

The Development of Vocational English Materials from a Social Semiotic
Perspective: Participatory Action Research

Handoyo Puji Widodo

BA in English Education (Jember University, Indonesia)

Postgrad.Dip.Appl.Ling. (SEAMEO-RELC, Singapore)

MA in TESOL (Indiana University of Pennsylvania, USA)

A thesis submitted in fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy

Department of Linguistics
School of Humanities
Faculty of Arts
University of Adelaide
Australia

March 2015

TABLE OF CONTENTS

TABLE OF CONTENTS.....	ii
ABSTRACT.....	v
DECLARATION	vi
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	vii
DEDICATION.....	ix
LIST OF TABLES	x
LIST OF FIGURES	xii
ABBREVIATIONS.....	xiv
TRANSCRIPTION CONVENTIONS	xv
 CHAPTER 1: Highlighting the Value of Language Materials Development.....	 1
1.1 Rationale.....	4
1.2 Statements of the Research Problems and Purposes of the Study	7
1.3 Contributions of the Study.....	9
1.4 Scopes of the Present Study	11
1.5 Organization of the Doctoral Thesis.....	12
 CHAPTER 2: Literature Review and Conceptual Frameworks	 13
2.1 ESP	13
2.2 Vocational English	16
2.3 Reframing Needs Analysis in Vocational English Materials Development.....	19
2.4 Language Materials	23
2.5 Locally Grounded Language Materials Development as Curricular Innovation.....	25
2.6 Participatory Action Research as a Platform for Locally Grounded Language Materials Development	 28
2.7 Theoretically and Research Informed Materials Development: Theory and Evidence Based Practice	 30
2.8 Theory of Language and Language Learning: A Social Semiotic Perspective.....	31
2.8.1 Theory of Language.....	31
2.8.2 Language Based Theory of Learning.....	34
2.9 SFL-Informed Pedagogical Practices.....	37
2.9.1 Content Based Instruction (CBI)	37
2.9.2 Text Based Language Instruction (TBLI)	39
2.10 Previous Studies on ELT Materials Evaluation, Design, and Development	46

CHAPTER 3: Research Context and Methods	49
3.1 Research Design	49
3.2 Research Context	51
3.3 Gaining and Negotiating Access to the Field Site	55
3.4 Participant Recruitment and Participant Profiles	57
3.5 Research Procedures and Data Collection Methods	61
3.6 Data Analysis: Approaches and Procedures	70
CHAPTER 4: The Conditions of English Language Teaching in the Vocational Secondary Education Sector: Macro and Micro Lenses	75
4.1 Educational and Language-in-Education Policies: Policy Makers' Perspectives	75
4.2 Conceptualization of ELT: Textbook Writers' Perspectives	86
4.3 English Language Teaching: Lessons Observed	97
4.4 English Teachers' Knowledge and Beliefs about the Design and Use of Pedagogical Curriculum Materials and English for Specific Purposes (ESP)	102
4.5 Students' Voices: Goals, Interests, and Expectations of English Learning	109
CHAPTER 5: Negotiating Participatory Vocational English (VE) Materials Design	116
5.1 Negotiating the Design of Vocational English Materials: Meeting Different Expectations of School Administrators, Vocational Teachers, English Teachers, and Students	116
5.1.1 The Nature of Negotiated Collaborative Teacher Design	117
5.1.2 Negotiated VE Materials Development	120
5.3 Collegial Training and Mentorship: Teacher Learning in VE Materials Design	124
5.4 Decision Making Processes: Course Design	129
CHAPTER 6: Engaging Students in In-Class and Out-of-Class Meaning Making Activities: Learning to Mean and Learning to Learn	138
6.1 Content or Vocational Vocabulary Building	138
6.2 Understanding and Building Vocational Knowledge	146
6.2.1 Learning to Mean through Dialogic Reading: A Guided Reading Comprehension Task	146
6.2.2 Learning to Mean through Dialogic Reading: Literature Circles	155
6.2.3 Doing Vocationally Oriented Extensive Reading along with Learning Logs	166
6.2.4 Speaking Vocationally through Collaborative Oral Presentations	173
6.3 Authentic Digital Text Navigation	181
6.4 Learning to Write and Writing to Mean Vocationally	185
6.4.1 Summary Writing in Vocationally Oriented Extensive Reading (VOER)	185
6.4.2 Collaborative Vocationally Based Paragraph Writing	192
6.4.3 Job Application Letter Writing	201

6.4 Exploring Lexico-grammatical and Appraisal Resources, Genres, and Use of Digital Dictionaries, Corpus, and Translators as Semiotic Tools	209
CHAPTER 7: Engaging English Teachers in VE Materials Development: Change in English Teachers' Knowledge and Practice	220
7.1 The Value of School-Based Professional Development.....	220
7.2 Teacher Knowledge and Beliefs about VE Materials Development	226
7.3 VE Materials Development as Pedagogical Innovation.....	229
CHAPTER 8: Discussion and Conclusions	233
8.1 Summaries of the Findings and Discussion	233
8.2 The Contribution of SFL Theory to Language Materials Development	238
8.3 Participatory Language Materials Development as Curricular Innovation through PAR	240
8.4 Implications of the Findings for ESP Materials Development.....	242
8.5 Limitations of the Present Study and Directions for Future Studies	243
REFERENCES	245
Appendix A: Ethics Approval.....	271
Appendix B: Sample Consent Form.....	273
Appendix C: Sample Participant Information Sheet	274
Appendix D: Research Instruments	277
Appendix E: Sample Official Textbook Texts	288
Appendix F: List of Vocational Competencies.....	303
Appendix G: Lesson Units Developed by the English Teachers and the Researcher.....	307
Appendix H: Learning Logs.....	331

ABSTRACT

This study documents the design and use of vocational English materials informed by Systemic Functional Linguistics (SFL) as social semiotic theory. Extensive studies in language materials development have been undertaken particularly in English for Specific Purposes (ESP) programs in the higher education context (see Harwood, 2014) but only a few in the secondary vocational education sector (see Hua & Beverton, 2013). The study extends the scholarship of ESP materials development in the context of schooling, integrating context analysis, materials creation, and materials enactment (see Singapore Wala, 2013).

Grounded in a participatory action research design, this study, conducted over a 13-month period, provides a detailed account of the design and use of the materials in one Indonesian vocational school. School administrators, English teachers, vocational teachers, and 142 students volunteered to participate in the study. Data for the study included field notes, non-participant and participant observations, curriculum documentation, focus group and individual interviews, reflective journals/diaries, and photovoice. The data were qualitatively analyzed using critical thematic and SFL based analyses.

The context analysis revealed that while the current language policy provided teachers with full autonomy to design their own materials, the teachers consistently based their instruction on published textbooks, which contained decontextualized exercises geared towards school and national examinations. This situation did not provide students with opportunities to engage with vocational texts. With the support of the school, the teachers and the researcher in consultation with the students created and used text-based materials based on students' vocational specializations. The analysis of the actual use of the materials by the teachers and the students revealed that they had opportunities to explore different vocational texts, to analyze how language works in these texts, and to use the language as a tool for communication, knowledge building, and social participation. From a teacher perspective, the teachers viewed the materials development process as professional learning and a way to understand SFL theory and apply it to pedagogical practices, such as content based instruction and text based instruction. This study offers evidence of how social semiotic theory can contribute to ESP materials development and instruction.

DECLARATION

I certify that this work contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text. I certify that no part of this work will, in the future, be used in a submission in my name for any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution without the prior approval of the University of Adelaide and where applicable, any partner institution responsible for the joint award of this degree.

I give consent to this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University Library, being made available for loan and photocopying, subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.

The author acknowledges that copyright of published works contained within this thesis resides with the copyright holder(s) of those works.

I also give permission for the digital version of my thesis to be made available on the web, via the University's digital research repository, the Library Search and also through web search engines, unless permission has been granted by the University to restrict access for a period of time.

Signed: _____

Date _____

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Over a period of three and a half years, doing a PhD and completing a PhD thesis has been a spiritual and intellectual journey for me. Doing a PhD as a spiritual journey involved self dialog and my dialog with Allah Swt, as the Greatest Motivator. I had to motivate myself and sustain this motivation to complete this mission. As an intellectual journey, I had engaged in staged-oriented meaning making processes from proposal writing, fieldwork, to thesis writing. I had dialogic conversations with my supervisors, with scholars through the readings of books and articles, and with my participants. With this in mind, this PhD thesis is a representation of different voices of my research participants, experts, and mine. This journey has shaped my identities as a PhD student and scholar alike. As a Muslim scholar, I would like to express my great gratitude to Allah Swt who has always guided me throughout my PhD journey. He has bestowed this as *Amanah* (Arabic: أمانة) or godly trust and as an earthly reward. This spirituality has sustained my motivation to complete my PhD. There were also always people who had made the completion of my PhD possible.

At the outset, I owe a debt of gratitude to Dr. Peter Mickan, my principal supervisor for his sustained guidance and sincere personal and professional support. I felt fortunate that he introduced me social semiotic theory (Hallidayan Systemic Functional Linguistics). He challenged me to translate this theory into ESP materials development. He also motivated me to experiment with Hallidayan SFL informed vocational English (VE) materials development in particular. I have learned much from Dr. Mickan about this theory as pedagogical and research tools. He guided me to fully understand the contribution of Hallidayan SFL to educational research in general and ESP research in particular. I am really grateful for 3.5 years of Dr. Mickan's generous support and guidance.

I am also extremely grateful to Dr. John Walsh, my co-supervisor for his professional and administrative support. I felt blessed to have him as my co-supervisor because he introduced me the concept of discourse analysis (language appraisal and critical discourse analysis) that I did not know before. He encouraged me to use this tool for data analysis. I was fully aware that the use of language is always fraught with discourses. Under Dr. Walsh's guidance, I saw the interconnectedness between SFL and discourse analysis. Dr. Walsh also assisted me with administrative stuff, such as providing useful course book resources and revival of lost data. His generous personal support sustained my motivation to complete my PhD.

This work would not been possible without the support of the school where the fieldwork took place and the involvements of the teachers, the students, and the parents. I had learned a lot from my research participants. Immersing myself in the school community made me realized the importance

of educating and empowering teachers and students. I spent a great deal of time talking with the participants. We successfully broke the big wall between us. We are a big family who are concerned about the value of education.

I am very fortunate to have a family that has always supported my professional and academic careers. I feel a tremendous sense of obligation to my wife, Ririn Pusporini, and my kids, Tsabita Rosaria Qonnita and Reyhan Naufal Hafidz, for allowing me to stay away from them while doing a PhD. They also provided both personal and spiritual support to me. Their kind understanding, love, and patience as well as their continued prayers made this PhD journal possible. I am also indebted to my parents: Saim, Misnah, Suyono, and Sunarsih who ceaselessly offered me their prayers and best wishes.

I am sincerely appreciative of the University of Adelaide that provided generous financial support of my PhD studies for 3.5 years. My sincere thanks go to Ms. Janelle Palmer and other staff of Adelaide Graduate Centre for their administrative support throughout my PhD studies. I would also like to express my sincere thanks for their personal support to the following scholars: Dr. Michelle Picard (The University of Adelaide), Dr. Rob Emery (The University of Adelaide), Dr. Ghi'lad Zuckermann (The University of Adelaide), Dr. Willy Renandya (NIE-Nanyang Technological University-Singapore), Dr. Jack C. Richards (SEAME-RELC Singapore), Dr. Lilia Savova (Indiana University of Pennsylvania), Dr. Gloria Park (Indiana University of Pennsylvania), Dr. Sharon Deckert (Indiana University of Pennsylvania), Dr. Joko Nurkamto (Universitas Sebelas Maret Surakarta Indonesia), Dr. Jonathan Newton (Victoria University of Wellington, New Zealand), Dr. John Macalister (Victoria University of Wellington, New Zealand), Dr. Brian Tomlinson (MATSDA-UK), Bapak Nanang Dwi Wahyono (Politeknik Negeri Jember-Indonesia), and Bapak Asmuji (Politeknik Negeri Banyuwangi-Indonesia). I am also much obliged for prayers and best wishes to my former lecturers of Faculty of Education (Universitas Jember Indonesia), my brothers and sisters, my roommates of the Payneham Apartment and of the Allen Avenue, my Facebook friends, my colleagues, my relatives, and my neighbors.

Undertaking a PhD has been a journey that has shaped who I have been and what I have done academically and professionally. Completing this journey is a reward and point of departure for continuing my professional and academic journey. This is another chapter of my life.

DEDICATION

My Wife

Ririn Pusporini

My Jewels:

Tsabita Rosaria Qonnita and ***Reyhan Naufal Hafidz***

My Parents:

Saim and ***Misnah***

Suyono and ***Sunarsih***

LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1 Basturkmen’s Classification of ESP Branches	15
Table 2.2 A List of Previous Studies on Needs Analysis in ESP	21
Table 2.3 Differences between Locally Produced Materials and Commercial Texts	24
Table 2.4 Macro and Micro Strategies of Teachers-as-Curriculum Developers	27
Table 2.5 Metafunctional Discourse in SFL	32
Table 2.6 Metafunctional Meanings in SFL	32
Table 3.1 Ethical Guidelines	58
Table 3.2 A List of Participants	58
Table 3.3 A List of Teacher Participants	59
Table 3.4 Types of Data Collection Methods	63
Table 4.1 A Summary of the National Curriculum Guidelines during the last 10 Years in Indonesia	76
Table 4.2 General English Competencies	84
Table 4.3 Themes in the Students’ Textbooks	87
Table 4.4 Core Competencies in the Students’ Textbooks	89
Table 4.5 Learning Activities in the Students’ Textbooks	90
Table 4.6 Conditions of English Language Lessons	97
Table 4.7 Snapshot of an English Lesson Observation	101
Table 4.8 Reflective Vignettes # 4 and # 5 (20 June 2012)	104
Table 4.9 Roles of Teachers and Students	105
Table 4.10 Preferred Lesson Activities	106
Table 4.11 Teachers’ Knowledge about Vocational English	108
Table 5.1 Roles of Team Members in Participatory VE Materials Design	119
Table 5.2 Core Competency Descriptors	131
Table 5.3 Topics or Themes in the Lesson Units	134
Table 5.4 A List of Vocational Textbooks for Sustained Extensive Reading	136
Table 6.1. A Snapshot of How the Teacher Guiding the Students What to Do in a Vocabulary Building Task	139
Table 6.2 A Collaborative Dialog as a Platform for Making Meaning of the Text Hotel, “Guest Registration”	152
Table 6.3 Students’ Reflections on Guided Reading Comprehension Activities	154
Table 6.4 The Roles the Students Played in Literature Circles Activities	156

Table 6.5 Criteria for Selecting Vocational Texts	158
Table 6.6 The Students Discussing the Concept of Cash Flow Statements	160
Table 6.7 Students' Reflections on the Roles Played in Literature Circles Activities (Part 1)....	162
Table 6.8 Students' Reflections on the Roles Played in Literature Circles Activities (Part 2)....	164
Table 6.9 Students' Reflections on Engaging with Sustained ER	167
Table 6.10 Linguistic Realizations Indicating Interactional Meanings	177
Table 6.11 Attempted Paraphrases in Students' First Summaries	188
Table 6.12 SFL Genre Informed Summary Components	190
Table 6.13 Text Types Composed by Students	193
Table 6.14 Guiding Questions by the Teachers	196
Table 6.15 Meta-functional Meanings in Students' Application Letters	201
Table 6.16 A Guide to Evaluating Application Letters	206
Table 6.17 A Guide Sheet of Functional Meta-Language Analysis	210
Table 6.18 Transitivity Analysis of Hotel Front Webpage Text.....	211
Table 6.19 Students' Engagement in How Lexicogrammar Works in a Text	214
Table 7.1 A Professional Dialogue between the English Teachers, Vocational Teachers, and the Researcher	223

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 2.1 Extended Classification of ESP Domains	17
Figure 2.2 Components of Vocationally-Oriented Language Learning (VOLL)	18
Figure 2.3 A Framework for Context Analysis.....	22
Figure 2.4 The Stratal Perspective of Language in SFL	33
Figure 2.5 Types of Genres	43
Figure 2.6 The Teaching and Learning Cycle	45
Figure 2.7 Working with Texts for Meaning Making	46
Figure 4.1 Listening Activity in the textbook (Grade X)	91
Figure 4.2 Speaking Activity in the textbook (Grade X).....	92
Figure 4.3 Reading Activity in the Textbook (Grade XI, p. 146)	93
Figure 4.4 Writing Activities (Grade XI, p. 146).....	94
Figure 4.5 Writing Activity (Grade XII, p. 12).....	95
Figure 4.6 Grammar Exercise (Grade X, p. 53)	96
Figure 4.7 Grammar Exercise (Grade XII, p. 14)	96
Figure 4.8 Hotel Hospitality and Management Test Items	112
Figure 4.9 Accounting Test Items	113
Figure 5.1 Different Stages of Curriculum Activities.....	118
Figure 5.2 Different Stages of Negotiated Collegial Training and Mentorship.....	127
Figure 5.3 Meaning Making Tasks.....	137
Figure 6.1. Taxonomic Relations (Hyponym).....	141
Figure 6.2. The Students Discussing Technical Vocabulary in Pairs	143
Figure 6.3 A Dialogic Reading Model.....	147
Figure 6.4 Accounting Text of the Recording Process.....	149
Figure 6.5 Hotel Management and Hospitality Text of Hotel Websites	150
Figure 6.6 Computer Engineering Text of Website Design	151
Figure 6.7 The Students Engaging in Literature Circles Activities	159
Figure 6.8 A Concept Map of a Cash Flow Statement.....	161
Figure 6.9 An Extensive Reading Log.....	167
Figure 6.10 Examples of Learning Objectives in the Accounting Textbook	169
Figure 6.11 Examples of Vocationally Oriented Learning Goals.....	170
Figure 6.12 Key Words in Hotel Management and Hospitality	170

Figure 6.13 Sample Hotel Management and Hospitality Text	171
Figure 6.14 Students' Learning Portfolios	172
Figure 6.15 The Nature of Collaborative Oral Presentations	175
Figure 6.16 Hotel Webpage Text	179
Figure 6.17 The Skeleton of a Paragraph	195
Figure 6.18 Joint Text Construction Guided by the Teachers	197
Figure 6.19 Moves of Application Letters in Bahasa Indonesia and English	203
Figure 6.20 Guidelines for Application Letter Writing	205
Figure 6.21 Sample Application Letter Written by Students	208
Figure 6.22 Functional Analysis of Hotel Front Webpage Text	212
Figure 6.23 The Use of British National Corpus as a Semiotic Tool	218
Figure 7.1 Necessary Conditions for Invigorating Language Materials Development as Pedagogical Innovation	230
Figure 8.1 Roles of Materials: Content, Process, and Product	240

ABBREVIATIONS

CBI	Content Based Instruction
CTL	Contextual Teaching and Learning
EAP	English for Academic Purposes
EGP	English for General Purposes
ELT	English language teaching
ER	Extensive Reading
ESL	English as a second language
ESP	English for Specific Purposes
EVP	English for Vocational Purposes
GE	General English
ICT	Information and Communication Technology
<i>MGMP</i>	<i>Musyawarah Guru Mata Pelajaran</i> [Teacher Development Groups]
PAR	Participatory Action Research
PD	Professional Development
PLCs	Professional Learning Communities
SBC	School based Curriculum
SBPD	School Based Professional Development
SFL	Systemic Functional Linguistics
TBLI	Text Based Language Instruction
TBLT	Task Based Language Teaching
VE	Vocational English
VET	Vocational Education and Training
VOER	Vocationally Oriented Extensive Reading
VOLL	Vocationally-Oriented Language Learning

TRANSCRIPTION CONVENTIONS

- (.) : short pause
- ... : normal pause
- \ : falling accent
- (()) : non-linguistic events
- ? : question remarks
- : truncated talks
- () : Particular word/phrase
- bold** : particular expressions