PREDICTING FIRM SUSTAINABILITY THROUGH GOVERNANCE: THE RELATIONAL CORPORATE GOVERNANCE APPROACH

Francesco de Zwart

B Comm (Melb), LLB (Hons) (Melb), Grad Dip Ed (Monash), LLM (Monash)
Adelaide Law School
Faculty of the Professions
The University of Adelaide

31 January 2014

ABSTRACT PREDICTING FIRM SUSTAINABILITY THROUGH GOVERNANCE: THE RELATIONAL CORPORATE GOVERNANCE APPROACH

The **relational corporate governance approach** presented in this thesis is a tool which complements and enhances the explanatory power of the existing principal 'law and economics' theories and models of the firm. It maps the effectiveness of corporate **Governance Variables** in use in corporate **Governance Codes** and laws around the world and assesses reform proposals in the field. The approach can be used by regulators, policy-makers, law reformers and corporate actors as a diagnostic tool to analyse the governance health of individual companies and the governance actions required to remedy sub-optimal governance and management arrangements. The **principal aim** of the relational approach is to describe and evaluate the *interrelationships* between the most significant fields of corporate governance study and practice and the Governance Variables to which these fields give rise. In this way, the relational approach can be used to make predictions in relation to the relative importance of Governance Variables *inter se* in reducing (or increasing) agency costs and enhancing (or reducing) the long-term efficiency and survival of the for-profit firm.

The relational approach is built from an artificial environment that simulates the real world sphere of corporate governance and is comprised of the four **Key Fields** drawn from the Social Science Research Network database: (1) application of the principal theories of the firm to the relational approach; (2) 'autopsies' of the Enron and Hastie corporate collapses; (3) comparative corporate Governance Codes; and (4) empirical studies of the effectiveness of Governance Variables. From these Key Fields a **'Weighing Mechanism'** is constructed comprising four theoretical components.

First, the thesis introduces a **new definition of relational corporate governance** known as the **Three Relational Axes of Good Governance**. These Three Relational Axes act like a set of scales to theoretically 'weigh' the competing interests of those 'inside' the corporation and those 'outside'. Second, the thesis establishes a set of eight **Governance Factors** which are the principal or central themes underlying the four Key Fields. These eight Governance Factors are the eight most common themes in the thesis' simulated representation of real world corporate governance. The theoretical 'weighing' of the Governance Factors in the Three Relational Axes of Good Governance is already completed and presented for the reader. Thus the *interrelationships* between the eight Governance Factors are presented in two diagrams called **Interrelationship Schemes**, one for the shareholder (primacy) model and the other representing the stakeholder model. From these Interrelationship Schemes the thesis constructs – for each of 39 Governance Variables – a **relational effect path** that seeks to explain which Governance Factors are affected by each Governance Variable and the direction of the effect.

The interrelationships depicted in a relational effect path for each Governance Variable are then summarised in operational tables. The greater the number of Governance Factors affected by a Governance Variable in either direction, then the greater is the relative importance of that Variable in affecting agency costs and the long-term efficiency and survival/sustainability of the for-profit corporation.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This thesis would not be possible without the supervision, guidance, help and love of a lot of people.

I began the thesis at Monash University in Victoria with the supervision of Dr George Gilligan and Associate Professor Helen Anderson. I thank them for their supervision of the genesis of the thesis and its early form. The thesis would not have been possible without them.

At the University of Adelaide, my profound gratitude to Associate Professor Chris Symes and Dr Suzanne Le Mire who took up the supervision of the mid and end points of the thesis - at short notice - when I moved to Adelaide. The accessibility of the thesis owes a great deal to their careful guidance. I thank them for a wonderful thesis experience rich in new knowledge and direction for me and many thoughtful discussions.

Truly great friends came to the aid and support of me and my family during an illness I suffered and I thank them for their great faith in me – Domenic and Sharon Carbone, Max and Nicole Haitana, Monica Soncin and Simon Jolly, Stefan Klaebe and Helen Gilbert, Associate Professor Bernadette Richards and Dr Paul Richards and Professor John Williams. There would be no completion without them.

My wider family was tireless support during the whole thesis and again during my illness and I count myself very lucky to have them – June de Zwart (grandma) and Peter Fitzpatrick (Papa) for their tireless help with my children; Fiona McLennan, David McLennan and Catherine and Nick Forge for their love of my children; Peter and Justine de Zwart at crux time; Del Sladdin for sending "flash money" when we needed a treat and Elivio and Kit Bonollo for their prayers.

It is difficult to express my love and admiration to my own family and I feel very undeserving of their great love and support of me. To my children – Bronte for being a grown-up at only 10 years old and Emily who is 8 who prayed every night at dinner time that Dad would finish his thesis.

Finally, to my wife Associate Professor Melissa de Zwart. I have admiring love for the tireless way you look after all of us, for your great enthusiasm and inclusiveness at everything you do, for the way you keep going when things get really difficult, for your amazing decision-making in pressure times, for your Dutch sense of humour (I still think you are telling me off), for thinking David Tennant is the best Dr Who when I think it is Matt Smith, for how you love Stephen Silvagni of Carlton and Jeronimo of Adelaide United, for how you never age and your steadfastness in all you do. You are the most wonderful and beautiful person I have ever met. Thanks for Loving.

THESIS DECLARATION

I certify that this work contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in my name, in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text. In addition, I certify that no part of this work will, in the future, be used in a submission in my name, for any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution without the prior approval of the University of Adelaide and where applicable, any partner institution responsible for the joint-award of this degree.

I give consent to this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University Library, being made available for loan and photocopying, subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.

I also give permission for the digital version of my thesis to be made available on the web, via the University's digital research repository, the Library Search and also through web search engines, unless permission has been granted by the University to restrict access for a period of time.

Signed by Francesco de	Zwart
Dated	

TABLE OF CONTENTS

SEC1	SECTION AND TITLE		
-	PTER 1: CHALLE	NGE OF CORPORATE GOVERNANCE	1
1.1		Blobal Financial Crisis and Failures of Corporate rnance	1
1.2	-	ration of Ownership from Management and the Role rporate Governance	2
	1.2.1	The Balancing of Interests of 'Insiders' and 'Outsiders'	2
	1.2.2	Separation of Ownership, 'Nexus of Contracts', Agency Costs and the Shareholder Model	4
	1.2.3	The Shareholder-Wealth Maximisation Principle	6
1.3	'Core' Failur	' Areas of Corporate Governance and Corporate res	7
	1.3.1	Multiple Failures in Core Governance Variables	8
	1.3.2	Key Fields and Research Questions in Firm Sustainability	11
1.4	Relati	ional Corporate Governance	15
1.5	Agend	cy Costs and Sustainability in this Thesis	16
1.6	Scope	e of the Thesis	17
1.7	Overv	riew of Thesis	17
	1.7.1	Overview of Relational Corporate Governance Approach	17
	1.7.2	Introduction to Thesis Chapters	18
THE		VORK OF THE RELATIONAL CORPORATE SE APPROACH	21
2.1	Appro Frame	oach to the Relational Corporate Governance ework	21

2.2		iew of the Firm-Specific (Micro) and Macro- omic Benefits of 'Good' Corporate Governance	26
2.3	The C	omponents of the Relational Approach	28
	2.3.1	The Three Relational Axes of Good Governance	29
	2.3.2	The Purpose and Interrelationship of the Three Relational Axes	29
	2.3.3	The Weighing Process of the Three Relational Axes	31
2.4	Introd	uction to the Governance Variables	32
	Table	2.4: Summary of Governance Variables	33
2.5		pal Considerations in the Selection of the nance Factors	35
	2.5.1	The Governance Factors are Drawn from the Key Fields	35
	2.5.2	What is a Governance Factor?	36
	2.5.3	Governance Factors Must Be Distinguished From Governance Variables	37
2.6		overnance Factors are Recurring Themes and ons From the Key Fields	37
	2.6.1	Reporting Factor No. 1: Transparency, Timing and Integrity of Financial and Other Reports	37
	2.6.2	Compliance Factor No. 2: Corporate Governance and Legal Compliance	41
	2.6.3	Alignment Factor No. 3: Alignment of Management and Shareholder Interests	43
	2.6.4	Compensation Factor No. 4: Board, CEO and Management Compensation and Incentives	46
	2.6.5	Monitoring & Audit Factor No. 5: Internal and External/Audit Monitoring Quality	47
	2.6.6	Stakeholders Factor No. 6: Identification, Participation and Protection of Stakeholder Interests	51
	2.6.7	Decision-making Factor No. 7: Quality of Board, CEO and Management Decision-Making	53

	2.6.8:	Responsibility Factor No. 8: Delineation and Disclosure of Powers, Duties and Lines of Responsibility	56
2.7		elationships between Governance Factors – terrelationship Schemes	61
	2.7.1	The Two Interrelationship Schemes	61
	2.7.2	The Direction of the 'Effect' in the Interrelationship Schemes	61
	Figure	2.7.2A: Shareholder Primacy Interrelationship Scheme	64
	Figure	2.7.2B: Stakeholder Model Interrelationship Scheme	65
2.8	Concle Frame	usion - The Relational Corporate Governance work	66
	Figure	2.8: The Relational Corporate Governance Framework	67
	PTER 3: ERNANC	E VARIABLES IN PRACTICE	69
3.1	Purpo	se and Approach of Chapter Three	69
3.2	Gover	tional Measures of the Relational Approach – nance Factor 'Coverage' and 'Relational nity Rating'	70
3.3		ypothesised Coverage Effect on Governance rs by Individual Governance Variables	71
	3.3.1	The Coverage Table	71
		Table 3.3.1. Coverage Table	71
		Hypothesised Significant Coverage Effect and Direction of Interrelationship between Governance Variables and Governance Factors	
	3.3.2	The Hypothesised Relative Importance of Governance Variables – The Relational Proximity Table	76
		Table 3.3.2.1: Relational Proximity Table	78
		Hypothesised Relative Importance of Governance Variables in the Sustainability of the Firm	

KEY THE		O. 1: ATION OF THE PRINCIPAL THEORIES TO THE RELATIONAL APPROACH	80
4.1		ems Arising from the Separation of Ownership Management	80
4.2		lexus of Contracts Foundations of the Three ional Axes of Good Governance and Governance rs	82
	4.2.1	'Neoclassical' Model Shortcomings are Unsuitable for the Relational Approach	84
	4.2.2	Relational Approach is Aligned with Nexus of Contracts Theory	84
	4.2.3	The Components of the Relational Approach and Agency Costs	88
	4.2.4	Director Primacy Model Reflected in the Governance Factors	93
4.3		cation of the Shareholder Primacy and Stakeholder Is to the Relational Approach	95
	4.3.1	The Relational Approach and the Shareholder Primacy Model	95
	4.3.2	Shareholder Primacy - The Precedence of the Shareholders' Residual Claims are Reflected in the Governance Factors	95
4.4	The In	offluence of Stakeholder Theory in the Relational bach	96
	4.4.1	Shortcomings of the Shareholder Primacy Model	97
	4.4.2	Perceived Problems and Suggested Solutions in Balancing Competing Stakeholder Interests	104
4.5	Concl	luding Remarks for Chapter 4	109

KEY F	CHAPTER 5 KEY FIELD NO. 2: AUTOPSIES' OF THE ENRON AND HASTIE CORPORATE COLLAPSES		111
5.1		nron Governance Failure Abyss and the Hastie Collapse	111
	5.1.1	Purpose, Scope and Methodology of Chapter 5 – Enron and Hastie Case Studies of the Behaviour of Governance Variables and Governance Factors	111
5.2	Failur Variab	es in 'Central' or 'Proximate' Governance ples	114
	5.2.1	Agency Theory and the Shareholder Model	114
	5.2.2	Board and Director Variables	116
	5.2.3	Earnings Manipulation	124
	5.2.4	External or Independent Audit	131
	5.2.5	Inadequate Disclosure Affects the Transparency and Timing of Financial Reporting and Monitoring	141
5.3		nary - Some Recurring Themes in the Enron and Group Corporate Collapses	142
	5.3.1	The Nexus of Contracts and Agency Theory in the Enron and Hastie Failure Scenarios	143
	5.3.2	Director Independence, Monitoring and Risk Management	144
	5.3.3	Earnings Manipulation	148
	5.3.4	External/Independent Audit	151
	5.3.5	Concluding Remarks	153
KEY F	PTER 6 FIELD NO PARATIV	O. 3: /E CORPORATE GOVERNANCE CODES	155
6.1	The P	urpose, Scope and Function of Chapter 6	155
	6.1.1	Exploring Relative Importance	155
	6.1.2	The Function of Commonality – How to Use Chapter 6	157

	6.1.3	Justification for Selection of Global and National Corporate Governance Codes	157
	6.1.4	The Governance Codes Examined in Chapter 6	167
6.2	Globa	I/Cross-Border Corporate Governance Codes	169
	6.2.1	Selection of the Global Sector and OECD Principles	169
	6.2.2	Principal Governance Variables in Global Corporate Governance	170
	6.2.3	Global 'Core' Variables - Comparison and Commonality of Global/Cross-Border Corporate Governance Codes	173
6.3	Nation	nal Corporate Governance Codes	177
	6.3.1	Focus on US, UK and Australian National Codes	177
6.4	United	d States Corporate Governance Codes	178
	6.4.1	SOX Effects on Securities Exchange Act and NYSE Final Rules in Appendix C2	178
	6.4.2	US National Corporate Governance Codes	178
6.5	United	d Kingdom Corporate Governance Codes	182
	6.5.1	UK National Corporate Governance Codes	182
6.6	Austra	alian Corporate Governance Codes	186
	6.6.1	ASX 2003 Best Practice Recommendations, ASX 2007-10 Revised Principles and IFSA Blue Book	186
6.7	'Core'	National <u>Listed</u> Governance Variables	189
	6.7.1	Comparison of US, UK and Australian National <u>Listed</u> Corporate Governance Codes	189
6.8		usion - Core Features and Aspects of Corporate nance Codes	190
	6.8.1	Core Features – Global and National <u>Listed</u> Governance Codes Combined	190

NATIO	ELD NO	0. 4 (PART 1): AREHOLDER PROTECTION REGIME AND DRS I	192
7.1	Aims a	nd Purpose of Chapter 7	192
7.2	Structu	re and Approach of Chapter 7	194
7.3		pecific Effects of 'Good' Corporate Governance – alue and Operating Performance	195
	7.3.1	'Overall' Governance Structure and the Level and Strength of the National Shareholder Protection Regime	196
	7.3.2	Board Factors I – 'Independence' and the Proportion of Non-Executive/Independent Directors	214
	ELD NO	0. 4 (PART 2): DRS II AND OTHER FIRM-SPECIFIC VARIABLES	230
8.1	Aims a	nd Approach of Chapter 8.	230
8.2	Board Positio	Factors II - Board Size and Outside Board	231
	8.2.1	Determinants of Optimum Board Size	231
	8.2.2	The Relationship between Board Size and Firm Operating Performance/Value is Inconclusive	233
	8.2.3	Do Board Positions of Outside Directors Reduce Monitoring Quality?	236
8.3		nkeover Mechanisms and Market for Corporate I – 'Whole' Board and 'Staggered' Board Ins	239
	8.3.1	Overview – Anti-Takeover Mechanisms May Reduce the Effectiveness of the Market for Corporate Control and May Reduce Firm Value	240
8.4	Audit S Expert	Sub-Committee – Presence, Independence and ise	245
	8.4.1	Effect of Audit Committee Independence and Financial Expertise on Firm Value and Operating Performance	246

	8.4.2	[AudCom] (+) Variable Relational Effect Path	248
	8.4.3	[AudIndMon] (+): Audit Committee – Independence – Monitoring Effect and	249
		[AudIndInfo] (-): Audit Committee – Information Flow and Decision Quality 'Trade-Off'	
	8.4.4	Likely Positive Effect between <u>Accounting</u> Financial Expertise and Firm Value and Operating Performance	250
8.5	'Block	c' and Institutional Shareholdings	252
	8.5.1	Governance Effects Both Positive and Negative	252
	8.5.2	[BlockMon] (+) and [BlockCosts] (-) Variables Relational Effect Paths	257
8.6	Divisi	on in CEO/Chairperson Roles	259
	8.6.1	Enhanced Firm Knowledge and 'Trade-off' with Board Control/Monitoring	259
	8.6.2	[DualTrade] (+/-) Variable Relational Effect Path	260
	8.6.3	[DualDismiss] (-) and [DualStrat] (-) Variables Relational Effect Paths	261
8.7	Contir Chapt	nuation of Empirical Studies Key Field No. 4 in er 9	263
EMPII BOAF		TUDIES KEY FIELD NO. 4 (PART 3): AUDIT COMMITTEE FACTORS AND EARNINGS ON	264
9.1		ngs Manipulation and Purpose and Approach apter 9	264
	9.1.1	Principal Aim of Reporting – To Reduce Information Asymmetry and Agency Risk	264
	9.1.2	Transparency and the 'Trade-Off' Effect on the Quality of Board and Market Monitoring	265
9.2	Earni Struct	ngs Manipulation and Board and Committee tures	272

	9.2.1	Board and Audit Committee Independence, Time, Financial Expertise and Duality of CEO/Chairperson	274
	9.2.2	Board and Audit Committee Size and Earnings Management	283
	9.2.3	Review of Auditors, Non-Audit Services and Earnings Management	284
	9.2.4	Summary and Conclusion of Empirical Studies Key Field No. 4 in Chapter 10.	289
EMPIF	D' CORP	TUDIES KEY FIELD NO. 4 (PART 4): ORATE GOVERNANCE AND DIRECTOR, CEO EMENT COMPENSATION	291
10.1	Overvi Chapte	iew of Governance Approaches and Purpose of er 10	291
	10.1.1	The Governance Issue - The Director/CEO Compensation Levels Variable: [DirCEO\$] (+/-)	292
	10.1.2	Approaches to Governance of Compensation	293
	10.1.3	'Alignment' of Performance, Option Compensation and the Purpose of Chapter 10	295
10.2	•	ensation, the Level/Quality of Monitoring and alue and Operating Performance	296
	10.2.1	Proportion of Insider/Management Equity Ownership – 'Incentive Alignment' Effect Countered By 'Entrenchment' Effect	296
	10.2.2	Studies Finding Positive Relationship Between Compensation and Firm Value and/or Operating Performance	297
	10.2.3	Studies Finding No or Negative Relationship Between Compensation and Firm Value and/or Operating Performance for [DirCEO\$]	299
	10.2.4	Summary of Studies and Relational Effect Paths for [DirCEO\$] (+/-), [EqOptIncent] (+) and [EqOptEntrch] (-)	307
	10.2.5	Short-Term Options and the Risk of Earnings Manipulation	310

	10.2.6	Possible Connection Between Director and CEO Compensation Level	312
10.3		ole Connection Between Firm Size and or/Executive Compensation	313
10.4	Compe Constr	ensation, Governance and Reputational raints	314
	10.4.1	Reputational Constraints on Compensation are Dependent on Disclosure and Transparency	314
10.5	Tensio	uding Remarks on the Recurring Themes and ons in Executive, CEO and Director ensation	316
	10.5.1	The Compensation 'Trade-off'	316
	10.5.2	Compensation and the Level/Quality of Monitoring	316
	10.5.3	Firm Operating Performance and Firm Value	317
	10.5.4	Short-Term Options and Earnings Manipulation	318
	10.5.5	Firm Size and Director/Executive Compensation	319
	10.5.6	Compensation and Reputational Constraints	319
10.6	Conclu	usion of Empirical Studies Key Field No. 4	319
	TER 11 TIONAL	APPROACH CONCLUSIONS	321
11.1		onal Approach Conclusions and Approach pter 11	321
11.2	Key Ai Chapte	ms and Developments of the Thesis from er 1	323
	11.2.1	To introduce a new definition of corporate governance	323
	11.2.2	To create a simulated corporate governance environment which represents the 'real world' sphere of corporate governance	325
	11.2.3	To identify, describe and map diagrammatically the interrelationships, themes and factors underpinning this environment	326

	11.2.4	To create a comparative table or scheme system upon which to compare across sectors and over time the Governance Variables utilised in the major US, UK, Australian and global Governance Codes and schemes	328
	11.2.5	As an over-arching aim, to propose an approach or tool for regulators and policy-makers to predict and measure the relative importance of Governance Variables in reducing (or increasing) agency costs and enhancing (or reducing) the long-term efficiency and sustainability of the for-profit firm	329
11.3		oplication of the Principal Theories of the Firm to lational Approach	330
11.4		uding Remarks for 'Overall' Governance and Board s I and II	331
	11.4.1	'Overall' or 'Multi-Variable' Governance	331
	11.4.2	Board Factors I - 'Independence' and Proportion of Non-Executive/Independent Directors	331
	11.4.3	Board Factors II - Board Size	332
	11.4.4	Audit Sub-Committee – Presence, Independence and Expertise	332
	11.4.5	Independence and Earnings Management	333
	11.4.6	Executive, CEO and Director Compensation	333
11.5		vations on the Explanatory Power of the onal Approach and Future Research	335
11.6	Conclu	uding Remarks for the Thesis	336

APPENDICIES

SECTI	ON AND TITLE	PAGE
APPEI	NDIX A	338
A1:	GLOSSARY OF RELATIONAL CORPORATE GOVERNANCE APPROACH TERMS AND COMPONENTS	338
A2:	GLOSSARY OF GOVERNANCE VARIABLES	345
APPEI	NDIX B:	352
ADDIT	IONAL REFERENCES FOR CHAPTERS 1 – 5	
B1:	The Operation and Efficacy of Corporate Governance Variables in the 2008 Global Financial Crisis	352
B2:	Accounts of the Enron and Other Corporate Collapses	354
B3:	References on the Separation of Ownership from Management	357
B4:	Discussion of Models of the Firm and Corporate Governance Theories	359
APPENDIX C:		360
ADDIT 6 – 10	IONAL REFERENCES AND TABLES FOR CHAPTERS	
C1:	Harmonisation or Convergence of Global and National Corporate Governance	360
C2:	Summary of Content and Themes from SOX Reforms	362
	SOX Summary Table: Summary of SOX Content and Themes	362
C3:	Evaluations of the SOX Reforms	371
C4:	Summary of Content and Themes from NYSE 'Core' Variables	373
	NYSE Summary Table: NYSE 'Core' Variables and Themes	373

APPEN	DIX D1:	380
	RING THEMES AND TENSIONS IN EMPIRICAL STUDIES ELD NO. 4 (PARTS 1 AND 2)	
	Summary Table D1: Benefits and Effects from the National Shareholder Protection Regime and Board Factors I and II	381
APPEN	DIX D2:	392
	RING THEMES AND TENSIONS IN EMPIRICAL STUDIES ELD NO. 4 (PART 3)	
	Summary Table D2: Benefits and Effects from the Board and Audit Committee Factors and Earnings Manipulation	393
APPEN	DIX E:	400
ADDITI	DIX E: ONAL REFERENCES FOR EMPIRICAL STUDIES KEY NO. 4 (PART 4)	400
ADDITI	ONAL REFERENCES FOR EMPIRICAL STUDIES KEY	400 400
ADDITI	ONAL REFERENCES FOR EMPIRICAL STUDIES KEY NO. 4 (PART 4) Additional References on Director, CEO and Management	
ADDITION NO.	ONAL REFERENCES FOR EMPIRICAL STUDIES KEY NO. 4 (PART 4) Additional References on Director, CEO and Management Compensation	400

BIBLIOGRAPHIES

SECTION AND TITLE	PAGE
BIBLIOGRAPHY F1:	410
KEY FIELD NO. 1 – THE APPLICATION OF THE PRINCIPAL THEORIES OF THE FIRM TO THE RELATIONAL APPROACH	
BIBLIOGRAPHY F2:	420
KEY FIELD NO. 2 - AUTOPSIES OF THE ENRON AND HASTIE CORPORATE COLLAPSES	
BIBLIOGRAPHY F3:	433
KEY FIELD NO. 3 – COMPARATIVE CORPORATE GOVERNANCE CODES	
BIBLIOGRAPHY F4:	442
KEY FIELD NO. 4 – EMPIRICAL STUDIES ON THE EFFECTIVENESS OF GOVERNANCE VARIABLES	