Determinants and Impacts of Rules of Origin in Australia’s Free Trade Agreements

By

Uwe Kaufmann

THESIS

Submitted to the University of Adelaide
in partial fulfillment of the requirement for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy
in
Economics.

March, 2014
Declaration

I, Uwe Kaufmann, certify that this thesis contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in my name, in any university or other tertiary institution. I further certify that to the best of my knowledge and belief, this thesis contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text. In addition, I certify that no part of this work will, in the future, be used in a submission in my name, for any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution without the prior approval of the University of Adelaide and where applicable, any partner institution responsible for the joint award of this degree.

I give consent to this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University Library, being made available for loan and photocopying, subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.

I also give permission for the digital version of my thesis to be made available on the web, via the University’s digital research repository, the Library Search and also through web search engines, unless permission has been granted by the University to restrict access for a period of time.

Uwe Kaufmann
Abstract

This thesis investigates the determination of the rates of utilisation of Australian free trade agreements (FTAs).

The topic is important and interesting because the utilisation rates show the usage of the agreements by traders. Low utilisation rates imply that trade agreements fail in their objective.

Following a review of relevant literature, the study presents data on the utilisation rates of Australia’s preferential trade agreements (PTAs) over the time frame of 2000-9. This work requires some care in the definition of the utilisation rate, a matter which is discussed in detail in the presentation of this part of the empirical work.

It is found that utilisation rates vary a lot. The variations appear to be related to low preferential tariff margins and the degree to which there are strict rules of origin (ROO). These rules are associated with FTAs to manage the problem of trade deflection (TD).

The ROO schemes of five Australian FTAs are investigated and a ROO restrictiveness index is developed and applied to these five Australian trade agreements. The main findings are that all five ROO regimes differ significantly between the agreements, indicating that ROO are negotiated according to criteria beyond their role in managing TD.

A question of interest therefore arises about the set of important determinants of ROO. One hypothesis in the literature is that more restrictive ROO are negotiated in tariff lines with relatively high preferential margins. To examine and test this hypothesis in detail, a political economy (PE) model is applied. PE and TD factors are taken into account in a test of the relative importance of these different factors. The results confirm that TD concerns in form of potential transshipment are reflected by ROO design;
however this is the case only for the Australian agreements with its developing country partners. The results also show that more restrictive ROO are negotiated in tariff lines with high applied tariff rates and for commodities where a potential import penetration may occur. The higher the potential competition in the form of trade penetration and the higher market access in the form of low preferential tariff rates, the more restrictive are the negotiated ROO. Therefore, these results suggest that ROO are used as both a trade protection and as a tariff substitution tool.

The research then returns to the question of the impact of ROO on the utilisation rates and trade development in Australia’s FTAs. An equation is estimated in which the relationship and impact of ROO and preferential tariff margins on the utilisation rates is tested.

To avoid endogeneity between tariff rates and ROO as identified in this thesis, the study employs the instrumental variable method by using the results of the determinants of ROO as an instrument.

Two main hypotheses are examined, namely (1) do more restrictive ROO increase trade costs and with that lower the application of preferential treatment in form of utilisation rates, and (2) do preferential tariff margins serve as an incentive to apply for preferential treatment.

The results show a strong negative relationship between the degree of restrictiveness of ROO and the utilisation rates and a positive relationship between preferential tariff margins, and utilisation rates.
Acknowledgements

There are many who supported me in my studies and in my professional development and I am grateful for their guidance and support throughout this journey.

I would like to thank my supervisor Professor Christopher Findlay for his advice, the stimulating discussions, his support and understanding throughout my studies. I am also very appreciative for his guidance and the trust he has invested in me throughout my professional development.

My appreciation also goes to Professor Richard Pomfret for his very helpful guidance and equally useful critiques of my research work throughout my PhD.

A thank you also goes to Dr Nicholas Sim for introducing me to advanced econometrics and in helping me to understand and value this field and to Aletha Blayse for her helpful editorial comments.

I am also very grateful to my Australian family – Rita and Ron Duncan, Rachael and Stephen Nano. Even though I am far away from home, they always let me know that I have a place to come to. Thank you all so much. I am very grateful for all your help, their friendship and love!

Ron and Satish Chand provided me with a lot of guidance and have also helped me to find my place here in Adelaide by introducing me to my supervisor.

My friend John Snelling taught me not only how to teach but also that teaching can be an enjoyable hobby.

Throughout my studies I had two homes within the University of Adelaide and I would like to thank the staff at the School of Economics and the Institute for International Trade. I am also thankful for the financial support from the University of Adelaide by providing me with a scholarship to succeed in my studies.
I wish to thank my parents for their love, support and encouragement and to my grandma for always being there for me, for teaching me so many things in life and for letting me go on this journey.

Finally, I wish to thank Zifang Su for all her unconditional support, her friendship and love. Thank you so much!
# Table of Contents

1. Introduction .............................................................................................................................. 1

2. Literature review ......................................................................................................................... 7
   2.1 The utilisation of preferential trade agreements ................................................................. 7
   2.2 Determinants of utilisation rates of preferential trade agreements ............................... 10

3. The usage of Australia’s bilateral FTAs and SPARTECA ......................................................... 14
   3.1 Introduction .......................................................................................................................... 14
   3.2 Australia’s FTAs and PTAs ................................................................................................. 17
      3.2.1 Australia’s non-reciprocal PTAs ............................................................................... 17
      3.2.2 Australia’s regional and bilateral FTAs ..................................................................... 22
   3.3 Data and measurement of utilisation ................................................................................... 25
   3.4 The utilisation rates of selected Australian PTAs and RTAs .............................................. 27
   3.5 Observations from a disaggregated data analysis ............................................................... 40
      3.5.1 A disaggregated analysis of the raw utilisation rate – an overview ........................ 40
   3.6 Conclusions ......................................................................................................................... 46

4. ROO in Australia’s RTAs and PTAs and their restrictiveness ................................................ 51
   4.1 Introduction .......................................................................................................................... 51
   4.2 ROO .................................................................................................................................... 54
   4.3 ROO in more detail ............................................................................................................... 57
   4.4 ROO in PTAs and FTAs ........................................................................................................ 58
   4.5 ROO in Australia’s FTAs under consideration in this study .............................................. 63
      4.5.1 Examples ....................................................................................................................... 65
   4.6 Measuring the restrictiveness of ROO ................................................................................ 66
      4.6.1 How is the restrictiveness index applied in Australia’s FTAs? ................................ 73
   4.7 Overview of the restrictiveness of ROO in Australia’s RTAs and PTAs ............................. 74
   4.8 Conclusions ......................................................................................................................... 77

5. The determinants of ROO .......................................................................................................... 79
   5.1 Introduction .......................................................................................................................... 79
   5.2 Determination of ROO in a bargaining process ................................................................. 84
   5.3 Empirical methodology ....................................................................................................... 87
      5.3.1 TD variables .................................................................................................................. 87
6. Evaluating the impact of ROO on the utilisation rates and the benefits of Australia’s FTAs ......................................................... 112
   6.1 Introduction ........................................................................ 112
   6.2 The impact of FTAs and binding effects of ROO ...................... 114
       6.2.1 The impact of FTAs ...................................................... 114
       6.2.2 Binding effects of ROO and their impact on trade costs ...... 118
   6.3 Statistical analysis: The impact of ROO and preferential tariffs ....... 120
   6.4 Empirical Analysis: The impact of ROO and preferential tariff margins on utilisation rates and trade ........................................... 128
       6.4.1 Modelling the impact of ROO and preferential tariff margins on utilisation rates ......................................................... 129
       6.4.2 Applied model on the impact of ROO and preferential tariff margins on trade .................................................................. 133
   6.5 Results .............................................................................. 136
   6.6 Conclusions ....................................................................... 139

7. Conclusions ............................................................................ 141

Appendix ...................................................................................... 149

Appendix to Chapter 3 .................................................................. 149
   A. Disaggregated Analysis by Agreement ................................. 149
   B. Disaggregated analysis of Australia’s FTAs by Sector .............. 166

Appendix to Chapter 5 .................................................................. 214
   A. Discussion of the Results of Tables 5.2 to 5.6 ......................... 214

Appendix to Chapter 6 .................................................................. 220
   A. ROO, Preferential Tariff Margins and Utilisation Rates of Australia’s bilateral FTAs for 2009 .................................................. 220

References .................................................................................. 234
List of Figures

Figure 3.1: Utilisation rates of Australia’s PTAs, 2000-9 ........................................ 31
Figure 3.2: Average applied customs duties and tariffs of Australia’s PTAs, 2000-9 ... 32
Figure 4.1: A three-country model ........................................................................... 55
Figure 4.2: A three-country model with an FTA ......................................................... 56
Figure 4.3: Comparison of restrictiveness of ROO of Australia’s FTAs by section, 2009
........................................................................................................................................ 75
Figure 5.1: Determinants of ROO and preferential market access ............................. 81
Figure 6.1: The impact of an FTA ............................................................................... 116
Figure 6.2: Binding effects of ROO and their impact on trade costs ......................... 119
Figure 6.3: Assumed impacts of ROO restrictiveness and preferential tariff margins
on the utilisation rate ........................................................................................................ 121
Figure 6.4: Actual empirical impact of ROO restrictiveness and preferential
tariff margins on the utilisation rates, 2009 ................................................................. 123
List of Tables

Table 3.1: Overview of Australia’s preferential trading schemes ........................................... 18
Table 3.2: Summary statistics of Australia’s imports from PTA partners, 2009.................. 28
Table 3.3: Average applied customs duties and tariffs on Australia’s imports from PTA
partners, 2009.................................................................................................................. 29
Table 3.4: Customs duty collected on imports from New Zealand, 2009 ..................... 34
Table 3.5: Customs duty collected on imports from the United States, 2009 ............... 39
Table 3.6: HS classification by section and HS tariff chapters.......................................... 41
Table 3.7: Australia’s applied tariff structure, 2009............................................................ 48
Table 4.1: Merits and de-merits of ROO criteria............................................................... 59
Table 4.2: Common RVC methods....................................................................................... 60
Table 4.3: Restrictiveness points of the Harris (2007) restrictiveness index............... 70
Table 4.4: Adjusted RVC value test points.......................................................................... 72
Table 5.1: Determinants of ROO under Australia’s bilateral FTAs ................................. 97
Table 5.2: Determinants of ROO under the CER ............................................................... 104
Table 5.3: Determinants of ROO of the SAFTA ................................................................ 105
Table 5.4: Determinants of ROO of the TAFTA ................................................................. 106
Table 5.5: Determinants of ROO of the Australia AUS-FTA ............................................ 107
Table 5.6: Determinants of ROO under the Chile/AUS-FTA ........................................... 108
Table 6.1: Utilisation rates and preferential tariff margins............................................... 124
Table 6.2: Utilisation rates, preferential tariff margins and ROO restrictiveness........... 124
Table 6.3: Utilisation rates and preferential tariff margins at a given ROO-i (1-4) .... 125
Table 6.4: Utilisation rates and preferential tariff margins at a given ROO-i (5-8) .... 125
Table 6.5: Utilisation rates and preferential tariff margins at a given ROO-i (9-19) ... 126
Table 6.6: Utilisation rates, preferential tariff margins and ROO-i at increasing trade volumes

Table 6.7: Utilisation rates, preferential tariff margins and ROO-i at different trade volume

Table 6.8: Determinants of utilisation rates and the impact of ROO and preferential tariff margins

Table 6.9: Determinants of Australian FTA imports and the impact of ROO and preferential tariff margins

Table A3.1: CER – Development of raw utilisation rates (2000-09)

Table A3.2: SPARTECA – Development of raw utilisation rates (2000-09)

Table A3.3: SAFTA – Development of raw utilisation rates (2000-09)

Table A3.4: TAFTA – Development of raw utilisation rates (2000-09)

Table A3.5: AUS-FTA – Development of raw utilisation rates (2000-09)

Table A3.6: Chile/AUS-FTA – Development of raw utilisation rates (2000-09)

Table A6.1: CER – Applied ROO and ROO index, preferential tariff margins and utilisation rate in 2009

Table A6.2: SAFTA – Applied ROO and ROO index, preferential tariff margins and utilisation rate in 2009

Table A6.3: TAFTA – Applied ROO and ROO index, preferential tariff margins and utilisation rate in 2009

Table A6.4: AUS-FTA – Applied ROO and ROO index, preferential tariff margins and utilisation rate in 2009

Table A6.5: Chile/AUS-FTA – Applied ROO and ROO index, preferential tariff margins and utilisation rate in 2009
# List of Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ABS</td>
<td>Australian Bureau of Statistics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACS</td>
<td>Australian Customs Service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACTA</td>
<td>Australian Customs Tariff Act</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASTP</td>
<td>Australian System of Tariff Preferences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AFTA</td>
<td>ASEAN Free Trade Area</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AUS-FTA</td>
<td>Australia United States Free Trade Agreement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APEC</td>
<td>Asian Pacific Economic Community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AV</td>
<td>Adjusted value</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A$</td>
<td>Australian dollars</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BEC</td>
<td>Broad Economic Classification index</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CER</td>
<td>Australia New Zealand Closer Economics Relation Trade Agreement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chile/AUS-FTA</td>
<td>Chile Australia Free Trade Agreement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CTC</td>
<td>Change in tariff classification</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CU$s</td>
<td>Customs Unions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DFAT</td>
<td>Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FTAs</td>
<td>Free Trade Agreements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GATT</td>
<td>General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP</td>
<td>Gross domestic product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GSP</td>
<td>Generalized System of Preferences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HS</td>
<td>Harmonized System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JS-EPA</td>
<td>Japan-Singapore Economic Partnership Agreement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JETRO</td>
<td>Japan External Trade Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LDCs</td>
<td>Least Developed Countries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MFN</td>
<td>Most favoured nations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NAFTA</td>
<td>North American Free Trade Agreement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NC</td>
<td>Net cost</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PACER</td>
<td>Pacific Agreement on Closer Economic Relations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PATCRA</td>
<td>Papua New Guinea Australia Trade and Commercial Relations Agreement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PE</td>
<td>Political economy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acronym</td>
<td>Full Form</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PTAs</td>
<td>Preferential Trade Agreements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OCTA</td>
<td>Office of the Chief Trade Adviser</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OECD</td>
<td>Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ROO</td>
<td>Rules of origin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ROO-i</td>
<td>Rules of origin restrictiveness index</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RTAs</td>
<td>Regional Trade Agreements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RVC</td>
<td>Regional value content</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAFTA</td>
<td>Singapore Australia Free Trade Agreement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SPARTECA</td>
<td>South Pacific Regional Trade and Economic Cooperation Agreement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TAFTA</td>
<td>Thailand Australia Free Trade Agreement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TD</td>
<td>Trade deflection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TR</td>
<td>Technical requirements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TV</td>
<td>Transaction value</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNCTAD</td>
<td>United Nations Conference on Trade and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VNM</td>
<td>Value of non-originating materials</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VOM</td>
<td>Value of originating materials</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VUOM</td>
<td>Value of materials with uncertain origin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WCO</td>
<td>World Customs Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WTO</td>
<td>World Trade Organization</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>