Anglo-American Discourse About the USSR, 1984-1986.

Melody Catherine Watson

School of Humanities
Department of History
The University of Adelaide

Submitted for the postgraduate qualification of Doctor of Philosophy (History)
November 2017
# Contents

Abstract ................................................................................................................................. 4  
Declaration ............................................................................................................................ 6  
Acknowledgements ............................................................................................................... 7  
List of Abbreviations ......................................................................................................... 8  
Notes ................................................................................................................................... 9  
Introduction ......................................................................................................................... 10  
  Foundations ....................................................................................................................... 11  
  Approach ........................................................................................................................... 12  
  Thesis Structure ............................................................................................................... 13  
Chapter One: Methodology ............................................................................................... 15  
  Discourse and Identity ..................................................................................................... 15  
  Narrating the late Cold War ............................................................................................. 20  
  Russia and the Soviet Union ............................................................................................ 21  
  The Role of Gorbachev .................................................................................................... 24  
  The United Kingdom and the United States .................................................................... 26  
  Mainstream discourses ..................................................................................................... 26  
  Methodology .................................................................................................................... 32  
Chapter One: Common Threads in Anglo-American Discourse About the USSR, January 1984–February 1985 .............................................................................................................. 39  
  Historical Overview ........................................................................................................ 40  
  Timeline of Significant Events, 1982-1985 .................................................................. 43  
  Common Threads ............................................................................................................. 43  
  Media Commentators — Ian Davidson and William Safire ........................................... 47  
  Political Discourse — Ronald Reagan and Margaret Thatcher ..................................... 57  
  Conclusion ......................................................................................................................... 72  
Chapter Two: Discursive Tensions in Anglo-American Discourse About the USSR, January 1984–February 1985 ............................................................................................................. 74  
  Discursive Tensions ........................................................................................................ 75  
  Key Debates ..................................................................................................................... 77  
  Cold War ............................................................................................................................ 79  
  Reagan and Thatcher ....................................................................................................... 82  
  Davidson and Safire ......................................................................................................... 95  
  Conclusion ......................................................................................................................... 108
Chapter Three: Political Discourses from Chernenko to Geneva, March 1985–April 1986
- Gorbachev and Geneva .......................... 111
- Nuclear Strategy and Foreign Policy .......................... 112
- Defence, Strength and Deterrence .......................... 114
- The Strategic Defense Initiative .......................... 117
- Ronald Reagan on Peace .......................... 124
- Margaret Thatcher on Peace .......................... 131
- Geneva, Before and After .......................... 142
- Conclusion .............................................. 146

Chapter Four: Understanding Gorbachev: Newspaper Discourses of Anxiety, Optimism and Masculinity, March 1985–April 1986
- Gorbachev and Geneva .......................... 156
- Gender and Metaphor ........................................ 157
- Walker on Gorbachev as Protagonist ........................................ 158
- Davidson on Gorbachev as Foil ........................................ 163
- Safire on Gorbachev as Antagonist ........................................ 172
- Conclusion .............................................. 177

Chapter Five: Glasnost and the Chernobyl Disaster
- The Disaster .............................................. 187
- Chernobyl as a Critical Discourse Moment ........................................ 188
- Methodology .............................................. 189
- Initial Responses, 28-30 April ........................................ 191
- Chernobyl and Soviet Secrecy, 28 April-6 May ........................................ 192
- Chernobyl and Glasnost, 2 May-Onwards ........................................ 196
- Walker on Chernobyl ........................................ 204
- Conclusion .............................................. 211

Chapter Seven: Conclusion
- Patterns and Concepts ........................................ 220
- The Consequences of Discursive Change ........................................ 220

Appendix 1: Past, Present, and Future in Reagan’s Major Speeches, January 1984-March 1985 .......................... 233
Appendix 2: Number and Distribution of Articles Referencing Chernobyl, 29 April 1986-16 May 1986 ........................................ 235
Appendix 3: Sources provided in initial articles about the Chernobyl disaster, 29 April 1986 ........................................ 236
Bibliography .............................................. 239
Abstract
This thesis examines mainstream discourses about the Soviet Union in the United States and United Kingdom from 1984 to 1986. For more than 50 years, the Soviet Union presented an alternate image of modernity to that pursued by the USA and the UK. The Soviet Union was one of the great ‘Others’ against which the West, along with liberalism and democracy, could be defined. When commentators began to describe the Soviet Union as changing in the 1980s, this had far-reaching implications. As such, this thesis asks how the events of the 1980s, especially the rise of Gorbachev, were explained and discursively interpreted. Which discourses changed, and which ones remained the same? How were new events used to justify or disrupt traditional narratives about the USSR, which were themselves grounded in traditional narratives about Russia?

More specifically, this thesis addresses the ways in which important political figures and journalists changed or reinforced the ways that they described the world. An important part of this is understanding the place that Gorbachev occupied in Anglo-American discourse: did he challenge criticisms of the USSR or did he reinforce them, and was he reconceptualised by these discursive actors for the sake of maintaining the consistency of their discourses? It is also necessary to elaborate key narratives about the Soviet Union that had existed since the earliest meetings between the British and Russians, and demonstrate the way in which discourses about the USSR never truly departed from these frameworks. These topics have significance not just for understanding Anglo-American self-image, but also the nature of the late Cold War and the ways we attempt to make Eastern Europe explicable in the twenty-first century.

I approach these discourses through a study of political and newspaper commentary. Ronald Reagan and Margaret Thatcher are key figures whose discourse makes for strong case studies in both change and resilience. I also consider significant journalists, including foreign correspondents and political columnists like William Safire, Ian Davidson, and Martin Walker.

The sources that I use are those considered public. They were intended for widespread and open consumption. Above all, I analyse articles which discuss the USSR in several prominent newspapers: The Times, the Guardian, the New York Times, the Washington Post, and the Financial Times. I also use speeches by, and interviews with, Ronald Reagan and Margaret Thatcher. As far as is practical, I approach these sources in a
systematic fashion. The purpose of this is to demonstrate the existence and evolution of certain discourses, not to present a comprehensive picture of everything that was said about the USSR in this period.
Declaration

I certify that this work contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in my name, in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text. In addition, I certify that no part of this work will, in the future, be used in a submission in my name, for any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution without the prior approval of the University of Adelaide and where applicable, any partner institution responsible for the joint-award of this degree.

I give consent to this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University Library, being made available for loan and photocopying, subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968. I also give permission for the digital version of my thesis to be made available on the web, via the University’s digital research repository, the Library Search and also through web search engines, unless permission has been granted by the University to restrict access for a period of time.

22/11/2017
Acknowledgements

This thesis would not have been possible without the assistance of countless friends and colleagues, as well as the tireless efforts of staff at the University of Adelaide. I would particularly like to thank my supervisors, Dr Gareth Pritchard and Associate Professor Vesna Drapac for their wisdom, understanding, and patience. Gareth’s encouragement has kept me writing when I would rather be doing absolutely anything else, and his honest critique has been a blessing. It takes a great deal of trust to hand over new drafts and new ideas for dissection, and I have never found that trust misplaced. Further thanks goes to the postgraduate coordinators who helped me and offered advice along the way: Lisa Mansfield, Claire Walker, and Kathryn Bowd. The professional staff in the former School of History and Politics, the School of Humanities, and the Graduate Centre have also been amazingly helpful, as has the book-finding magic performed by Margaret Hosking from the Barr Smith Library.

The process of writing a thesis is a long one, and I can barely hope to remember all of the friends and colleagues who have helped along the way. But there are some who cannot be forgotten. I am more thankful than I can say to Sarah Johinke, who has accompanied me throughout this process, who has kept me rested and fed, and who has absorbed much more of my stress and fretting than is entirely fair. I also owe a great deal to Robyn and Graham Watson, Katie Harwood, and Augie Terrell, for their support and for helping me to think occasionally about something other than the 1980s. Beyond these few, my gratitude goes to a small army of occasional proofreaders and interlocutors, along with the other denizens of room 519. For encouragement, inspiration, and firmness when needed, thanks go to Alistair Grantham, Alexia Moncrieff, Phil Ritson, Jill McKenzie, Elizabeth Connolly, Steven Anderson, Jim Bates, Nerina Dunt, Dana Rehn, Fletcher O’Leary, Kate McLoughlin, Andrew Smith, Stuart Barrow, Xole Karman, and Drs Jodie Martin, Bodie Ashton and Clare Parker.

Last of all, I am endlessly grateful to my colleagues at the Adelaide University Union, who knew when not to ask about my thesis and whose flexibility made it possible to write while trying to pay the bills.
List of Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ABM</td>
<td>Anti-Ballistic Missile Treaty (1972)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BBC</td>
<td>British Broadcasting Corporation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CDA</td>
<td>Critical Discourse Analysis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CDM</td>
<td>Critical Discourse Moment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CIA</td>
<td>Central Intelligence Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CL</td>
<td>Critical Linguistics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPD</td>
<td>Committee on the Present Danger</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPSU</td>
<td>Communist Party of the Soviet Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FT</td>
<td><em>Financial Times</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G7</td>
<td>Group of Seven</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDR</td>
<td>German Democratic Republic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IAEA</td>
<td>International Atomic Energy Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IBM</td>
<td>Intercontinental Ballistic Missile</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IR</td>
<td>International Relations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KAL 007</td>
<td>Korean Airlines Flight 007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MAD</td>
<td>Mutual Assured Destruction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NATO</td>
<td>North Atlantic Treaty Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NSC</td>
<td>National Security Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NYT</td>
<td><em>New York Times</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK</td>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN</td>
<td>United Nations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UPI</td>
<td>United Press International</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>US</td>
<td>United States</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USA</td>
<td>United States of America</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USSR</td>
<td>Union of Soviet Socialist Republics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SALT II</td>
<td>Strategic Arms Limitation Treaty (1979)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SDI</td>
<td>Strategic Defense Initiative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TASS</td>
<td>Telegraph Agency of the Soviet Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TMI</td>
<td>Three Mile Island (nuclear accident)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WP</td>
<td><em>Washington Post</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WSJ</td>
<td><em>Wall Street Journal</em></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Notes

Because most of the primary sources used in this thesis were accessed online, either through databases or on the websites of various newspapers, my citations contain many URLs. For ease of reading, I have not included URLs in footnotes. They are, however, included in the bibliography where relevant. Citations of newspaper articles accessed through databases are instead followed by the database through which they were accessed: Factiva, Periodicals Archive Online, or ProQuest Historical Newspapers. Speeches are identified by the date on which they were given and the website through which they were accessed. Other websites are identified as such by noting of the date on which they were accessed. For example: ‘About the Public Papers of President Ronald Reagan’, Ronald Reagan Presidential Library and Museum, accessed 9 June 2016.