Moving from Meat

Vegetarianism, Beliefs and Information Sources

Emma J. Lea B.A. (Hons)
Department of Public Health
The University of Adelaide

Thesis submitted for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy
The University of Adelaide
Submitted November 2001
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

*List of appendices* .................................................................................................................. iv  

*List of figures* ....................................................................................................................... v  

*List of tables* ........................................................................................................................ vi  

*List of publications published or submitted during candidature* ....................................... viii  

*Abstract* ................................................................................................................................ ix  

*Declaration* ............................................................................................................................ xi  

*Acknowledgements* ................................................................................................................ xii  

1. **Literature Review** ............................................................................................................ 1  
   1.1 Introduction...................................................................................................................... 1  
   1.2 Vegetarianism ............................................................................................................... 2  
   1.3 Factors associated with food choice behaviours ......................................................... 16  
   1.4 Vegetarian diets and health ......................................................................................... 42  

2. **Aim and Hypotheses** ...................................................................................................... 48  
   2.1 Study aim...................................................................................................................... 48  
   2.2 Research hypotheses .................................................................................................... 49  
   2.3 Rationale and chapter outline ..................................................................................... 52  

3. **Study Design and Method** ............................................................................................ 55  
   3.1 Introduction.................................................................................................................. 55  
   3.2 Interviews with vegetarians ......................................................................................... 56  
   3.3 Random population survey ......................................................................................... 58  
   3.4 Survey of vegetarians .................................................................................................. 64  
   3.5 Data management and statistical analyses .................................................................. 64  

4. **Response and Respondent Characteristics** ................................................................... 73  
   4.1 Response........................................................................................................................ 73  
   4.2 Sample distribution and potential bias in the survey ................................................... 73  
   4.3 Actual consumption of animal products by self-identified dietary group .................. 78  

5. **Factors and Frequencies: Comparisons between Beliefs of Vegetarians, Non-Vegetarians, and Semi-Vegetarians** ........................................................................................................ 81  
   5.1 Introduction.................................................................................................................. 81  
   5.2 Method.......................................................................................................................... 82  
   5.3 Use of information sources ......................................................................................... 83  
   5.4 Trust in information sources ....................................................................................... 87  
   5.5 General nutrition beliefs and behaviours ..................................................................... 93  
   5.6 Beliefs about meat ....................................................................................................... 95  
   5.7 Barriers to vegetarian diets ......................................................................................... 102
5.8 Benefits of vegetarian diets...................................................... 110
5.9 Personal values................................................................. 118
5.10 Conclusion............................................................................ 123

6. The Factors Associated with Meat Consumption............... 126
   6.1 Introduction.......................................................................... 126
   6.2 Method............................................................................... 130
   6.3 Results............................................................................... 130
   6.4 Discussion.......................................................................... 133

7. The Factors Associated with the Belief that Meat is Necessary.. 144
   7.1 Introduction.......................................................................... 144
   7.2 Method............................................................................... 146
   7.3 Results............................................................................... 147
   7.4 Discussion.......................................................................... 149

8. The Factors Associated with Health Concerns about Vegetarian
   Diets and Meat Appreciation.................................................. 154
   8.1 Introduction.......................................................................... 154
   8.2 Method............................................................................... 155
   8.3 Results............................................................................... 156
   8.4 Discussion.......................................................................... 158

9. The Factors Associated with the Belief that Meat is Unhealthy... 161
   9.1 Introduction.......................................................................... 161
   9.2 Method............................................................................... 164
   9.3 Results............................................................................... 165
   9.4 Discussion.......................................................................... 167

10. The Factors Associated with the Belief that Vegetarian Diets
    Provide Health Benefits......................................................... 172
    10.1 Introduction........................................................................ 172
    10.2 Method............................................................................ 173
    10.3 Results............................................................................ 174
    10.4 Discussion........................................................................ 176

11. The Information Source Factors Associated with Meat Consumption
    and Health-Related Beliefs about Meat and Vegetarianism....... 180
    11.1 Introduction....................................................................... 180
    11.2 Method............................................................................ 183
    11.3 Results............................................................................ 184
    11.4 Discussion........................................................................ 190

12. Prevalence of Prospective Vegetarians................................... 197
    12.1 Introduction....................................................................... 197
    12.2 Method............................................................................ 199
    12.3 Results............................................................................ 201
    12.4 Discussion........................................................................ 216
13. Discussion........................................................................................................224
    13.1 Introduction..................................................................................................224
    13.2 Key findings..................................................................................................224
    13.3 Implications of results..................................................................................238
    13.4 Limitations of the study................................................................................251
    13.5 Directions for future research.................................................................255
    13.6 Conclusion....................................................................................................258

Appendices............................................................................................................259

Bibliography..........................................................................................................327
LIST OF APPENDICES

Appendix 1: Information elicited from vegetarian interviewees........................................259
Appendix 2: Information sheet for interviewees..............................................................261
Appendix 3: Consent form signed by interviewees.........................................................262
Appendix 4: Interviewees' characteristics......................................................................263
Appendix 5: Questionnaire cover letter.........................................................................264
Appendix 6: Questionnaire............................................................................................265
Appendix 7: Responses to questionnaire items for the random population sample........278
Appendix 8: Principal components analysis results for the random population sample.....285
Appendix 9: Multiple regression results for the random population sample...................296
Appendix 10: Cross-tabulation results by sex and dietary group for the pooled (random and vegetarian) samples............................................................301
Appendix 11: Multiple regression results by sex and age group for the pooled (random and vegetarian) samples..........................................................309
Appendix 12: Cross-tabulation results of frequency of animal food consumption, meat beliefs and barriers and benefits of vegetarianism for vegetarians, prospective vegetarians and omnivores (pooled samples)........................................322
Appendix 13: Multiple regression analysis results of Animal Welfare, Environmental and Hunger Benefits of Vegetarianism for non-vegetarians and vegetarians (pooled samples).............326
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 12.1: Categorical principal components plot showing the areas covered by the object points for the vegetarian group and the two non-vegetarian groups (prospective vegetarians and omnivores) for beliefs about meat, perceived benefits of vegetarianism, and perceived barriers to vegetarianism.................................202

Figure 12.2: Frequency of red meat consumption ("never", "rarely", "one to three times a month", "one to four times a week", "daily or almost daily") for vegetarians, prospective vegetarians and omnivores, expressed as the percentage of cases.......203

Figure 12.3: The level of interest in vegetarianism ("not interested", "somewhat interested", "very interested", or "unsure" if interested) for prospective vegetarians and omnivores, expressed as the percentage of cases.......................................................204

Figure 12.4: The perceived likelihood of making some changes towards becoming vegetarian during the next six months ("not likely", "slightly likely", "quite likely", "very likely", or "unsure") for prospective vegetarians and omnivores, expressed as the percentage of cases.................................................................205

Figure 12.5: Proportion of the friends of vegetarians, prospective vegetarians and omnivores who are vegetarian ("none", "a few", "about a quarter of my friends", "about half of my friends", "about three-quarters of my friends", "all"), expressed as the percentage of cases.................................................................205
LIST OF TABLES

Table 4.1: The demographic characteristics of the random population survey respondents (n = 601), the non-randomly selected vegetarian and semi-vegetarian sample (n = 106), and, where applicable, the South Australian population as a whole, as obtained from the 1996 Census................................................................. 76

Table 4.2: The percentage of self-identified vegetarians, semi-vegetarians and non-vegetarians who stated that they consume red meat, white meat and fish/seafood at various frequencies......................................................... 80

Table 5.1: Results of principal components analysis, and cross-tabulations analysis by dietary group, of use of food, health and nutrition information sources........................................ 84

Table 5.2: The five most highly used sources of food, health and nutrition information for each dietary group (non-vegetarians, semi-vegetarians, vegetarians).......................... 86

Table 5.3: Results of principal components analysis, and cross-tabulations analysis by dietary group, of trust in food, health and nutrition information sources.......................... 89

Table 5.4: The five most highly trusted sources of food, health and nutrition information for each dietary group (non-vegetarians, semi-vegetarians, vegetarians)..................... 90

Table 5.5: Results of cross-tabulations analysis by dietary group of general nutrition beliefs and behaviours........................................................................................................... 94

Table 5.6: Results of principal components analysis, and cross-tabulations analysis by dietary group, of beliefs about meat.................................................................................. 96

Table 5.7: The five strongest beliefs about meat for each dietary group (non-vegetarians, semi-vegetarians, vegetarians).................................................................................. 98

Table 5.8: Results of principal components analysis, and cross-tabulations analysis by dietary group, of barriers to vegetarianism............................................................................. 103

Table 5.9: The five strongest perceived barriers to the consumption of a vegetarian diet for each dietary group (non-vegetarians, semi-vegetarians, vegetarians)...................... 105

Table 5.10: Results of principal components analysis, and cross-tabulations analysis by dietary group, of benefits of vegetarianism........................................................................... 112

Table 5.11: The five strongest perceived benefits of the consumption of a vegetarian diet for each dietary group (non-vegetarians, semi-vegetarians, vegetarians)...................... 114

Table 5.12: Results of principal components analysis, and cross-tabulations analysis by dietary group, of personal values...................................................................................... 120

Table 5.13: The five strongest personal values for each dietary group (non-vegetarians, semi-vegetarians, vegetarians)...................................................................................... 122

Table 6.1: Multiple regression analysis of frequency of meat consumption........................................ 132

Table 7.1: Description of the Meat is Necessary score, obtained by summing respondents' answers to the four variables, and the percentage of non-vegetarians, semi-vegetarians and vegetarians who agreed with the variables.............................................. 146

Table 7.2: Multiple regression analysis of Meat is Necessary.................................................................. 148
| Table 8.1: | Multiple regression analysis of *Vegetarianism Health Concerns and Appreciates Meat*..........................................................................................................................157 |
| Table 9.1: | Description of the *Meat is Unhealthy* score, obtained by summing respondents' answers to the four variables, and the percentage of non-vegetarians, semi-vegetarians and vegetarians who agreed with the variables......................................................163 |
| Table 9.2: | Multiple regression analysis of *Meat is Unhealthy*.................................................166 |
| Table 10.1: | Multiple regression analysis of *Health Benefits of Vegetarianism*..............................175 |
| Table 11.1: | Multiple regression analysis of frequency of meat consumption, with information sources as predictors...............................................................185 |
| Table 11.2: | Multiple regression analysis of *Meat is Necessary*, with information sources as predictors....................................................................................................................186 |
| Table 11.3: | Multiple regression analysis of *Vegetarianism Health Concerns and Appreciates Meat*, with information sources as predictors..........................................................187 |
| Table 11.4: | Multiple regression analysis of *Meat is Unhealthy*, with information sources as predictors....................................................................................................................188 |
| Table 11.5: | Multiple regression analysis of *Health Benefits of Vegetarianism*, with information sources as predictors...............................................................189 |
| Table 12.1: | Differences between vegetarians', prospective vegetarians' and omnivores' general nutrition beliefs and behaviours.................................................................206 |
| Table 12.2: | Differences between vegetarians', prospective vegetarians' and omnivores' frequency of use of food, health and nutrition information sources..................................................208 |
| Table 12.3: | Differences between vegetarians', prospective vegetarians' and omnivores' frequency of trust in food, health and nutrition information sources..................................................208 |
| Table 12.4: | The eight most highly used sources of food, health and nutrition information for vegetarians, prospective vegetarians and omnivores.................................................209 |
| Table 12.5: | The eight most highly trusted sources of food, health and nutrition information for vegetarians, prospective vegetarians and omnivores.................................................210 |
| Table 12.6: | Personal value differences between vegetarians, prospective vegetarians and omnivores.................................................................................................................211 |
| Table 12.7: | The eight strongest beliefs about meat for vegetarians, prospective vegetarians and omnivores.................................................................................................................214 |
| Table 12.8: | The eight strongest barriers to the consumption of a vegetarian diet for vegetarians, prospective vegetarians and omnivores.................................................215 |
| Table 12.9: | The eight strongest benefits of the consumption of a vegetarian diet for vegetarians, prospective vegetarians and omnivores.................................................216 |
LIST OF PUBLICATIONS PUBLISHED OR SUBMITTED DURING CANDIDATURE


Lea, E., & Worsley, A. Are information sources associated with Australians' beliefs about the necessity of meat? *Ecology of Food and Nutrition;* accepted for publication June 2001.


CONFERENCE ABSTRACT

ABSTRACT

A random population survey \((n=601)\) and a survey of vegetarians \((n=106)\) were conducted to examine South Australians' beliefs about meat and vegetarianism. Meat beliefs, barriers and benefits of vegetarianism, meat consumption, personal values, use of and trust in sources of food/nutrition/health information and demographic variables were measured via a written questionnaire.

There were differences in the responses of vegetarians, semi-vegetarians, and non-vegetarians. For example, vegetarians were more likely than non-vegetarians to use and trust unorthodox information sources and to hold universal values (e.g. "equality").

The factors associated with meat consumption and four sets of health-related beliefs about meat and vegetarianism \((Meat is Necessary, Vegetarianism Health Concerns and Appreciates Meat, Meat is Unhealthy, Health Benefits of Vegetarianism)\) were examined. Other (health and non-health) beliefs, barriers and benefits of vegetarianism were the most important factors overall to be associated with these beliefs and with meat consumption. Information sources were also associated (particularly orthodox, unorthodox, mass media, advertising, and social sources). Together, these results provided insight into how consumption of meat and plant foods might be influenced.

Finally, the proportion of prospective vegetarians was gauged. Approximately 15% of non-vegetarians were found to hold similar beliefs about vegetarianism as vegetarians. Prospective vegetarians were distinct from vegetarians and the remaining
omnivores. For example, they were less likely than the remaining omnivores to eat red meat as frequently or to be Anglo-Australian.

The research suggested that a significant portion of the population is interested in vegetarian diets, but that certain barriers need to be overcome if this is to increase and lead to dietary change; in particular, the beliefs that vegetarian diets are nutritionally inadequate and that meat is essential for health. Tailored communications about how to prepare healthy, tasty vegetarian meals may also be useful. The results indicated the sources of food/nutrition/health information that may be most appropriate to disseminate such messages. Additionally, it was found that ethical (e.g. environmental, animal welfare) issues were linked to health and dietary behaviour. They may need to be more fully addressed by health professionals if the public is to obtain maximum benefit from plant-based diets, with minimum risk.
DECLARATION

This work contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text.

I give consent to this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University Library, being available for loan and photocopying.

EMMA J. LEA
November 2001
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I wish firstly to thank my supervisor, Professor Tony Worsley, for his intellectual guidance and support over the last few years. He has shown much patience with my never-ending questions and has been a wonderful source of inspiration.

I also express my gratitude to Chris O'Brien, Kristen de Wit, Hamish Meffin, Ross Meffin, and Vanessa Lea for the time they spent helping to fold and envelope questionnaire booklets and letters. Chris O'Brien helped at the survey pre-tests with the recruitment of participants and the administration of early versions of the questionnaire. Dr Phil Ryan and Nicole Pratt provided statistical advice, as did Dr Hamish Meffin. I thank my parents, Linda and Jeff, my brothers, Elvin and Patrick, and my sister, Vanessa, for their support and advice and for their proofreading assistance. Andrew Clissold, Chris O'Brien, Christine Crawshaw, Ross Meffin, Kerry Boswell and Robert Ryan also provided invaluable help proofreading chapters.

I owe a special thank you to Chris O'Brien for his support and encouragement since I began this thesis.

Financial assistance for the survey was provided through an ARC small grant.