Child Contact, Domestic Violence, and Family Law in Australia

Donna Celeste Roberts.
BSc (Hons). Grad Dip Psych Sci. BHSc (Hons).

School of Psychology
University of Adelaide

January 2018
# Table of Contents

Table of Contents ................................................................. i
List of Tables ........................................................................ v
List of Figures ......................................................................... vii
List of Abbreviations .............................................................. ix
List of Cases ........................................................................... xi
Abstract ................................................................................ xiii
Declaration .............................................................................. xv
Acknowledgments ................................................................... xvii
Introduction ............................................................................. 1

## Part One ...............................................................................

Part One .................................................................................. 3

## Chapter One ....................................................................... 

1. Introduction ........................................................................ 5

1.1. Family, marriage, divorce and family law ........................ 5
1.2. What is domestic violence? .............................................. 9
1.3. The impact of domestic violence on women ..................... 14
1.4. The impact of domestic violence on children .................... 17

1.4.1. The Adverse Childhood Events Study ......................... 23

1.5. Protection orders ............................................................. 24
1.6. The Family Law system .................................................. 27

## Chapter Two ....................................................................... 

2. The Australian Court System and Judiciary ....................... 31

2.1. Family Law ...................................................................... 33

2.2. Amendments to the Family Law Act ............................... 34

2.2.1. The 1995 Amendment ................................................ 35
2.2.2. The 2006 Amendment ............................................... 38
2.2.3. The 2011 Amendment ............................................... 42

2.2.4. Best interests of the child (BIC) ................................ 44

2.3. Family Law Personnel .................................................... 45

2.3.1. Judges ................................................................. 45

2.3.2. Lawyers ............................................................... 46

2.3.2.1. Barristers ......................................................... 48

2.3.2.2. Independent Children’s Lawyers ............................ 48

2.3.3. Family Consultants .................................................. 49
## List of Tables

1. Table 1: Disposition of parental responsibility in domestic violence cases in the Federal Magistrate’s court 2010-2012
2. Table 2: Parental responsibility in domestic violence cases by AVO/no AVO
3. Table 3: Details of participants and related court proceedings
4. Table 4: Themes present in the data
5. Table 5: Demographics
6. Table 6: Scoring method for measures
7. Table 7: Residence – overall and for those whose parents separated 2006 or later (all respondents, n = 210)
8. Table 8: Satisfaction with living arrangements overall (all respondents, n = 210)
9. Table 9: Satisfaction with living arrangements by sex of respondent (all respondents, n = 210)
10. Table 10: Face to face contact and the type of contact (primary care respondents only, n = 185)
11. Table 11: Face to face contact and the type of contact by sex of respondent (respondents with primary care only, n = 185)
12. Table 12: ‘Parental fear’, ‘care concerns’, and ‘care concerns – violence and abuse’ by ‘contact type’
13. Table 13: Paternal relationship pre- and post-separation, and experience of contact by contact type
14. Table 14: Paternal relationship and closeness of that relationship by contact type
15. Table 15: Correlations: Participants’ relationships with their fathers, the influence of maternal concerns including violence and abuse, and the type of contact experienced
16. Table 16: Multiple regression: predictors of participants ‘experience of contact’
17. Table 17: Logistic regression: predictors of the ‘type of contact’ (continuous vs. Non-continuous) experienced by participants
18. Table 18: Logistic regression: predictor variables scoring legend
19. Table 19: Amount of contact and feelings about contact by contact type (N = 154)
20. Table 20: Participants ‘experience of contact’ by ‘age at separation’ (n = 154)
Table 21: Participants’ ‘experience of contact’ by pre-separation relationship with the (now) non-resident father (N = 154)..................................................................................................................241

Table 22: Participants’ ‘experience of contact’ by contact type and parental relationship post-separation (n = 154)............................................................................................................................................244

Table 23: Participants’ ‘experience of contact’ by contact type and parental arguments post-separation (n = 154)............................................................................................................................................245

Table 24: Participants’ ‘experience of contact’ by fear of the other parent (n = 154)......248

Table 25: Participants’ ‘experience of contact’ by resident mothers’ concerns about the non-resident fathers’ parenting (n = 154).............................................................................................................249

Table 26: Participants’ ‘experience of contact’ by resident mothers’ encouragement of the relationship with the non-resident father..............................................................................................................251

Table 27: Participants’ feelings about contact with their non-resident father..................254
List of Figures

Figure 1: Law degrees in Australia..............................................................47

Figure 2: AVO cases where equal shared parental responsibility was ordered...........85
List of Abbreviations

ADHD – attention deficit hyperactive disorder
AVO – apprehended violence order
BIC – Best interests of the Child
DV – domestic violence
ESPR – equal shared parental responsibility
FCC – Federal Circuit Court
FCoA – Family Court of Australia
FLA – Family Law Act
FM – Federal Magistrate
FMC – Federal Magistrates Court
FV – family violence
ICL – Independent Children’s Lawyer
NRF – non-resident father
NRP – non-resident parent
PTSD – post traumatic stress disorder
# List of Cases

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pseudonym</th>
<th>Reference</th>
<th>Magistrate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cloake &amp; Cloake</td>
<td>[2011]FMCAfam784</td>
<td>Neville</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goldstein &amp; Hopkirk</td>
<td>[2010]FMCAfam469</td>
<td>Monahan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Houlis &amp; Houlis</td>
<td>[2010]FMCAfam972</td>
<td>Baker</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Howard &amp; Birnie and Anor</td>
<td>[2010]FMCAfam16</td>
<td>Bender</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Katzer &amp; Katzer</td>
<td>[2011]FMCAfam85</td>
<td>Harman</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marino &amp; Marino No.2</td>
<td>[2010]FMCAfam951</td>
<td>Brown</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meeker &amp; Loucks</td>
<td>[2010] FMCAfam345</td>
<td>Altobelli</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Starkey &amp; Starkey</td>
<td>[2011]FMCAfam940</td>
<td>Harman</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vogel &amp; Abel</td>
<td>[2010]FMCAfam1189</td>
<td>Harman</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Abstract

Divorce is a common experience for many children - around half of Australian divorces annually involve children under 18 years. Research indicates these children are worse off on several measures of well-being than children from intact families. Evidence suggests children can benefit from contact with the non-resident parent (NRP), usually the father, although not if he exhibits anti-social behaviours including violence and substance abuse.

Domestic violence (DV) is a pervasive, endemic, significant social and public health issue that can have a range of physical, emotional, social, legal, economic and political ramifications. The full extent of the problem is not understood due to considerable underreporting; however, studies reveal 25-34% of women who have ever had an intimate partner have experienced at least one form of violence in their lifetime.

A popular belief is that women should leave the violent/abusive partner, yet separation creates significant risk for women and children - more than 30% of women are murdered by their intimate partner at this time. These women are then required to arrange residence and contact agreements, frequently resorting to litigation.

This dissertation examined three elements of the family law process – court orders; the effects of contact with violent/abusive fathers on children subjected to orders; and finally, for young adults who have ‘aged out’ of the orders, their opinions about spending time with their NRP, particularly where violence/abuse was present.
Study one explored the application of the presumption of equal shared parental responsibility (ESPR) in cases with DV and apprehended violence orders (AVOs). Published judgments from the Australian Federal Magistrates Court for 2010-2012 were examined. Of 105 cases containing the term ‘domestic violence’, 68 had evidence of AVOs, 15 of these had an order for ESPR. Judgments fell into two groups: group one were “one off incidents”, group two recognised “severe violence”. The results indicated that some judges are unwilling to remove decision making responsibility from parents even when they acknowledge serious DV.

Study two examined the effects of court ordered contact for children of violent/abusive fathers. The sample comprised eight mothers whose children were ordered to spend time with fathers who were violent/abusive to the mother during their relationship. Qualitative interviews investigated mothers’ experiences of ex-partners’ behaviour at handovers, their parenting, and children’s behaviours before and after visits. Respondents were also asked about the attitude of legal practitioners, including judges who were often perceived as tending to minimise fathers’ behaviour or being towards mothers for wanting to protect their children. The results highlighted the potential links between problematic child behaviour and contact with their violent and/or abusive fathers.

Study three used a survey to assess the opinions of young adults (N = 210, 18-25 years) about contact with their NRP, usually the father. Most participants experienced maternal primary care; almost all had contact with their father post-separation, although the type of contact varied. The perception of contact as found to be related to the pre-separation relationship with the father. Good relationships predicted positive contact, whereas the reverse held for negative relationships.
Declaration

I certify that this work contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in my name in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text. In addition, I certify that no part of this work will, in the future, be used in a submission in my name for any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution without the prior approval of the University of Adelaide and where applicable, any partner institution responsible for the joint award of this degree.

I give consent to this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University Library, being made available for loan and photocopying, subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.

I also give permission for the digital version of my thesis to be made available on the web, via the University's digital research repository, the Library Search and also through web search engines, unless permission has been granted by the University to restrict access for a period of time.

I acknowledge the support I have received for my research through the provision of an Australian Government Research Training Program Scholarship.

Donna Roberts
January 2018
Acknowledgments

I dedicate this thesis to the honourable memory of Dr Peter Chamberlain, who sadly passed away in June 2017, a few months shy of seeing this work completed. I am so very blessed to have known Peter, and to have worked with him these last few years. He will be very much missed.

It has been a long and difficult journey to complete this labour of love, a journey that at times I was not sure I would complete, however, here I am! As such, I would like to thank both Peter and my other supervisor, Professor Paul Delfabbro for their insight, support and feedback. I have been blessed to have continued my research under their guidance. Sincere thanks also go to Professor Molly Dragiewicz, for sharing her knowledge and time with me. I would also like to thank Professor Anna Chur-Hansen for her support during the final stages of my PhD. I am deeply grateful to all of these people.

Thanks must also go to the participants in the studies – the young adults who took the time to complete the survey; and the wonderful, courageous women who came forward to participate in the interview study, and tell their often heartbreaking stories. I am blessed to have shared the time with these women, and hope that I can do their stories justice.

I would also like to profess my love and gratitude for my three children, Matui, Cheyenne-Jade and Nathaniel, for standing by me, supporting me and providing me with wonderful memories of what has been an interesting five years! I would also like to thank Athol Newell for the time we had together, for his strength, and his ‘fort holding’ that allowed me to attend conferences and the like.