Re-Thinking Islamic Architecture
A Critique of the Aga Khan Award for Architecture
Through the Paradigm of Encounter

Katharine A. R. Barisch
BArch (Adel), BArch (Hons) (Adel)

A thesis submitted to The University of Adelaide in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

School of Architecture, Landscape Architecture and Urban Design Centre for Asian and Middle Eastern Architecture

July 2005
# Table of Contents

Abstract iv  
Declaration v  
Acknowledgements vi  
List of Abbreviations vii  
List of Figures viii  

1 Introduction  
1.1 OVERVIEW 1  
1.2 AIMS AND METHOD 5  
1.3 STRUCTURE 11  

2 The Paradigm of Encounter  
2.1 INTRODUCTION 14  
2.2 CULTURAL ROOTS AND CULTURAL ROUTES 14  
2.2.1 Islamic Roots 18  
2.2.2 Islamic Roots and Architecture 20  
2.2.3 Islamic Routes and Architecture 31  
2.3 SUMMARY 42  

PART I EUROPEAN TRAVEL AND THE FORMATION OF THE DISCOURSE  

3 Islamic Architecture in Image and Text  
3.1 INTRODUCTION 45  
3.1.1 Medieval European Travel 46  
3.1.2 European Colonial Encounters 47  
3.2 THE GRAND TOUR 49  
3.2.1 Late Limits 50  
3.2.2 Beyond the Pyrenees 51  
3.2.3 Exotic Itineraries 53  
3.3 SCHOLARLY EXPEDITIONS 58  
3.3.1 Intrepid Architects 60  
3.3.2 Comparing Islamic Architecture 63  
3.3.3 Abstracting Design Principles 70  
3.4 SUMMARY 73  

4 Building Islamic Architecture Amidst Encounters  
4.1 INTRODUCTION 74  
4.2 INTERNATIONAL EXHIBITIONS 74  
4.2.1 Exhibition Objectives 76  
4.2.2 Reciprocal Identity 77  
4.2.3 Civic Identity 82  
4.2.4 Building Beyond the Exhibition 85  
4.3 SUMMARY 93
Abstract

This research examines how the Aga Kahn Award for Architecture, established in 1977, manifests a re-thinking of Islamic architecture since the formation of the predominant discourse on that topic in the nineteenth century. It identifies a shift in thinking in recent scholarship from re-presentations of Islamic architecture as 'other'—that are traced to the formation of an influential discourse about Islamic architecture by European scholars in the nineteenth century—toward a more dynamic confluence of architecture and Islam.

To do so, this research privileges the paradigm of 'encounter' to capture an entangled terrain of contemporary architectural practice and coexistent assertions of cultural difference. To address this simultaneous condition of interaction and difference, this thesis turns to an interdisciplinary shift away from essentialist representations of culture. This research draws specific inspiration from the writing of anthropologist James Clifford. Clifford characterises essentialist representations of culture with the metaphor of cultural roots. This thesis adopts this metaphor to describe the pervasive tendency to represent architecture as an essential expression of Islam, often represented as a homogeneous religious and cultural entity. Clifford's alternative metaphor of cultural routes enables the conceptualisation of varied experiences of dwelling and travelling amidst global encounters today. Encounters provoke assertions of cultural identity—of 'self' and 'other'. Paradoxically, encounters enable coexistence, interaction and transformation.

The Award manifests this paradox. A collective search for Islamic identity and its potential manifestation in architecture, premoted at the time of the Award's conception, can be linked to perceptions of escalating encounters between Islam and the West. However, a 'homogeneous 'self' image and its potential manifestation in architecture has been uprooted during the sophisticated evolution of the Award. The Award presents a unique forum for the articulation of plural, often contradictory, perspectives on architecture and Islam (predominantly published in English). This has inspired further reflection in this thesis on the creative possibilities arising from the productive encounter of differences. This thesis complements the merits of a unique Award that has received minor critical attention. It aims to further contribute to global debate on identity and difference, whilst bringing timely insights to contemporary architectural scholarship and practice.