An aural analysis of bel canto:

Traditions and interpretations

as preserved through selected sound recordings

Airlie Jane Kirkham

Thesis submitted in fulfillment of the requirements
for the degree of

Master of Music

Elder Conservatorium of Music
Faculty of Humanities and Social Sciences
The University of Adelaide
May 2010
# Contents

Contents..........................................................................................................................2
Abstract..............................................................................................................................i
Declaration.........................................................................................................................ii
Acknowledgements............................................................................................................iii
List of musical examples....................................................................................................iv

## 1 Chapter One – Introduction

1.1 Origins of bel canto .................................................................................................1
1.2 Methodology ............................................................................................................7

## 2 Chapter Two - Bel Canto

2.1 Historical uses of the term bel canto .......................................................................10
2.2 Major characteristics of bel canto opera ...............................................................14

## 3 Chapter Three

3.1 Norma: Case Study One .......................................................................................17
3.1.1. Introduction .....................................................................................................17
3.1.2. Scores .............................................................................................................18
3.1.3. Singers ...........................................................................................................19
3.2 CASTA DIVA Act One, scene four, Norma ..........................................................20
3.2.1. Opera Synopsis .............................................................................................20
3.2.2. 'Casta Diva', Norma's aria from Norma .......................................................21
3.3 CELESTINA BONINSEGNA (Recorded 1904) .........................................................25
3.3.1. Introduction ..................................................................................................25
3.3.2. Performance and dramatic events ...............................................................26
3.3.3. Realisation of Bellini's style .........................................................................26
3.3.4. Elements of bel canto ...................................................................................28
3.3.5. Comparison of performances ......................................................................32
3.4 ROSA PONSELLE (Performed 1928-29) ...............................................................34
3.4.1. Introduction ..................................................................................................34
3.4.2. Performance and dramatic events ...............................................................35
3.4.3. Realisation of Bellini's style .........................................................................36
3.4.4. Elements of bel canto ...................................................................................37
3.4.5. Comparison of performances ......................................................................42
3.5 MARIA CALLAS (1954 and 1960) ......................................................................44
3.5.1. Introduction ..................................................................................................44
3.5.2. Performance and dramatic events ...............................................................46
3.5.3. Realisation of Bellini's style .........................................................................48
3.5.4. Elements of bel canto ...................................................................................50
3.5.5. Comparison of performances ......................................................................55
3.6 DAME JOAN SUTHERLAND (Performed 1960, 1963 and 1978) .....................57
3.6.1. Introduction ..................................................................................................57
3.6.2. Performance and dramatic events ...............................................................59
3.6.3. Realisation of Bellini's style .........................................................................61
3.6.4. Elements of bel canto ...................................................................................64
3.6.5. Comparison of performances ......................................................................70
3.7 MONTSERRAT CABALLÉ (Performed 1973) .........................................................72
3.7.1. Introduction ..................................................................................................72
3.7.2. Performance and dramatic events ...............................................................73
3.7.3. Realisation of Bellini's style .........................................................................76
3.7.4. Elements of bel canto ...................................................................................77
3.7.5. Comparison of performances ......................................................................79
3.8 ELENA SOULIOTIS (Recorded 1965) ..................................................................81
3.8.1. Introduction ..................................................................................................81
3.8.2. Performance and dramatic events ...............................................................82
Abstract

An aural analysis of bel canto: traditions and interpretations as preserved through selected sound recordings.

The thesis addresses the lack of an aural appreciation of bel canto operatic traditions. Further it asserts that sound recordings are invaluable in examining aspects of improvisation and ornamentation of the melodic line that are characteristic of this tradition. A detailed aural analysis also provides valuable and unique insights into the bel canto techniques demonstrated by the performers as perceived aurally. The incentive to undertake this research from an aural perspective exclusively developed from the writer’s physical limitations. This differs from more traditional methods of research which would focus on contemporary critiques on the subject. The essence of the aural research undertaken has been to compare different recordings by different singers in various eras, and to establish the ways bel canto traditions have been preserved, maintained, nurtured and performed.

The project focuses on selected operas from the nineteenth century repertoire of Gaetano Donizetti and Vincenzo Bellini. Two arias are analysed as case studies, each one examining aspects of bel canto opera from the twentieth century to the present. The first case study focuses on the soprano aria ‘Casta Diva’ from Bellini’s *Norma*, while the second is the tenor aria ‘Una furtiva lagrima’ from *L’Elisir d’Amore* by Donizetti. Each case study is documented, and includes transcribed excerpts from the chosen aria to illustrate and interpret bel canto traditions through both preserved and re-mastered recordings. Comparisons are made between different singers, describing which aspects of performance display the characteristics and qualities of bel canto.

High quality sound recordings are indispensable in making an aural approach, particularly if there are no longer suitably skilled singers available to perform the works live, since it is through this medium of sound recordings, as well as live performances, that future generations can appreciate these operatic techniques. It is hoped that this thesis will contribute to a significant appreciation of the Italian bel canto tradition of the nineteenth century and the transmission of its various techniques.
Declaration

This thesis contains no material that has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution, to Airlie Jane Kirkham, and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text of the thesis.

I give consent to this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University library, being made available for photocopying and loan, subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.

I also give permission for the digital version of my thesis (exegesis only, and with the exclusion of the accompanying CD of musical recordings) to be made available on the web, via the University’s digital research repository, the library catalogue, the Australasian Digital Theses Program (ADTP) and also through web search engines, unless permission has been granted by the university to restrict access for a period of time.

SIGNED: ___________________________________________ DATE: ______________
Acknowledgements

It has been a significant challenge and turning point in my life to be able to complete this thesis. I want to thank sincerely my mother who has been my amanuensis, for type setting this document and playing me the recordings endless numbers of times, for without her untiring effort, enthusiasm and encouragement, it would have been impossible.

I would like also to convey my sincere thanks to the following people for their support, understanding and encouragement during the course of this work.

My principal supervisor, Associate Professor Dr Mark Carroll, for his attention to detail, useful suggestions and willingness to assist.

My co-supervisor, Professor Charles Bodman Rae, for his support for this project, for his challenging comments which spurred me on to further knowledge.

My post-graduate co-ordinator, Associate Professor Dr. Kimi Coaldrake, for her enthusiastic support in all aspects of my Master's research.

Dr Michelle Picard for her helpful comments, understanding and careful reading of my text.

Letho Kostoglou, who has been my amanuensis for the musical examples.

Debbie Holt, my primary caregiver, who has read me endless texts and other friends who have contributed in so many ways, their love, encouragement, patience and time.

Airlie Jane Kirkham © 2010
### List of musical examples

#### Chapter Three – Norma

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ex.</th>
<th>Bars</th>
<th>Vocal Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>32-34</td>
<td>‘Casta Diva’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>37-38</td>
<td>‘Casta Diva’</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Boninsegna

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ex.</th>
<th>Bars</th>
<th>Vocal Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>29-30</td>
<td>‘Casta Diva’ Stanza one</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>54-55</td>
<td>‘Casta Diva’ - Stanza two Boninsegna’s version</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>26-30</td>
<td>‘Casta Diva’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>26-30</td>
<td>‘Casta Diva’. Boninsegna’s breathing marks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>‘Casta Diva’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.8</td>
<td>56-59</td>
<td>‘Casta Diva’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.9</td>
<td>56-59</td>
<td>‘Casta Diva’ Cadenza - Boninsegna’s version</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Ponselle

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ex.</th>
<th>Bars</th>
<th>Vocal Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.10</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>‘Casta Diva’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.11</td>
<td>24-25</td>
<td>‘Casta Diva’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.12</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>‘Casta Diva’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.13</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>‘Casta Diva’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.14</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>‘Casta Diva’ Ponselle’s version</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.15</td>
<td>32-34</td>
<td>‘Casta Diva’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.16</td>
<td>37-38</td>
<td>‘Casta Diva’ showing Ponselle’s breathing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.17</td>
<td>38 and 55</td>
<td>‘Casta Diva’ showing Ponselle's transfer over the omitted section</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.18</td>
<td>56-59</td>
<td>‘Casta Diva’ Vocal Score</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.19</td>
<td>56-59</td>
<td>‘Casta Diva’ Cadenza Ponselle’s version</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Callas

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ex.</th>
<th>Bars</th>
<th>Vocal Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.20</td>
<td>28-30</td>
<td>‘Casta Diva’ Callas' 1954 version</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.21</td>
<td>32-34</td>
<td>‘Casta Diva’ Callas' 1954 version</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.22</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>‘Casta Diva’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.23</td>
<td>26-30</td>
<td>‘Casta Diva’ Callas' version 1954</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.24</td>
<td>16-17</td>
<td>‘Casta Diva’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.25</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>‘Casta Diva’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.26</td>
<td>28-30</td>
<td>‘Casta Diva’ Callas' 1954 recording – breathing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.27</td>
<td>28-30</td>
<td>‘Casta Diva’ 1960 version, showing breathing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.28</td>
<td>32-34</td>
<td>‘Casta Diva’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.29</td>
<td>37-38</td>
<td>‘Casta Diva’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.30</td>
<td>56-59</td>
<td>‘Casta Diva’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.31</td>
<td>56-59</td>
<td>‘Casta Diva’ Callas’ cadenza, 1954 version</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Second version 1960 shows additional breath</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Sutherland
Ex. 3.32 Bars 22-23 Rockstro Vocal Score 'Casta Diva' showing augmented Intervals
Ex. 3.33 Bar 25 Rockstro Vocal Score 'Casta Diva' showing augmented intervals
Ex. 3.34 Bar 27 Rockstro Vocal Score 'Casta Diva'
Ex. 3.35 Bars 51-53 Rockstro Vocal Score 'Casta Diva'
Ex. 3.36 Bar 24 Rockstro Vocal Score 'Casta Diva'
Ex. 3.37 Bar 27 Rockstro Vocal Score 'Casta Diva'
Ex. 3.38 Bars 26-30 Rockstro Vocal Score 'Casta Diva' showing breathing by Sutherland
Ex. 3.39 Bars 32-34 Rockstro Vocal Score 'Casta Diva' Melismata showing breathing of Sutherland's 1963 version.
Ex. 3.40 Bars 56-59 Rockstro Vocal Score 'Casta Diva'
Ex. 3.41 Bars 56-59 Rockstro Score 'Casta Diva' Sutherland’s 1960 version
Ex. 3.42 Bars 56-59 Rockstro Vocal Score 'Casta Diva' Sutherland’s 1963 version
Ex. 3.43 Bars 55-59 Novello Vocal Score 'Casta Diva' Harmonic structure of accompaniment
Ex. 3.44 Bars 55-56 Novello Vocal Score 'Casta Diva' 1978 version showing the tied notes - f' - which are omitted

Caballé
Ex. 3.45 Bars 37-38 Novello Vocal Score 'Casta Diva' showing breathing
Ex. 3.46 Bars 27-28 Novello Vocal Score 'Casta Diva' Caballé’s version
Ex. 3.47 Bars 16-17 Novello Vocal Score 'Casta Diva'
Ex. 3.48 Bars 22-23 Novello Vocal Score 'Casta Diva' (identical with 47-48 in stanza two)
Ex. 3.49 Bars 16-17 Novello Vocal Score 'Casta Diva' Low lying registers
Ex. 3.50 Bars 32-34 Novello Vocal Score 'Casta Diva' Melismata showing breathing
Ex. 3.51 Bars 37-38 Novello Vocal Score 'Casta Diva' Melismata
Ex. 3.52 Bars 56-59 Novello Vocal Score 'Casta Diva' Cadenza and trill of Caballé

Souliotis
Ex. 3.53 Bars 16-18 Novello Vocal Score 'Casta Diva'
Ex. 3.54 Bars 26-30 Novello Vocal Score 'Casta Diva' Souliotis’ breathing
Ex. 3.55 Bars 32-34 Novello Vocal Score 'Casta Diva' Unclear notes identified by ↓
Ex. 3.56 Bars 37-38 Novello Vocal Score 'Casta Diva' showing Souliotis’ breaths
Ex. 3.57 Bars 56-59 Novello Vocal Score 'Casta Diva' Cadenza
Ex. 3.58 Bars 56-59 Novello Vocal Score 'Casta Diva' Cadenza Souliotis’ version
Ex. 3.59 Bars 56-59 Novello Vocal Score 'Casta Diva' Cadenza Callas’ 1954 version and 1960 version
Chapter four – *L’Elisir d’Amore*

**Caruso**

- Ex. 4.1 Bars 20-22 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’ showing messa di voce and portamento
- Ex. 4.2 Bars 22-25 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’ with additions by Caruso
- Ex. 4.3 Bar 10, bars 36-38 and bars 39-41 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’
  - 4.3.a Bar 10 ‘u-na’ Vocal Score
  - 4.3.b Bars 36-38 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’ ‘(con) -on-dere, i miei’ and ‘so-spir’ with Caruso’s additions
  - 4.3.c Bars 39-43 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’ ‘di piu non chie-do’ Caruso’s portamento
- Ex. 4.4 Bars 12-13 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’
- Ex. 4.5 Bars 15-17 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’ Donizetti’s score
- Ex. 4.6 Bars 15—17 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’ Caruso’s version
- Ex. 4.7 Bars 18-19 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’
- Ex. 4.8 Bars 20-22 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’
- Ex. 4.9 Bars 20-22 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’ Caruso’s versions
- Ex. 4.10 Bar 16 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’
- Ex. 4.11 Bars 24-25 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’ Caruso’s ornamentation
- Ex. 4.12 Bar 32-34 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’ Caruso’s version
- Ex. 4.13 Bars 42-44 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’ Caruso’s version
- Ex. 4.14 Bars 42-46 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’ showing cadenza proper
- Ex. 4.15 Bars 42-46 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’ Cadenza line sung by Caruso

**Gigli**

- Ex. 4.16 Bar 12 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’ Gigli’s version
- Ex. 4.17 Bars 32-34 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’ Gigli’s version
- Ex. 4.18 Bars 45-46 Ricordi vocal score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’
- Ex. 4.19 Bars 45-46 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’ Gigli’s version
- Ex. 4.20 Bars 39-42 Ricordi Vocal score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’ Gigli’s version
- Ex. 4.21 Bars 20-25 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’ Gigli’s version
- Ex. 4.22 Bars 39-40 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’ Gigli’s version
- Ex. 4.23 Bars 12-13 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’ Gigli’s version
- Ex. 4.24 Bars 32-34 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’ Gigli’s version
- Ex. 4.25 Bars 15-17 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’ Gigli’s version
- Ex. 4.26 Bars 20-22 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’ Gigli’s additions
- Ex. 4.27 Bars 24-25 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’ Gigli’s additions
Ex. 4.28 Bars 36-40 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’ showing Gigli’s breathing points
Ex. 4.29 Bars 42-46 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’ showing lead-in to the cadenza, and the cadenza proper
Ex. 4.30 Bars 42-46 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’ Gigli’s cadenza

**Pavarotti**

Ex. 4.31 Bars 15-17 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’ Pavarotti’s version (Pavarotti follows the slurring of the Schirmer edition)
Ex. 4.32 Bars 20-22 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’ Pavarotti’s version
Ex. 4.33 Bars 22-25 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’ Pavarotti’s version
Ex. 4.34 Bars 41-42 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’ Caruso’s and Gigli’s version.
Ex. 4.35 Bars 36-39 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’ Pavarotti’s version
Ex. 4.36 Bars 29-30 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’
Ex. 4.37 Bars 39 and 43 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’
Ex. 4.38 Bars 16-19 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’ Slurring in bar 16 and bar 18
Ex. 4.39 Bars 12-13 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’ Pavarotti’s version
Ex. 4.40 Bars 34-36 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’
Ex. 4.41 Bars 15-17 and 32-34 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’ Pavarotti’s versions
  a. Bars 15-17
  b. Bars 32-34
Ex. 4.42 Bars 20-22 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’ Pavarotti’s version
Ex. 4.43 Bars 36-39 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’ Pavarotti’s version
Ex. 4.44 Bars 42-44 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’ showing harmonic structure
Ex. 4.45 Bar 15 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’
Ex. 4.46 Bars 42-46 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’ showing Donizetti’s cadenza
Ex. 4.47 Bars 42-46 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’ Pavarotti’s version

**Edmonds**

Ex. 4.48 Bars 20-25 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’ Edmonds’ version
Ex. 4.49 Bars 18-19 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’ Edmonds’ version is the same
Ex. 4.50 Bars 15-17 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’ Edmonds’ version
Ex. 4.51 Bars 34-36 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’ Edmonds’ version
Ex. 4.52 Bars 42-46 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’ Cadenza
Ex. 4.53 Bars 42-46 Ricordi Vocal Score ‘Una furtiva lagrima’ Cadenza, Edmonds’ version