Exploring the fit between the perceived mental health needs of resettling refugees and current health service responses

Michael Savic
BSc(Hons)

Discipline of Public Health
School of Population Health and Clinical Practice,
and Discipline of Psychiatry,
School of Medicine,
Faculty of Health Sciences
The University of Adelaide

Submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy
April 2010
# Table of Contents

Table of Contents ................................. i
List of Tables ................................... vi
List of Figures ................................... vii
Abstract ........................................... viii
Declaration ....................................... ix
Acknowledgements ............................... x
Abbreviations and Acronyms ................... xi

## Chapter 1

**Introduction**

1.1 Introduction .................................. 1
1.2 Refugees ...................................... 2
1.3 Resettling refugees ............................ 3
1.4 Resettling refugees in Australia .......... 4
1.5 The extent and context of Sudanese refugee resettlement in Australia 4
1.6 Material, social and mental health needs 6
1.7 Need ........................................... 7
1.8 Australia’s refugee resettlement programme and services 8
1.9 The Australian health system ............. 10
1.10 South Australian health system and resettling refugees 12
1.11 My interest in the topic .................... 13
1.12 Aims and research questions .............. 14
1.13 Organisation of the thesis ................. 15
1.14 Conclusion .................................. 15

## Chapter 2

**Refugee mental health and current health service provision responses reviewed** 16

2.1 Introduction .................................. 16
2.2 Forced migration and mental health ........ 16
   2.2.1 Pre-migration experiences ............. 17
   2.2.2 Post-migration experiences .......... 18
2.3 Health research on Sudanese refugees .... 25
2.4 Health service responses to resettling refugees 27
   2.4.1 Macro-level ............................ 28
   2.4.2 Micro-level ............................ 32
2.5 Conclusion .................................. 35

## Chapter 3

**Methods** .................................... 37

3.1 Introduction ................................ 37
3.2 Theoretical framework ...................... 37
3.3 Ethical considerations ...................... 38
   3.3.1 Ethical clearance ..................... 41
   3.3.2 Consultative process ................ 41
3.4 Sampling 42
3.5 Participants 45
  3.5.1 Selection criteria 45
  3.5.2 Refusals to participate 46
  3.5.3 Description of key informants 47
  3.5.4 Distinguishing between multiple voices 49
3.6 Data collection 50
  3.6.1 Time and place 50
  3.6.2 Interviews in practice 51
  3.6.3 Note taking 52
  3.6.4 Interview schedule 52
  3.6.5 Other materials used in interviews 53
  3.6.6 After the interview 53
3.7 Data analysis 54
  3.7.1 Framework analysis in theory 54
  3.7.2 Framework analysis in practice 56
3.8 Rigour 58
3.9 Reflexivity 60
  3.9.1 Insiders and outsiders 60
  3.9.2 Ethical preoccupation 63
  3.9.3 Perspective 63
  3.9.4 Interdisciplinary perspectives 64
  3.9.5 Power 64
  3.9.6 Age 64
  3.9.7 Gender 65
3.10 Conclusion 65

Chapter 4 66
Exploring the material, social and mental health needs of resettling refugees

4.1 Introduction 66
4.2 Thematic framework 66
4.3 Overarching theme: the need to rebuild social worlds 67
4.4 Practicalities of rebuilding social worlds 68
  4.4.1 Expectations 70
  4.4.2 Housing 71
  4.4.3 Education 75
  4.4.4 Employment and financial security 78
  4.4.5 Need for information 82
  4.4.6 English language abilities 82
4.5 Adjustment to living in a new social world 83
  4.5.1 Changing gender roles and family dynamics 85
  4.5.2 Divergent adjustment pathways 88
  4.5.3 Cultural differences 90
4.6 Coping with living in old and new social worlds simultaneously 92
  4.6.1 Separation and its impact 94
4.6.2 Sending money home
4.7 Overarching theme: Addressing mental health issues
4.8. The need to deal with trauma
  4.8.1 The role of trauma in the experience of forced migration
  4.8.2 Impacts of trauma
4.9. The need to address other mental health issues
  4.9.1 Mental health beliefs
  4.9.2 Depression
  4.9.3 Psychosis
4.10 Interconnectedness of needs
4.11 Conclusion

Chapter 5
Current responses to addressing the material, social and mental health needs of resettling Sudanese refugees
  5.1 Introduction
  5.2 Thematic framework
  5.3 Overarching theme: Outside of the formal health system
  5.4 Informal sector
    5.4.1 Social support and community belonging
    5.4.2 Instrumental support
    5.4.3 Bridging the separation gap
    5.4.4 Dealing with loss, grief and mental health issues
  5.5 Resettlement and other services
    5.5.1 Case management
    5.5.2 Information provision
    5.5.3 Group programmes
    5.5.4 Dealing with mental health issues
  5.6 Overarching theme: Inside the formal health system
  5.7 Primary care and community mental health services
    5.7.1 Dealing with mental health issues
    5.7.2 Supporting refugees to rebuild social worlds
    5.7.3 Bi-cultural community health workers
  5.8 Secondary mental health services
    5.8.1 Dealing with severe mental health issues
  5.9 Interconnectedness of themes
  5.10 Gaps
  5.11 Conclusion

Chapter 6
Factors impacting upon the ability of services to address the material, social and mental health needs of resettling refugees
  6.1 Introduction
  6.2 Thematic framework
  6.3 Overarching theme: Health service factors
6.4 Access to care
  6.4.1 Avenues utilised by refugees in accessing services 151
  6.4.2 Barriers to accessing services 152
6.5 Quality of care
  6.5.1 Cultural and linguistic sensitivity 168
  6.5.2 The patient-provider relationship 176
6.6 Philosophy and structure of services
  6.6.1 Philosophy 179
  6.6.2 Structures 182
6.7 Individual organisational factors
  6.7.1 Motivation to focus on resettling refugees 188
  6.7.2 Management support 190
6.8 Overarching theme: Health system factors 191
6.9 Integration and partnerships
  6.9.1 Benefits of integration and partnerships 193
  6.9.2 Informal and formal health sectors 194
  6.9.3 Resettlement and primary and community care services 195
  6.9.4 Refugee specific and mainstream services 197
  6.9.5 Primary and community care services and secondary mental health 198
6.10 Workforce issues
  6.10.1 Attracting and retaining health providers 201
  6.10.2 Training and up-skilling health providers 203
6.11 Agents of change
  6.11.1 Refugee specific and community health services 206
  6.11.2 Advocacy groups 207
  6.11.3 Motivated individuals 207
  6.11.4 Refugee participation 208
6.12 Policy
  6.12.1 Need for and role of policy 211
  6.12.2 Absence of a state refugee health policy and existing barriers 212
6.13 Interconnectedness of themes 215
6.14 Conclusion 215

Chapter 7
Improving the relevance, quality and accessibility of health service and system responses to addressing the needs of resettling refugees 216
  7.1 Introduction 216
  7.2 Needs 216
  7.3 Gap: Capacity to support resettling refugees in rebuilding social worlds 220
  7.4 The role of health services 221
  7.5 Imagining the ‘fair and decent’ service 223
  7.6 Community and refugee specific services versus mainstream services 227
  7.7 Strategies for improving health service capacity 229
    7.7.1 Structures and philosophy 230
    7.7.2 Integration 235
List of Tables

Table 3.1: Summary of Framework Analysis (Pope et al. 2000) ........................................... 55
Table 3.2: Rigour enhancing strategies as articulated by Mays and Pope (2000) and the use of in this research .......................................................... 59
Table 4.1: Summary of important perceptions about the mental health beliefs of resettling Sudanese refugees to emerge from key informants’ accounts ........................................ 108
List of Figures

Figure 4.1: Thematic framework for Research Question One 67
Figure 4.2: Rebuilding social worlds diagram 68
Figure 4.3: Practicalities of rebuilding social worlds – theme overview 69
Figure 4.4: Adjustment to living in a new social world – theme overview 84
Figure 4.5: Coping with living in old and new social worlds simultaneously – theme overview 93
Figure 4.6: The need to deal with trauma – theme overview 102
Figure 4.7: The need to address other mental health issues – theme overview 107
Figure 5.1: Thematic framework for Research Question Two 113
Figure 5.2: Informal sector – theme overview 114
Figure 5.3: Resettlement and other services – theme overview 126
Figure 5.4: Primary care and community mental health care services – theme overview 130
Figure 5.5: Secondary mental health services – theme overview 143
Figure 6.1: Thematic framework for Research Question Three 150
Figure 6.2: Access to care – theme overview 151
Figure 6.3: Quality of care – theme overview 167
Figure 6.4: Philosophy and structures of services – theme overview 179
Figure 6.5: Individual organisational factors – theme overview 188
Figure 6.6: Integration and partnerships – theme overview 192
Figure 6.7: Workforce issues – theme overview 201
Figure 6.8: Agents of change – theme overview 206
Figure 6.9: Policy – theme overview 211
Abstract

Introduction
A small but growing field of research has expanded the focus on trauma and associated interventions historically evident in refugee mental health research. Proponents emphasise the need to contextualise refugee mental health with respect to resettlement and culture. Furthermore, they argue for a re-assessment of how health services and systems respond. However, health service research has tended to focus on small sections of the health system. Studies have included those concentrating on a singular group of practitioners, a particular service, or on a particular type of service. This narrow scope of investigation may not be useful in informing overall health systems development.

Aims
This thesis explores the fit between the perceived mental health needs of resettling refugees and current health service responses from a broad health system perspective. Furthermore, it considers how a better alignment of responses and needs can be facilitated, and how health service and system capacity can be increased.

Methods
A qualitative study focussing on health service and system responses to Sudanese refugees in South Australia – a group that has figured prominently in Australian humanitarian intakes over the last decade – was undertaken in order to explore the responsiveness of the health system to the mental health needs of refugees. A qualitative approach was used in order to gather information-rich data from a range of perspectives. In-depth interviews were conducted with a diverse array of key informants. Sudanese community leaders, Sudanese health workers, primary and mental health care practitioners, health service managers and policy makers were among the twenty key informants interviewed. Interviews were analysed using the Framework approach to thematic analysis.

Results
This study reiterated the need to address issues relating to the social and cultural context of resettlement. These needs were viewed as most immediate and pressing. However, there was variation in the capacity of services within the health system to respond to such issues. Services with higher degrees of refugee specificity were generally better equipped than those with less specificity. General Practitioners working in private practices were considered to face particular challenges. Several factors were found to influence the capacity of services to provide responses that are holistic, accessible, and of sufficient quality. The structures and philosophies in operation within services and the system, and the level of integration between services and sectors were important among these.

Conclusion
This thesis argues that there is a need to build health system capacity to address the needs of resettling refugees holistically. It outlines several health service and system level strategies that could be adopted to do so. In so doing this thesis constitutes a resource that health service managers, policy makers and decision makers can draw on to further service and health system development.
Declaration

This work contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text.

I give consent to this copy of my thesis when deposited in the University Library being made available for loan and photocopying, subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.

I also give permission for the digital version of my thesis to be made available on the web, via the University’s digital research repository, the Library catalogue, the Australian Digital Theses Program (ADTP) and also through web search engines, unless permission has been granted by the university to restrict access for a period of time.

Signed: ______________________
Michael Savic (Candidate)

Date: ______________________
Acknowledgements

I would like to acknowledge the support and assistance of a number of people in enabling this thesis to happen.

To my supervisors – Dr Afzal Mahmood, Prof Anna Chur-Hansen and A/Prof Vivienne Moore – who were generous and unwavering in their collective guidance, inspiration, and encouragement.

Many thanks to the key informants who generously gave their time and entrusted me with their stories over the course of my research, without them there would be no thesis.

Thanks to members of the Disciplines of Public Health and Psychiatry at the University of Adelaide for their support, and inspiration. A special thanks to Prof Annette Braunack-Mayer, A/Prof Peng Bi, and Dr Shona Crabb for their assistance in postgraduate matters.

I’m grateful for the support and friendship of my fellow postgraduates, of which there are too many to name.

As always, the love, understanding and encouragement of my family and friends sustained me during my candidature when nothing else could. For this I’m indebted.
Abbreviations and Acronyms

ABS – Australian Bureau of Statistics
ACIS – Acute Crisis and Intervention Service
AIHW – Australian Institute of Health and Welfare
AMEP – Adult Migrant English Program
CALD – Culturally and Linguistically Diverse
CCS – Complex Case Support
CHW – Community Health Worker
DIAC – Department of Immigration and Citizenship
DIMIA – Department of Immigration and Multicultural Affairs
DIMIA – Department of Immigration, Multicultural and Indigenous Affairs
ECT – Electroconvulsive Therapy
GP – General Practitioner
HiaP – Health in all Policies
ICTs – Information Communication Technologies
IHSS – Integrated Humanitarian Settlement Strategy
MRCSA – Migrant Resource Centre of South Australia
NGOs – Non-Government Organisations
NHHRC –  National Health and Hospitals Reform Commission
NHMRC – National Health and Medical Research Council
PTSD – Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder
RCOA – Refugee Council of Australia
SA –  South Australia
SDB – Settlement Database
SGP – Settlement Grants Program
TIS – Translating and Interpreting Service
UNHCR – United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees
WHO – World Health Organization