Banking Regulation and Corporate Governance

An Empirical Study of Chinese Banks

Yishu Fu

A thesis submitted to the Business school, The University of Adelaide, in fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

February 2014
Contents

LIST OF TABLES .............................................................................................................. v
LIST OF FIGURES .......................................................................................................... viii
ABSTRACT ....................................................................................................................... ix
DECLARATION ................................................................................................................. xii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS ................................................................................................. xiii

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION ......................................................................................... 1
  1.1. Background to the Thesis ..................................................................................... 1
  1.2. Research Questions ............................................................................................. 3
  1.3. Research Agenda ................................................................................................ 6
       1.3.1. An overview of the research design ............................................................. 6
       1.3.2. An outline of the major research components ............................................. 7
       1.3.3. Some highlights of the research methodology ............................................. 9
  1.4. Thesis Outline ...................................................................................................... 10

CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW ............................................................................... 12
  2.1. Bank Reform and Capital Regulation in China .................................................. 12
       2.1.1. Bank reform in China .................................................................................. 12
       2.1.2. Banking capital regulation in China ............................................................ 16
  2.2. Regulatory Capital Requirements vs. Market Capital Requirements .......... 20
       2.2.1. Theoretical background: the M&M proposition ......................................... 20
       2.2.2. Regulatory capital requirements ................................................................. 22
       2.2.3. Market capital requirements ...................................................................... 24
       2.2.4. Related studies about regulatory forces and market forces .................... 28
  2.3. Literature on Bank Governance and Performance ........................................... 29
       2.3.1. Bank governance and performance .............................................................. 30
       2.3.2. Some Chinese evidence ............................................................................. 41

CHAPTER 3: DATA AND DESCRIPTIVE STATISTICS ............................................... 50
  3.1. Stock Ownership Structure of the Public-listed Banks in China ..................... 50
  3.2. Stylized Facts of Chinese Commercial Banks .................................................. 53
       3.2.1. Asset quality ............................................................................................... 53
       3.2.2. Capital data for Chinese commercial banks (2004-2011) ....................... 59
       3.2.3. General information of Asset/Liability structure for commercial banks in China (2004-2011) .............................................................. 59
3.3. Descriptive Statistics of Variables in the Empirical Tests

CHAPTER 4: MODEL AND METHODOLOGY

4.1. Regulatory Forces versus Market Forces

4.1.1. The disequilibrium model

4.1.2. The definition of the variables for the disequilibrium estimation

4.1.3. Probability estimation

4.2. Commercial Banks’ Risk Behavior in China

4.2.1. Simultaneous model with partial adjustment framework

4.2.2. Definitions of capital and risk

4.2.3. Variables affecting changes in capital and changes in risk

4.2.4. Empirical specification

4.3. Corporate Governance in Chinese Banks

4.3.1. Corporate governance affecting changes in risk

4.3.2. Corporate governance affecting changes in risk

CHAPTER 5: EMPIRICAL RESULTS

5.1. Regression Results from the Switching Regime Estimation

5.1.1. Empirical results based on CAP

5.1.2. Empirical results based on CAR

5.2. Risk-taking Behavior for Banks with Different Ownership Structure

5.2.1. Relationship between changes in capital and risk: whole sample regression

5.2.2. Relationship between changes in capital and risk: subsample regressions

5.3. Corporate Governance Influences on Banks’ Risk

5.3.1. The effects of corporate governance on banks’ risk: listed vs. unlisted banks

5.3.2. The effects of corporate governance on banks’ risk: state ownership

5.3.3. The effects of corporate governance on banks’ risk: different bank types

CHAPTER 6: CONCLUSION

6.1. Key Findings

6.2. Significance/Contribution of the Thesis

6.2.1. Contribution to knowledge
6.2.2. Contribution to practice.................................164
6.3. Limitations ......................................................166
6.4. Areas for Future Research ..................................166
   6.4.1. Modeling the demand for loans to the private sector ....167
   6.4.2. Banks’ regulatory capital buffer and the business cycle ....169
6.5. Concluding Remarks...........................................172
REFERENCES ..................................................................174
**LIST OF TABLES**

Table 3.1 Information of stock ownership structure for domestic listed banks .......... 52  
Table 3.2 General information about asset quality for different types of banks .......... 52  
Table 3.3 Mean value of asset quality by bank types (2004~2011) .......................... 55  
Table 3.4 Mean value of asset quality: different indicators (2004~2011) ................. 57  
Table 3.5 Capital data for Chinese commercial banks (2004-2011) .......................... 60  
Table 3.6 General Information of Asset/ Liability structure for commercial banks in  
China (2004-2011) .................................................................................................................. 61  
Table 3.7 Descriptive statistics for the variables in the disequilibrium models .......... 62  
Table 3.8 Descriptive statistics for the variables in the simultaneous equations ........... 63  
Table 3.9 Descriptive statistics for corporate governance variables .......................... 65  
Table 4.1 Definitions and expected signs for variables used in the disequilibrium model  
.................................................................................................................................................. 72  
Table 4.2 Definitions and expected signs for variables used in the simultaneous models  
.................................................................................................................................................. 83  
Table 4.3 Definitions and expected signs for variables used in the simultaneous models:  
Corporate governance .................................................................................................................. 86  
Table 5.1 Disequilibrium regression results for CAP (no interaction product terms):  
regulatory model ....................................................................................................................... 93  
Table 5.2 Disequilibrium regression results based on CAP (no interaction product  
terms): market model ............................................................................................................... 94  
Table 5.3 Disequilibrium regression results for CAP based on under-capitalized & well-  
capitalized banks: regulatory model. ...................................................................................... 99  
Table 5.4 Disequilibrium regression results for CAP based on under-capitalized & well-  
capitalized banks: market model .......................................................................................... 100  
Table 5.5 Disequilibrium regression results for CAP based on listed & unlisted banks:  
regulatory model ....................................................................................................................... 102  
Table 5.6 Disequilibrium regression results for CAP based on the listed & unlisted  
banks: market model ............................................................................................................... 103  
Table 5.7 Disequilibrium regression results for CAP based on state ownership (full  
sample regression): regulatory model .................................................................................... 108
Table 5.8 Disequilibrium regression results for CAP based on state ownership (full sample regression): market model ................................................................. 109
Table 5.9 Disequilibrium regression results for CAP based on state ownership (delete 3 local banks): regulatory model ................................................................. 110
Table 5.10 Disequilibrium regression results for CAP based on state ownership (delete 3 local banks): market model ................................................................. 111
Table 5.11 Disequilibrium regression results for CAP based on different bank types: regulatory model .................................................................................. 118
Table 5.12 Disequilibrium regression results for CAP based on different bank types: market model .................................................................................. 119
Table 5.13 Disequilibrium regression results for CAR (no interaction product terms): regulatory model .................................................................................. 122
Table 5.14 Disequilibrium regression results for CAR (no interaction product terms): market model .................................................................................. 123
Table 5.15 Disequilibrium regression results for CAR based on under-capitalized & well-capitalized banks: regulatory model ............................................. 125
Table 5.16 Disequilibrium regression results for CAR based on under-capitalized & well-capitalized banks: market model .................................................. 126
Table 5.17 Disequilibrium regression results for CAR based on listed & unlisted banks: regulatory model ........................................................................... 128
Table 5.18 Disequilibrium regression results for CAR based on listed & unlisted banks: market model ........................................................................... 129
Table 5.19 Disequilibrium regression results for CAR based on state ownership (full sample regression): regulatory model ............................................. 130
Table 5.20 Disequilibrium regression results for CAR based on state ownership (full sample regression): market model ............................................. 131
Table 5.21 Disequilibrium regression results for CAR based on state ownership (delete 3 local banks): regulatory model ............................................. 132
Table 5.22 Disequilibrium regression results for CAR based on state ownership (delete 3 local banks): market model ............................................. 133
Table 5.23 Disequilibrium regression results for CAR based on different bank types: regulatory model ................................................................. 135
Table 5.24 Disequilibrium regression results for CAR based on different bank types: market model ................................................................. 136
Table 5.25 Simultaneous regression based on ΔCAP/ΔCAR and ΔRWATA .......... 139
Table 5.26 Simultaneous regressions based on ΔCAP/ΔCAR and ΔRWATA (with REG and REGU) ........................................................................................................................................................................... 143
Table 5.27 Simultaneous regressions based on ΔCAP and ΔRWATA: listed vs. unlisted banks .................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................. 146
Table 5.28 Simultaneous regressions based on ΔCAP and ΔRWATA: state ownership .................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................. 147
Table 5.29 Simultaneous regressions based on ΔCAP and ΔRWATA: different bank types .................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................. 150
Table 5.30 Corporate governance and banks’ risk: listed vs. unlisted banks ........ 152
Table 5.31 Corporate governance and banks’ risk: state ownership ................. 154
Table 5.32 Corporate governance and banks’ risk: different bank types .......... 157
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 3.1 Asset quality: ‘Big 5’ banks .............................................................. 56
Figure 3.2 Asset quality: joint-equity banks ......................................................... 56
Figure 3.3 Asset quality: local banks ................................................................. 56
Figure 3.4 Asset quality: foreign banks ............................................................... 56
Figure 3.5 Asset quality indicator: NPL/Total Loans ........................................ 58
Figure 3.6 Asset quality indicator: NPL/Total Assets ........................................ 58
Figure 3.7 Asset quality indicator: Loan Loss Provision/Total Loans ............... 58
Figure 3.8 Asset quality indicator: Loan Loss Provision/Total Assets ............... 58
Figure 3.9 Capital adequacy level and their variation tendency ......................... 63
Figure 3.10 Corporate governance variables and their variation trend ............. 65
ABSTRACT

Although there is an increasing research interest in banking capital requirements, the impact of the China Banking Regulatory Commission (CBRC) banking regulation on Chinese commercial banks’ behaviors has not been fully explored. Even though CBRC banking regulation has tremendously improved the capital adequacy ratio, on average, for Chinese commercial banks in recent years, the question of whether and how different types of banks in China have reacted to constraints placed by the regulator on their capital has not been empirically tested in the literature for Chinese cases.

This overarching research problem, which forms the foundation of this doctoral research project, gives rise to three important research questions. First, do different types of banks in China react differently to capital requirements in terms of capital adequacy level, i.e. do state-owned banks, joint-equity banks, local banks, and foreign banks behave the same in their capital ratio when adhering to changes in capital requirements? Second, do Chinese banks differ in their ability to adjust risk, i.e. do different types of banks simultaneously adjust their capital and risk due to the influence of binding capital requirements? Third, do corporate governance factors jointly work with banking regulation in explaining Chinese banks’ risk behaviors, i.e. does corporate governance have significant impact on the banks’ risk level and affect the relationship between change in capital and change in risk? These three issues correspond to the three gaps found in the extant literature on the CBRC regulation, also in the strand of empirical studies focusing on the role of capital standards for regulating banks’ behavior. To explore these research questions, this research tries to provide extensive
empirical evidence from three interrelated projects, each with a unique contribution to informing the research topic.

These closely related, investigative components jointly provide consolidated answers to the three research questions proposed previously. In response to the first research question, I show that regulation does affect all banks in the way they adjust their capital levels, although the degree to which this occurs does vary. Specifically, regulation has a stronger positive influence on capital ratios for unlisted banks, joint-stock banks and foreign banks, but a relatively weaker, positive influence on the capital ratios of the ‘Big 5’ banks, and local banks (i.e. city and rural commercial banks). With respect to the second question, I find that regulation does not have any impact on the risk ratio for banks where the state is the largest shareholder; it only has the expected and negative effect on risk levels for predominately non-state owned banks and unlisted banks (which primarily are the local and rural commercial banks). Therefore, banks with a large degree of state ownership still face a certain degree of credit risk. As for the last research question, my findings indicate that although corporate governance factors do have expected effects in reducing banks’ risk, it is the specific feature of the bank itself that plays a major role in explaining their risk behaviors associated with binding capital requirements.

This doctoral research makes a valuable contribution to the field of the Chinese banking industry. From the theoretical perspective, it fills the significant gaps in the existing banking literature, adopts the specific variables to distinguish Chinese banks’ unique character, extends knowledge and theoretical foundations, and identifies important issues which require further investigation. From the practical perspective, it follows
well-established models and applies the complicated estimation technique to show the
effects of Chinese banking policy on different types of banks. My empirical results will
contribute to the continuously improving the CBRC regulation by providing useful
suggestions regarding whether these binding capital requirements have positive
influences on commercial banks’ performance in terms of capital adequacy level and
risk control.
DECLARATION

I, Yishu Fu, certify that this work contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution and to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text.

I give consent to this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University Library, being made available for loan and photocopying, subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.

I also give permission for the digital version of my thesis to be made available on the web, via the University’s digital research repository, the Library catalogue, the Australasian Digital Theses Program (ADTP) and also through web search engines, unless permission has been granted by the University to restrict access for a period of time.

Signature: ___________________________ Date: 08/02/2014
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First and foremost, I would like to extend my immense gratitude to my principle supervisor, Prof. Ralf-Yves Zurbrugg, for his unreserved support. This thesis would not have been completed on time without his efficient feedback, rich experience and detailed guidance which ensured the quality of my work. His warm encouragement helped me always keep a positive attitude towards life. Above all, I became more confident about my research ability under his supervision. I really enjoyed working with him and would like to offer him my most sincere thanks.

I also would like to thank my co-supervisor, Prof. Chien-Ting Lin, for his useful guidance and advice on my last project, which helped me to finish my thesis on time. In addition, I also would like to express my sincere gratitude to Prof. Shih-Cheng Lee, for his enormous guidance and assistance during the infant stage of my PhD research. I am indeed indebted to him.

Many thanks to the business school for its support for doctoral students and the insightful feedback on my research proposal and research projects. I personally thank Dr. Juan Luo and Dr. Jiun-Lin Chen for their mentoring supports and feel particularly grateful to my good friends Chang, Juan, Shan, Shasha, Yessy… life here would never have been so colorful without them. Lastly, I would like to thank my parents, who are the most important people in my life. They have always been so supportive and patient and have given me enormous love and strength for so many years.