Towards Safer and more Congruent Prison Environments for Male Aboriginal Prisoners

A South Australian Study

Elizabeth Grant

A thesis submitted to the University of Adelaide
in fulfilment of the requirements of
the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

The School of Architecture, Landscape Architecture and Urban Design

June 2008
# Table of Contents

List of Figures ............................................................................................................................................... xi 
List of Tables ................................................................................................................................................ xvi 
Abbreviations ................................................................................................................................................ xvi 
Glossary of Terms ........................................................................................................................................ xix 
Abstract ........................................................................................................................................................ xxi 
Declaration .................................................................................................................................................... xxiii 
Acknowledgements .................................................................................................................................... xxv 
Preface .......................................................................................................................................................... xxviii 

**CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION** .............................................................................................................. 1  
Research Aims ............................................................................................................................................. 6  
The Dissertation Structure .................................................................................................................... 7  
Summary .................................................................................................................................................... 8  

**CHAPTER TWO: BACKGROUND & APPROACH TO THE RESEARCH TOPIC** .............................. 9  
Developing Research Ethics ................................................................................................................... 9  
Ethical Processes ..................................................................................................................................... 11  
The Research Design ........................................................................................................................... 12  
Literature Review ..................................................................................................................................... 13  
   Literature Reviewed .......................................................................................................................... 14  
   Terminology ......................................................................................................................................... 15  
Familiarisation with Prison Environments ............................................................................................ 20  
The Research Settings .......................................................................................................................... 22  
The Subject Group ................................................................................................................................... 23  
Observations ............................................................................................................................................ 24  
Subject Interviews .................................................................................................................................... 26  
   First Interview ................................................................................................................................. 30  
   Second Interview ............................................................................................................................. 30  
   Third Interview ............................................................................................................................... 32  
   Feedback to the Subject Group ........................................................................................................ 34  
Data Analysis ............................................................................................................................................ 33  
Summary .................................................................................................................................................. 37
The Recommendations of Royal Commissions and other Inquiries...... 139
The Implementation of Recommendations ...................................... 145
The Royal Commission into Aboriginal Deaths in Custody ............... 146
RCIADIC Recommendations relating to Prison Environment ............. 146
Recommendations of the State Coroner ......................................... 150
Coronial Recommendations within Inquest Findings ....................... 151
Coronial Recommendations relating to Hanging Points .................... 151
Reviewing Coronial Recommendations related to other aspects of
Prison Environments ...................................................................... 155
Absences in Coronial Recommendations ....................................... 155
Summary ......................................................................................... 156

CHAPTER SIX: PRISONS IN SOUTH AUSTRALIA .............................. 159
Correctional Facilities within South Australia.................................. 160
The Philosophies of Corrections in South Australia ........................... 160
Yatala Labour Prison ....................................................................... 162
B Division ...................................................................................... 167
B Division Accommodation ................................................................ 167
Aboriginal Prisoners’ Use of Accommodation .................................. 168
The Social Environment of B Division ............................................. 168
E Division ...................................................................................... 169
Accommodation in E Division ........................................................ 171
F Division ...................................................................................... 173
Accommodation in F Division ........................................................ 174
Aboriginal Prisoners’ Use of Accommodation .................................. 175
The Social Environment of F Division ............................................. 175
G Division ...................................................................................... 177
Accommodation in G Division ........................................................ 179
Port Augusta Prison ........................................................................ 179
Accommodation Types at Port Augusta Prison ................................. 180
Aboriginal Prisoners Use of Accommodation .................................. 186
The Social Environment of Port Augusta Prison .............................. 187
Cadell Training Centre ...................................................................... 188
Accommodation Types at Cadell Training Centre ............................. 192
Aboriginal Prisoners’ Use of Accommodation .................................. 194
The Social Environment of Cadell Training Centre ......................... 195
Mobilong Prison .............................................................................. 197
Accommodation Types at Mobilong Prison ...................................... 197
Aboriginal Prisoners’ Use of Accommodation .................................. 200
The Social Environment of Mobilong Prison ................................... 202
Adelaide Remand Centre ................................................................. 205
Accommodation Types at Adelaide Remand Centre ......................... 210
Aboriginal Prisoners’ Use of Accommodation .................................. 212
The Social Environment of the Adelaide Remand Centre .................. 214
Compliance of South Australian Prisons to Standards, Guidelines and
Recommendations ............................................................................ 216
Compliance to International Guidelines ........................................... 216
Compliance to the National Guidelines ............................................ 217
The Implementation and Compliance to RCIADIC Recommendations . 221
Compliance to Coronial Recommendations ...................................... 222
Summary ......................................................................................... 224
CHAPTER SEVEN: ABORIGINAL PRISONERS AND THEIR PREFERENCES

The Subject Group ........................................................................................................ 230
Identified Language Groupings of the Subject Group ...................................................... 230
Demographics of the Subject Group .............................................................................. 232
Living Arrangements prior to Incarceration .................................................................... 235
The Subjects within the Correctional System ................................................................. 240
Legal Status ..................................................................................................................... 240
Previous Custodial Sentences ....................................................................................... 242
Other Experiences of Custodial Environments ................................................................ 242
Responses to the Prison Environment ........................................................................... 243
Levels of Stress .............................................................................................................. 243
Resistance Behaviours ................................................................................................... 244
Preferences for Prison Environments .............................................................................. 247
The Prison Location ........................................................................................................ 248
Prison Location to Family .............................................................................................. 248
Access to the External Environment .............................................................................. 252
Relationship to Country ................................................................................................. 253
Other People at the Location ........................................................................................... 254
Perimeter Barriers .......................................................................................................... 254
No Secure Perimeter ....................................................................................................... 255
Perforated Perimeters ..................................................................................................... 256
Solid Perimeters ............................................................................................................. 257
Prison Layout .................................................................................................................. 258
Open Layout ................................................................................................................... 259
Layout Separated into Divisions .................................................................................... 260
Campus Layout ............................................................................................................... 260
The Prison as One Entity ............................................................................................... 262
Accommodation Types .................................................................................................... 263
Cottage Style Accommodation ...................................................................................... 263
Second Generation Accommodation .............................................................................. 265
Variations between the Models ...................................................................................... 266
First Generation Accommodation .................................................................................. 266
Third Generation Prisons .............................................................................................. 267
Social and Spatial Density ............................................................................................. 267
Socially Spacious Prisons .............................................................................................. 268
Socially Dense Prisons ................................................................................................... 268
Prison Entrances ............................................................................................................ 269
The Impact of the Entrance on Visitors ........................................................................... 269
Predicting the Environment from the Entrance ............................................................. 270
The Aesthetics of the Entrance ....................................................................................... 271
Visits Areas .................................................................................................................... 272
The Cultural Fit of Visits Areas ...................................................................................... 273
Building Height ............................................................................................................... 278
Dining Areas ................................................................................................................... 279
Aboriginal Dedicated Units, Prisons and Areas .............................................................. 280
Aboriginal Cultural Areas and Spaces ............................................................................ 283
Priorities In Accommodation ................................................................. 286
Television ......................................................................................... 287
The Importance of Television .......................................................... 287
Accessing Televisions ................................................................. 289
Preferred Cell Occupancy ................................................................. 293
Preference for Single Sleeping Accommodation/Cells .................. 294
Preference for Shared Cells .............................................................. 297
Dormitory Accommodation .............................................................. 298
Contact with other Prisoners .......................................................... 299
The Relationship between the Interior and Exterior of the Building ... 299
Windows ......................................................................................... 301
External Outlook of Accommodation ............................................ 303
The Relationship of Accommodation to the rest of the Building ..... 304
Spatial Density ............................................................................ 307
Cell Size .......................................................................................... 308
Layout ............................................................................................. 309
Health And Safety ........................................................................ 311
Health ............................................................................................. 311
Safety ............................................................................................. 313
Comfort .......................................................................................... 315
Colour ............................................................................................. 317
Furniture .......................................................................................... 318
Thermal Comfort ........................................................................ 319
The Importance of Television .......................................................... 323
Acoustical Properties .................................................................... 323
Summary ........................................................................................ 324

CHAPTER EIGHT: SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS ............................................. 327
Early Prison Environments for Australian Aboriginal Prisoners .......... 327
Research into the Environments for Australian Aboriginal Prisoners..... 328
The People-Environment Interaction ................................................... 329
Cultural Approaches to the Design of Prison Environments for Aboriginal Peoples ................................................ 331
Other Design Approaches to shape the Prison Experience ................ 332
Developing more congruent Prison Environments for Aboriginal Prisoner ................................................................. 333
Understanding the Users ................................................................ 333
Aboriginal Prisoners' Use of Space within South Australian Prisons .... 335
The Subjects' Experiences of Prison .................................................. 337
The Subjects' Preferences for Prison Environments .......................... 338
Connections to Country .................................................................. 339
Lifestyles structured around a Social Group ...................................... 340
Connections to Family and Kin .......................................................... 341
The Importance of Television and other Activities .......................... 342
Privacy .............................................................................................. 343
Accommodation to match Personal Needs ........................................ 343
Major constraints to achieving Congruency ........................................ 344
The Dichotomy of the Graduating System ....................................... 344
Reducing the Use of Segregation ...................................................... 345
The Need for Standards for Prison Accommodation ....................... 347
The Need to legislate standards for Prison Environments ................ 347
The Diminishing Quality of Prison Environments ................................ 347
Conclusion ....................................................................................... 346
BIBLIOGRAPHY ............................................................................................................. 351
PERSONAL COMMUNICATIONS .................................................................................. 383

APPENDICES .................................................................................................................. 385
Appendix 1: Deaths in Custody, South Australian Prison System, 1990 -2005 .................. 387
Appendix 2: Correspondence ......................................................................................... 393
Appendix 3: Language Groupings relevant to South Australia ........................................ 397
Appendix 4: Information Sheets & Consent Forms ......................................................... 403
Appendix 5: Questionnaire ............................................................................................. 407
Appendix 6: Photographic Sets used for Interviewing ..................................................... 415
Appendix 7: Plan of Cell used to elicit Drawings of Aspired Living Environments .......... 429
Appendix 8: Painting presented to the Researcher .......................................................... 431
Appendix 9: International Covenant on Civil & Political Rights (1980) ......................... 433
Appendix 12: Analysis of the Implementation in South Australia RCIADIC recommendations relating to Prison Environments ............................................................................................. 471
Appendix 13: Department for Correctional Services (South Australia) obligation & compliance to identified Accommodation Standards, Guidelines & Recommendations .......................................................... 473
Appendix 14: Timeline of the development of South Australian Prison Facilities .......... 475
Appendix 15: Adult Prisons & Accommodation Units in South Australia ....................... 477
Appendix 16: South Australian Average Daily Prison Population and Authorised Capacities 2004-05 .................................................................................................................. 479
Appendix 17: Preferences noted using Photographic Sets .............................................. 481
Appendix 18: Letter to the State Coroner of South Australia ............................................ 489
Appendix 19: Submission to the Correctional Services Advisory Council of South Australia .......................................................................................................................... 493
Abstract

This thesis presents the first empirical study into the accommodation needs of Australian Aboriginal prisoners in prison custody. The over-representation of Aboriginal people in the Australian prison system is increasing and the continuing deaths of Aboriginal peoples in prison custody by suicide are an important national issue. Previous prison studies have not addressed all of the issues surrounding this problem. Although the varying and differing accommodation needs of Aboriginal prisoners have been recognised since the 1800s, there is a limited understanding of the relationship between the prison environment and the rates of suicide among Aboriginal prisoners. The aim of the thesis is to investigate the issues and present findings which may contribute to the creation of prison environments which reduce stress levels, and may in turn decrease rates of suicide among Aboriginal prisoners.

The research investigates the prison environment for the Aboriginal prisoner from a people-environments approach, locates the act of suicide among a series of behaviours which may occur in response to an environment incongruent with the needs of users. These responses are influenced by a complex of personal, environmental and institutional factors.

Data for the research was gathered by studying five South Australian prisons and conducting a series of interviews with 55 male Aboriginal prisoners incarcerated within them. The prisons were documented using observations, interviews with staff and prisoners, photographic surveys and environmental walkthroughs. Both the accommodation standards, and the responsibility to provide those standards by the Department for Correctional Services (South Australia), are examined. The needs and preferences of the subject group were investigated using a three-stage interview process which included gathering personal and incarceration profiles, a forced choice experiment employing photographic sets and a number of drawing exercises to elicit design preferences.

The results present a picture of the Aboriginal prison population in South Australia and their design needs. It shows that there are commonalities among the Aboriginal prisoner population in that they are relatively young, have relatively large numbers of children and are dependent on other family members for stability outside the prison environment. Aboriginal people display non-complaint and resistance behaviours and are consequently segregated at an alarming rate in South Australian prisons.

The research identifies that prison environments in South Australia are often incongruent with the needs of Aboriginal prisoners. The thesis presents the argument for prison environments to move from being designed within philosophies of segregation and separation to recognising the importance of Aboriginal domiciliary practices, lifestyles structured around the social group and the need to maintain connections to country for all Aboriginal prisoners. The need for prison environments to take into account the identity and spirituality of Aboriginal prisoners is highlighted. The thesis yields further understandings on the design of prison environments for Aboriginal prisoners and will stimulate debate on incarcerating Aboriginal people in a Western tradition.