The Development and Validation of a Cognitive-Behavioural Measure of Psychological Mindedness

Matthew Davies

Submitted in Partial Fulfilment of the Requirements for the Combined Degree of Master of Psychology (Clinical) / Doctor of Philosophy

January 2007

School of Psychology
Faculty of Health Sciences
University of Adelaide
# Table of Contents

Abstract ......................................................................................................................... 15

Declaration .................................................................................................................... 18

Acknowledgements ....................................................................................................... 19

Introduction .................................................................................................................. 20

Chapter 1: A brief history of psychological mindedness and psychological thought .......................................................................................................................... 23

1.1 Introduction ............................................................................................................ 23

1.2 Definitions of psychological mindedness within the psychodynamic literature ................................................................................................................................. 24

1.3 Similarities and differences between the definitions of psychological mindedness .......................................................................................................................... 32

1.4 Psychological mindedness and psychodynamic therapy ........................................ 34

1.4.1 The theory of psychoanalysis ........................................................................... 34

1.4.2 The role of psychological mindedness as a predictor of psychodynamic therapy outcome ............................................................................................................. 37

1.4.3 The evidence for psychological mindedness as a predictor of outcome in psychodynamic therapy ......................................................................................... 39
1.5 Constructs related to psychological mindedness ........................................... 42
  1.5.1 Alexithymia ....................................................................................... 42
  1.5.2 Private self-consciousness ................................................................. 45
  1.5.3 Emotional intelligence ...................................................................... 47
  1.5.4 Mindfulness .................................................................................... 48
1.6 The assessment of psychological mindedness ........................................... 50
  1.6.1 The Psychological Mindedness Scale of the California Psychological
        Inventory .............................................................................................. 51
  1.6.2 The Psychological Mindedness Scale .................................................... 53
  1.6.3 The Psychological Mindedness Assessment Procedure ....................... 56
1.7 Chapter summary ..................................................................................... 59

Chapter 2: Psychological mindedness and cognitive-behaviour therapy .......... 60
2.1 Introduction ............................................................................................ 60
2.2 Cognitive-behaviour therapy .................................................................... 61
  2.2.1 The information-processing model .................................................... 61
  2.2.2 Structural organisation of thinking ................................................... 62
    2.2.2.1 Automatic thoughts ................................................................. 62
    2.2.2.2 Underlying assumptions ............................................................ 63
    2.2.2.3 Core beliefs or schemas .......................................................... 64
  2.2.3 The interaction between thoughts, emotions, and behaviour ................ 65
2.3 Treatment strategy in cognitive-behaviour therapy ..................................... 67
2.4 Efficacy of cognitive-behaviour therapy ................................................... 68
2.5 Psychological mindedness and cognitive-behaviour therapy ....................... 69
2.5.1 The ability to identify thoughts, emotions, and behaviours within
cognitive-behaviour therapy .......................................................... 71

2.5.2 The ability to see connections between thoughts, emotions, and
behaviours within cognitive-behaviour therapy .................................... 72

2.6 The potential clinical utility of a cognitive-behavioural measure of
psychological mindedness .................................................................... 73

2.7 A new cognitive-behavioural measure of psychological mindedness .......... 75
   2.7.1 Rationale for the first study ......................................................... 75
   2.7.2 Rationale for the second study .................................................... 76
   2.7.3 Rationale for the third study ....................................................... 76

Chapter 3: The development of a cognitive-behavioural measure of
psychological mindedness ..................................................................... 78
   3.1 Introduction .................................................................................... 78
   3.2 Cognitive-behavioural assessment and the measurement of psychological
   mindedness ....................................................................................... 78
   3.3 Item development of the CB-PM ..................................................... 80
   3.4 History of the CB-PM ..................................................................... 113
   3.5 Summary of the development of the CB-PM ..................................... 114

Chapter 4: The psychometric properties of the CB-PM in a non-clinical
sample ................................................................................................. 116
   4.1 Introduction .................................................................................... 116
      4.1.1 The relationship between the CB-PM and other related measures ...... 116
         4.1.1.1 Toronto Alexithymia Scale – 20 ............................................ 116
4.1.2 Aim of the first study ................................................. 124
4.1.3 Hypotheses of the first study .................................... 124
4.2 Method ........................................................................ 126
  4.2.1 Participants .............................................................. 126
  4.2.2 Measures ................................................................. 126
  4.2.3 Procedure ................................................................. 130
4.3 Results .......................................................................... 130
  4.3.1 Statistical procedure ................................................ 130
  4.3.2 Factor analysis ........................................................ 131
  4.3.3 Test of hypotheses .................................................... 135
4.4 Discussion ...................................................................... 146
  4.4.1 Psychometric properties of the CB-PM ....................... 146
  4.4.2 Limitations of the first study ..................................... 154
  4.4.3 Summary of findings from the first study ..................... 155

Chapter 5: Validating the CB-PM against cognitive-behavioural, ability-based measures ................................................. 157
5.1 Introduction ................................................................... 157
  5.1.1 Self-report vs. ability based measurement .................... 157
  5.1.2 Differing theoretical rationales ................................. 159
5.1.3 Cognitive-behavioural and ability-based measurement relating to psychological mindedness .................................................. 160

5.1.3.1 Assessing thought record skills ........................................ 161

5.1.3.2 The development of a scale to measure the ability to discriminate between thoughts, emotions, behaviours, and bodily sensations ................................................................................................. 165

5.1.3.3 The development of a scale to measure the ability to identify connections between thoughts, emotions, behaviours, and bodily sensations ................................................................. 168

5.1.4 Aims of the second study ...................................................................... 173

5.1.5 Hypotheses of the second study ............................................................ 174

5.2 Method ..................................................................................................... 174

5.2.1 Participants .......................................................................................... 174

5.2.2 Measures .............................................................................................. 175

5.2.3 Procedure ............................................................................................. 177

5.3 Results ...................................................................................................... 177

5.3.1 Statistical procedure ............................................................................ 177

5.3.2 Psychometric properties of the D-TEBBS .......................................... 178

5.3.2.1 Frequencies and descriptive statistics of the D-TEBBS ............... 178

5.3.2.2 Transformation of the D-TEBBS .................................................. 179

5.3.2.3 Frequencies and descriptive statistics of the 20-item D-TEBBS ...................................................................................... 180

5.3.2.4 Comparison of the 20 and 40-item versions of the D-TEBBS ......... 181

5.3.2.5 Internal reliability of the D-TEBBS .............................................. 182

5.3.3 Psychometric properties of the C-TEBBS .......................................... 182

5
5.3.3.1 Frequencies and descriptive statistics of the C-TEBBS........... 182
5.3.3.2 Internal reliability of the C-TEBBS ........................................ 185
5.3.4 The psychometric properties of the Thought Record Skills Assessment
.................................................................................................................................................. 185
5.3.4.1 Frequencies and descriptive statistics of the TRSA ............... 185
5.3.4.2 Internal reliability of the TRSA ............................................. 187
5.3.5 Descriptive statistics of the CB-PM............................................. 187
5.3.6 Convergent validity of the CB-PM in relation to ability-based, cognitive-behavioural measures .................................................. 188
5.4 Discussion ................................................................................................. 190
5.4.1 The psychometric properties of the D-TEBBS and C-TEBBS .... 190
5.4.2 Validity of the CB-PM ................................................................. 192
5.4.3 Limitations of the second study ....................................................... 194
5.4.4 Summary of findings from the second study ................................. 194

Chapter 6: The predictive validity and sensitivity to change of the CB-PM in a depressed population ................................................................................................. 196
6.1 Introduction ............................................................................................... 196
6.1.1 Epidemiology of depression .......................................................... 196
6.1.2 Efficacy of cognitive-behaviour therapy for depression ............... 197
6.1.3 Predictors of treatment outcome for cognitive-behaviour therapy and other psychotherapies for depression .................................................. 198
6.1.3.1 Therapeutic alliance .............................................................. 198
6.1.3.2 Therapist competence .......................................................... 199
6.1.3.3 Experiencing ............................................................................ 200

6
6.1.3.4 Initial client characteristics .......................................................... 201
6.1.3.5 Homework compliance ..................................................................... 201

6.1.4 The clinical utility of the CB-PM in the cognitive-behavioural treatment of depression ................................................................. 202

6.1.4.1 Psychological mindedness as a predictor of outcome in CBT for depression .................................................................................. 202

6.1.4.2 The stability of psychological mindedness over the course of psychotherapy ............................................................................. 205

6.1.4.2.1 The stability of psychological mindedness over the course of psychodynamic therapy ................................................................. 206

6.1.4.2.2 Psychological mindedness and cognitive change mechanisms during the course of cognitive-behaviour therapy for depression ................................................................. 207

6.1.4.3 Psychological mindedness and the therapeutic alliance .......................... 210

6.1.5 Aims of the third study ......................................................................... 211

6.1.6 Hypotheses of the third study ............................................................... 211

6.2 Method .................................................................................................. 213

6.2.1 Participants ......................................................................................... 215

6.2.2 Inclusion criteria ................................................................................. 214

6.2.3 Exclusion criteria ............................................................................... 214

6.2.4 Withdrawal criteria ............................................................................ 214

6.2.5 Measures .......................................................................................... 215

6.2.6 Procedure .......................................................................................... 217

6.3 Results .................................................................................................. 219

6.3.1 Statistical procedure ......................................................................... 219
6.3.2 Pre-treatment characteristics of treatment groups .................................. 219
6.3.3 Descriptive statistics of the CB-PM .......................................................... 220
6.3.4 Reliability of the CB-PM ................................................................. 221
6.3.5 Effectiveness of cognitive-behaviour therapy for depression in the current study .......................................................... 223
6.3.6 Test of hypotheses .................................................................................. 225
6.3.7 Additional exploratory analyses .............................................................. 235
6.4 Discussion ......................................................................................... 237
6.4.1 The convergent validity of the CB-PM in a depressed population .......... 237
6.4.2 The predictive validity of the CB-PM .................................................... 239
6.4.3 Sensitivity to change of the CB-PM over the course of cognitive-
behaviour therapy ......................................................................................... 241
6.4.4 Limitations of the third study ............................................................... 244
6.4.5 Summary of the third study .................................................................. 247

Chapter 7: Conclusion .............................................................................. 249
7.1 Introduction ...................................................................................... 249
7.2 The psychometric properties of the CB-PM in a non-clinical sample ........ 249
7.3 Validating the CB-PM against cognitive-behavioural, ability-based measures 250
7.4 The predictive validity and sensitivity to change of the CB-PM ................. 251
7.5 Strengths of the research ....................................................................... 251
7.6 Limitations of the research .................................................................... 253
7.7 Clinical utility of the CB-PM .................................................................. 254
7.8 Future research .................................................................................... 255
7.9 Conclusion ....................................................................................... 256
Appendices ........................................................................................................... 282

Appendix A: Cognitive-behavioural measure of psychological mindedness .... 282
Appendix B: Study 1 information sheet ............................................................... 287
Appendix C: Study 1 and 2 consent form ............................................................ 288
Appendix D: Discriminating between thoughts, emotions, behaviours, and bodily sensations scale ............................................................................... 289
Appendix E: Identifying connections between thoughts, emotions, behaviours, and bodily sensations scale .............................................................. 290
Appendix F: Study 2 information sheet ............................................................... 296
Appendix G: Study 3 information sheet ............................................................... 297
Appendix H: Study 3 consent form .................................................................. 300
Appendix I: Study 3 demographics items .......................................................... 301
Abstract

Empirical research examining the construct of psychological mindedness has typically been conducted from a psychodynamic perspective. According to Conte and Ratto (1997), clinicians often view psychological mindedness as a pre-requisite for successful engagement in psychodynamic therapy, although there is limited empirical research to support this assumption. While the construct of psychological mindedness has received attention in the psychodynamic literature, it has received very little interest from a cognitive-behavioural perspective. Examination of various definitions of psychological mindedness (Appelbaum, 1973; Baekeland & Lundwall, 1975) suggests the construct may be clinically useful and applicable to the processes and outcomes of cognitive-behaviour therapy.

The current work provided a new cognitive-behavioural conceptualisation of the construct, defining psychological mindedness as 'the ability to identify one's thoughts, emotions, and behaviours, and see connections between them'. As such, this new definition was adopted for the purposes of developing and validating a new Cognitive-Behavioural measure of Psychological Mindedness (CB-PM). This dissertation examined the psychometric properties of the CB-PM by conducting three empirical investigations to assess the clinical utility of the measure.

The first study explored the factor structure, reliability, and validity of the CB-PM, comparing the instrument with established self-report measures, in 100 undergraduate students. A factor analysis of the CB-PM revealed a two-factor structure, labelled 'ability to identify thoughts, emotions, and behaviours', and 'ability
to see connections between thoughts, emotions, and behaviours. The CB-PM demonstrated high internal, test-retest, and inter-rater reliability. Demonstrating some evidence for its convergent validity, the CB-PM significantly correlated with the theoretically related construct of alexithymia (measured by the Toronto Alexithymia Scale-20; Bagby, Taylor, & Parker, 1994), and with a self-report measure of psychological mindedness derived from a psychodynamic framework (the Psychological Mindedness Scale; Conte & Ratto, 1997), although the CB-PM did not correlate significantly with self-reflection or insight (measured by the Self-Reflection and Insight Scale; Grant, Franklin, & Langford, 2002). In summary, results from the first study provided support for the reliability and validity of the CB-PM.

The second study aimed to address two limitations of the first study, namely, the use of (1) self-report and (2) atheoretical or psychodynamic measures, to establish the convergent validity of the CB-PM. To overcome these two limitations, the second study tested the validity of the CB-PM in 108 undergraduate students, using three ability-based cognitive-behavioural measures that were theoretically expected to be associated with psychological mindedness. These measures were (1) The Thought Record Skills Assessment (TRSA; Neimeyer & Feixas, 1990), designed to measure an individual’s competence in completing a thought record consistent with Beck’s cognitive-behavioural theory of psychopathology, (2) the D-TEBBS, a measure of the ability to discriminate between thoughts, emotions, behaviours, and bodily sensations, and (3) the C-TEBBS, a measure of the ability to see connections between thoughts, emotions, behaviours, and bodily sensations. The latter two measures were developed by the current author to validate the CB-PM. Results indicated that the CB-PM
correlated positively with each of the three ability-based, cognitive-behavioural measures.

The third study extended the first and second studies by providing further validation for the CB-PM in a depressed population, before and after cognitive-behaviour therapy (and in a depressed waiting-list control group), while also exploring important hypotheses about the role of psychological mindedness in therapeutic practice. The main findings of the third study were that higher levels of psychological mindedness (measured by the CB-PM) before cognitive-behavioural treatment predicted lower post-treatment depression severity. In addition, the therapy group demonstrated increased psychological mindedness scores from pre- to post-treatment, suggesting that cognitive-behaviour therapy improves psychological mindedness, with the CB-PM being sensitive to such change.

Results of the three empirical investigations were integrated and their strengths and limitations outlined. The potential clinical utility of the CB-PM as a tool in therapeutic practice was described and areas for future research were discussed. It was concluded that the findings of the three investigations provide support for the applicability of the CB-PM to the processes, outcomes, and practice of cognitive-behaviour therapy.