

Assemblages of care: why women with disordered eating are ambivalent to seek therapeutic care

Connie Marguerite Musolino

Thesis submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in
Gender Studies and Social Analysis (School of Social Sciences)
The University of Adelaide

Contents

List of Figures.....	vi
Abstract.....	vii
Declaration	ix
Acknowledgements.....	x
Rationale for journal choice.....	xii
Introduction.....	1
Terminology and remaking ‘eating disorder’ classifications	8
ARC project: A multidisciplinary study	15
Structure of thesis	17
Chapter One.....	22
Intersections of care: navigating discourses of psychiatry, health and self-care	22
Introduction.....	22
Being made through psychiatric classifications: The DSM-5 and eating disorder diagnosis....	26
Feminist analyses of eating, bodies and gender	30
Care as rhizomatic: Tracing care through multiple knowledges.....	37
Self-care regimes: Healthism, bodywork and the moralisation of fat	38
Theories of desire: The multiplicities and potential of disordered eating.....	43
Pro-disordered eating desire in everyday worlds	46
Conceptions of care: Caring practices in health, eating and bodies.....	50
Good care: negotiating coexisting care(s)	52
Letting someone care: the encounters of undeserving care and healthcare.....	55
Conclusion.....	57
Chapter Two	59
Coming forward: the research process.....	59
Characteristics of participants	61
First time disclosure of disordered eating.....	62
Previous diagnosis and length of disordered eating	64
Research Methods: The constraints and significance of a mixed methods approach.....	65
‘I’m not sick, but I’m not well’: Study design and ethical considerations	68
Recruitment processes	72
Hard to reach groups and research limitations	76

Semi-structured interviews, observation, EDE, diary writing and focus groups	80
Piloting	80
Semi-structured interviews	82
Eating Disorder Examination: administering a diagnostic tool	86
Observation and field notes	91
Diary writing	92
Focus groups	96
Confidentiality and handling of data	97
Analysis	97
Reflexivity: sucking my stomach in	100
Conclusion	101
Introduction to the findings chapters	103
Chapter Three	104
Disordered eating and choice in postfeminist spaces	104
Introduction	104
Feminist approaches to choice and agency	106
Article: Disordered eating and choice in postfeminist spaces	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Chapter Four	127
‘Healthy anorexia’: the complexity of care in disordered eating	133
Introduction	133
Article: ‘Healthy anorexia’: The complexity of care in disordered eating ... Error! Bookmark not defined.	
Chapter Five	145
Positioning relapse and recovery through a cultural and spatial lens of desire	145
Introduction	145
Triggering and spaces of desire in disordered eating	146
Article: Positioning relapse and recovery through a cultural lens of desire: An Australian case study of disordered eating	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Chapter Six	178
Developing shared understandings of recovery and care in the eating disorder therapeutic relationship	178
Introduction	178
Article: Developing shared understandings of recovery and care: a qualitative study of women with eating disorders who resist therapeutic care	Error! Bookmark not defined.

Conclusion: Disordered eating and the ‘choreography of care’	209
Thesis overview	213
Future considerations and recommendations for research.....	217
Appendices	219
Appendix 1 – Eating Disorder Examination	219
Appendix 2 - Recruitment Posters	220
Appendix 3: - Participant information sheets and consent forms.....	222
Appendix 4 - University of Adelaide Contacts and Independent Complaints sheet and debrief information and resources.....	232
Appendix 5 - Interview Schedules.....	234
Appendix 6 - Diagnostic results.....	240
REFERENCES.....	241

List of Figures

Description

1	“Continuum of eating behaviours”, NEDC, 2016	9
2	Recruitment poster located on the back of a toilet door at the University of Adelaide	71
3	Drawings from participant Gemma’s diary.....	94
4	Diary being coded	96
5	Participant diagnosis	193

Abstract

This thesis critically examines why women with disordered eating are reluctant or resistant to seek professional health care. In exploring whether participants perceive their eating practices to be problematic, I analyse how health, illness and disorder are constantly negotiated processes understood through the multiple contexts of care and its intersections with postfeminism, neoliberalism and healthism. I argue that these political and cultural contexts represent a constellation of contemporary forces that together have created an environment where disordered eating practices can be culturally valued, allowing the women in this study to rationalise their practices as healthy lifestyle choices and embodied performances of self-care.

Employing a mixed methods approach (including ethnographic interviewing and observation, diary writing and psychological evaluation) with 28 women in metropolitan Adelaide, South Australia, this research is one of the few national or international studies to engage with people who deny they have disordered eating and/or do not actively seek professional help. Extending Foucauldian theories of self-discipline and individual responsibility I argue that Bourdieu's (1977) concept of *habitus* and Mol, Moser and Pols' (2008, 2010) concept of care provide a broader theoretical framework to understand the ways in which people with disordered eating embody and practise care as a form of 'healthism'. In this way their agency of choice enables them to engage in gendered bodywork and symbolic capital.

Key to my argument is how desire works in practices of care, and I draw on Deleuze and Guattari (1987) and Probyn's (1996, 2000) productive theories of desire to show that desire is not contained within individuals but is constantly articulated in social relations and spaces. It is through this

Deleuzian approach to desire that I reveal the ambivalence of care, and the ways in which disordered eating provides a safe space for both caring and not caring. In so doing I demonstrate how and why people rarely follow a linear trajectory from (distinct categories of) illness to recovery, and are instead propelled constantly back and forth in movements that connect them to the perceived safety of caring spaces. Desire is thus positioned as a rhizomatic framework for tracing the everyday enactments and multiple assemblages of care which intersect in participants' lives.

Examining experiences of disordered eating through the theoretical lens of care, this thesis provides new knowledge about how the notion of care is rationalised, experienced and performed in participants' lives. I argue that this understanding of care is at odds with assumed, clinical and therapeutic models of care, thus providing new insights into the low rates of help seeking amongst people with disordered eating and the high rates of relapse and therapeutic treatment failure. This work has significance to both social scientists and to health professionals working in the fields of disordered eating.

Declaration

I certify that this work contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in my name, in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text. In addition, I certify that no part of this work will, in the future, be used in a submission in my name, for any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution without the prior approval of the University of Adelaide and where applicable, any partner institution responsible for the joint-award of this degree.

I give consent to this copy of my thesis when deposited in the university Library, being made available for loan and photocopying, subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968. The author acknowledges that copyright of published works contained within this thesis resides with the copyright holder(s) of those works.

I also give permission for the digital version of my thesis to be made available on the web, via the university's digital research repository, the Library Search and also through web search engines, unless permission has been granted by the university to restrict access for a period of time.

Signed

Dated

Connie Marguerite Musolino

Acknowledgements

Firstly, I would like to acknowledge the contribution of the participants to this project. I have ample respect and gratitude for the women who bravely reached out to talk to me and share their private and painful experiences. On first meeting we often fumbled nervously together, with me initiating polite chatter in slow-moving lifts, outside buildings, walking to office spaces and entering homes — both of us anticipating the weight of the conversation about to come. From these conversations I take away with me their honesty and rawness, thoughtfulness and intelligence, and strength and humour in difficult situations. Thank you.

I would like to acknowledge the financial support I received through my Australian Postgraduate Award (Industry) from the Australian Research Council grant that funded this project. I also acknowledge the industry partners for the grant, which included SA Health (Mental Health Unit) and the Weight Disorder Unit at Flinders Medical Centre.

Many thanks to Professor Tracey Wade and Dr Peter Gilchrist who were co-investigators on the Australian Research Council project. Their insight and depth of knowledge from working many years as researchers and clinicians in the field of eating disorders, as clinical members of a multidisciplinary research team, contributed greatly to the project on many levels. Their willingness to support and trust the sociological and anthropological approach to the research that Megan and I adopted was much appreciated.

Thanks to Dr Anne O'Shea, from Flinders University for taking the time during her PhD to provide me with training in administering psychological diagnostic interviews and for providing me with insights into the clinical processes of eating disorder diagnosis and classifications.

Loraine House and Kate Parsons established the Eating Disorder Association of SA (EDASA) during the early stages of this project and I thank them for providing valuable support in the recruitment process and offering advice and encouragement.

Thanks to Valerie Mobley for her contributions to editing the thesis.

Thank you to the administrative staff in the Department of Gender Studies and Social Analysis and the School of Social Sciences for all their prompt and friendly help throughout my candidature.

To my fellow postgraduates — an intelligent and compassionate bunch! — I'm thankful to have shared my experience with you over the past four years. So to Nadine Levy, Tara Bates, Mark Dean, Bridget Jay, Karen Williams, Kathy Radoslovich, Shawna Marks, Anne Burger, Dr Jillian Schedneck,

Sharyn Gouldie, Damian Creaser, Dr Gabbi Zizzo, Thomas Steeples, Zurina Simm, Dr Kirsty Whitman — thanks!

I greatly appreciate the teaching staff in the Department of Gender Studies and Social Analysis for being so dedicated to their teaching and research, and for their support and encouragement over the years. Thank you all for running such engaging and socially relevant undergraduate courses, which sparked my interest across a range of issues concerning gender, class, and race. Having the opportunity to study feminist and sociological studies has had a great impact on my personal relationship to the world and has been a source of strength and purpose. It is a privilege I do not take for granted. I would especially like to thank Associate Professor Megan Warin, Dr Anna Szorenyi, Associate Professor Susan Oakley, Dr Pam Papadelos, Dr Dee Michell, Dr Kathie Muir, Dr Erica Miller and Professor Margaret Allen.

To my supervisors, Associate Professor Megan Warin and Dr Tanya Zivkovic, I am grateful to have been supervised by two very devoted, intelligent and caring people. Megan, you have been much more than a supervisor, being a mentor and role model to me over the past four years. Your unwavering support and confidence in my abilities as a social researcher has helped me to develop my own confidence and a plethora of professional and academic skills. Thank you for giving me the opportunity to work on such an interesting and important project. To Tanya, thank you for always being encouraging and enthusiastic about my work. Your anthropological and thoughtful insights have contributed greatly to the development of my work.

To Vanessa — who else would I have to roll my eyes with when another person made a joke about university students? Thanks for being my sounding board and encouraging my academic aspirations.

To my sisters, Kathleen, Christine, Michelle and Vanessa — as the youngest, I have you all to thank for helping me to develop my critical listening and observation skills due to never being able to get a word in! Not to mention the ability to analyse any situation into the early hours of the morning. There is never enough time to talk, and always a lot to talk about.

Finally, I thank my parents Karen and Tony. Thank you for the emotional and financial support, and for holding off asking ‘when are you going to finish?’ until the very end. Your resolute and non-judgemental support for my academic endeavours has allowed me to find my own path, and through your example of treating people with care and compassion you have unwittingly pointed me in the right direction.

Rationale for journal choice

The articles in this thesis were submitted to journals, the choice of which reflects the multidisciplinary approach of this research project and a central aim that its findings should reach academic audiences nationally and internationally across the social sciences and health sciences, as well as health professionals working in the field of eating disorders.

The first article in this thesis, entitled 'Disordered eating and choice in postfeminist spaces' was published in a special edition for *Outskirts: Feminisms along the edge*. The special edition, themed 'Responsibility', selected papers from the Australian Women and Gender Studies Association Conference held in Melbourne in June 2014, at which I presented the building blocks of this article. This is a leading Australian feminist and gender studies online journal produced through the School of Humanities at the University of Western Australia. *Outskirts* is a double-blind peer-reviewed journal with a 2010 ERA Ranking "A"¹. *Outskirts* was an appropriate choice for disseminating findings from this study, which are based on women's experiences with disordered eating and how they engaged with gendered regimes of health, fitness and beauty. In addition, this article interrogates theories on choice, agency and empowerment, which feminist scholars have pioneered. The feedback I received on this article from reviewers in the field of feminist and gender studies was valuable to the article's theoretical development. Moreover, as an open access journal it is freely accessible to a broad readership.

¹ Excellence in Research for Australia (ERA) is an assessment system that evaluates the quality of the research conducted at Australian universities.

The second article in this thesis, entitled 'Healthy anorexia: The complexity of care in disordered eating', was published in *Social Science and Medicine*. This is a prestigious international journal with a high impact factor (2014: 2.890); it reaches a broad readership, including social scientists, health professionals and policy makers. The rigorous submission guidelines and peer reviewing process contributed to the strength of this article's methodology and theoretical arguments.

The third article in this thesis, entitled 'Positioning relapse and recovery through a cultural lens of desire: An Australian case study of disordered eating', has been submitted to the forthcoming Special Issue 'Anthropological Perspectives on Eating Disorders' in the journal *Transcultural Psychiatry*. The aim of the special edition is to reflect on what anthropologists have achieved methodologically and theoretically in the eating disorder field in the last decade. *Transcultural Psychiatry* draws from disciplines of psychiatric epidemiology, medical anthropology and cultural psychology, and publishes articles concerned with the social and cultural determinants of psychopathology and psychosocial treatments of a range of mental and behavioural problems in individuals, families and communities. Critical analysis of the field of psychiatry through a cultural lens, and considering how participants related and interacted with psychiatric diagnosis and labelling are central to this thesis, and therefore this journal was an appropriate forum to disseminate the research findings.

The final article in this thesis is entitled 'Developing shared understandings of recovery and care in the eating disorder therapeutic alliance' and has been accepted for publication in the *Journal of Eating Disorders*, which is the first open access, peer-reviewed journal publishing leading research in the clinical practice of eating disorders. This concluding article is based on the study's findings and makes recommendations to health professionals working in the field of eating disorders.

Dissemination through this journal has the potential to reach policy makers and service providers in Australia. As it is 'open access' it also has the potential to reach a wider audience outside of academia, including health professionals working across the field of eating disorders, as well as carers and people with disordered eating.