

**A Critical History of Change in
Agricultural Extension and
Considerations for Future
Policies and Programs**

Katherine Fay Boon

A thesis submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy
School of Agriculture, Food and Wine
The University of Adelaide

June 2009

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract	x
Author's Statement	xi
Acknowledgements	xii
Acronyms	xiii
1 Introduction	1
2 Development of Adult Education Theory and Concepts	5
2.1 Foundation of Adult Education Theory	7
2.1.1 American Pragmatism: learning, interacting, problem solving	9
2.1.2 Humanism: self-direction and personal growth	10
2.1.3 Marxist Adult Education: social transformation	11
2.2 Early Learning Models	14
2.2.1 Action Research	14
2.2.2 Action Learning	15
2.2.3 Comparing Action Research and Action Learning	17
2.3 Adult Education Movement	19
2.3.1 Increased Participatory Approaches	21
2.3.2 Rise of Andragogy	22
2.3.3 Adult Learning Principles	24
2.3.4 Experiential Learning: transforming experience	25
2.3.5 Theory-in-Action	27
2.4 Current Influences, Theories and Concepts	28
2.4.1 Foley's Learning in Struggle Framework	31
2.4.2 Transformative Theories	32
2.4.3 Finger and Asún's Theory of 'Learning Our Way Out'	33
2.5 Conclusion	36

3	Early Developments in Agricultural Extension	38
3.1	The Beginning of Extension in Australia	39
3.2	Defining Agricultural Extension	42
3.3	Transfer of Technology	45
3.4	A Change in Focus	46
	3.4.1 Diffusion of Innovations	47
3.5	Closing the Equity Gap	49
	3.5.1 People-Centred Agricultural Development	53
	3.5.2 Linkage Model	54
	3.5.3 Rapid Rural Appraisal	55
	3.5.4 Farming Systems Research	57
	3.5.5 Training and Visit System	58
	3.5.6 Agroecosystem Analysis	60
3.6	Conclusion	61
4	Broadening the Outlook	63
4.1	National Goals and Farming Income	63
	4.1.1 An Australian Perspective	64
4.2	Adoption	68
4.3	Inclusion of the Social Sciences	71
4.4	Increased Participation	74
	4.4.1 Government and Participation Types	77
	4.4.2 Revisiting the Training and Visit System	81
	4.4.3 Farmer-First-and-Last	83
	4.4.4 Participatory Rural Appraisal	84
4.5	A Systems Perspective	85
	4.5.1 Developments in Farming Systems Research	87
	4.5.2 Knowledge, Information, Learning and Knowing Systems	90
4.6	Developing an Appreciation for the Natural Environment	92
	4.6.1 Sustainable Agriculture	94
	4.6.2 National Landcare Program	96
4.7	Current Theories and Models in Australian Agricultural Extension	104
4.8	Conclusion	107

5	NAVIGATOR[®]: a learning process for change	109
5.1	Program Rationale: the operating environment	111
5.1.1	Competition Policies	112
5.1.2	Whole-of-Government Concept	113
5.1.3	Changes to Government-Community Relationships	114
5.1.4	Approach to Agriculture Extension	115
5.2	NAVIGATOR [®] : clarifying the purpose	118
5.3	The Research Framework	121
5.4	Developing the NAVIGATOR [®] Process	124
5.4.1	Exploration Workshop	130
5.4.2	Project Development	133
5.4.3	Project Implementation	134
5.4.4	Project Review	135
5.4.5	Refining the Process	135
5.5	Industry Engagement and Group Formation	136
5.6	Industry Facilitator Training	138
5.7	Monitoring and Evaluation: a qualitative approach	140
5.7.1	Data Collection Methods	143
5.7.2	Data Analysis	146
5.8	Reporting and Promotion	148
5.9	Commercialisation of NAVIGATOR [®]	148
5.10	Summary	149
6	Assessing NAVIGATOR[®]	150
6.1	Comments on the Data Collection	150
6.2	The Participants and Their Projects	152
6.2.1	The Participants	154
6.2.2	Participants' Projects	155
6.3	Skill and Capability Development	162
6.3.1	Strategic Planning	162
6.3.2	Developing Networks	163
6.3.3	Developing Confidence	164
6.3.4	Learning	167
6.4	The Facilitators and their Facilitation	170

6.4.1	Difficulty of 'Empowerment'	171
6.4.2	Energy in Facilitation	173
6.4.3	Facilitator Comparison	173
6.5	Commercialisation	174
6.6	Meeting the Program Objectives	176
6.6.1	Achieving 'Cultural Change'	177
6.6.2	Developing Leadership	180
6.6.3	Responding to Market Change	181
6.7	Conclusion	182
7	Popular Language	185
7.1	The First Appearance	186
7.2	Prominent Areas of Use	190
7.3	Integration into Agriculture	195
7.3.1	International interpretation	196
7.3.2	The Australian Context	198
7.4	Deciphering the Language	202
7.4.1	Emerging Language	202
7.4.2	Influences on Language Over Time	206
7.5	Conclusion	209
8	The Facets of Social Capital	211
8.1	Early Contributors to Social Capital Theory	211
8.1.1	Pierre Bourdieu	212
8.1.2	James Coleman	213
8.1.3	Robert Putnum	215
8.2	Government and Social Capital	217
8.3	Negative Effects of Social Capital	219
8.4	The Social Capital Debate	220
8.4.1	Perspectives of Social Capital	221
8.4.2	Reaching Agreement on Social Capital	223
8.5	Measuring Social Capital	225
8.6	Conclusion	226

9	Reviewing Sustainability	229
9.1	Development of the Sustainability Concept	229
9.2	Forms of Sustainability	233
9.3	Sustainability in a Global Context	236
9.4	Sustainability in Australia	238
	9.4.1 Environmental Degradation	239
	9.4.2 Government Policies and Initiatives	241
9.5	Sustainability and Farming	246
	9.5.1 Technologies	248
	9.5.2 Adoption	249
9.6	Sustainable Solutions	251
	9.6.1 Society, Attitudes and Behaviour	254
	9.6.2 Food Supply and Population	255
	9.6.3 Government Policies and Roles	256
	9.6.4 Economic Considerations	260
	9.6.5 Environmental Conservation	261
	9.6.6 Sustainable Agriculture	262
9.7	Conclusion	264
10	Influences of Change and Solutions for the Future	267
10.1	Influences of Change	268
	10.1.1 Adult Education and Agriculture Extension	268
	10.1.2 Globalisation of Markets	270
	10.1.3 Environmental Concerns	273
	10.1.4 Social Considerations	275
10.2	Solutions for the Future	276
	10.2.1 Moving Beyond Economics	276
	10.2.2 Clarity in the Language	278
	10.2.3 Policies that Suit	279
	10.2.4 Organisational Change	280
	10.2.5 Allowing Time for Change	283
	10.2.6 Theory and Program Development	283
	10.2.7 Monitoring and Evaluation	286
10.3	Conclusion and Recommendations	287

Appendices	290
A Comparison of Theoretical Schools of Action Learning	290
B Comparison of Pedagogy and Andragogy	293
C Early Developments in Australian Agriculture and Significant Global Events – 1788 to 1970s	295
D Historical Developments in Australian Agriculture and Significant Global Events – 1980s to the present	319
E NAVIGATOR [®] Brochure	333
F NAVIGATOR [®] Promotional Material and Reports	335
G Popular Language Incorporation into Agriculture	339
H Measuring Social Capital	352
Bibliography	360

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 2.1	Dewey's Model of the Learning Cycle	8
Figure 2.2	Lewin's Action-Research Model	15
Figure 2.3	Modern Action Research Model	18
Figure 2.4	Double-loop Learning	28
Figure 2.5	Reflection-in-Action	28
Figure 2.6	Finger and Asún's Model of 'Learning Our Way Out'	35
Figure 3.1	Transfer of Technology Model	45
Figure 3.2	Diffusion of Innovations Path	47
Figure 3.3	Phases in the Diffusion Process	48
Figure 3.4	Organisational Structure of the Training and Visit System	60
Figure 4.1	Interactive Model of Extension	75
Figure 4.2	Arnstein's Eight Ranges on a Ladder of Citizen Participation	77
Figure 4.3	Bawden's Agricultural System, Environmental Suprasystem and Knowing Subsystem	86
Figure 4.4	Campbell's Institutional Framework for Landcare	99
Figure 4.5	van Beek and Coutt's Four Paradigms of Extension	104
Figure 5.1	Winegrape Production by State	110
Figure 5.2	Gross Wine Production by State	110
Figure 5.3	Development and Implementation of NAVIGATOR [®]	124
Figure 5.4	NAVIGATOR [®] Process	128
Figure 5.5	Planning Cycle and NAVIGATOR [®]	128
Figure 5.6	Exploration Workshop Structure	130
Figure 5.7	Categorisation of Data – an example	147
Figure 5.8	NAVIGATOR [®] Trademark	148
Figure 6.1	Group Locations within the South Australian Wine Regions	150
Figure 7.1	Frequency of Occurrence for Capacity Building by Subject Category	191
Figure 7.2	Frequency of Occurrence for Cultural Change by Subject Category	192
Figure 7.3	Frequency of Occurrence for Empowerment by Subject Category	192
Figure 7.4	Frequency of Occurrence for Participation by Subject Category	193

Figure 7.5	Frequency of Occurrence for Self Reliance by Subject Category	193
Figure 7.6	Frequency of Occurrence for Social Capital by Subject Category	194
Figure 7.7	Frequency of Occurrence for Sustainability by Subject Category	194
Figure 9.1	Sustainable Development – integration of social, ecological and economic systems	234

LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1	The Prime Idea of Action Learning	17
Table 2.2	Summary of Selected Historical Developments in Adult Education	36
Table 3.1	Summary of Selected Historical Developments in Agricultural Extension, 1880s – 1970s	62
Table 4.1	Considerations for Adoption	70
Table 4.2	Pretty’s Typologies of Participation	78
Table 4.3	Contrasts in Learning and Location – Comparisons between TOT and FFL	83
Table 4.4	Black’s Current Models, Methods and Media in Extension	105
Table 4.5	Summary of Selected Historical Developments in Agricultural Extension, 1880s – present	108
Table 5.1	Research Elements	123
Table 5.2	NAVIGATOR [®] Manual Content	129
Table 6.1	Group Details	153
Table 6.2	Participants’ Projects	156
Table 6.3	Facilitator Representation	170
Table 7.1	Search Terms	185
Table 7.2	Summary of Terms’ First Appearance	187
Table 7.3	Terms’ Predominant Areas of Use Since First Appearance	191
Table 7.4	Number of Journals within Each Subject Category from the Elsevier Journal List	196
Table 7.5	Summary of Terms First Occurrence, Article Content and Country of Origin for each Subject Category and Agriculture	203
Table 7.6	Term First Appearance for Agriculture Internationally and in Australia	205
Table 7.7	Prominent Areas of Influence in Agriculture Internationally and in Australia	207
Table 8.1	Comparison of Social Capital Theories	227
Table 9.1	Policies that Work for Sustainable Agriculture	258

ABSTRACT

The thesis explores the history of changes in agriculture policy and extension so as to inform the more effective delivery of future activity in these areas. Social and sustainability concepts are given particular attention due to their growing popularity in current agriculture initiatives. The questions framing the thesis address: what influences have shaped agriculture policy and how do these affect the development of extension models? and what is required to develop effective agriculture extension policies and programs that specify social and sustainability outcomes?

The thesis achieves the above by observing a history of ideas relating to adult education in general and more specifically agricultural extension, including an account of the main movements in which they have been significant. A contemporary example of how policy directs program delivery to achieve social outcomes involving learning is provided through the NAVIGATOR[®] case study, developed and implemented in partnership with the South Australian wine industry. The case study leads to an investigation into the historical origins and application of selection of terms commonly used in agricultural extension to gain a greater understanding of the adoption of new language into this field of study. This is followed by a more in-depth examination of the social capital and sustainability concepts, touted as preferred outcomes for modern agricultural programs.

Key features identified by the study include the confusion surrounding the language used and the role of the political economy in directing agriculture initiatives. I conclude that, if the social outcomes implicit in many modern agricultural policies and programs related to the concept of sustainable development are to be achieved, more weight must be given to the tradition of social science that emphasizes inquisitive and collectivist understandings of the dynamics of change. In obtaining clarification on the language used and what is to be achieved, the tendency for programs to lead to government 'rhetoric' when scrutinised may be avoided.

AUTHOR'S STATEMENT

This work contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution to Katherine Boon and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text.

I give consent to this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University Library, being made available for loan and photocopying, subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.

I also give permission for the digital version of my thesis to be made available on the web, via the University's digital research repository, the Library catalogue, the Australasian Digital Thesis Program (ADTP) and also through web search engines, unless permission has been granted by the University to restrict access for a period of time.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I would like to extend a sincere thank you to my supervisors Associate Professor Neville Hicks and Dr Ian Nuberg. Both provided me with a great deal of guidance and demonstrated to me the value of observing past events to understand present day activities, while also continuing to encourage me to complete this thesis.

A special thank you needs to go to Dr Patricia Murray, who encouraged me to undertake this research, while working with me on NAVIGATOR[®] and continued to support me early on in my studies as my supervisor. She spent many hours with me, providing insight into the social sciences and its connections with agriculture and rural Australia. I would also like to thank Dr Jocelyn Davies who was also involved in supervising me in the early years of this research.

A number of other people also assisted me in shaping the NAVIGATOR[®] program. John Cornish provided me with the opportunity to develop and implement NAVIGATOR[®]. Without his vision and willingness to experiment with new approaches to educating primary producers, this research would not have occurred. My colleagues, Bob Peake and Bill Panagiotopoulos, and the winery and producer facilitators, contributed their extensive experience in working with producers and provided frank advice on the ideas in deciding what form NAVIGATOR[®] would take, and supported its delivery. All the participants of NAVIGATOR[®] brought with them a willingness to engage with the program and continued enthusiasm to work and share their experiences with their peers. All of those above provided many enjoyable experiences and learning opportunities through my interactions with them, and as a consequence were a source of motivation to complete this work.

Last, but not least, to my family and husband Gerard, who patiently supported me for many years to complete this work along with our best friend, Pablo.

ACRONYMS

AAA	Agriculture Advancing Australia
AKIS	Agricultural Knowledge and Information Systems
ARMCANZ	Agriculture and Resource Ministers Council of Australia and New Zealand
ATO	Australian Tax Office
BRS	Bureau of Rural Sciences
CoAG	Council of Australian Governments
CRLRA	Centre for Research and Learning in Regional Australia
CSIR	Commonwealth Scientific and Industrial Research
CSIRO	Commonwealth Scientific and Industrial and Research Organisation
CVCB	Cooperative Venture for Capacity Building for Innovation in Rural Industries
DAFF	Department of Agriculture, Fisheries and Forestry
EEC	European Economic Community
ESD	Ecologically Sustainable Development
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organisation of the United Nations
FFL	Farmer First and Last
FPR	Farmer Participatory Research
FSR	Farming Systems Research
FSR/D	Farming Systems Research and Development
FSR/E	Farming Systems Research and Extension
GATT	General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade
GST	Goods and Services Tax
HACCP	Hazard Analysis Critical Control Point
IRRI	International Rice Research Institute
ITK	Indigenous Technical Knowledge
LGU	Land-Grant University System
MDB	Murray Darling Basin
NFF	National Farmers Federation
NGO	Non-Government Organisations
NCP	National Competition Policy
NIRS	Near Infra Red Spectrometry
NSESD	National Strategy for Ecologically Sustainable Development
NHT	Natural Heritage Trust
NLP	National Landcare Programme
NRM	Natural Resource Management
NSESD	National Strategy for Ecologically Sustainable Development
NSW	New South Wales

NT	Northern Territory
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
OFR	On-Farm Research
PAR	Participatory Action Research
PIRSA	Primary Industries and Resources South Australia
PMP	Property Management Planning
PRA	Participatory Rural Appraisal
Qld	Queensland
RAS	Rural Adjustment Scheme
RDC	Research and Development Corporation
RDI	Regulated Deficit Irrigation
RGIC	Riverland Grape Industry Committee
RIRDC	Rural Industry and Research and Development Corporation
RPF	Resource Poor Farmers
RRA	Rapid Rural Appraisal
RSSA	Rural Solutions SA
SA	South Australia
SCRAM	Social/Human Capital Rapid Appraisal Model
Tas	Tasmania
T&V	Training and Visit Organisational System
TI	Technological Innovation
TOT	Transfer of Technology model
UNCED	United Nations Conference on Environment and Development
UN	United Nations
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation
VEW	Village Extension Worker
Vic	Victoria
WA	Western Australia
WWI	World War One
WWII	World War Two