A “nihilistic dreamboat to negation”? 

The cultural study of death metal and the limits of political criticism

Michelle Phillipov

Thesis submitted for the degree of 
Doctor of Philosophy
Discipline of English
University of Adelaide
October 2008
CONTENTS

Contents ....................................................................................................................... II
Abstract ....................................................................................................................... IV
Declaration ............................................................................................................... VI
Acknowledgements ..................................................................................... VII

Introduction .............................................................................................................. 1
  From heavy to extreme metal .................................................................................. 9
  The politics of cultural studies .............................................................................. 20
  Towards an understanding of musical pleasure .................................................... 34

Chapter 1

Popular music studies and the search for the “new punk”: punk, hip hop and dance music .......................................................................................... 38
  Punk studies and the persistence of politics ............................................................ 39
  The “new punk”: rap and hip hop ......................................................................... 57
  Electronic dance music and the politicisation of pleasure ........................................ 75

Chapter 2

“A promise unfulfilled”: critics evaluate heavy and extreme metal .......................... 93
  Metal and deindustrialisation ................................................................................. 95
  Spectacles of “heroic individualism”? Rethinking virtuosity ................................... 103
  Masculine domination and the problem of gender ................................................. 109
  The “politics of depoliticization” .......................................................................... 116
  Rethinking heavy and extreme metal .................................................................... 123
Cultural studies analyses have consistently viewed heavy and extreme metal as less culturally significant, less empowering for fans and less worthy of study than other major genres of popular music. Metal has been viewed as a reactionary and unproductive encounter with anger, aggression and alienation: a “nihilistic dreamboat to negation”. Underlying critics’ objections to metal is a discomfort about the genre’s apparent lack of commitment to progressive political values. In the cultural study of popular music, pleasures not easily understood in terms of ‘politics’ have been viewed with suspicion by a discipline seeking wider political agendas in all musical and subcultural practices.

This thesis explores cultural studies’ marginalisation of metal by examining the critical literature on death metal, an ‘extreme’ variant of the genre that is particularly resistant to the kinds of political readings conventionally performed by progressive critics. Death metal bands frequently transgress social taboos, presenting as pleasurable or comedic material that is conventionally considered to be ethically and/or politically problematic. The kinds of listening pleasures that this material may offer independently of conventional ‘political’ concerns remain largely unexplored in the critical literature in the field.
Via an examination and critique of the major critical approaches to heavy and extreme metal, as well as interpretation and analysis of the musical and lyrical conventions of two key death metal bands, this thesis will explore ways of reading death metal that are, in a sense, ‘beyond’ political criticism. In particular, I suggest that death metal’s apparent disengagement from politics need not be seen as a deficiency but as something which invites particular kinds of listening pleasure; in fact, one of the pleasures that death metal offers its listeners is the opportunity to disengage the literal content of musical texts from their ‘real’ social values, practices and beliefs. As a result, any reluctance to use this music as a platform for political engagement need not be seen as a deficiency or oversight to be changed in the interests of a more politically engaged practice, but an important dimension of the pleasures of death metal to be thought with. Analysis of the musical and lyrical specificities of death metal song texts is a productive starting point for expanding the critical vocabulary of death metal scholarship for a more effective theorisation of death metal music.
DECLARATION

This work contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other
degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my
knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another
person, except where due reference has been made in the text.

I give consent to this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University Library,
being available for loan and photocopying.

Michelle Phillipov
23 October 2008
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to acknowledge the assistance of my supervisors, past and present: Mandy Treagus for her guidance, advice and support throughout the course of the project; Greg Hainge for his commitment and enthusiasm during the project’s formative phase; Phil Butterss for his encouragement, care and tact during the initial stages of my candidature; and Heather Kerr for her thoughtful and thorough feedback on the final draft. Special appreciation also goes to Simon Koop for his assistance with the musical analysis. In addition, I would like to acknowledge the Discipline of English, University of Adelaide, and in particular: Joy McEntee, Jon Dale and Ken Ruthven for their advice, guidance and support over the past four years; and Shirley Ball, Sue Mleczko, Michelle Lai and Helen Payne for their care and helpfulness in administrative matters. My appreciation to Sue Yell and the referees at Southern Review for feedback that was provided at a crucial stage of the project; Andy Bennett for his time and advice during the initial phases of my work; George Phillipov for the last-minute proof-reading; and, of course, to my parents for all their assistance, support and encouragement.

Parts of this thesis have been published under the following titles:
