



THE UNIVERSITY
of ADELAIDE

**The Double Heuristic Method: Perspectives on how
teachers deal with an alternative model for teaching
in the VET sector.**

Homayoon Azemikhah

**This thesis is submitted in total fulfillment of the
requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy**

2013

University of Adelaide

**The Double Heuristic Method: Perspectives on how
teachers deal with an alternative model for teaching
in the VET Sector.**

Homayoon Azemikhah
Master of Management and Organisational Development;
Bachelor of Business; Graduate Diploma of Further Education and
Training; Graduate Diploma in Financial Management.

Faculty of the Professions,
School of Education,
University of Adelaide

March 2013

Declaration by Candidate

I certify that, except where due acknowledgement has been made, the work is that of the author alone.

This work has not been accepted, in whole or in part, to qualify for any other award in any university or other tertiary institution and to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where reference has been made in the text; the content of the thesis is the result of work which has been carried out since the official commencement date of the approved research program; and any editorial work, paid or unpaid, carried out by a third party is acknowledged.

I give consent to a copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University Library, being available for loan and photocopying.

Homayoon Azemikhah

31 March, 2013

Acknowledgements

I wish to gratefully acknowledge the following for their contribution to the research process and the development of this thesis, that is:

- The participants who willingly provided such wonderful accounts of their rich perceptions of the application of the Double Heuristic Method and the development of competency in the Training Packages context;
- Professor Tania Aspland of the University of Adelaide, who as my supervisor, has maintained her faith in my capacity to undertake my research and has willingly read and provided me with constructive feedback on my work over a period of more than six years;
- My friend and editor, George Sterling, who checked and edited the manuscript;
- My colleague and now friend Glenda Ashleigh, who provided editing feedback and advice on some formatting and layout issues;
- Ray Adams of Semiota for final editing and formatting of the manuscript.

I am most sincerely grateful to all those listed above, especially the research participants whose voices I have tried to foreground throughout this account.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Declaration by Candidate.....	i
Acknowledgements	ii
List of Figures.....	viii
List of Tables	ix
List of Acronyms	x
ABSTRACT.....	1
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION.....	2
1.1 The Researcher’s signature story	2
1.2 The aim of the study.....	6
1.3 The central research question and the guiding research questions.....	7
1.3.1. Central Research Question:	7
1.4 Research Design and Research Methods	8
1.4.1. Study Population and Sample	8
1.5 Data Gathering and Data Analysis.....	8
1.6 Structure of the Thesis	9
1.7 Data analysis chapters.....	11
CHAPTER 2: BACKGROUND AND CONTEXT.....	14
2.1 International context.....	14
2.2 The three emerging typologies.....	16
2.3 United Kingdom VET context	21
2.4 Australian VET context.....	24
2.5 Content era, competency era and paradigm shift	32
2.5.1. Anomalies (Kuhn 1970).....	35
2.6 The revolution in VET education.....	36
2.7 Conclusion	37
CHAPTER 3: LITERATURE REVIEW.....	40
3.1 Introduction.....	40
3.2 Lifelong learning.....	40
3.2.1. Lisbon Strategy 2000: Searching for a global 21 st Century approach to VET.....	43
3.3 Competency development.....	45

3.3.1. The structure of IVET systems	52
3.3.2. IVET, CVET and VET pedagogy.....	53
3.4 In search of a theory of applied learning.....	56
3.5 Empirical research in vocational education in the UK.....	57
3.5.1. Education and training for the 21 st century (1991)	60
3.5.2. Moser Report (1999).....	60
3.5.3. Learning and Skills Act (2000).....	61
3.5.4. Success for all (2002)	61
3.5.5. The White Paper, 21 st Century skills: Realising our potential (2003)	62
3.5.6. Equipping our teachers for the future (2004).....	62
3.5.7. White paper: 14-19 education and skills, February 2005.	63
3.5.8. Foster Review (2005) and VET as neglected middle child	63
3.5.9. Leitch Report (2006).....	64
3.5.10. FE Reform White Paper - Raising skills, improving life chances (2006).....	65
3.5.11. Initial teacher training – Making the reform happen (DfES), (2007)	66
3.5.12. Teacher training in vocational education (Skills Commission – Tomlinson, 2010).....	66
3.5.12.1. The first area of neglect.....	67
3.5.12.2. The second area of neglect	68
3.5.13. Wolf Report (UK) 2011 – labour market shift away from 14-19 cohorts	68
3.6 Exploring empirical research and policies in the Australian VET.....	69
3.6.1. Training Packages.....	71
3.6.2. Industry-led replaced provider-led vocational education	72
3.6.3. New order in education and the new vocationalism of the 21 st Century	74
3.6.4. Emergence of new vocational education practitioner.....	75
3.6.5. New pedagogy	77
3.6.6. Supporting quality teaching, learning and assessment	81
3.6.7. Complexities and Opportunities Report (Mitchell et al, 2005).....	82
3.6.8. Quality is the Key (2006).....	82
3.6.9. Australian Quality Training Framework (AQTF) 2007 – Aiming at quality outcomes.....	83
3.6.10. Employability skills in Training Packages (2008).....	84
3.6.11. Integration into industry expectations of vocational education and training assessment – Final Report (NQC 2008)	84
3.6.12. VET products for the 21 st Century (2009)	85
3.6.13. Report on streamlined Training Package material (2010)	86
3.6.14. Creating a future direction for VET: Discussion paper (Skills Australia 2010).....	87

3.6.15. Skills for prosperity – a roadmap for vocational education and training (Skills Australia 2011) Final Report.....	90
3.7 Conclusion	92
CHAPTER 4: THE CONCEPTUAL and THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK	96
4.1 Introduction.....	96
4.2 Concept of competence.....	97
4.3 Competencivism.....	101
4.3.1. Premise 1 - Certainty	102
4.3.2. Premise 2 - Independency.....	107
4.3.3. Premise 3 - Currency	109
4.3.4. Premise 4 - Intelligence	111
4.4 Double Heuristic Method (DHM).....	114
4.5 Conclusion	115
CHAPTER 5: THE DOUBLE HEURISTIC METHOD (DHM)	117
5.1 Introduction.....	117
5.2 The Double Heuristic Method.....	117
5.2.1. The First Heuristic	119
5.2.1.1. The concepts	120
5.2.1.2. The skills.....	120
5.2.1.3. Performance criteria	121
5.2.1.4. Competency Learning Event	122
5.3 The Second Heuristic	122
5.3.1.1. Required knowledge.....	123
5.3.1.2. Elements	123
5.3.1.3. Teaching strategies	124
5.3.1.4. Focus questions.....	124
5.4 Pedagogical significance of the DHM	124
5.5 How the DHM is used.....	126
5.5.1. Illustrating example of using the DHM	127
5.5.1.1. First Heuristic	127
5.5.1.2. Second Heuristic.....	131
5.6 Using the DHM for assessment purposes	134
5.7 Conclusion	134
CHAPTER 6: METHODOLOGY.....	136
6.1 Introduction.....	136
6.2 Theoretical underpinnings of the study.....	136

6.2.1. Central research question:.....	137
6.2.2. Guiding questions	137
6.2.3. Symbolic Interactionism.....	138
6.3 Locating the research question within the Symbolic Interactionist theory	140
6.4 Data gathering and study population.....	143
6.5 Grounded theory.....	143
6.6 Study population and theoretical sampling	144
6.7 VET teachers.....	147
6.8 The interrelationship between data collection and analysis	147
6.9 Semi-structured interviews.....	147
6.10 Probing questions	148
6.11 Recording of data	149
6.12 Data analysis	150
6.12.1. Code notes and theoretical memos	151
6.12.2. Axial coding.....	155
6.12.3. Selective coding.....	156
6.13 Findings and further Chapters.....	157
6.14 Evaluation of the study.....	158
6.14.1. Credibility	158
6.14.2. Transferability.....	158
6.14.3. Dependability.....	159
6.14.4. Confirmability.....	159
6.15 Ethical considerations	159
6.16 Conclusion	160
CHAPTER 7: CLARIFYING ROLE OF the DOUBLE HEURISTIC	
METHOD.....	162
7.1 Introduction.....	162
7.2 Appropriateness.....	163
7.3 Articulation	166
7.4 Effective communication	167
7.5 Precision.....	170
7.6 Conclusion	175
CHAPTER 8: TEACHERS' PERSPECTIVES ON THE	
CONFIRMATORY ROLE OF DOUBLE HEURISTIC METHOD.....	177
8.1 Introduction.....	177
8.2 Validity.....	178
8.3 Guiding.....	180

8.4 Improvement of performance.....	184
8.4.1. Improvement in students' learning	187
8.5 Conclusion	189
CHAPTER 9: TEACHERS' PERSPECTIVES ON SYNTHESISING ROLE OF DOUBLE HEURISTIC METHOD.....	191
9.1 Introduction.....	191
9.2 Seeing the picture.....	191
9.2.1 The teachers already know it.....	193
9.2.2 The teachers are not aware that they know it	193
9.2.3 So, the DHM is going to paint a picture of it	194
9.2.4 Then the teachers would say they knew it.....	194
9.2.5 Then the teachers will be able to give a description of it	194
9.3 Comprehending the substructure of the DHM.....	197
9.4 VET delivery planning.....	201
9.4.1 Planning.....	202
9.4.2 Designing.....	203
9.4.3 Delivery.....	204
9.5 Conclusion.....	206
CHAPTER 10: THE THEORY OF PROGRESSIVE REVELATION OF PEDAGOGICAL ENGAGEMENT.....	208
10.1 Introduction.....	208
10.2 Discussion	210
10.3 Recommendation for practice	214
10.4 Recommendations for Future Research	215
References	218
Appendix A: Professional Development Program on Double Heuristic Method (DHM)	231

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 2.1: Holistic model of competence adopted from Le Deist and Winterton (2005).....	20
Figure 2.2: Four types of competences in holistic typology of competence adopted from Le Deist and Winterton (2005).....	21
Figure 3.1: IVET pathways (adapted from CEDEFOP 2008).....	53
Figure 3.2: World of learning and world of work.....	55
Figure 4.1: Equilibrium of hands and mind.....	100
Figure 4.2: Equilibrium of mental reflection and physical Action.....	101
Figure 4.3: The four premises.....	102
Figure 4.4: Competency certainty (CC) diagram.....	104
Figure 4.5: The transposition of competency and learning.....	108
Figure 4.6: Integration/disintegration in competencivism.....	111
Figure 4.7: Theoretical framework of competencivism underpinning the DHM.....	115
Figure 5.1: The Heuristics of the DHM.....	118
Figure 5.2: First Heuristic of the DHM.....	119
Figure 5.3: The Second Heuristic frames the First Heuristic.....	123
Figure 5.4: The completed DHM template.....	126
Figure 5.5 : First Heuristic of the DHM.....	130
Figure 5.6 : Completed DHM showing both First and Second Heuristics.....	133
Figure 5.7: Completed DHM showing both First and Second Heuristics for an assessment.....	134
Figure 10.1: The DHM and clarity outcome.....	211
Figure 10.2: Theory of Progressive Revelation of Pedagogical Engagement (PROPE).....	213

LIST OF TABLES

Table 5.1: Selecting relevant Performance Criteria.....	128
Table 6.1: Development of the interview guide questions from the guiding questions.	143
Table 6.2: Data gathering chronology	146
Table 6.3: Some examples of open coding interview transcript.....	152
Table 6.4: Emerged concept categories	155
Table 6.5: Categories emerged	156
Table 6.6 Three key theoretical propositions grounded in the data of the study.....	157

LIST OF ACRONYMS

ACTU/TDC	Australian Council of Trade Unions and Trade Development Council
ANTA	Australian National Training Authority
APEC	Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation
AQF	Australian Qualification Framework
AQFC	Australian Qualifications Framework Council
AQTF	Australian Quality Training Framework
CBT	Competency Based Training
CCM	Constant Comparative Method
CEDEFOP	Centre Européen de Développement de Formation Professionnelle
CI	Competency Intelligence
CLE	Competency Learning Event
COAG	Council of Australian Governments
CODE	Competency Development
CP	Competent Position
CTC	The Confusion to Clarity Theory
CTE	The Career and Technical Education system representing VET In Texas
CQ	Competency Quotient
CVET	Continuous Vocational Education and Training
DeSeCo	Definition and Selection of Competencies
DEST	Department of Education, Science and Training
DHM	Double Heuristic Method
EI	Emotional Intelligence
EQ	Emotional Quotient
EU	European Union
FE	Further Education
FH	First heuristic
FQ	Focus Question
GIT	Graphical Interface Template of DHM

GNVQ	General National Vocational Qualification (UK)
HE	Higher Education
HLR	High Level Review
HP	Horizontal Pedagogies
HRD	Human Resource Development
ICEQ	Intelligence, Competency & Emotional Quotient combined
ILO	International Labour Organisation
IQ	Intelligence Quotient
IVET	Initial Vocational Education and Training
Kompetenz	“Competence” in German language
KSA	Knowledge, Skills, Attributes
Lernfelder	“Learning fields” in German language
LLL	Lifelong Learning
LLUK	Lifelong Learning United Kingdom
LSC	Learning and Skills Councils (UK)
NCVER	National Centre for Vocational Education and Research
NCVQ	National Council for Vocational Qualifications (UK)
NP	Not yet competent position
NQF	National Qualification Framework (UK)
NV	New Vocationalism
NCVQ	National Council for Vocational Qualifications (UK)
NQC	National Quality Council
NVQ	National Vocational Qualification (UK)
NVQ	National Vocational Qualification framework in the United Kingdom
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
O' NET	Occupational Network online database in United States
OTM	Open Training Market
PBTE	Performance Based Teacher Education
PDP	Professional development Program

PISA	Programme for International Student Assessment and is used to evaluate students of OECD member countries
POT	Point of Transposition of competency
PR	Progressive Revelation
PROPE	Progressive Revelation of Pedagogical Engagement
QCF	Qualification and Credit Framework (UK)
QTLS	Qualified Teachers Learning and Skills status (UK)
RTO	Registered Training Organisation
SH	Second Heuristic
SSC	Sector skills Councils (SSCs) UK-wide
TAFE	Tertiary and Further Education
TP	Training Packages
TDC	Trade Development Council
TQM	Total Quality Management
TVEI	Technical Vocational Education Initiative (UK)
UK	United Kingdom
USA	United States of America
V	Gowin's Vee
VET	Vocational Education and Training
VP	Vertical Pedagogies
WA	Western Australia

ABSTRACT

The aim of this research has been to investigate how teachers in Vocational Education and Training (VET) in Australia deal with the Double Heuristic Method (DHM) as an alternative model for teaching in the VET Sector.

The context is set within a vocational educational landscape globally, highlighting approaches in the delivery of vocational education in the USA, European countries and Australia. In pursuit of these approaches, various typologies of competency-based training (CBT) are explored. The VET systems around the world have been undergoing a period of continuous reform, moving VET systems towards a more holistic approach of teaching and learning in higher education. In such a context, the Australian VET sector has been and continues to be faced with challenges in the implementation of the Australian Training Packages, the core curriculum for the VET sector.

This inquiry has been implemented within an interpretive paradigm in seeking to capture teachers' perspectives of using the DHM and to investigate how VET teachers deal with the pedagogical challenges in their work. Central to the research question is investigating how teachers deal with an alternative model of pedagogy, the Double Heuristic Model, from their own frames of reference, and as they experience it. Qualitative methods have been used for data collection and analysis. The primary source of data was a series of semi-structured interviews. The data analysis was based on the principles of grounded theory method as outlined in the work of Strauss and Corbin (1990) whereby participants are placed in a position to consider a phenomenon and how they make meaning of that phenomena. In pursuing this approach to methodology in the two years of data collection and analysis, all three types of coding were utilised: open coding, axial coding and selective coding (Strauss and Corbin, 1990).

As the Double Heuristic Method is a relatively new approach in vocational education in Australia, there has not been any prior research on its use in this area. Hence, this research contributes to developing new insights into teachers' perspectives and responses to one approach in teaching the Units of Competency in the Training Packages in Australia, using an alternative pedagogical framework.