BRUCKNER’S NINTH
REVISITED

TOWARDS THE RE-EVALUATION OF A
FOUR-MOVEMENT SYMPHONY

THESIS

Submitted for the Degree of
Doctor of Philosophy
in
Adelaide University
Elder Conservatorium — School of Performing Arts

by

JOHN ALAN PHILLIPS

— VOLUME ONE —

© Copyright Adelaide 2002
# Contents

## VOLUME I

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Abstract</td>
<td>xii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Declaration</td>
<td>xiii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Tables</td>
<td>xiv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Musical Examples</td>
<td>xv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Facsimiles</td>
<td>xvi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>0.1 Foreword</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.1.1 Mistaken assumptions concerning the Ninth and its Finale</td>
<td>xix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.1.2 The new research</td>
<td>xx</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.1.3 Justification for this study</td>
<td>xxiv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.1.4 Approach and outline</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>0.2 Guide to Terminology</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.2.1 Glossary of German terms</td>
<td>xxxi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.2.2 General abbreviations</td>
<td>xxi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.2.3 Library sigla</td>
<td>xxv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.2.4 Bibliographic sigla</td>
<td>xxv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.2.5 The citation of works by Bruckner</td>
<td>xxxvi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.2.6 Internal cross-reference</td>
<td>xvi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>0.3 Concerning BiblioClassifications</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.3.1 The use of prepared paper in the score of the Finale</td>
<td>xxi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.3.2 The revision of Orel's biblio classificiations</td>
<td>xxi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>0.4 Acknowledgements</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## PART ONE. THE GENESIS AND SUBSEQUENT HISTORY OF THE NINTH

### 1.0 Preliminary

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.0.1 Introduction to Part One</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.0.2 Literature</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.0.3 Beethoven, Bruckner, and the Ninth Symphony</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.0.4 The problem of the primary sources and their modern-day reading</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 1.1 Bruckner’s Last Years

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.1.1 The beginning of work on the Ninth: the last revision phase</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1.2 The composition of the first three movements</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1.3 Growing fame, declining health</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1.4 Bruckner’s will; relations with his ‘disciples’</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1.5 The move to the Belvedere</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1.6 The beginning of work on the Finale</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1.7 The projected opera</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1.8 Keller’s recollections concerning the Finale</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1.9 Bruckner’s devotional life and state of health</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1.10 The composition of the Finale</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1.11 The Te Deum as Ersatz</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1.12 The final months</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1.2 The Transmission of the Sources

1.2.1 Bruckner’s death ........................................ 109
1.2.2 The disposal of Bruckner’s musical estate .......... 111
1.2.3 The transmission of the autograph score of the Ninth ...
1.2.4 The transmission of the manuscript MS of the Ninth ...
1.2.5 The transmission of the original sketches for the Finale ...
1.2.6 The transmission of the orchestral reductions of the Finale ...
1.2.7 More recent developments .................................. 148
1.2.8 Conclusions ............................................. 145

1.3 Reception of the Ninth Symphony and its Finale

1.3.1 Early Bruckner reception: a perspective ............... 149
1.3.2 Ferdinand Löwe’s version of the Ninth ................. 151
1.3.3 The reception of the Löwe version ..................... 159
1.3.4 Early opinion concerning the Finale and the Tē Deum .... 168
1.3.5 The “Streich um den eckigen” Bruckner” and the Gesamtausgabe: then and now .... 175
1.3.6 Alfred Orel and the Ewanspiele and Sitzung ........ 196
1.3.7 Reception in the 1930s and early 1940s ............... 202
1.3.8 Max Aus and the Finale .................................. 206
1.3.9 Reception from the late 1940s to the early 1970s .... 219
1.3.10 Contrasting views: Paul-Gilbert Langevin and Harry Huthweich .... 218
1.3.11 More recent views ...................................... 225
1.3.12 Towards a “Wirkungsgeschichte” of the Ninth Symphony ...... 233
1.3.13 Conclusions ............................................. 247

1.4 Performing Versions of the Finale, 1934–1990

1.4.1 Apologies .................................................. 252
1.4.2 Terminological clarification ............................... 253
1.4.3 The term “reconstruction” and the Finale .............. 257
1.4.4 The methodology required by a performing version of the Finale ........ 258
1.4.5 Early piano preparations .................................. 263
1.4.6 Fritz Oster ............................................... 265
1.4.7 Edward Neill and Giuseppe Guastali ................. 267
1.4.8 Arthur D. Walker ....................................... 267
1.4.9 Hein’s Grünwald ........................................ 268
1.4.10 Ernst Masendorfer ...................................... 270
1.4.11 Marshall Fine ........................................... 275
1.4.12 William Carragan ....................................... 276
1.4.13 Nors S. Josephson ...................................... 281
1.4.14 Nicola Samale and Giuseppe Mazzucca .............. 283
1.4.15 The Rome Symposium .................................... 296
1.4.16 Nicola Samale and Gianni Cohn ....................... 297
1.4.17 Conclusions ............................................. 302

PART TWO. BRUCKNER AS THEORETICIAN AND COMPOSER

2.0 Prolegomena

2.0.1 Introduction to Part Two .................................. 307
2.0.2 Outline .................................................. 310
2.0.3 Literature ............................................... 315
2.1 Bruckner’s “musikalische Architektur”
  2.1.1 The relationship between theory and composition .................................. 321
  2.1.2 Harmonic theory in Bruckner’s teaching and compositional practice .......... 331
  2.1.3 "Terschichtig" and the ninth chord ...................................................... 340
  2.1.4 Bruckner’s formal concepts .................................................................... 346
  2.1.5 Period structure and metrical numbers ............................................... 352
  2.1.6 The numerology hypothesis ................................................................. 363
  2.1.7 Conclusions ......................................................................................... 368

2.2 The Motivic-Thematic Process
  2.2.1 The Mutationsverfahren ......................................................................... 370
  2.2.2 Motivic-thematic process in the Ninth .................................................. 375
  2.2.3 Quotation, allusion, and the Mutationsverfahren .................................... 382
  2.2.4 On Bruckner’s conception of the Ninth ................................................. 390

PART THREE. THE RECONSTRUCTION OF THE FINALE

3.0 Prolegomena
  3.0.1 Introduction to Part Three ................................................................. 399
  3.0.2 Literature ............................................................................................ 402

3.1 The Sources Re-Assessed
  3.1.1 The sources for the Finale ................................................................. 408
  3.1.2 The Orol edition and its revision; Nowak’s corrections ......................... 413
  3.1.3 Working method and compositional process ........................................ 420
  3.1.4 The condition and legibility of the MSS .............................................. 431
  3.1.5 The paper types .................................................................................. 434
  3.1.6 The particello sketches ....................................................................... 437
  3.1.7 The paper rulings ................................................................................. 441
  3.1.8 The composition of the Finale ............................................................. 451
  3.1.9 The editorial principles of the Autograph-Partitur ............................... 474
  3.1.10 Critical commentary on the reconstruction of the Autograph-Partitur ...... 480
  3.1.11 The ‘vir-go’ markings and the Te Deum transition .............................. 507

3.2 The Dokumentation des Fragments
  3.2.0 Introduction .......................................................................................... 512
  3.2.1 Concerning the Dokumentation des Fragments .................................... 513
  3.2.2 Editorial principles .............................................................................. 516
  3.2.3 General critical remarks ...................................................................... 517
  3.2.4 The question of tempo ........................................................................ 518
  3.2.5 Further suplementations ...................................................................... 519
  3.2.6 Critical commentary ............................................................................ 520
  3.2.7 Concerning the coda ............................................................................ 544

3.3 The Aufführungsfassung
  3.3.0 Introduction .......................................................................................... 546
  3.3.1 Concerning the Aufführungsfassung .................................................... 549
  3.3.2 Editorial principles .............................................................................. 550
  3.3.3 General critical remarks ...................................................................... 552
  3.3.4 The question of tempo ........................................................................ 554
  3.3.5 Further suplementations ...................................................................... 557
  3.3.6 Critical commentary ............................................................................ 558
  3.3.7 Concerning the coda ............................................................................ 592
  3.3.8 The conjectural Te Deum transition .................................................... 609
3.4 History and Reception of the Finale since 1990

3.4.1 Research developments since 1990

3.4.2 The Linz premiere and ensuing reception

3.4.3 Lectures and publications

3.4.4 Subsequent performance plans

3.4.5 The Fluchthorn recording

3.4.6 The German and Italian premieres

3.4.7 Publication of the Aufführungsfullage

3.4.8 Publication of the Autograph-Partitur

3.4.9 Publication of the Faksimile-Ausgabe

3.4.10 The 1996 Bruckner Symposium

3.4.11 Reception of the Aufführungsfullage since 1996

3.4.12 The Dokumentation des Fragments

3.4.13 The Ninth Symphony in the Gesamtausgabe

3.4.14 Conclusions

Epilogue

APPENDICES

I. Notes for the first CD release of the Aufführungsfullage by Concarre Tokyo (J. A. Phillips)

II. Notes for the second CD release of the Aufführungsfullage by Sonarte (B. G. Cohrs)

III. "Text spoken at the premiere of the Dokumentation, November 1999 (Nikolaus Harnoncourt)

IV. Notes for the Bremen performances of the Aufführungsfullage, March 2000 (Eva Finde)

V. "Das Finale der Neunten Symphonie: Herausforderung an den musikalischen und musikwissenschaftlichen Kanon" (J. A. Phillips)

VI. "Für die IX. ist gezeugt:" Einige Erläuterungen zum Editionsprojekt Neunte Symphonie in der Bruckner-Gesamtausgabe—und wie es dazu kam" (J. A. Phillips)

BIBLIOGRAPHY

I. Musical Scores and Critical Reports

II. Biography, Documentation, Reception

III. Further Perspectives

IV. The Ninth Symphony and Finale

V. Bibliographic Studies; Work Listings
VOLUME II

Volume Two is paginated in seven sections:

A. Tables [Tabs.] .................................................. Ad-i, 1–47
B. Musical Examples [Mus. Ex.] ................................. Bi-ii, 1–25
C. Facsimiles [Facs.] ................................................. Ci-iv, 1–361
D. Entwürfe und Skizzen zur IX. Symphonie, edited by Alfred Orel (Leipzig 1934), pages relevant to the Finale [Orel] ........................................................... Di-ii, i–6, 63–143
F. Dokumentation des Fragments (Documentation of the Fragment), edited by John A. Phillips (Vienna 1999, 2002) [DAP] .............................................. Fi-xvi, 1–84

Detailed listings of the Tables, Musical Examples and Facsimiles are given on pp. xiv ff. below.
Abstract

Ever since its first performance in 1903, the Ninth Symphony of Anton Bruckner (1824–1896) has been generally thought of as a symphony in three movements. Despite the publication in 1934 of the surviving materials for the fourth movement together with the known sketches and drafts for the first three, the existence of a highly advanced orchestral score for the Finale of this symphony was until recently largely ignored or dismissed as irrelevant. The author’s research established the following:

i. That the surviving fragments of the orchestral score of the Finale constitute no mere draft but an emergent autograph score;

ii. That Bruckner, by the time of his death, may have reached the end of the movement in its initial score phase, and

iii. That material for the Finale has not survived the work’s capricious transmission.

Endorsed by an examination of Bruckner’s compositional techniques, these findings, firstly, make a Performing Version of the movement a far more justifiable proposition, resulting in publication and performance of the version edited by Samale, Phillips, Cohn and Masson (Adelaide–Bremen 1992, 1996). Secondly, it brought about a decision by the Bruckner Complete Edition (Musikwissenschaftlicher Verlag, Vienna) to publish a reconstruction of the movement from the extant sources (1994, 1999), facsimile edition of relevant manuscripts (1996), and monograph (forthcoming). In 1999 and 2002, Musikwissenschaftlicher Verlag published a second performing version of the Finale, the Dokumentation des Fragments, based solely on the surviving fragments of the movement. The original project was expanded to encompass a new edition and critical report on the first three movements (2000, 2002), separate monographs on the sources for each movement and a text volume on the symphony’s genesis and reception.

This thesis combines a detailed history of the Finale and its reception with an account of the author’s philological research and commentaries on the resulting scores and publications—research which in time may assist musical opinion in re-evaluating this work more closely along the lines of its composer’s original conception. It is divided into three sections:

Part One, The Genesis and Subsequent History of the Ninth, examines the biographical background surrounding the composition of the symphony, the transcription of its manuscripts and critical reception of both the trio of the first three movements and, in varying realisations, the Finale.

Part Two, Bruckner as Theoretician and Composer, examines the theoretical underpinnings of Bruckner’s compositional technique, the insights into his compositional procedures to be gained from an understanding of his harmonic and structural thinking, and presents a model for better understanding the motivic processes of his music.

Part Three, The Reconstruction of the Finale, examines Bruckner’s compositional method, the surviving manuscripts of the Finale, its compositional chronology and reconstruction. Included are critical reports on the reconstruction of Bruckner’s autograph score, the Documentation and Performing Version of the Finale, and an account of the critical reception of the Finale to 2004.

Volume One concludes with six appendices of relevant texts and articles and a comprehensive bibliography. Volume Two comprises the tables, musical examples and manuscript facsimiles, a reproduction of relevant portions of Alfred Ott’s 1934 publication, and the scores of the reconstructed autograph, Documentation and Performing Version.