



Breakdown of Residual Stress in Highly Restrained Thick Section Steel Welds

Susan Pearce

School of Mechanical Engineering

The University of Adelaide

South Australia 5005

May 2009

Supervisors:

Prof. Valerie Linton

Mr Ian Brown

Abstract

Residual stress is the stress that remains stored within a structure as a result of its manufacturing history. Often called a locked in stress, it remains when there is no applied load, influences the applied load and changes the structure's expected response to stress. An example of this is that a tensile residual stress will add to an applied tensile load, increasing the maximum tensile stress. Conversely when a compressive load is applied, a tensile residual stress reduces the maximum compressive stress. Residual stress develops in a part during all stages of manufacturing through the action of plastic deformation and thermal inhomogeneities. The final residual stress within a structure can be a combination of the residual stresses created through these stages.

Processes that produce significant residual stress in steels include quenching and tempering, rolling, bending and welding. Due to the highly localised thermal input at the weld point, welding produces the largest short range variation in residual stress field. In the immediate region of a weld, the residual stress is dominated by the residual stress from the welding processes: tensile stress in the weld region, becoming compressive further from the weld. Prior residual stress fields can influence the expansion and contraction and thus the final welded residual stress profile.

Because residual stress acts on a scale that interacts with applied stresses, it becomes important to know what residual stress is present within a component in order to know the final load acting on the structure. In many situations it is not possible to determine the residual stress within a component directly and an approximation, or best practice, residual stress profile must be used. This can be simple, for example considering the residual stress produced by bending, but the residual stress profile produced in welding is a great deal more complex, depending on weld thickness, geometry, restraint, heat input and is difficult to accurately predict. It is important to have a highly accurate prediction of the residual stress when carrying out processes such as an Engineering Critical Assessment (ECA) since this will determine the integrity of a welded joint in its environment.

An ECA uses a combination of the applied stress and the residual stress profiles in order to determine the likelihood of growth of a flaw at a particular point in the structure. The residual stress profiles used to make these assessments are conservative and in the case of steel T-butt welds are based on a very narrow range of heat inputs and welding processes. The typical residual stress profile is assumed to be highly tensile which means that an ECA on any flaws in the weld region will indicate potential failure of the welded joint and repair is necessary.

One of the factors that may affect the conservatism of these residual stress profiles is the lack of consideration of the overall interaction of the residual stress fields prior to welding. This work experimentally measures the residual stress fields in thick steel plate before and after welding, in

both restrained and unrestrained plate, and uses this to consider whether the residual stresses are a result of welding or pre-welding processes and examines how these influence the final residual stress field. The work allows a new consideration of what residual stress fields around highly restrained, thick section welds are: creating a basis for pre-existing residual stress fields to be considered in conjunction with the welding residual stress in ECAs.

Acknowledgments

I would like to thank the Cooperative Research Centre for Welded Structures (CRC-WS), ASC Pty Ltd, the Australian Institute of Nuclear Science and Engineering (award number AIN-STU1804) and the Access to Major Research Facilities Program (grant numbers 06/07-N-16 and 07/08-N-13) for financial assistance with this project.

From ANSTO I would like to thank Richard Blevins for his invaluable assistance with neutron strain scanning and general advice. In addition thanks to David Carr, Maurice Ripley and Phil Bendich for their support while at ANSTO, and to Phil in particular for the X-ray strain scanning when in Adelaide.

Thanks to ASC for providing samples and to Fletch, Dave, Chris and Peter for their assistance with setup, measurement, data collection and welding. I extend particular appreciation to my ASC supervisor Glen Sloan for his help throughout this work.

I would like to also extend my gratitude to the people I worked with at ENGIN-X: Ed Oliver and Ania Paradowska, thank you for your assistance and your time in setup and data collection, and thanks to Lyndon Edwards who was able to cut my strain free samples on very short notice. Thank you to my supervisors Valerie Linton and Ian Brown for their support and assistance. Particular thanks to Valerie who has been invaluable throughout and without whom I would never have finished. To Aisha Mahmood whose project overlapped with mine and who helped me out considerably I extend my gratitude.

Finally thanks to my family, friends and to Billy who have supported me throughout the enterprise, told me to keep going when I thought of giving up and especially for keeping me supplied with Red Bull from the local corner shoppe.

Declaration

This work contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text.

I consent to this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University Library, being available for loan and photocopying.

SIGNED: DATE:

Contents

Abstract	ii
Acknowledgments	iv
Declaration	v
List of Tables	xiv
List of Figures	xix
Abbreviations and Symbols	xx
1 Introduction	1
1.1 Objectives	2
1.2 Methodology	2
1.3 Findings	3
2 Literature Review	5
2.1 What are residual stresses?	5
2.2 How do residual stresses form?	6
2.2.1 Mechanically induced residual stress	8
2.2.2 Thermally induced residual stress	9
2.2.2.1 Quenching and tempering residual stress	10
2.2.2.2 Welding residual stress	11
2.2.3 Summary	15
2.3 Effects of residual stress	15
2.3.1 Failure mechanisms	16
2.3.2 Effects of residual stress in welds	17
2.3.2.1 Hydrogen Assisted Cold Cracking	18
2.4 Review of Welding Residual Stress	18

2.4.1	Thickness	19
2.4.2	Plate geometry: flat plate vs bent plate	20
2.4.3	Plate butt welds	21
2.4.3.1	Summary	28
2.4.4	T-butt welds	30
2.4.4.1	Surface stresses	32
2.4.4.2	Through thickness stresses	34
2.5	Influencing the residual stress state after manufacture	39
2.5.1	Overstressing	39
2.5.2	Peening	40
2.5.3	Heat treatment	41
2.5.4	Summary	41
2.6	Evaluating residual stress in service and for structural stability	42
2.6.1	Flat plate butt welds	42
2.6.1.1	Through thickness Standard residual stress profiles	42
2.6.1.2	Surface Standard residual stress profiles	45
2.6.2	T-butt and fillet welds	47
2.6.2.1	Surface residual stress profiles	47
2.6.2.2	Through thickness residual stress profiles	49
2.6.3	Assessing welds using Standard profiles	50
2.7	Summary	51
2.8	Discussion of welding residual stresses	51
2.9	Gap	52
3	Residual Stress Measurement	55
3.1	Destructive techniques	55
3.1.1	Hole drilling	56
3.1.2	Sectioning and contour methods	56
3.2	Non-destructive techniques	57
3.2.1	X-ray surface strain scanning	61
3.2.2	Neutron strain scanning	62
3.2.2.1	The Australian Strain Scanner	62
3.2.2.2	ENGIN-X	63
3.2.2.3	Comparison	64
3.3	Summary	65

4	Experimental Method	67
4.1	Introduction	67
4.2	Materials	70
4.3	Unwelded test sections	70
4.4	Flat test section	71
4.5	Curved test section	72
4.5.1	Dimensional inspection	72
4.5.1.1	Initial surface height measurements	73
4.5.2	Neutron strain scanning	74
4.5.3	Analytical bending residual stress prediction	75
4.6	Flat butt test weld	77
4.6.1	Sample details	78
4.6.2	Hole drilling	81
4.6.3	Dimensional inspection	82
4.6.4	Strain gauging	83
4.6.5	Neutron strain scanning	86
4.6.6	Dimensional inspection of test plates with varying heat inputs	89
4.7	Full scale butt weld	91
4.7.1	Dimensional inspection	91
4.7.2	X-ray strain scanning	93
4.8	Flat T-butt weld	93
4.8.1	Sample details	94
4.8.2	X-ray strain scanning	94
4.8.3	Dimensional inspection	95
4.8.4	Neutron strain scanning	96
4.9	Full scale T-butt weld	96
4.9.1	Sample details	97
4.9.2	Strain gauging	99
4.9.3	Dimensional inspection	101
4.9.4	X-ray strain scanning	104
4.9.5	Neutron strain scanning	104
4.9.6	Summary	107
5	Results	109
5.1	Flat test piece	110

5.2	Bent test piece	111
5.2.1	Surface height measurements	111
5.2.1.1	Pre-sectioning height measurements	111
5.2.1.2	Post-cutting surface heights	113
5.2.2	Calculated residual stress	115
5.2.3	Neutron strain scanning	116
5.3	Flat butt test weld	118
5.3.1	Pre-welding residual stress measurement	118
5.3.2	Surface distortion mapping	118
5.3.3	High temperature strain gauges	122
5.3.4	Neutron strain scanning	124
5.3.4.1	Side A scan, first side welded	125
5.3.4.2	Side B scans, second side welded	129
5.3.4.3	Through thickness scans, from first to second side welded	135
5.3.5	Dimensional inspection of test plates with varying heat inputs	140
5.4	Full scale butt weld	145
5.4.1	Pre-removal X-ray strain scanning	145
5.4.2	Dimensional inspection	146
5.5	Flat T-butt weld	150
5.5.1	Dimensional inspection	150
5.5.2	X-ray strain scanning	153
5.5.3	Neutron strain scanning	155
5.6	Full scale T-butt weld	160
5.6.1	Post cutting X-ray strain scanning	160
5.6.2	Dimensional inspection	162
5.6.3	Strain gauging	167
5.6.4	Neutron strain scanning	171
6	Discussion	175
6.1	Flat plate	175
6.1.1	Neutron strain scanning	176
6.2	Curved plate	176
6.2.1	Surface height	178
6.2.2	Neutron strain scanning	178
6.3	Flat butt test weld	180

6.3.1	Hole drilling	180
6.3.2	Strain gauge during welding	182
6.3.3	Surface distortion	184
6.3.4	Neutron strain scanning	185
6.3.5	Dimensional inspection of test plates with varying heat inputs	190
6.4	Full scale butt weld	192
6.4.1	X-rays	192
6.4.2	Dimensional inspection	193
6.5	Flat T-butt weld	194
6.5.1	Dimensional inspection	194
6.5.2	X-rays	194
6.5.3	Neutron strain scanning	195
6.6	Full scale T-butt weld	202
6.6.1	X-rays	202
6.6.2	Dimensional inspection	202
6.6.3	Strain gauging	203
6.6.4	Neutron strain scanning	204
6.7	Summary of stresses	211
6.7.1	Quenching and tempering residual stress	211
6.7.2	Curved residual stress	212
6.7.3	Welding residual stress	213
6.8	General Discussion	217
6.8.1	Discussion of experimental techniques	217
6.8.1.1	Surface profile measurement	217
6.8.1.2	Strain gauging	217
6.8.1.3	Hole drilling	219
6.8.1.4	X-ray strain scanning	219
6.8.1.5	Neutron strain scanning	219
6.8.2	Overview discussion of the test samples	220
6.8.3	Restraint and sample size	222
6.9	Comparison with Standard residual stress profiles for ECA	223
7	Conclusions	229
7.1	Experimental techniques	229
7.2	Sample size, preparation and selection	230

7.3	Residual stresses in thick steel welds of different geometries	231
7.4	Comparison of stresses with standards and implications for ECA's	232
8	Further Work	235
9	Publications arising from this work	237
	References	238

List of Tables

2.1	Plate butt welds in ferritic steels	22
2.2	T-butt and T-fillet welds	31
2.3	Residual stress profile parameters	42
4.1	Experimental Summary	69
4.2	BIS 812 Ema material composition	70
4.3	BIS 812 Ema mechanical properties	70
4.4	E12018-M2 filler composition	79
4.5	E12018-M2 mechanical properties	79
4.6	MIL-120S-1 consumable composition	94
4.7	MIL-120S-1 consumable mechanical properties	94
5.1	Hole drilling results from top of test panel	118
5.2	Hole drilling results from bottom of test panel	118
5.3	Longitudinal pseudo-strain along the centre of the weld	131
5.4	Full section double V butt weld X-ray results	145
5.5	X-ray residual stresses, pre-welding flat T-butt weld	153
5.6	X-ray residual stresses, post cutting curved full scale T-butt weld	160
5.7	Gauges on the test section on the unwelded side	167
5.8	Gauges external to the neutron test section on the can on the line of the test weld	167
5.9	Gauges on the welded side, along the top of the web	167
6.1	Flat test piece	176
6.2	Bent test piece	176
6.3	Flat butt test weld	180
6.4	Full scale butt weld	192
6.5	Flat T-butt weld	194
6.6	Yield strengths, heat inputs and thickness of T-joint data	199

6.7	Full scale T-butt weld	202
6.8	Yield strengths, heat inputs and thickness of T-joint data	207

List of Figures

2.1	Residual stress produced through overload	7
2.2	Residual stress in bending	8
2.3	Restrained bar with residual stress	10
2.4	Longitudinal through thickness quenched and tempered residual stress profile . .	11
2.5	Contour map of temperature during welding	12
2.6	Changes in temperature and stress during welding	13
2.7	Residual stresses in welded joints	14
2.8	Effect of residual stress on the final stress under uniform compressive load	16
2.9	Transverse and longitudinal through thickness residual stress as measured by Leg- gatt [1991]	23
2.10	Transverse, longitudinal and normal through thickness residual stress as measured by Stout [1985]	24
2.11	Transverse and longitudinal surface, mid and quarter depth residual stresses as reviewed by Ruud and Dimascio [1981]	25
2.12	Transverse through thickness residual stress modelled by Ueda et al. [1978] for a 200mm and 300mm thick butt weld	26
2.13	Through thickness longitudinal and transverse residual stresses at the toe of a plate butt weld as reported by Smith et al. [2000]	27
2.14	Transverse surface residual stresses modelled by Cho et al. [2004]	27
2.15	Transverse scans from James et al. [2006] at 9mm and 2mm depths	28
2.16	Through thickness scans beneath the weld toe and through the centre of the weld as reported by James et al. [2006]	29
2.17	Transverse surface residual stress using different weld pass orders	32
2.18	Surface residual stresses modelled by Teng et al. [2001]	33
2.19	Through thickness residual stresses as measured by Wimpory et al. [2003a]	36
2.20	Through thickness residual stress measured by Kingston et al. [2006]	37
2.21	Through thickness residual stresses measured by Holden et al. [1988]	38

2.22	Through thickness residual stresses measured by Lee et al. [2006a]	38
2.23	Overstressing and the effect on residual stress	40
2.24	Plate butt weld geometry	43
2.25	Standard flat plate residual stress profiles	44
2.26	Longitudinal surface residual stress	45
2.27	Transverse surface residual stress	46
2.28	T-butt weld geometry as used in BS7910 [1999], R6 [2001], SINTAP [1999]	47
2.29	Transverse and longitudinal surface residual stresses on T-butt and fillet welds	48
2.30	Transverse and longitudinal through thickness residual stress, T-butt and fillet welds	49
3.1	Diffraction of neutrons	58
3.2	Strain measurement directions	60
3.3	Strain scanning	61
3.4	As measured Bragg diffraction peaks, number of counts vs 2θ	63
3.5	Time of Flight diffraction pattern	65
4.1	Flow diagram of residual stress development	68
4.2	Unwelded sample removal	71
4.3	Unwelded test section scan schematic	72
4.4	Surface heights on full rolled section	74
4.5	Surface heights on small rolled section	75
4.6	Shell theory	76
4.7	Flat butt weld test panel	78
4.8	Butt weld	79
4.9	Watercutting schematic	80
4.10	Watercutting of flat butt weld test section	80
4.11	Hole drilling schematic	81
4.12	Distortion measurement grid	83
4.13	High temperature strain gauges	84
4.14	Layout of strain gauges for section monitoring	85
4.15	Strain gauge axis	86
4.16	Flat butt weld neutron strain scans	87
4.17	Flat butt weld strain free layout	88
4.18	Varying heat input surface height	89
4.19	Surface height measurements, curved double V butt weld, transverse	92

4.20	Full sized butt weld X-ray strain scanning	93
4.21	T-butt flat test plate pre welding x-ray points	95
4.22	Flat T-butt weld pre-welding dimensional inspection	96
4.23	Flat test T-butt weld neutron scans	97
4.24	T-butt full size specimen piece	98
4.25	T-butt strain gauge layout	99
4.26	Strain gauges on removed T-butt	100
4.27	T-butt strain gauge layout-flange	100
4.28	Surface height measurements, curved T-butt weld	102
4.29	Surface height measurements, curved T-butt weld	103
4.30	Curved T-butt surface X-ray scans	104
4.31	Four scans in the centre of the sample	105
4.32	Test piece in ENGIN-X in longitudinal configuration	107
4.33	T-butt weld macro	108
5.1	Residual stress flow diagram	109
5.2	Unwelded flat plate neutron scan	110
5.3	Surface heights on rolled sample	112
5.4	Height changes after test piece removal	114
5.5	Through thickness bending stress and residual stress profiles	115
5.6	Unwelded curve plate neutron scan	116
5.7	Surface profiles of panel after welding	120
5.8	Surface profiles of panel after removing strong backs	121
5.9	Microstrain changes during welding of the flat butt weld panel-transverse	122
5.10	Microstrain change during welding of the flat butt weld panel- longitudinal, 12mm	123
5.11	Microstrain change during welding of the flat butt weld panel - longitudinal, 18mm	124
5.12	Welding data variation	124
5.13	Neutron scan sample, removed from the flat butt weld panel, side A	125
5.14	Neutron scan sample, removed from the flat butt weld panel, side B	126
5.15	Microstrain in flat butt weld, side A	127
5.16	Stress in flat butt weld, side A	127
5.17	Unstressed pseudo-strains for the flat butt weld, side A	128
5.18	Plot of longitudinal pseudo-strain in the centre of the weld	131
5.19	Microstrain in flat butt weld, side B	132
5.20	Stress in flat butt weld, side B	133

5.21 Flat butt weld side B pseudo-strains	134
5.22 Flat butt weld balanced residual stress profile 10mm below second welded side . .	135
5.23 Microstrain in flat butt weld, through thickness	137
5.24 Stress in flat butt weld, through thickness	138
5.25 Pseudo strain through thickness	139
5.26 Deflection measurement coordinate system	141
5.27 Transverse line plots of height variation for welds of various heat inputs	142
5.28 Longitudinal line plots of height variation for welds of various heat inputs	143
5.29 Contour plot of surface height variation on double V butt plates with various heat inputs	144
5.30 Full scale butt weld surface stresses	145
5.31 Transverse height before and after removal, full scale butt weld	147
5.32 Longitudinal height before and after removal, full scale butt weld	148
5.33 2D contour map of the change in heights before and after removal of the full scale butt weld test section	149
5.34 2D contour plot of the flat plate height variation before welding	151
5.35 Longitudinal height variations on flat plate	152
5.36 X-ray strain scanning results before welding	154
5.37 Flat T-butt weld, neutron scan 1	156
5.38 Flat T-butt weld, neutron scan 2	157
5.39 Flat T-butt weld, neutron scans 3,5	159
5.40 X-ray strain scanning results opposite full scale T-butt weld	161
5.41 Transverse height variation T-butt weld	164
5.42 Longitudinal height variation T-butt weld	165
5.43 2D height variation	166
5.44 Strain gauge measurements of the stress change during full scale T-butt weld removal	169
5.45 Stress change opposite T-butt weld during full scale T-butt removal	170
5.46 Full scale T-butt weld, neutron strain scan 1	171
5.47 Full scale T-butt weld, neutron strain scan 2	173
5.48 Full scale T-butt weld, neutron strain scans 3 and 4	174
6.1 Through thickness neutron stress results and expected Q&T profile	177
6.2 Neutron and calculated through thickness residual stresses in a bent plate	179
6.3 Butt weld hole drilling vectors	181
6.4 Flat butt weld surface stress change during grinding	183

6.5	Normalised longitudinal through thickness residual stress distribution in a double V butt weld	187
6.6	Normalised transverse through thickness residual stress distribution in a double V butt weld	188
6.7	Normalised normal through thickness residual stress distribution in a double V butt weld	189
6.8	2D Contour plots of surface height change of flat plate butt welds with varying heat inputs	191
6.9	Surface X-ray residual stress, full scale double V butt weld	193
6.10	Scan 1 and scan 2, flat T-butt weld	196
6.11	Flat T-butt weld through thickness scans 3, 4 and 5	198
6.12	Normalised transverse through thickness residual stress beneath flat T-butt weld	200
6.13	Normalised longitudinal through thickness residual stress beneath flat T-butt weld	200
6.14	Normalised normal through thickness residual stress beneath flat T-butt weld . .	201
6.15	Comparison of transverse scans 1 and 2 beneath the full scale T-butt weld	205
6.16	Full scale T-butt weld through thickness residual stress scans 3 and 4	206
6.17	Normalised transverse through thickness residual stress beneath full scale T-butt weld	208
6.18	Normalised longitudinal through thickness residual stress beneath full scale T-butt weld	209
6.19	Normalised normal through thickness residual stress beneath full scale T-butt weld	210
6.20	Comparison of through thickness residual stress distribution beneath the flat and curved T-butt welds	214
6.21	Comparison of residual stress distribution beneath the flat and curved T-butt welds, scan 1	215
6.22	Comparison of residual stress distribution beneath the flat and curved T-butt welds, scan 2	216
6.23	Normalised residual stress profiles	218
6.24	Flow chart of residual stress and test pieces	221
6.25	Through thickness residual stress profiles for double V butt welds	224
6.26	Through thickness residual stress profiles for T-butt welds	226
6.27	Surface Standard residual stress profile for thick section T-butt welds	228

Abbreviations and Symbols

ANSTO - Australian Nuclear Science and Technology Organisation

AINSE - Australian Institute of Nuclear Science and Engineering

FEA - Finite Element Analysis

HSLA - High Strength Low Alloy

ECA - Engineering Critical Assessment

MMA - Manual Metal Arc

SMAW - Shielded Metal Arc Welding

SAW - Submerged Arc Welding

TASS - The Australian Strain Scanner

TOF - Time of Flight

RS - Residual Stress

$\mu strain$ - microstrain ($\mu m/\mu m$)

σ - stress (MPa)

$\sigma_{y,w}$ - Yield strength of weld metal

$\sigma_{y,p}$ - Yield strength of parent metal

E - modulus of elasticity (GPa)

ε_i - strain in i direction (mm/mm)

r_a - outer measuring grid radius (mm), hole drilling

r_i - inner measuring gauge radius (mm), hole drilling

ν - Poisson's ratio

ε_{ps} = pseudo-strain

d - lattice spacing

d_{av} - average lattice spacing of an unstressed sample

θ_{av} - average Bragg diffraction angle of an unstressed sample

a - lattice parameter