ON DEALING WITH DEATH AND DYING: A QUALITATIVE STUDY OF THE EXPERIENCES OF SURGEONS, ONCOLOGISTS, INTENSIVE CARE, AND PALLIATIVE MEDICINE SPECIALISTS

SOFÍA CAROLINA ZAMBRANO RAMOS

DISCIPLINE OF PSYCHIATRY AND DISCIPLINE OF MEDICINE

SCHOOL OF MEDICINE

FACULTY OF HEALTH SCIENCES

UNIVERSITY OF ADENLAIDE

THESIS SUBMITTED FOR THE DEGREE OF

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

SEPTEMBER, 2012
Tidal Wave

So many have passed this way before,
Ocean rising behind the door;
The sea forestalled no more.
What do you want of me?
So many have passed this way
Knowing what’s behind the door
Needing solace and nothing more.
What do you expect of me?
So many have passed,
Wanting my miracle,
Not seeing the Sirens behind the door.
Oh God, what do you demand of me?
Where in the lexicon of learning
Was I taught
The wave action of this moment.
Never, never more
Did I learn the pulling of the tide
On those entrusted to me, to me.
I am not young anymore
God damn, summon me.
So many have passed this way,
And I, one more.
Stand-down and let it pass.
Ocean falling behind the door.
Tidal wave,
Taunt me no more.

Frank L. Meyskens, MD
Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TABLE OF CONTENTS</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABSTRACT</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STATEMENT OF ORIGINALITY OF THE WORK</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1 List of publications contained in this thesis</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 List of conference presentations based on the thesis</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3 List of poster presentations based on the thesis</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PREAMBLE</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 1 – INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Thesis overview</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Introductory background</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Medicine and death</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 From acceptance to denial</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 The medicalisation of death</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3 Palliative care perspective</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Research on medical practitioners’ experiences with death and dying</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1 Classic publications in the seventies</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 Pioneering anthropological and sociological studies</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3 Contemporary accounts</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.4 Contemporary research ................................................................. 33
4.5 Studies according to medical specialities .................................... 39
4.6 Summary ...................................................................................... 55
5 Rationale for the study ................................................................ 56
6 Research questions ....................................................................... 58
7 Significance / Contribution of the study ...................................... 59
8 Research approach ....................................................................... 59
8.1 The need for a qualitative approach .......................................... 59
9 Academic and scientific rigour ..................................................... 61
9.1 Ethical considerations ................................................................. 63
9.2 Reflexivity in theory .................................................................. 64
9.3 Reflexivity in practice ................................................................. 65

CHAPTER 2 - HOW DO SURGEONS EXPERIENCE AND COPE WITH THE DEATH AND DYING OF THEIR PATIENTS?: A QUALITATIVE STUDY IN THE CONTEXT OF LIFE-LIMITING ILLNESSES .............................................................. 72
1 Abstract ..................................................................................... 75
2 Introduction .................................................................................. 75
3 Methodology ................................................................................ 77
3.1 Data collection .......................................................................... 77
3.2 Interviews .................................................................................. 78
3.3 Participants ................................................................................ 78
3.4 Data analysis ............................................................................. 78
4 Results ........................................................................................ 79
4.1 The essence of surgical practice ................................................. 79
4.2 Experiences with death and dying ............................................. 84
4.3 Coping mechanisms ................................................................. 88
5 Discussion .................................................................................... 91
CHAPTER 3 - THE EXPERIENCES, COPING MECHANISMS AND IMPACT OF DEATH AND DYING ON PALLIATIVE MEDICINE SPECIALISTS

1 Abstract

2 Introduction

3 Methodology

3.1 Interviews

3.2 Participants

3.3 Data analysis

4 Results

4.1 Being with the dying

4.2 Being affected by death and dying [positively and negatively]

4.3 Adjusting to the impact of death and dying

5 Discussion

CHAPTER 4 - ON THE EMOTIONAL CONNECTION OF MEDICAL SPECIALISTS DEALING WITH DEATH AND DYING: A QUALITATIVE STUDY OF ONCOLOGISTS, SURGEONS, INTENSIVE CARE SPECIALISTS AND PALLIATIVE MEDICINE SPECIALISTS

1 Abstract

2 Introduction

3 Methodology

3.1 Research perspective

3.2 Interviews

3.3 Data collection

3.4 Participants

3.5 Data Analysis

4 Results

4.1 Getting emotionally involved
5.1 Methodological strengths ................................................................. 171
5.2 Methodological limitations ............................................................ 172
6 Suggestions for future research ....................................................... 174

APPENDICES ......................................................................................... 176
1 Appendix 1. Reviewers’ comments to Paper One (Chapter 2) .......... 177
2 Appendix 2. Reviewers’ comments to Paper Two (Chapter 3) .......... 181
3 Appendix 3. Reviewers’ comments to Paper Three (Chapter 4) ...... 183
4 Appendix 4. Paper Four .................................................................. 184

REFERENCES ....................................................................................... 190
Acknowledgements

My deepest gratitude lies with my supervisors. For their guidance, knowledge, experience, expertise and ideas, and perhaps most importantly, for the freedom they granted me to make the choices that have made me a confident, independent researcher. For their understanding that life exists outside one’s candidature, thus making it possible for me to live important life moments in parallel to my doctoral studies. For always demanding the best of me. In particular, to Professor Anna Chur-Hansen for her open door policy, assurance, continuous support, and friendship. To A/Professor Gregory B. Crawford for his support, trust, and attention to detail.

To everyone else who in one way or another have influenced this process. In particular to the University of Adelaide for awarding me with the Scholarship that made this work possible. To Ann Francis, who never hesitated to give prompt support and for her kindness. To Dr. Jairo Moyano and Dr. Carlos Guerrero: without my time at Hospital Universitario Fundación Santafe De Bogotá, I would not have had access to the experiences, patients, and medical practitioners to which I owe my professional interests and development.
To my sister and extended family in Colombia, for their support and understanding over the distance. To my Adelaidean friends, my family away from home: thank you for welcoming me and making me feel at home, as if we had known each other for years; I am grateful for the times shared together. My Colombian friends have also been part of this endeavour; I am glad that our friendship has remained strong through the years.

To my parents, Sofía and Ricardo, for being the constant example in my life, for providing the best experiences and education, for opening the world to me, believing in me, and believing in my dreams. For their support over the distance, which is every day more valuable because we miss each other constantly.

To my now husband, then boyfriend, Lewis. Who perhaps understood me the most as a PhD candidate himself. To our late nights, early mornings, busy weekends, working holidays, but also for all the fun, company, encouragement, love, and support that we’ve shared. I am grateful for your support when things seemed upside down, but most importantly, for making me happy.

To those close to me who have died and from whom I learnt significant lessons, here is hoping that your legacy is honoured.
Abstract

This thesis explores the experiences with death and dying of medical specialists who frequently deal with patients with life-threatening illnesses. Thirty-three participants from Surgery, Oncology, Intensive Care, and Palliative Medicine responded to interviews that lasted between 29 and 105 min, with an average length of 48 min. The interviews were analysed thematically. Measures to preserve qualitative rigour were employed from the initial stages of the process until the writing of the results.

From the thematic analysis, four areas were chosen as a focus for the thesis, each was the subject of a separate paper: a) the experiences of surgeons, b) the experiences of palliative medicine specialists, c) the emotional connection as developed in the four specialties, and d) an analysis of commonalities and differences between specialties in how they experienced the death of their patients.

Surgeons’ experiences and coping mechanisms, as described in Paper One, were influenced by personality traits favoured in surgical practice, such as distancing from patients. In contrast, participants from cancer surgery displayed a proclivity towards developing a closer relationship with their patients. Sources of support, particularly peer support, were not considered essential.
Palliative medicine specialists were the focus of Paper Two. These participants highlighted the role of emotions, and emphasised their ability to derive positive meaning from their work. Religion was identified as a coping mechanism, and differences were identified in relation to those participants with no religious affiliation. The homogeneity of participants’ experiences was attributed to aspects that may refer to the philosophy of practice within palliative care.

Paper Three drew on the emotional connection that developed between participants from all four specialties and their patients. Ambivalence about developing or refraining from establishing an emotional connection with their patients was the central theme. To reconcile the ambivalence, some participants resorted to finding a balance in their exchanges with patients, but tended to employ strategies that invalidated their emotional reactions. Other participants preferred an approach where they reaffirmed the emotional nature of working with dying patients.

The common themes amongst the four specialties were the subject of the fourth paper. These themes were related to two overarching aspects: participants’ professional practice, and the impact of their professional role on their personal lives. Professional practice aspects were related to frequent exposure to death and dying, limited training opportunities, decision-making process, and the delivery of bad news. The impact of the professional roles on personal lives was related to these medical specialists’ experience of emotional uncertainty, individual differences (e.g. gender, years of medical practice), the impact of dealing with death and dying of their patients, and how they deal with death and dying without support.

The findings presented in this thesis may be valuable in the development of strategies to support medical practitioners to deal with common aspects of medical practice, such as the recognition of one’s and others’ emotions, as well as to enhance
learning opportunities through medical training. Furthermore, the results suggest that the focus of research should be widened from death itself, to experiences during practitioners’ entire contact with patients approaching death, particularly from when an impending death is acknowledged.
Statement of Originality of the Work

I, Sofia Carolina Zambrano Ramos, hereby declare that this work contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution, and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, it contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text.

I acknowledge that copyright of published works contained within this thesis (as listed below) resides with the copyright holder(s) of those works.

I give consent to this copy of my thesis when deposited in the University Library, being made available for loan and photocopying, subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.

I also give permission for the digital version of my thesis to be made available on the web, via the University's digital research repository, the Library catalogue, the Australasian Digital Theses Program (ADTP) and also through web search engines, unless permission has been granted by the University to restrict access for a period of time.

1.1 List of publications contained in this thesis

Zambrano, S.C., Chur-Hansen, A. & Crawford, G.B. (2012). The experiences, coping mechanisms and impact of death and dying on palliative medicine specialists. (Accepted for publication in Palliative & Supportive Care, July 2012)

1.2 List of conference presentations based on the thesis


1.3 List of poster presentations based on the thesis

What can we learn from oncologists’ experiences with death and dying?


______________________   Sofía C. Zambrano R.   Date: _________________
Preamble

To the reader,

As you read this thesis, I would like you to note that this thesis is formatted as a ‘thesis by publication’, comprising four articles, an Introduction and a Conclusion that draws the work together. Secondly, please note that my advocacy for a palliative care approach in the care of the dying can be evidenced early in the text. I am a registered Colombian psychologist, with clinical and research experience in psychological aspects of palliative care. While you are reading this thesis, you are asked to consider the thesis in the context of these two issues.