Optimism in child development: Conceptual issues and methodological approaches.

Edwina M. Farrall

School of Psychology
University of Adelaide
South Australia

October, 2007

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT DECLARATION ACKNOWLEDGMENTS LIST OF TABLES LIST OF FIGURES	viii xi xii xii
CHAPTER ONE: Introduction and Review of the Literature	1
'Optimism as a Dimension of Positive Psychology: Theories, Methodologies, and Implications for the Study of Child Development'	
The genesis of 'positive psychology'	3
Positive well-being and notions of resilience and thriving	7
The development of an organizational framework of resilience in children	10
External factors affecting resilience	15
Internal factors affecting resilience	16
The framework itself: Synthesizing and utilizing the knowledge base	22
Taking positive psychology forward	23
Affect and cognition in the developing child: Optimism as a potential mechanism toward ensuring resilience	25
On optimism: Assumptions, intuitions, and typologies	28
Stepping back: What is "optimism", and what is known or assumed about it?	29
Optimism, temperament, and self-regulation	30
"Situated optimism"	32
"Dispositional optimism"	34

Test	35
Specific expectancies and "unrealistic optimism"	40
"Big" versus "little" optimism	42
Optimism and pessimism: Roles and relatedness	44
The measurement of child optimism	46
The new Youth Life Orientation Test	47
The YLOT: Development, structure, and interpretation	48
Alternate approaches to the measurement of optimism	53
Optimism and hope	53
Vignette-based methodologies and optimism	55
Optimism as an explanatory framework: Using the optimism/pessimism dichotomy to explicate issues of health and psychopathology	56
State-based optimism as a determinant of physical health outcomes	57
Trait-based optimism as the key to mental health	59
Cognitive models of psychopathology: The Response Style Theory of depression	62
The way forward: Aims of this program of research	65
CHAPTER TWO: Study One: Contributing Factors to Youth Optimism and Pessimism Part One	71
'Do Cognitive Coping Styles Mediate the Age-Related Decline in Optimism?'	
METHOD	77
Participants	77
Measures	78
Procedure	82

Planned Data Analyses	83
Statistical analysis and interpretation: A note on statistical emphases in this, and future, studies	84
RESULTS	86
Extending the findings: Predictive and mediating models	93
Rationale and testing of the proposed mediation model	98
DISCUSSION	102
CHAPTER THREE: Study Two: Contributing Factors to Youth Optimism and Pessimism Part Two 'Assessing the Interplay of Dispositional and Cognitive Coping Factors upon Affective Outcomes in Late Childhood'	112
METHOD	121
Participants	121
Measures	121
Procedure	125
Planned data analyses	126
RESULTS	127
DISCUSSION	134
CHAPTER FOUR: Study Three: Comparing Optimism Methodologies	144
'The Utility of the YLOT and a Series of Hypothetical Trait- Based Vignettes as Measures of Youth Optimism and Pessimism'	
The vignette methodology: Premises and practices	147
Children's trait-based thinking	149

Attributions and domain applicability: The domains of biology and	
psychology	150
METHOD	156
Participants	156
Measures	156
Procedure	162
Planned data analyses	163
RESULTS	164
Hypotheses 1 and 2: Age and patterns of optimism and pessimism	165
Hypotheses 3 and 4: Measure concordance and prediction	168
DISCUSSION	172
Age and optimism: Implications for the scope of children's optimism and its independence from pessimism	173
Discerning optimism: Drawing on notions of domain-specific thinking and permissible change	176
Concordance between the YLOT and the vignettes: Implications for the future conceptualization of optimism and pessimism	178
CHAPTER FIVE: Study Four: The Functionality and Dimensionality of the YLOT	184
'A Pilot- and Factor Analytic Study drawing on the Outcomes of the 'Optimistic Kids' Intervention'	
'Optimistic Kids': An intervention program	186
Intervention programs: Penn Resilience Program (PRP) and Optimistic Kids (OK)	187
METHOD	196
Design and intervention procedures	196
The school	196
The participating children	197

The intervention	198
Planned analyses and participant pool characteristics	203
RESULTS	205
Research Question 1: Indications of intervention efficacy based on YLOT scores obtained	205
Research Question 2: Indications of the underlying dimensionality of the YLOT through exploratory Factor Analysis	207
DISCUSSION	214
CHAPTER SIX: General Discussion	224
'Constructions and Functions of Children's Optimism and Pessimism: A Grounding Framework for the study of Discrete Domains of Resilience and Vulnerability'	
The work so far: Implications for positive psychology and the systematic study of resilience	225
Optimism as an explanatory framework of resilience: Evidence of relevance or specificity?	227
Children's cognitive and emotional development: Potential roles and benefits of optimistic and pessimistic processes through childhood and adolescence	231
Optimism theories as frameworks of well-being: Reduction and deduction in the epistemological pursuit of 'resilience'	237
The measurement of optimism and pessimism: Alternate approaches and common conceptual premises	240
The dimensionality of the YLOT: Evidence in support of the discernment and uniqueness of children's optimism	243
The vignette approach: Methodological benefits and theoretical implications	245
Reconciling the measurement of optimism and pessimism with that of cognitive coping style: Adaptive sets of expectancies or independent indices of self-regulation?	248
Towards a new ontology of optimism: Challenges to potential assumptions and misconceptions in its theoretical foundation	258

Theories of optimism: Typologies and functions	259
Reconciling the existing research methodologies and findings with a new foundation to the study of optimism and pessimism through childhood and adolescence	262
Concluding comments	266
APPENDIX A: Presentation of the Youth Life Orientation Test	269
APPENDIX B: Presentation of the Children's Response Style Questionnaire	275
APPENDIX C: Presentation of the modified 'anxiety' version of the Children's Response Style Questionnaire	282
APPENDIX D: Example scenarios from the series of hypothetical trait-based vignettes	289
APPENDIX E: Statistical results from the multiple regression procedures undertaken in pursuit of the mediation model analyses in Study One	292
APPENDIX F: Statistical results from the multiple regression procedures undertaken in pursuit of the mediation model analyses in Study Two	295
APPENDIX G: Illustrated tasks from the workbook provided to children participating in the Optimistic Kids intervention in Study 4	297
REFERENCES	298

ABSTRACT

Past research into optimism and pessimism has tended to view these constructs as polar opposites of a fixed personality trait that function in mutually exclusive ways. In the field of child development in particular, this has led to theory-driven work that not only accepts this dichotomy but also uses it to drive and explicate larger issues of resilience and vulnerability. The current thesis challenges the assumptions underpinning this conceptual framework, and, through the use of divergent methodologies, seeks to establish children's optimism as a dynamic and adaptive process with predictive value during the developmental period. In the first two studies, predictors and correlates of putative dispositional optimism and pessimism in children and adolescents were examined. A significant age-related decline in optimism was found, but importantly a degree of functional independence between optimism and pessimism was also observed. The third study elicited more specific optimistic expectancies using a vignette methodology. This was seen to share some congruence with the earlier measures of dispositional optimism, but the study also elucidated some of the parameters and realism constraining children's optimism. Again an age-related decline in optimism was demonstrated that was distinct from any associated changes in pessimism. The fourth and final study involved a pilot examination of the dimensionality of the optimism construct, confirming its functional independence from pessimism, and also demonstrating the fluidity and receptivity of children's optimistic processes from an intervention perspective. From these various studies, it is concluded that optimistic and

pessimistic processes in children and adolescents reflect functionally distinct pathways and drive different aspects of vulnerability and well-being. A reconfiguration of the extant theory in this area seems warranted. Based on this conceptual and methodological critique, a preliminary proposal is put forward towards a more substantive approach to the development of optimism and pessimism during childhood and adolescence.

DECLARATION

This thesis contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any
other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the
best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or
written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text.

I give consent to this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University

Library, being made available in all forms of media, now or hereafter known.

Signed,

Edwina M. Farrall

Date:

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to offer my sincere thanks to the following people, all of whom have provided help and support throughout my PhD candidature:

My supervisors Professor John Taplin and Dr Lisa Kettler: for the guidance, advice, thoroughness and dedication you have both shown throughout the course of this research program. It is so deeply appreciated.

My partner Andrew Brolese: for your support, your humour and patience, your insight and care, and your constant love, all of which kept me on course through our doctoral years.

My parents Vanda and Michael Farrall, my sisters and brothers, and my close friends, especially Emily Kilpatrick and Rebecca Grivas: for encouragement, intellectual challenge and growth, laughter, motivation, and perspective.

Assoc. Professor Paul Delfabbro and Professor Deborah Turnbull: for all your help, valuable input, and support over the years.

Last but by no means least, Simon Andrews and Chris Thompson of North Eastern Psychological Services and 'Optimistic Kids': for the amazing opportunities you have given me.

LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1: Means (<i>SDs</i>) of all variables included in bivariate correlation analyses	88
Table 2.2: Showing correlations of Age, extravsersion (E), neuroticism (N), rumination coping (Rum), distraction coping (Dist), PS coping (PS), internalising behaviour symptoms T-score (Int.B) and externalising behaviour symptoms T-score (Ext.B), with the YLOT scores of subscale optimism (Opt), subscale pessimism (Pess) and total optimism (T.Opt)	88
Table 2.3: Showing correlations between the YLOT subscale optimism (Opt) and pessimism (Pess) scores, extraversion (E) and neuroticism (N) scores, and T-scores of internalising behaviour symptoms (Int.B) and externalising behaviour symptoms (Ext.B)	90
Table 3.1: Means (SDs) of all variables included in bivariate correlation analyses	127
Table 3.2: Correlations between the YLOT measures (subscale optimism [Opt], pessimism [Pess], and total optimism [Total Opt]), and age, rumination coping (Rum), distraction coping (Dist), Problem-Solving coping (PS) and SCAS scores	128
Table 3.3: Correlation and regression statistics obtained with regard to ascertaining the power of CRSQ-A (Rumination subscale) for predicting scores on the SCAS	130
Table 4.1: Showing all scores obtained for Sections A, B, C, and overall, from the Vignette Method	162
Table 4.2: Means (SDs) of age and YLOT and vignette scores obtained	164
Table 4.3: Correlations amongst the variables of interest: Age, YLOT scores (optimism, pessimism subscales, and total optimism) and the vignette scores (total scores for all positive and all negative valence traits, as well as component subsections A, B and C)	165
Table 5.1: Mean scores (SDs) of subscale optimism, subscale pessimism, and total optimism at Time1 (pre-test) and Time2 (post-test)	206

Table 5.2: PCA factor loadings, factor % variances, and	210
communalities of the items of the YLOT	210
Table 5.3: YLOT item content for each of the three Factors	211
Table E.1: Hierarchical regression for the prediction of YLOT optimism subscale scores from the Independent Variables of the study (age, extraversion, neuroticism, distraction coping, problem-solving (PS) coping, rumination coping, internalising behaviours and externalising behaviours)	292
Table E.2: Repetition of the above analysis for the prediction of YLOT <u>pessimism subscale</u> scores	292
Table E.3: Repetition of the above analysis for the prediction of YLOT <u>total optimism</u> scores	293
Table E.4: Step 1: Age (IV) as a predictor of PS coping (M)	293
Table E.5: Step 2: PS coping (M) as a predictor of total optimism (DV)	293
Table E.6: Step 3: Age (IV) as a predictor of total optimism (DV)	293
Table E.7: Step 4: Testing the mediation model: Hierarchical multiple regression for the prediction of total optimism by age, after controlling for PS coping	294
Table E.8: Step 2: PS coping (M) as a predictor of subscale optimism scores (DV)	294
Table E.9: Step 3: Age (IV) as a predictor of subscale optimism scores (DV)	294
Table E.10: Step 4: Testing the mediation model: Hierarchical multiple regression for the prediction of subscale optimism by age, after controlling for PS coping	294
Table F.1: Step 1: Pessimism (IV) as a predictor of rumination (M)	295
Table F.2: Step 2: Rumination (M) as a predictor of SCAS scores (DV)	295
Table F.3: Step 3: Pessimism (IV) as a predictor of SCAS scores (DV)	295

Table F.4: Step 4: Testing the mediation model: Hierarchical multiple regression for the prediction of SCAS scores by pessimism, after	
controlling for rumination coping	295
Table F.5: Step 1: Optimism (IV) as a predictor of PS coping (M)	296
Table F.6: Step 2: PS coping (M) as a predictor of SCAS scores (DV)	296
Table F.7: Step 1: Optimism (IV) as a predictor of rumination coping (M)	296
Table F.8: Step 2: Rumination (M) as a predictor of SCAS scores (DV)	296
Table F.9: Step 3: Optimism (IV) as a predictor of SCAS scores (DV)	296

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 2.1: The casual mediation mechanism	83
Figure 2.2: Showing PS coping as mediating the relationship between age and optimism (i.e., reduction in optimism with increasing age)	97
Figure 3.1: Rumination coping as mediating the relationship between pessimism and SCAS scores	130
Figure 3.2: PS coping as mediating the relationship between optimism and anxiety (SCAS scores)	130
Figure 3.3: Rumination coping as mediating the relationship between optimism and anxiety (SCAS score)	131
Figure 6.1: A proposed model of functionally distinct pathways of resilience or vulnerability in children and youth	249
Figure G.1: Thought substitution exercise	297
Figure G.2: The real-life problem-solving framework	297