The Discipline of Nursing

School of Population Health & Clinical Practice

Faculty of Health Science

Violence in the emergency department: an ethnographic study

BEE CHUO LAU

RN, BHSc (Nursing), MHSc (Beh Sc)

Thesis submitted to the University of Adelaide for fulfilment of the requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

2009
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

TABLE OF CONTENTS ........................................................................................................I

LIST OF TABLES .................................................................................................................. X
LIST OF FIGURES ................................................................................................................ XI
LISTS OF RELATED PUBLICATIONS AND PRESENTATIONS ................................. XII
STATEMENT OF ORIGINALITY ......................................................................................XIV
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS ................................................................................................. XV
ABSTRACT........................................................................................................................... XVI

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION ......................................................................................... 1

INTRODUCTION .................................................................................................................. 1
CONTEXT OF THE STUDY ................................................................................................. 2
RESEARCH QUESTIONS ..................................................................................................... 3
PURPOSES OF THE STUDY ............................................................................................... 3
SIGNIFICANCE OF THE STUDY ......................................................................................... 3
THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK .......................................................................................... 6
ASSUMPTIONS OF THE STUDY ....................................................................................... 7
DEFINITION OF TERMS ..................................................................................................... 7

Violence .............................................................................................................................. 7
Verbal violence .................................................................................................................. 8
Physical violence .............................................................................................................. 8
Threat/intimidation .......................................................................................................... 8

Culture ............................................................................................................................... 9

Patient ............................................................................................................................... 9

OUTLINE OF THE THESIS ............................................................................................... 9
CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW

INTRODUCTION

THEORIES OF VIOLENCE

Biological theory

Social learning theory

Frustration-aggression theory

THE PREVALENCE OF VIOLENCE

Estimating the prevalence of violence

Comparison of prevalence across countries

Comparison of prevalence across various settings

CHARACTERISTICS OF VIOLENCE

Common types of violence

Relationships between types of violence

Time of incidents

PATIENTS/RELATIVES’ CHARACTERISTICS

STAFF CHARACTERISTICS

RISK FACTORS RELATED TO VIOLENCE

Intrinsic risk factors

Extrinsic risk factors

Ranking of risk factors

CONTRIBUTING CULTURE

Organisational culture

Culture of blaming

Culture of not reporting
THE MANAGEMENT AND PREVENTION OF VIOLENCE

Micro management and prevention of violence ........................................ 36
Evaluation of micro violence management and prevention strategies ........ 37
Macro management and prevention of violence ...................................... 39
Evaluation of macro violence management and prevention strategies ........ 39

PREDICTION OF VIOLENCE .................................................................. 40
Nature of violence prediction .................................................................. 40
Accuracy of violence prediction ................................................................. 41

PERCEPTIONS OF VIOLENCE ................................................................. 43
Nurses’ perceptions of violence ................................................................. 43
Patients’ perceptions of violence ............................................................... 46
Comparison of nurses’ and patients’ perceptions of violence ................... 47

SUMMARY .............................................................................................. 49

CHAPTER 3: METHODOLOGY ................................................................. 50

INTRODUCTION ...................................................................................... 50
ETHNOGRAPHY ...................................................................................... 51
Defining ethnography ............................................................................. 51
CLASSICAL TRADITIONAL ETHNOGRAPHY ........................................ 52
CONTEMPORARY ETHNOGRAPHY ....................................................... 53
Common ground and contrasts for classical traditional and contemporary
ethnography .......................................................................................... 54
ETHNOGRAPHY IN NURSING ............................................................... 58
PARADIGMS ADOPTED FOR THE STUDY ........................................... 59
Interpretive paradigm ............................................................................. 59
Post-positive paradigm .......................................................................... 61
CHAPTER 4: RESEARCH METHODS

INTRODUCTION

RESEARCH SETTING

PARTICIPANTS

Identification of participants

Inclusion and exclusion criteria

GAINING ACCESS

ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS

DATA COLLECTION METHODS

Observation

Nature of observations

Duration of observations

Definition and philosophy underpinning observation

Types of observations

Questionnaires

Interviews
STRUCTURED DATA COLLECTION PROCEDURES .......................................................... 94

DATA ANALYSIS ........................................................................................................ 96

Nature of data analysis in ethnographic study .......................................................... 97
Cognitive processes .................................................................................................... 98
Sequential selection .................................................................................................. 99
Data analysis framework for the study ...................................................................... 100
The item level of analysis ......................................................................................... 102
Domain analysis ...................................................................................................... 103
The pattern level of analysis .................................................................................... 105
Taxonomic analysis .................................................................................................. 106
Componential analysis ............................................................................................. 109
The structural level of analysis ................................................................................ 111

SUMMARY .................................................................................................................. 112

CHAPTER 5: FINDINGS .............................................................................................. 114

INTRODUCTION ......................................................................................................... 115

CULTURAL SCENE ..................................................................................................... 115

The scene .................................................................................................................... 115
The actors .................................................................................................................... 119
The patients/relatives ............................................................................................... 120
The nurses .................................................................................................................. 121
What goes on in this place? ....................................................................................... 124

THE CULTURAL DOMAINS ...................................................................................... 126

‘Problems and solutions’ (‘...communication is the key...’) ................................ 126
‘Them and us’ (‘...I don’t like your attitude...’) .................................................... 127
‘Requests and demands’ (‘I want to see the doctor ASAP’) ................................. 127
‘PROBLEMS AND SOLUTIONS’ ................................................................. 129

Perceptions of violence ................................................................. 130

‘That’s not violence, this is violence’ .............................................. 130

Violence - inevitable and unpredictable ....................................... 132

‘I can handle violence’ ................................................................. 133

‘It’s not my fault’ ........................................................................... 134

Victim blaming ............................................................................. 135

Feelings about violence ............................................................... 136

Indicators of violence ................................................................. 137

Characteristics of patients and situations ..................................... 138

Warning signs of violence ......................................................... 139

Patients’ characteristics and warning signs matched ................. 140

Responses to violence ............................................................... 141

‘THEM AND US’ ........................................................................... 145

Patients/relatives’ behaviours .................................................... 145

The initial interactions ............................................................... 146

The first impressions of patients/relatives .................................. 148

Nurses’ behaviours ................................................................. 148

Behaviours relevant to the establishment of rapport .................. 150

‘Turning point’ ........................................................................... 152

Patients’ presenting problems .................................................. 153

‘REQUESTS AND DEMANDS’ ..................................................... 154

Requests from patients/relatives .............................................. 155

Nurses’ perceptions about the requests ..................................... 156

Rejecting patients/relatives’ requests ....................................... 158
APPENDIX 1: VIOLENT INCIDENT QUESTIONNAIRE .................................................. 255
APPENDIX 2: ETHICS APPROVAL LETTER ............................................................... 257
APPENDIX 3: INFORMATION SHEET ...................................................................... 258
APPENDIX 4: POSTER FOR THE STUDY ................................................................. 260
APPENDIX 5: CONSENT FORM ............................................................................ 261
APPENDIX 6: REFUSAL FORM FOR TELEPHONE CONTACT ............................... 262
APPENDIX 7: LAYOUT OF THE CULTURAL SCENE ............................................. 263
APPENDIX 8: GUIDE FOR OBSERVATIONS .......................................................... 264
APPENDIX 9: REVISED OBSERVATION GUIDE .................................................. 265
APPENDIX 10: SEMI-STRUCTURED INTERVIEW QUESTIONS FOR NURSES........ 266
APPENDIX 11: TELEPHONE INTERVIEW PROCEDURES & QUESTIONS FOR PATIENTS 267
LIST OF TABLES

TABLE 2.1: COMPARISON OF PREVALENCE OF VIOLENCE ACROSS SETTINGS ........ 22

TABLE 3.1 ISSUES AND STRATEGIES USED TO PROMOTE INTERNAL VALIDITY OR CREDIBILITY ........................................................................................................ 73

TABLE 3.2: STRATEGIES USED TO ENSURE INTERNAL RELIABILITY OR DEPENDABILITY ........................................................................................................ 75

TABLE 4.1: INCLUSION AND EXCLUSION CRITERIA FOR PATIENTS .................. 79

TABLE 4.2: INCLUSION AND EXCLUSION CRITERIA FOR NURSES .................... 80
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FIGURE</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Paradigmatic triangulation underpinning the study</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Attendance of patients in the proposed hospital ED</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>Flow-chart for structured data collection procedures</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>Data analysis framework for the study</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>Nurses’ and patients/relatives’ views of triage</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>Framework of nature of violence in the ED culture</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>Taxonomy of a patient’s initial interaction</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>Patients/relatives’ and nurses’ view of requests</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>Taxonomy of steps in estimating waiting time</td>
<td>164</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>Patients/relatives’ and nurses’ view of waiting</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.7</td>
<td>Taxonomy of cultural aspects of violence in the ED</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>Relationships between nurses’ roles and their implications for patients</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LISTS OF RELATED PUBLICATIONS AND PRESENTATIONS

RELATED PUBLICATIONS


RELATED PRESENTATIONS AT CONFERENCE

Conference: 1st National Emergency Nursing Conference, Glenelg, Adelaide, South Australia

Topic: ‘Violence in the Emergency Department: a review of literature’ (Oral presentation)

Date: 4 September 2004

Conference: International Emergency Nursing Conference, Coogee Beach, Sydney, NSW

Topic: Violence in the Emergency Department inevitable? An ethnographic study (Oral presentation)

Date: 13 October 2005
Conference: 7th International Interdisciplinary Conference: Advances in Qualitative Methods, Surfers Paradise, Australia

Topic: Ethnography in Action: The dilemmas (Poster presentation)

Date: 14 July 2006

SCHOLARSHIP RECEIVED TO SUPPORT THIS RESEARCH

2003-2006 JS Barker Divisional Scholarships
STATEMENT OF ORIGINALITY

This thesis contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, this thesis contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text.

I give consent to this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University library, being available for loan and photocopying, subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.

I also give permission for the digital version of my thesis to be made available on the web, via the University’s digital research repository, the Library catalogue, the Australian Digital Thesis Program (ADTP) and also through web search engines, unless permission has been granted by the University to restrict access for a period of time.

Signed:

Bee Chuo Lau

Date
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

There are many people who have contributed to the completion of this thesis by providing encouragement, support and assistance. Initially, thanks to my supervisors Dr Judy Magarey and Dr Rick Wiechula for their guidance, encouragement and support throughout the duration of my study.

I also thank the Clinical Nurse Consultant in the Emergency Department; Nigel Kitto for helping me to contact the patients involved in violent incidents, and the Head of Emergency Medicine; Associate Prof Robert Dunn, for his contribution in selecting of an area of interest. I am very grateful to the participants, in particular the nurses for their time and knowledge shared in the data collection phase of this research.

Last but not least, my thanks to Professor Helen McCutcheon, Professor Alison Tierney and fellow classmates for their contributions and support during the early stages of this research.

The final draft of this thesis was edited by Mr. Philip Thomas who has a Masters degree in History (University of Adelaide) and Graduate Diploma in Information Studies (University of South Australia). He was advised to restrict his assistance to the Australian Standards for Editing Practice (ASEP) for ‘Language and illustration’ and for ‘Completeness and consistency’.
ABSTRACT

Background Violence in the emergency department (ED) is a significant problem and it is increasing. Several studies have shown that violence in the ED is more likely to occur within the first hour of a patient’s presentation. Therefore, it is possible that there are some indicators of violence observable during the initial nurse-patient/relative interaction at triage.

Nevertheless the problem remains inadequately investigated as many incidents are not reported and most studies that have investigated this issue are descriptive in nature. Although these studies have provided important preliminary information, they fail to reveal the complexities of the problem, in particular the cultural aspects of violence which are crucial for the ED.

Aims The main aims of this study were to explore the cultural aspects of violence in the ED and to determine the possible indicators of violence at triage.

Methodology Contemporary ethnography based on interpretive and post-positive paradigms was adopted to frame the methodology of this study.

Methods This study was carried out at a major metropolitan ED over three months. The data collection techniques included field observations, questionnaires and semi-structured interviews. The data analysis framework adopted for this study incorporated Spradley’s (1980) and LeCompte and Schensul’s (1999) approaches.
Findings The study indicated that the cultural meanings of violence were complex and highly subjective with variations among nurses which in turn influenced their responses to violence (e.g. reporting or not reporting an incident). The cultural meanings were sometimes contradictory and confusing as violence could be seen as both a challenge and a threat or predictable and unpredictable. The same type of behaviour from one individual could be perceived as violent but not for another.

Many nurses perceived that violence was unpredictable and inevitable but the study demonstrated that there were indicators of violence which could be used to predict and prevent the problem. Factors such as environment, conflicting messages regarding waiting time, and patients’ expectations and needs played an important part in violence. Besides, there were immediate warning signs of violence such as the overt verbal (e.g. mumbling or shouting) and covert nonverbal signs (e.g. staring or agitation). This study showed that patients’ behaviours for instance being unfriendly, not appreciative, inattentive and uncooperative were better predictors of violence in the ED than their traits or problems alone.

However, nurse-patient/relative behaviours and the resulting reciprocal relationship were considered central in determining if violence would occur or be avoided. Nurses’ efforts to establish rapport with patients was crucial in minimising violence and needed to occur early. There was usually a ‘turning point’ that provided an opportunity for the nurse to avoid violence. Nurses’ behaviours at the ‘turning point’ strongly influence the outcome. Nurses’ awareness of their personal expectations, prejudices and ethnocentrism were the pivotal points in preventing escalation of violence.
**Conclusion** This study has provided a more comprehensive and sophisticated understanding of the cultural aspects of violence in the ED. While violence is a complex issue with many paradoxes, there are lessons to be learned. The study indicates that effective interpersonal empathetic communication has a significant role in reducing violence in the ED.