Northern Ireland and the Political Economy of Peace

Neo-Liberalism and the end of the Troubles

David Cannon
B.Int Studies (University of Adelaide, 2002)
B.A.(Hons) (University of Adelaide, 2003)

Thesis submitted for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy in the Discipline of Politics
School of History and Politics
The University of Adelaide

December 2011
TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT ................................................................................................................ i
DECLARATION.......................................................................................................... ii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS........................................................................................... iii
TABLE OF FIGURES................................................................................................ v

INTRODUCTION ........................................................................................................ 1
Timeline: Scope of the Research ................................................................................ 3
Terminology ............................................................................................................... 6
Thesis Outline ............................................................................................................ 9

CHAPTER 1: MARXIST THOUGHT IN IRELAND ....................................................... 15
Terminology ............................................................................................................... 16
Historic Marxism ........................................................................................................ 17
Industrialisation and Imperialism: Marx and Engels .................................................. 17
The Russian Revolution, Imperialism and the Irish Question ........................................ 20
Ireland and the ‘National Question’: Kautsky ............................................................. 20
Imperialism, the Highest Stage of Capitalism: Lenin ................................................... 22
Rosa Luxemburg ........................................................................................................ 25
James Connolly .......................................................................................................... 26
The Radical Shift: Decolonisation and 1968 ............................................................... 29
Traditional Marxism .................................................................................................... 29
Revisionist Marxism ................................................................................................... 33
Conclusion ................................................................................................................ 38

CHAPTER 2: THE INTRACTABILITY OF VIOLENCE ................................................. 40
Legitimacy ................................................................................................................ 46
Nationalism and Ethnicity ........................................................................................ 51
Religion and Sectarianism ........................................................................................ 53
The British Army: Operation Banner 1969 – 2007 ..................................................... 57
Territory and Segregation ........................................................................................ 58
The Victory of Materialism? ....................................................................................... 62
Conclusion ................................................................................................................ 65

CHAPTER 3: NEO-LIBERALISM AND IDEOLOGY ..................................................... 66
Hardt and Negri: Empire ............................................................................................ 73
Problematic Themes in Empire ................................................................................... 76
The Relevance of Empire to Northern Ireland ........................................................... 81
Hybridity and the ‘Other’ in Northern Ireland .............................................................. 82
Smooth Space: The ‘Global Society of Control’ ......................................................... 89
Foucault and ‘homo oeconomicus’ ............................................................................. 92
Capitalism and Expansion ....................................................................................... 95
‘The poisoned gift of national liberation’ .................................................................... 96
Conclusion ................................................................................................................ 99
ABSTRACT

Since the outbreak of the Troubles in Northern Ireland, the conflict has been mainly analytically understood in terms of ethno-nationalism and competing identities. However, as this thesis argues, economics have played a crucial role in the instances of violence in Ireland, and after partition, in Northern Ireland. With every development of the economy, from rural, to industrial and to social democratic, the complexity and intensity of violence shifted, but never disappeared. The current shift, the transformation to neo-liberalism, is the only conjuncture that has not adhered to this pattern.

This thesis argues that the resolution to the long-standing conflict in Northern Ireland is primarily caused by the new material conditions, generated by the neo-liberal globalisation of that economy. The thesis re-examines the theoretical debates on the conflict through this globalisation framework to reveal how the Catholic community and its political representatives have embraced the new material discourse and its form of governance, therein making the previous debates on the intractability of the Northern Ireland conflict a product of a historic moment, where economics, civil rights and state power were discriminatory barriers to the full integration of the Catholic population. The changed conditions are not reducible to mere economic global forces but these were essential to breaking down the historic impasse.
DECLARATION

This work contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution to David Cannon and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text.

I give consent to this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University Library, being made available for loan and photocopying, subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.

I also give permission for the digital version of my thesis to be made available on the web, via the University's digital research repository, the Library catalogue, and also through web search engines, unless permission has been granted by the University to restrict access for a period of time.

Signed

David Cannon

Date:
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This thesis has changed character several times since it was first conceived. Sometimes, as a result of life's unpredictability, it was placed on the back-burner. It was an undertaking that sometimes tested my emotional and intellectual capabilities and occasionally, my sense of humour. Nevertheless, while I look forward to its completion, it is the most significant single endeavour I have undertaken so far. Many people deserve gratitude for their assistance over the years in helping to bring this about, as I could not have done it without them.

I need to thank, first and foremost, the late Paul Nursey-Bray. Paul mentored me from undergraduate, through honours and into the PhD, and his friendship was very important to me. Without him, I doubt I would have entertained honours, let alone attempted a doctoral thesis. Paul passed away in 2005 and is still missed.

If there is a single person who contributed the most to the completion of this thesis, it is Greg McCarthy. As my principle supervisor, Greg was attentive and timely with all reviews and feedback. I cannot recall waiting long for his input in order to keep moving forward. However, Greg's contribution extended far beyond the professionalism with which he dealt with me on a weekly basis. He struck, without fail, an extraordinary balance between active encouragement and gentle consideration during what was an intense and extended period of upheaval and loss. Therefore, the contribution Greg made to my thesis was unique and went far beyond his professional obligations; without his understanding, it may have taken many more years to complete, or not have come to completion at all.

I have to also thank Vicki Spencer, who worked hard to keep me moving forward very early on, and both Paul Corcoran and Carol Johnson, in their respective roles as postgraduate coordinators, helped immeasurably over the years. I was fortunate enough to meet several Belfast based academics who took my proposal seriously and in some cases, spent quite some time with me. First, Dominic Bryan from the Queens University Belfast has been assisting me since my honours thesis in 2004. This has included many discussions and the occasional tour around Belfast. Gordon Gillespie, also from Queens, and Will Hazleton, from the University of Miami, have both helped me since 2004 and continue to assist me to this very day. I also need to thank Minerva Nasser-Eddine for editing and crucial feedback.
I must thank the fine staff in the administration nerve centre; Greta Larsen, Mel Pearson, Caroline Ralph and Julie McMahon for their patience and assistance. My thanks also goes to Antoinette Brincat from the Graduate Centre who made otherwise complicated bureaucratic interactions as agreeable as possible. Linda Christensen requires a very special thank you for her general assistance over the years and final edit. I would like to give a specific thank you to Chris McElhinney who has been helping me navigate the machinery of the politics department for many years.

I have shared this unusual experience with an evolving group of friends and some deserve a special mention. First to Mark Bode, whose friendship and vast knowledge I have been privileged to enjoy since undergrad. For friendship, coffees and something stronger I thank Josh Forkert, Priya Chacko, Aaron Retz, Zoë Gill and Kazu Shimada. I need to thank Alan Goldstone for all of the above and for his editorial prowess. I must thank Jonathon Louth for his friendship and for convincing me that I wasn't a ‘pretender’. And to Paul Tsoundarou, who has become a friend I can rely on when things get rough.

During this process, my mother and father both passed away after long illnesses. The demands of caring fell to me and my siblings Barbara and Richard. Our mutual support for each other and for our parents meant that I had a chance to keep the thesis, however slowly, moving forward. I thank them for this. I must also thank Richard for starting me off on the journey of critical thought. His simple questions to me, at a formative time, did nothing less than change my worldview and I wouldn’t be here without him. Finally I thank my partner Sabine. Sabine had her own losses and helped me while I endured mine. This was, sometimes, not easy and the struggle was occasionally compounded by the ever present thesis. However, we are emerging from the other side of a long and sometimes hard trek; although, Sabine is already now part way through her own PhD. Here’s to the next step Sabine...whatever that will be.

I would like to dedicate this thesis to my mother Ann, my father Pat, Paul Nursey-Bray and Oma Franziska, all of whom left us during the process.
# TABLE OF FIGURES

1. A Decline in Manufacturing Employment: 1955-1985 ................................................................. 152
2. B Regional Personal Income (PI) and Disposable Personal Income (DPI) 1986-1996 .................. 156
3. B Wales and Northern Ireland Personal Income (PI) and Disposable Personal Income (DPI) 1986-1996 ........................................... 156
4. B Consumer Credit: Credit Cards 1995-2005 ........................................................................... 158
4. C Consumer Durables: 1983-2010 .......................................................................................... 159
4. D Comparison of Consumer Durables: Northern Ireland and UK ......................................... 160
4. E Comparison of Consumer Durables: Northern Ireland and UK ........................................... 160
4. F Comparison of Consumer Durables: Northern Ireland and UK ......................................... 161
4. G Comparison of Consumer Durables: Northern Ireland and UK ......................................... 161
5. A Housing Tenure in Northern Ireland ...................................................................................... 163
5. B Comparison of Housing Tenure Northern Ireland and UK .................................................. 164
5. C Sales of NIHE Dwellings ....................................................................................................... 165
6. A Proportion of Economically Active Catholics: 1992-2007 ..................................................... 166
6. C Catholic Participation in the Police Service of Northern Ireland ........................................... 168
7. A Population of the Six Counties that constitute Northern Ireland: 1841-2010 ....................... 170
7. D International Migration Patterns: 2000-2009 ...................................................................... 171
7. I Self-Identification as –very‘ or ‘a little’ Prejudiced” Against Ethnic Minorities: 1994-2008 .... 175
8. A ‘Do you think the long-term policy for Northern Ireland should be for it…’ 2000.................. 219
8. B ‘Do you think the long-term policy for Northern Ireland should be for it…’ 2008.................. 220
8. C ‘… do you think of yourself as a unionist, a nationalist or neither?’ 1998 ............................... 212
8. D ‘… do you think of yourself as a unionist, a nationalist or neither?’ 2002 ............................... 222
8. E ‘… do you think of yourself as a unionist, a nationalist or neither?’ 2008 ............................... 222