Constructions of primary caregiving fathers and masculinities

Sarah Clare Hunter

School of Psychology
Faculty of Health Sciences
The University of Adelaide

Submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

November 2017
# Table of contents

Table of contents .................................................................................................................. iii

List of tables .......................................................................................................................... vii

Abstract ................................................................................................................................... viii

Declaration ............................................................................................................................. x

Acknowledgements ............................................................................................................... xi

Chapter 1: Introduction and contextualising the research .............................................. 12

Overview ................................................................................................................................. 12

Empirical research ............................................................................................................... 15

  Motivations: Why do men become primary caregivers? .............................................. 16

  Attitudes towards primary caregiving fathers .......................................................... 23

  Compensatory actions ................................................................................................. 27

Theoretical approach ........................................................................................................... 28

  Fathering or mothering? .............................................................................................. 29

  Terminology .................................................................................................................. 30

  Social constructionism ................................................................................................. 33

Constructions and representations .................................................................................... 34

  Parenting texts ............................................................................................................. 35

  Newsprint media ......................................................................................................... 37

Analytic approach .............................................................................................................. 40

  Discourse analysis .................................................................................................... 41

  Critical psychology .................................................................................................... 43
Ideological dilemmas ........................................................................... 44
Membership categorisation analysis .................................................... 44
Aims of this thesis ............................................................................. 45
Thesis overview .................................................................................. 46

Statement of authorship ..................................................................... 49

Chapter 2: Paper 1 .......................................................................... 51
Hegemonic masculinity ....................................................................... 54
Caring masculinity and the new and involved father ......................... 56
Primary caregiving fathers negotiating masculinities ....................... 57
Conclusion ......................................................................................... 62

Statement of authorship ..................................................................... 65

Chapter 3: Paper 2 .......................................................................... 67
Introduction ........................................................................................ 68
Previous research on men in parenting texts ...................................... 69
Method ............................................................................................... 71
Analytic approach ............................................................................. 71
Sample ............................................................................................... 72
Coding procedure .............................................................................. 74
Analysis .............................................................................................. 74
Fathers as financial providers ........................................................... 75
Established masculinity ..................................................................... 80
Masculine caregiving ........................................................................ 84
Inferiors to mothers .......................................................................... 87
List of tables

Table 1: *Parenting Manual Books* ................................................................. 73
Table 2: *Autobiographical Books* ................................................................. 73
Table 3: *Newspaper Sample for Chapters 4 and 5* ........................................ 189
Abstract

This thesis presents a discursive analysis of constructions and representations of primary caregiving fathers in popular parenting texts and Australian newsprint media. Primary caregiving fathers are increasingly the focus of both academic and cultural interest and this interest stems from the argument that there are shifting understandings and practices of fatherhood. Fathers are argued to be shifting away from traditional, provider models of fathering, toward a new and involved model where fathers can express a more nurturing side.

In addition to the changing nature and practice of fatherhood, there have been arguments that this change reflects and contributes to simultaneous changes in masculinities. Hegemonic masculinity – the form of masculinity that maintains men’s dominance – has long informed traditional definitions of fathers as the distant, financial provider. However, the concept of hegemonic masculinity cannot account for the experiences of primary caregiving fathers, as these fathers typically step away from the financial provider role. The literature therefore argues that there has been a shift away from hegemonic forms of masculinity and towards one that has been termed a “caring masculinity”.

The analyses in this thesis draw on a social constructionist and discursive approach to explore the constructions of masculinities and primary caregiving fathers in order to better understand and account for the experiences of these fathers. Taking this approach allowed for a focus on how fatherhood is a complex cultural and ideological construction that is continuously negotiated and constructed. In particular, three analytic chapters are concerned with the constructions and accounts of primary caregiving fathers in parenting texts published for
these fathers and Australian newsprint media. The analyses focus on interpretative repertoires, ideological dilemmas and membership categorisation devices deployed in the data. The analytic findings indicate that:

- Despite claims to encourage and promote primary caregiving fathers, parenting texts suggest very specific ways in which it is deemed appropriate for men to take on the primary caregiving role.
- Media accounts of primary caregiving fathers rest upon a principle/practice dichotomy of endorsing new and involved fathering in theory, but reproduce considerations that suggest it is unrealistic and impracticable.
- The category – primary caregiving father – is fluid and flexible and can be reworked to position these fathers as both within and transgressive of normative masculine and fathering boundaries.

This thesis concludes by discussing the implications of these constructions in relation to contemporary conceptualisations and practices of fathering and masculinities.
Declaration

I certify that this work contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in my name, in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text. In addition, I certify that no part of this work will, in the future, be used in a submission in my name, for any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution without the prior approval of the University of Adelaide and where applicable, any partner institution responsible for the joint-award of this degree.

I give consent to this copy of my thesis when deposited in the University Library, being made available for loan and photocopying, subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.

I acknowledge that copyright of published works contained within this thesis resides with the copyright holder(s) of those works.

I also give permission for the digital version of my thesis to be made available on the web, via the University’s digital research repository, the Library Search and also through web search engines, unless permission has been granted by the University to restrict access for a period of time.

Sarah Clare Hunter

Signature: ___________________________________________ Date: 29/11/17
Acknowledgements

This thesis was made possible due to a number of important people.

I firstly want to acknowledge and thank my supervisors – Damien and Martha. I appreciate the time and commitment you have given my research endeavours. I would not be where I am today without your guidance. A special thank you Damien for your insane turnaround time on drafts, it never ceased to amaze me.

To my family, although you may never quite understand what I have been doing for the past 4 years, I appreciate your relentless support and faith in me.

Jordan, your listening skills have undoubtedly saved me many days and our “power hours” are likely where I achieved most of my work. Thank you!

And of course, Stef. There is absolutely no way I could have gone on this journey without you. You have been through every step of this process with me, both emotionally and practically. For the all the ideas I ran by you, all the drafts you read, and all the time we spent together working (not working) and complaining. There is no one else I would have wanted to do this with.