Private dental insurance and use of dental care by Australian adults

Dana Nicole Teusner

Australian Research Centre for Population Oral Health (ARCPOH)
School of Dentistry
The University of Adelaide
Adelaide, South Australia
2016

Submitted in fulfilment of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

Supervised by:
Professor David S. Brennan
Emeritus Professor A. John Spencer
ARCPOH, School of Dentistry, The University of Adelaide
Contents

List of figures ........................................................................................................................................... v
List of tables ........................................................................................................................................ vi
Abbreviations ............................................................................................................................................... ix
Definitions .................................................................................................................................................. x
Statement of original work ......................................................................................................................... xii
Acknowledgements ...................................................................................................................................... xiii
Funding support .......................................................................................................................................... xiv
Abstract ..................................................................................................................................................... xv
Keywords ..................................................................................................................................................... xvi

Chapter 1: Introduction ................................................................................................................................. 1
1.1 Dental health system in Australia .......................................................................................................... 1
1.2 Private health insurance industry in Australia .................................................................................... 15
1.3 Oral health of Australian adults .......................................................................................................... 29
1.4 Study rationale .................................................................................................................................. 31
1.5 Research approach .............................................................................................................................. 35

Chapter 2: Literature review ....................................................................................................................... 41
2.1 Search methods .................................................................................................................................. 41
2.2 Overview of papers identified ........................................................................................................... 42
2.3 Summary of findings .......................................................................................................................... 45
2.4 Discussion ........................................................................................................................................... 64

Chapter 3: Dental insurance, level of cover and use of dental care ............................................................. 69
3.1 Introduction ........................................................................................................................................ 69
3.2 Hypotheses ......................................................................................................................................... 70
3.3 Research approach .................................................................................................................... 70
3.4 Methods ...................................................................................................................................... 72
  3.4.1 Sampling and data collection ........................................................................................... 72
  3.4.2 Data preparation and weighting ..................................................................................... 73
  3.4.3 Variables .............................................................................................................................. 74
  3.4.4 Analytical approach ..................................................................................................... ..... 78
3.5 Results ........................................................................................................................................ 82
  3.5.1 Response rates and participant characteristics .............................................................. 82
  3.5.2 Dental insurance policies .................................................................................................. 86
  3.5.3 Dental insurance status and level of cover ..................................................................... 91
  3.5.4 Dental visiting and dental services received ............................................................... 101
3.6 Discussion ................................................................................................................................ 125
  3.6.1 Key findings............................................................................................................. ......... 125
  3.6.2 Predictors of dental insurance ....................................................................................... 128
  3.6.3 Dental insurance and dental care received .................................................................. 132
  3.6.4 Dental care and other explanatory variables ............................................................... 135
  3.6.5 Study design and limitations ......................................................................................... 138
3.7 Conclusion ............................................................................................................................... 143

Chapter 4: Dental insurance and attitudes to dental care .......................................................... 145
  4.1 Introduction ............................................................................................................................. 145
  4.2 Hypotheses .............................................................................................................................. 148
  4.3 Research approach .................................................................................................................. 149
  4.4 Methods .................................................................................................................................... 152
    4.4.1 Sampling and data collection ......................................................................................... 152
    4.4.2 Data preparation .............................................................................................................. 153
| Appendix 2: | Chapter 2 appendix items | 254 |
| Appendix 3: | Chapter 3 appendix items | 258 |
| Appendix 4: | Chapter 4 appendix items | 300 |
| Appendix 5: | Chapter 5 appendix items | 326 |
List of figures

Figure 1.1: Andersen’s initial behavioural model (1960s) ................................................................. 38
Figure 3.1: Study design and response rates ...................................................................................... 83
Figure 3.2: Proportion making regular dental visits by dwelling type and level of dental insurance cover ............................................................ 111
Figure 3.3: Proportion usually visiting for a check-up by household income and level of dental insurance cover ............................................................ 112
Figure 4.1: Schema of study design .............................................................................................. 151
Figure 4.2: Schema of Poisson regression models to examine associations between dental insurance status, attitudes and dental care ............................................................ 164
List of tables

Table 2.1: Main findings of papers selected for review .......................................................... 52
Table 3.1: Participant characteristics by DIPS response status ................................................. 85
Table 3.2: Characteristics of insured participants by dental policy response ...................... 87
Table 3.3: Reported dental policies: mean maximum benefits by level of cover .................. 89
Table 3.4: Reported dental policies: comprehensiveness by level of cover ......................... 91
Table 3.5: Dental insurance cover by demographic characteristics and geographic location .................................................................................................... 93
Table 3.6: Dental insurance cover by socioeconomic characteristics .................................... 95
Table 3.7: Dental insurance cover by selected health-related characteristics ..................... 97
Table 3.8: Adjusted prevalence ratios of having dental insurance ........................................ 99
Table 3.9: Adjusted prevalence ratios of having a high level of dental insurance ............ 100
Table 3.10: Dental visiting by demographic characteristics and geographic location........... 103
Table 3.11: Dental visiting by socioeconomic characteristics ................................................. 104
Table 3.12: Dental visiting by health-related characteristics .................................................. 105
Table 3.13: Post-hoc power and sample size calculations .................................................... 106
Table 3.14: Adjusted prevalence ratios of dental visiting ..................................................... 108
Table 3.15: Adjusted prevalence ratios of dental visiting accounting for interaction terms ................................................................................................... 113
Table 3.16: Dental services received by demographic characteristics and geographic location ........................................................................................................ 116
Table 3.17: Dental services received by socioeconomic characteristics ............................... 117
Table 3.18: Dental services received by health-related characteristics ................................. 118
Table 3.19: Adjusted prevalence ratios of dental services received ..................................... 120
Table 3.20: Prevalence of dental visiting by level of cover, comparison of estimates derived from complete case data and imputed datasets ............................................ 124
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.22</td>
<td>Adjusted prevalence ratios of regular visits</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.23</td>
<td>Adjusted prevalence ratios of recent visit</td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.24</td>
<td>Adjusted prevalence ratios of receiving a scale and clean</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.25</td>
<td>Adjusted prevalence ratios of receiving an extraction</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.26</td>
<td>Adjusted prevalence ratios of receiving an endodontic service</td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.27</td>
<td>Adjusted prevalence ratios of receiving one or more prosthodontic services</td>
<td>205</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Abbreviations

Acronyms

ABS  Australian Bureau of Statistics
ADA  Australian Dental Association
AIHW  Australian Institute of Health and Welfare
APRA  Australian Prudential Regulation Authority
ARCPOH Australian Research Centre for Population Oral Health
CI  Concentration indices
COB  Country of birth
DI  Dental insurance
DMFT  Decayed, Missing, Filled Teeth
DSRU  Dental Statistics and Research Unit
DIPS  Dental Insurance Programs Survey
DVA  Department of Veteran Affairs
HWA  Health Workforce Australia
NDTIS National Dental Telephone Interview Survey
NHHRC National Health and Hospitals Review Commission
NHMRC National Health and Medical Research Council
NHS National Health Survey
NPA National Partnership Agreement
NSAOH National Survey of Adult Oral Health
OHIP Oral Health Impact Profile
OR Odds ratio
PAF Population Attributable Fraction
PAHI Private Ancillary Health Insurance
PHI Private Health Insurance
PHIO Private Health Insurance Ombudsman
PHIAC Private Health Insurance Administration Council
PR Prevalence ratio
SES Socioeconomic status
SDS School Dental Service
SIS Standard information statements
95%CI 95% Confidence interval
Definitions

Access to dental care

Refers to the opportunity or capacity to make a dental visit and receive dental services provided by a registered clinical oral health practitioner in a clinical setting (unspecified time period).

Dentate

Having one or more natural teeth.

Dental visit

A patient visit to a registered clinical oral health practitioner in clinical setting.

Dental visiting

A pattern or quantum of visits made in a specified time period.

Dental services

Services provided by a registered clinical oral health practitioner in clinical setting.

Dental service use

Received dental services, provided at a dental visit, in a specified time period.

Edentulous

A state of complete loss of natural teeth.

General treatment insurance

Prior to 2005 general treatment insurance was referred to as ‘ancillary’ or ‘extras cover’. Depending on the structure of the plan, general treatment insurance provides varying cover for services delivered by allied health professionals (e.g. physiotherapists, optometrists, podiatrists, chiropractors, psychologists, acupuncture, dental practitioners).

Dental insurance

Insurance covering services provided by dentists, dental hygienists, dental prosthetists, dental therapists and oral health therapists. In Australia, dental insurance is typically bundled in a general treatment health insurance policy. During the time period of this thesis, there were very few separate dental insurance policies offered by Australian private health insurance funds.
Favourable visiting pattern

A pattern of dental care use that is considered important for maintenance and/or attainment of satisfactory oral health status. A pattern of regular dental visiting, which includes receipt of preventive and maintenance dental care. In addition, favourable dental visiting may also refer to continuity of care, that is, regular dental visiting to a usual dental provider.

General dental insurance

Provides varying levels of cover for less complex treatments and services such as simple restorations, non-surgical extractions, preventive and diagnostic care.

Major dental insurance

Provides varying levels of cover for complex treatments such as complex restorations, crown and bridge, and specialist services.

Registered clinical oral health practitioner

Includes dentist, dental hygienist, dental therapist, oral health therapist (OHT) or dental prosthodontist registered with the Australian Health Practitioners Regulation Agency.
Statement of original work

I certify that this work contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in my name, in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text. In addition, I certify that no part of this work will, in the future, be used in a submission in my name, for any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution without the prior approval of the University of Adelaide and where applicable, any partner institution responsible for the joint-award of this degree.

I give consent to this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University Library, being made available for loan and photocopying, subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.

The author acknowledges that copyright of published works contained within this thesis resides with the copyright holders of those works.

I also give permission for the digital version of my thesis to be made available on the web, via the University’s digital research repository, the Library Search and also through web search engines, unless permission has been granted by the University to restrict access for a period of time.

________________________________

Dana Nicole Teusner

Date:      2016
Acknowledgements

I wish to thank my family Tim, Owen and Jessie, and in particular, I would like to give special thanks to Carmel and Ron Teusner, and Carmen Brincat-Cotton, for their love and support.

I also wish to thank my Supervisors Professor David S Brennan and Emeritus Professor A John Spencer. Thank you for your sense of humor, passion for public health and for your understanding.

I would like to acknowledge the following people who have helped and contributed to the process of conducting this thesis project:

Anne Ellershaw and Judy Stewart for their involvement in the 2008 National Dental Telephone Interview Survey.

Beverley Ellis for her assistance with data entry (dental insurance policy database).

Liana Luzzi, Deputy Director ARCPOH

Dr. Jane Harford, DIPS project

Fellow current and former ARCPOH postgraduate candidates and post-doctoral researchers, in particular, Kelly Jones, Sergio Chrisopoullos, Emmanuel Gnanamanickam, Dominic Keuskamp, Sue Gardner, Jenny Miller, Xiangqun Ju, Associate Professor Lisa Jamieson, Associate Professor Jason Armfield, Knute Carter, Madhan Balasubramian, Olga Anikeeva and Kostas Kapellas.
Funding support

This Ph.D. was supported by a Faculty of Health Sciences divisional scholarship.

NDTIS 2008 and the DIPS study were financially supported by the Commonwealth Government of Australia, Department of Health and Ageing.

The ‘Oral health and use of dental services’ study was funded by the Australian National Health and Medical Research Council (NHMRC project grant: 250316, 627037) and the ‘Attitudes to dental care’ follow-up study was supported by the Australian Dental Research Foundation (ADRF project grant: 68/2008).
Abstract

Objectives:
To describe associations between dental insurance and use of dental care by Australian adults. Two studies were conducted, the first assessed whether dental care use varied by level of dental insurance cover. The second study examined attitudes to dental care and tested whether these attitudes explain associations between dental insurance and dental visiting.

Methods:
The level of dental cover study sourced data from a nationally representative surveillance data collection and follow-up survey. Participant’s dental policies were examined and categorised by level of cover (i.e. generosity of cover). Dental care use and level of cover were described, and predictors of dental insurance status were assessed. Multiple variable models, accounting for participant characteristics and predictors of insurance, assessed associations between level of cover and various dental care use variables.

The attitudes to dental care study sourced data from a two-year cohort study on dental care use by middle-aged adults. A follow-up survey on attitudes to dental care was mailed to the cohort participants. Descriptive analysis of the sample’s dental care use and attitudes were reported. Multiple variable models assessed associations between dental insurance and dental care use accounting for dental care attitudes.

Main results:
Level of dental cover study: On average, dental cover held by insured adults was relatively limited in generosity. Having dental insurance and having a relatively higher level of cover was associated with higher socioeconomic status and some health-related variables. After accounting for explanatory variables, the pattern of associations with various measures of dental visiting indicated that insured adults (with any level of cover) had a more favourable pattern of dental visiting. Adjusted prevalence ratios of dental visiting increased as the level of insurance cover increased, but effect sizes were small and not significant (based on 95%CI). Insurance effects were modified by socioeconomic status, significant interactions observed indicated that insurance effects were slightly larger for adults in lower income groups. Adults with high level cover had a 20% higher prevalence of receiving a scale and
clean than uninsured adults; other service types assessed were not associated with insurance status.

Attitudes to dental care study: In unadjusted analysis, attitudes to dental care were positively associated with having dental insurance and positively associated with higher prevalence of regular and recent dental care use. After adjusting for dental care attitudes, associations between having dental insurance and dental visiting persisted and were only slightly attenuated. Insured adults had a 46% higher prevalence of having regular visits and 17% higher prevalence of a recent visit than uninsured adults.

Conclusion:

Among Australian adults, visiting patterns considered favourable for maintaining oral health were associated with having dental insurance. Among insured adults, use of dental care did not vary by level of cover. Accounting for oral health status and attitudes to dental care did not attenuate the associations between insurance and use of dental care. Insurance effects appeared larger for adults from lower socioeconomic groups than higher socioeconomic groups broadly indicating that universal insurance may not necessarily increase inequalities in access to dental care.

Keywords

Dental services, private health insurance, dental insurance, dental visiting, dental attitudes and dental public health.