. One concert for each age group would also feature a piece that involves side by side participation.

To support teachers in their preparation of students for such concerts, pre- and post-concert lesson plans and activities should be supplied, and posted online for further access. Wherever possible concerts should link with the National Curriculum, and ideally feature a local contemporary composer.

4. Early years programme

- **Junior Jams (children aged 2 to 6 and parents)**
  - Number of sessions: 3
  - Personnel required: Workshop leader and minimum of four orchestral musicians
  - Venue: either a rehearsal studio or community venue (eg. Library, museum or community hall)

These are fun, informal occasions where musical concepts are explored through listening, singing, dancing and creating. These offer opportunities for cross-arts links; for example, sessions could be based on books, artworks, dances or plays. Each session would feature a short performance by the orchestral musicians related to the theme for the session.

- **Family Concerts**
  - Number of sessions: 2
• Personnel required: orchestra and presenter

• Venue: small concert hall or rehearsal venue

Participants in the Junior Jams would also be encouraged to attend the Family Concerts scheduled throughout the year. These are short, one hour concerts that are lively and participatory, with a presenter to help facilitate interaction between the audience and the orchestra.

The importance of connecting with young children (from infancy to pre-school age) was noted by several interviewees throughout this research. This point is supported by an increasing body of research on the importance of early music training for cognitive development in children. Additionally, as these children will be attending with their parents, a link with the whole family will be made. If resources allow, a CD specifically recorded for young children could also be produced and distributed. The Helsinki Philharmonic ‘Godchild’709 and Royal Scottish National Orchestra ‘Astar’710 programmes are particularly strong examples of sequential early years programming.

5. Family Jams (children aged 6 to 12 and parents)

• Number of sessions: 3

• Personnel required: workshop leader and minimum of four orchestral musicians

• Venue: in small studio or community venue

Similar to the Junior Jam model but offered to Primary school aged children. With the older age group there is further opportunity to explore musical concepts and the children will be guided in creating their own music as part of the session.

710 www.rsno.org.uk accessed 15 August 2015.
6. **Workshops for secondary school students**

- Number of sessions: 4
- Personnel required: workshop leader and minimum of four orchestral musicians
- Venue: in schools

These workshops are additional to those included in the year-long flagship programme. These take place in schools and would be tailored on a case-by-case basis. Possibilities would include sessions with secondary instrumental students to develop ensemble skills, or workshops assisting students to explore composition techniques. Composition workshops should focus either on the work of one particular composer (ideally an Australian composer who could be there in person), or focus on selected compositional techniques.

All students taking part in these workshops should also attend a main stage orchestral event: either an Open Rehearsal or Education Concert. The workshops would be linked to the main stage event through both repertoire and personnel. The orchestral musicians leading the workshops would also have personal interaction with the students at the Open Rehearsal or Education Concert. Professional development for teachers would also be offered as appropriate.

7. **Open Rehearsals**

- Number of sessions: 4
- Personnel required: full orchestra
- Venue: concert hall or rehearsal venue
There would be four open rehearsals over the course of the year: two for secondary students and two for the general community. Each should include an opportunity for interaction between members of the audience and the orchestra, conductor and soloist as appropriate. This could be achieved through a guided tour back stage before the rehearsal or a Q&A session after the rehearsal.

8. Adult lecture series

- Number of sessions: 3
- Personnel required: Orchestra, presenter
- Venue: Small concert hall

These events should have an informal, social feel, possibly with food or drinks incorporated. The concert should be kept short, ideally no more than an hour, however extra activities would also be scheduled through the day of the performance for those with more flexible schedules. These activities would be related to the theme of the concert, for instance through chamber music performances of works by a featured composer or a talk by a musicologist. The adult lecture concerts could also be linked with other cultural events such as visiting exhibitions. A theme for the event, either musical or linking with another discipline, could also help to broaden appeal.

The chart on the following page shows how the eight programmes listed above would be organised across the calendar year. The Junior and Family Jams would be best placed in school holiday periods while other activities targeted towards school aged children would be scheduled in term time. Shaded boxes indicate performances that feature side-by-side participation.
## Figure 4. Overview of education and community programming

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Programme</th>
<th>Jan</th>
<th>Feb</th>
<th>March</th>
<th>April</th>
<th>May</th>
<th>June</th>
<th>July</th>
<th>Aug</th>
<th>Sept</th>
<th>Oct</th>
<th>Nov</th>
<th>Dec</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Flagship programme</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary education concert</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secondary Education Concert</td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Music therapy (Chamber perf. in hospital)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family Jams</td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Junior Jams</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secondary school workshops</td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Youth orchestra side by side</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community participatory concert</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Open rehearsal</td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adult lecture concert</td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family concert</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The structure over the course of the year is intended to streamline demands upon the orchestra’s schedule and resources. For example, Family Concerts have been scheduled in the same month as Primary Education Concerts as repertoire could be shared between the two events. Secondary Workshops are scheduled in the same calendar months as the Secondary Education Concerts or an Open Rehearsal in order to make links between school based activities and main stage programming. Events have not been scheduled for January as this is generally a holiday period in Australia; similarly, the only event scheduled for December is the Community participation concert.

In addition to the above core programming components, the following recommendations are also highly desirable elements of a successful education department.

**Strategic Partnership with local Music College and Youth Orchestra**

The flagship programme develops a partnership between the symphony orchestra and its local music college and youth orchestra, however it would be desirable to also create further strategic links between these organisations.

A partnership between the orchestra and the tertiary music college could be in the form of a mentorship programme in which participants gain practical experience with the orchestra over the course of the year. Ideally, such a programme would be incorporated into the University course curriculum. This would avoid any potential conflicts of interest for the students. Any mentorship arrangement should be sequential and participatory in order to provide maximum benefit to the student.
As previously noted, there is at present no formalised partnership between a symphony orchestra and local youth orchestra in Australia; this is a clear area for future development. Informal links already exist, with orchestral musicians involved in tutoring and conducting roles with youth orchestras. Some orchestras have also developed opportunities for side-by-side performances with youth orchestras. However, in the view of the author, a formalised partnership would offer greater benefits to the students and would strengthen long-term links between the two organisations.

**Digital and Online**

Care should be taken here not to replicate existing material, as it is possible to access the digital content of orchestras worldwide. However, in light of Australia’s geography, there is a clear need for further exploration of live-streaming of concerts, webinars and interviews in order to increase access to Australia’s rural and outback communities. As previously noted, any resource materials linked to education programming should be made available online to broaden access. There is also further potential to explore the use of technology to enhance learning and engagement in concerts.

**Music therapy and community support**

Orchestras are increasingly looking to use their resources to support the well-being, both emotional and physical, of their communities. Research has shown that orchestra education programmes can have a positive impact when linked with hospitals, nursing homes, drug or alcohol programmes, prisons, or to low socio-economic areas. Therefore, there is a strong case to be made to incorporate a
programme that focuses on at least one of these areas. Several examples of such work were presented in the Case Studies in Chapters Eleven and Twelve, including hospital performances, performances at nursing homes or partnerships with prisons. Included in the model above are several performances at a hospital by a chamber music ensemble, however further commitment in this area is highly desirable if resources allow.

An El Sistema inspired programme would be another avenue through which an orchestra could support its community. Although resource intensive, the growing body of research on the significant benefits of such work could be expected to attract higher government and private funding in coming years. A further model in this area is the Juilliard’s ‘Music Advancement Programme,’ an intensive instrumental scheme for students from disadvantaged backgrounds. A partnership with a tertiary music college would work well with this programme, as it would provide tertiary music students with an opportunity to gain practical pedagogy experience while also helping to keep the costs feasible.

Summary

As noted in the opening of this chapter, these recommendations depend on an orchestra having sufficient resources available, both of finances and personnel. However, if an orchestra were able to put the above model into practice then they would be making a significant contribution to their community as well as bolstering the music education of a range of age groups. In this way they would be achieving two key aims: firstly, establishing community relevance and, secondly, supporting a wide sector of society in their participation and engagement with music.

Conclusion

The body of research presented here aims to reflect best current practice in orchestral education and outreach in Australia and the United Kingdom, alongside an analysis of the growth and development of the industry. A number of key conclusions can be drawn from an overview of the research presented. The education and outreach work of orchestras continue to be key growth areas, both in Australia and internationally. This can be clearly seen in the number of new initiatives, in particular participatory programmes, increasingly being explored. From an original focus on work with school students, orchestras are increasingly aware of the roles that they can play in a variety of spheres, including instrumental training, community choral singing, music therapy, prison rehabilitation, and social welfare. The models of best practice in arts partnerships emerging from the UK are of international interest, although it should be noted that the difficulties and problems encountered in this area in the UK could also be informative to others looking to establish similar strategic partnerships.

Partnerships fall into three main categories: schools, community and vocational training. Partnerships with schools are necessary to bolster music education and help to establish more equitable access to music for children. As studies continue to point to extra musical benefits for children engaged in musical activity, it is increasingly a social responsibility to ensure that access is as wide as possible. All school-aged children should have the opportunity to experience a live symphony orchestra concert, and orchestral education programmes can also provide inspiration and encouragement to students beginning instrumental study. Strength at the grass roots level of instrumental music is essential to the overall music ‘eco-system,’ and there is further potential for Australian orchestras to explore in this area. Partnerships with the
community allow orchestras to support life-long learning, music therapy, rehabilitation and social regeneration. Effective partnerships between professional orchestras, tertiary music departments and youth orchestras are essential to ensure that future orchestral musicians are identified and supported in their journey.

Australian orchestras are increasingly exploring the areas of creative composition and participatory orchestral education programmes. Of particular interest here are the resources and experience established by various UK orchestras in staging high profile opportunities for multi-level side-by-side performances. The skills developed in the UK in facilitating creative music workshops could also be of increasing value to Australia with the introduction of the National Curriculum, which mandates for students to develop their creativity and composition skills. While some Australian orchestras have begun to introduce informal creative workshops, these can be further developed in order to support students in their understanding of contemporary composition. Workshops for secondary school students focused upon the compositional style of a contemporary Australian composer would be a possible model to explore. This would support students in their understanding of such music and assist composers in maintaining their relevance with future audiences.

UK conservatoires continue to be highly innovative in their attempts to produce ‘modern’ orchestral musicians equipped with the skills required by careers in the twenty first century. Two aspects in particular can be considered here. Firstly, there is a need to produce orchestral musicians with a ‘portfolio’ of skills in education, improvisation, public speaking, digital media and arranging. Secondly, there is a gap in Australian training in terms of producing musicians known as ‘animateurs’ in the United Kingdom, or ‘teaching artists’ in the United States. While visits from animateurs
such as Paul Rissmann and Fraser Trainer have contributed significantly to the Australian orchestral education field in recent years, it is important for Australia to be looking to create its own leaders in this role.

Digital and online resources are providing new directions for orchestral education and outreach departments worldwide. While the value of live performances and personal contact should not be underestimated, digital technology could be of particular value to Australia’s many remote and isolated communities. Online resources support teachers in their preparation of students for participation in orchestral education projects. Digital installations are increasingly offering the public insight into the workings of symphony orchestras, including placing them in the player’s role. There remains untapped potential for digital technology in concert halls to support learning and engagement.

While projects with large numbers of participants are appealing to funding bodies, there is also a growing momentum towards a more intimate, concentrated approach. This can be seen in Sistema inspired programmes focused upon one Primary school, in the ‘Beacon Schools’ initiative of the Aurora Orchestra, and in programmes that focus on personal connections rather than large scale occasions. These do not need to be resource intensive in order to make an impact: they can be simple concepts such as the WASO’s Back Stage Pass, the Hallé’s Adopt-a-Player, or the RLPO and Sistema Scotland ‘In Home’ concerts.

The new Australian Curriculum would be well supported by orchestra education programmes with a cross-arts focus. In addition, orchestras could look to maximise their audience base by linking with patrons of other arts sectors. Here the recent Audience Atlas Victoria Survey (2014), the ‘most detailed and comprehensive
profile of arts audiences ever undertaken in Victoria, could be of interest. This survey highlights various points of intersection between the audience bases of various arts organisations, as well as exploring ways that these links could be further developed. Ideas for orchestras in this respect could be education and outreach events linking with major art gallery or museum exhibitions, focus events on periods of history linking with state libraries or historical associations, or festivals.

Over the course of the project, a model for best practice in orchestral education and community engagement has emerged. Key points include the importance of full support from Management, Chief Conductor and the Board and the establishment of an Education and Community Outreach Department. Education and Community Outreach Managers need to be involved in strategic planning in order to integrate their work with the long-term planning of the orchestra. The most important growth area in orchestral education and outreach work is participation: a strong participative element is increasingly central to education and outreach programming. The participation should be tailored to suit the project, ranging from side-by-side main stage performances to body percussion, singing and creative music making.

Several avenues for future investigation were identified during the research process. The focus for the present study was intentionally restricted to the education and community engagement work of orchestras in Australia and the United Kingdom. However similar evaluative studies of the education and community activities of orchestras in a number of other nations and continents, such as the United States, Canada, Europe, New Zealand or Asia, would also be of interest and benefit to the international music community. One such example is the educational role of the

---

712 Audience Atlas Victoria, prepared by Morris Hargreaves McIntyre, 30 April 2014.
Orquestra Sinfônica do Estado de São Paulo (OSESP), which has established a strong role in supporting music education in Brazil.

There is also a need for continued evaluative research on the benefits of Sistema inspired programmes in order to provide clear data on this high-profile field of work. A comparison of Sistema programmes with other programmes with a similar focus, such as the Soweto String Project, would be of great use to the music community. It is also important to undertake evaluative research upon other orchestral education programmes with extra-musical social agendas, such as music therapy programmes or projects in prisons. Further future research on these aspects of the field will help to create a clear picture of exactly how orchestras can be of most benefit to their communities.

In order for music to maintain its relevance in society, there is a need for all orchestral musicians to be effective advocates for their art form. Eric Booth makes the point that this can occur not only through orchestral education and outreach programming, but also in everyday interactions in society. When projects are led by full-time orchestra members, rather than casual players or visiting animateurs, it is an indication of an orchestra’s sincere commitment to education and outreach. To achieve this, it is important for orchestral musicians to feel prepared for outreach and education work, both through regular professional training sessions and in their initial tertiary training. It is also important, of course, to publicise orchestras’ efforts to engage with their communities. Here clusters of events can be of assistance, or a high impact flagship programme such as that recommended in the previous chapter. The support of high profile patrons can also be of value in achieving public recognition, as can

---

713 Booth, *Music Teaching Artist’s Bible*, op.cit.
nationally coordinated sector-wide events.

While many take a bleak view of the future of classical music, others are optimistic that the efforts by orchestras to support music education and connect with their communities can in fact usher us into a brighter future. Alan Gilbert, Chief Conductor of the New York Philharmonic, presented this view in his 2015 Royal Philharmonic Society Lecture, commenting:

In these turbulent times there are wonderful and inspiring examples of orchestras that are getting it right. What they share is a site-specific understanding of what their communities need, and what they can uniquely provide with their musical powers...What orchestras can be for their audiences is changing, and that actually presents a wonderful opportunity for us to grow.

It is now no longer a question of whether orchestras will do such work, rather how they can achieve maximum impact with their finite resources. To help make these decisions, evaluation is key, both in order to add quantitative data to the body of research on such work, and to ensure that best practice is being developed. From early, somewhat self-centred motivations of building audiences and maintaining funding, orchestras are now increasingly aware of the potential value of their work with their communities. The education and community engagement managers interviewed for this study were uniformly altruistic in their aims and approaches, focused on achieving maximum benefit for both their community and their orchestras through their programming.

Musicians, administrators and audiences alike need to now explore together what a twenty-first century orchestra can achieve and contribute to society. Alan Gilbert has commented:

714 Gilbert, RPS Lecture op.cit., p.4
I want to see orchestra musicians held up as heroes in their communities—both for their brilliance as musicians, but also for how they use that talent to touch the lives of those around them through music. How this redefinition is seen by the audience is equally critical: people must get used to seeing musicians as the crucial agents of change in communities, as teachers, leaders and role-models.715

With the advocacy and support of leading figures for the excellent work being undertaken by orchestral education departments the ‘redefinition’ of an orchestral musician may be imminent. This redefinition would see the skills of orchestral musicians being used to create a positive impact in society through their performances, teaching, and involvement in music therapy and social regeneration programmes.

Ultimately, the goal of orchestral education programmes is to establish a broad, equitable level of access to the innate power and joy of music. Education Managers seek to achieve this by enabling people of all ages and backgrounds to find personal ways in which music can enhance their everyday life. If this vision can come to fruition, then orchestras may overcome the difficulties of past decades, and look forward to a vibrant future.

715 ibid.
List of Sources

The sources consulted in the course of this study are here provided, divided into nine categories for the sake of clarity. All listings are alphabetical unless otherwise specified.

1. List of Interviews.

The following interviews were all recorded by the present author, in person wherever practicable, otherwise by video-conference. Each interview was transcribed, and quotes from these transcripts underscore the research throughout.

   Ackrill, Judith. Director of London Symphony Orchestra Discovery Department. 10 February 2015. (Skype interview).


   Benn, Naomi. Head of Ensembles, Hallé Concerts Society. 2 March 2015. (Skype interview).

   Compton, Jenny. Outreach and Education Executive, Tasmanian Symphony Orchestra. 16 February 2015. (Skype interview).

   Estell, Tabby. Freelance project consultant, Learning and Participation, Southbank Centre, 19 March 2013. (Skype interview).

Garden, Peter. Executive Director of Performance and Learning, Royal Liverpool Philharmonic Orchestra. 23 June 2015. (Skype interview).

Gregory, Sean. Director of Creative Learning Department, Guildhall School of Music and Drama and Barbican Centre. 8 May 2015. (Skype interview).


Harvey, Fiona. Education and Youth Ensembles Consultant, Association of British Orchestras, 5 December 2011 and 30 March 2015. (Skype interview).

Howell, Gillian. Past Education Director of Melbourne Symphony Orchestra. 19 February 2015. (Skype interview).

Lake, Cassandra. Executive Manager, Community Engagement, West Australian Symphony Orchestra. 1 June 2015. (Skype interview).


Lowry, Pam. Education Liaison Officer, Queensland Symphony Orchestra. 27 March 2015. (Skype interview).


Marcus, Marshall. Chief Executive Officer, European Youth Orchestra, and Founder and Chairman of Sistema Europe. 2 April 2015. (Skype interview).

Nicholls, Christopher. Music education advocate, founder of Sistema Australia. 6 February 2015. (Skype interview).

Norton, Vicki. Education Manager, Australian Chamber Orchestra. 2 November 2012. (Skype interview).


Pickett, Steve. Education Director, Hallé. 2 March 2015. (Skype interview).
Rissmann, Paul. Animateur, composer. 16 April 2015. (Skype interview).

Rodericks, Julia. Director of Learning and Participation, Aurora Orchestra, London. 8 May 2015. (Skype interview).


Trainer, Fraser. Animateur, composer, former Creative Director of Education Department London Sinfonietta. 11 February 2015. (Skype interview).


Wilson, Lindsay. Director of Education Department, Philharmonia Orchestra. London, 21 September 2011. (In person interview).
2. Theses


3. Reports: Listed in Reverse Chronological Order.


Burns, S. and Bewick, P. *In Harmony Liverpool: Interim Reports Years One-Five*. Co-commissioned by Royal Liverpool Philharmonic Orchestra; Department for Education; In Harmony Sistema England, 2010-2014. Retrieved from: 


Vaughan, T., Harris, J., Caldwell, B. *Bridging the Gap in School Achievement through the Arts*. Commissioned by the Song Room, Melbourne, 2011.


*The evaluation of the process and outcomes achieved to date by Big Noise Children’s Orchestra in the Raploch Estate in Stirling*. Commissioned by the Scottish Government, 2011.

Knell, J. and Taylor, M. *Arts Funding, Austerity and the Big Society: Remaking the case for the arts*, Essay 4. Commissioned by the Royal Society of Arts, Arts Council England,


Harvey, Fiona. *Education Programmes of ABO Orchestras and Organisations*. Commissioned by the Association of British Orchestras, August 2005.

*Submission to the National Review of School Music Education*. Commissioned and published by the Australia Council for the Arts, 2005.
National Review of School Music Education: Augmenting the Diminished.


Ledgard, A. and G. Odam. The Art of the Animateur: An investigation into the skills and insight required of artists to work effectively in schools and communities. Published by Animarts in partnership with Guildhall School of Music and Drama and LIFT (London International Festival of Theatre), 2003.


Lockwood, Fiona. (Editor). *The Workbook Volume 1, the central written resource for the ABO National Education Programme*. Commissioned by the Association of British Orchestras, 1997.


Commissioned by the Gulbenkian Foundation, 1982.


*Industries Assistance Commission: draft report on assistance to the performing arts.*
Commissioned by the Industries Assistance Commission, Canberra, 1976.

4. Books


5. Journal Articles


Kjemtrup, Inge. ‘News and Notes: Raise the Rafters,’ *Strings*, Vol. 18 (2), 2003, p. 16.


<https://voices.no/index.php/voices/article/view/347/271>,


Wiegold, Peter. ‘But who will make their tea?’ *Harmony. Forum of the Symphony Orchestra Institute*, Number 12, April 2001, pp. 1-12.


6. Newspaper Articles


Brennan, Clare. ‘A Connection Mozart would have made’. The Times (London), 16 February 2006, p.3.


Higgins, Charlotte. ‘The trumpets are sounding for the LSO’s centenary year, but financial problems could spoil the party.’ The Guardian (London), 15 January 2004, p.17.


Melvin, Sheila. ‘East is East and West is West, but the Twain are now Meeting in Opera’. The New York Times, 1 January 2011, p. C3.


7. Speeches, Lectures and Television Broadcasts


Maxwell Davies, Peter (Sir), *Will serious music become extinct?* Royal Philharmonic Society Lecture, 2005. Retrieved from:


Robinson, Ken. *Do Schools Kill Creativity?* (video file), Feb 2006. Retrieved from:


Vick, Graham. *Inclusion or be damned*, Royal Philharmonic Society Lecture (2003).

Retrieved from:

Wright, Roger. *The future of classical music, we’re all in this together*, Royal Philharmonic Society Lecture, 2013. Retrieved from:

8. **DVDs**

*Rhythm is It! You can change your life in a dance class*. Directed by Grube, Thomas and Enrique Sanchez Lansch, Boomtown Media, Germany, 2004.

Appendix A

Examples of Repertoire for Participatory Education Programmes

Banney, David. Tigers and Teapots: vocal participation.


Dove, Jonathan.
  • The Monster in the Maze: (community and children’s voices, orchestra).
  • There was a Child: (children’s choir and orchestra).

Ferguson, Mark Simeon. The Bush Concert: vocal and percussion participation.

Glyn, Gareth.
  • All Together Now! Suite for symphony orchestra and flute, violin and trumpet learners.
  • America (Bernstein): Arrangement for multi-ability orchestra.
  • As I Went upon the Ice (trad.): Arrangement for multi-ability orchestra.
  • Bint el Chalabaya - Arrangement for multi-ability orchestra.
  • Carillon from L'Arlésienne (Bizet) - Arrangement for multi-ability orchestra.
  • Cello Concerto (Dvorak), 3rd movement- Arrangement for multi-ability orchestra.
  • Chan Chan (C. Segundo) - Arrangement for multi-ability orchestra.
  • Cockney Medley/Cockney Songs - Arrangements of London-themed music hall songs for multi-ability brass orchestra.
• Dardanus (Rameau) - Arrangement of movements for multi-ability string orchestra and percussion.

• Double Concerto (Bach) - Arrangement of the outer movements of the Bach double violin concerto for soloists and multi-ability strings.

• EGAD! - Variations on an original theme for concert violinists, symphony orchestra and string learners.

• Farandole (Bizet) - Arrangement for multi-ability orchestra.

• Firebird (finale) (Stravinsky)- Arrangement for multi-ability orchestra.

• Great Gate of Kiev (Moussorgsky)- Arrangement for multi-ability orchestra.

• Hello, Dolly! (Jerry Herman), arrangement- Arrangement for multi-ability orchestra.

• Hoe-down (Copland)- Arrangement for multi-ability orchestra.

• Hungarian Dance no. 5 (Brahms)- Arrangement for multi-ability orchestra.

• I Got Rhythm (Gershwin)- Arrangement for multi-ability orchestra.

• James Bond theme (Norman)- Arrangement for multi-ability orchestra.

• Kastchei’s Infernal Dance (Firebird, Stravinsky) - Arrangement for multi-ability orchestra.

• La Traviata medley - Arrangement of melodies from La Traviata for multi-ability orchestra.

• Libertango (Piazzolla) - Arrangement for multi-ability orchestra.
• Lieutenant Kijé suite (Prokofiev), extracts - Arrangement for multi-ability orchestra.

• March from The Love for Three Oranges (Prokofiev)- Arrangement for multi-ability orchestra.

• Music Makers Sing! - Song-cycle for school choirs and symphony orchestra.

• Nimrod, from the Enigma Variations (Elgar)- Arrangement for multi-ability orchestra.

• O Fortuna (Orff) - Arrangement for multi-ability orchestra.

• Overture from Ruslan and Ludmila (Glinka)- Arrangement for multi-ability orchestra.

• Polovtsian Dances (Borodin) - Arrangement for multi-ability orchestra.

• Rejouissance (Music for the Royal Fireworks, Handel) - Arrangement for multi-ability orchestra.

• Roumanian Dances no. 1, 5 & 6 (Bartok)- Arrangement for multi-ability orchestra.

• Sabre Dance (Khatchaturian) - Arrangement for multi-ability orchestra.

• Sheep may Safely Graze (Bach) - Arrangement for multi-ability orchestra.

• Strings on the Wing - Concert piece for multiple-skill-level strings.

• Surprise Symphony movement (Haydn) - Arrangement for multi-ability orchestra.
• Swan Lake theme (Tchaikovsky) - Arrangement for multi-ability orchestra.

• Symphonie Fantastique (Berlioz), abridged - Arrangement for multi-ability orchestra.

• Symphony no. 2 (Brahms), 4th movements (extracts) - Arrangement for multi-ability orchestra.

• Symphony no. 3 (Beethoven), 1st movement (exposition) - Arrangement for multi-ability orchestra.

• Symphony no. 40 (Mozart), 3rd movement (extracts) - Arrangement for multi-ability orchestra.

• Symphony no. 7 (Beethoven), Allegretto (extracts) - Arrangement for multi-ability orchestra.

• Symphony no. 9 (Dvorak), 4th movement (extracts) - Arrangement for multi-ability orchestra.

• Troika (Prokofiev) - Arrangement for multi-ability orchestra.

• Trumpet Voluntary (Clarke) - Arrangement for multi-ability orchestra.

• Turkish March from The Ruins of Athens (Beethoven) - Arrangement for multi-ability orchestra.

• Violin concerto (Mendelssohn), 1st movement, extracts - Arrangement for multi-ability orchestra.

• Water Music (Handel) - Arrangement of movements from Handel's Water Music for multi-ability orchestra.
Leach, Rachel.

- Hector and Harriet
- Any Person’s Guide to the Orchestra
- Wound Up
- Horton Hears a Who (based on Dr Seuss book)
- Mr Cheadle’s Menagerie String-a-Long

Maxwell Davies, Peter. The Turn of the Tide

Moore, Jeff.

- The Gypsy Violin (multi-level, for students and professionals)
- The Sea and the Sky (multi-level, for students and professionals)
- River Journey (multi-level, for students and professionals.)

Rissmann, Paul.

- Stan and Mabel
- The Chimpanzees of Happy Town
- Sir Scallywag and the Golden Underpants
- Supersonic
- Bamboozled
- H2Oz
BBC Ten Pieces (Arrangements found in the Resources link on website)

- Short Ride in a Fast Machine (John Adams),
- Symphony Number 5, 1st Movement (Beethoven),
- In the Hall of the Mountain King (Grieg),
- Mars from The Planets (Holst),
- Horn Concerto No.4, 3rd Movement (Mozart),
- A Night on the Bare Mountain (Mussorgsky) and the Firebird Suite, Finale (Stravinsky).
- Zadok the Priest (Handel) has also been arranged for varying levels of choral ability.

Roth, Alec.

- Concerto Piccolo: for multi-level string ensemble
- Dolphin Songs: for children’s choir and orchestra
- Arion and the Dolphin: community opera

Vaughan Williams, Ralph. Concerto Grosso for String Orchestra (multi level arrangement).
Appendix B

Interview Questions for Orchestral Education Personnel

What are the key aims for your Education Programmes?
How do you assess if these aims are being realised?
How are your programmes evaluated?
How are repertoire choices made for concerts? Are contemporary works included?
Who selects the focus/theme of your concerts?
To what extent do you use the internet or social networking tools?
Do you know when teacher preparatory materials were first included in the orchestra’s education programmes?
What are the sources for your funding?
Do these sources impact upon the operation of activities?
What are your activities this year?
Do these differ from previous years and if so, why?
Do your Education Programmes enhance/acknowledge the music curriculum in your local area? Do you collaborate with curriculum planners?
Do you support local youth and amateur music activities in your area?
Are your Education Programmes primarily participatory or passive for the audience?
Do you operate any composer led activities?
How did you personally come to be involved in this field?
What are your views about the balance between education and entertainment in education programmes?
How do you assess the success of programmes? Do you examine the short or long term impact?

Do your education programmes aim to increase/diversify your audience base? Have your audiences been surveyed with this in mind?

What is the tickets price for your concerts? Is this subsidised? Is travel to concerts subsidised?

What are the key issues that you feel need to be negotiated in developing and delivering education programmes?

To what extent do you feel that El Sistema has influenced your programmes?