

SUBMITTED VERSION

O'Brien, Roderick 2009, 'The uncertain future of China's law graduates, University of Adelaide. Centre for Asian Studies.

Copyright the author

PERMISSIONS

This working paper series presents papers in their preliminary forms. The sole objective is to stimulate discussion and get comments from colleagues. Furthermore, the views expressed are entirely the author's own and not that of the CAS.

<http://digital.library.adelaide.edu.au/dspace/handle/2440/62209>

The uncertain future for China's law graduates.

Roderick O'Brien

This working paper series presents papers in their preliminary forms. The sole objective is to stimulate discussion and get comments from colleagues. Furthermore, the views expressed are entirely the author's own and not that of the CAS. For more information, please contact ming.ting@adelaide.edu.au

Life Impact The University of Adelaide



**"The Uncertain Future for China's Law Graduates".
Seminar
Centre for Asian Studies: University of Adelaide
Friday 3 July 2009**

1 Introduction:

The purpose of this seminar is twofold: First, to provide an overview of legal education system in the People's Republic of China. Second, to look at the uncertain situation of graduates from this system today, and to consider some of the consequences of that uncertainty.

An appendix provides a list of English-language references on legal education in China.

2. The Structure of Education in China:

Education in China is conducted at three levels. The lowest level, primary education, is from grades 1 to 6. The next level, middle education, is divided. Lower middle schooling covers grades 7 to 9, and higher middle schooling covers grades 10 to 12. Higher middle schools may be academic, or they may be vocational. Basic tertiary education is offered in universities and colleges or institutes, and consists of sub-degree courses, usually of two or three years duration, (*da zhuan* 大专), and degree courses of four years duration (*ben ke* 本科). Some universities also offer advanced degrees of master, with three additional years duration (*shuoshi* 硕士) and doctor degrees after a further three years (*boshi* 博士). Formal education may continue with post-doctoral programmes (*boshihou* 博士后). Instruction in law is offered at all of these levels.¹

The educational programmes do not directly prepare students for professional qualification. Each profession has its own gateway examinations, with its own standards. In the legal professions, the most important examination is the Unified Justice Examination (*sifa kaoshi* 司法考试), which is now the gateway for entrance to the professions of judge, procurator, notary and lawyer. A variety of short courses, some provided by universities, are available to assist students preparing for this examination..

After qualification, further training is often available, and encouraged in an effort to raise standards. In addition, for some professions there may be a

¹ Huang Jin: "The Structure of Legal Education in China" paper presented at the Conference of International Legal Educators, 24-27 May 2000, Florence, Italy.
www.aals.org/2000international/english/chinaintro.htm. (visited 8 May 2005)

promotion system by examination. There is a system of promotion by grades for judges, procurators and notaries, all of whom are regarded as public servants.

3. The Development of Modern Legal Education in China:

In 1862 the Qing government opened a school in Beijing largely for the study of foreign languages. From 1867 a single law subject, international public law, was taught to meet the needs of the Qing diplomats.² This was the first modern teaching of law. Then, as part of the late-Qing reforms, the teaching of law began a slow expansion. From 1895, law subjects were first taught in the Zhongxi (later Peiyang) University in Tianjin. However, a law department was not developed at that university until 1905. The first state-run law school, called the “Legal-Political School”, was founded by the Qing dynasty in 1907.³

Legal education in the Qing period had little chance to become established before the dynasty itself collapsed in the revolution of 1911. The new Republican Government established a legal profession in 1912, and law schools, public and private, were established to meet the new needs. In 1915-16 there were 49 law colleges in various parts of China, twenty-four of them being government controlled.⁴ In 1918 the law department at Zhongxi (Peiyang) was closed so that its staff might join in the law school of the National University in Beijing.⁵

The main purpose of these institutes was to produce graduates who could serve in government as judicial and revenue officials, and to some extent they became the path to a career as an official, replacing the old imperial examinations.⁶ Because of this, politics and law schools frequently offered accounting as well as law training. Law courses were offered especially in universities with foreign connections, who produced law graduates who could deal with foreign trade. These were Aurora University and the Comparative Law School of Soochow

² Wang Jian: “Legal Education in Modern China” *China Law*, 1998, vol 2, pp98-100.

³ Wang Weiguo: “A Brief Introduction to the Legal Education in China” paper presented at the Conference of International Legal Educators, 24-27 May 2000, Florence, Italy. www.aals.org/2000international/english/chinaintro.htm (visited 8 May 2005)

⁴ William Blume: “Legal Education in China” *China Law Review*, vol1 no 7, 1923, page 305-312.

⁵ William Blume: “Legal Education in China” *China Law Review*, vol1 no 7, 1923, page 305-312.

⁶ Alison Conner: “Training China’s Early Modern Lawyers: Soochow University Law School” *Journal of Chinese Law* (Spring 1984) vol 8 page 1

University (actually located in Shanghai).⁷ Legal education continued, with fluctuations, during the Republican period. Even during the Japanese occupation of parts of China, some law teaching continued in occupied areas, while other universities moved to the west of China, for example to Chongqing or to Yunnan.

In the 1950s, after the dissolution of the old legal system, many law schools were merged and reorganized. The new system of education was strongly influenced by the Soviet model of specialised institutes, though some comprehensive universities remained. By 1956 over 2,000 students were enrolled in legal education. After the anti-Rightist campaigns of 1957, legal education was badly damaged, and few students were enrolled. In the early 1960s, there was some recovery, and in 1965 there were still nine establishments offering legal training. During the Cultural Revolution, only two law departments survived, and then only in truncated form.⁸ The re-establishment of legal education followed the re-establishment of the legal system in 1979.

4. Contemporary Legal Education in China:

From 1979 until today, there has been a continuous, if uneven, commitment to re-establishing a legal system in the People's Republic of China. This has resulted in the re-opening of law courses, and the opening of new programmes. More recently, the law has become a popular discipline for study, and there has been an explosion in law teaching.⁹ By the end of 2005, the number of law schools offering a bachelor degree (本科) had grown to 559.¹⁰ This rapid expansion has produced a variety of problems discussed below.

In practice, legal education has usually been linked with political training – a combination which also applied in many institutions in the Republic of China prior to the establishment in 1949 of the People's Republic of China. So, many of the institutions for legal training have been named for “political science and law”. It is sign of the changing times, that one institute was recently named for “law and political science”.

⁷ Alison Conner: “The Comparative Law School of China” in C Stephen Hsu: *Understanding China's Legal System: Essays in Honor of Jerome A Cohen*, 2003, New York University Press, New York.

⁸ Wang Weiguo: “A Brief Introduction to the Legal Education in China” paper presented at the Conference of International Legal Educators, 24-27 May 2000, Florence, Italy. www.aals.org/2000international/english/chinaintro.htm (visited 8 May 2005)

⁹ Sections 3 and 4 draw on prior research conducted in 1999-2000, and published as “Legal Training in the People's Republic of China at the Turn of the Century” *The Law Teacher*, 2000, no 34 pp 204-212. The earlier research was updated for a presentation at the Macau Ricci Institute in 2005 (see www.riccimac.org/doc/MRIF16_O'Brien.pdf); and again updated for this study.

¹⁰ 朱景文 《中国法律发展报告 1979-2004：数据库和指标体系》北京；中国人民大学出版社；2007。 520页。

4.1. Politics and Law Schools, and Justice Schools

These are at the lowest level of legal training. These schools are equivalent to senior middle schools, specialising in training personnel for political and legal work. They teach from years 10-12 (sometimes from 10-11). To enter, the students must be graduates of junior middle school.¹¹ Those who have already graduated from senior middle school may take the courses in a shorter time, usually two years. After graduation, the students will be likely to be employed in clerical and lower-level work in the Ministry of Justice, and other posts requiring politico-legal knowledge. This may include finance or accounting training.

These schools are in the process of being phased out: usually they are being upgraded to offer post-secondary professional courses,¹² or merged with higher institutes, such as the post-secondary schools mentioned in the next paragraph.

4.2. Professional Politics and Law Schools, and Politics and Law Management Cadre Training Institutes

Students who have graduated from a regular senior middle school (year twelve) will be able to go on to further study, depending on their scores. Those with the highest scores will seek to enter university (and some universities are preferred to others!). But those graduates whose scores are lower, and who cannot enter university to study for a degree, may enter a professional politics and law school, or a Politics and Law Management Cadre Training Institute for a sub-degree course. The courses are usually for 2 years, but may be for 3 years.

4.3 Politics and Law Institutes and Politics and Law Universities

These are full tertiary level institutions, with the capacity to offer the degrees of Bachelor, Master, and sometimes Doctor. But, unlike a comprehensive university, they offer courses only within the field of law and political science, or in related fields such as languages.

In this context, the use of the word “institute” does not necessarily denote a lower status: it has been used to mean that the institution does not provide a

¹¹ Wang Weiguo: “A Brief Introduction to the Legal Education in China” paper presented at the Conference of International Legal Educators, 24-27 May 2000, Florence, Italy. www.aals.org/2000international/english/chinaintro.htm (visited 8 May 2005)]

¹² See, for example, the Guangzhou Judicature Vocational School 广州司法职业学校 which offers post-upper secondary courses, but still at the secondary level. <http://58.63.109.38/viewnews.asp?id=564> (visited 21 June 2009) See also the Shanxi Yuncheng Politics and Law School 山西运城政法学校 which offers three-year post secondary courses. www.yczfxx.com (visited 21 June 2009).

comprehensive range of courses. However, in terms of academic status, some institutes may rank higher than some universities.

4.4 Law Departments or Law Faculties within comprehensive or other Universities

(a) Comprehensive universities usually offer a wide range of disciplines, and have the capacity to offer degrees of Bachelor, usually Master, and sometimes Doctor. Such a university may include a law department, or a law faculty or college, as one of the disciplines.

(b) With the popularity of legal studies, other universities besides comprehensive universities have opened law departments or courses. For example, a specialised university such as a teachers' university or an institute for study by members of national minorities may establish a law department. Sometimes this department will be established by expanding the former politics department.

(c) A growing number of universities now have a Faculty of Law, which includes more than one department. The departments will usually offer specialised areas of teaching. Sometimes law may be combined with another subject, such as management, in a Faculty.

In recent years, there have been a number of mergers of China's universities and other educational institutions. During the educational reforms of the 1950s, the model adopted from the USSR was largely of specialized institutes. These institutes were aligned within the various levels of appropriate ministries. Thus politics and law institutes came under the Ministry of Justice, while medical and nursing institutes came under the Ministry of Health. Under that system, there were few comprehensive universities. The educational reforms of the 1990s involved two main changes: first, educational institutions are generally being transferred from other ministries to the Education Department.¹³ Second, specialized institutes are being merged into existing universities, or merged to create new comprehensive universities. Because of these mergers, the above distinctions may not be so clear in practice. For example, a comprehensive university which has absorbed a vocational or professional school may continue to offer sub-degree courses. The implementation of the educational reforms of the 1990s is uneven, and a number of institutes remain under the control of particular ministries. Even now, while most university law courses come under the control of the Ministry of Education, the Ministry of Justice retains control

¹³ Huang Futao: "Qualitative Enhancement and Quantitative Growth: Changes and Trends of China's Higher Education" *Chinese Cross Currents*, (2009) vol 6 no 2 p.41

of the *Juris Master* 法律硕士 degree.¹⁴ This programme is discussed below in section 11.5.

4.5 Self-Study Programmes

An alternative path to a bachelor degree is provided by self-study programmes, administered by the Department of Education. Using text books provided for the programmes, students can complete a degree outside an educational institute.¹⁵ Although the programmes are designed for self-study, some training classes are offered by the adult education section of regular universities, or by other organizations.

5. Law Study Programmes

5.1 Fields of Study

Candidates for the Bachelor degree usually study for four years, in a full-time programme. There is only one degree in law, but in practice it may be offered in a number of specialised fields. The availability of different fields depends on the institution offering the degree. For example, a Politics and Law Institute could offer Bachelor's degrees in Criminal Law, in Civil Law, in International Law, and so on. A university or institute in another field might offer particular degrees: for example, an Economics and Trade University might offer a Bachelor degree in Economic Law.

Candidates for the Master and Doctor degrees will usually take courses during their three years of study. In addition to course work, the candidates must complete a short dissertation (for Master students) or a major dissertation (for Doctor students).

Law is a first degree in the PRC: a candidate does not have to graduate in another discipline before being admitted to a law degree. Since most students enter university direct from senior middle school, the age range of law students is from 18 to 22, with some variation, especially in courses accessible through adult education programmes.

However, a number of universities now offer a Professional Master of Law degree, of 2 to 3 years duration, for candidates who have already a bachelor degree in another discipline. This is a fully taught degree, not a research degree.

¹⁴ Erie, Matthew: "Legal Education Reform in China Through U.S.-Inspired Transplants", *Journal of Legal Education*, (2009) vol 59 no 1, pages 60-96.

¹⁵ Wang Weiguo: "A Brief Introduction to the Legal Education in China" paper presented at the Conference of International Legal Educators, 24-27 May 2000, Florence, Italy. www.aals.org/2000international/english/chinaintro.htm (visited 8 May 2005)

This is reflected in the Chinese title for the degree 法律硕士 (*falu shuoshi*), rather than the regular 法学硕士 (*faxue shuoshi*). This programme commenced in 1996 in eight universities, and has spread since then. As of 2007, 79 institutions were approved to offer the *Juris Master* degree.¹⁶ To some extent the Professional Master of Law degree is modelled on the *Juris Doctor* degree available at universities in the United States of America, and the name is sometimes translated as *Juris Master*.¹⁷ Naturally this degree attracts older candidates. One writer, reviewing the experience of the past decade, has suggested a number of changes to the teaching for this degree, including strengthening case study, and giving the students some real experience of the issues in society. The changes are intended to train better lawyers.¹⁸

These criticisms of the *Juris Master* reflect in a particular case an overall criticism of China's legal education, that it is too theoretical.¹⁹ Some foreign observers with experience in China have described Chinese legal education as "formalism".²⁰

5.2. Clinical Legal Education

Clinical legal education provides an opportunity for students to practice their legal skills while still in a university setting. Clinics are set up by universities to offer student legal services to real clients. Usually, these clients are in some way needy, or they would avail themselves of regular legal services. Universities in China have offered legal advice or legal aid services for some years - the earliest was the Northwest Institute of Politics and Law in 1984. However, formal clinical legal education is new to China, having begun around 2000.²¹ Some are based in the university's legal aid service. Some of the programmes may have started through support by the Ford Foundation,²² and are influenced

¹⁶ 周成奎（主编）：《中国法律年鉴2008年》北京，中国法律年鉴社，2008，第926-927页

¹⁷ 王健（编者）《法律硕士教育指南》西北政法学院研究生部，西安，2005 at page 110.

¹⁸ 乔玉君：“法律硕士：造就优秀律师的摇篮”《中国律师》2005, no 6, pp87-89 at 89.

¹⁹ Deorah Meiners and Jian Chen: "Professionalization in the Chinese Legal System: Current Education and Certification of Chinese Lawyers", *The Bar Examiner*, May 2007, pp 29-40 at p 32

²⁰ Patricia McCubbin *et al.*: "China's Future Lawyers: Some difference in Education and Outlook" *Asper Review* 2007, vol 7, pp 293-303

²¹ Mao Ling: "Clinical Legal Education and the Reform of Higher Legal Education System in China" (2007) 30 *Fordham International Law Journal* 421

²² anon: "Developing Experiential Legal Education in China" *Pacific Law*, Spring 2008, p.10 www.mcgeorge.edu/Documents/publications/paclaw/PacLawSpring08.pdf (visited 20 June 2009)

directly by US models,²³ but at least one is the result of local initiative.²⁴ These CLE programmes include introduction to legal ethics. Under the general heading “Nurturing lawyers, promoting the forming of a legal professional community: the educational objectives of the ‘Northwest Pattern’”, the director of the clinical legal education programme at the Northwest Institute of Politics and Law, Professor Wang Shirong discussed four objectives of the programme:

- fostering a mode of thinking as lawyers
- fostering a co-operative spirit
- training in lawyers’ skills
- promoting development of mature legal professional ethics.

“Because clinical students face practical cases, and face real parties, as a result even the simplest discussion relating to professional responsibility, professional standards and even professional ambitions and the guidance derived from it is their own activity. From the start the Northwest Institute of Politics and Law clinical education is not just talk, but among its objectives is that clinical education not only has value in serving the masses, but also in having the students discuss legal professional ethics and learn how to offer worthwhile services in the best possible way.

“When discussion in the clinic concerns professional responsibility, students practice questions of professional ethics, they implement personally what they say about professional ethics, and this has a decisive function in forming students’ professional awareness, understanding of and adherence to professional standards, and training in professional responsibility.”²⁵

Nevertheless, clinical legal education is very difficult to deliver effectively, and requires considerable staff commitment. In practice, ethics may not get much time in a clinical programme, which accounts for only a small fraction of a student’s course time.²⁶

5.3 Foreign Examinations

²³ see, for example www.ibj.org/2008/03/25/robert-e-precht-to-launch-ibjs-criminal-clinical-legal-education-project-in-china/ (visited 1 July 2009)

²⁴ 李春来：“法律诊所在中国”《法服人》(2002) no 4 p.20-21

²⁵ 汪世荣：“中国的诊所式法律教育—‘西北模式’及其经验”
<http://www.nwcliniclaw.cn/news/news/31/200544100531.htm> (visited 27 June 2005)

²⁶ Pamela Phan: “Clinical Legal Education in China: In Pursuit of a Culture of Law and a Mission of Social Justice”, *Yale Human Rights and Development Law Journal*, (2005), vol 8, 117

Some students are preparing for foreign examinations in law. An example would be students preparing for a LLM degree of Temple University which is offered in Beijing.

6 The Expansion of Legal Education

From a very small base after the Cultural Revolution, legal education has expanded dramatically. By the end of 2005, there were 559 law faculties, departments, or institutes offering at least a bachelor's degree. There were 449,295 students enrolled for bachelor (本科) or sub-bachelor (专科) degrees.²⁷ This rapid expansion has led to oversupply of graduates. By 2007, this number had fallen a little to 425,324,²⁸ but it still remains high, even for a populous country.

Already by 2006, a comparatively prosperous year in China, law graduates had significant problems in finding employment, especially in law or law related fields. According to a study by the All-China Youth Federation and Peking University, graduates with bachelor degrees in law had one of the lowest post-graduation employment rates of any field of study.²⁹ This situation continues to the present time (2009), when all graduates are finding it difficult to get employment, but especially law graduates.³⁰

The problem is not only one of the sheer quantity of graduates³¹, but also of the quality of their instruction.³² Three main responses have been suggested:

(a) Zhu Congshi, the President of Xiamen University, has suggested that the undergraduate degree in law should be abolished, and follow the model of the United States of America, where law is a graduate degree. Critics of this position argue that the degree providers will simply offer as many places in graduate degrees, without improving the quality.

²⁷ 朱景文 《中国法律发展报告 1979-2004：数据库和指标体系》北京；人民大学出版社；2007。 523页

²⁸ See www.moe.gov.cn/edoas/website18/52/info33552. (visited 20 June 2009)

²⁹ Liu Li: "Should law educational system change" *China Daily*, 10 October 2006. www.chinadaily.com.cn/2006-10/10/content_704455.htm (visited 21 June 2009)

³⁰ "Law School Graduates Experience the Hardest Time in the Labor Market" *China Education News* issue 6; 9 June 2009, citing *Beijing Evening News* 9 March 2009.

³¹ Huang Futao: "Qualitative Enhancement and Quantitative Growth: Changes and Trends of China's Higher Education" *Chinese Cross Currents*, (2009) vol 6 no 2 p.41

³² Pamela Phan: "Clinical Legal Education in China: In Pursuit of a Culture of Law and a Mission of Social Justice", *Yale Human Rights and Development Law Journal*, (2005), vol 8, 117

(b) Gao Gongze, former chairman of the All China Lawyers Association argues that the Ministry of Education is at fault for failing to supervise the quality of education in law schools. They require little equipment or library resources, have high staff-student ratios, and the rapid expansion means that many teachers are not qualified for the task.³³

(c) Zhu Suli, the President of the Law Department at Beijing University argues that the market will take care of the variations in quality, and that jobs are available – but that they are in the less developed west and other poorer areas of China. The graduates simply do not want to go, and prefer to stay in the coastal developed provinces.³⁴ But in fact, the central and western parts of China are facing a more severe unemployment situation than wealthy coastal areas.³⁵ Professor Zhu may be able to identify jobs in western areas, but this does not mean that the cash-strapped local governments will be able to pay salaries for legal appointments, and certainly not premium salaries to attract graduates to the west, where they may lose their coastal or mid-China *hukou* 户口 (residence permit).

These issues of quantity and quality mean that there is a very large pool of applicants for the available legal positions, at least in prosperous areas. Candidates are likely to manoeuvre to secure any available advantage in the fierce competition. Some of these are legal, such as joining the Communist Party to enhance the candidate's competitive edge, and connections.³⁶ But in a society where the exploitation of *guanxi* connections³⁷ and unethical practices such as bribery are commonplace, it is certain that candidates for jobs and candidates for the Unified Justice Examination will try to enhance their competitive edge by unethical practices.³⁸ Sometimes the two are combined, as

³³ Liu Li: "Should law educational system change" *China Daily*, 10 October 2006. www.chinadaily.com.cn/2006-10/10/content_704455.htm (visited 21 June 2009)

³⁴ Liu Li: "Should law educational system change" *China Daily*, 10 October 2006. www.chinadaily.com.cn/2006-10/10/content_704455.htm (visited 21 June 2009)

³⁵ Tan Yingzi: "Public Concern over Jobs, Pay Gap", *China Daily*, 16 December 2008, www.chinadaily.com.cn/china/2008-12/16/content_7307133.htm (visited 21 June 2009)

³⁶ anon: "Where will all the students go?" *the Economist* (8 April 2009) www.economist.com/world/asia/displaystory.cfm?story_id=13446878 (visited 22 June 2009)

³⁷ Huang Xianbi: "Where to Network: Job Acquisition in China's Emerging Labour Market" TASA Conference 2006, University of Western Australia & Murdoch University, 4-7 December 2006; *TASA 2006 Conference Proceedings*; at page 5

³⁸ Liu Li: "Exam 'cheats' sue ministry", *China Daily* (10 May 2005) www.chinadaily.com.cn/english/doc.2005-05/10/cpmtent_440622.htm (visited 22 June 2009).

in a case where an official of the Ministry of Justice was persuaded by a *guanxi* connection to leak examination papers for the Unified Justice Examination, and the leaked information found its way on to the market through further connections.³⁹

7. Conclusion

The problem of over-supply of graduates is common enough in China, but it is especially evident in the humanities, including law, where the explosion in student numbers has been greatest. At least one commentator has suggested that “In a few years time the problem of graduate employment could be even more acute.”⁴⁰

The consequences will be very great, and two of them may be suggested in this conclusion:

(a) There is a tradition in China of student political activism, and the Chinese Communist Party will be wary of any activism based on the disappointment of students who have toiled for years – and at great expense – only to find that they are unable to make a career in the law.

(b) But there is another possibility: that the oversupply of graduates will make China’s lawyers even more cautious about undertaking cases which might upset the central or local governments. Already the government is using a variety of methods, such as the denial of annual registration, to control lawyers who take difficult human rights cases.⁴¹ The availability of a vast number of graduates seeking to enter the professions could make lawyers, judges, notaries, and procurators very cautious about taking any action which would endanger their livelihood.

³⁹ Xinhua: “Senior Justice Official gets five-year jail term for national judicial exam leak”; *Peoples Daily Online*, (24 February 2009) <http://english.people.com.cn/9001/90776/90785/6600137.html> (visited 22 June 2009)

⁴⁰ Gerard Postiglione and Xie Ailei: “Catering for the Market: China’s Graduate Employment Problem” *Chinese Cross Currents*, (2009) vol 6 no 2 p.81

⁴¹ Reuters: “Human Rights Lawyers in Limbo as Annual Registration Denied” *South China Morning Post*, 1 June 2009 p A8.

Appendix

Legal Education in China: English Language Materials

date: **6 July 2009**

compiler: Roderick O'Brien

This list is intended to be a complement to the list of Chinese-language materials compiled by Professor Wang Jian: 王健 : 《法律教育文献索引》
China Law Society (2007). www.chinalawsociety.org.cn/research/shownews.asp?id=282
(visited 19 June 2009)

anon:

“Developing Experiential Legal Education in China” *Pacific Law*, Spring 2008, p.10
www.mcgeorge.edu/Documents/publications/paclaw/PacLawSpring08.pdf (visited 20 June 2009)

Abramson, Kara:

“Paradigms in the Cultivation of China’s Future Legal Elite: A Case Study of Legal Education in Western China”,
(2006) 7 *Asian-Pacific Law and Policy Journal*, 302

Blume, William:

“Legal Education in China” (1923) *China Law Review*, vol 1 no 7, pages 305-312.

Calarco, Paul:

“Continuing Legal Education in China”
www.paulcalarco.com/China_article.pdf (visited 23 June 2009)

Chen, Albert H Y:

“Legal Education”
in *An Introduction to the Legal System of the People’s Republic of China*, 3rd edition, 2004,
Butterworths/Lexis-Nexis, Hong Kong; at pages 193-197

Cheng Yang, Vincent:

“Judicial and Legal Training in China – Current Status of Professional Development and Topics of Human Rights”
at www.icclr.law.ubc.ca/Publications/Reports/Beijing_August_2002.pdf

Conner, Alison:

“Training China’s Early Modern Lawyers: Soochow University Law School”
(Spring 1984) 8 *Journal of Chinese Law* page1

Conner, Alison:

“The Comparative Law School of China”
in C Stephen Hsu: *Understanding China’s Legal System: Essays in Honor of Jerome A Cohen*, 2003,
New York University Press, New York. pages 210-273

Edwards, Randle:

“An Overview of Chinese Law and Legal Education”

The Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science, 1984, no 476, pages 48-61

Erie, Matthew

“Legal Education Reform in China Through U.S.-Inspired Transplants”

Journal of Legal Education, (2009) vol 59 no 1, pages 60-96

Fairbrother, Gregory:

“Demonstrating legality: Legal Education for Chinese youth, 1979-2006”

(2007) Paper presented at the International Conference on Contemporary China Studies, Hong Kong

Gao, Lingyun:

“What makes a Lawyer in China? Chinese Legal Education System After China’s Entry into the WTO”

Williamette Journal of International Law and Dispute Resolution,
2002, vol 10, p.197

Hom, Sharon:

Beyond “Stuffing the Goose”: The Challenge of Modernization and Reform for Law and Legal Education in the People’s Republic of China”

in Irving Epstein (ed): *Chinese Education: Problems, Policies, and Prospects*, Garland Press, New York, 1991. page 287

Hou Xinyi:

“Modern Legal Education in China”

www.okcu.edu/law/academics/international/pdfs/ModernLegalEducationinChina.pdf (visited 23 June 2009)

Huang Jin: “The Structure of Legal Education in China” paper presented at the Conference of International Legal Educators, 24-27 May 2000, Florence, Italy.

www.aals.org/2000international/english/chinaintro.htm. (visited 8 May 2005)

Ji Weidong:

“Legal Education in China: A Great Leap Forward of Professionalism”

www.law.kobe-u.ac.jp/lawrev/2005ji.pdf (visited 23 June 2009)

Kong Qingjiang:

“Advancing US Experiential Legal Education Method in the Context of Internationalization of Chinese Legal Education”

[http://www.mcgeorge.edu/Documents/centers/global/usaid/jan%2009%20conferencepapers/Kong%20\(english\).pdf](http://www.mcgeorge.edu/Documents/centers/global/usaid/jan%2009%20conferencepapers/Kong%20(english).pdf) (visited 29 June 2009)

Liu Li:

“Should law educational system change?” *China Daily*, 10 October 2006.

www.chinadaily.com.cn/2006-10/10/content_704455.htm (visited 21 June 2009)

Mao Ling:

“Clinical Legal Education and the Reform of Higher Education System in China”

Fordham International Law Journal, 2007, 30, p421

Meiners, Deborah and Chen Jian:

“Professionalization in the Chinese Legal System: Current Education and Certification of Chinese Lawyers”

The Bar Examiner

May 2007, pages 29-40

www.ncbex.org/uploads/user_docrepos/BEMayChineseLawyers.pdf (visited 7 July 2009)

McCubbin, Patricia (*et al*):

“China’s Future Lawyers: Some Differences in Education and Outlook”

Asper Review (2007) vol 7, pp.293-303

McDonald; R St J

“Legal Education in China Today”

Dalhousie Law Journal, vol 6 no 2, pages 313-327 (November 1980)

Mo, JS and Li W:

“Legal Education in the People’s Republic of China”

(2002) *Journal of the History of International Law*,

vol 4, no 1, pages 176-203

Murphy, John:

“Legal Education in China: Some Impressions”

China Law Reporter II, (1982) pages 50-53

O’Brien, Roderick:

“Legal Training in the People’s Republic of China at the Turn of the Century”

The Law Teacher, 2000, no 34 pp 204-212

O’Brien, Roderick:

“Changes in Legal Education in China” (20 July 2005) *MRI Forum 16* (Macau Ricci Institute)

http://www.riccimac.org/doc/MRIF16_OBrien.pdf

Phan, Pamela:

“Clinical Legal Education in China: In Pursuit of a Culture of Law and a Mission of Social Justice”

(2005) 8 *Yale Human Rights and Development Law Journal* pp117

Wald, Eli:

“Notes from Tsinghua: Law and Legal Ethics in Contemporary China”

(2007-2008) 23 *Connecticut Journal of International Law* pp369-415

Wang Chenguang:

“The Rapid but Unbalanced Growth of China’s Legal Education Programs”, (2006) Spring (vol.)

Harvard. China Review 1

Wang Jian:

“Legal Education in Modern China”

China Law, 1998, vol 2, pp98-100

Wang Weiguo: “A Brief Introduction to the Legal Education in China” paper presented at the

Conference of International Legal Educators, 24-27 May 2000, Florence, Italy.

www.aals.org/2000international/english/chinaintro.htm (visited 8 May 2005)

Wang Zhenmin:

“Problems and Reforms of Legal Education in China”

Paper presented at the annual meeting of The Law and Society Association, TBA, Berlin, 25 July

2007

Xie Hongfei:
“An Interview with Xie Huaishi”
(Fall 2005) *China Law Review*, vol 1 no 1, pages 51-66.

Xinhua:
“China’s legal education to target judicial officials: top legislator”
http://english.peopledaily.com.cn/200604/30/eng20060430_262232.html (visited 23 June 2009)

Yu Xi:
“China-EU School of Law: A School of Great promise”
China Law, no 77, issue 2, 2009, pp.74-77
<http://home.totoo.org?action-blogdetail-uid-20118-id-121> (visited 23 June 2009)

Zeng Xianyi:
“Legal Education in China”
(2002) 43 *Southern Texas Law Review*, 707, 711-12

Zheng Zhen:
“Present Situation and Prosperous Future of China Clinical Legal Education”
China Law, April 2006; pages 104-106

