Architectural Exchange in the Eighteenth Century
A Study of Three Gateway Cities:
Istanbul, Aleppo and Lucknow


Elise Kamleh

A thesis submitted to The University of Adelaide
in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

Centre for Asian and Middle Eastern Architecture (CAMEA)
School of Architecture, Landscape Architecture, and Urban Design
The University of Adelaide

April 2012
Abstract

Architectural Exchange in the Eighteenth Century
A Study of Three Gateway Cities: Istanbul, Aleppo and Lucknow

This dissertation examines architectural exchange amidst connected civilizational networks—European, Islamic, Hindu—with the intent to appreciate the richness and extent of this phenomenon. Emphasis is placed on mobility—of people, ideas, materials, artisans—and the way this mobility powers the process of architectural exchange. The influence of Asian architecture and landscapes on European sites has received extensive scholarly attention. However, this dissertation examines the lesser known architectural interplay between Europe and West and South Asia during the eighteenth century. The cities of Istanbul, Lucknow and Aleppo—urban centres governed by Islamic rulers—are chosen as exemplars of a wider phenomenon of architectural exchange that was not exclusive to Europe. The aim of this dissertation, then, is to argue that architectural exchange is neither rare nor exceptional.

To do so, this dissertation surveys and synthesises the findings of disparate studies that document architectural exchange—studies which often focus on specific buildings—to interpret the breadth and depth of this global phenomenon. This perspective is inspired by the scholarship of world systems theorists and scholars who privilege the phenomenon of travel, particularly Geoffrey Gunn, Eric Leed and Andre Gunder Frank, who have convincingly destabilised Eurocentric representations of world history, and encourage recognition of parallels and equivalencies between competing civilizations, as well as the central role travel plays in the formation of these changing cities and civilizations. This sheds light on the reciprocity of architectural exchange and the many instances whereby European techniques, themes or motifs were incorporated into Asian buildings or landscapes. This scholarship has also inspired the notion of a ‘gateway city’—simultaneously a port, portal or even the Sublime Porte—which is used to conceptualise sites that were located amidst dynamic networks of cultural exchange. The ‘gateway city’ enhances the interpretation of architectural exchange and even enables understanding of the port-ability of architecture. Moreover, it enables understanding of architectural
exchange occurring beyond, and independently of, Europe, either within the Islamic world or within local networks of exchange in West and South Asia. The contribution of this dissertation is to provide a dynamic and interconnected view of architecture in the selected cities in the eighteenth century, as well as challenging historical convictions about ‘decline’ and stasis in this period of Ottoman and Mughal history.
Declaration

I, Elise Kamleh, certify that this work contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by any other person, except where due reference has been made in the text.

I give consent to this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University Library, being made available for loan and photocopying, subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.

I also give permission for the digital version of my thesis to be made available on the web, via the University’s digital research repository, the Library catalogue and also through web search engines, unless permission has been granted by the University to restrict access for a period of time.

Signed

………………………………………………                      (Elise J. Kamleh, nee Ehrlich)
Acknowledgements

The person to whom I am most indebted in the production of this thesis is my supervisor, Katharine Bartsch. She has patiently explained concepts and sorted through some of the key aspects of this dissertation over many years. Without her this study could not have been completed. Peter Scriver also took on the task of supervision as principal advisor, and he has listened to my proposals and provided insightful comments. Samer Akkach, principal supervisor in the early stages of this study, initially encouraged me to undertake this research project and alerted me to some important texts which were to spark my consuming interest in the concept of exchange.

Michelle Picard, Director, Researcher Education and Development, from The University of Adelaide’s Graduate Centre has also been very helpful in teaching me how to approach each new stage of thesis writing. I am also indebted to her expertise. Other staff from the Graduate Centre, such as Cally Guerin and Lizzie Summerfield conducted research groups that helped understand the process of thesis writing and other issues. Kate Cadman also provided some valuable advice.

The translation into English of the Arabic titles of several travellers’ texts by Marwa Moustfa El-Ashmouni was greatly appreciated and the translation of Doğan Kuban’s article from French into English by Anastasiya Silkatcheva made this text available for inclusion in the study. Selen Morkoç and Trevor Nottle identified several important sources on the Ottoman Empire and Kew Gardens respectively.

Library staff members who helped to locate material are: Kay Leverett, Architectural Librarian, Margaret Hoskins, Art History Librarian and Maria Albanese, Document Delivery Supervisor. I am also indebted to staff members of the Barr Smith Library, The University of Adelaide, who often obtained material from obscure locations. Fiona Mariner, a Research Librarian, also helped with technical and document issues. In addition, Ian Florance always provided timely IT assistance, and I am very grateful for his expertise.
Greg Smith and Chris Gent provided encouragement during critical periods, and Chris Gent also helped with financial support. An Australian Postgraduate Award, as well as the Walter and Dorothy Duncan Trust, and support from Ernst and Erika Ellis helped with the ‘economics’ of the thesis, without which I could not have continued. Another aspect, that I was not aware of, was articulated by the Canadian Head of School, Nancy Pollock-Ellwand, when she said that a thesis is an ‘emotional journey’, and this proved to be a very valuable insight.

During the course of the study I travelled to Spain, Greece and Iran. These travels provided me with further information about architectural exchange. Prior to the commencement of research I had travelled to Turkey, Syria, Jordan, Egypt, China, and India, which sharpened my knowledge of particular details through first hand experience. This current project has been a culmination of the exploration of various interests, where my archaeological, anthropological, historical, linguistic and architectural studies have been deployed to uncover the widespread patterns of architectural exchange.
# Table of Contents

Abstract iii  
Declaration v  
Acknowledgements vii  
Table of Contents ix  
List of Figures xi  

1 Introduction 1  
1.1 Problem and Context 3  
1.2 Hypothesis 6  
1.3 Aims and Method 10  
1.4 Scope 17  
1.5 Structure 18  

Part I Critical Survey and Synthesis

2 Architectural Exchange in Europe: The Example of Kew 23  
2.1 Overview 25  
2.2 Architectural Studies of Kew’s Oriental Follies 27  
2.3 William Chambers’ Architectural Exchange 35  
2.4 Summary 51  

3 Exploring Exchange in the Ottoman and Mughal Empires 55  
3.1 Overview 57  
3.2 Studies of Western Influence on Ottoman and Mughal Architecture 58  
3.3 Reciprocal Routes 67  
3.4 Courtly Exchange 75  
3.5 Summary 85  

4 Portable Architecture and Gateway Cities 89  
4.1 Overview 91  
4.2 Interdisciplinary Scholarship on Exchange 93  
4.3 Portable Images of European Architecture in Asia 107  
4.4 Portable Images of Asian Architecture in Europe 111  
4.5 Portable Building Fragments in Eurasia 126  
4.6 Gateway Cities 133  
4.7 Summary 160
Part II  The Gateway Cities of Istanbul, Aleppo and Lucknow

5  Istanbul  165
5.1 Overview  167
5.2 Location  169
5.3 Representations of Istanbul’s European Exchange  174
5.4 Exchange Before the Eighteenth Century  181
5.5 Eighteenth Century Exchange  190
5.6 Sa’dâbâd  203
5.7 Topkapi  211
5.8 Inter-Islamic Exchange  217
5.9 Local Exchange  230
5.10 Summary  243

6  Aleppo  247
6.1 Overview  249
6.2 Location  251
6.3 Representations of Aleppo  260
6.4 Exchange Before the Eighteenth Century  265
6.5 European Exchange in Aleppo  270
6.6 Inter-Islamic Exchange  283
6.7 European Exchanges in Cities with Connections to Aleppo  294
6.8 Summary  309

7  Lucknow  313
7.1 Overview  315
7.2 Location  317
7.3 Representations of Lucknow’s European Exchange  321
7.4 Lucknow as a Gateway City  328
7.5 Exchange Before the Eighteenth Century  337
7.6 European Exchange in Lucknow  345
7.7 Inter-Islamic Exchange  360
7.8 Local Exchange  383
7.9 Summary  385

8  Conclusions and Recommendations  391

Bibliography  405
List of Figures


Chapter 1

Fig 1.0 European frescoes on the exterior walls of the side portico of the Chehelsotoon (or Chihil Sutun) pavilion and gardens in Isfahan. Photograph by author.

Chapter 2


Fig 2.2 Kew Gardens c.1763-5, showing a view of the Alhambra (left), the Pagoda, and the Mosque (to the right in distance), by William Marlow, titled ‘A View of the Wilderness’. John Harris and Michael Snodin, eds., Sir William Chambers, Architect to George III (New Haven and London, Yale University Press, 1996), 65. Fig 2.2.a The figural paintings on the central ceiling of the Hall of the Kings in the Alhambra, Granada, c.1370-1430. This painting uses Italian or Catalan Gothic techniques. All Granada and the Alhambra, editorial Fisa Escudo de Oro, S.A (Escudo de Oro, n.d.), 38. Francois de Montêquin, Compendium of Hispano-Islamic Art and Architecture (Francois de Montêquin, Saint Paul Minnesota: Hamline University, 1976), 154, 155.

Fig 2.3 Some examples of Pagodas in China (from left to right) Fig 2.3.a Feihong Pagoda (brick and glazed tiles) of Guangshengshang Temple, Hongdong, Shanxi, 1515-1527, Chan Chiu Ming, Ian Wong, Classical Chinese Architecture (Hong Kong: Joint Publishing Co., 1986), 164. Fig 2.3.b Iron Pagoda (brick), Yougou Monastery, Kaifeng, Henan Province, 1049; Nancy S. Steinhardt ed., Chinese Architecture (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 2002), 183, fig 5.51. Fig 2.3.c White Pagoda, (brick), Qingzhou, Chifeng city, Inner Mongolia, 1049. Nancy S. Steinhardt ed., Chinese Architecture (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 2002), 165, fig 5.29.

Fig 2.4.a Part of the engraving of the brick Pagoda at Kew-William Marlow-1763 from Chambers Plans...of the gardens...1763. Ray Desmond, The History of the Royal Botanic Gardens Kew (Kew: Kew Publishing, 2007), 55. Fig 2.4.b The Porcelain Pagoda (white porcelain bricks) at Nanjing, 1669, engraving from Nieuhoff, An Embassy...to China. Patrick Conner, Oriental Architecture in the West (London: Thames and Hudson, 1979), 17, fig 4. Fig 2.4 c, d Canton (Guangzhou) Two views of the eleventh century (brick) Liurongsi Pagoda (Flower Pagoda) in the Temple of the Six Banyan Trees. It was built in 1097. Fig.2.4.c http://www.muztagh.com/chinapictures/guangzhou/pic11.htm (accessed September 9, 2011). Fig.2.4.d http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/File:Guangzhou_LiurongSi_Huata_1.jpg. (accessed September 4, 2011). Fig 2.4.e The design Chambers selected from his plans for the great pagoda at Kew. They were based on his sketches in Canton. Ray Desmond, The History of the Royal Botanic Gardens Kew (Kew:
Fig 2.4f Chambers sketch of the pagoda in Canton. William Chambers, *Designs of Chinese Buildings* (London: 1757), Plate V, Fig 1.


Fig 2.6 The depiction of the ‘The Look Abroad Hall’ in one of the twenty engravings of the European quarter of the Garden of Perfect Brightness. It was one of the eighteenth century European palaces in the Yuanming Yuan, Beijing. Hope Danby, *The Garden of Perfect Brightness: The History of the Yuan Ming Yuan and of the Emperors Who Lived There* (London: Williams and Norgate Ltd, 1950), opposite 128.

Fig 2.7 South façade of Xieqi Qu (Symmetric and Amazing Pleasure). From a copperplate engraving by the eighteenth century Jesuit designers. Young-Tsu Wong, *A Paradise Lost, The Imperial Garden Yuanming Yuan* (Honolulu: University of Hawai‘i Press, 2001), 61.

Fig 2.8 Overview of the European palaces and gardens in the Yuan Ming Yuan, also called the ‘Chinese Versailles’. Young-Tsu Wong, *A Paradise Lost, The Imperial Garden Yuanming Yuan* (Honolulu: University of Hawai‘i Press, 2001), 59.


Fig 2.12 The inscription on the Mosque at Kew, 1762, appearing in reverse because of the engraved image. Section enlarged from John Harris and Michael Snodin, eds., *Sir William Chambers, Architect to George III* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1996), Plate 33.


Chapter 3

Fig 3.0 The Ottoman Ambassador, Yirmiseki Celebi Mehmed Efendi, 1720-21, at the court of Louis XV. Fatma Göçek, *East Encounters West, France and the Ottoman Empire in the Eighteenth Century* (New York, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1987), 32.


Fig 3.4 The Ottoman Ambassador, Yirmiseki Celebi Mehmed Efendi, 1720-21, at the court of Louis XV (left) and the French ambassador (Marquis de Bonnac) at the court of Ahmed III, 13th April, 1717 (right). Fatma Göçek, *East Encounters West, France and the Ottoman Empire in the Eighteenth Century* (New York, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1987), 32.


Fig 3.6 Part of the Choir and High altar in the Cathedral of Cordova (left); Mosque arches of Cordoba in the Cathedral of Cordova (centre); altar in a chapel of Cordoba (right). Manuel Salcines, *The Mosque of Cordoba* (Barcelona: Editorial Escudo de Oro, S.A, 2003), Fig 54, Frontispiece, Fig 69.

Fig 3.7 Door of the Lions in the interior of the Toledo Cathedral (left), the retable of the high altar in the Cathedral (centre), and the White Virgin in the Toledo Cathedral (right). Rufino Miranda, *Toledo: Its Art and its History* (Toledo: Artes Graficas, 2003), 57, 73, 77.

Fig 3.8 The masked ball in the Grand Gallery at Versailles, held in 1745. The ‘Turkish’ party with oversize head dressings is in the left foreground. Engraving by Charles-Nicolas Cochin. John Sweetman, *The Oriental Obsession: Islamic Inspiration in British and American Art and Architecture 1500-1920* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1987), 44, Fig 22.


Fig 3.10 The throne for Mahmud I from Nadir Shah, in Topkapi Palace, Istanbul. Photograph by author.

Chapter 4

Fig 4.0 Gateway to the Cathedral of Seville, built on the site of a mosque from 1402, and incorporating some of the elements of the mosque (such as this arched gateway). The minaret of the mosque became the bell tower, called the Giralda. Photograph by author.

Fig 4.1.a Part of the Parthenon (fifth century B.C.), the Acropolis, Athens. The Parthenon was dedicated to the Greek Goddess, Athena. In the fifth century A.D. the Parthenon was converted into a Christian church, and in the 1460s, during the Ottoman Occupation, it was turned into a mosque, and a minaret was built in it. Photograph by the author. **Fig 4.1.b** Drawing of the mosque situated in the acropolis 1728-30, by Etienne Fourmont, titled *View of Athens from the North*. Nebahat Avcioğlu, *Turquerie and the Politics of Representation 1728-1876* (Farnham, Surrey: Ashgate Publishing Ltd, 2011), 169, Fig. 3.12.

Fig 4.2 The steps leading to the remains of St Paul’s Cathedral, Macau. Photograph by author.


Fig 4.5 Portrait of Lady M.W. Montagu. She was in Istanbul from 1717-18. Engraving from an original miniature in the possession (1844) of the Earl of Harrington. W. Moy Thomas, The Letters and Works of Lady Mary Wortley Montagu, Volume 1 (London: George Bell and Sons, c.1861), frontispiece.


**Fig 4.9.a** Bath at Buda. **Fig 4.9.b** Mahomet’s tomb, Medina. **Fig 4.9.c** The Mosque, in Pest, Hungary. **Fig 4.9.d** Sultan Achmed Mosque. **Fig 4.9.e** Sultan Orchanus Mosque. **Fig 4.9.f** Sultan Süleyman II Mosque. **Fig 4.9.g** Aya Sophia. **Fig 4.9.h** Mecca. Some of Fischer von Erlach’s illustrations of the architecture of the Ottoman Empire, Mecca and Medina in his *A Plan of Civil and Historical Architecture of 1730*.


**Fig 4.11** The Turkish Tent, *Corps de garde*, Drottningholm Park, Sweden, 1780. Patrick Conner, *Oriental Architecture in the West* (London: Thames and Hudson Ltd, 1979), 75, Illustration 45.

**Fig 4.12.a** Ceramic lustre mihrab, 2.84 m (9.3 ft) high, re-used in the Masjid-I Maidan, Kashan, dated 1226. It lists the names of the Twelve Shi’ite Imams and is signed by al-Hasan ibn ‘Arabshah. Its ceramic components were fired separately and then fitted together. Its colour scheme of predominantly stone-grey and blue (with turquoise highlights) harmonizes with a colour scheme often used in architecture of that period. Robert Hillenbrand, *Islamic Art and Architecture* (London: Thames and Hudson, 1999), 92, 93, Fig 65. **Fig 4.12.b** The interior of the Synagogue of Samuel Levy (the Transito) established in 1357 A.D. was converted into a church in the medieval period by the use of paintings. Rufino Miranda, *Toledo: Its Art and its History* (Toledo: Artes Graficas, 2003), 28. **Fig 4.12.c** The interior is richly ornamented with Arabic and Hebrew inscriptions, geometric and vegetal decoration, arches, twin pillars, as well as blind and open windows with lattice decoration. Rufino Miranda, *Toledo: Its Art and its History* (Toledo: Artes Graficas, 2003), 27. **Fig 4.12.d** The interior of the Santa Maria la Blanca Synagogue, with horseshoe arches and geometric and vegetal decoration, is dated to the middle of the thirteenth century, when it was built on the foundations of an older building. Later the synagogue was converted into a church. A doorway and altars were added. Existing inscriptions were erased, as well as the polychrome work when it was reconsecrated as a church in c.1405. It has also been used as barracks and a warehouse. Rufino Miranda, *Toledo: Its Art and its History* (Toledo: Artes Graficas, 2003), 24. **Fig 4.12.e** Gateway to the Cathedral of Seville, built on the site of a mosque from 1402, and incorporating some of the elements of the mosque (such as this arched gateway). The minaret of the mosque became the bell tower, called the Giralda. Photograph by author.

**Fig 4.13** Inside the Cathedral of Cordoba, formerly the mosque of Cordoba. Photograph by author.


**Fig 4.15** Door of the church of St John from Acre re-erected as an entrance in the mausoleum of Al-Malik An-Nasir Muhammad in Cairo, 1295/6-1303/4. Deborah Howard, *Venice and the East, The Impact of the Islamic World on Venetian Architecture 1100-1500* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 2000), 175, Fig 219.


**Fig 4.18** Sanchi, front view of the Eastern Gateway. James Fergusson, *Tree and Serpent Worship, or Illustrations of Mythology and Art in India in the First and Fourth Centuries after Christ from the*

Chapter 5

**Fig 5.0.a** H. Sophia from the shores of the Bosphorus, by Cornelius Loos, 1710-11. Alfred Westholm, *Cornelius Loos, Teckningar från en expedition till Främre Orienten 1710-1711* (Stockholm: Nationalmuseums Skrifter serie N.S. 6, 1985), 3b.

**Fig 5.0.b** Map of West Asia and Europe after Onians showing trade routes and commodity flows between the regions, 1500-188. John Onians ed., *The Art Atlas* (New York and London: Abbeville Press, 2008), 195.

**Fig 5.1** Map showing location of Istanbul in relation to surrounding countries, capitals and seas. After Harold Fullard, *Philips' Modern Commonwealth Atlas* (South Yarra: George Philip and O'Neil Pty Ltd, 2000 edition), 34.

**Fig 5.2** Istanbul and the Bosphorus After Peter Mayne, *Cities of the World: Istanbul* (London: Phoenix House, 1967), 11.


**Fig 5.4.a** Map of Istanbul showing some of the places mentioned in the study, such as the Topkapi Saray, Aya (Hagia) Sophia (18), Nuruosmaniye Mosque (25), Dolmabahçe Palace, the Tophane Fountain, and the districts of Galata and Fener. After Michael Maclagan, *The City of Constantinople* (London: Thames and Hudson, 1968), 24, 25. **Fig 5.4.b** Map of Istanbul showing location of district of Pera (beyond Galata) and Üsküdar (across the Bosphorus) on the Asian side. The location of Edirne and Bursa (previous capitals) in relationship to Istanbul are also shown. Edhem Eldem, “Istanbul: from Imperial to Peripheralized Capital” in *The Ottoman City Between East and West, Aleppo, Izmir, and Istanbul*, Edhem Eldem, Daniel Goffman and Bruce Masters (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1999), Map 3, 136.

**Fig 5.5** Engraving of ‘the Sultan’s New Palace on the Bosphorus’, by Thomas Allom (this is the Çirigan Palace of Mahmud II, 1808-1839). From Thomas Allom’s *Constantinople and the Scenery of the Seven Churches of Asia Minor*, illustrations by Thomas Allom, descriptions by Robert Walsh ed. and introduction by Mark Wilson (New Jersey: Gorgias Press, 2006), 65.

**Fig 5.6** Melling’s plans for the pavilion of Nesatabad on the shores of the Bosphorus. From Cornelis Boschma et Jacques Perot, *Antoine-Ignace Melling (1763-1831) Artiste-Voyageur* (Paris: Musée Carnavalet, 1991), 13, 14.

Fig 5.8 Blue and white tile panel in Muradiye mosque, based on Chinese and Anamese designs, Edirne, fifteenth century. Michael Levey, *The World of Ottoman Art* (London: Thames and Hudson, 1975), Fig 19, 39.

Fig 5.9 Palmette crest on mihrab, fifteenth century Turbe of Yesil, in Bursa, compare cloud collar on fourteenth century Chinese porcelain vase from Ardebil Shrine collection of Shah Abbas. For illustration of mihrab see Barbara Brent, *Islamic Art* (Cambridge: Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1991), 178, Fig 121; for vase see John Alexander Pope, *Chinese Porcelains from the Ardebil Shrine* (Washington: Smithsonian Institution, Freer Gallery of Art, 1956), Plate 28.

Fig 5.10.a Taqi al Din (1520/25-1585) and the Istanbul Observatory. Fig 5.10.b Astronomers at work in the small observatory, in sixteenth century. From Aydin Sayili, *The Observatory in Islam* (Ankara: Türk Tarih Kurumu Basimevi, 1960), Plate 6 and Plate 7.

Fig 5.11 Scenes of Istanbul, Topkapi and Sepetci Kasri (left) and H. Sophia (right) from the shores of the Bosphorus, by Cornelius Loos, 1710-11. From Alfred Westholm, *Cornelius Loos, Teckningar från en expedition till Främre Orienten 1710-1711* (Stockholm: Nationalmuseums Skrifterie N.S. 6, 1985), 3b.

Fig 5.12 Two Qing Chinese porcelain items in the eighteenth century collection of the Topkapi Palace. From İlhan Akşit, *The Topkapi Palace* (Istanbul: Akşit, 1994), 73, 71.


Fig 5.14 View of the Nuruosmaniye Mosque (1748-1755) in Istanbul. Michael Levey, *The World of Ottoman Art* (London: Thames and Hudson, 1975), 122, Fig 79.

Fig 5.15 Architects carrying a model of the Süleymaniye Mosque in a procession, illustration from the manuscript *Surname*, dated 1582-83. Renda, Erol, Turani, Ozsezgin, Aslier, *A History of Turkish Painting* (Seattle-London: Palasar SA in Association with the University of Washington Press, 1988), 31, Plate 17.


Fig 5.19 Sa’dâbâd-drawing of the canal, smaller cascades and pavilions by D’Ohson, late eighteenth century. From Sedad Hakki Eldem, *Sa’dâbâd* (Istanbul: University of Istanbul, 1977), Fig 25, 43.

Fig 5.20 Main palace buildings of Sa’dabad, the pools and fountains. Drawing by D’Ohson, late eighteenth century. Sedad Hakki Eldem, *Sa’dabad* (Istanbul: University of Istanbul, 1977), Fig 23, 41.

Fig 5.22 Cascades of Sa’dâbâd. After Sedad Hakki Eldem, Sa’dâbâd (Istanbul: University of Istanbul, 1977), 54, Fig 43.

Fig 5.23 André Le Nôtre, La Rivière, Marly, 1697-98, Engraving by Jacques Rigaud. After Robert W Berger, A Royal Passion, Louis XIV as Patron of Architecture (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994), Fig 133, 151.


Fig 5.25 Pamukkale, view from the top of the pools. Photograph by author.

Fig 5.26 Pavilion of Murad III in Topkapi, sixteenth century. İlhan Akşit, The Topkapi Palace (Istanbul: Akşit, 1994), 50.

Fig 5.27 The ‘Fruit Room’ Ahmed III, Topkapi, 1705. İlhan Akşit, The Topkapi Palace (Istanbul: Akşit, 1994), 53.


Fig 5.29 Tile cut-outs in the interior of the Revan Pavilion, Murat IV, 1635. İlhan Akşit, The Topkapi Palace (Istanbul: Akşit, 1994), 34.


Fig 5.31 Hearth of the Pavilion of Murat III, sixteenth century. İlhan Akşit, The Topkapi Palace (Istanbul: Akşit, 1994), 51.

Fig 5.32 Hearth of the ‘Fruit Room’, Ahmed III, eighteenth century. İlhan Akşit, The Topkapi Palace (Istanbul: Akşit, 1994), 52.

Fig 5.33 Fireplace in Selim III’s salon, Topkapi, late eighteenth century. Michael Levey, The World of Ottoman Art (London: Thames and Hudson, 1975), Fig 82, 126.

Fig 5.34 Interior of the Sofa Kiosk, Topkapi. Michael Levey, The World of Ottoman Art (London: Thames and Hudson, 1975), 115, fig 71.

Fig 5.35. Çinili Kiosk, or Tiled Pavilion, Istanbul, 1472. Godfrey Goodwin, A History of Ottoman Architecture (London: Thames and Hudson), Colour Plate 1, opp. 144.

Fig 5.36 The Hasht Bihisht or “Eight Paradises” Safavid Palace (1669) in Isfahan in 2011. Photograph by author.


Fig 5.40 Entry gateways to notables mansions along the Chaharbagh Avenue from 1596-1602. Ahmed III also had Ottoman dignitaries build mansions along the canal of Sa’dâbad. Stephen Blake, Half the World: The Social Architecture of Safavid Isfahan, 1590-1722 (Costa Mesa: Mazda Publishers, 1999), 96.

Fig 5.41.a The Grand Boulevard of Chaharbagh (engraving from Le Bruyn, Travels). Stephen Blake, Half the World: The Social Architecture of Safavid Isfahan, 1590-1722 (Costa Mesa: Mazda Publishers, 1999), Fig 10. 92. Fig 5.41.b Trees lining the straight canal of Kagithane (Cetvel-i Sim), part of the Sa’dâbad Palace complex. Sedad Hakki Eldem, Sa’dabad (Istanbul: University of Istanbul, 1977), Fig 9, 15.

Fig 5.42 The private garden palace of Sa’adatabad, part of the Chahar Bagh complex in Isfahan Stephen Blake, Half the World: The Social Architecture of Safavid Isfahan, 1590-1722 (Costa Mesa: Mazda Publishers, 1999), Fig 9, 79.

Fig 5.43.a Bayildum, Mahmud I’s pavilion at the Beşiktaş Palace, Istanbul, engraving c. 1770’s. From D’Ohsson, Tableau General de l’Empire Ottoman. Shirine Hamadeh, “Ottoman Expressions of Early Modernity and the ‘Inevitable’ Question of Westernization”, Journal of the Society of Architectural Historians 63, no.1 (2004): 41, Fig 11. Fig 5.43.b Engraving (1867) of the front view of the long upright, decorated, wooden pillars of the Chihil Sutun (began 1647) in Imperial Naqsh-i Jahan Palace of Isfahan. Stephen P. Blake, Half the World: The Social Architecture of Safavid Isfahan, 1590-1722 (Costa Mesa: Mazda Publishers, 1999) 67, Figure 5. Fig 5.43.c A recent view of the Chihil Sutun (Chehelsotoon) in Isfahan. Photograph the author.

Fig 5.44 Domes on the Jamia Masjid at Delhi, aquatint by the Daniells, (left) and the small umbrella domes on the top of the fountain of Ahmed III, 1728 (right). Patrick Conner, Oriental Architecture in the West (London: Thames and Hudson, 1979), 132, Illustration 92, and Levey, The World of Ottoman Art (London: Thames and Hudson, 1975), Fig 76, 119.

Fig 5.45 Silver model of the fountain of Ahmet III (left). İlhan Akşit, The Topkapi Palace (Istanbul: Akşit, 1994), 23.

Fig 5.46 Illustration of the Tophane fountain, built in 1732 (right). From Mark Wilson ed., Thomas Allom’s Constantinople and the Scenery of the Seven Churches of Asia Minor, illustrations by Thomas Allom, descriptions by Robert Walsh (New Jersey: Gorgias Press, 2006), 61, ‘Fountain and Market Place of Tophana’.

Fig 5.47.a Laleli Cami, 1759-63, restored in 1783, Istanbul. Godfrey Goodwin, A History of Ottoman Architecture (London: Thames and Hudson, 1971), Fig. 405, 389. Fig 5.47.b Ayazma Cami (1756-60) built by Mustafa III, on the skyline of Istanbul. Godfrey Goodwin, A History of Ottoman Architecture (London: Thames and Hudson, 1971), Fig. 272, 283. Fig 5.47.c Nuruosmaniye Complex from the south-east. Godfrey Goodwin, A History of Ottoman Architecture (London: Thames and Hudson, 1971), Fig. 397, 383.

Fig 5.48 Engraving of Selim III Complex, in Haydarpaşa from the east. Godfrey Goodwin, A History of Ottoman Architecture (London: Thames and Hudson, 1971), Fig. 445, 413.


**Fig 5.51** Panorama of Istanbul from Şemaki House in Yenişehir, near Bursa. From Günsel Renda, “Wall Paintings in Turkish Houses”, *Fifth International Congress of Turkish Art*, ed. G. Fehér (Budapest: Akademiai Kiado, 1978), Fig 16, 728.

**Fig 5.52** Panorama of Istanbul from Mehmed Ali Aga Konak in Datça, near Marmaris. From Günsel Renda, “Wall Paintings in Turkish Houses”, *Fifth International Congress of Turkish Art*, ed. G. Fehér (Budapest: Akademiai Kiado, 1978), Fig 15, 728.


**Fig 5.54** The models of the gardens carried by architects in the 1720 circumcision festival in Istanbul. B. Deniz Çalış, “Gardens at the Kağıthane commons during the Tulip Period (1718-1730)”, in *Middle East Garden Traditions: Unity and Diversity, Questions, Methods and Resources in a Multicultural Perspective*, ed. Michel Conan (Washington: Dumbarton Oaks, Trustees for Harvard University, 2007), 242, Fig 3, 244, Fig 5.


**Fig 5.57** Detail of a landscape by Rakkamehu Mehmet, on the lacquer binding of a manuscript, 1732. Günsel Renda, “Traditional Turkish Painting and the Beginnings of Western Trends,” in *A History of Turkish Painting*, Renda, Erol, Turani, Ozsezgin, Aslier (Seattle-London: Palasar SA, University of Washington Press, 1988), 61, Plates 52, 53, and 54.

**Chapter 6**


**Fig 6.0.b** Map of West Asia and Europe after Onians showing trade routes and commodity flows between the regions, 1500-188. John Onians ed., *The Art Atlas* (New York and London: Abbeville Press, 2008), 195.


**Fig 6.2** Map of Syria with trade routes of importance to the factors of the English Trading Company situated in Aleppo, which also highlights the route used in the trading of Persian silk. After Ralph Davis, *Aleppo and Devonshire Square, English Traders in the Levant in the Eighteenth Century* (London: Macmillan, 1967), opposite page 1.

**Fig 6.3.a** The Desert Route to India, Syria and Mesopotamia. To illustrate the Desert Route from the Mediterranean Sea to the Persian Gulf as described in the journals of William Beawes, Gaylard Roberts, Bartholemew Plaisted and John Carmichael, 1745-175. Douglas Carruthers ed., *The Desert Route to India*. 

**Fig 6.4** Pilgrimage routes to Mecca from Damascus (pilgrims from Aleppo and Hama joined the caravan leaving from Damascus), Cairo (and North Africa), East (and Central) Africa, Baghdad (and Iran), Basra (and India). William C. Brice, An Historical Atlas of Islam (Leiden: E.J. Brill, 1981), 22.

**Fig 6.5** Eighth-century engraving of ‘The City of Aleppo’, 1794. Alexander Russell, The Natural History Of Aleppo, Volume 1, Description Of The City And The Parts Adjacent (London: Robinson, 1794), Frontispiece.

**Fig 6.6** Illustration of the Hajj caravan in Cairo in 1705, from Paul Lucas. Paul Lucas, Voyage du Sieur Paul Lucas au Levant in Andre Raymond, ‘‘A Divided Sea: The Cairo Coffee Trade in the Red Sea Area during the Seventeenth and Eighteenth Centuries’’ in Modernity and Culture, eds. Leila Fawaz Tarazi and C.A Bayly (New York: Columbia University Press, 2002), 49, Illustration 2.2.

**Fig 6.7** Scanderoon, one of the main ports to Europe for Aleppo, in about 1700. Corneille Le Bruin, Voyage au Levant, in Ralph Davis, Aleppo and Devonshire Square, English Traders in the Levant in the Eighteenth Century (London, Melbourne: Macmillan Press, 1967), opposite 162.


**Fig 6.9** Part of Herzfeld’s drawing of the incorporation of the classical entablature into the building of al-Shu’aybiyya in Aleppo, before the later additions. Yasser Tabbaa, “Monuments with a Message: Propogation of Jihad under Nūr A-Dīn (1146-1174)” in The Meeting of Two Worlds: Cultural Exchange between East and West during the Period of the Crusades, eds. Vladimir P. Goss and Christine Verzar Bornstein (Michigan: Western Michigan University, 1986), Fig 23.

**Fig 6.10** Aleppo in about 1750, featuring the citadel predominantly encircled by mosques. Illustration from Alexander Drummond’s traveologue. Alexander Drummond Travels through Different Cities…and Several Parts of Asia in Ralph Davis, Aleppo and Devonshire Square, English Traders in the Levant in the Eighteenth Century (London, Melbourne, Toronto: Macmillan, 1967), 83.

**Fig 6.11** Henry Maundrell, Prospect of Aleppo. Henry Maundrell, A Journey from Aleppo to Jerusalem in 1697, with a new introduction by David Howell (Beirut: Khyats, 1963), Frontispiece, Plate 1.


**Fig 6.13.a** A Plan of the City of Aleppo from Alexander Russell, 1794. Russell lists the gates of Aleppo first, capitalizing the letters to show their importance to the city. Gate I (Bab Anta케) leads to Antakya (Antioch) and Gate K (Bab al Jideida) is the gate or door (Bab) to the Judayda quarter. Alexander Russell,

**Fig 6.14.a** Engraving of the interior of a house in Aleppo. The Turkish lady is dressed in a cape and robes and is lying on a lounge. She is smoking and preparing to drink coffee and is accompanied by a woman servant. Alexander Russell, *The Natural History Of Aleppo* (London: 1794) Vol. I, Plate III. **Fig 6.14.b** Part of the engraving of the decorative interior of a palace in Aleppo with seated Ottoman officials. The commander of the Janissary corps (centre), and the governor (right) are dressed in furs accompanied by a servant. An ‘Aga’ was the name given to the commander of the Janissary corps by Russell, and he called the Turkish governor the ‘Bashaw’. The ‘Cady’ (Qadi), or learned head of the religious scholars, is partially in view to the left of the engraving. He also performed the function of a judge. The view through the window shows an internal courtyard. From Alexander Russell, *The Natural History Of Aleppo* (London, 1794) Vol. I, Plate II. This commentary on the illustration is taken from Russell’s explanation to the engraving as well as Abraham Marcus’s caption to this illustration in *The Middle-East on the Eve of Modernity: Aleppo in the Eighteenth Century* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1989), Fig 5.2.

**Fig 6.15** Aleppo, Judayda Quarter, showing the location of the houses mentioned in the text. After Ross Burns, *Monuments of Syria, An Historical Guide* (New York: New York University Press, 1992), 41.


**Fig 6.18** The musicians and their various dress playing in a court, with views of a mosque and inner court of a great house through the windows, as well as the elaborate stonework of the court and the raised stone platform, the ‘Mustaby’. Alexander Russell, *The Natural History Of Aleppo* (London: 1794), Vol. I, Plate IV, 152, 153.

**Fig 6.19.a** The *minbar* of the Aqsa mosque. **Fig 6.19.b** Detail of the *minbar*. Yasser Tabbaa, “Monuments with a Message: Propogation of Jihad under Nur A-Din (1146-1174)” in *The Meeting of Two Worlds: Cultural Exchange Between East and West during the Period of the Crusades*, eds. Vladimir P Goss and Christine Verzar Bornstein (Michigan, Kalamazoo: Western Michigan University, 1986), Figs 26, 27.

**Fig 6.20** Seventeenth century map of Aleppo, showing the location of the great mosque of Aleppo in relation to the citadel. Hegnhar Zeitlian Watenpaugh, *The Image of an Ottoman City, Imperial Architecture and Urban Experience in Aleppo in the 16th and 17th Centuries* (Leiden: Boston: Brill, 2004), Fig 8.


**Fig 6.24.a** View of Sabil Mustapha Agha, and southwest corner column. **Fig 6.24.b** Lotus flower at the top of the column. **Fig 6.24.c** Southeast corner column with chrysanthemum heads. **Fig 6.24.d** Enlarged view

Fig 6.25 Fig 6.25 The courtyard of Beit al-Azem in Hama, with a reception room off the upper terrace (now a museum). Ross Burns, Monuments of Syria, An Historical Guide (New York: New York University Press, 1992), Plate 8.


Fig 6.27 The location of the Azem Palace in relation to the Umayyad Mosque, the madrasas and khans of Damascus. Warwick Ball, Syria, A Historical and Architectural Guide (New York: Interlink Books 1998), Fig 2, 53.


Chapter 7

Fig 7.0.a Replica of the Taj Mahal in the Husainabad Imambara, built in Lucknow. Surendra Sahai, Indian Architecture, Islamic Period 1192-1857 (New Delhi: Prakash Books, 2004), 159.

Fig 7.0.b Map of Central and Southern Asia after Onians showing trade routes and commodity flows within these regions and beyond, 1500-1800. John Onians ed., The Art Atlas (New York and London: Abbeville Press, 2008), 192.

Fig 7.1 India in its Central Asian position, showing surrounding countries. Delhi is indicated in the north. After Harold Fullard, Philips’ Modern Commonwealth Atlas (Melbourne: George Philip and O’Neil Pty Ltd, 2000), 34.

Fig 7.2 Map showing the journey of the Ottoman Admiral Seydi ‘Ali Re’is in the mid 1550s from Istanbul to Northern India and Delhi. Muzaffar Alam and Sanjay Subrahmanyam, Indo-Persian Travels in the Age of Discoveries, 1400-1800 (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007), Map 2, 102.

Fig 7.3 The location of the city of Lucknow, about 488 kilometres to the south east of Delhi. G.H.R. Tillotson, The Tradition of Indian Architecture, Continuity, Controversy and Change since 1850 (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1989), map opposite page vii.

Fig 7.4 Map of India showing territory of the Nawabs of Oudh and other areas of India under Muslim rulers. Ralph Russell and Khurshidul Islam Three Mughal Poets, Mir, Sauda, Mir Hasan (London: George Allen and Unwin Ltd, 1969) 27.

Fig 7.5 Oudh after 1801, showing the location of Lucknow and Faizabad. John Pembie, The Raj, the Indian Mutiny and the Kingdom of Oudh 1801-1859 (Sussex: The Harvester Press, 1977), Map 2, 118.
Fig 7.6.a The image of the Indian bull (nandi) used in Ruskin’s 1870 lecture illustrating ‘barbarian’ sculpture, contrasted to a Greek engraving of a bull (left). John Ruskin, *Aratra Pentelici, Six Lectures on the Elements of Sculpture*, given before the University of Oxford in Michaelmas term, 1870, in *The Works of John Ruskin*, Volume III (Kent: George Allen, 1879), 200, Plate XX. Fig 7.6.b The Peacock Throne in the Treasury of National Jewels, Teheran. This is not the throne Nadir Shah brought with him from Delhi, but it has design features in common with the original Mughal throne such as the divan base on supporting legs and the steps leading to the throne. The Central Bank of the Islamic Republic of Iran, *Treasury of National Jewels* (Teheran: Katibeh Graphic), n.d.


Fig 7.12 Danish House in Tranquebar on Prins Christian Street with Mughal arch. Sten Nilsson, *European Architecture in India 1750-1850* (London: Faber and Faber, 1968), Fig 8.


Fig 7.15 Location of Taxila (Sirkap), in the far north west of India. G.H.R. Tillotson, *The Tradition of Indian Architecture, Continuity, Controversy and Change since 1850* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1989), map opposite page vii.
Fig 7.16 Clay Stupa at Taxila designed as a huge Corinthian capital, c.2nd century A.D. From John Boardman, *The Diffusion of Classical Art in Antiquity* (London: Thames and Hudson, 1994), fig 4.70, 132.


Fig 7.23.a Constantia (La Martiniere) a building initiated by Claude Martin in 1795, in Lucknow. Surendra Sahai, *Indian Architecture, Islamic Period 1192-1857* (New Delhi: Prakash Books, 2004), 158. Fig 7.23.b The Red Fort in Delhi from Delhi Gate. Constantia also has many parallels with Mughal masonry structures (for example the Red Fort of Delhi), such as the central massing, and the use of sandstone. Virginia Fass, *The Forts of India*, foreword by the Maharaja of Jaipur, text by Rita and Vijay Sharma and Christopher Tadgell (London: Collins, 1986), 22.


Fig 7.28 1775-97 Bibiapur Kothi and a drawing showing the elevation of front of Bibiapur Kothi. Banmali Tandan, *The Architecture of Lucknow and its Dependencies, 1722-1856, A Descriptive Inventory and Analysis of Nawabi Types* (New Delhi: Vikas Publishing House, PVT Ltd, 2001), III.24, and Fig 19.


Fig 7.30 Section of twentieth Century map showing location of Kazmain (Kadhiman or Kadhimayn) near Baghdad, Karbala and Najaf (An-Najaf) in Iraq. Joseph Gardner ed., *Atlas of the World* (Hong Kong: Reader’s Digest, 1987), 119.


Fig 7.35 View of the west and south fronts of the Bara Imambara of Lucknow, whose southern gallery was raised three feet for the keeping of taziyas. Banmali Tandan, *The Architecture of Lucknow and its Dependencies, 1722-1856* (New Delhi: Vikas, 2001), 32, III. 4.


Fig 7.38.a Konark Temple, Orissa. Satish Grover, *Masterpieces of Traditional Indian Architecture* (New Delhi: Roli Books, 2004), 52, 53. **Fig 7.38.b** Close up of one of the wheels of the stone chariot of the Konark Temple. Satish Grover, *Masterpieces of Traditional Indian Architecture* (New Delhi: Roli Books, 2004), 58, 59.

Fig 7.39 Central Persian Hall of the Bara Imambara with adjoining Chinese and Indian Halls, the Chinese Hall is on the eastern end (left), the Indian Hall is on the western end (right). Peter Chelkowski, “Monumental Grief: The Bara Imambara” in *Lucknow, City of Illusion*, ed. Rosie Llewellyn Jones (Munich: Prestel, 2006), 127, Fig 62.

**Fig 7.41** Location of the ‘Rumi Darwaza’ gateway in relation to the rest of the Bara Imambara complex, which is situated in lower right section of the drawing by W. Sypniewski. Peter Chelkowski, “Monumental Grief: the Bara Imambara, in Lucknow, City of Illusion,” ed. Rosie Llewellyn-Jones (Munich: Prestel, 2006), 113, Fig 51.


**Fig 7.43.a** Rumi Derwaza Gateway in Lucknow. Banmali Tandan, *The Architecture of Lucknow and its Dependencies, 1722-1856* (New Delhi: Vikas, 2001), Ill 15. **Fig 7.43.b** The Imperial Gateway (Bab-ül-Ḥumayun) of Topkapi Palace in Istanbul. İlhan Akşit, *The Topkapi Palace* (Istanbul: Akşit, 1994), 11.

**Fig 7.44.a** The second gateway of Topkapi. İlhan Akşit, *The Topkapi Palace* (Istanbul: Akşit, 1994), 11. **Fig 7.44.b** The middle gateway, the Gateway of Salutations or Respects (Bab-ül Salaam), in Topkapi in Istanbul. İlhan Akşit, *The Topkapi Palace* (Istanbul: Akşit, 1994), 8.


**Fig 7.46** Chowringhi Street, Calcutta in 1797. Sten Nilsson, *European Architecture in India 1750-1850* (London: Faber and Faber, 1968), Plate 10a.


**Fig 7.48** Replica of the Taj Mahal in the Husainabad Imambara, built in Lucknow. Surendra Sahai, *Indian Architecture, Islamic Period 1192-1857* (New Delhi: Prakash Books, 2004), 159. **Fig 7.49** the Taj Mahal at Agra, built by Shah Jahan as a mausoleum for his wife Mumtaz Mahal in 1674. Photograph by author.

**Chapter 8**

**Fig 8.0** Stone Chariot with moveable wheels, Vithalla Temple, Hampi, Karnataka. Satish Grover, *Masterpieces of Traditional Indian Architecture* (New Delhi: Roli Books, 2004), 84.

**Fig 8.1** The Shantadurga (Maratha) temple erected in 1738 displays significant exchanges with elements of Portuguese church architecture built in the area. It is near Ponda in Goa. George Michell, *Hindu Art and Architecture* (London: Thames and Hudson, 2000), 167, fig 149.