

**INNOVATION AND DIFFERENCE:
city planning in Adelaide from 1972 until 1993 within the
historical framework of the politics of City/State relations from 1836**

Michael Llewellyn-Smith

**A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements
of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy**

**School of Architecture, Landscape Architecture and Urban Design
The University of Adelaide**

28 November 2010

Table of Contents

Title Page	
Table of Contents	p.1
Abstract	p.7
List of Figures	p.8
List of Appendices	p.9
List of Tables	p.10
Abbreviations	p.11
Statement of Originality	p.13
Acknowledgements	p.14
PART ONE:	
INTRODUCTION, RESEARCH METHODOLOGY, LITERATURE REVIEW – THEORY AND ADELAIDE, LITERATURE REVIEW – THEORY AND CONTEXT	p.15
Chapter 1.1: Introduction	p.16
1.1.1 Background	p.16
1.1.2 Historical Context	p.18
1.1.3 Why this research? Rationale	p.22
1.1.4 Focussing the topic of inquiry	p.23
1.1.5 The Research Questions	p.24
1.1.6 The role of the researcher: personal perspective	p.24
1.1.7 Structure of the thesis	p.28
1.1.8 Summary and aim of the thesis	p.31
Chapter 1.2: Research Methodology	p.32
1.2.1 Introduction	p.32
1.2.2 The research approach used	p.32
1.2.3 The City of Adelaide as the focus of the investigation	p.32
1.2.4 Qualitative research through personal interviews	p.33

1.2.5	Collecting the data	p.35
1.2.6	Interpretive research through a review and analysis of documents	p.39
1.2.7	Triangulation	p.40
1.2.8	Analysing the data and the emergence of themes	p.40
1.2.9	Summary	p.41
Chapter 1.3: Literature Review – Theory and Adelaide		p.42
1.3.1	Introduction	p.42
1.3.2	Planning Theory	p.42
1.3.3	Background for the founding of Adelaide and South Australia	p.45
1.3.4	Development of the City and State and their relationship from 1840 until 1950	p.45
1.3.5	Changing attitudes to planning in the City and State from 1950 until 1972	p.46
1.3.6	The politics of city planning in Adelaide from 1972 until 1993	p.48
1.3.7	Summary	p.49
Chapter 1.4: Literature Review – Theory and Context		p.50
1.4.1	Introduction	p.50
1.4.2	Power and Governance	p.50
1.4.3	The exercise of the city planning function between upper and lower levels of government	p.51
1.4.4	Planning in Britain	p.54
1.4.5	Planning in Canada	p.56
1.4.6	Planning in New Zealand	p.58
1.4.7	Planning in the United States of America	p.59
1.4.8	Governance and Planning in Australia	p.62
1.4.9	Planning in the City of Brisbane, Queensland	p.65
1.4.10	Planning in the City of Canberra, National Capital	p.66
1.4.11	Planning in the City of Darwin, Northern Territory	p.67
1.4.12	Planning in the City of Hobart, Tasmania	p.68
1.4.13	Planning in the City of Melbourne, Victoria	p.69

1.4.14	Planning in the City of Perth, Western Australia	p.76
1.4.14	Planning in the City of Sydney, New South Wales	p.77
1.4.15	Summary	p.89

PART TWO:

	THE HISTORY OF ADELAIDE AND SOUTH AUSTRALIA FROM 1836 UNTIL 1972	p.90
--	---	------

Chapter 2.1:	The background to the founding of Adelaide and South Australia in 1836; <i>Influence, Heritage and Governance</i>	p.91
--------------	--	------

2.1.1	Introduction	p.91
2.1.2	European settlement in Australia	p.91
2.1.3	Edward Gibbon Wakefield and the SA Land Company	p.92
2.1.4	Colonel William Light and Governor John Hindmarsh	p.94
2.1.5	Light's Plan for the City of Adelaide	p.98
2.1.6	Light's work after his Plan for the City of Adelaide	p.103
2.1.7	Summary	p.108

Chapter 2.2:	The development of the City and State from 1840 until 1950 and the City/State relationship during this period; <i>Influence, Heritage and Governance</i>	p.109
--------------	---	-------

2.2.1	Introduction	p.109
2.2.2	The growth of the City from 1840 until 1900	p.109
2.2.3	The Adelaide Club and its influence	p.112
2.2.4	Town Planning and the Garden City Movement	p.114
2.2.5	The influence of Charles Reade in Adelaide	p.118
2.2.6	Influences in Adelaide after Reade	p.118
2.2.7	The influence of Premier Tom Playford	p.122
2.2.8	The influence of Town Clerk Bill Veale	p.127
2.2.9	Summary	p.130

Chapter 2.3:	Changing attitudes to planning in the City and State from 1950 until 1972; <i>Governance and Influence</i>	p.131
2.3.1	Introduction	p.131
2.3.2	The international context after World War II	p.131
2.3.3	The Adelaide Metropolitan Development Plan	p.135
2.3.4	Metropolitan Adelaide Transportation Study	p.143
2.3.5	Policies of the Adelaide City Council	p.147
2.3.6	Public participation in the planning process and the rise of residents' action groups	p.156
2.3.7	Summary	p.159

PART THREE:

	THE POLITICS OF STRATEGIC AND STATUTORY PLANNING IN THE CITY OF ADELAIDE FROM 1972 UNTIL 1993	p.161
--	---	-------

Chapter 3.1:	The period of Interim Development Control from October 1972 until February 1977; <i>Governance, Influence, Heritage and Integration</i>	p.162
3.1.1	Introduction	p.162
3.1.2	The influence of Premier Dunstan and Lord Mayor Hayes	p.162
3.1.3	Legislation for the City of Adelaide Development Committee	p.168
3.1.4	The influential Council and State members of the CADC	p.172
3.1.5	Operation and influence of the CADC	p.174
3.1.6	Choosing a consultant for the Planning Study	p.179
3.1.7	<i>The City of Adelaide Planning Study</i>	p.183
3.1.8	Response to the Study by the Council	p.194
3.1.9	Interdepartmental Plan Review Committee	p.199
3.1.10	City/State negotiations	p.202
3.1.11	<i>The City of Adelaide Development Control Act, 1976</i>	p.205
3.1.12	<i>The City of Adelaide Plan 1976-81</i>	p.207
3.1.13	Summary	p.208

Chapter 3.2:	An innovative and different system of planning from 1 March 1977; <i>Governance, Influence, Heritage and Integration</i>	p.210
3.2.1	Introduction	p.210
3.2.2	City of Adelaide Planning Commission	p.211
3.2.3	The role of the Council in the new system of planning	p.216
3.2.4	The CAPC's role in implementing the City Plan	p.218
3.2.5	Different influences resulting from changes within the Council	p.225
3.2.6	Different influences resulting from changes within the State	p.228
3.2.7	Influences on the heritage of the City	p.231
3.2.8	Review of the <i>City of Adelaide Plan 1976-81</i>	p.233
3.2.9	Consequential statutory amendments	p.238
3.2.10	Changes within the Council after Bowen's influence	p.239
3.2.11	Summary	p.241
Chapter 3.3:	The operation of the City's planning system from November 1982 until May 1987; <i>Governance, Influence, Heritage and Integration</i>	p.243
3.3.1	Introduction	p.243
3.3.2	Planning in the City in the early years of the Bannon Government	p.244
3.3.3	Controversy over the State's ASER proposal	p.247
3.3.4	The City of Adelaide Heritage Study	p.250
3.3.5	The Aurora Hotel and Citicom development	p.262
3.3.6	Review of the <i>City of Adelaide Plan 1981-86</i>	p.266
3.3.7	Adoption of the <i>City of Adelaide Plan 1986-91</i>	p.274
3.3.8	Summary	p.277
Chapter 3.4:	The State Planning Review and the end of the City's separate system in December 1993; <i>Governance, Influence, Heritage and Integration</i>	p.279
3.4.1	Introduction	p.279
3.4.2	The early years of the Condous Lord Mayoralty	p.280
3.4.3	Decline in the governance role of the Planning Commission	p.282
3.4.4	House of Chow Restaurant	p.287

3.4.5	Review of the <i>City of Adelaide Plan 1986-91</i> and Townscape	p.289
3.4.6	The State Planning Review	p.299
3.4.7	Changes in the leadership of the State and the Council	p.308
3.4.8	The <i>City of Adelaide Plan 1991-96</i>	p.312
3.4.9	Summary	p.316

PART FOUR:

	CONCLUSIONS, REFERENCES AND APPENDICES	p.317
--	--	-------

Chapter 4.1:	Conclusions; <i>Heritage, Influence, Governance and Integration</i>	p.318
--------------	---	-------

4.1.1	Introduction	p.318
4.1.2	The heritage of the City arising from Light's Plan	p.319
4.1.3	The influence of key individuals	p.319
4.1.4	Governance of the City	p.321
4.1.5	The integration of strategic and statutory planning	p.322
4.1.6	Theories of Pluralism and Identity-based politics	p.323
4.1.7	What was discovered; the success of the Adelaide model	p.326
4.1.8	Lessons learned for Adelaide and Australia	p.328
4.1.9	Future Research Questions arising from this Inquiry	p.329
4.2	References	p.331
4.3	Appendices	p.348

ABSTRACT

INNOVATION AND DIFFERENCE:

city planning in Adelaide from 1972 until 1993 within the historical framework of the politics of City/State relations from 1836.

This thesis is about the successful *integration of strategic and statutory planning* for the City of Adelaide during the period 1972 until 1993. It is a historical perspective of the City from the founding of Adelaide and South Australia in 1836 and their development until 1972; and then on the politics of planning in the City from October 1972 until December 1993. There are four themes in this thesis. In addition to the theme of *integration*, I will argue that the *heritage of the City arising from Colonel Light's Plan in 1836, particularly the Park Lands*, made Adelaide different from the other capital cities in Australia. Through the *influence of key individuals* there was a particular relationship and balance of power between the City and State in terms of their respective power and the *governance of the City*. I will argue that in the 1960s the policies of the Council and the statutory provisions of the State's Metropolitan Development Plan contributed to a considerable loss of residential population from the City. These issues provided reasons for major reform in 1972 when an innovative system of Interim Development Control was introduced and a Planning Study of the City subsequently carried out. After agreement between the City and the State an innovative and different legislative approach to city planning in an Australian capital city was introduced. I will argue that this legislation, which provided for a joint City/State planning authority for Adelaide, enabled critical political decisions to be made which facilitated the re-establishment of an inner city residential population. But it also maintained the City's role and function as the centre of the metropolitan area. I will also argue that planning legislation specifically for the City in 1977 was important as it not only provided for the continuation of a joint City/State authority, but also for five-yearly City Plans within which strategic and statutory approaches to city planning were integrated. This situation continued until 1993 when after a State Planning Review the separate legislation was repealed for political and technical reasons. Thus, after twenty-one years of innovation and difference in the City of Adelaide, a new State planning system was introduced partially modelled on the approach taken in the City.

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1	Map of the present City of Adelaide	p.17
Figure 2	Diagrammatic representation of the Thesis	p.29
Figure 3	The boundaries of the City of Sydney in 1971	p.79
Figure 4	The Four Objectives of the Sydney Strategic Plan	p.84
Figure 5	City of Sydney Structure	p.85
Figure 6	South Australia in context	p.93
Figure 7	Preamble to the <i>South Australia Colonisation Act, 1834</i>	p.93
Figure 8	Kangaroo Island, Rapid Bay and Holdfast Bay	p.96
Figure 9	Light's original concept	p.97
Figure 10	Light's Plan for the City of Adelaide	p.98
Figure 11	Cataneo's Plan for the ideal city with a central and surrounding squares	p.100
Figure 12	Penn's Plan of Philadelphia	p.101
Figure 13	Light's respect for the topography	p.102
Figure 14	Light's layout of the Country Sections outside the City	p.104
Figure 15	The Adelaide Club when constructed on North Terrace in 1863	p.113
Figure 16	The three magnets of Howard	p.117
Figure 17	Reade's proposal for an outer belt of Park Lands	p.120
Figure 18	Veale's plan for a new north-south road on the eastern side of the City	p.129
Figure 19	Le Corbusier's City of Towers	p.132
Figure 20	Cumbernauld New Town: Tower blocks and motorways	p.133
Figure 21	Zoning for the City with all of South Adelaide zoned commercial	p.141
Figure 22	MATS plan for the City of Adelaide	p.145
Figure 23	Madigan's study area and Bubb's area for high rise housing	p.151
Figure 24	Proposed Stock Exchange Plaza	p.153
Figure 25	City of Adelaide Planning Centre	p.188
Figure 26	Implementation Program	p.192
Figure 27	Cover of the <i>City of Adelaide Planning Study</i>	p.193
Figure 28	The roles and influence of the researcher	p.195
Figure 29	The City Precinct Structure	p.211
Figure 30	Ruthven Mansions; saved from demolition and restored	p.222
Figure 31	Relocated façade of the Marine and Harbours' Building	p.224
Figure 32	The new northern wall of the restored Old Methodist Meeting Hall	p.225
Figure 33	Zone X: no on-site parking	p.235
Figure 34	Aurora Hotel, Hindmarsh Square	p.263
Figure 35	The City's Planning System 1986	p.276
Figure 36	Urban Design Guidelines	p.282
Figure 37	House of Chow Restaurant, Hutt Street	p.287
Figure 38	Tram Barn retained and new Conservatory	p.310
Figure 39	The redeveloped East End Markets	p.315
Figure 40	Canberra's "Y-Plan"	p.360

LIST OF APPENDICES

Reference

Appendix 1	Consultant Registrations for the <i>City of Adelaide Planning Study</i>	p.21
Appendix 2	Key people of influence identified as potential interviewees (65)	p.33
Appendix 3	The University's Human Research Ethics Committee's approval	p.35
Appendix 4	Technical details of the equipment used	p.35
Appendix 5	Consent Form signed by all interviewees	p.38
Appendix 6	Planning in Canberra, ACT	p.66
Appendix 7	Woolloomooloo Agreement	p.88
Appendix 8	Directions of the Commissioners to Surveyor-General Light	p.95, p.99
Appendix 9	Colonel Light Ceremony and statue	p.106
Appendix 10	City/State models	p.112
Appendix 11	Brief for the Planning Study	p.165
Appendix 12	Text of Dunstan's Address in Reply	p.170
Appendix 13	USC Planning Team	p.183
Appendix 14	Clarke and his method of working	p.184
Appendix 15	USC proposed Action Projects	p.191
Appendix 16	Details of the USC draft City Plan	p.191
Appendix 17	CADC report to Premier Dunstan	p.193
Appendix 18	Council's process to finalise the City Plan	p.196
Appendix 19	Council's approach to representations	p.198
Appendix 20	Submissions by State Departments and Agencies	p.199
Appendix 21	Council's Action Projects	p.202
Appendix 22	A continuing role for the CADC	p.203
Appendix 23	Heritage Summary Assessment Sheet	p.250
Appendix 24	Council report to Minister Crafter on Townscape	p.298
Appendix 25	Terms of Reference for the State Planning Review	p.300
Appendix 26	East End Markets and Le Cornu Developments	p.315

LIST OF TABLES

Table1	The 47 Interviewees	p.34
Table2	Individuals of influence 1972 – 1977	p.163
Table 3	Individuals of influence 1977 – 1982	p.210
Table 4	Members of the Lord Mayor’s Heritage Advisory Committee	p.232
Table 5	Individuals of influence 1982 – 1987	p.243
Table 6	Individuals of influence 1987 – 1993	p.279
Table 7	Members of the City of Adelaide Heritage Advisory Committee	p.292

ABBREVIATIONS

Note: 'The Corporation of the Council of the City of Adelaide' is the legal entity which comprises the Council of elected members and the City administration.

ABC	Australian Broadcasting Corporation
ACC	Adelaide City Council
ACT	Australian Capital Territory
AESC	Adelaide Electric Supply Company
ALP	Australian Labor Party
ASER	Adelaide Railway Station and Environs Redevelopment
BCC	Brisbane City Council
BLF	Building Labourers' Federation
BOMA	Building Owners and Managers' Association
CADC	City of Adelaide Development Committee
CAPC	City of Adelaide Planning Commission
CBD	Central Business District
CCoA	Corporation of the Council of the City of Adelaide
CEO	Chief Executive Officer
CE&P	City Engineer and Planner
City	City of Adelaide
COAHAC	City of Adelaide Heritage Advisory Committee
CPO	Chief Planning Officer
CRA	Civic Reform Association
CSO	Crown Solicitor's Office
DAC	Development Assessment Commission
DCC	Darwin City Council
DE&P	Department of Environment and Planning
DFC	Desired Future Character Statement
DMS	Donovan, Marsden & Stark
DPAC	Development Policy Advisory Committee
DURD	Department of Urban and Regional Development
ETSA	Electricity Trust of South Australia
HCC	Hobart City Council

HOBAC	Height of Buildings Advisory Committee
IDC	Interim Development Control
IDO	Interim Development Order
LCL	Liberal and Country League
LOMHAC	Lord Mayor's Heritage Advisory Committee
MATS	Metropolitan Adelaide Transport Study
MCC	Melbourne City Council
MDP	Metropolitan Development Plan
MMBW	Melbourne and Metropolitan Board of Works
NCDC	National Capital Development Commission
NSW	New South Wales
NT	Northern Territory
ohi	Oral History Interview
PCC	Perth City Council
QLD	Queensland
RAIA (SA)	Royal Australian Institute of Architects (South Australia)
RAIA (NSW)	Royal Australian Institute of Architects (New South Wales)
RAPI	Royal Australian Planning Institute
SAHC	South Australian Heritage Committee
SAHT	South Australian Housing Trust
SCC	Sydney City Council
SDP	Supplementary Development Plan
SGIC	State Government Insurance Commission
SPA	State Planning Authority
SPO	State Planning Office
State	The Provincial and subsequent Colonial and State Governments of South Australia
TAS	Tasmania
TFA	Transferrable Floor Area
USA	United States of America
USC	Urban Systems Corporation
VHC	Victorian Housing Commission
VIC	Victoria
WA	Western Australia
WRAG	Woolloomooloo Residents Action Group

STATEMENT OF ORIGINALITY

This thesis contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution to Michael Llewellyn-Smith and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text.

I give consent to this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University Library, being made available for loan and photocopying, subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.

I also give permission for the digital version of my thesis to be made available on the web, via the University's digital research repository, the Library catalogue, the Australasian Digital Theses Program (ADTP) and also through web search engines, unless permission has been granted by the University to restrict access for a period of time.

.....
(Michael Llewellyn-Smith)

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I am indebted to many individuals who have assisted me in the preparation of this thesis:

Professor Nancy Pollock-Ellwand was my original Principal Supervisor and encouraged me to think about the topic in the broader international and Australian context.

Dr Susan Shannon has remained a Co-Supervisor throughout the whole period of research and provided encouragement, support and guidance, particularly in relation to the oral histories.

Associate Professor Rob Foster (Department of History and Politics) joined the Supervision Panel as a Co-Supervisor when there was a change in direction of the research and the situation in Adelaide was examined within the historical framework of City/State relations.

Associate Professor David Jones became my Principal Supervisor after Professor Pollock-Ellwand left the University of Adelaide. I am particularly grateful to him for taking on this responsibility at a late stage in the research and providing guidance and support which enabled the thesis to be completed.

Thanks are also due to my professional colleagues Steve Hamnett and Donna Ferretti for providing constructive advice on some early drafts and a possible structure for the thesis.

Associate Professor Samer Akkach (Post Graduate Co-ordinator) has been a constant source of support and encouragement throughout the preparation of the thesis for which I am grateful.

Michial Farrow provided invaluable assistance for me to access all the information relevant to my research contained in the Adelaide City Archives.

Kystyna Luczak, George Clarke's widow, kindly provided me with copies of all his personal papers in relation to his work in Sydney and Adelaide which were important sources of information.

I am most grateful to the 47 interviewees for making the time available for me to interview them, for commenting on the draft record of the interview and then approving and signing the final version.

My wife, Ida, acknowledged my assistance in the preparation of her doctoral thesis at the University of Sydney nearly 40 years ago. I thank Ida for her sustained encouragement and practical technical support at this time in my life without which this research could not have been carried out.