Declining Water Quality as a Driver of Changes to Subtidal Communities

Daniel Gorman

Presented for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy
School of Earth and Environmental Sciences
The University of Adelaide, South Australia
December 2009
I dedicate this thesis to my late father, Phillip Roy Gorman. The help and encouragement Dad gave me throughout undergraduate years and at the onset of my PhD were key influences that drove me to the finishing line. Not only did he push me to reach my goals, but he was also the first to celebrate success. Phillip died on the 19th October 2004, aged 53 years. You will be missed by all who knew you, and remembered as the “king of your castle”. As part of this dedication I include the following lyric – from a favourite poet of Dad’s and one that I read at his funeral.

A Lyric
If space and time, as sages say,
Are things that cannot be,
The fly that lives a single day
Has lived as long as we.
But let us live while yet we may,
While love and life are free
For time is time, and runs away,
Though sages disagree.
The flowers I sent thee when the dew
Was trembling on the vine,
Were withered ere the wild bee flew
To suck the eglantine.
But let us haste to pluck anew
Nor mourn to see them pine,
And though the flowers of life be few
Yet let them be divine.
T.S. ELIOT
Declaration of Authorship

This work contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or tertiary institution to Daniel Gorman and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text.

I give consent to this copy of my thesis when deposited in the University Library, being made available for loan and photocopying, subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.

The author acknowledges that copyright of published works contained within this thesis (as listed in Appendix A) resides with the copyright holder(s) of those works.

I also give permission for the digital version of my thesis to be made available on the web, via the University’s digital research repository, the Library catalogue, the Australasian Digital Theses Program (ADTP) and also through web search engines, unless permission has been granted by the University to restrict access for a period of time.

Daniel Gorman

December 2009

Cover image: Regime-shifted landscape? An example of structurally simple turfed habitat, common along southern Australia’s urbanised coastlines. Photograph taken along the Adelaide metropolitan coast in 2008 by the author.
# Table of contents

Declining **Water Quality** as a **Driver** of Changes to Subtidal Communities

Abstract: 1  
Acknowledgements: 3

CHAPTER ONE: General Introduction: 7  
1.1 Regime shifts in temperate rocky marine communities: 10  
1.2 Spatial subsidies: 13  
1.3 Recovery of regime-shifted landscapes?: 14  
1.4 Stable Isotope Analysis as a tool for ecologists: 15  
1.5 Studying Australia’s southern seas: 17  
1.6 Scope and outline of the thesis: 19

CHAPTER TWO: Land-to-sea connectivity: linking human-derived terrestrial subsidies to subtidal habitat change on open rocky coasts: 21  
2.1 Introduction: 25  
2.2 Methods: 28  
2.3 Results: 33  
2.4 Discussion: 46

CHAPTER THREE: Nutrient-driven changes to turf phenology and its implications for forest resilience: 53  
3.1 Introduction: 57  
3.2 Methods: 60  
3.3 Results: 66  
3.4 Discussion: 76
CHAPTER FOUR: Habitat loss and shifts in the diet of consumers  81
  4.1 Introduction  85
  4.2 Methods  88
  4.3 Results  94
  4.4 Discussion  108

CHAPTER FIVE: Recovering subtidal forests in human-dominated landscapes  115
  5.1 Introduction  119
  5.2 Methods  121
  5.3 Results  125
  5.4 Discussion  133

CHAPTER SIX: General Discussion  137
  6.1 Terrestrial inputs as drivers of regime shifts  140
  6.2 Reduced resilience in macroalgal forests  142
  6.3 The effect of regime shifts on higher trophic levels  145
  6.4 Implications for the restoration of regime-shifted landscapes  147
  6.5 Future research  148
  6.6 Conclusions  149

Appendix A: Permission to reproduce published material  150
Appendix B: Supplementary material  153
Bibliography  156
“Man has only recently come to realise the finite limitations of the coast as a place to live, work and play and as a source of valuable resources. This realisation has come along with overcrowding, overdevelopment in some areas, and destruction of valuable resources by his misuse of this unique environment”. Ketchum 1972
Abstract

This body of work examines the influence of land use on nearshore water quality, and how this can drive changes to algal and invertebrate communities along Australia’s southern coastline. The overall aim of the thesis was to investigate links between increasing coastal water-column nitrogen concentrations (derived from terrestrial inputs) and the expansion of turf-forming habitats that can alter the structure and function of subtidal ecosystems.

I initially tested whether human activities in coastal catchments can increase subsidies of nitrogen to open rocky coasts. I identified landscape-scale variation in the supply of Dissolved Inorganic Nitrogen (DIN) to coastal waters adjacent to natural, agricultural and urban catchments. Compared to natural catchments, subsidies of DIN were 8 - 407 times greater in urban catchments, and 1 - 63 times greater in agricultural catchments. Subsidies of nitrogen from urban catchments were attributed to the release of sewage effluent, as delineated by δ15N isotopic values of transplanted algae.

Having made this link, I then assessed whether catchment-scale variation in nitrogen subsidies may predict patterns of subtidal habitat structure, particularly as related to theories of regime shifts from forested landscapes to structurally depauperate turf-forming habitats. I validated this hypothesis, demonstrating that both relative covers and patch-sizes of turfed habitat were greater where the ratio of terrestrial nitrogen inputs to ambient coastal resources was large. An important realisation was that loss of forests may be more strongly related to the size of subsidy (i.e. the relative increases in water column nitrogen concentrations along urban coasts) rather than the size of coastal populations. Together, these data link coastal development with modified land-to-sea subsidies, and indirectly support the model that ecological effects may be proportional to the disparity between donor and recipient resources.
Having demonstrated a link between nitrogen subsidies and subtidal habitat change, I then investigated factors likely to initiate and maintain such shifts. My results demonstrate that nutrient elevation can alter the natural phenology of turfs, sustaining dense covers throughout periods of natural senescence (winter). Perennial turf covers are able to accumulate large volumes of sediment; a synergy can impede the winter recruitment of canopy-forming species (kelps and fucoid algae). My observations of reduced forest recovery along urban coasts serve to highlight the complex interaction between elevated nutrients, persistent turf covers and increased sediment accumulation, which can reduce the resilience of coastal ecosystems to disturbance.

In recognition that regime shifts are likely to have consequences for higher trophic levels, I compared the diet of invertebrate herbivores from healthy and degraded coastlines using stable isotope analysis ($\delta^{13}$C and $\delta^{15}$N). Dietary modelling showed that turfs contributed more to the diet of consumers along degraded coastlines where turfed landscapes have replaced extensive covers of macroalgal forest. Additionally, there were strong correlations between covers of turfed habitat, herbivore diet and relative densities. Changes to ambient food quality associated with regime shift may be an important aspect of nutrient-driven change along human-dominated coastlines.

The final component of my thesis redressed some of the uncertainty about restoration initiatives for urban coasts by demonstrating that regime shifts are not necessarily permanent. I showed that turf removal can facilitate the recovery of degraded forests. Future restoration, therefore, is a possible outcome of polices that aim to decouple the link between nutrient inputs and recalcitrant turfed habitats that prevent forest recovery. Initiatives that reduce nutrient discharge to coastal waters (e.g., wastewater recycling) are likely to restore the resilience of nearshore marine ecosystems and promote their rehabilitation.
Acknowledgements

I am indebted to my supervisors Sean Connell and Bronwyn Gillanders, whose energy and enthusiasm for subtidal and estuarine ecology is truly inspiring. To colleagues and members of the Southern Seas Ecology Laboratories (past and present) who helped with fieldwork, labwork, and to make time spent in the office both stimulating as well as entertaining. Special thanks, in addition to photo credits (below) to, The Livore family, A. Irving, T. Saunders, S. Hart, B. Roberts, C. Izzo and J. Brooks. Thanks also, to the many who offered passionate discussions about science held on the green couch or in various Rundle Street hotels. I am also thankful for the love and support of my family and friends, especially Mum and Rainer; Amy Vomiero, Delphine Fleury, Claire Doughty and the group-of-8 brotherhood (while not exactly beneficial to a life of study, were always there when needed).

Funding bodies

I would like to formally acknowledge the financial support of The Sir Mark Mitchell Research Foundation, the Wildlife Advisory Committee (Department of Environment and Heritage, Government of South Australia), The Field Naturalists Society of South Australia Inc., and the Trustees of the Kirsty Brown Memorial Award. The contributions awarded by these organisations greatly expanded the scope of my research, increasing its spatial generality and theoretical relevance. I would also like to formally acknowledge the support of The University of Adelaide Graduate Centre for awarding me with a Research Abroad Scholarship that enabled a research program to the University of Hawaii.
Chapter Acknowledgements
(As per individual manuscripts)

Chapter two

This research was encouraged from inception to implementation by Patricia von Baumgarten (Principal Marine Policy Advisor, South Australia). Financial support for this research was provided by The Department of Environment and Heritage with leverage from an Australian Research Council Linkage Grant. At the time of writing this grant, there was substantial uncertainty about habitat loss, the role of human activities and the need for renewed policy development. Today, we thank the organisations (The Department of Environment and Heritage, Environmental Protection Agency and SA Water Authority) and processes which engaged our research outcomes with policy development and new initiatives (The Parliamentary Enquiry into Coastal Development, Water Proofing Adelaide: 20-year blueprint). Field assistance was provided by I. Carlson and J. Stehbens. Helpful comments on the manuscript were provided by R. M. Connolly and T. F. Gaston. Funding was provided by a Sir Mark Mitchell Research Foundation Grant and Kirsty Brown Memorial Award for Gorman, ARC Linkage for Connell and Russell, and QEII Fellowship for Connell.

Chapter three

This research was motivated by the requirement of policy makers (South Australian Department of Premier and Cabinet) for improved understanding of the factors contributing to habitat loss along Adelaide”s metropolitan coastline. Field assistance was provided by A. D. Irving, J. Brooks and F. Colosio. Paul Burch (SARDI Aquatic Sciences) provided helpful advice on statistical analysis. This research was funded by a Wildlife Conservation Fund South Australia Grant to Gorman (0254) and an ARC Discovery grant to Sean Connell.
Chapter four

This research was driven by the need to understand the affects and the potential for reversing subtidal regime shifts along the southern coastline of Australia. We are thankful for the helpful comments of Bronwyn M. Gillanders and Bayden D. Russell. Financial support was provided through an Australian Research Council Grant to Sean Connell and a Lirabenda Endowment Fund Research Grant to Daniel Gorman. We thank R. Diocares for mass spectrometry, I.J. Carlson for assistance with nutrient analysis, T. Saunders and A.F. Dobrovolskis for field assistance. The experiments performed in this study comply with the current laws of Australia.

Chapter five

We thank the farsighted recognition of P. von Baumgarten (Principle Marine Policy Adviser) and her department (The Department of Environment and Heritage) for commissioning this research to guide development of new policy on coastal management. The Australian Research Council (ARC Linkage) provided leverage funds to assist DEH achieve our work in an applied context. These research outcomes have been used by the South Australian Department of Premier and Cabinet as part of its coastal planning and water recycling initiatives. Helpful comments were provided by T. Wernberg. Field assistance was provided by J. Brooks, J.P. Livore and J.R. Naumann. Daniel Gorman was supported by a Wildlife Conservation Foundation Research Grant (0254), and Sean Connell by a QEII Fellowship.
Conducting broad-scale subtidal research along Australia’s southern coastline requires a great deal of logistical planning, and a "big" boat. Research vessel "Odax" in front of Australia’s parliament house. Photograph taken by the author during the Southern Ocean trip 2005.