Engaging Adolescents in High School Music

Jennifer Claire Rosevear

Thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

Elder Conservatorium of Music

Faculty of Humanities and Social Sciences

The University of Adelaide

February, 2008
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CONTENTS</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Abstract</td>
<td>iv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Declaration</td>
<td>vi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgments</td>
<td>vii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of tables</td>
<td>viii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of figures</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of musical examples</td>
<td>xiii</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Chapter 1**  
**Introduction**

1.1 Purpose of the study                        1  
1.2 Theoretical basis of the study              3  
1.3 Research questions                          4  
1.4 Significance of the study                   5  
1.5 Context of the study                        6  

**Chapter 2**  
**Review of Literature on Self-perception and Motivation**

2.1 Self-concept as an umbrella term            10  
2.2 Self-esteem                                13  
2.3 Self-efficacy and self-regulation           19  
2.4 Self-concept development                   25  
2.5 Indicators of motivation                    28  
2.6 Social cognitive theories/models of motivation 30  
2.7 Impact of self-perceptions on engagement, learning and achievement 38  

**Chapter 3**  
**Review of Literature on Learning and Music**

3.1 Basic principles of learning                43  
3.2 Principles of music learning                50  
3.3 Learning to play a musical instrument       57  
3.4 Singing, listening, creating and music technology 67  
3.5 Musical literacy                           78  
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 3 (continued)</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.6 Informal learning</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7 Music learning and academic achievement</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.8 Overview of music, self-concept and identity development</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.9 Motivation and engagement in music learning</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 4</th>
<th>Research Design and Methodology</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.1 Introduction</td>
<td></td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 Development of survey</td>
<td></td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3 Description of method of data collection</td>
<td></td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4 Organisation of variables for data collection</td>
<td></td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 5</th>
<th>Results</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.1 Overview of data collected</td>
<td></td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2 Survey Section A – background information</td>
<td></td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3 Survey Section B – musical experiences</td>
<td></td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4 Survey Section C – Rosenberg Self-esteem Scale</td>
<td></td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5 Survey Section D – Chan’s Perceived Competence Scale</td>
<td></td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6 Academic achievement</td>
<td></td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 6</th>
<th>Discussion of Results</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.1 Research questions</td>
<td></td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2 General discussion</td>
<td></td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 7</th>
<th>Conclusions</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7.1 Introduction</td>
<td></td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2 Conclusions about learning in general</td>
<td></td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3 Conclusions about music learning</td>
<td></td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4 Limitations of the research</td>
<td></td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.5 Directions for future research</td>
<td></td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Appendices

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Appendix</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Appendix A</td>
<td>Constructivism and the SACSA Framework</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix C</td>
<td>Selected music research reports included in the <em>Critical Links</em> report (Deasy, 2002)</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix D</td>
<td>Extract from Harland et al. (2000) report entitled: <em>Arts education in secondary schools: effects and effectiveness</em></td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix E</td>
<td>Survey of Musical Experiences and Self-concept</td>
<td>187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix F</td>
<td>Information sheet and consent form for survey participants</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Bibliography

Bibliography 203
ABSTRACT

This investigation aims to explore the attitudes of adolescents towards learning music and to gauge the extent of their involvement in the activities of playing, singing, creating and listening to music. It also seeks to determine the views of adolescents on attributions for success in various activities, including music. Beliefs about self-concept, or self-identity, and their relationships to academic achievement and musical involvement are explored.

The review of literature spans various facets of self-perception, including self-concept, self-esteem, self-efficacy, self-regulation, and self-concept development, and considers the role of music in self-concept development. The impact of self-perceptions on motivation, which is central to learning, achievement and engagement, is also considered. The basic principles of learning, and their application to learning in music, provide the foundation for specific aspects of music learning, namely, music literacy, learning to play a musical instrument, singing, music technology and informal learning. The relationship between music learning and academic achievement is reviewed. The particular importance of music in adolescence, and adolescent attitudes to school music, provide a backdrop to the analysis of the wide-ranging factors involved in self-concept development, motivation and learning principles, thus leading to an overview of the various approaches which can facilitate the engagement of adolescents in learning in general, and in high school music in particular.

A researcher-designed Survey of Musical Experiences and Self-concept was administered to Year 9 and 10 students in three high schools in metropolitan Adelaide, South Australia. Data from the survey, along with academic results, were collected from the 282 participants in the study. The data provide background information about each participant, along with their perceptions about perceived areas of strength and reasons for success in these areas. Information about involvement in musical activities was collated for all students, with approximately half of the students not studying music at school. Measures for self-esteem (Rosenberg, 1965) and perceived competence (Chan, 1993) were included in the survey. Using a mixture of qualitative and quantitative methods, the data were analysed in relation to the extent of involvement in
music, attitudes to learning music, students’ attributions for success, and strengths of the relationships between musical involvement, self-concept and academic achievement.

Conclusions can be drawn based on the survey data and the literature review, and these emphasise the importance of the social nature of learning and of providing opportunities for creative work in classroom activities. The most outstanding finding to be highlighted from the study was the aspect of enjoyment as a reason for achievement which appears to feature prominently in students’ responses, yet it is less widely recognised in the literature.
DECLARATION

This work contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text.

I give consent to this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University Library, being made available for loan and photocopying, subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.

Signed: __________________________

Date: ______________
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I wish to acknowledge the following people for their support and encouragement without which I would not have been able to complete this study. Prior to his retirement at the end of 2001, my first supervisor was Dr Warren Bourne, whose guidance in assisting me to formulate the original research proposal was much appreciated. I am grateful to Dr. Jolanta Kalandyk in Canberra, who was willing to discuss early ideas and whose book entitled *Music and the self-esteem of young children* provided some original inspiration when embarking on this study. The late Professor Kevin Marjoribanks, Head of the School of Education at the University of Adelaide, was always willing to provide constructive feedback. He was instrumental in helping to fine tune the research methodology, and I learned to use the SPSS software by attending a course that he taught.

I have been inspired by the work of Dr. Doreen Bridges over many years and I am grateful that I have been able to discuss with her various facets of the study over the last couple of years, and I am especially appreciative of her feedback on some draft material in the latter part of 2007.

My external co-supervisor, Dr. Neryl Jeanneret (initially at the University of Newcastle and over the last two years at the University of Melbourne) has provided timely and beneficial feedback whenever I have sought it, and I am very appreciative of her efforts and support. My principal supervisor, Professor Charles Bodman Rae has assisted greatly in the latter stages of the study, especially in helping me to formulate realistic goals and timelines. His encouragement and belief in me have made a significant impact on my approach to completing the study, and I greatly value his strong support. I am also appreciative of the ongoing support of the Postgraduate Coordinator at the Elder Conservatorium, Associate Professor Kimi Coaldrake.

I am indebted to the following colleagues and friends whose moral support and inspiration have been most welcome: Dr. Pauline Carter, Carl Crossin OAM, Associate Professor Elizabeth Koch OAM and Dr. Diana Weekes. Finally, I wish to acknowledge my daughter, Miri, my mother, Kath, and my late father Jim, who have always been most supportive of my efforts.
# LIST OF TABLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Comparison of likely outcomes based on efficacy beliefs (adapted from Bandura, 1997, p. 39).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Summary of learning goals as opposed to performance goals (based on description by Maehr et al., 2002, p. 360).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Two goal orientations and their approach and avoidance states (Pintrich, 2000, p. 100).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Gardner’s intelligences applied to music (Hallam, 1998a, p. 35).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Self-regulatory processes for effective music practice (McPherson and Davidson, 2006, p. 342).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Comparison of formal and informal learning practices (Green &amp; Walmsley, n.d., p. 2).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>List of quantitative variables from <em>Survey of Musical Experiences and Self-concept</em> used in SPSS for data collation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Positive and negative statements in Rosenberg’s SES.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Cognitive, social, physical, and general perceived competence subscales in Chan’s PCS.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>List of Variables from closed questions in <em>Survey of Musical Experiences and Self-concept</em>.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>List of Variables from open-ended questions in <em>Survey of Musical Experiences and Self-concept</em>.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Number of participants and sub-groups.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Perceptions of which were best subjects when one, two or three subjects were listed, as a percentage of responses.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Reasons given for best school subject.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Types of pursuits based on perceptions of being good at these pursuits.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Reasons given for being good at various pursuits.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Pearson correlation coefficients for the Perceived Competence Sub-scales.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Significant t-values for academic achievement.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Pearson correlation coefficients for the Rosenberg Self-esteem Scale, the Chan Perceived Competence Sub-scales and academic achievement, all participants (N=282).

Pearson correlation coefficients for the Rosenberg self-esteem scale, the Chan perceived competence sub-scales and academic achievement, males and females.

Pearson correlation coefficients for the Rosenberg self-esteem scale, the Chan perceived competence sub-scales and academic achievement, Music and non-Music participants.

Significant t-values for comparing types of musical involvement and academic achievement.
# LIST OF FIGURES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Self-concept as an umbrella term (Lawrence, 1988, p. 2).</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>The process of self-perceiving (Beane &amp; Lipka, 1984, p. 17).</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Diagram of self-efficacy and self-regulation parameters.</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Interactions between individual and environmental factors in determining motivation (Hallam, 2006a, p. 143).</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Consequences of attributions (based on description by Maehr, Pintrich &amp; Linnenbrink, 2002, p. 358).</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Basic types of attributions to explain success or failure (Austin, Renwick &amp; McPherson, 2006, p. 228).</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Cycle of interaction between self-concept, motivation and achievement.</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>The various aspects of content in music (Hoffer, 2001, p. 40).</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>The parameters of music education (Swanwick, 1979, p. 45).</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Model of instrumental learning (Hallam, 1998a, p. 129).</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Teaching via imitation. (Kohut, 1985, p. 15).</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Bypassing musical thinking.</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


22 Main reasons for being best at particular school subjects.

23 Frequency of reasons for being good at various pursuits.

24 Frequency of main reasons for doing well in schools subjects and various pursuits.

25 Summary of parental background.

26 Estimate of frequency of listening.

27 Estimate of hours of listening per week.

28 Favourite styles of music for listening.

29 Frequency of names of favourite performers.

30 Frequency of names of favourite pieces of music.

31 Number of instruments (including voice) learned.

32 Aspects liked best about learning a musical instrument.

33 Aspects liked least about learning a musical instrument.

34 Frequency of practice sessions per week.

35 Reasons for ceasing instrumental/vocal lessons.

36 Instruments played in music classes at primary or high school.

37 Frequency for instruments being either self-taught or taught by friend.

38 Number of family members who play instruments at home.

39 Playing in ensembles, at school and outside of school.

40 Participation in singing in an ensemble.

41 Frequency of prior involvement in the South Australian Public Primary Schools’ Music Festival.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td>Aspects liked most about Music as a school subject.</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43</td>
<td>Aspects liked least about Music as a school subject (N=124).</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
<td>Self-esteem scores.</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45</td>
<td>Mean scores for Perceived Competence Sub-Scales.</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46</td>
<td>Academic achievement in core subjects (English, Mathematics, Science, and Studies of Society and Environment).</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47</td>
<td>Summary of findings.</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# LIST OF MUSICAL EXAMPLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Example</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 A meaningful whole. (Mills and McPherson, 2006, p.164)</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Individual notes. (Mills and McPherson, 2006, p.164)</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 A comparison of staff notation and tab notation.</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Grid notation using two different symbols.</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 An interpretation of the grid using two different symbols (from Example 4), written in traditional percussion staff notation.</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 An example of grid notation converting to standard rhythmic notation.</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>