

The Experimental and Theoretical Study of
Fines Migration in Porous Media under
Particle-rock Repulsion and Attraction

Kaiser Aji

A thesis submitted for the degree of Doctor of
Philosophy (PhD)

Australian School of Petroleum

Faculty of Engineering, Computer & Mathematical Sciences

The University of Adelaide



October 2014

Table of Contents

Abstract	iii
Statement of Originality	vi
Acknowledgment	vii
Thesis by Publications	viii
Statement of Authors' Contributions	x
1 Contextual Statement	1
1.1 Thesis Structure	6
1.2 Relation between Publications and This Thesis	9
1.3 References	14
2 Literature Review	16
2.1 Introduction	16
2.2 Particle Migration in Porous Media	18
2.2.1 Chemical Mechanism	19
2.2.2 Physical Mechanism	20
2.3 Permeability Reduction due to Size Exclusion	21
2.4 Deep Bed Filtration Theory	24
2.5 Methodology of Experimental Study	27
2.5.1 Experimental Study under the Particle-Rock Repulsion during Suspension Flow	28
2.5.2 Determining the Pore Throat Size Distribution	30
2.6 References	31
3 Particle Transport in Porous Media under Particle-Rock Repulsion: Experimental and Theoretical Study	34
3.1 Transport and Straining of Suspension in Porous Media: Experimental and Theoretical Study	35

3.2	Colloidal Flow in Aquifers during Produced Water Disposal: Experimental and Mathematical Modelling	41
3.3	Effect of Nanoparticle Transport and Retention in Oilfield Rocks on the Efficiency of Different Nanotechnologies in Oil Industry	67
3.4	Study of Particle Straining Effect on Produced Water Management and Injectivity Enhancement	83
3.5	Colloidal-suspension Flow in Rocks: A New Mathematical Model, Laboratory Study, IOR	96
4	Particle Transport in Porous Media under Particle-Rock Attraction: Experimental and Theoretical Study	115
4.1	Particle Deposition and Mobilization during Deep Bed Filtration in Oilfield	116
4.2	Experimental Study of Colloidal Flow in Porous Media at High Velocities	130
4.3	High Velocity Colloidal Flow in Porous Media: Experimental Study and Modelling	139
5	Critical Analysis of Uncertainties during the Deep Bed Filtration	179
5.1	Size Exclusion Deep Bed Filtration: Experimental and Modelling Uncertainties	180
5.2	Critical Analysis of Uncertainties during Particle Filtration	194
6	Summary and Conclusion	204

Abstract

This is a PhD thesis by publication. The essence of the research performed has been published in one book chapter, five journal papers and four SPE papers.

The thesis contains laboratory study of deep bed filtration in porous media accounting for particle migration, mobilization and straining for two particular cases: straining-dominant particle capture and filtering under high flow velocities.

Advanced *challenge core flood test* methodology to determine pore throat size distribution *under unfavorable particle retention conditions* is designed and developed in the thesis. It includes significant advance in design of the laboratory set-up if compared with previous version, development of the test procedures to provide the particle-rock repulsion and measure the *post-mortem* retention profile, analysis of accuracy and uncertainties of the experiments.

In more details, the improvements of the laboratory set-up and procedures include sieving of glass beads in the ultrasonic bath with consequent reduction of the sieving time and more reproducible grain size distribution, application of the dual syringe pump system with continuous injection of suspension and pulseless delivery of particles in the porous medium, measurements of the retention profile after the test by cutting up the porous column in 4-6 pieces and dispersing the material in water. The above methods are applicable to continuous as well as to a pulse type particle injection. Latex particle have been injected into packed glass beads or borosilicate filters at different concentrations, velocities, pH, and salinities. However, main varying parameters are size distributions of injected latex particles and compacted glass beads. The tests show that the pore throat size distributions can be recovered from the challenge tests.

Another development of the thesis includes deep bed filtration investigation under *high flow velocities under favorable particle retention conditions*. It includes the design of laboratory set-up, development of the experimental methodology to reveal the hysteretic phenomena of the particle attachment and detachment under high velocities, treatment of the data using the Forchheimer law of high velocity flow in rocks and formulating the modified Forchheimer law under the conditions of formation damage, development of the methodology for estimates of the accuracy and uncertainties of the performed laboratory high-velocity tests.

In more details, high velocity suspension flow in engineered porous medium was studied at various volumetric flow rates and conditions favorable for particle attachment under the occurrence of the phenomena of particle deposition, mobilization, migration and entrainment. The maximum retention function (the critical particle retention concentration) derived is a quadratic function of flow velocity. A strong particle surface attraction as indicated by calculation of DLVO energy potential, translates to almost a quarter of filter surface coverage by the attached particles. The particles can't be removed by an increase of solution velocity only due to strong particle-matrix attraction. The removal of approximately 17.5 % of the attached particles was achieved only after the reduction of salinity and increase in pH of solution at maximum velocity.

The work includes the development of the Forchheimer model for the case of particle retention, i.e. the advanced formula for inertial coefficient versus retained concentration is proposed. Application of the Forchheimer law to the laboratory data results in the formation damage coefficient dependency of the critical retained concentration and the inverse dimensionless function of velocity. The inertial coefficient showed similar behavior at low velocities, although it remained almost constant at low surface coverage. Partial formation of the external cake on the inlet surface of the filter was observed by a

post-experimental examination using an optical microscope and via an abrupt increase in the formation damage and inertial coefficients during particle deposition at lower velocities. The partial cake coverage is the indication of the continuation of deep bed filtration even at high surface coverage which is supported by high filtration coefficient values at lower velocities. Results from the theoretical micro scale model based on the torque balance exerted on attached fine particles agree well with the experimental critical retention concentration data within combined standard uncertainties in the entire range of velocities. It allows proposing the model with modified Forchheimer flow equation and micro scale based maximum retention function for high velocity colloidal flows in porous media.

Statement of Originality

This work contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published by or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text.

I give consent to this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University Library, being made available for loan and photocopying, subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.

The author acknowledges that copyright of published works contained within this thesis (as listed below) resides with the copyright holder/s of those works.

I also give permission for the digital version of my thesis to be made available on the web, via the University's digital research repository, the library catalogue, the Australian Digital Theses program (ADTP) and also through web search engines, unless permission has been granted by the university to restrict access for a period of time.

Signed.....

Date.....

Acknowledgment

First and foremost I offer my sincerest gratitude to my supervisor, Professor Pavel Bedrikovetsky, who has supported me throughout my thesis with his patience and knowledge whilst allowing me to work in my own way. I am very appreciative of his generosity with his time, advice, and contribution. His guidance helped me in the entire time of researching and writing of this thesis.

Besides my advisor, I would like to thank Dr. Alexander Badalyan and my Co-Supervisor Dr. Themis Carageorgos for her support, reviews, comments, criticisms and advices during my research. They also aided my various laboratorial and experimental works during the development of my research.

My sincere thank also goes to Dr. Zhenjiang You, for helping me with the theoretical part of my research.

In my daily work I have been blessed with a friendly and cheerful group of fellow students at Australian School of Petroleum. Thanks to all for welcoming and helping. I deeply appreciate ASP for providing all the equipments I needed to accomplish my thesis.

Finally, I thank my parents and family members for supporting me throughout all my studies at University. They have always provided unwavering love and encouragement.

Thesis by Publications

Book Chapter

1. **Aji K.**, Badalyan A., Carageorgos T., Zeinijahromi A., Bedrikovetsky P. *High Velocity Colloidal Flow in Porous Media: Experimental study and modeling*, in: Focus on Porous Media Research, Ed. by Zhao C, 2013, Nova Science Publishers, NY.

Peer Reviewed Publications

2. **Aji K.** *Particle deposition and mobilization during deep bed filtration in oil field*. International Journal of Oil, Gas and Coal Technology. Accepted on 31.06. **2013**. (<http://www.inderscience.com/info/ingeneral/forthcoming.php?jcode=ijgct>)
3. Badalyan A., You Z, **Aji K.**, Bedrikovetsky P., Carageorgos T., Zeinijahromi A. *Size exclusion deep bed filtration: experimental and modelling uncertainties*. Review of Scientific Instruments. V. 85, 015111.**2014**.
4. **Aji K.** *Experimental study of colloidal flow in porous media at high velocities*. Asia-Pacific Journal of Chemical Engineering. DOI: 10.1002/apj.1782.**2013**.
5. **Aji K.**, You Z., Badalyan A. *Transport and straining of suspensions in porous media: experimental and theoretical study*. Thermal Science. **2012**, 16(5), 1444-1448.
6. Badalyan A., Carageorgos T., Bedrikovetsky P., You Z., Zeinijahromi A., **Aji K.** *Critical analysis of uncertainties during particle filtration*. Review of Scientific Instruments, 83, 095106/1-9. **2012**.

SPE (Society of Petroleum Engineering) Papers

7. McLindin C., Saha A., Le K., **Aji K.**, You Z., Badalyan A., Bedrikovetsky P. *Colloidal flow in aquifers during produced water disposal: experimental and mathematical*

- modelling*. SPE-153502-MS. SPE Middle East Health, Safety, Security, and Environmental Conference, 2-4 April **2012**, Abu Dhabi, UAE. DOI: 10.2118/153502-MS.
- 8.** You Z., **Aji K.**, Badalyan A., Bedrikovetsky P. *Effect of nanoparticle transport and retention in oilfield rocks on the efficiency of different nanotechnologies in oil industry*. SPE-157097-MS. SPE International Oilfield Nanotechnology Conference, 12-14 June **2012**, Noordwijk, The Netherlands. DOI: 10.2118/157097-MS. ISBN: 978-1-61399-206-7.
- 9.** **Aji K.**, You Z., Badalyan A., Bedrikovetsky P. *Study of particle straining effect on produced water management and injectivity enhancement*. SPE-157399-MS. SPE International Production and Operations Conference & Exhibition, 14-16 May **2012**, Doha, Qatar. DOI: 10.2118/157399-MS. ISBN: 978-1-61399-201-2.
- 10.** **Aji K.**, McLindin C., Saha A., Le K., You Z., Badalyan A., Bedrikovetsky P. *Colloidal-suspension flow in rocks: a new mathematical model, laboratory study, IOR*. SPE-152025-MS, The 2012 SPE EOR Conference at Oil and Gas West Asia, 16-18 April 2012, Muscat, Oman. DOI: 10.2118/152025-MS. ISBN: 978-1-61399-199-2.

Statement of Authors' Contributions

This thesis comprises a portfolio of ten publications that have been published, accepted for publication and/or submitted for publications in accordance with 'Academic Program Rules and Specifications 2012'. All journals to which the papers have been submitted are indexed in the 'ERA 2012 Journal List' database. The research summarized in the papers that constitute this thesis was undertaken within 'Formation Damage and EOR Research Group' at Australian School of Petroleum and with other universities and industry collaborators. Hence all the papers presented herein are co-authored and detail statements of relative contributions are endorsed by the co-authors.

Statement of Authorship

Title of Paper	Transport and straining of suspensions in porous media: experimental and theoretical study
Publication Status	<input checked="" type="radio"/> Published, <input type="radio"/> Accepted for Publication, <input type="radio"/> Submitted for Publication, <input type="radio"/> Publication style
Publication Details	Aji K., You Z., Badalyan A. Transport and straining of suspensions in porous media: experimental and theoretical study. Thermal Science. 2012, 16(5), 1444-1448.

Author Contributions

By signing the Statement of Authorship, each author certifies that their stated contribution to the publication is accurate and that permission is granted for the publication to be included in the candidate's thesis.

Name of Principal Author (Candidate)	Kaiser Aji		
Contribution to the Paper	Experimental design and work, data analysis, wrote manuscript		
Signature		Date	08/03/2014

Name of Co-Author	Zhenjiang You		
Contribution to the Paper	Helped model prediction and calculation		
Signature		Date	11/3/14

Name of Co-Author	Alexander Badalyan		
Contribution to the Paper	Supervised experimental set up and work		
Signature		Date	08/03/2014.

Name of Co-Author			
Contribution to the Paper			
Signature		Date	

Statement of Authorship

Title of Paper	Colloidal Flow in Aquifers during Produced Water Disposal: Experimental and Mathematical Modelling
Publication Status	<input checked="" type="radio"/> Published, <input type="radio"/> Accepted for Publication, <input type="radio"/> Submitted for Publication, <input type="radio"/> Publication style
Publication Details	McLindin C., Saha A., Le K., Aji K., You Z., Badalyan A., Bedrikovetsky P Colloidal Flow in Aquifers during Produced Water Disposal: Experimental and Mathematical Modelling. SPE-153502-MS, The 2012 SPE Middle East Health, Safety, Security, and Environment Conference Held in Abu Dhabi, UAE, 2-4 April 2012, . DOI: 10.2118/153502-MS.

Author Contributions

By signing the Statement of Authorship, each author certifies that their stated contribution to the publication is accurate and that permission is granted for the publication to be included in the candidate's thesis.

Name of Principal Author (Candidate)	Cale McLindin		
Contribution to the Paper	Data assimilation and wrote manuscript		
Signature	_____	Date	23/04/2014

Name of Co-Author	Atanu Saha		
Contribution to the Paper	Helped data analysis and experimental work		
Signature	_____	Date	29/04/2014

Name of Co-Author	Khoi Le		
Contribution to the Paper	Helped experimental work		
Signature	_____	Date	15/04/2014

Name of Co-Author	Kaiser Aji		
Contribution to the Paper	Helped and guided design experimental work, data assimilation and wrote manuscript		
Signature	_____	Date	07/05/2014

Name of Co-Author	Zhenjiang You		
Contribution to the Paper	Helped model prediction, data evaluation wrote manuscript		
Signature		Date	12/5/14

Name of Co-Author	Alexander Badalyan		
Contribution to the Paper	Supervised experimental design and work, data analysis		
Signature		Date	12.05.2014.

Name of Co-Author	Pavel Bedikovetsky		
Contribution to the Paper	Supervised writing of the manuscript		
Signature		12/05/2014	

Statement of Authorship

Title of Paper	Effect of Nanoparticle Transport and retention in Oilfield Rocks on The Efficiency of Different Nanotechnologies in Oil Industry
Publication Status	<input checked="" type="radio"/> Published, <input type="radio"/> Accepted for Publication, <input type="radio"/> Submitted for Publication, <input type="radio"/> Publication style
Publication Details	You Z., Aji K., Badalyan A., Bedrikovetsky P. Effect of Nanoparticle Transport and retention in Oilfield Rocks on The Efficiency of Different Nanotechnologies in Oil Industry SPE-157097-MS, The 2012 SPE International Oilfield Nanotechnology Conference held in Noordwijk, The Netherld. 12-14 June 2012, . DOI: 10.2118/157097-MS. ISBN: 978-1-61399-206-7.

Author Contributions

By signing the Statement of Authorship, each author certifies that their stated contribution to the publication is accurate and that permission is granted for the publication to be included in the candidate's thesis.

Name of Principal Author (Candidate)	Zhenjiang You		
Contribution to the Paper	Data assimilation and wrote manuscript		
Signature	_____	Date	12/5/14

Name of Co-Author	Kaiser Aji		
Contribution to the Paper	Helped experimental design, work, data assimilation and writing manuscript		
Signature	_____	Date	07/05/2014

Name of Co-Author	Alexander Badalyan		
Contribution to the Paper	Supervised experimental design and work, data analysis		
Signature	_____	Date	12.05.2014

Name of Co-Author	Pavel Bedrikovetsky		
Contribution to the Paper	Supervised writing of the manuscript		
Signature	_____	Date	12/05/2014

Statement of Authorship

Title of Paper	Study of particle straining effect on produced water management and injectivity enhancement
Publication Status	<input checked="" type="radio"/> Published, <input type="radio"/> Accepted for Publication, <input type="radio"/> Submitted for Publication, <input type="radio"/> Publication style
Publication Details	Aji K., You Z., Badalyan A., Bedrikovetsky P. Study of particle straining effect on produced water management and injectivity enhancement. SPE-157399-MS. SPE International Production and Operations Conference & Exhibition, 14-16 May 2012, Doha, Qatar. DOI: 10.2118/157399-MS. ISBN: 978-1-61399-201-2.

Author Contributions

By signing the Statement of Authorship, each author certifies that their stated contribution to the publication is accurate and that permission is granted for the publication to be included in the candidate's thesis.

Name of Principal Author (Candidate)	Kaiser Aji		
Contribution to the Paper	Experimental design, setup, work and wrote manuscript		
Signature		Date	08/03/2014

Name of Co-Author	Zhenjiang You		
Contribution to the Paper	Helped model prediction, data evaluation wrote manuscript		
Signature		Date	11/3/14

Name of Co-Author	Alexander Badalyan		
Contribution to the Paper	Supervised experimental design and work, data analysis		
Signature		Date	08/03/2014

Name of Co-Author	Pavel Bedrikovetsky		
Contribution to the Paper	Supervised writing of the manuscript		
Signature		Date	08/03/2014

Statement of Authorship

Title of Paper	Colloidal-suspension flow in rocks: a new mathematical model, laboratory study, IOR.
Publication Status	<input checked="" type="radio"/> Published, <input type="radio"/> Accepted for Publication, <input type="radio"/> Submitted for Publication, <input type="radio"/> Publication style
Publication Details	Aji K., McLindin C., Saha A., Le K., You Z., Badalyan A., Bedrikovetsky P. Colloidal-suspension flow in rocks: a new mathematical model, laboratory study, IOR. SPE-152025-MS, The 2012 SPE EOR Conference at Oil and Gas West Asia, 16-18 April 2012, Muscat, Oman. DOI: 10.2118/152025-MS. ISBN: 978-1-61399-199-2.

Author Contributions

By signing the Statement of Authorship, each author certifies that their stated contribution to the publication is accurate and that permission is granted for the publication to be included in the candidate's thesis.

Name of Principal Author (Candidate)	Kaiser Aji		
Contribution to the Paper	Experimental design, work, data assimilation and wrote manuscript		
Signature		Date	08/03/2014

Name of Co-Author	Cale McLindin		
Contribution to the Paper	Helped experimental work		
Signature		Date	23/04/2014.

Name of Co-Author	Atanu Saha		
Contribution to the Paper	Helped experimental work		
Signature		Date	29/04/2014

Name of Co-Author	Khoi Le		
Contribution to the Paper	Helped experimental work		
Signature		Date	15/04/2014

Name of Co-Author	Zhenjiang You		
Contribution to the Paper	Helped model prediction, data evaluation wrote manuscript		
Signature		Date	12/5/14

Name of Co-Author	Alexander Badalyan		
Contribution to the Paper	Supervised experimental design and work, data analysis		
Signature		Date	12.05.2014

Name of Co-Author	Pavel Bedikovetsky		
Contribution to the Paper	Supervised writing of the manuscript		
Signature		Date	15/05/2014

Statement of Authorship

Title of Paper	Particle deposition and mobilization during deep bed filtration in oil field
Publication Status	<input checked="" type="radio"/> Published, <input type="radio"/> Accepted for Publication, <input type="radio"/> Submitted for Publication, <input type="radio"/> Publication style
Publication Details	Aji K. Particle deposition and mobilization during deep bed filtration in oil field. International Journal of Oil, Gas and Coal Technology. Accepted on 31.06. 2013. Available online: http://www.insiderscience.com/info/ingeneral/forthcoming.php?jcode=ijgct

Author Contributions

By signing the Statement of Authorship, each author certifies that their stated contribution to the publication is accurate and that permission is granted for the publication to be included in the candidate's thesis.

Name of Principal Author (Candidate)	Kaiser Aji		
Contribution to the Paper	Experimental design and work, data analysis, wrote manuscript		
Signature		Date	09/05/2014

Name of Co-Author			
Contribution to the Paper			
Signature		Date	

Name of Co-Author			
Contribution to the Paper			
Signature		Date	

Name of Co-Author			
Contribution to the Paper			
Signature		Date	

Statement of Authorship

Title of Paper	Experimental study of colloidal flow in porous media at high velocities
Publication Status	<input checked="" type="radio"/> Published, <input type="radio"/> Accepted for Publication, <input type="radio"/> Submitted for Publication, <input type="radio"/> Publication style
Publication Details	Aji K. Experimental study of colloidal flow in porous media at high velocities. Asia-Pacific Journal of Chemical Engineering. Accepted on 20.11.2013.

Author Contributions

By signing the Statement of Authorship, each author certifies that their stated contribution to the publication is accurate and that permission is granted for the publication to be included in the candidate's thesis.

Name of Principal Author (Candidate)	Kaiser Aji		
Contribution to the Paper	Experimental design and work, data analysis, wrote manuscript		
Signature		Date	12/05/2014

Name of Co-Author			
Contribution to the Paper			
Signature		Date	

Name of Co-Author			
Contribution to the Paper			
Signature		Date	

Name of Co-Author			
Contribution to the Paper			
Signature		Date	

Statement of Authorship

Title of Paper	High Velocity Colloidal Flow in Porous Media: Experimental study and modeling
Publication Status	<input checked="" type="radio"/> Published, <input type="radio"/> Accepted for Publication, <input type="radio"/> Submitted for Publication, <input type="radio"/> Publication style
Publication Details	Aji K., Badalyan A., Carageorgos T., Zeinijahromi A., Bedrikovetsky P. High Velocity Colloidal Flow in Porous Media: Experimental study and modeling, in: Focus on Porous Media Research, Ed. by Zhao C, 2013, p 359- 398. Nova Science Publishers, NY.

Author Contributions

By signing the Statement of Authorship, each author certifies that their stated contribution to the publication is accurate and that permission is granted for the publication to be included in the candidate's thesis.

Name of Principal Author (Candidate)	Kaiser Aji		
Contribution to the Paper	Experimental design and work, data analysis, wrote manuscript		
Signature		Date	12/05/2014

Name of Co-Author	Alexander Badalyan		
Contribution to the Paper	Supervised experimental work and manuscript evaluation		
Signature		Date	

Name of Co-Author	Themis Carageorgos		
Contribution to the Paper	Supervised and helped experimental work		
Signature		Date	12/05/14

Name of Co-Author	Abbas Zeinijahromi		
Contribution to the Paper	Helped experimental work and model prediction		
Signature		Date	13 105 14

Name of Co-Author	Pavel Bedrikovetsky		
Contribution to the Paper	Supervised whole of the work		
Signature			28/05/2014

Name of Co-Author			
Contribution to the Paper			
Signature		Date	

Name of Co-Author			
Contribution to the Paper			
Signature		Date	

Statement of Authorship

Title of Paper	Size exclusion deep bed filtration: experimental and modelling uncertainties
Publication Status	<input checked="" type="radio"/> Published, <input type="radio"/> Accepted for Publication, <input type="radio"/> Submitted for Publication, <input type="radio"/> Publication style
Publication Details	Badalyan A., You Z, Aji K., Bedrikovetsky P., Carageorgos T., Zeinijahromi A. Size exclusion deep bed filtration: experimental and modelling uncertainties. Review of Scientific Instruments, 2014. V.85, 015111/1-13.

Author Contributions

By signing the Statement of Authorship, each author certifies that their stated contribution to the publication is accurate and that permission is granted for the publication to be included in the candidate's thesis.

Name of Principal Author (Candidate)	Alexander Badalyan
Contribution to the Paper	Experimental design and work, data analysis, wrote manuscript
Signature	<hr/>
Date	12.05.2014

Name of Co-Author	Zhenjiang You
Contribution to the Paper	Helped model prediction and calculation
Signature	<hr/>
Date	12/5/14

Name of Co-Author	Kaiser Aji
Contribution to the Paper	Experimental set up and work, data analysis
Signature	<hr/>
Date	09/05/2014

Name of Co-Author	Pavel Bedrikovetsky
Contribution to the Paper	Supervised of the work
Signature	<hr/>
Date	5/05/2014

Name of Co-Author	Themis Carageorgos		
Contribution to the Paper	Helped experimental work		
Signature		Date	12/05/14

Name of Co-Author	Abbas Zeinjahromi		
Contribution to the Paper	Helped experimental work and calculation		
Signature		Date	13/05/14

Name of Co-Author			
Contribution to the Paper			
Signature		Date	

Statement of Authorship

Title of Paper	Critical analysis of uncertainties during particle filtration
Publication Status	<input checked="" type="radio"/> Published, <input type="radio"/> Accepted for Publication, <input type="radio"/> Submitted for Publication, <input type="radio"/> Publication style
Publication Details	Badalyan A., Carageorgos T., Bedrikovetsky P., You Z., Zeinjahromi A., Aji K. Critical analysis of uncertainties during particle filtration. Review of Scientific Instruments. 2012, 83, 095106/1-9.

Author Contributions

By signing the Statement of Authorship, each author certifies that their stated contribution to the publication is accurate and that permission is granted for the publication to be included in the candidate's thesis.

Name of Principal Author (Candidate)	Alexander Badalyan		
Contribution to the Paper	Experimental design and work, data analysis, wrote manuscript		
Signature		Date	12.05.2014

Name of Co-Author	Themis Carageorgos		
Contribution to the Paper	Helped experimental work and data evaluation		
Signature		Date	12/05/14

Name of Co-Author	Pavel Bedrikovetsky		
Contribution to the Paper	Supervised writing this manuscript		
Signature		15/05/2014	

Name of Co-Author	Zhenjiang You		
Contribution to the Paper	Helped mathematical calculation and model prediction		
Signature		Date	12/5/14

Name of Co-Author	Abbas Zeinjahromi		
Contribution to the Paper	Helped experimental work and data evaluation		
Signature		Date	13/05/14

Name of Co-Author	Kaiser Aji		
Contribution to the Paper	Helped experimental setup and work		
Signature		Date	06/05/2014

Name of Co-Author			
Contribution to the Paper			
Signature		Date	