
Students' Experiences of Mathematics and How They Affect Further Engagement with Mathematics

Patrick Korbel

Supervisors: Assoc. Prof. Nicholas Buchdahl and Assoc. Prof.
Sivakumar Alagumalai

September 2015

Thesis submitted for the degree of Doctor in Philosophy in 2015.

School of Mathematical Sciences,
Faculty of Engineering, Mathematical and Computer Sciences,
University of Adelaide

Declaration

I certify that this work contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in my name, in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text. In addition, I certify that no part of this work will, in the future, be used in a submission in my name, for any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution without the prior approval of the University of Adelaide.

I give consent to this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University Library, being made available for loan and photocopying, subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.

I also give permission for the digital version of my thesis to be made available on the web, via the University’s digital research repository, the Library Search and also through web search engines.

Signed by candidate:

Date:

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank my supervisors, Nicholas Buchdahl and Sivakumar Alagumalai, for all their assistance, guidance, patience and help throughout my research. Thank you to Nick for being my supervisor in my Honours year in pure mathematics and for joining me again to delve into the field of mathematics education. Thank you to Siva for joining us and guiding us through the field of education research. It has been a pleasure to work with you both and have our regular meetings over coffee. Hopefully we can continue our good work!

Thank you to all the schools, teachers and students who participated anonymously in this research. I appreciate the time that you all took out of your schedules to accommodate my research project and me. You may never read this research and it may never produce a tangible result that directly affects you, but you have given a gift to the field of mathematics education. It is now my duty to pay it back in kind through my research and work.

Thank you to my partner, Claire Langsford, who has been my partner in so many different ways throughout our undergraduate and postgraduate years. Thanks for being a fellow doctoral researcher who understood the research roller coaster and all that it entails. Thanks for being a sounding board, an editor and a gentle but firm critic. Thanks for getting me out of house and the hundreds of coffees. Thanks for being my point of reference in this stormy life.

Thank you to my parents, Boguslaw Korbel and Annette Hurley, for always supporting my education and encouraging my interests. Few people are privileged enough to be able to pursue their education for interests sake, but your support has allowed me to do just that and focus on producing this research.

Thank you to all of my friends that have suffered my gripes and moans, heard me talk endlessly about mathematics and listened to me talk excitedly about my research. Thanks for all the Friday catch ups at the Churches of Chocolate that got me through undergraduate and postgraduate. Thanks to Ainslie Dewet-Piper and staff at the Chocolate Bean (gone but not forgotten), Bracegirdles, Steven ter Horst Chocolatier and Koko Black for supplying the copious amounts of chocolate.

Abstract

The aim of this research was to investigate what factors affect senior secondary school students' attitudes towards mathematics, intentions to continue studying mathematics and mathematical literacy. In particular, this research was primarily interested in what happens "inside the classroom" and what effects this can have on students. The research was focused on the behaviours and practices of mathematics teachers and students in the classroom - how they teach, learn and interact.

The research involved Year 10 and Year 11 students in mathematics classes from a range of schools across Adelaide, South Australia. This group was the focus of the research because they are nearing the end of their compulsory mathematics education, making substantive decisions about their future education and considering pathways to further study and careers. This is can be crucial turning point for many students, so we must understand what influences them.

In Australia and internationally, there are persistent and wide-spread concerns about students' engagement in mathematics at all levels of education. These concerns are often prompted by declining rates of enrolment in mathematics, particularly at the senior secondary school level where advanced mathematics subjects are part of an important pathway into further education. This research is a response to those concerns and an attempt to find out in which areas we can improve mathematics education to engage and retain more students.

However, the study of mathematics is not just for those with plans to become mathematicians or engineers. There is a growing need for mathematical literacy throughout society, so that we are prepared to engage in critical thought and debates and interact with an increasingly technological world. This research has been borne out of a personal

appreciation of mathematics and a desire to spread this appreciation more widely.

The primary data collection tools for this research were participant observation of mathematics classes, a survey questionnaire and a mathematics test. The participant observation was used to investigate classroom behaviours and practices to inform the development of the survey. The survey and the test were used together to measure students' attitude towards mathematics, their intentions to continue studying mathematics, how often they and their teachers did certain things in their classes and their mathematical literacy.

A combination of analysis of variance, logistic regression and hierarchical linear modelling techniques were used to investigate what factors significantly affected attitudes towards mathematics, future intentions and mathematical literacy. In particular, logistic regressions and hierarchical linear models were used to develop models that sought to explain the variance in students' attitude, intentions and literacy.

For mathematical literacy, the analysis indicates that some of the most important factors were country of birth, educational expectations, parental education, attitudes towards mathematics, the use of technology in the classroom and being assigned mathematics projects. This indicates that factors both "inside" (e.g. teachers' use of technology) and "outside" the class (e.g. students' background) are important to students' mathematical literacy.

For attitudes towards mathematics, the analysis indicates that some of the most important factors were sex, language spoken at home, educational expectations, teachers, roaming the class, doing work from the textbook with and without other students. This again points to the importance of what happens inside and outside of the classroom.

For intentions to study mathematics, the analysis indicates that some of the most important factors were the perceived value of mathematics, attitudes towards mathematics, university entrance and prerequisites, interest in mathematics and the advice of teachers. These results highlight the importance of student attitudes towards mathematics and its general perception as a useful and necessary subject.

One of the most significant conclusions from this research is the importance of what happens inside and outside the classroom.

Students bring with them to their mathematics classes a lot more than a pencil case, textbook and exercise book. Students bring with them certain values, beliefs and perceptions about mathematics that they have learned and digested outside the classroom (and in previous classrooms) that affect their engagement with mathematics.

At the same time, what happens inside the classroom can and does make a difference to students and their engagement with mathematics. Above all, this research points to the fact that any interventions or initiatives should not ignore what happens inside the classroom nor what happens outside the classroom. Both aspects, and their complex and changing interactions, must be considered.

The results and process of this research suggests many avenues for future investigation and study. Future analyses should consider the multi-level and hierarchical nature of school education, the change in students' engagement with mathematics over time and how best to capture the frequency of teacher and student practices in useful scales.

Contents

1	Introduction	1
2	Literature Review	7
2.1	Motivations for the Research	7
2.2	Focus of the Study	15
2.3	Research Methods	23
2.4	Summary	31
3	Methodology	33
3.1	Variables	34
3.2	Attitudes Towards Mathematics	40
3.3	Mathematical Literacy	42
3.4	Research Methods	44
4	Effects on Mathematical Literacy	59
4.1	Introduction	59
4.2	Background and Education	60
4.3	Attitude (Instrumental Motivation)	71
4.4	Attitude (Self-concept)	76
4.5	Attitude (Intrinsic Motivation)	82
4.6	Teacher’s Practices	85
4.7	Required Practices	90
4.8	Student’s Practices	93
4.9	Effective Teaching	97
4.10	Sources	99

4.11 Conclusion	100
5 Effects on Attitude Towards Mathematics	107
5.1 Introduction	107
5.2 Background and Education	108
5.3 Teacher's Practices	116
5.4 Required Practices	121
5.5 Student's Practices	125
5.6 Effective Teaching	132
5.7 Sources	134
5.8 Conclusion	137
6 Intentions to Study Mathematics	145
6.1 Introduction	145
6.2 Background	146
6.3 Attitude (Instrumental Motivation)	149
6.4 Attitude (Self-concept)	154
6.5 Attitude (Intrinsic Motivation)	158
6.6 Factors Influencing Intentions	163
6.7 Teacher's Practices	171
6.8 Required Practices	175
6.9 Student's Practices	176
6.10 Sources	179
6.11 Conclusion	180
7 Intentions to Study Advanced Mathematics	187
7.1 Introduction	187
7.2 Background and Education	188
7.3 Attitude (Instrumental Motivation)	194
7.4 Attitude (Self-concept)	199
7.5 Attitude (Intrinsic Motivation)	204
7.6 Factors	209
7.7 Teacher's Practices	215
7.8 Required Tasks	216
7.9 Student's Practices	217

7.10 Sources	219
7.11 Conclusion	220
8 Hierarchical Linear Modelling	229
8.1 Introduction	229
8.2 Literacy	230
8.3 Attitude	252
9 Conclusion	275
9.1 Main Findings	278
9.2 Limitations	290
9.3 Future Research	298

Appendices

A Literacy	319
B Literacy (HLM)	343
C Attitude	419
D Attitude (HLM)	447
E Intentions to Study Mathematics	499
F Intentions to Study Advanced Mathematics	519
G PISA and TIMSS	541
H Participant Observation	547
I Rasch Analysis	613
J Survey Questionnaire	621
K Mathematics Test	631
L Ethics Approvals	657

List of Tables

4.1	Effect of Background and Education Variables on Literacy	68
4.2	Effect of Teacher’s Practice Variables on Literacy	89
4.3	Effect of Required Practices Variables on Literacy	92
4.4	Effect of Student’s Practices Variables on Literacy	96
4.5	Effect of Effective Teaching Variables on Literacy	98
4.6	Effect of External Sources Variables on Literacy	100
5.1	Effect of Background and Education Variables on Attitude	115
5.2	Effect of Teacher’s Practices Variables on Attitude	119
5.3	Effect of Required Practices Variables on Attitude	124
5.4	Effect of Student’s Practices Variables on Attitude	131
5.5	Effect of Effective Teaching Variables on Attitude	133
5.6	Effect of External Sources Variables on Attitude	136
6.1	Effect of Background and Education Variables on Mathematics Intentions	148
6.2	Variables Not in the Model (Instrumental Motivation)	153
6.3	Variables Entered in the Model (Self-concept)	157
6.4	Variables in the Equation (Self-concept)	158
6.5	Variables Not in the Model (Intrinsic Motivation)	162
6.6	Variables in the Equation (Intrinsic Motivation)	163
6.7	Effect of Factor Variables on Mathematics Intentions	170
6.8	Variables Entered in the Model (Factor)	171
6.9	Variables in the Equation (Factor)	171
6.10	Effect of Teacher’s Practices Variables on Mathematics Intentions	174
6.11	Effect of Required Practices Variables on Mathematics Intentions	176

6.12	Effect of Student's Practices Variables on Mathematics Intentions	178
6.13	Effect of Source Variables on Mathematics Intentions	179
6.14	Significant Variables - Intentions to Study Mathematics	180
6.15	Variables Entered in the Model (Mathematics Intentions)	181
6.16	Model Summary (Mathematics Intentions)	181
6.17	Variables Not in the Model (Mathematics Intentions)	182
6.18	Variables in the Equation (Mathematics Intentions)	183
6.19	Classification Table (Mathematics Intentions)	184
6.20	Variables in the Equation (Second Model) (Mathematics Intentions) . . .	185
7.1	Effect of Background and Education Variables on Advanced Mathematics Intentions	192
7.2	Model Summary (Background and Education)	193
7.3	Variables in the Model (Background and Education)	193
7.4	Variables Not in the Model (Instrumental Motivation)	198
7.5	Variables Not in the Model (Self-concept)	203
7.6	Variables in the Equation (Self-concept)	203
7.7	Variables Not in the Model (Intrinsic Motivation)	208
7.8	Variables in the Equation (Intrinsic Motivation)	208
7.9	Effect of Factor Variables on Advanced Mathematics Intentions	213
7.10	Variables Entered in the Model (Factor)	214
7.11	Variables in the Equation (Factor)	214
7.12	Effect of Teacher's Practices Variables on Advanced Mathematics Intentions	216
7.13	Effect of Required Practices Variables on Advanced Mathematics Intentions	217
7.14	Effect of Student's Practices Variables on Advanced Mathematics Intentions	219
7.15	Effect of Source Variables on Advanced Mathematics Intentions	220
7.16	Significant Variables - Intentions to Study Advanced Mathematics	221
7.17	Variables Entered in the Model (Advanced Mathematics)	222
7.18	Model Summary (Advanced Mathematics)	222
7.19	Variables Not in the Model (Advanced Mathematics)	223
7.20	Variables in the Equation (Advanced Mathematics)	224

7.21	Variables Affecting Intentions to Study Mathematics and Advanced Mathematics	226
8.1	Effect of Background Variables on Literacy	230
8.2	Effect of Instrumental Motivation Variables on Literacy	232
8.3	Effect of Self-concept Variables on Literacy	234
8.4	Model Statistics (Self-concept)	235
8.5	Effect of Intrinsic Motivation Variables on Literacy	236
8.6	Model Statistics (Intrinsic Motivation)	237
8.7	Effect of Teacher's Practices Variables on Literacy	238
8.8	Model Statistics (Teacher's Practices)	239
8.9	Effect of Required Practices Variables on Literacy	240
8.10	Model Statistics (Required Practices)	240
8.11	Effect of Student's Practices Variables on Literacy	241
8.12	Model Statistics (Student's Practices)	243
8.13	Effect of Source Variables on Literacy	244
8.14	Model Statistics (Source)	244
8.15	Significant Variables - Literacy	245
8.16	Overall Model (Fixed Effects) (Literacy)	248
8.17	Overall Model (Variance Components) (Literacy)	248
8.18	Effect of Background Variables on Attitude	253
8.19	Effect of Teacher's Practices Variables on Attitude	255
8.20	Model Statistics (Teacher's Practices)	255
8.21	Effect of Required Practices Variables on Attitude	256
8.22	Effect of Student's Practices Variables on Attitude	257
8.23	Effect of Source Variables on Attitude	259
8.24	Model Statistics (Source)	260
8.25	Significant Variables - Attitude	261
8.26	Overall Model (Fixed Effects) (Attitude)	265
8.27	Overall Model (Variance Components) (Attitude)	266
8.28	Variables Affecting Literacy and Attitude	271

List of Figures

8.1 Student-level Effects in the Overall Model (Literacy) 249

8.2 Student-level Effects in the Overall Model (Attitude) 267