

**Dental insurance, dental service use
and health outcomes:
Effectiveness and cost-effectiveness
among Australian adults**

Emmanuel Sumithran Gnanamanickam

**Australian Research Centre for Population
Oral Health (ARCPOH), School of Dentistry,
The University of Adelaide**

May 2016

**Submitted in fulfilment of the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy**

Supervised by

Professor David S Brennan

Dr Peter Arrow

ARCPOH, School of Dentistry, The University of Adelaide

Contents

List of Figures	v
List of Tables	vi
List of Abbreviations	viii
Abstract.....	x
Declaration.....	xii
Acknowledgement.....	xiii
Chapter 1 Introduction and background	1
Structure of Thesis	2
Background	2
Health system in Australia	3
Dental insurance, dental service use and health outcomes.....	9
Summary of literature.....	10
Scope of problem.....	11
Gaps and significance	11
Research Questions and Objectives	14
Objectives	14
Chapter 2 Methods	15
Data.....	16
Main dataset	16
Insurance fund data	17
Data preparation.....	18
Analytical plan and variables	19
Main Explanatory Variable.....	21
Outcome variables by area of analysis	21
Other Explanatory variables and co-variates.....	30
Statistical analysis	31
Power and Sample Size	34
Chapter 3 Results: Response and description of Data.....	35
Response rates.....	36
Response rates by rounds of data collection.....	36

Response rates by completeness of data	37
Baseline characteristics.....	38
Comparison of demographic and health variables.....	38
Descriptive Summary of explanatory and outcome variables.....	41
Dental insurance status by baseline characteristics	41
Descriptive summary of all outcome variables	42
Summary – Response and description of data	43
Chapter 4 Results: Access to Dental Care / Dental Service Use	44
Bivariate associations with insurance status and other explanatory variables	45
Dental visiting and number of visits	45
Number of services and services per visit	46
Main areas of dental services	48
Main areas of dental services per visit	52
Multivariable associations with dental insurance status and other explanatory variables.....	56
Dental visiting and number of services per visit.....	56
Main Areas of Services.....	57
Main areas of services per visit.....	58
Summary – Dental service use/access to dental care	60
Chapter 5 Results: Health Outcomes	61
Bivariate associations between health outcomes and dental insurance	62
Oral health outcomes	62
General health outcomes	66
Multivariable associations between dental insurance and health outcomes.....	68
Oral health outcomes	68
General health outcomes	69
Summary – Health outcomes	70
Chapter 6 Results: Economic Evaluation	71
Cost Analysis	72
Dental expenditure and its components	72
Dental insurance premiums.....	72
Dental Service use costs.....	73

Total net consumer expenditure	73
Bivariate associations with insurance status and other variables.....	74
Multivariable association with dental insurance and other variables	76
Cost Effectiveness Analysis	78
Costs and outcomes.....	78
Cost effectiveness analysis - OHIP severity change.....	79
Net monetary benefit (NMB).....	80
Cost Effectiveness Acceptability Curve (CEAC).....	82
Cost Effectiveness Analysis – Negative change in SROH	84
Net monetary benefit (NMB).....	85
Cost Effectiveness Acceptability Curve (CEAC).....	87
Summary.....	88
Cost analysis.....	88
Cost effectiveness analysis	88
Chapter 7 Discussion and Conclusion	89
Findings from the study	90
Dental service use	90
Health outcomes.....	93
Cost	96
Cost Effectiveness	99
Limitations and strengths of the study.....	100
Implications of the study	102
Health and policy implications.....	102
Implications for future research and analysis	104
Conclusion.....	105
Appendices.....	115
Appendix 1 - Systematic Literature Review	116
Introduction	116
Review methods	119
Literature search.....	119
Inclusion and Exclusion criteria	120
Full paper quality assessment.....	121

Results of the review	122
Quality Assessment.....	126
Descriptive synthesis	127
Narrative synthesis	131
Dental Service Outcomes.....	131
Oral health outcomes	138
Discussion of review results.....	143
Quality, strength of evidence and selection bias.....	144
Limitations.....	145
Public health implications.....	146
Areas for future research.....	146
Conclusions from the review	147
Appendix 2: Literature Review Sifting Table.....	149
Appendix 3: Final Review and data extraction	160
Appendix 4a: Data collection tools – Baseline Questionnaire.....	198
Appendix 4b: Data collection tools – First year follow up questionnaire	206
Appendix 4c: Data collection tools – Second year follow up questionnaire	208
Appendix 5: Data collection tools Dental log book.....	211

List of Figures

Figure 1.1 Health services-funding and responsibility.....	4
Figure 1.2: Sources of total dental service expenditure in \$millions (constant prices) 2011-12	5
Figure 2.1: Main data set - Sample and data collection stages	17
Figure 6.1: Bootstrapped ICER replications for Change in OHIP severity.....	80
Figure 6.2: Net Monetary Benefit for insured vs uninsured: change in OHIP severity ..	81
Figure 6.3: Net Monetary Benefit for insured vs uninsured (Using Bootstrap): change in OHIP severity	82
Figure 6.4: CEAC for Insured vs uninsured (original sample): change in OHIP severity .	83
Figure 6.5: CEAC for Insured vs Uninsured (bootstrapped sample): change in OHIP severity.....	83
Figure 6.6: Bootstrapped ICER replications for Negative Change in Self-Rated Oral Health.....	85
Figure 6.7: Net Monetary Benefit for insured vs uninsured (original data): Negative Change in SROH	86
Figure 6.8: Incremental Net Benefit for insured vs uninsured (Using Bootstrap): Negative change in SROH	86
Figure 6.9: CEAC for Insured vs Uninsured: Negative change in SROH	87
Figure 6.10: CEAC for Insured vs Uninsured (bootstrapped sample): Negative change in SROH	88
Figure A1.1: Flowchart of literature review process	123

List of Tables

Table 2.1: Analytical plan and variables	20
Table 2.2: Outcome variables and definitions - Dental service use/Access to dental care.....	21
Table 2.3a: Outcome variables and definitions – Oral Health outcomes.....	22
Table 2.3b: Outcome variables and definitions – General Health outcomes.....	23
Table 2.4: Proportions of dental components of insurance policies.....	29
Table 2.5: Outcome variables, types, distribution and regression model used	33
Table 3.1 Crude response rates by data collection tools and rounds	36
Table 3.2 Crude response rates by completeness of data.....	37
Table 3.3: Respondent characteristics at baseline by response at 24-month follow-up and non-respondents	39
Table 3.4: Respondent characteristics by response at 2-year follow-up and population estimates	40
Table 3.5: Dental Insurance status by baseline characteristics	41
Table 3.6: Descriptive summary of all outcome variables.....	43
Table 4.1: Dental visiting and number of visits by Insurance status and oral and general health and demographic variables	46
Table 4.2: Number of services and services per visit by insurance status and oral and general health and demographic variables	47
Table 4.3: Number of diagnostic and preventive services by Insurance status and oral and general health and demographic variables	49
Table 4.4: Number of oral surgery, restorative and prosthodontic services by Insurance status and oral and general health and demographic variables	51
Table 4.5: Number of diagnostic and preventive services per visit by Insurance status and oral and general health and demographic variables	53
Table 4.6: Number of oral surgery, restorative and prosthodontic services per visit by Insurance status and oral and general health and demographic variables...	55
Table 4.7: Ratios of dental visiting and number of services per visit adjusted for other significant variables.....	57
Table 4.8: Ratios of number of preventive and restorative services adjusted for other significant variables.....	58
Table 4.9: Ratios of number of diagnostic, preventive and restorative services per visit adjusted for other significant variables.....	59
Table 5.1: Tooth loss by Insurance status and oral and general health, visiting and demographic variables.....	63
Table 5.2: OHIP severity and SROH change variables by Insurance status and oral and general health, visiting and demographic variables	65

Table 5.3: EuroQoL health utility and SRGH change variables by Insurance status and oral and general health, visiting and demographic variables.....	67
Table 5.4: Ratios and estimates of negative OHIP change, OHIP severity change scores and negative change in SROH adjusted for other significant variables ..	69
Table 5.5: Prevalence ratio of negative change in EuroQoL health utility values and negative change in SRGH adjusted for other significant variables.....	70
Table 6.1 – Dental insurance premium estimates by policy type and year (2009-10 \$s).....	72
Table 6.2 – Dental service use costs by year (2009-10 \$s)	73
Table 6.3 – Total net expenditure by year (2009-10 \$s).....	73
Table 6.4: Net dental expenditure by Insurance status and oral and general health and demographic variables.....	75
Table 6.5: Beta estimates of net expenditure adjusted for other significant variables .	77
Table 6.6: Summary Statistics of costs and outcomes	78
Table 6.7: Incremental Cost Effectiveness Ratio (ICER) – OHIP severity Change	79
Table 6.8: Incremental Cost Effectiveness Ratio (ICER) – Negative Change in SROH	84
Table 7.1: Estimates of Individual dental service expenditure by sources	98
Table A1.1 – Domains and elements assessed to determine study quality	121
Table A1.2: Quality Assessment matrix of final review papers	124
Table A1.2: Quality Assessment matrix of final review papers (continued)	125
Table A1.3 – Year of study, authors, year of publication, samples and outcome measures of reviewed publications.....	128
Table A1.3 – Year of study, authors, year of publication, samples and outcome measures of reviewed publications (continued)	129
Table A1.3 – Year of study, authors, year of publication, samples and outcome measures of reviewed publications (continued)	130
Table A1.4a: Collated results - Dental service use outcomes – Dental visiting.....	132
Table A1.4b: Collated results - Dental service use outcomes - Dental visiting (continued).....	134
Table A1.5a: Collated results - Dental service use outcomes – Services Received/Provided.....	136
Table A1.5b: Collated results - Dental service use outcomes Services Received/Provided (continued)	137
Table A1.6a: Collated results – Oral health outcomes – Clinically measured	139
Table A1.6b: Collated results – Oral health outcomes – Self Reported	141
Table A2.1a: Literature search results – Publications identified in initial database searches	149
Table A2.1b: Literature search results – Subsequent publications identified.....	153

List of Abbreviations

ABS	Australian Bureau of Statistics
ACT	Australian Capital Territory, Australia
AIHW	Australian Institute of Health and Welfare
APRA	Australian Prudential Regulation Authority
ARCPOH	Australian Research Centre for Population Oral Health
BLQ	Baseline Questionnaire
CAL	Clinical Attachment Loss
CDHP	Commonwealth Dental Health Program
CEA	Cost-Effectiveness Analysis
CEAC	Cost Effectiveness Acceptability Curve
CI	Confidence Intervals
CUA	Cost Utility Analysis
DALYS	Disability Adjusted Life years
DMFS	Decayed, Missing and Filled Surfaces
DMFT	Decayed, Missing and Filled Teeth
EuroQoL or EQ-5D	European Quality of Life Scale
GP	General Practitioner
HHI	Household Income
HICAPS	Health Industry Claims and Payments Service
HIE	Health Insurance Experiment
HLL	Healthy Life-years Lost
HRQoL	Health Related Quality of Life
ICER	Incremental Cost-Effectiveness Ratio
LHC	Lifetime Health Cover
LSDPA	Longitudinal Study of Dentists Practice Activity
MEPS	Medical Expenditure Panel Survey
MID	Minimal Important Difference
MLS	Medicare Levy Surcharge
NDTIS	National Dental Telephone Interview Survey
NHHRC	National Health and Hospital Reforms Commission
NHMRC	National Health and Medical Research Council
NHS	National Health Survey
NMB	Net Monetary benefit
NSAOH	National Survey of Adult Oral Health
NSW	New South Wales, Australia
OECD	Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development
OHIP	Oral Health Impact Profile
OOP	Out of Pocket (Expenditure)

OR	Odds Ratio
PBS	Pharmaceutical Benefits Scheme
PD	Pocket Depth
PHI	Private Health Insurance
PHIAC	Private Health Insurance Administrative Council
PHIO	Private Health Insurance Ombudsman
PICO	Population Intervention Comparator Outcome
PR	Prevalence Ratio
PRISMA	Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses
QALYS	Quality Adjusted Life Years
RAND	Research and Development Corporation
ROP	Relief of Pain
RTS	Returned To Sender
SDS	School Dental Service
SES	Socio-Economic Status
SG	Standard Gamble
SIS	Standard Information Sheets
SRGH	Self-Rated General Health
SROH/SRDH	Self-Rated Oral/Dental Health
TTO	Time Trade Off
VAS	Visual Analogue Scale

Abstract

Aim

The aim of this research thesis is to examine the relationship between dental insurance status and dental service use and health outcomes, to ascertain the out of pocket dental expenditure from a consumer perspective and examine the cost-effectiveness of being dentally insured.

Methods

The thesis presents a summary of existing literature and examined the relationship between dental insurance status and dental service use and oral health outcomes in working age adults in Australia using a two-year prospective cohort study. Out of pocket dental expenditure was calculated for the 2 year cohort and cost-effectiveness was examined. Baseline data was collected in 2009-10 with two follow ups in 2010-11 and 2011-12, through questionnaires, service use log books and receipts. Dental insurance premium costs were imputed from a database of private health insurance funds, plans and policies.

Results

The literature review showed a positive relationship between dental insurance status and favourable dental visiting pattern (regular dental visiting, visiting for check-up and visiting the same dentist). Mixed evidence on a positive relationship with oral health outcomes was reported.

The cohort study had a 37% response rate and a 40% retention rate (from baseline) by the end of the two years. 67% of the participants were dentally insured, 73% visited a dental professional, 15% and 23% reported negative change in self-rated oral and general health respectively and mean out of pocket expenditure was \$788 during the study period.

Dental visiting among the insured was significantly higher than the uninsured. Among those who visited, there were no significant associations with dental insurance for number of visits, services or services per visit. None of the main areas of services were significantly associated with dental insurance status either. However, the insured received significantly higher rates of diagnostic and preventive services per visit. Dental insurance was positively associated with OHIP severity change and negative change in self-rated oral health but not with general health outcomes. Mean net expenditure was marginally higher among the dentally insured participants but not significantly. Dental insurance was cost effective with 95% certainty if an individual consumer was willing to pay \$4300 over two years to maintain or improve their self-reported oral health.

Conclusion

The systematic analysis of literature and comprehensive analysis of cohort data found that dental insurance is effective in increasing dental visiting. It is also effective in improving oral health outcomes but not general health outcomes. The out of pocket dental expenditure is large but not substantially larger than other common household expenditures. Being dentally insured is more expensive but also provides better maintenance or improvement of oral health among adults. What these results mean for subgroups based on visiting frequency, type of visiting, longer term outcomes and reduction of future expenditure needs to be further examined in larger and longer duration studies.

Declaration

I certify that this work contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in my name, in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text. In addition, I certify that no part of this work will, in the future, be used in a submission in my name, for any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution without the prior approval of the University of Adelaide and where applicable, any partner institution responsible for the joint-award of this degree. I give consent to this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University Library, being made available for loan and photocopying, subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968. I also give permission for the digital version of my thesis to be made available on the web, via the University's digital research repository, the Library Search and also through web search engines, unless permission has been granted by the University to restrict access for a period of time.

Emmanuel Sumithran Gnanamanickam

Date: 10th May 2016

Acknowledgement

First and foremost I am thankful to God who is the giver of all, for the opportunity, wisdom, knowledge, understanding, discernment, concentration and ability to undertake a project of this nature. He has never failed to strengthen me and his grace has been abundant at every stage.

I am also thankful to God for placing the following people and resources in my life to aid me in accomplishing this research. First, I would like to thank my wife, Greta, who has been my chief source of inspiration, not just by her love which was ever present and never dwindling but also by exhibiting to me perseverance, motivation and zeal through the undertaking and successful completion of her own PhD. I learned and was inspired by her courage and endurance. I also thank her for her support and prayer and all the inconvenience she has put up with and the things she has given up in order that I finish this project successfully. I deeply appreciate it. Our three week old son Micah has also had to let go of his dad to work on his thesis during the first few days of his life outside the womb.

Second I would like to thank my parents and family who have always encouraged, supported and motivated me with all their means to gain knowledge and excel in education. My parents' daily prayers go a long way from the time I was born into this world. I believe everything I have accomplished in life including this research project is a product of many an early morning spent in prayer for me.

Next, I would like to thank Prof David Brennan and Dana Teusner for trusting me with their research project and giving me the free reign of the entire data to conduct this research. This PhD would not have been possible without their research idea, design, planning and execution of the data collection.

David and Dr Peter Arrow as my supervisors have been relentless in their advice, guidance and support throughout my candidature. They gave me space to explore while also guiding me when I went off course with their knowledge and experience. Both of them provided me very contrasting yet complementary points of view from their respective backgrounds. I am also thankful to them for giving me very constructive feedback on different versions of my thesis drafts.

Both David and Peter along with Dana are the three individuals who have been my academic and at certain times even personal advisors to guide me through this process. Dana has educated me on several things spanning from SAS codes, writing styles, Australian insurance and dental system to key literature, statistics and data cleaning and preparation.

I would like to place on record the assistance provided by David Harley and Bev Ellis in data collection and data entry for this project. I also like to thank Prof Jon Karnon for his advice on the cost-effectiveness analysis and feedback on the last results chapter of this thesis.

The essence of this study, are the participants from across Australia. I thank them for the time and the interest they showed in this project and for answering the questionnaires and maintaining and returning their log books.

I would like to acknowledge the support, advice, listening ear, comments and feedback on presentations and drafts provided by ARCPOH staff and students. I would also like to acknowledge the financial support from NHMRC project grant that funded the research, the CRE that supported my scholarship and the University of Adelaide for the excellent student experience that includes access to an exhaustive library and the fee waiver scholarship.

Lastly, I would like to thank all my teachers, professors and lectures from the start of my education several years ago for inculcating in me various qualities and knowledge that has aided me in reaching this far in academia.

Thank You