Essays on the impacts of household financial decision making

George Simon Mihaylov

Thesis submitted to the School of Accounting and Finance, The University of Adelaide, in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

April 2015
# Table of Contents

List of Figures and Tables ........................................................................................................... iv
Glossary .......................................................................................................................................... v
Declaration ......................................................................................................................................... vi
Acknowledgements ......................................................................................................................... vii
Abstract ........................................................................................................................................... viii

1. Introduction ................................................................................................................................. 10
   1.1 Shared appreciation mortgages ............................................................................................ 11
   1.2 Self-managed superannuation funds .................................................................................. 13
   1.3 Small-to-medium sized agricultural enterprises ............................................................... 14
   1.4 Contributions ......................................................................................................................... 16

2. Shared Appreciation Mortgages ................................................................................................. 18
   2.1 Introduction ............................................................................................................................. 18
   2.2 Background and literature review ....................................................................................... 21
   2.3 Data and methodology .......................................................................................................... 24
       2.3.1 Data collection .................................................................................................................. 24
       2.3.2 Descriptive statistics ....................................................................................................... 26
       2.3.3 Methodology .................................................................................................................... 29
           2.3.3.1 Measuring budgetary expenditure outcomes .......................................................... 31
           2.3.3.2 Measuring social perception outcomes ................................................................. 33
           2.3.3.3 Control variables ...................................................................................................... 35
   2.4 Results and discussion ............................................................................................................ 35
       2.4.1 Budgetary impacts for SAM households ........................................................................ 36
           2.4.1.1 Renovations .............................................................................................................. 37
           2.4.1.2 Public transport ....................................................................................................... 38
           2.4.1.3 Holidays ................................................................................................................... 40
4.3.1 Data collection ........................................................................................................ 84
4.3.2 Descriptive statistics ............................................................................................. 85
4.3.3 Key variable constructs ....................................................................................... 87
4.4 Results and discussion ............................................................................................. 89
  4.4.1 Analytical framework ......................................................................................... 89
  4.4.2 Diagnostics ......................................................................................................... 90
  4.4.3 Succession planning within the broader context of SMAE management .......... 91
  4.4.4 Succession planning and financial outcomes .................................................... 95
4.5 Conclusion ............................................................................................................... 97
5. Conclusion ............................................................................................................... 100
  5.1 Contributions ........................................................................................................ 100
  5.2 Limitations ............................................................................................................ 103
  5.3 Directions for future research ................................................................................ 104
References ..................................................................................................................... 106
Appendix A .................................................................................................................... 117
Appendix B .................................................................................................................... 128
Appendix C .................................................................................................................... 137
List of Figures and Tables

Figure 2.1 Housing affordability stress levels for SAM and HILDA households ..................28
Figure 2.2 Self-reported annual holiday expenditure .........................................................31
Figure 3.1 Growth in Australian self-managed superannuation funds .................................50

Table 2.1 Demographic statistics for SAM and HILDA households and individuals ..........27
Table 2.2 The impact of SAM financed homeownership on household spending against home owners from the general population with similar mortgage tenure ...................................36
Table 2.3 The impact of SAM financed homeownership on household spending against renters from the general population .......................................................................................38
Table 2.4 The impact of SAM financed homeownership on borrower social satisfaction ....42
Table 3.1 SMSF descriptive statistics .....................................................................................57
Table 3.2 Variable list with descriptions and derivations .........................................................62
Table 3.3 Pairwise correlations and variance inflation factors .................................................65
Table 3.4 The decision to not seek advice ..............................................................................67
Table 3.5 Performance impact from not seeking advice .........................................................68
Table 4.1 Variable definitions ...............................................................................................85
Table 4.2 Descriptive statistics with pairwise correlations ....................................................86
Table 4.3 Succession planning in the broader context of SMAE management .........................92
Table 4.4 Professionalization in succession planning and financial outcomes .........................95
# Glossary

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ANZ</td>
<td>Australian and New Zealand Banking Group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APRA</td>
<td>Australian Prudential Regulation Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ATO</td>
<td>Australian Taxation Office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AUD</td>
<td>Australian Dollar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CBD</td>
<td>Central Business District</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HAS</td>
<td>Housing Affordability Stress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HILDA</td>
<td>Household, Income and Labour Dynamics in Australia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OECD</td>
<td>Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RB</td>
<td>Rural Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RFCS</td>
<td>Rural Financial Counselling Service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ROA</td>
<td>Return on Assets</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAM</td>
<td>Shared Appreciation Mortgage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SIS</td>
<td>Superannuation Industry (Supervision)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SPAA</td>
<td>SMSF Professionals’ Association of Australia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SMAE</td>
<td>Small-to-medium sized agricultural enterprise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SME</td>
<td>Small-to-medium sized enterprise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SMSF</td>
<td>Self-managed Superannuation Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VIF</td>
<td>Variance Inflation Factor</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Declaration

I certify that this work contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in my name, in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text. In addition, I certify that no part of this work will, in the future, be used in a submission in my name, for any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution without the prior approval of the University of Adelaide and where applicable, any partner institution responsible for the joint-award of this degree.

I give consent to this copy of my thesis when deposited in the University Library, being made available for loan and photocopying, subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.

The author acknowledges that copyright of published works contained within this thesis resides with the copyright holder(s) of those works.

I also give permission for the digital version of my thesis to be made available on the web, via the University’s digital research repository, the Library Search and also through web search engines, unless permission has been granted by the University to restrict access for a period of time.

Signature: Date: 9 April 2015
Acknowledgements

I am particularly grateful and indebted to my principal supervisor, Professor Ralf Zurbruegg, for initially encouraging me to undertake this research and for his support and guidance throughout the journey. He was there for me at each step along the way, even when I chose to go down the wrong path. I would also like to thank Dr Chee Cheong for his assistance and encouragement during my studies. Finally, none of this would have been possible in the first place without Dr Aku Ali and Dr Erin Derina, who introduced me to financial research as an undergraduate student.

As an empirical researcher, my work is reliant on quality data. To this end, I have greatly benefited from the invaluable guidance of Professor Alfred Yawson, Dr Jean Canil and Dr Claire Sherman as well as from the substantial assistance of Ashley Miller and Andrew Harrison. Lastly, a range of industry partners assisted me with data collection and logistics. I extend a special thank you to Deb Dickson and Mutsa Tumbare from HomeStart Finance, Peter Burgess and Andrea Slattery from SPAA, and Mick Davidson from Rural Bank.

It is hard to imagine succeeding in research without the support of family and friends. I am immensely thankful to my family for their endless dedication to me and this cause. Finally and most importantly, I wish to thank my wife Anna. She is my greatest advocate and the reason why I get up in the afternoon.
Abstract

The thesis examines the consequences of household and individual financial decision making in three different areas: mortgages, superannuation and family businesses. The questions posed in each case cannot be tackled using conventional financial databases. I therefore address each case by applying survey methods.

First, I examine the socioeconomic impacts of households choosing to take out shared appreciation mortgages (SAMs). Tax and regulatory barriers have impeded the development and use of SAMs in many mortgage markets. Empirical studies on household impacts stemming from SAMs have therefore also been limited. However, the State Government of South Australia has implemented SAMs as a means of enabling and encouraging low-income homeownership, thereby creating a unique dataset of SAM financed households. I survey this population, finding that SAM borrowers benefit from increased budgetary expenditure on discretionary items following take-up, while simultaneously saving on some non-discretionary items relative to control samples of renters and other homeowners from the general population. Furthermore, SAM homeownership also appears to be associated with increased levels of neighbourhood satisfaction and community involvement for borrowers. The results from this study indicate that SAM financed homeownership leads to changes in household behaviour and deserves further consideration by the housing industry and research community.

Second, I examine the influence of investor knowledge and the cognitive bias which arises from overconfidence on the advice seeking behaviour of investors in self-managed superannuation funds (SMSFs). I trace whether overestimating one’s own technical and financial abilities can hinder the willingness to seek advice. I identify a subset of investors
who are not knowledgeable and yet do not seek advice to compensate for this. These investors appear to be overconfident in their ability to manage their SMSF, despite holding under-diversified and less financially sophisticated portfolios when compared to their peers. Given the global rise in investors choosing to manage their own retirement funds and the importance of seeking advice in this context, there are direct policy implications from these findings. They suggest a need to identify and target self-managed retirement investors who display overconfidence since they are the most likely to manage under-performing SMSFs in the longer term.

Third, I examine links between the succession planning decisions, operational management and financial performance of small-to-medium sized agricultural enterprises (SMAEs). I differentiate between written, verbal and other succession arrangements to investigate how each type embeds within the broader operational environment of SMAE households. Further tests are performed to see if differences in financial outcomes can be linked with a particular approach to succession. The results indicate that succession planning decisions are positively associated with the use of written business plans and crop insurance, but that this is only true for SMAEs with professionalised written succession arrangements. This was also the only cohort associated with improved return on assets relative to peer agricultural businesses with alternative succession arrangements in place. Given the critical role of succession in the long-term sustainability of family business households, these results have direct implications for farmers and practitioners advising the private agricultural sector. They suggest that the value in planning succession at least partly lies in the value of going down pathways for professionalization.