A Neurobiological and Computational Analysis of Target Discrimination in Visual Clutter by the Insect Visual System

Steven Wiederman

Discipline of Physiology
School of Molecular & Biomedical Science
The University of Adelaide

September 2008

A thesis submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy
Some insects have the capability to detect and track small moving objects, often against cluttered moving backgrounds. Determining how this task is performed is an intriguing challenge, both from a physiological and computational perspective. Previous research has characterized higher-order neurons within the fly brain known as small target motion detectors (STMD) that respond selectively to targets, even within complex moving surrounds. Interestingly, these cells still respond robustly when the velocity of the target is matched to the velocity of the background (i.e. with no relative motion cues).

We performed intracellular recordings from intermediate-order neurons in the fly visual system (the medulla). These full-wave rectifying, transient cells (RTC) reveal independent adaptation to luminance changes of opposite signs (suggesting separate on and off channels) and fast adaptive temporal mechanisms (as seen in some previously described cell types). We show, via electrophysiological experiments, that the RTC is temporally responsive to rapidly changing stimuli and is well suited to serving an important function in a proposed target-detecting pathway.

To model this target discrimination, we use high dynamic range (HDR) natural images to represent real-world luminance values that serve as inputs to a biomimetic representation of photoreceptor processing. Adaptive spatiotemporal high-pass filtering (1st-order interneurons) shapes the transient edge-like responses, useful for feature discrimination. Following this, a model for the RTC implements a nonlinear facilitation between the rapidly adapting, and independent polarity contrast channels, each with centre-surround antagonism. The recombination of the channels results in increased discrimination of small targets, of approximately the size of a single pixel, without the need for relative motion cues. This method of feature discrimination contrasts with traditional target and background motion-field computations. We show that our RTC-based target detection model is well matched to properties described for the higher-order STMD neurons, such as contrast sensitivity, height tuning and velocity tuning. The model output shows that the spatiotemporal profile of small targets is sufficiently rare within natural scene imagery to allow our highly nonlinear matched filter to successfully detect many targets from the background.
The model produces robust target discrimination across a biologically plausible range of target sizes and a range of velocities. We show that the model for small target motion detection is highly correlated to the velocity of the stimulus but not other background statistics, such as local brightness or local contrast, which normally influence target detection tasks.

From an engineering perspective, we examine model elaborations for improved target discrimination via inhibitory interactions from correlation-type motion detectors, using a form of antagonism between our feature correlator and the more typical motion correlator. We also observe that a changing optimal threshold is highly correlated to the value of observer ego-motion. We present an elaborated target detection model that allows for implementation of a static optimal threshold, by scaling the target discrimination mechanism with a model-derived velocity estimation of ego-motion.

Finally, we investigate the physiological relevance of this target discrimination model. We show that via very subtle image manipulation of the visual stimulus, our model accurately predicts dramatic changes in observed electrophysiological responses from STMD neurons.
THESIS DECLARATION

This work contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text. I give consent to this copy of my thesis when deposited in the University Library, being made available for loan and photocopying, subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.

The author acknowledges that copyright of published works contained within this thesis (as listed below) resides with the copyright holder(s) of those works.


Copyright: © 2008 Wiederman et al. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License, which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original author and source are credited.


Copyright: © 2007 IEEE. Reprinted with permission


Copyright: © 2007 IEEE. Reprinted with permission


Copyright: © 2008 SPIE, Wiederman et.al. Reprinted with permission

SIGNATURE ______________________ DATE ____________
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Most importantly, I would like to thank Alicia, who moved with me from Sydney so that I could join the O'Carroll lab in Adelaide. Without her love and support, none of this would have been possible.

I would like to thank my supervisor Dave O'Carroll, who knows the perfect balance between being mentor, friend and family support. I have learned so much these last few years, all of which was due to his great guidance and helpful encouragement.

Thanks to Paul Barnett, for being a fantastic office buddy and a good friend – it was a pleasure to share the PhD experience with you.

Thanks to Russell Brinkworth and Karin Nordström, both for your friendship and help with my research. I was very lucky, as I was able to learn from each of you, entirely different things, and it has made me an ‘all round’ better scientist and engineer.

Thanks to my external supervisors; to Subhash Challa for setting me up here in Adelaide, and to Pat Shoemaker for his help in my project and our work together.

Many thanks to the O’Carroll lab family, Doug Bolzon, Jodi Gray, Ximena Nelson, Bob Piddington, Bart Geurten, Irene Moyer and Eng Leng Mah. Also, thanks to the extended family, everyone in the Discipline of Physiology.

PhD Supervisors;

Associate Professor David O'Carroll
Discipline of Physiology, The University of Adelaide

Dr Patrick Shoemaker
Tanner Research Inc., California, USA

Professor Subhash Challa
Victorian Research Labs, The University of Melbourne
Statement of Contributions of Jointly Authored Works

The following states the contribution of the authors to the following published works.

Steven Wiederman    SDW    Patrick Shoemaker    PAS
Russell Brinkworth   RSAB    David O'Carroll  DO'C


Conceptualisation: SDW wished to understand the functionality of _on-off_ units, whether as non-directional motion detectors, inputs to correlator motion detectors, or feature detectors. Upon discussion with DO'C, SDW agreed to model these units as contrast gain controllers in the arms of motion correlators (poster presentation), whilst SDW discussed the relevance of _on-off_ units as feature detectors and as possible inputs to motion detectors with DO'C and PAS. SDW and PAS suggested that the presence of ON- and OFF-signaling pathways with independent adaptation might well be relevant for small feature extraction (by the novel on and off contrast phases (independent and unadapted) _hitting_ of the small subunits within the _on-off_ unit). PAS's immediate interest was in small target detection which was reinforced by the presence of inhibitory surrounds in the receptive fields of these cells (as indicated by the previous literature). SDW conceptualized elaborated models for this spatial filtering. These various ideas coalesced into a suitable nonlinear matched filter for small moving targets. This required a model to test for this target discrimination which was then designed and implemented in Simulink/Matlab by SDW.

Realisation: All electrophysiological investigation undertaken by SDW, under the tutelage of DO'C. Modeling: Lipetz function PAS, with varying midpoint parameter by SDW. Original model for fast depolarisation, slow repolarisation adaptive mechanism developed by PAS. Implementation of nonlinear filter was provided in SPICE by PAS that coincidentally was mathematically equivalent to gradient _switched_ filter designed by SDW. All simulation and analysis tools written by SDW. Suggested use of natural scenes and panoramic inputs by DO'C. ROC analysis suggested by PAS. Examining temporal responsiveness of RTC by DO'C, SDW and PAS with PAS suggesting _doulet_ stimulus. All Python coding of new visual stimuli by SDW. All electrophysiological data analysis and model analysis by SDW.

Documentation: First writing by SDW, with both PAS and DO'C providing strong written contributions and review.

**Conceptualisation and Realisation:** this is an engineering publication of the modelling results as seen in the PLoS research, therefore see (1) above.

**Documentation:** written by SDW

---


**Conceptualisation:** Idea to test model across varying target sizes and velocities by SDW. Interest in seeing capability for target discrimination with HDR stimulus (due to photoreceptor dynamics) by RSAB and SDW. Idea to test for correlations with image luminance and contrast values, and panorama velocities by SDW.

**Realisation:** Translation of overall modelling efforts to Matlab was a collaboration by SDW and RSAB. All elaborated photoreceptor modelling by RSAB. Extended modelling of LMC dynamics by SDW and RSAB. All analysis of results by SDW.

**Documentation:** written by SDW, with RSAB providing editing and review. Useful suggestions by D’OC.

---


**Conceptualisation:** The model elaborations were conceptualised by SDW. Insightful mathematical interpretation and helpful analysis of ideas provided by RSAB.

**Realisation:** Target discrimination model design, implementation and analysis by SDW. All EMD/Wide-field components of the model written by RSAB. Interactions between the two written by SDW. All analysis of results by SDW.

**Documentation:** written by SDW, with RSAB providing editing and review Useful suggestions by D’OC.
I agree with the above statement of contribution and give permission for the paper(s) to be included in this thesis.

Steven Wiederman:       SIGNATURE _______________       DATE______

Patrick Shoemaker:       SIGNATURE _______________       DATE______

Russell Brinkworth:      SIGNATURE _______________       DATE______

David O'Carroll:        SIGNATURE _______________       DATE______
Author’s Comments

- Publications within this thesis are exact copies of the original article except for the following considerations

  1. The typesetting is changed to provide a consistent format across the chapters of the thesis.

  2. References at the end of each article are removed and can be found at the end of the thesis. I changed the format of citations within the articles, to be consistent throughout the thesis.

  3. Some figure titles have been improved, to provide a clearer Table of Figures.

- Within journal articles, figures are cross referenced as they were published, e.g. figure 4 in Chapter 2 is captioned 2.4, but referenced in text as Figure 4.

- There are variations in spelling between the chapters, both Australian and United States versions (due to submission rules for article publications).

- In the jointly published articles (see “Statement of Contributions of Jointly Authored Works”), I use the plural form of the personal pronoun. In the rest of the thesis, I return to the singular form. In some cases, when referencing work performed over the duration of the research (for example, the thesis abstract), it is more appropriate to use the plural personal pronoun.
### Common Acronyms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Definition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AUROC</td>
<td>Area Under the Receiver Operating Characteristic (Curve)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSTMD</td>
<td>Centrifugal Small Target Motion Detector</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EMD</td>
<td>Elementary Motion Detector</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ESTMD</td>
<td>Elementary Small Target Motion Detector</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FD</td>
<td>Figure Detection (Cell)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HDR</td>
<td>High Dynamic Range</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HPF</td>
<td>High-Pass Filter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LED</td>
<td>Light Emitting Diode</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LMC</td>
<td>Large Monopolar Cell</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LPF</td>
<td>Low-Pass Filter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LPTC</td>
<td>Lobula Plate Tangential Cell</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ROC</td>
<td>Receiver Operating Characteristic (Curve)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RTC</td>
<td>Rectifying Transient Cell</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SMC</td>
<td>Small Monopolar Cell</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STMD</td>
<td>Small Target Motion Detector</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Table of Contents

Chapter 1: Introduction .................................................................18

1.1 Target Detection, Tracking and Pursuit ........................................18

1.2 Motion Detection Theory..........................................................20
   1.2.1 Feature-tracking ...............................................................20
   1.2.2 The Gradient Scheme ......................................................20
   1.2.3 The Reichardt Correlator .................................................22
   1.2.4 The Motion Stimulus (Classical and Natural Images) .............24

1.3 Insect Visual Pathway ...............................................................26
   1.3.1 Optics ..............................................................................26
   1.3.2 Photoreceptors ...............................................................27
   1.3.3 Neural Superposition .......................................................27
   1.3.4 Lamina Neurons .............................................................28
   1.3.5 On-Off cells ....................................................................31
   1.3.6 The Neural Basis for an Elementary Motion Detector (EMD) ...32

1.4 Neural Mechanisms and Models for Motion Detection .................34
   1.4.1 Lobula Plate Tangential Cells (LPTC) ..................................34
      1.4.1.1 Figure Detection (FD) cells ...........................................34
   1.4.2 LGMD/DCMD .................................................................35
   1.4.3 Target selective neurons in the insect brain .........................36
      1.4.3.1 Small Target Motion Detectors (STMD) .........................36

1.5 Neuromorphic Models for Target Selectivity ...............................38
   1.5.1 Photoreceptors .............................................................38
   1.5.2 Figure Detection (FD) Cells .............................................39
   1.5.3 Elaborated FD ...............................................................40
   1.5.4 Small Target Motion Detector (STMD) ...............................40
Chapter 2: Rectifying Transient Cells and Target Discrimination

2.1 Context

2.2 A Model for the Detection of Moving Targets in Visual Clutter Inspired by Insect Physiology

2.2.1 Abstract

2.2.2 Introduction

2.2.2.1 Computational models for target discrimination

2.2.2.2 Full-wave rectifying transient neurons

2.2.2.3 Rectifying Transient Cells in the target detection pathway

2.2.3 Methods

2.2.3.1 Modeling

2.2.3.2 Input imagery

2.2.3.3 Physiology

2.2.4 Results

2.2.4.1 Photoreceptors

2.2.4.2 Large Monopolar Cells

2.2.4.3 Rectifying Transient Cell

2.2.4.4 Comparison of model responses to fly RTCs

2.2.4.5 Temporal responsiveness

2.2.4.6 Contrast Sensitivity Function

2.2.4.7 Target height tuning

2.2.4.8 Velocity tuning

2.2.4.9 Responses to targets in clutter

2.2.4.10 Relative motion

2.2.5 Discussion

2.2.6 Conclusion
2.2.7 Acknowledgements .............................................................................................. 69

Chapter 3. Target Discrimination Inspired from Insect Physiology .......................... 70

3.1 Context .................................................................................................................. 70

3.2 Biologically Inspired Small Target Detection Mechanisms ............................... 71

3.2.1 Abstract ............................................................................................................. 71

3.2.2 Introduction ...................................................................................................... 72

3.2.3 Modelling & Simulation ................................................................................... 74

3.2.3.1 Overview ....................................................................................................... 74

3.2.3.2 Input Images .................................................................................................. 75

3.2.3.3 Early Visual Processing .................................................................................. 75

3.2.3.4 Rectifying Transient Cell ............................................................................. 76

3.2.4 Results ............................................................................................................. 78

3.2.5 Discussion ....................................................................................................... 79

3.2.6 Acknowledgement ........................................................................................... 81

Chapter 4: Target Discrimination in General Stimulus Conditions ......................... 82

4.1 Context .................................................................................................................. 82

4.2 Bio-inspired Small Target Discrimination in High Dynamic Range Natural Scenes .................................................................................................................. 84

4.2.1 Abstract ........................................................................................................... 84

4.2.2 Introduction ..................................................................................................... 85

4.2.3 Methods (Modeling & Simulation) ................................................................... 86

4.2.3.1 Overview ....................................................................................................... 86

4.2.3.2 Input Images .................................................................................................. 87

4.2.3.3 Photoreceptors ............................................................................................. 89

4.2.3.4 Large Monopolar Cells ............................................................................... 90

4.2.3.5 Rectifying Transient Cells ......................................................................... 90
4.2.3.6 Simulation and Analysis ................................................................. 93
4.2.4 Results & Discussion ...................................................................... 94
4.2.5 Conclusion ..................................................................................... 100
4.2.6 Acknowledgements ....................................................................... 101

Chapter 5: Elaborated Models for Target Detection ................................. 102

5.1 Context .............................................................................................. 102
5.2 Bio-inspired Target Detection in Natural Scenes: Optimal Thresholds and Ego-motion ................................................................. 103
  5.2.1 Abstract ....................................................................................... 103
  5.2.2 Introduction ................................................................................. 104
  5.2.3 Modeling, Simulation & Analysis ................................................. 107
    5.2.3.1 Model Overview ............................................................... 107
    5.2.3.2 Bio-inspired & Biomimetic ............................................... 107
    5.2.3.3 Input Images .................................................................... 108
    5.2.3.4 Early Visual Processing ................................................... 109
    5.2.3.5 Rectifying Transient Cells ............................................. 110
    5.2.3.6 Elementary Motion Detectors ....................................... 111
    5.2.3.7 Near-local EMD inhibition ............................................ 113
    5.2.3.8 Ego-motion scaling ......................................................... 115
  5.2.4 Conclusion ................................................................................. 118
  5.2.5 Acknowledgements .................................................................... 120

Chapter 6: Testing the ESTMD Model with Experiments on STMDs .......... 121

6.1 Context .............................................................................................. 121
6.2 Comparison of the ESTMD Model to the Dragonfly CSTMD Responses ...... 122
  6.2.1 Introduction ................................................................................. 122
  6.2.2 Methods .................................................................................... 122
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure 1-1. Fly Chase Behaviour</th>
<th>19</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Figure 1-2. The Gradient Detector</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 1-3. The Reichardt Correlator</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 1-4. Sexual Dimorphism</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 1-5. Fly Eyes</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 1-6. The Lamina and Medulla of <em>Drosophila</em></td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 1-7. Cross-section of the Fly Head</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 1-8. Photoreceptor Processing</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 1-9. Small Field FD model</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 2-1. Model Overviews</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 2-2. Input Images and Optical Blurring</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 2-3. Panorama Rotation</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 2-4. Rectifying Transient Cells (Independent Adaptation)</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 2-5. Temporal Responsiveness</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 2-6. Contrast Sensitivity Function (Small Target and Wide-field)</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 2-7. Target Height Tuning</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 2-8. Velocity Tuning</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 2-9. Sample Data Traces</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 2-10. Natural Image Panoramas (ROC curves)</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 2-11. Relative Motion</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 3-1. Responses of Model Rectifying Transient Cell</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 3-2. Overview of the ESTMD model</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figure 3-3. An Example of Model Outputs. .................................................................77
Figure 3-4. ROC curves for four panoramic images..................................................79
Figure 4-1. Overview of the ESTMD model...............................................................88
Figure 4-2. Complex Photoreceptor Model...............................................................90
Figure 4-3. HDR Panoramic Images.........................................................................92
Figure 4-4. Model Output Stages................................................................................95
Figure 4-5. Receiver Operating Characteristic Analysis..............................................96
Figure 4-6. Target Size AUROC................................................................................98
Figure 4-7. Panorama Velocity AUROC......................................................................99
Figure 4-8. Model Response Correlations.................................................................100
Figure 5-1. Elaborated Model Overview....................................................................108
Figure 5-2. Output of the Elaborated ESTMD model................................................112
Figure 5-3. ESTMD with Inhibition............................................................................114
Figure 5-4. Ego-motion Rescaling Technique............................................................116
Figure 5-5. Ego-motion Rescaled ESTMD.................................................................117
Figure 5-6. Cumulative Distribution Functions........................................................118
Figure 6-1. Single Scan through Receptive Field.......................................................124
Figure 6-2. Spiking Receptive Field Scan.................................................................125
Figure 6-3. High Contrast Sensitivity..........................................................................126
Figure 6-4. Graded Receptive Field Scan.................................................................127
Figure 6-5. Dark Target Selectivity of CSTMD..........................................................128
Figure 6-6. Target Height Tuning (Dark and Light Polarity).......................................129
Figure 6-7. An Off Channel in the Medulla of the Blowfly, Calliphora......................130
Figure 6-8. ESTMD Model Responses to the Natural Images....................................132
Figure 6-9. Mirrored Receptive Field ................................................................. 133

Figure 6-10. CSTMD Neural Responses to the _Bush_ Images ......................... 135

Figure 6-11. CSTMD Neural Responses to the _Car Park_ Images ..................... 136

Figure 6-12. Morphology of CSTMD ................................................................. 138