INTEGRATION OR EXCLUSION?

The resettlement experiences of refugees in Australia

Julia Hinsliff
BA (Hons)

Discipline of Geography and Environmental Studies
School of Social Sciences
The University of Adelaide

Submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

September 2006
# Table of Contents

Table of Contents  
List of Tables  
List of Figures  
Abstract  
Declaration  
Acknowledgments  
Abbreviations and Acronyms  

SECTION A  
Chapter 1 Introduction  
1.1 Introduction  
1.2 The International Refugee System  
  1.2.1 Definition of ‘Refugee’  
  1.2.2 Durable Solutions  
  1.2.3 Sharing the Resettlement ‘Burden’  
1.3 Refugee Resettlement in the Age of Terror  
1.4 Temporary Protection  
1.5 The Refugee Resettlement Experience  
1.6 Aims and Objectives of the Research  
1.7 Theoretical Framework  
1.8 Methodological Approach  
1.9 Refugee Case Study Groups  
1.10 Study Area  
1.11 Overview of the Thesis  
1.12 Conclusion  

Chapter 2 Refugee Resettlement in Australia  
2.1 Introduction  
2.2 From Permanent Resettlement to Temporary Protection  
  2.2.1 Establishing A Permanent Protection System  
  2.2.2 The Development of Temporary Protection for Refugees in Australia  
  2.2.3 People Smuggling, Boat People and Temporary Protection  
  2.2.4 Australian Political Response: Deter, Deny and Detain  
2.3 The Current Humanitarian Program in Australia  
  2.3.1. Offshore Resettlement Program  
  2.3.1.1 Offshore-Visaed Refugee Arrivals  
  2.3.2 Onshore Protection Program  
  2.3.2.1 Onshore-Visaed Refugee Arrivals  
  2.3.2.2 Temporary Protection Visas  
2.4 Refugee Resettlement Policy in Australia  
  2.4.1 Historical Development of Settlement Policy in Australia  
  2.4.2 The Two-Tier Resettlement Assistance System  
  2.4.2.1 Early Settlement Assistance  
  2.4.2.2 Long Term Settlement Services  
  2.4.2.3 Mainstream Government Services  
2.5 Impacts of the TPV Regime on Refugees During Resettlement
Chapter 5 Study Area and Case Study Groups

5.1 Introduction
5.2 Study Area
  5.2.1 Geography and History
  5.2.2 Migrant Settlement in Adelaide
5.3 Case Study Group Selection
5.4 Sudanese Refugees
  5.4.1 The North/South Divide
  5.4.2 Civil War
  5.4.3 Famine
  5.4.4 Human Rights Abuses
  5.4.5 Sudanese in African Refugee Camps
  5.4.6 Sudanese Refugees in African Host Societies
  5.4.7 Sudanese Refugee Resettlement
  5.4.8 Sudanese Refugees in Australia
5.5 Iraqi Refugees
  5.5.1 Refugee-Generating Situation in Iraq
  5.5.2 Human Rights Abuses
  5.5.3 Gender Issues
  5.5.4 Iraqi Refugee Movements
  5.5.5 Countries of First Asylum
  5.5.6 Iraqi Refugees in Australia
5.6 Conclusion

SECTION B
Chapter 6 A New Home in a New Land

6.1 Introduction
6.2 Journeys to Australia
  6.2.1 Sudanese Journeys
  6.2.2 Iraqi Journeys
6.3 Reception Experiences
  6.3.1 “Official Welcome”
  6.3.2 Australian Community Welcome
  6.3.3 Ethnic Community Welcome
6.4 Resettlement Assistance
  6.4.1 Resettlement Assistance - Need and Provision
  6.4.2 Experiences of Resettlement Assistance in Adelaide
  6.4.3 Assistance for TPV Holders
6.5 Housing
  6.5.1 Accommodation On-Arrival
  6.5.2 Housing Assistance
  6.5.3 Tenure
  6.5.4 Housing Problems
    6.5.4.1 Overcrowding
    6.5.4.2 Furnishing Accommodation
    6.5.4.3 Housing Condition
  6.5.5 Mobility
6.6 Conclusion

Chapter 7 Economic Integration

7.1 Introduction
7.2 Refugees in the Labour Market 158
7.3 Recently Arrived Refugees Experiences in the Labour Market 162
    7.3.1 Current Main Activity 162
    7.3.2 Current Occupation 163
    7.3.3 Qualifications On Arrival 163
    7.3.4 Problems Looking for Work 164
    7.3.5 Refugee Experiences in the Adelaide Labour Market 165
        7.3.5.1 Childcare 166
        7.3.5.2 Health 166
        7.3.5.3 Transport 167
        7.3.5.4 Interviews and Resumes 168
        7.3.5.5 Qualification Recognition and Downward Occupational Mobility 168
        7.3.5.6 Appropriate Employment Options 170
        7.3.5.7 Moving for Employment 171
7.4 Refugees and Education and Training 172
    7.4.1 Recently Arrived Refugees and Training Participation 174
    7.4.2 Education Experiences of Recently Arrived Refugees in Adelaide 175
        7.4.2.1 Previous Study in Australia 175
        7.4.2.2 Implications of the TPV for Education and Training Opportunities 176
        7.4.2.3 Leaving Study for Work 177
7.5 Financial Issues for Refugees During Resettlement 178
    7.5.1 Recently Arrived Refugees and Income 180
    7.5.2 Financial Issues for Refugees in Adelaide 186
        7.5.2.1 Sharing Resources 187
        7.5.2.2 Getting into Debt 187
        7.5.2.3 Social Security 189
        7.5.2.4 A Not-So-Special Benefit 190
7.6 Conclusion 196

Chapter 8 Social Integration 199
8.1 Introduction 199
8.2 English Language 200
    8.2.1 On-Arrival Language Proficiency 200
    8.2.2 Language and Integration 201
    8.2.3 Learning English 202
    8.2.4 Adult Migrant English Program 203
    8.2.5 Current Language Training Availability for Refugees in Australia 204
8.3 The English Proficiency of Recent Migrants 204
    8.3.1 Use of Interpreters 206
    8.3.2 English Class Participation 207
    8.3.3 Refugee Experiences of Communicating in a New Land 209
        8.3.3.1 English Classes in Australia 212
        8.3.3.2 Interpreters 214
8.4 Health 216
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10.7.2 Integration as a Two-Way Process: Investigations from the Other Direction</td>
<td>293</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.7.3 Data</td>
<td>293</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.7.4 Expanding Research into the Resettlement Experiences of Other Groups</td>
<td>295</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.7.5 Examination of Other Temporary Humanitarian Visas</td>
<td>296</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.8 Conclusion</td>
<td>296</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
<td>297</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendixes</td>
<td>322</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# List of Tables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table 1.1</td>
<td>Refugee Resettlement Countries, 2004</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 1.2</td>
<td>Ratio of Resettled Refugees to Host Population, 2005</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 2.1</td>
<td>Chronology of Refugee Arrivals in Australia, Federation to 2006</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 2.2</td>
<td>Number of Boats and Unauthorised Persons aboard arriving and detected in Australia, 1989-90 to 2004-05</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 2.3</td>
<td>Total Number of People Admitted to Detention in Australia, 1995-96 to 2004-05</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 2.4</td>
<td>Top Ten Countries of Birth of Offshore Humanitarian Entrants 1995-96 to 2004-05</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 2.5</td>
<td>Offshore Humanitarian Program Visas Granted 1995-96 to 2004-05</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 2.6</td>
<td>Total Asylum Applications Submitted in Selected Destination Countries, 1995 to 2004</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 2.7</td>
<td>Top Ten Source Countries of Onshore Humanitarian Visa Applicants</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 2.8</td>
<td>Protection Visa Grants by Main Countries of Citizenship, 1995-96 to 2004-05</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 2.9</td>
<td>Temporary Protection Visa Grants 1999-2000 to 2004-2005</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 2.10</td>
<td>Temporary Protection Visa Grants by Country of Citizenship, 1999-2004</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 2.11</td>
<td>Number of PPV grants to Iraqi TPV holders</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 2.12</td>
<td>Integrated Humanitarian Settlement Strategy Eligibility</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 2.13</td>
<td>Recently Arrived Refugees Eligibility for Long Term Settlement Services</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 2.14</td>
<td>General Government Services available to Humanitarian Entrants</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 3.1</td>
<td>Odyssean and Rubicon Refugee Typology</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 3.2</td>
<td>A Sample of Integration Indicators</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.1</td>
<td>Research Model</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.2</td>
<td>Attrition between LSIA2 Wave 1 and Wave 2</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.3</td>
<td>Topics Included in the LSIA2 Primary Applicant Questionnaire</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.4</td>
<td>Interview and Weighted Sample Size for Selected Categories</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.5</td>
<td>Topics Planned for Each Interview</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.6</td>
<td>Profile of In-Depth Interview Respondents</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 8.1 English Proficiency of Recent Migrants, 6 and 18 Months After Arrival 205
Table 8.2 English Proficiency of Recent Migrants by Country of Origin, 6 and 18 Months After Arrival 205
Table 8.3 Spoken English Levels of Recent Migrants and Interpreter Assistance, 6 Months After Arrival 206
Table 8.4 Spoken English Levels of Recent Migrants and Interpreting Assistance by Country of Origin, 6 Months After Arrival 207
Table 8.5 Recent Migrants Attendance at English Classes Prior to Immigration 207
Table 8.6 Main Methods of Learning English in Australia Reported by Recent Migrants, 6 and 18 Months After Arrival 208
Table 8.7 Main Reason for Improving English Given By Recent Migrants, 6 and 18 Months After Arrival 208
Table 8.8 Benefits of English Class Attendance Reported by Recent Migrants, 18 Months After Arrival 209
Table 8.9 English Class Attendance by Recent Migrants, 6 and 18 Months After Arrival 209
Table 8.10 Presence of Long-Term Health Condition Among Recent Migrants, 6 and 18 Months After Arrival 221
Table 8.11 Long Term Health Conditions Reported by Humanitarian Entrants at 6 and 18 months after Arrival 221
Table 8.12 Self-Assessed Health Status of Recent Migrants, 6 and 18 Months After Arrival 222
Table 8.13 Use of Medical Services by Recent Migrants, 6 and 18 Months After Arrival 222
Table 8.14 Psychological Distress Rates Among Recent Migrants, 6 and 18 Months After Arrival 223
Table 8.15 Prevalence of Psychological Distress Among Humanitarian Entrants at Wave 1 Interview of LSIA1 and LSIA2 224
Table 8.16 Psychological Distress of Humanitarian Entrants by Country of Origin, 6 and 18 Months After Arrival 224
Table 8.17 Level of Psychological Distress Among Humanitarian Entrants (mean GHQ-12 score), 6 and 18 Months After Arrival 225
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8.18</td>
<td>Comparison Rates of Psychological Distress Levels in Selected Populations</td>
<td>225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.1</td>
<td>Citizenship Rates of Eligible Overseas-born People in Australia, 2001</td>
<td>244</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.2</td>
<td>Intentions of Recent Migrants to Apply for Australian Citizenship, 6 and 18 Months After Arrival</td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3</td>
<td>Intentions to Apply for Australian Citizenship by Country of Origin, 6 and 18 Months After Arrival</td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4</td>
<td>Top 5 Reasons Provided by Recent Migrants for Intending to Take up Australian Citizenship, 18 Months After Arrival</td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Figures

Figure 1.1  Global Number of Convention Refugees, 1976 to 2005 4
Figure 2.1  Map of Australia showing Excised Migration Zone and Location of Immigration Detention Centres 23
Figure 2.2  Australia’s Humanitarian Program 24
Figure 2.3  Offshore Refugee and Humanitarian Visa Arrivals, 1978-79 to 2003-2004 26
Figure 2.4  Unauthorised Boat and Air Arrivals in Australia, 1989-90 to 2004-05 29
Figure 2.5  Onshore Humanitarian Visa Applications and Grants, 1995-96 to 2004-05 30
Figure 3.1  A Typology of Forced Migrations 49
Figure 3.2  Kuhlman’s Comprehensive Model of Refugee Integration 57
Figure 4.1  LSIA2 Interview Schedule 80
Figure 5.1  Location Map of Metropolitan Adelaide 102
Figure 5.2  Map of Sudan 108
Figure 5.3  Number of Sudanese Arrivals in Australia 1994-95 to 2004-05 111
Figure 5.4  Map of Iraq 113
Figure 5.5  Offshore-Visaed Iraqi Humanitarian Arrivals in Australia, 1990-91 to 2004-05 116
Figure 6.1  Map of Routes Taken by Refugees to Australia 119
Figure 6.2  Resettlement Assistance Need and Provision Reported by Recently Arrived Migrants, 6 Months After Arrival 131
Figure 7.1  Current Income of Recent Migrants from all Sources, 6 Months After Arrival 182
Figure 7.2  Current Income of Recent Migrants from all Sources, 18 Months After Arrival 182
Figure 7.3  Recent Migrants Current Weekly Income from Wages or Salary, 6 Months After Arrival 183
Figure 7.4  Recent Migrants Current Weekly Income from Wages or Salary, 18 Months After Arrival 183
Figure 7.5  Amount of Money Available in Recent Migrant Households Each
Figure 7.6  Amount of Money Available in Recent Migrant Households Each, 18 Months After Arrival  
Figure 7.7  Comparison of Recent Migrants Current Household Income and Expenses 6 and 18 Months After Arrival  
Figure 7.8  Remittance Behaviour of Recent Migrants, 6 and 18 Months After Arrival  
Figure 7.9  Remittance Behaviour of Recent Migrants by Country of Birth, 6 and 18 Months After Arrival  
Figure 10.1  Refigured Comprehensive Model of Refugee Integration
Abstract

Recent policy changes have created a new era of refugee resettlement in Australia. As a result of the introduction of the onshore refugee program, a two-tier resettlement assistance system has developed. This system differentiates between refugees who have been issued protection visas offshore and onshore, and provides considerably less resettlement assistance to onshore-visa refugees with Temporary Protection Visas (TPVs). The exclusion of TPV holders from resettlement assistance programs and the temporary nature of the visa has prompted this comparative study of the resettlement experiences of two groups of recently arrived refugees. This thesis considers the experiences of recently arrived refugees within the economic, social, cultural and political spheres of resettlement, in order to develop a deeper understanding of the inter-related nature of the resettlement process and the impact of visa category on the integration of refugees in contemporary Australia.

Kuhlman’s (1991) model of refugee resettlement, and definition of integration form the basis of the theoretical framework of the thesis. A multiple method approach has been applied to the study and data from the second cohort of the Longitudinal Survey of Immigrants to Australia (LSIA) was analysed to present a macro level understanding of the resettlement experiences of recent arrivals in Australia. In Adelaide, interviews with key informants and service providers were undertaken in conjunction with a series of in-depth interviews with 10 Sudanese offshore-visa Humanitarian entrants and 9 Iraqi onshore-visa refugees, to provide detailed descriptions of the resettlement experience.

While the resettlement process is found to be difficult for all refugees, the TPV policy acts to compound the problems and disadvantages refugees face in resettlement. Under these circumstances it is found that TPV holders experience social exclusion during their early resettlement in Australia. The importance of host-related factors on the resettlement experience are therefore found to be extremely relevant in contemporary Australian refugee resettlement. Policies regarding visa conditions, and refugees’ eligibility for resettlement assistance have a significant impact in all spheres of the resettlement process. These findings suggest that the influence of host society policies must be accorded more
weight in theories of resettlement, given their ability to extensively influence the resettlement process. Further this thesis presents substantial evidence against the TPV policy and recommends that temporary protection in Australia be reviewed, in order to ensure the social inclusion and successful integration of future refugee arrivals.
Declaration

This work contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text.

I give consent to this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University Library, being made available in all forms of media, now or hereafter known.

Julia Hinsliff
Acknowledgements

First and foremost I would like to thank the refugee respondents who participated in this study. They deserve much recognition, as without their generosity this research could not have been completed.

My supervisors, Professor Graeme Hugo and Dr Matthew Rofe are also acknowledged for their support and assistance. I particularly thank Professor Hugo for his early suggestions regarding the focus of the study and Dr Rofe’s assistance with the ethics approval process. In addition, I appreciate Margaret Young’s help with the data analysis and Christine Crothers is also thanked for her cartographic services.

Further, the staff and students, past and present of Geography and Environmental Studies are thanked for their encouragement, friendship and support throughout my time in the department. Sue Barnard must also be acknowledged for her special support during a difficult period.

Finally, I would like to thank my family and friends for their love, understanding, encouragement and support throughout my candidature.
# Abbreviations and Acronyms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ABS</td>
<td>Australian Bureau of Statistics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AMEP</td>
<td>Adult Migrant English Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ARA</td>
<td>Australian Refugee Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DIMA</td>
<td>Department of Immigration and Multicultural Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DIMIA</td>
<td>Department of Immigration and Multicultural and Indigenous Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ESL</td>
<td>English as a Second Language</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GHQ</td>
<td>General Health Questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HECS</td>
<td>Higher Education Contribution Scheme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IDP</td>
<td>Internally Displaced Person</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IOM</td>
<td>International Organisation for Migration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IHSS</td>
<td>Integrated Humanitarian Settlement Strategy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LSIA</td>
<td>Longitudinal Survey of Immigrants to Australia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LSIA1</td>
<td>Longitudinal Survey of Immigrants to Australia (first cohort)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LSIA2</td>
<td>Longitudinal Survey of Immigrants to Australia (second cohort)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MRC</td>
<td>Migrant Resource Centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MRCSA</td>
<td>Migrant Resource Centre of South Australia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NESB</td>
<td>Non English Speaking Background</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>Non-Government Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PA</td>
<td>Primary Applicant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PPV</td>
<td>Permanent Protection Visa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PTSD</td>
<td>Post Traumatic Stress Disorder</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RPV</td>
<td>Return Pending Visa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAC</td>
<td>Special Assistance Category</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SACE</td>
<td>South Australian Certificate of Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAHT</td>
<td>South Australian Housing Trust</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SBS</td>
<td>Special Broadcasting Service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SHP</td>
<td>Special Humanitarian Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STTARS</td>
<td>Survivors of Trauma and Torture Rehabilitation Service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TAFE</td>
<td>Technical and Further Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TB</td>
<td>Tuberculosis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THV</td>
<td>Temporary Humanitarian Visa</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
TIS  Translating and Interpreting Service
TPV  Temporary Protection Visa
UN  United Nations
UNHCR  United Nations High Commission for Refugees