ACCELERATING CONTROL

An ethnographic account of the impact of micro-economic reform on the work of health professionals

By

Eileen Mary Wilks

A thesis submitted in fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

University of Adelaide
Department of Social Inquiry
January
2004
TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF TABLES ........................................................................................................ vi
LIST OF FIGURES ...................................................................................................... vii
ABSTRACT ................................................................................................................ viii
Statement of originality ............................................................................................ x
Acknowledgements .................................................................................................. xi
PREPARATORY NOTATION .................................................................................. xiii
  Acronyms and abbreviations ................................................................................. xiv
  Management and industrial relations glossary .................................................. xvi
  Health care system glossary ............................................................................... xviii
  Medical and nursing glossary .............................................................................. xxiv

CHAPTER ONE: TIME TO START ........................................................................... 1
  Introduction: time and the control of health professionals ................................ 1
  An outline of the thesis ....................................................................................... 6
  Why a thesis on time: factoring in the self? ....................................................... 14

CHAPTER TWO: TIME IN HEALTH CARE: BODILY, GENDERED
AND ABSTRACT WORKING TIME ..................................................................... 10
  Introduction: theories of time .......................................................................... 16
  Incorporating understandings of natured/bodily modes of time into health care 18
  Gendered relations of time use in the labour process ....................................... 23
  Abstract time and domination: the treadmill of innovation ............................ 28
  A cultural history of abstract time .................................................................... 35
  A timely conclusion ........................................................................................... 43

CHAPTER THREE: METHODOLOGICAL CONSIDERATIONS & SHORT
STAY ETHNOGRAPHY ......................................................................................... 45
  A brief introduction to the methodology ......................................................... 45
  The research process ....................................................................................... 48
  Interpretation and analysis of working time at Westervale ............................ 50
  Ethnography: a short-term approach to understanding the social world ....... 57
  Ethnographic trustworthiness: emotions and time ........................................ 63
CHAPTER FOUR: CREATING A POLICY FRAMEWORK FOR ACCELERATING CONTROL OF HEALTH PROFESSIONALS’ TIME

Introduction: service professionals and autonomy ...........................................72
The new public management ..............................................................................76
Controlling health professionals through labour market flexibility ..................79
Controlling health professionals through performance management ..............80
The introduction of casemix funding and the Medicare incentives into public hospitals in South Australia .................................................92
Concluding discussion .....................................................................................101

CHAPTER FIVE: BENCHMARKING TIME IN THE PUBLIC ACUTE

HOSPITAL SECTOR: GIVING SHAPE TO ABSTRACT TIME ............................104

Introduction: benchmarking and time ............................................................104
Benchmarking efficiency through the use of time ............................................108
Benchmarking productivity through time .........................................................116
Benchmarking quality through the use of time .................................................117
Benchmarking access through the use of time ................................................119
Concluding discussion .....................................................................................126

CHAPTER SIX: FROM ORDINARY TO EXTRAORDINARY ABSTRACT TIME 129

Introduction: ordinary everyday time ............................................................129
Managing beds: rationalising the chaotic .........................................................138
Hospital rosters and the maintenance of professional boundaries ..................140
Power and time: medical control of nurses’ time .............................................146
The first innovation: managing beds, up-skilling and intensifying work ..........149
Concluding discussion .....................................................................................153

CHAPTER SEVEN: REDETERMINING AND RESISTING THE NURSING

HOUR USING EXCEL Care ..............................................................................155

Introduction: an ethnographic account ...........................................................156
The second innovation: Excelcare, the computerised nursing workload product ......158
Excelcare as scientific computerised management ..........................................160
Excelcare: contradictory practices and ambiguity ............................................161
Evidence-based research on computerised workload products .....................166
The Excelcare project on Hartley: not yet resistance .......................................168
Excelcare: the managerial agenda ....................................................................170
Excelcare and service weights: the bureaucratic agenda ..................................172
Excelcare and resistance ..................................................................................174
Concluding discussion ...................................................................................177
CHAPTER EIGHT: FROM MANAGERIAL TO MEDICAL CONTROL OF TIME
Introduction: scientific management versus evidence-based medicine
Nursing case management and clinical pathways
The third innovation: the cardiac clinical pathways project
Clinical pathways: the case for ambiguity and resistance
The fourth innovation: the Fast Track Surgery Project
Nursing labour time and the Fast Track Surgery Project
Concluding discussion

CHAPTER NINE: EXTENDING THE TIME BETWEEN EPISODES OF CARE
Introduction: Reducing readmissions; gendered care
The fifth innovation: the Program Budget and Marginal Analysis (PBMA) to reduce readmissions
The first PBMA Report: gathering the medical and financial evidence
The PBMA study: Phase two
The Nursing Respiratory Outreach Program
Organised and individual resistance: a gendered analysis
Concluding discussion

CHAPTER TEN: TIME TO FINISH
Introduction: Time to summarise
Labour market flexibility: enterprise bargaining, resistance and abstract time
Performance management systems: benchmarking, organisational and cultural change
Making time for disposable time: the question of resistance
Methodological limitations
An apocalyptic ending?

REFERENCES
Major References
Silent references - Omitted in this document

APENDICES
Appendix A: Introductory statement
Appendix B: Consent form
Appendix C Angina clinical pathway for Mawson ward
Appendix D Valid variance codes used at Westervale
ABSTRACT

This thesis is a sociological study that examines the way in which time is used to exert control over the work of health professionals. The thesis explores political, bureaucratic and managerial attempts to control the labour time of nurses and doctors in one public hospital in South Australia. The period covered is 1992–2000, a time characterised by Federal government bi-partisan initiatives to wind back the welfare state.

The study shows how political control was attempted through micro-economic strategies built into enterprise bargaining and the performance management strategies incorporated into Medicare, and casemix models of funding. Bureaucratic attempts at control are illustrated by the imposition of benchmarks for productivity, efficiency, quality and access, while managerial control is evident in the processes of constant workplace change. The account offered here draws on document analysis and focused ethnography to understand the impact of these changes on the work of nurses and doctors.

The response of hospital managers and health professionals to the ‘reforms’ introduced by the Commonwealth and State governments between 1992 and 2000 was to introduce a number of changes aimed at saving time. The thesis presents four case studies of five time-saving innovations introduced at Westernvale Hospital. These were: (1) a program to change the culture to up-skill, and interalising the work; (2) the implementation of ‘Excelcare’, a computerised nursing workload product; (3) a nurse-managed clinical pathway program; (4) a Fast Track Surgery Project controlled by surgeons; and (5) the utilisation of the resource allocation tool: Program Budget and Marginal Analysis.

These attempts to control the labour time of health professionals were rarely completely successful. Resistance was evident through organised union activity via enterprise bargaining, through the use of evidence-based medicine and through gendered differences in responses to the innovations. It was also organised along professional lines. As a consequence the traditional doctor/nurse division of labour and associated medical dominance remained largely intact.

This exploration of the re-organisation of working time reveals much about the nature of time itself in capitalist society. It suggests that in human service workplaces in capitalist societies, subject as they are to budgetary constraints, time is predominantly abstract and empty. The
monetary value of the worker's hour is repeatedly reduced in order to create surplus value and to ensure continuous productivity and efficiency gains. The cultural predispositions supporting this approach to time can be found in the historical origins of capitalism: firstly in the Roman Catholic invention of Purgatory and later in the Protestant work ethic. Embedded in Purgatory and the Protestant ethic is the origin of a secular psychological predisposition, or *purgatorial complex*. This is a profound anxiety towards time in everyday life.