

**Exploring the experiences of first time  
fatherhood and paternal postnatal  
depression:  
A grounded theory analysis revealing the  
importance of the concept of 'coping'**

**KARINA BRIA**  
RN, RM, BN, Master of Midwifery

June 2013

Discipline of General Practice  
School of Population Health & Clinical Practice  
School of Psychology  
Discipline of Gender, Work and Social Inquiry  
The University of Adelaide

Thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the  
Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

NOTE: Pagination of the digital copy does not correspond with  
the pagination of the print copy

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF TABLES .....	VII
LIST OF FIGURES .....	VIII
LIST OF APPENDICES .....	IX
ABSTRACT .....	XII
PUBLICATIONS .....	XIII
DECLARATION .....	XIV
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS .....	XV
CHAPTER 1 – FIRST TIME FATHERS AND PATERNAL POSTNATAL	
DEPRESSION .....	1
1.0 Introduction .....	1
1.1 Contemporary experiences of fatherhood .....	4
1.2 Depression	
1.3 Masculinity, male depression and fatherhood .....	6
1.3.1 Men, depression and suicide	
1.4 Postnatal depression	
1.5 Scientific research and paternal depression .....	20
1.5.1. Predictors of paternal depression .....	21
1.5.2 Research methods to investigate paternal depression .....	22
1.5.3 Duration of paternal depression .....	23
1.5.4 Assessment of paternal depression .....	24
1.5.5 The need for a gender-specific questionnaire .....	25
1.6 What is unique to this research? .....	25
1.7 Theoretical framework for this research .....	26
1.8 Purpose and significance of this research .....	27
1.9 Initial research proposal .....	28
1.9.1 Final research proposal .....	29
1.10 Assumptions .....	30
1.11 Outline of this thesis .....	30
CHAPTER 2 – LITERATURE REVIEW .....	33

2.0 Introduction.....	33
2.1 A search of the research literature .....	34
2.2 Paternal postnatal depression.....	40
2.3 Prevalence of postnatal depression in fathers .....	42
2.4 Predictors for paternal depression.....	45
2.5 Paternal mental health and its affect on the father-infant relationship .....	50
2.6 Assessment tools for perinatal depression .....	52
2.6.1 Edinburgh Postnatal Depression Scale .....	54
2.7 Gaps in the research on paternal depression .....	55
2.8 Identifiable patterns in the research literature.....	57
2.8.1 Other findings identified in the research literature .....	57
2.8.2 Convergence and agreement in the research literature .....	58
2.9 Summary .....	59
 CHAPTER 3 – THEROETICAL FRAMEWORK.....	 60
3.0 Introduction.....	60
3.1 Research question .....	60
3.2 Research design .....	62
3.3 Using two methods of inquiry.....	63
3.4 The discovery of grounded theory .....	65
3.5 Constructivist grounded theory.....	66
3.6 Using grounded theory methodology.....	67
3.7 Data collection .....	68
3.7.1 In-depth interviewing.....	68
3.7.2 Stages of the interview process.....	69
3.7.3 Role of the interviewer.....	71
3.7.4 Probes and prompts.....	73
3.8 Coding the data .....	74
3.8.1 Memo writing and diagrams .....	75
3.8.2 Constant comparative analysis.....	76
3.8.3 Theoretical sampling.....	76
3.9 Rigour in qualitative research .....	77
3.9.1 Discussion of emergent findings with advisory group	
3.9.2 Peer debriefing	
3.9.3 Presentations	

3.9.4 Prolonged engagement	
3.9.5 Recording the data objectively and comprehensively	
3.10 Summary .....	80
CHAPTER 4 - METHODS.....	81
4.0 Introduction.....	81
4.1 Ethical considerations .....	88
4.2 Recruitment.....	82
4.2.1 Response to media exposure .....	85
4.2.2 Information for potential participants .....	85
4.2.3 A need to broaden inclusion criteria .....	86
4.3 Selection of participants.....	87
4.4 The sample	
4.5 Self-selected sampling	
4.6 Commencement of interviews .....	91
4.6.1 Socio-demographic participant information .....	92
4.7 Qualitative data collection .....	95
4.8 Transcribing the data.....	97
4.9 Limitations to the qualitative method	
4.10 Summary .....	99
CHAPTER 5 – STAGE ONE - QUALITATIVE DATA ANALYSIS .....	100
5.0 Introduction.....	100
5.1 Transcribing interviews .....	100
5.2 Coding the data using grounded theory analysis .....	101
5.3 Theoretical sampling and saturation .....	101
5.4 Open coding .....	102
5.5 Using a data management tool.....	103
5.6 Developing themes and categories.....	104
5.7 Axial coding.....	105
5.8 Selective coding .....	107
5.9 Major categories and sub-categories.....	107
5.10 Core category: <b>Coping</b> .....	128
5.10.1 The concept of coping.....	130
5.10.2 Coping strategies.....	131
5.10.3 Coping with emotional distress and paternal depression .....	132

5.10.4 Coping and defining the role.....	135
5.10.5 Coping with changes to the relationship.....	136
5.10.6 Coping and the father-infant relationship.....	137
5.10.7 Coping with limited social support.....	137
5.10.8 Coping and work-life balance.....	140
5.11 Comparisons with existing research.....	140
5.12 Summary.....	142
<b>CHAPTER 6 – STAGE TWO – A FOUR PHASE QUANTITATIVE STUDY .....</b>	<b>144</b>
6.0 Introduction.....	144
6.1 Ethics approval.....	144
6.2 Flow chart of process.....	145
<b>PHASE ONE – ITEM CREATION AND REDUCTION .....</b>	<b>146</b>
6.3 Item creation.....	146
6.4 Criteria for item reduction.....	146
<b>PHASE TWO – RANKING OF ITEMS FOR FURTHER REDUCTION .....</b>	<b>148</b>
6.5 Introduction.....	148
6.6 Design of the survey.....	148
6.6.1 Likert response scale.....	149
6.6.2 Advantages of the survey.....	150
6.7 Recruitment of participants.....	150
6.7.1 Considerations.....	151
6.8 Ranking items in the survey.....	152
6.9 Survey responses.....	153
6.9.1 Results.....	154
6.9.2 Interpretation of the results.....	156
6.10 Summary.....	156
<b>PHASE THREE – SORT ITEMS .....</b>	<b>157</b>
6.11 Introduction.....	157
6.12 Q-Methodology.....	157
6.12.1 Modified Q-sort method.....	159
6.12.2 Themes for the Q-sort exercise.....	160
6.13 The modified Q-sort exercise.....	162
6.14 Results.....	163

6.15 Further reduction of items.....	164
6.16 Summary .....	165
PHASE FOUR – CONSTRUCT OF A DRAFT QUESTIONNAIRE .....	167
6.17 Introduction.....	167
6.18 Questionnaire design.....	167
6.19 Face validity.....	168
6.20 Construct of the first draft questionnaire .....	169
6.20.1 Second draft questionnaire.....	171
6.20.2 Third draft questionnaire.....	174
6.21 Pilot the draft questionnaire .....	176
6.22 Results.....	177
6.23 Strengths and Limitations	
6.24 Summary .....	179
CHAPTER 7– DISCUSSION.....	181
7.0 Introduction.....	181
7.1 Predictors of paternal depression .....	184
7.1.1 Changes to lifestyle	
7.1.2 Change to the couple's relationship	
7.1.3 Responsibility of fatherhood	
7.1.4 Unexpected feeding and health problems in the baby	
7.1.5 Limited social support	
7.2 Stage Two: Development of the Coping with New Fatherhood Questionnaire .....	194
7.3 Rigour and limitations of this research .....	195
7.4 Strengths of this research .....	197
7.5 Contributions of this research .....	198
7.6 Promotion and prevention in policy and practice .....	199
7.7 Directions for future research .....	201
7.8 Conclusion .....	202
APPENDICES .....	204
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS.....	255

## LIST OF TABLES

- 2.1 Studies included in the review of research literature in order of first author and in chronological order
- 4.6.1 Socio-demographic Participant Information
- 4.6.1 State, Metropolitan and Rural Demographic Information
- 4.6.1 Participants' Experiences with Depression and Anxiety
- 6.14 Frequency Table
- 6.15 Themes and Items Table

## **LIST OF FIGURES**

- 3.8 Coding Sequence for Data Analysis
- 5.4 Merged Codes with Similar Meaning
- 5.4 Codes to Create Preliminary Categories
- 5.7 Codes, Sub-categories and Preliminary Categories
- 5.10 Core Category
- 6.2 Flow Chart of Phases 1-4
- 6.12 Diagram of Example Q-sort

## LIST OF APPENDICES

- Appendix 1 Introduction Letter – Stage 1
- Appendix 2 Information sheet for participants – Stage 1
- Appendix 3 Consent form – Stage 1
- Appendix 4 Socio-demographic questionnaire – Stage 1
- Appendix 5 Socio-demographic data of interviewees – Stage 1
- Appendix 6a Interview Guide 1
- Appendix 6b Interview Guide 2
- Appendix 6c Interview Guide 3
- Appendix 7 Introduction letter for participants – Quantitative study – Stage 2
- Appendix 8 Consent form – Stage 2
- Appendix 9 Instruction sheet - Phase 2
- Appendix 10 Survey of items – Phase 2
- Appendix 11 Frequency table – Survey responses – Phase 2
- Appendix 12a Histogram – Fairly Irrelevant
- Appendix 12b Histogram – Entirely Irrelevant
- Appendix 12c Histogram – Merged Fairly & Entirely Irrelevant
- Appendix 13 Instruction sheet - Phase 3
- Appendix 14 List of items – Q-sort exercise – Phase 3
- Appendix 15 Table of items for Q-sort – Phase 3
- Appendix 16 Frequency table for Q-sort results – Phase 3
- Appendix 17 Information sheet – Pilot study – Phase 4
- Appendix 18 Draft Coping with New Fatherhood Questionnaire (CNFQ)
- Appendix 19 Feedback sheet – Phase 4

Appendix 20 Edinburgh Postnatal Depression Scale (EPDS)

Appendix 21 List of Abbreviations

- Appendix A Advertisement – Stage 1 recruitment
- Appendix B Media release - *The Adelaidean* 2007
- Appendix C ABC News 2007 ‘Australian research to explore postnatal depression in dads’.
- Appendix D ABC Transcripts 2007 ‘Paternity Blues: Adelaide researcher examines depression in dads’.
- Appendix E The Courier Mail 2007 ‘Dads miss out on postnatal support’.
- Appendix F Australian Associated Press General News 2007 ‘SA: Depression research on first time fathers’.
- Appendix F The Advertiser 2007 ‘Fathers get the ‘baby blues’.
- Appendix G Herald Sun 2007 ‘New dads get blues’.
- Appendix H ABC News 2007 ‘Australian research to explore postnatal depression in dads’.
- Appendix I Sun Herald 2008 ‘Daddy blues’.

## ABSTRACT

This longitudinal exploratory research was conducted to explore the experiences of first time fathers who self-identified through in-depth interviews as having experienced depression and/or anxiety or depressed mood in the first six months after the birth of their baby as well as their experiences with first time fatherhood more generally.

The research was conducted in two distinct but interconnected stages with the results of the first method (qualitative) used to inform the second method (quantitative). Stage one involves a qualitative approach to explore in-depth the experiences of first time fathers as well as the phenomenon of paternal postnatal depression. The tenets of grounded theory analysis were used to analyse the data and identified the emergent theory of '**cop**ing' comprised of all the emergent categories that provided an insight into the experiences of first time fathers in a specific context that provided a better understanding of the phenomenon from the participants' perspective

Stage two involves a quantitative approach in the collection of the data and was conducted in four phases. Each phase contributed to the development of the Coping with New Fatherhood Questionnaire (CNFQ), a gender-specific self-report questionnaire for application in future population-based research. In the fourth phase a small sub-set of participants from the qualitative research in stage one reviewed the questionnaire to provide feedback on the format, wording and purpose of the draft questionnaire to determine face validity. The author plans to continue as part of a post-doctoral research focus to further refine and pilot the CNFQ with a large population sample and assess the psychometric properties of the instrument.

## **PUBLICATIONS**

Karina Bria, Jan Pincombe and Maria Fedoruk. Incidence of paternal postpartum depression in new fathers. *British Journal of Midwifery*, June 2008, Vol 16, No 6 pp 398-402.

Pincombe J McKellar L Grech C Fedoruk M Bria K Grinter E Beresford G. Midwifery education in Australia; requirements for assessment. *British Journal of Midwifery*, 2007 15 (2) pp 98-105.

## **ABSTRACTS**

Bria K, Moulding N, Turnbull D, Ripper M, Barton C. Paternal Postnatal Depression in First Time Fathers. PHCRED Tri-State Collaboration Event Conference Proceedings. March 2007 (p16).

Bria K, Moulding N, Turnbull D, Ripper M, Barton C. Paternal postnatal depression in first-time fathers. SA Public Health and Health Promotion State Conference. 2007 Adelaide, Australia.

Bria K, Turnbull D, Ripper M, Barton C, Moulding N. Paternal postnatal depression in first time fathers. Program and Abstracts of the GP&PHC Conference 2008, Hobart Tasmania (p.63).

Bria K (Invited), Turnbull D, Ripper M, Barton C, Moulding N. Paternal Postnatal Depression in First Time Fathers. Preventing the Bough from Breaking: New Approaches To Postnatal Depression, Bonding And Attachment Conference, April 2008, Byron Bay, NSW.

Bria K, Turnbull D, Barton C. Paternal Postnatal Depression. 13<sup>th</sup> Annual Congress of the Perinatal Society of Australia & New Zealand (PSANZ) Conference April 2009, Darwin, NT.

Bria K, Turnbull D, Barton C. Paternal Postnatal Depression (PPND) in First Time Fathers: A Grounded Theory Analysis. GP&PHC Conference, 2009, Melbourne.

Bria K (Invited), Paternal Postnatal Depression in Fathers. Loving Life For 30 Years – Generations Of Caring Conference, Pregnancy Help Australia. August 2009, Adelaide.

Bria K, Turnbull D, Barton, Moulding N, Small R. Paternal Postnatal Depression in First Time Fathers: Research Outcomes for Phase 1 & 2 of a Four Phase Quantitative Research. Tri-State Primary Health Care Research Evaluation & Development Conference, September 2009, Alice Springs.

## DECLARATION

I certify that this work contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text. In addition, I certify that no part of this work will, in the future, be used in a submission for any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution without the prior approval of the University of Adelaide and where applicable, any partner institution responsible for the joint – award of this degree.

I give consent for this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University Library, being made available for loan and photocopying, subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.

The author acknowledges that copyright of published works contained within this thesis resides with the copyright holder(s) of those works.

I also give permission for the digital version of my thesis to be made available on the web, via the University's digital research repository, the Library catalogue, and also through web search engines, unless permission has been granted by the University to restrict access for a period of time.

Signed.....Date.....

## **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

**I sincerely thank the fathers who volunteered to generously share their experiences and committed their valuable time and interest to this research.**

I would like to acknowledge my principle supervisor Professor Deborah Turnbull and co-supervisors Associate Professor Margie Ripper, Dr. Christopher Barton, Dr. Nicole Moulding and Professor Rhonda Small.

I would like to acknowledge Clear Words Australia Proofreading and Editing Services for professional editing assistance.