Title: A DIFFICULT PATH TO WALK: CRITICAL CARE NURSES’ LIVED EXPERIENCE OF CRUCIAL CONVERSATIONS: PERSPECTIVES FROM ONE AUSTRALIAN TEAM

NIHADA BESIC
a1107124

Thesis for a Master’s Degree in Master of Nursing Science (Intensive Care Nursing),
The University of Adelaide 2017

ADELAIDE NURSING SCHOOL
FACULTY OF HEALTH SCIENCE
THE UNIVERSITY OF ADELAIDE

2017
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

TABLE OF CONTENTS ........................................................................................................ ii

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT ................................................................................................... vii

ABSTRACT ....................................................................................................................... viii

PREFACE ......................................................................................................................... 1

Disclaimer ....................................................................................................................... 2

CHAPTER ONE – INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND .............................................. 3

  Introduction .................................................................................................................. 3

  Early history of safety models in health ................................................................. 3

  Crew resource management ................................................................................. 4

  Team STEPPS ........................................................................................................... 6

  Evolution of thought that led to the development of Crucial Conversations as a safety system .......................................................... 6

  Crucial Conversations in the critical care setting ............................................... 7

  Summary of chapters ............................................................................................ 8

  Summary .................................................................................................................. 9

CHAPTER TWO - LITERATURE REVIEW .................................................................... 10

  Introduction .............................................................................................................. 10

  Search method and filters ...................................................................................... 10

  Classification of safety concepts in non health care industries ...................... 11

  Evidence for the adaptation to health care of safety methods from other fields .... 11

  Evidence for delineating behaviors in health care that threaten patient safety ...... 13

  Evidence for the clinical effectiveness of Crucial Conversations ...................... 14

  Synthesis of Crucial Conversation perspectives ............................................... 15
Critical Care Nurses’ Crucial Conversations

Current gaps in the published literature ............................................................... 16
Summary .................................................................................................................. 17

CHAPTER THREE – METHODOLOGY .................................................................. 18

Introduction .......................................................................................................... 18
Qualitative research ............................................................................................... 18
Phenomenology and hermeneutic phenomenology ............................................. 19
Choice of research method .................................................................................. 20
Van Manen’s method ............................................................................................ 21
Van Manen’s six components of phenomenological research ............................... 21
Van Manen’s method for isolating thematic statements ....................................... 22
Rigour and credibility in qualitative research ....................................................... 23
Summary ................................................................................................................ 24

CHAPTER FOUR – METHODS ............................................................................. 25

Introduction .......................................................................................................... 25
Ethical considerations ............................................................................................ 25
Participant recruitment .......................................................................................... 26
Conduct before, during and after the interview .................................................... 26
Data recording, storage and management ............................................................. 27
Auditing and confirmability .................................................................................. 28
Design .................................................................................................................... 28
Transferability and dependability ......................................................................... 30
Data collection ........................................................................................................ 31
Data analysis and interpretation: the place of the researcher’s personal experience .............................................................................................................. 33
Critical Care Nurses’ Crucial Conversations

1. Turning to the nature of lived experience.......................................................... 33
2. Investigating experience as we live it............................................................... 34
3. Reflecting on the essential themes which characterise the phenomenon.......... 34
4. Describing the phenomena in the art of writing and rewriting....................... 35
5. Maintaining a strong and orientated relation to the phenomenon................. 35
6. Balancing the research context by considering the parts and the whole......... 35

Isolating thematic statements.................................................................................. 35
The detailed reading approach................................................................................ 36
The selective or highlighting approach................................................................... 36
The holistic reading approach.................................................................................. 37
The development of themes and sub-themes - the first stage of analysis.......... 38
The second level of analysis - moving from key words and concepts to sub-themes and themes .......................................................... 40

Summary.................................................................................................................. 41

CHAPTER FIVE – INTERPRETATION AND DISCUSSION .................................... 42

Introduction............................................................................................................. 42
Crucial concerns..................................................................................................... 42
Major themes and subthemes.................................................................................. 45
Summary.................................................................................................................. 59

FINAL CHAPTER – DISCUSSION........................................................................... 59

Introduction............................................................................................................. 60
Strengths and limitations of the research process................................................ 60
Implications of crucial conversations for critical care nursing practice.............. 62
Synopsis of this thesis.............................................................................................. 64
SIGNED STATEMENT

I certify that this thesis contains no material that has been accepted for any award of any other degree or diploma in any other university.

To the best of my knowledge, this thesis contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due references has been made in the text.

I give consent to this thesis being available for loan and photocopying, when deposited in the School of Nursing Library.

_____________________________________________
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

In writing this thank you note, I come to the end of a long and intensive academic and personal journey. I would like to express my gratitude to the individuals who supported and guided me throughout this journey. Without their support and guidance, this thesis would not be possible. I owe a debt of gratitude to my colleague Svatka Micik. Thank you from the bottom of my heart. I clearly remember the day you told me ‘there is only so many bags you can buy, so many dinner parties you can host? ‘You told me, ‘you need to study’, ‘you are ready and I know you have it in you, I just don’t know how to get it out of you’. Your passion for empowering your colleagues has made working with you an honor. Your non-linear thinking, encouragement and reinforcement through every step of this research have enriched the way I look at things academically invaluably. My depth of gratitude for your patience and guidance cannot be reduced to words. My apologies go to your partner Michael for the ruined weekend of watching football in silence so as not to disturb the creative process of writing up this thesis. To yours and Michael’s canine friend Chipp, thank you for your undivided attention and endless hugs and kisses. I will miss coming over to your house to contemplate, debate and write. To my friend Lyn, who died of breast cancer, I am sorry you are not here. I know you would be very proud. I would also like to thank my supervisors Josephine Perry and Sindy Millington. Thank you for believing in me, from the beginning. Your wisdom, time generosity and positivity make me proud to be your student. I treasure our countless conversations and interesting avenues to explore. To my partner Gordon thank you for your patience. To my son as you can see it is never late for education. To my mother, thank you for modeling persistence and resilience throughout my whole life. To my friend Matilda, thank you for embarking on this academic journey with me. To all my friends and colleagues who have helped me in ways you cannot imagine, I thank you and I will never forget your generosity. And last, but not least, I would like to acknowledge my valued participants, the true legends of this voyage. It is my honor to represent your voices. I hope I have done your stories justice. Without you this thesis would not be possible.
ABSTRACT

This practice inquiry reports the lived experience of Crucial Conversations by a small group of critical care nurses in a South Australian quaternary hospital’s critical care unit. Crucial Conversations are high stakes, highly emotional dialogues, where opinions and understanding greatly differ. Executed well, these discourses result in increased collaboration, meaningful solutions to challenging issues and improved team performance. Literature reveals other systems in place for quality improvements in unit performance that include TeamSTEPPS and Safety Learning System (SLS) reporting, however, the unique conflict resolution strategies with reflective events has not been adequately covered. Crucial Conversations are one form of a structured resolution process, which addresses this gap. Research regarding the lived experience of Crucial Conversations is an important piece missing from the literature. Using van Manen’s hermeneutic phenomenological methods, ‘Too hot to handle’, ‘Anticipatory responding’ and ‘Moving from who is right to what is right’ emerged as themes of the critical care nurses’ lived experience of Crucial Conversations. The inquiry findings give complementary views to previous research, add to the body of knowledge related to Crucial Conversations and bring attention to the importance of improving professional relationships on all levels. The study findings lend themselves to a process of implementing Crucial Conversations into the critical care setting. The value of this research lies in the implementation of multidisciplinary strategies for effective ongoing working relationships.
PREFACE
My interest in Crucial Conversations began in 2012, during an amalgamation of the standalone cardiac intensive care, and general intensive care units of a major metropolitan public hospital in South Australia. It was anticipated that amalgamating the two teams of experts would result in a safer more effective clinical environment.

Instead distrust, lack of cooperation poor team cohesion, and disrespectful relationships ensued. The emergence of differences in clinical opinions was seen as a failure of the amalgamation, rather than an integral part of team performance. The expression of differing opinions turned into a struggle of power play with marked hierarchal emergence. The new team operated under stress. Internal team dynamics developed which led to lower performance and disrespectful interactions resulting in the Cardiothoracic Intensive Care External Review Report, 2 September 2013, which was subsequently tabled in the South Australian Parliament in 2014.

As a cardiothoracic critical care nurse I frequently witnessed or was personally involved in situations where individuals raised critical safety issues. Sometimes these discussions went well. At other times they resulted in angry emotional outbursts. On occasions, in corridor conversations my colleagues would discuss their reluctance to raise crucial safety issues for fear of being ridiculed or having their concerns dismissed, preferring instead to raise safety concerns in the Safety Learning System (SLS). Patient care suffered and team morale was low.

Change champions were employed to build cohesion, respectful interpersonal relationships and an acceptance of diverse opinions, in order to strengthen the team. The team was encouraged to create collaborative interdisciplinary care pathways, however there was no improvement in team dynamics.

Around this time I participated in a leadership and management program that introduced me to the concept of ‘Crucial Conversations’. The concept described by Paterson et al. (2012) as safety system that develops the personal skills necessary to
articulate difficult to discuss risks in ways that are effective and without the fear of being labelled as confrontational or a bully. My research on Crucial Conversations convinced me that this safety system could offer a way for the two opposing groups to work better together. I provided the book ‘Crucial Conversations: tools for talking when stakes are high’, to the Clinical Service Coordinator (CSC) of the cardiac intensive care unit (ICU) and the ICU Network Director. Both were supportive of the notion of Crucial Conversations.

The CSC encouraged me to choose Crucial Conversations as a topic for a project component of a Masters’ degree. I met with an organisational psychologist, a strong proponent of Crucial Conversations in 2014. Her enthusiasm for the topic and for its exploration in our current working environment further reinforced my commitment. In 2015 I enrolled in a Master’s program. In early 2016, I attended a two-day Crucial Conversation training course in Adelaide based on the book, Crucial Conversations by Paterson et al. (2012). The purpose was to develop the skills and confidence to have the tough conversations, get great results and build strong relationships.

Disclaimer
Although I have been part of this process described above and, although I know the people involved in this environment, I personally have not been part of any Crucial Conversations with any of the participants in the study and have not discussed this project externally. Hence, this project has been independent of the work environment.