
By

Osadebamwen Anthony Ogbeide
BSc, MSc Agribusiness. MBA

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

School of Agriculture, Food and Wine
Faculty of Science
The University of Adelaide
December 2013
Dedication

This doctoral research effort is dedicated to my late father, Anointed Elder Jacob Omoruyi Ogbeide, who paved the way for me to take hold of every opportunity that has come my way and to my family, who have endured sacrifice and hardship over time to ensure this successful outcome.
Acknowledgement

I thank my God and Lord, Jesus Christ from whom all good things come, for keeping me alive, giving me the wisdom and health to go through the PhD candidature. To God alone I ascribe all the glory.

I am grateful to my supervisors Associate Professor Christopher Ford and Professor Randy Stringer, for their expertise, guidance, encouragement and support throughout the challenging period of the PhD candidature. Words are not enough to express my heartfelt gratitude to them. Special thanks to Dr Cameron Grant for the moral and administrative support he provided in the challenging days of my candidature. My thanks also go to Dr Simone Mueller Loose, Adjunct Associate Professor Tony Spawton and Professor Aron O’Cass and his research group for their comments, remarks and feedback on my methodology and other processes in the study. To Dr Lynne Giles I owe a great debt of appreciation for all the assistance she provided for my data analysis. Not forgotten are my research group members Tey Yeong Sheng, Le Dang, Poppy Arsil and Tri Nugroho for moral and academic support along with intellectual idea sharing and contribution to discussions in the study room, seminars and presentations. I also thank my colleague Ervin Sim for the support he provided me in transferring the questionnaire into an online platform.

This work owes a profound debt of appreciation to the experts who made available their time and knowledge in the course of writing this thesis through monthly workshops on research writing. Special thanks to Dr Ron Smernik and Dr Margaret Cargill. Finally I acknowledge Mr Adam Jarvis and Ms Skye Greig for editing this thesis, Ms Maria Pasin and Mr David Livingston for the administrative support they provided to this study.
Declaration

I certify that this work contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in my name, in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text. In addition, I certify that no part of this work will, in the future, be used in a submission in my name, for any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution without the prior approval of the University of Adelaide and where applicable, any partner institution responsible for the joint-award of this degree.

I give consent to this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University Library, being made available for loan and photocopying, subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.

I also give permission for the digital version of my thesis to be made available on the web, via the University’s digital research repository, the Library Search and also through web search engines, unless permission has been granted by the University to restrict access for a period of time.

Waite Campus, November 2013

Osadebamwen A. Ogbeide
Abstract

This thesis investigates two major topics independently with outcomes that stand alone but can have influence on each other. Australian consumers’ interest in the consumption of organic products is increasing as they are receptive to the perceived health and environmental benefits that are linked to them. However, producers and consumers face challenges understanding the value of the health and environmental attributes. While consumers and producers express interest in organics, gaps exist in their common interest. Producers require premiums for their products to compensate for potential higher production costs or lower yields. Understanding how much consumers are willing to pay (WTP) for the benefits related to organic products is a challenge.

The role of expert service in wine retailing is important. Many studies document the value information provision creates in purchase situations. This service provision to consumers is a key factor encouraging purchase decisions and gaining interest and engagement. It can be important for retailers to provide an environment that extends this service to consumers. Training employees in wine knowledge is vital as they form the frontline between the wine purchase and the consumers. This service comes with a cost that is usually passed on to consumers and it is of interest to determine consumer willingness to absorb this cost.

The primary objectives of the study are twofold: (1) to determine which factors affect consumers’ willingness to pay an additional ‘premium’ price for organic wines benefits, and (2) to determine which factors affect consumers’ willingness to pay a premium for the expert services that retail wine stores provide in increasing consumer wine knowledge generally including the health and environmental considerations of organic wines. An online survey was carried out in all the states and territories of Australia. Respondents were obtained from
IMPACTLIST mailing list by random selection of list members that met the pre-requisite criteria. The potential respondents were emailed a questionnaire through the Adelaide Qualtrics online data collection software. The Stata 12 statistical software was used to analyse the sample and variable frequency statistics, factor analysis of the variables used for the regression model and the ordered probit regression and marginal effect analyses.

On average, the premiums or willingness to pay (WTP) respondents indicated were approximately 23% for both environmental (WTPe) and health (WTPh) benefits. The expert service provision is usually free or nonexistent in retail stores; therefore no price reference exists for the base price and was assumed to be $0.00. For the expert service of the sales outlets (WTPs), respondents indicated WTP of $0.60. The proposed hypotheses were tested using the ordered probit model and all except two were accepted. The social demographic variables presented a mixed outcome.

Overall for WTPe, consumers’ knowledge of organic wine was found to be significant, and will determine the WTPe of organic wines. The marginal effect of knowledge indicated that the probability of paying $0.00 premium for environmental benefit decreased as the knowledge of consumers about organic wine increased. For WTPh, the relationship between knowledge and WTP was similar in direction to WTPe but different in magnitude. The consumers’ motive indicated negative significance to WTPe and was not significant but positive for WTPh.

The consumer attitude was positive and significant in WTPe and WTPh and an increase in the consumers’ attitude decreases the unwillingness to pay premium for both environmental and health benefits. However, the consumer perceived risk was negative and significant in WTPe and WTPh. The consumers’ perceived risk was not significant in determining WTPs. For WTPe, WTPh and WTPs, risk reduction strategy was positive and significant in determining WTP.
The study further shows that 66.0% of respondents had purchased organic wine prior to the survey. However, questions about their knowledge of the environmental and health considerations associated with organic wines indicated that most consumers were lacking in organic product knowledge. This implies that sensitisation and enlightenment programs that are geared toward these factors may be effective in helping consumers move toward more organic wine consumption.

From this study, it is of note that the environmental and health attributes weigh differently in the consumers’ mind, and this influences their willingness and the amount of premium to be paid. The study acknowledges this and measured the WTP a premium for these attributes instead of the product itself. It was found that more consumers are willing to pay for the health attribute than an environmental one, and would pay somewhat higher premium for the former. It is the study recommendation that the distinctive attributes of the organic product should be used to measure consumer WTP rather than the present situation, in which organic wines are considered a commodity. Another contribution is the investigation of the WTP a premium for expert service provided by retail sale outlets. Previous studies emphasise the importance of service in differentiating retail sale outlets and creating customers’ relationships. This study investigates and measures consumers’ WTP for expert service provision in Australia and the factors that impact on consumers’ need for expert service.

**Keywords:** Consumer; Environmental; Expert service; Health; Organic; Premium; Wine; WTP.
Table of Contents

Dedication ............................................................................................................................. ii
Acknowledgement .............................................................................................................. iii
Declaration ............................................................................................................................ iv
Abstract ................................................................................................................................ v
Table of Contents ................................................................................................................ viii
List of Figures ........................................................................................................................ xv
List of Appendices ............................................................................................................... xvii
List of Symbols and Abbreviations .................................................................................... xvii

Chapter One ......................................................................................................................... 1

1. Introduction .................................................................................................................... 1
   1.1 The aim and objectives of the study ........................................................................... 7
   1.2 Background and Overview ....................................................................................... 7
      1.2.1 Snapshot of disciplines and concepts relevant to the study ................................. 8
      1.2.2 The effects of conventional production chemicals on consumers ....................... 9
      1.2.3 Sustainable production of food and drinks ....................................................... 9
      1.2.4 Global wine consumption and perception ..................................................... 11
   1.3 Contributions of the study ....................................................................................... 13
   1.4 Outline of the Thesis ............................................................................................... 14

Chapter Two ......................................................................................................................... 16

Literature Review ............................................................................................................... 16

   2.1 Introduction .............................................................................................................. 16
   2.2 Product in the context of the study .......................................................................... 16
      2.2.1. Products communicate desirability to consumer ............................................ 17
   2.3 Wine and its importance ........................................................................................... 17
      2.3.1 How wines are assessed by consumers ............................................................ 18
      2.3.2 Organic production and marketing ................................................................... 20
         2.3.2.1 A snapshot of the organic movement ......................................................... 20
         2.3.2.2 The organic market and its complexity ....................................................... 21
            2.3.2.2.1 Organic: the definitions and claims are confusing ................................. 23
            2.3.2.2.1.1 Sustainability is important to the future of organic wine consumption 25
            2.3.2.2.1.2 Organic: the health claims are diverse and often conflicting .............. 26
            2.3.2.2.1.3 Organic: the perception of the environmental claims is also diverse .... 27
            2.3.2.2.2 Attributes of organic wines are valued differently .............................. 28
2.3.2.2.3 The certification processes of organic product are concerning ............................. 28
2.4 Consumers’ behaviour in products and services acquisition are different .......................... 29
2.5 Importance of social demographics on willingness to pay premiums for products and services 30
2.6 Consumer needs and motivation ...................................................................................... 32
2.7 The role of product knowledge in the acquisition process .................................................. 34
2.8 Attitudes of consumers towards a product ........................................................................ 34
2.9 Risk and its importance .................................................................................................. 36
    2.9.1 The concept of risk perception .................................................................................. 36
    2.9.1.1 Consumer perception of risk ............................................................................... 37
    2.9.1.2 The importance of perceived risk ....................................................................... 38
    2.9.1.3 The importance of perceived risk in wine ............................................................. 38
    2.9.1.4 The measurement models for perceived risk .......................................................... 38
    2.9.2 Management of perceived risk: Risk reduction strategy .............................................. 39
    2.9.2.1 Risk reduction in wine .......................................................................................... 40
2.10 Retail transformation and values delivery ........................................................................ 42
2.11 Introduction to willingness to pay .................................................................................. 45
    2.11.1 Price in relation to payment for purchase .................................................................. 45
    2.11.2 Determining willingness to pay .............................................................................. 46
    2.11.2.1 Consumer willingness to pay .............................................................................. 47
    2.11.3 Determining WTP for organic product and store service ........................................ 49
    2.11.3.1 Revealed preference .......................................................................................... 49
    2.11.3.2 Stated preference .................................................................................................. 50
        2.11.3.2.1 Conjoint analysis ....................................................................................... 50
        2.11.3.2.2 Contingent valuation method (CVM) ............................................................ 51
        2.11.3.2.3 Offers of products ........................................................................................ 52
    2.12 Theoretical framework .................................................................................................. 54
2.13 Statement of research objectives and questions ................................................................. 60
    2.13.1 Hypotheses .............................................................................................................. 61
Chapter Three ......................................................................................................................... 66
Methodology ............................................................................................................................ 66
    3.1 Introduction ..................................................................................................................... 66
    3.2 Questionnaire design ..................................................................................................... 66
        3.2.1 The Structure of the questionnaire (Sources of variables) ....................................... 68
        3.2.2 The design layout of the questionnaire .................................................................. 69
3.3 Research area ........................................................................................................... 75
3.4 Procedure for data collection .................................................................................. 76
  3.4.1 The Research data ............................................................................................. 76
3.4.2 Survey method ..................................................................................................... 77
3.4.3 Sampling method .................................................................................................. 78
3.4.4 The sample frame and size ................................................................................ 79
3.4.5 Survey pilot .......................................................................................................... 81
3.4.6 Collection of data and questionnaire administration ........................................ 82
3.4.7 Data quality and security .................................................................................... 83
3.5 Data screening for completeness and consistency .................................................... 83
3.6 Coding ....................................................................................................................... 84
3.7 Ethical consideration ............................................................................................... 84
3.8 Statistical tools, empirical models and procedures for data analysis ..................... 85
  3.8.1 Factors purification using principal components analysis .................................. 87
  3.8.2 Reliability test ..................................................................................................... 88
  3.8.3 Summation scale scores .................................................................................... 88
  3.8.4 Ordered probit model ....................................................................................... 89
  3.8.5 Marginal analysis ............................................................................................... 92
  3.8.6 Discriminant analysis ....................................................................................... 92
3.9 Study appraisal ......................................................................................................... 94
  3.9.1 Academic visits .................................................................................................. 94
  3.9.2 Conferences, seminars and workshops Attendance ........................................ 94
3.10 Conclusion ............................................................................................................. 95

Chapter Four .................................................................................................................. 96

Result and Discussion: Sampling, Sample and Variable Descriptive Statistics ................ 96
  4.1 Introduction ............................................................................................................. 96
  4.2 Result of data screening ......................................................................................... 96
  4.3 Sample description ................................................................................................. 98
  4.4 Descriptive statistics of the variables .................................................................... 101
  4.4.1. Consumer information and knowledge of health and environment .................. 101
  4.4.2. Consumer information and knowledge of organic wine .................................. 102
  4.4.3 Current wine acquisition practices .................................................................... 104
  4.4.3.1 How often do consumers drink wine? ......................................................... 104
  4.4.3.2 Factors that influence the purchase decision in wine .................................. 105
4.4.4 Consumer motivation towards organic wine ............................................. 108
4.4.5 Respondents’ attitude towards organic wine ........................................... 110
4.4.6 Respondents’ perceived risk towards organic wine ................................. 111
4.4.6.1 Respondents’ perceived risk towards organic wine: Likelihood ............... 111
4.4.6.2 Respondents’ perceived risk about organic wine: Seriousness ............... 113
4.4.7 Respondents’ risk reduction strategy ...................................................... 114
4.4.7.1 Respondents’ risk reduction strategy (Intrinsic product related) ............... 114
4.4.7.2 Respondents’ risk reduction strategy (Extrinsic product related) .......... 115
4.4.7.3 Respondents’ risk reduction strategy (Store related) ......................... 117
4.5 Respondents’ willingness to pay (WTP) ................................................. 119
4.6 Discussion of sample and variables statistics .......................................... 121

Chapter Five .................................................................................................. 126
Result and Discussion on Willingness to Pay for the Environmental Benefit of Organic Wine ......................................................... 126
5.1 Introduction ............................................................................................... 126
5.2 Willingness to pay for the environmental benefit of organic wine ............... 126
5.3 Willingness to pay a premium for the environmental benefit of organic wine - Discriminant analysis .................................................. 128
5.4 Characteristics of consumers’ willingness and unwillingness to pay a premium for the environmental benefit of organic wine ............. 129
5.5 Ordered probit regression ......................................................................... 130
5.5.1 Result of factor analysis and reliability test ........................................... 130
5.6 Ordered probit regression and marginal analysis results ................................ 132
5.6.1 Ordered probit regression result ............................................................. 132
5.6.2 Marginal analysis result ........................................................................ 134
5.7 The Hypotheses ......................................................................................... 136
5.8 Discussion ................................................................................................. 142

Chapter Six .................................................................................................... 144
Willingness to Pay for the Health Benefits of Organic Wine: Results and Discussion ................................................................. 144
6.1 Introduction ............................................................................................... 144
6.2 Ranking of health benefits by respondents ................................................. 144
6.3 Willingness to pay for the health benefits of organic wine ....................... 145
6.3.1 The Premium respondents are willing to pay for the health benefits of organic wine: Results .............................................................. 146
6.4 Willingness to pay premium for health benefit of organic wine - discriminant analysis ....... 147
List of Tables

Table 3.1 Grouping of variables, measurement tools and the number of items in each variable
Table 4.1 Demographic Profile of Sample
Table 4.2 Descriptive Statistics for consumer information and knowledge of health and environment
Table 4.3 Descriptive Statistics for consumer information and knowledge of organic wine
Table 4.4 Respondents’ ranking of the importance of environmental benefit of wine
Table 4.5 Respondents’ ranking of the importance of health benefit of wine
Table 4.6 Descriptive Statistics for respondents’ motivation towards organic wine
Table 4.7 Respondents’ attitude towards organic wine
Table 4.8 Descriptive Statistics for respondents’ perception of risk (likelihood)
Table 4.9 Descriptive Statistics for respondents’ perception of risk (seriousness)
Table 4.10 Descriptive Statistics for respondents’ risk reduction strategy (intrinsic product related)
Table 4.11 Descriptive Statistics for respondents’ risk reduction strategy (extrinsic product related)
Table 4.12 Descriptive Statistics for respondents’ risk reduction strategy (store related)
Table 4.13 Cross-tabulation of Social Demographic variables and Latent variables: Chi Square Test Result
Table 5.1 Tests of significance of all canonical correlations for WTPe
Table 5.2 Factors that differentiate consumers willing and those unwilling to pay for environmental benefits of organic wine
Table 5.3 Factor analysis and reliability test
Table 5.4 Results of ordered probit analysis of consumers’ WTP for environmental benefit of organic wine
Table 5.5 Summary of outcome of hypotheses testing – WTPe

Table 6.1 Respondents’ ranking of the importance of health benefit of organic wine in their purchase decision

Table 6.2 Tests of significance of all canonical correlations for WTPh

Table 6.3 Factors that differentiate consumers willing and those unwilling to pay for health benefits of organic wine

Table 6.4 Results of ordered probit analysis of consumers’ WTP for ‘health benefits’ (WINE B)

Table 6.5 Summary of outcome of hypotheses testing – WTPh

Table 7.1 Respondents’ ranking of the ability of sales outlets to provide assistance during wine purchase

Table 7.2 Tests of significance of all canonical correlations for WTPs

Table 7.3 Difference between respondents willing to pay and those unwilling to pay premium for WTPs

Table 7.4 Results of ordered probit analysis of consumers’ WTP for the expert service rendered by wine sales outlet

Table 7.5 Summary of outcome of hypotheses testing – WTPs

Table 7.6 Chi Square test of relationship between WTPs and WTPs and, WTPh and WTPs

Table 8.1 Important Findings relating to the Hypotheses

**List of Figures**

Figure 1.1 Top 10 Wine consuming countries

Figure 2.1 Conceptual framework showing factors influencing willingness to pay for the attributes of organic wine
Figure 2.2 Conceptual framework showing factors influencing willingness to pay for the expert service rendered by wine retail sales outlets

Figure 3.1 Maps of Australian wine regions

Figure 3.2 Causal relationships between each of the independent variable and the corresponding dependent variable

Figure 3.3 Causal relationships between each of the independent variable and WTPs

Figure 4.1 Respondents' frequency of wine consumption

Figure 4.1a Cross tabulation of educational qualification and frequency of wine consumption

Figure 4.2 Ranking of decision factors in wine purchase

Figure 4.3 Percentage of respondents that have made previous purchases of organic wine

Figure 4.4 Cross tabulation: Respondents' educational qualification and past purchase of organic wine

Figure 5.1 Willingness to pay for the environmental benefit of organic wine

Figure 5.2 Result of Premium respondents are willing to pay for the environmental benefit of organic wine

Figure 5.3 Marginal effects of attitude on WTPe

Figure 5.4 Marginal Effects of Perceived Risk and Risk Reduction Strategy on WTPe

Figure 5.5 Marginal effects of knowledge of organic wine on WTPe

Figure 6.1 Willingness to pay for health benefit of organic wine

Figure 6.2 Premium consumers are willing to pay for health benefit of organic wine

Figure 6.3 Marginal effects of attitude on WTPh

Figure 6.4 Marginal effects of knowledge of organic wine and consumer's motivation on WTPh

Figure 6.5 Marginal effects of perceived risk and risk reduction strategy on WTPh

Figure 7.1 Ranking of stores’ ability to provide assistance to wine shoppers
Figure 7.2 Respondents willingness to pay for the expert service of wine retailers
Figure 7.3 The amount respondents are willing to pay for the expert service rendered by wine retail store

**List of Appendices**

Appendix 1 Letter of introduction and consent
Appendix 2 Survey Questionnaire
Appendix 3 Ranking of factors that influence wine purchase decision
Appendix 4 Ranking of retail store where purchase is made based on ability to provide useful assistance to consumers
Appendix 5 Respondents’ frequency of wine consumption
Appendix 6 Respondents’ willingness to pay (WTPe, WTPh and WTPs)
Appendix 7 Premium respondents are willing to pay
Appendix 8 Scale items and their sources
Appendix 9 Ordered probit model using summated RRS (RRS_A) to determine WTP for expert service provided by retail store
Appendix 10 Gender delimited demographic profile of sample
Appendix 11 Number of certified client by supply chain and year 2002-2011
Appendix 12 Estimated number of certified organic operators by state 2002-2011
Appendix 13 Total area certified in Australia 2002-2011
Appendix 14 The theoretical model, hypotheses outcome and the direction for WTPe and WTPh
Appendix 14a The theoretical model, hypotheses outcome and the direction for WTPs
Appendix 15 Cross-tabulation of Social Demographic variables and Latent variables: Chi Square Test Result
Appendix 16 Organic Agriculture: Key Indicators and Leading Countries
Appendix 17 Retail value growth of organic products in Australia
List of Symbols and Abbreviations

ATTITUDE Summated score for attitude
PACIV_RK Summated score for perceived risk
RRS_A Summated score for risk reduction strategy
MOTI Summated score for motivation (three scale items)
MOTIV Summated score for motivation (four scale items)
KNOWOW Summated score for knowledge of organic wine
AUD, $ Australian dollar
BFA Biological Farmers of Australia
Bach Bachelor degree
CSM Canonical structure matrix
CVM Contingent Valuation Method
DA Discriminant analysis
DAFF Department of Agriculture, Fisheries and Forestry
DC-CVM Dichotomous Choice Contingent Valuation Method
EU European Union
FSANZ Food Standards Australia New Zealand
GMO Genetically modified organism
HSC Higher school certificate
IFOAM International Federation of Organic Agriculture Movements
INC Importance of consequences of negative occurrence
ITR Item response theory
Mhl Million hectolitres
mhl Thousand hectolitres
MSA Measure of sample adequacy
Mast Master Degree
NOAA National Ocean and Atmospheric Association
NR Number right
OM Organic Movement
OIV International Organisation of Vine and Wine
PGd Post graduate diploma
PhD Doctor of philosophy
PR Potential respondents
PNC Probability of negative consequences occurrence
RRS Risk Reduction Strategy
SA South Australia
SI Situational Involvement
SS Summated scale or score
SLC School leaving certificate
TAFE Technical and further education
UK United Kingdom
USD United State dollar
USDA United State Department of Agriculture
USP unique selling proposition
WHO World Health Organisation
WTP Willingness to pay
WTPe Willingness to pay a premium for the environmental benefit
WTPh Willingness to pay a premium for the health benefit
WTPs Willingness to pay a premium for store (expert service provided by sales outlet)